PROCEDURES USED IN OVERCOMING NEGATIVE
ATTITUDES TOWARD SCHOOL MUSIC.

APPROVED:

[Signatures]

Major Professor

[Signatures]

Minor Professor

[Signatures]

Director of the Department of Education

[Signatures]

Dean of the Graduate School
PROCEDURES USED IN OVERCOMING NEGATIVE
ATTITUDES TOWARD SCHOOL MUSIC

THESIS

Presented to the Graduate Council of the
North Texas State College in Partial
fulfillment of the Requirements

For the Degree of

MASTER OF SCIENCE

By

193287
Edith W. Faires, B. S.

Jacksboro, Texas
August, 1951
TABLE OF CONTENTS

LIST OF TABLES ................................................. Iv
LIST OF ILLUSTRATIONS ................................. v

Chapter

I. INTRODUCTION ............................................. 1

Statement of the Problem
Significance of Study
Definition of Terms
Limitations
Source of Data and Method of Treatment
Organization of the Study

II. A BRIEF ANALYSIS OF THE OBJECTIVES AND
PRACTICES OF TEACHING MUSIC ................. 8

Introduction
Practices in the Traditional School
Recommendations of Music Educators
Practices in the Modern School

III. A COMPARISON OF PROCEDURES WITH TWO
GROUPS OF CHILDREN ................................ 15

A Comparison of the Two Groups
Description of the Program in the
"Free Group"
Description of the Program in the
"Controlled Group"
An Evaluation of Changes in Attitudes

IV. ACTIVITIES IN SPECIAL INTEREST GROUPS ....... 47

Factors Associated with Causes
Activities in the Inaccurate-Singer
Group
Activities in the Rhythmic Group

V. SUMMARY, CONCLUSIONS, RECOMMENDATIONS ........ 59

Summary
Conclusions
Recommendations

BIBLIOGRAPHY ................................................. 63
LIST OF TABLES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Scores on Forms A and B of the <em>Silence Attitude Test</em> in the &quot;Free Group&quot;</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Scores on Forms A and B of the <em>Silence Attitude Test</em> in the &quot;Controlled Group&quot;</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>Distribution of Scores on Each Form of the <em>Silence Attitude Test</em> in Each Group</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>Scores of Twelve Inaccurate-Singers made before and after Experiment</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td>Number of Pupils in the Inaccurate-Singers Group who gave response to each question in each test</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure</td>
<td>Description</td>
<td>Page</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Simple Note Values, Using a Song Title and a Pupil's Name</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Simple Step to Introduce Two-Part Singing</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Introducing Simple Two-Part Song Writing</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Use of Long and Short Lines to Indicate the Entrances of Instruments</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Notation for Rhythm Band</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Placing of Couples for Dance</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Findings of the Lyon Elementary Rhythm Test</td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CHAPTER I

INTRODUCTION

Statement of the Problem

The purpose of this study is to determine some probable effects of certain procedures in overcoming negative attitudes toward school music and to show the possibilities of locating and eliminating some of the factors associated with children's difficulties in music.

The problem stated represents a study of diagnostic and corrective procedures through demonstration and the use of research and was chosen as a practical problem urgently in need of solution. This compilation includes some actual experiments which were conducted to determine the effect of certain school-music procedures upon children's learning and upon their attitudes.

The objective of the study is to show, through demonstration and the use of case studies, that music can be enjoyed by most boys and girls.

Podolsky thinks that music exerts pleasant effects upon the sound of mind and also upon the mentally sick.1

---

1 Edward Podolsky, Music for Your Health, p. 7.
During a two-semester period, seventy-six pupils in the sixth grade of the Jacksboro (Texas) Elementary School were selected for study. All of the pupils took part in the regular class period activities; some few of the seventy-six engaged in specific group activities.

Significance of Study

Teachers must be on guard against believing that there is always one "best" method of teaching anything. The act of teaching a course does not merely inform the student but also arouses pleasure or distaste for the subject. Every child acquires attitudes as well as facts.

Barclay says that:

Among the many qualifications which are significant in their effect upon children's attitudes are that a teacher "enjoys her job and likes her pupils; sees things from the pupil's point of view; is interested in pupils' interests and activities; and possesses sufficient self-restraint to allow pupils to think through their own problems." 2

The fact that our schools have boys with negative attitudes toward music proves that music has not always been vital in the past.

Davison believes that the exaggeration of drill in music-reading is responsible for much of musical lethargy, since by this drill we have literally destroyed the natural love of music in multitudes of children. 3

2 Dorothy Barclay, "Influences of Teachers on Attitudes," New York Times, June 18, 1950, p. 36.

3 Archibald T. Davison, Music Education in America, p. 47.
Holmes' recent experiment challenged the music program by her findings on the popularity of music which is fifth, sixth, or seventh among the subjects liked best in the various grades. 4

Many teachers have been guilty of teaching music -- not children. All too true is the addage, "The success of any school music work lies chiefly with the grade school teacher." Because music offers a wide variety of interests and has many phases embodied in it, the teacher should be able to find some part of it that will appeal to the pre-adolescent boy or girl.

Interest on the part of the author in the needs of children who were antagonistic toward music, who had a voice problem, or who displayed an evident dislike for singing, arose from the fact that she was confronted by their difficulties in her experience as a teacher.

Heretofore, this teacher had done little to solve these difficulties for two different reasons. In the first place, most of the unscheduled time at school was spent in activities with a chorus and a tonette band. In the second place, the number of children needing special help in all the grades were such that one could not hope to give each child individual attention.

Meanwhile, from year to year, conditions concerning negative attitudes and inaccurate singers did not improve. It was assumed that the greatest number of difficulties arose from the reaction of certain pupils, and it was decided to experiment with some sort of group project in their behalf. The testing and re-testing program which was a small part of the experiment was undertaken as a means of measuring the possible abilities and probable progress of individual children in the group.

Definition of Terms

An understanding of the experiment and procedures in this demonstration will depend upon definitions of some terms. Certain words have a limited and specific meaning in this study.

The "free group" is thought of as a psychologically planned one wherein the children had an opportunity to choose, plan, and modify activities with the guidance of the teacher.

The "controlled group" is thought of as a logically planned one wherein drills and routine were provided. The teacher chose, planned, and modified the activities.

"Creative activities," as considered by the average music teacher not too many years ago, were restricted to the creating of melodies with words, or the construction of instruments on which original melodies might be played. In this project, a broader meaning will be given to the term. For the child,
creating is the developmental process of putting together materials which express ideas, feelings, and experiences of the learner. Teachers cannot teach creative processes; they can only provide opportunities for growth. They must be able to guide cautiously, praise fairly, criticize kindly, recognize all effort, and avoid imposing adult standards.

"Negative attitudes" will be referred to as unpleasant feelings or reactions toward certain phases of music. Suppose the child says he hates music or attempts to throw his book out the window. Attitudes are emotionally colored ideas.

The term "inaccurate singers" refers to all boys and girls with unchanged voices who were unable to carry the tune of a familiar song. A standard for the selection of such a singer was that he varied as much as one whole step from the proper tune.

Limitations

It was thought best to continue the study over as long a period of time as possible so that a maximum of probable progress might be observed. By this method of selection, the time span was fixed at two school terms of four and a half months each.

The experiment was undertaken in two sixth-grade music classes of the Jacksboro Elementary School, which has an approximate enrollment of 555 students and employs the services of two school music teachers in addition to the instrumental music teacher.
Seventy-six pupils were chosen for investigation; all of these met in regular music classes held every day for thirty-minute periods. The specific activity groups were segregated into two groups and each met twice each week for twenty-minute sessions.

A limited time was given to the testing and re-testing program that furnished the data from which some of the conclusions were drawn. Since music in the curriculum was a comparatively new thing, no music ability tests were administered; a prognostic test tends to show more native ability than does an achievement test, and this study was fundamentally interested in native talent.

It is proposed to devote some effort to a comparison of the psychological practices of teaching music in the traditional school and in the modern school.

Source of Data and Method of Treatment

The data for this study vary in source from periodicals, pamphlets, a few recently published books, tests, to actual demonstrations.

Every effort has been made to keep the procedure objective and the method was characterized by (1) reference to actual class work, (2) an effort to discover rather than to prove, and (3) a quest for more inclusive generalizations. Specific examples are given as illustrations of the included data. The special group work has been the most tangible aid in
completing this study. These cases offer evidence of the value of meaningful motivation in a school music class.

Many short articles on the study have been helpful in trying to keep the information scientific as well as factual.

The objective testing was accomplished by administering Form A and Form B of the Ella B. Silance A Scale for Measuring Attitudes Toward any School Subject. The Lyon's Elementary Rhythm and Pitch Test was also used.

The informal tests were devices worked out by the investigator and will be fully explained in succeeding chapters.

Organization of the Study

Chapter II deals with a brief analytical survey of the objectives and practices in teaching school music, both in the traditional and in the modern school. A short review of the recommendations of music educators is included along with a comparison of the psychological practices of teaching in the traditional school and in the modern or "good" school.

Chapter III gives the plans, steps, interests, and evaluation of the demonstration with the "free group" and the "controlled group." The test data, including figures and tables, are fully stated and explained.

Chapter IV deals with the program of the special interest groups, one of inaccurate singers and one of inaccurate rhythm.
CHAPTER II

A BRIEF ANALYSIS OF THE OBJECTIVES AND
PRACTICES OF TEACHING MUSIC

Introduction

Today music educators are fully aware that elementary school music should be for all the children of all the people -- for the masses. That children shall discover music as enjoyable is the very heart of the program. On this hinges its success or failure. Therefore, in general, one should make the music period one of enjoyment -- a period of discovery.

Practices in the Traditional School

In the older education, difficulty was often emphasized. If a subject was also disagreeable, so much the better. Anything like original expression on the child's part was bad, because he was usually teacher-dominated. An attempt was made to "store" the memory and to "train" the intellect.

Mursell believes that no teacher can effectively make a pupil work hard. One can be made to go unhappily through the motions. However, he does not argue for the elimination of all formal drill, but he does insist that it be concomitant with the actual experience of musical performance and creation.¹

The old music curriculum, departmentalized and aloof, attempted to impart a series of logically organized lessons which were adult-planned. The schedule operated on routine and squeezed music into twenty minutes each day.

The teacher often brought the music of Bach or Brahms before the children and insisted, "This is good, therefore you should learn to like and understand it." Gaps are bound to exist between the child's understanding and taste and the adult's conception of what the child should enjoy.

In the traditional school tests and measurements of achievement are used as checks upon the individual student's ability to meet requirements, or his failure to do so. In this respect music is not different from other subject matter. Oftentimes, the teacher is so tied up with specialized music courses, open only to a talented few, she may have no opportunity to work with the large group in other areas of music.

As evidenced in recent articles in music teachers' magazines, traditional musical practices lack a carry-over into life outside the school. The mastery of technical problems or skills in music is not the aim of the music program. Adherence on the part of the music teacher to a particular method, probably drills, produces negative attitudes toward music.

Factual knowledge and ability to perform were the only evidences of progress. In this traditional way, there is a feeling that music is for the especially talented rather
then a means of expression and enjoyment for all. This method excluded a large part of any school group.

If music educators cannot by the end of the grammar grades produce in quantity what they have been striving for, likely the goal is wrong. School music teachers devote far too much time to technique and not enough to music itself. 2

Recommendations of Music Educators

The worker in the field of music education should have no qualms at all about saying that one of his chief aims is to arouse a living and continuing interest in the art of music, and in setting out to do so in the most realistic possible way. . . . There is no better opportunity anywhere in the school than that afforded by the music program for applying the doctrine of interest which is rooted in popular demand. 3

Mursell thinks the aims of school music are:

1. Music in the schools affords the young people constructive and convincing experiences of a democratic type.
2. School music can and should be keyed to provide people with a means of recreation which can last throughout their lives.
3. The teaching of music in school may lead to the discovery of talent. 4

The ideal program in music education will require the blending of two points of view: the vision of the educator who brings the principles of general child development to bear on music, and the sensitized consciousness of the musician who sees the development of the child through the agency of music as the paramount aim in music education. 5

2Arthur Ward, Music Education for High School, p. 22.
3Mursell, Music in the American School, p. 19.
4Ibid., pp. 23-25.
5Beatrice Perham, Music in the New School, p. 36.
Commonly we judge the effectiveness of the school program in terms of the success of pupils upon certain written examinations, upon standardized tests, or upon the grades which they make. These things may show us the amount of information which the students have remembered, they may indicate the degree to which the students have developed the simple skills, but they rarely include any evidence of changes in habits, in attitudes, in effective work and study procedures, or in interests.

The music teacher has a job because the American public has come to want music for its children. It often seems wrong and discouraging to base one's teaching upon a consideration of the wishes and attitudes of those being taught. Therefore, the teacher must discriminate between well-intentioned and selfish pressures. Musical development depends, above everything else, upon valid and convincing musical experiences.

The philosophy which underlies their book is thus stated by Dykema and Gehrken's:

"Because participation and growing skill in music is a joyful and satisfying experience which lifts the individual to a higher level of satisfaction than is provided by most of life and therefore increases the sum-total of human happiness."

The music teacher, if he is to be successful in a real sense, must believe that music exalts and is a life-giving force in education. He must realize that music is taught for what it can contribute to the child and not what the child

---

6 Ibid., p. 153.
can contribute to music -- the teacher must carry music to the masses.

"There is no one wholly unresponsive to the elevating appeal of music. If only the right contacts and experiences are provided, every life can find in music some answer to its fundamental need for aesthetic and emotional outlet. Education fails of its cultural objectives unless it brings to every child the consciousness that his own spirit may find satisfying expression."

Practices in the Modern School

Modern education is concerned with the development of favorable attitudes and growing interests. Today education says: teach the child to be resourceful, to think for himself, to meet new situations with self assurance; provide him with opportunities to learn through discovery and insight.

The good school recognizes the value of a rich and challenging environment. To offer such opportunities, the teacher must see that music is both a bodily and a mental experience. Therefore, musical experiences, rather than lessons, are necessary in developing children's attitudes so that their interest will continue to grow for a long time after they have left school. Their interest and creativity must not be thwarted and killed by too much skill and technique emphasis.

Wheeler and Perkins state that, "the very essence of learning is not in repeating a performance, but in making a

---

new one." The new education emphasizes that pupils themselves should have a share in the planning of activities, in the selection of their materials, and in evaluating their experiences. The values of teacher-pupil planning have been tested and approved by the foremost educators of the day. Skills and techniques should be taught only when the need for them arises.

A check list for evaluating the modern music program might be:

1. How does the music program work toward the general philosophy of the school?

2. Are there evidences that the children understand the social use of music, in the past and at present?

3. Are the children vitally interested in what is going on?

4. To what extent is there whole-hearted participation in all phases?

5. What are the evidences of the development of good work habits?

6. What are the evidences of the children's use of music as a means of self-expression?

7. Are teachers building readiness for further growth in music?

8. What are the things we do in music which some children actively dislike?

---

Davison states that the indifferent attitude displayed by many young people toward music is wholly incomprehensible until one has made an examination of the aim, methods, and materials of modern American music education.¹⁰

All eight of the vital questions enumerated in the foregoing check list were incorporated in the procedures used in the free groups. In a sense they were the criteria.

¹⁰ Davison, op. cit., p. 8.
CHAPTER III

A COMPARISON OF PROCEDURES WITH TWO
GROUPS OF CHILDREN

A Comparison of the Two Groups

For each pupil enrolled, the Jacksboro Elementary School keeps a class analysis chart based upon the Metropolitan Achievement Test, Intermediate Battery. The purposes of this test are:

1. In general terms: the intent is that it shall contribute to a better understanding of the pupils in the class, both as individuals and as contributing members of the class as a group.

2. In specific terms: identifying the individual pupils who are in need of special attention because they are significantly above or below the class norm.

With the aid of the principal, the investigator checked each analysis chart of the pupils in both the "free group" and the "controlled group" and found the groups almost equally divided in ability, rate of achievement, social status, and economic status.

Similarities and differences of groups---The "free group" and the "controlled group" were alike in that:

1. Each group was composed of thirty-eight members of the sixth grade.
2. Both groups met in regular music classes for thirty-minute periods each school day.

3. In each group there were boys who had negative attitudes toward music, and some inaccurate singers.

4. Both groups were enrolled in regular classes in the same school and were under the same administration and the same school environment.

5. As shown by the Class Analysis Charts of the Metropolitan Achievement Tests, each group was almost equally divided in ability, in achievement, and in an equal distribution of economic and social status.

6. Each group shared equally in the type of academic studies offered and in the materials used.

7. In both groups were found musically gifted students who excelled in most of the activities undertaken.

The "controlled group" and the "free group" were different in some respects:

1. Each group had a different classroom teacher.

2. Certain psychological practices were exerted upon the "free group"; certain teacher-dominated practices were forced upon the "controlled group."

3. There was reason to think that the "free group," as a whole, was more capable of doing work requiring initiative.

4. More "discipline problems" were evident in the "controlled group."
5. In the "free group" there were two very unusual boys. One was a cripple and pampered at home; the other was the victim of a broken home.

Description of the Program in the Free Group

This group was thought of as a psychologically planned one wherein the teacher used all possible methods and devices to create a purposeful setting and to maintain the interest of the learner in time of difficulties. Both individuals and groups were led to criticize their own results — many devices were invented to encourage self-criticism.

The teacher took into consideration the fact that the pupil was a human being with desires, moods, and physical limitations; it was also realized that this particular subject was likely only an incident in the student's busy life instead of a dominating interest.

Richter says that the teacher's problem is to cope with the child's imaginative instincts, and through control direct him to tangible results.¹

Fine teaching was considered a leading, a guiding, and a social process. Two important functions were: first, to get the pupil to the point where he wanted to learn; second, to guide the learning process so that it would have desirable outcomes.

¹Ada Richter, "Imagination, the Key to the Child's Musical Interest," *Etude*, LXVII (January-December, 1949).
Along with the pupil's "felt needs," the teacher considered his moods, attitudes, interests, and physical capacities. However, a certain amount of systematic and efficiency was observed, else the teacher would have had no position.

Power rather than knowledge was the goal.

This is what my rural children have taught me: music must be fun and in order that it be fun, the children must have a feeling of achievement. 2

An effort was made to offer challenging musical environment which causes music learning to occur many times during the day, especially for individuals. In an integrated program, music goes on in many situations without the necessity of having the music teacher present. Many cues for much of the work were taken from individual and group interests. Much more opportunity was afforded for individual learning.

All traditional standards of achievement were disregarded. Much thought was given to recognizing, within the same group, the meager musical ability of some children and the unusual ability of others; challenging both types and realizing that both types have something to contribute to their group. Emphasis was on the attitude toward music. Therefore, the stress was upon what the pupil did rather than on what the teacher did.

The teacher was accepting in her attitude and sympathetic with the pupil when he had difficulties; but she was also firm

---

and insisted that when a worthwhile task had once been started, it must not be left until it was finished. The pupils worked happily, learning facts and skills, developing ideals and attitudes, the things that best survive the ravages of time. The music class was considered the best place for original and physical expression, and for the child to learn to subordinate his personal desires to the best interest of the group.

Little concern was given to "efficient, time-saving" devices. No prepared outlines were rigidly followed. Planned by the pupils and the teacher were experiences and activities that took the child at his own level and developed him at a pace determined by his own capacity. Over-training, which causes strain, was avoided. Uppermost in the teacher's mind was the concept of the child's being educated through the phases of music rather than his being trained to perform.

Sight reading was considered a functional part of the activities and not a special problem; it was a means of growth that developed as the child saw a need for it, and was accepted as a matter of course.

Especially striven for was a true appreciation of music as an outgrowth of first-hand experiences in music; however, these experiences demanded concentration on many types of music which became a means of child-development and creative expression for all, rather than for the talented ones only.

In order to give a richer background, a variety of books were used; the children followed the belief that it is more
fun for two or three children to look on the same book and
have three or four different kinds of books to use, than for
every child to have the same, but only one book. It is true
that a non-adherence to a text helps free the teacher for
creative ways of working.

The teacher felt that the ultimate goal in activities
was that the children worked together intently, talked with
the teacher and sang informally grouped in a circle—they
were learning with the sympathetic guidance of the teacher.
Skills were taught as they grew out of the needs and problems
of the children. Not all the skills were mastered by all the
children because needs and interests differed so widely.

Other ideas used to create interest were:

1. Provide material for both below and above the grade
level.

2. Do not give every child the same to do, regardless
   of his ability.

3. Have extra material available for children to use at
   odd times.

4. Have extra, challenging activities for those who
   finish early.

5. Give a short drill on diction.

6. Never condemn when the child has difficulties.

7. Find the "psychological moment" for assigning lessons,
or allow the children to suggest lessons.
History and music.---Dykema states that connections between music and other subjects exist only when one or more elements are found in both. 3

Whether paddling canoes down rivers, worshipping in a New England meeting house, setting up colonial homes, carrying forward social customs of the Old World, building roads through a wilderness, riding in covered wagons, or Christianizing the Indians, they sang. 4

Music has social, cultural, and aesthetic, as well as nationalistic, values; and because of this fact it can be correlated with any phase or period. If the study in history is centered in the Colonial Period, the music under consideration must actually belong to that particular period of time. Progress, prosperity, or depression of a nation are all pictured for us by the music composed as outcomes of life experiences.

In the history class a song might help to make concrete the general idea of the period, resulting in group performance of different phases of music. Here something begins and ends for all. Poor attitudes are seldom the result, and resentment among pupils is absent; while on the other hand, an inferiority complex has been avoided.


4 H. G. Kinscella, History Sings, p. 3.
The Colonial Period in American life was filled with strength, energy, and ideas, and it was all pictured in the music of the people -- their songs, their fiddle tunes, and their dances. Music expressed their feelings in work, love and laughter.

The "free group" used an enriched program of music integration with history, with creative music, with instruments, and with rhythms. The teacher realized that all old music, once modern, is dead until it comes to life again in our modern times and adds to our enjoyment of the present.

Both the "free group" and the "controlled group" were studying about the Colonial Period. The activities related will pertain mostly to this period, since time and space will not permit the relating of all the procedures of the "free group."

There was much discussion, reading, and dramatic play about Indians. The children began to discover Indian songs, Indian dances, and methods of making Indian signals upon drums. Soon the entire group was busy dramatizing, improvising, making instruments, writing melodies, singing and introducing ideas. The activities experienced will be discussed under their separate headings:

I. Listening:

Records used included:

5All recordings are listed in the Victor Catalogue.
Number
20447
22174
20342
20152
2035

Name
Miss McCollum's Reel
Money Musk
Old Dan Tucker
Pop Goes the Weasel
Deer Dance
Butterfly Dance
Shuffling Feet
Turkey in the Straw
From an Indian Lodge
Duke of Marlborough
Crusader Hymn
Tribal Prayer—Wakonda

II. Singing

Some of these songs were memorized, but most of them were just sung and are listed:

The Barn Dance
Turkey in the Straw
Market Day
Santa Lucia
Go, Tell It on the Mountain
Indian Echo Song
The Festival

Long, Long Age
A Pledge
America the Beautiful
Washington
Columbus
Song of the Happy Farmer

The song, Yankee Doodle, was almost the only one widely used, and the class chose it as a theme song of the time directly preceding and following the Revolutionary War. From the original verses, the children wrote the song into drama form. Four children managed the choosing of characters and the stage setting. Six or seven did the acting while the
remaining members of the class sang. Later, many instruments were used in the group. Several of the boys were chosen to be the Indians who spied upon the settlers from behind rocks and trees. At this stage of action, six "artists" from the fifth grade were invited to sketch different scenes of the drama. Amazing results were evident. Two of the boys checked in the library to find pictures of the big guns used in that period.

Next, the children created their own verses to fit the tune of Yankee Doodle. This activity produced exceptional results, because some of the originals were then dramatized. Several stories, based upon the study, were written. Two girls were anxious to set some words to music. A phrase was chosen from an individual story and the second line was added by the class.

The pupils started by chanting the lines many times to the accompaniment of the drum. When the teacher asked for a melody for the first phrase, several volunteered. The class sang over each suggested melody and voted on the one they thought was best. Then the group sang that phrase together and several children helped to add the next phrase. A few days later the children asked to write down their own song. A staff was drawn on the board and the words were written underneath. Through the use of syllables, the highest and lowest notes were found and the class decided to begin the song on the
third space. Then they located "do" and sang as a pupil
placed whole notes in the correct position on the staff.
While the class sang again, other pupils marked the accents
that formed the measures. The next step was to determine the
key signature and give the notes their proper values. When
the song was completed, each child made his own copy from the
board. A committee was chosen to make a large copy to be
placed on the bulletin board.

The class also wrote an Indian lullaby, a hymn, and a cow-
boy song, using the same procedure.

Often the class played a music game. "Helpers" passed
cardboard staves and an envelope of eight colored notes to
each boy and girl. The teacher told them where to place "do"
and then sang a tune while the class placed the notes where
they belonged. Each tune was sung twice; the second time each
pupil checked his work by pointing to the notes and singing
with the group. After a few minutes a pupil was chosen to
lead the game and he, in turn, chose someone else. Several
were astonished to find that tunes were so easy to build.

An introductory step in using note values is shown in
Figure 1. Here, again, the title Yankee Doodle was used. It
must be remembered that the children in this group had been
taught school music for only one year preceding the experi-
ment. Their ability to associate syllables with notes was
meager. Each child's name, in turn, was "set to notes" and
4 Yankee Doodle | Keep it up
or
4 Tommy Grey | Wants to help

Fig. 1.--Simple note values, using a song title and a pupil's name.

soon a large number of children, especially girls, were fitting some of their original verses to rhythm.

After the children used the simple quarter notes as a setting for titles and pupil names, the same song was next introduced in its correct form. Only two measures of each singing-part will be used to illustrate the simple step in learning to sing and write two-part singing:

![Musical notation]

Yankee Doodle Keep it up Yankee Doodle Dandy

Fig. 2.--Using a simple step to introduce two-part singing.

The boys were surprised to find that singing the "alto" was not a difficult task when done merely as a continuation of the melody. When this simple step was learned, the teacher helped suggest that the same song be written in the normal two-part form, using intervals of thirds.
Shown below is the final example of only four measures:

```
\[ \begin{array}{cccc}
| & | & | & | \\
\hline
E & E & E & E \\
\hline
\end{array} \]
```

Yan-kee Do-o-dle Keep it up Yan-kee Do-o-dle Dan-dy

Fig. 3.--The final step in introducing simple two-part song writing.

III. Making Instruments

The idea of the resourcefulness of the Americans after the Revolutionary War was advanced. Here is where the real work began. To keep in tune with the resourceful forefathers, each instrument was to be made from what was "at hand." Small drums, large drums, Indian drums, tambourines, triangles, bells, jingle bells, jingle sticks, and sand blocks appeared almost overnight. Since the children "sounded" their instruments, it was soon evident that some form of simple rhythmic notation needed to be improved. The teacher was asked to help write the notation, and she first made long and short lines to show the entrances of the various instruments. A simple illustration of this will be found in Figure 4. As the children began to understand and use the simple form of notation, the class gradually worked toward a better form. A short illustration of this is given in Figure 5, which follows Figure 4.
Rhythm Sticks 4
---------

Triangles

Bells
Play the tune

Snare Drum

Bass Drum

--- Fig. 4.---Shows the use of long and short lines to indicate the entrances of instruments.

Tambourine

Jingle Bells

Drum

Sticks

--- Fig. 5.---Notation for rhythm band.

A seating arrangement for a rhythm band was drawn and the playing began in earnest. After Yankee Doodle was mastered, other favorite music was used for experimentation. Captain Jinks, Old Dan Tucker, and America were next orchestrated and learned. All concerned, including the teacher, discovered just which instrument should play a particular number, or just the degree of loudness and softness which was
best suited. As a climax to the rhythm playing, the entire
group played their instruments in a short assembly program
and chose a few boys and girls to demonstrate their instru-
ments and play solos.

There was not a child in this group who did not appear
to enjoy playing the instruments. Some of the music used for
this purpose was already notated, but most of it was scored
by the group. Much was done with the group working together
and much individual work was done which was not notated or
recorded, but all was recognized in some way.

IV. The Dances

Much to the surprise of the class, some of the boys who
were usually antagonistic toward music demonstrated different
dances or jig-steps to the rhythm of the theme song, Yankee
Doodle.

The square dance for Yankee Doodle follows:

Music                      Activity

Father and I went down to  Four couples join hands in
camp, Along with Captain  circle and skip four skips to-
Godwin, And there we saw    ward center and four skips back-
the men and boys, as thick   ward. With hands still joined,
as hasty puddin'.         circle eight slips sun-wise

Yankee Doodle keep it up,  around into opposite place.

Four handsh. Girls of head couples
skip forward toward each other,
offer right hand and pass by
right shoulder. They continue
forward and fall into place be-
side the opposite boy, who be-
comes the new partner. Do not
Yankee Doodle dandy,

Mind the music and the step

And with the girls be handy

take hands or turn with the new partner, but fall at once into place at the right side. Use four skips to cross.

Girls of side couples cross over.

Boys of head couples cross over taking place beside their original partners.

Boys of side couples cross over.

Note: Dancers are now in original places and standing beside own partners.

Fig. 6.—The placing of couples for a dance of Yankee Doodle.

In creative activities, children discover for themselves answers to problems through experimentation and the application of what they already know to new situations through independent thinking. The teacher must also be an independent thinker; she must dare to be different.

Description of the Program in the "Controlled Group"

This group was thought of as the logically planned one, and the unfolding and developing of subject matter was
uppermost in the teacher's mind. Lessons were keyed to fit the average child. Patterned performances were in vogue and little attention was given to the needs and interests of individual children. The logically planned lessons were designed to cover a definite amount of ground. The teacher presented the problems rather than let them grow out of the musical experiences of the children.

Rigid outlines and courses of study were of importance to the teacher as "time saving" devices and no thought was given to the co-operation of teacher and students themselves. Music was also an isolated subject, requiring special procedures and maintaining an aloof position; emphasis was laid upon more opportunities for the talented students.

The same textbook was used for all the children and the methods of teaching were those found in manuals for teachers.

Lessons in sight-reading were observed on routine, and competition in singing and sight-reading were encouraged. Emphasis was on training to reach adult standards.

Music lessons were divided into segments: for instance, five minutes of rote singing, five minutes of ear-training drills, ten minutes of sight-reading, and two minutes for review of familiar songs -- not an integration of learnings.

The teacher made a fetish of system, became a slave to details of method, and always did a thing in exactly the same way. No single answer can be given to the question, "Why do
so many teachers fail to give adequate attention to the human element, the personal touch, in teaching." 

What the pupil knew was what counted; not what he was or did. The teacher decided what ought to be learned and the better pupils obediently followed. She chose materials which were unattractive musically, but which were good for the children because they contained score-reading problems.

This group followed the usual plan of study, emphasizing sight-singing, notation, syllables, key signatures and going step by step from one skill to another. Much drill and practice were employed. Occasionally, rounds were used to stimulate two-part singing and one classical song was learned to balance each cowboy or folk song introduced. The teacher repeatedly asked for the key signature of songs sung, and "do" was located. Scale building was ritually followed in the individual staff books. The major scale pattern was memorized and steps and half-steps were considered important in the foundation of scale building.

The procedures chosen for this class adhered rather closely to lesson outlines found in teachers' manuals. The class period was begun with tone-blending, drills on diction, and drills associated with the practice of the two-part song. When attacking a new song, the class attempted to sing both parts at once by syllables until a difficult passage demanded drill in one part alone.

---

6Dykema and Gehrken's, High School Music, p. 379.
The pitch names of the lines and spaces were stressed. Sharp chromatics were used in tone-blending drills and in the observation song. The dotted half-note beat was first chosen for time study.

Each month brought more advanced studies in the dotted half-note, more tone drill, and added practice in the pitch names of the lines and spaces. The waltz was the music appreciation topic and appropriate records were used.

New note reading and study songs were introduced using flat chromatics. The names of keys on the piano and the introduction of half-steps and whole-steps were learned by using the diagram in the back cover of the text. The children read stories of Mendelssohn and Schumann and listened to their compositions.

Occasionally rounds were sung to stimulate interest in two-part singing.

The next semester included the study of simple modulation. Again, the procedure suggested in a teacher's manual was followed. Changes of key were noted in the study of "My Heart's in the Highlands" and Market Day. The teacher attempted to give an awareness of key center by helping the children sustain a tone and mentally change the syllables.

Strauss and Mendelssohn were discussed through the singing of their songs and listening lessons. Several horns were introduced, but only through a recording, pictures, and a lengthy oral report.
The teacher continued to use drills at the beginning of each class period. She repeatedly asked for the key signature and for the location of "do". Sometimes at the end of a lesson, there remained time enough for a song chosen by the class.

During the last month the group learned *Sweet the Angelus is Ringing* in two-parts as a memory song and listened to the complete *Nut-Cracker Suite* and studied the life of Brahms.

The activities experienced will be discussed under their separate headings.

I. Listening

The following records were used:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number</th>
<th>Name</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>V-6927</td>
<td><em>Serenade</em>--Schubert</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V-6548</td>
<td><em>Blue Danube Waltz</em>--Strauss</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V-6623</td>
<td><em>Anitra's Dance</em>--Peer Gynt Suite--Greig</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V-35793</td>
<td><em>The Death of Ase</em>--Peer Gynt Suite--Greig</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V-22144</td>
<td><em>War Dance</em>--Skilton</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V-20963</td>
<td><em>Löwer's Wooing</em>--arranged by Carlos Troyer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V-1296</td>
<td><em>Hungarian Dance</em>--Brahms</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

This group also heard three "visiting" singers who presented strictly classical music. High school girls performed and one tenor who had studied in Italy sang for them. He was told of the experiment which was under way and was careful to choose songs appropriate for the existing plan.
II. Singing

Most of the following songs were memorized and all of them were selected by the teacher:

- Forest Peace
- Building a Canoe
- O Worship the King
- Minuet
- Home on the Range
- Amaryllis
- Indian Lullaby
- Long, Long, Ago
- The Crusader's Hymn
- Blue Bells of Scotland
- Sweet the Angelus is Ringing

Voice training received a special emphasis. Boys and girls sang separately once or twice a week.

For boys:
1. Vocalized songs as high as was easy and the compass went down to B-flat or A, below middle C.
2. Sang phrases of words on one tone, beginning with C, third space, and singing down to middle C.
3. Sang songs learned by class: (a) as solos, (b) in unison.

For girls:
1. Vocalized songs, with a forward and very light head quality, up as high as was easy, and then down (not lower than middle C).
2. Sang phrases of words on one tone, as high as was easy, and then down to F, first space.
3. Sang songs learned by class: (a) as solos, (b) in unison.

For boys and girls:
1. Vocalized rounds
2. Vocalized two-part songs
   (a) Boys low, girls high
   (b) Girls low, boys high
   (c) Some boys and girls on each part
   (d) Duets, one boy and one girl on each part

Outcomes of class performance were considered in terms of their contribution to the growth of the individual pupil. The teacher found many opportunities for stressing the importance of good posture, diction, intonation, and tone quality.

III. Rhythm

The following rhythmic activities were extended:

1. The principle of rhythmic development through bodily activity.

2. The study of characteristic national dances.

3. The actual performance of many types of dances which lay a good foundation for discriminative listening. For example, the effective way, was to distinguish between waltzes, minuets, gavotte, polka, mazurka, and bolero.

4. A feeling for musical form and structure was developed.

IV. The Dances

There were no individual demonstrations, but some of the pupils of the group did dances which were appropriate for the rhythmic activities of pupils of their age.

The Indian Dance was mastered:
Music

Star of Evening,
Star of evening,
Look, where yonder she cometh,
Look, where yonder she cometh,
Star of Heaven;
Star of Heaven,
Look, where yonder she cometh,
Look, where yonder she cometh,
Star of Morning,
Star of Morning,
Look, where yonder she cometh,
Look, where yonder she cometh.

Activity

Place right foot to right.
Hop on right.
Hop on right.
Step on left foot to left.
Hop on left.
Hop on left.
Stand with great dignity.
Search the horizon and watch for the first gleam of the evening star.
Slowly lift both arms with index fingers extended. Life arms until star is imprisoned between the extended fingers.
Gaze directly overhead into sky. Turn slowly on spot. Slowly drop arms.
Stand on place, arms at side. With great dignity, search out a friend. Turn only the head. Point slowly up to the star.
Study picture. Take position of dancing Indian in center of picture. With slow high step move first one arm and then the other, bid the Morning Star to rise.
Continue step but use both arms. Turn on spot. Hold imaginary eagle feathers upright in each hand.

An Evaluation of Changes in Attitudes

The objective evaluation of the completed experiment was based on the Ella B. Silance Scale of Attitude Toward Any
School Subject Test. This test was used for comparative purposes before and after a period of experimentation such as has been indicated, and it might direct the attention of the teacher toward the value of musical experiences at the expense of the more mechanical aspects of music. In the opinion of some music educators, this procedure of pursuing mere mechanical aspects is entirely too prevalent in school music teaching. In the field of school music, this test does rightly attempt to measure musical attitudes. It was found serviceable as a standard of comparison from one period of time to another.

The Silence Test squares with the criteria of objectivity, ease of administering and scoring, and alternative forms. It also has a useful and well-prepared manual of directions. It measures up to the criterion of validity less adequately than it measures up to the other criteria; and it ignores knowledge of musical terms, recognition of composers, aural recognition of familiar melodies, and knowledge of composition types.


The testing was an effort to discover rather than to prove. Several factors affected pupil growth within the two
groups: the first tests were not given as early in the year as they should have been given, to find all the progress made; a change of teachers in the "free group" three months before the second tests were given; and the lack of time on the part of the teacher to work with individuals.

The only factor that might have influenced the study was the fact that the teacher could have been influenced by her own feelings toward a particular teaching technique. Other factors that could have influenced such an experiment were: music study with private teachers, parental interest in music, and the emphasis on music in the home.

The scores reported in Table 1 are given exactly as they came from the individual tests.

Facts uncovered in this survey indicate that most of the boys and girls in the "free group" made exceptional improvements in attitudes.

The scores for the two forms of the test given before and after the experiment revealed the changes discussed in the following paragraphs.

Of the two girls who failed to improve, one did not have a native talent for music and the other was absent from school because of illness.

Numbers four, ten, eleven, and fourteen of the boys made great strides in improvement; probably their powers were released through creative activities.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Pupil</th>
<th>Form A</th>
<th>Form B</th>
<th>Gain</th>
<th>Loss</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Boys</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>7.3</td>
<td>8.1</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>7.7</td>
<td>8.3</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>6.5</td>
<td>7.3</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>5.4</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>7.6</td>
<td>7.3</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>7.7</td>
<td>8.2</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>6.1</td>
<td>7.4</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>8.1</td>
<td>8.4</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>6.5</td>
<td>6.3</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>5.8</td>
<td>7.3</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>3.0</td>
<td>5.9</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>7.8</td>
<td>8.6</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>7.4</td>
<td>8.5</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>2.3</td>
<td>6.2</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>7.8</td>
<td>8.5</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>2.2</td>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Girls</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>8.3</td>
<td>8.8</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>8.8</td>
<td>9.1</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>8.4</td>
<td>8.8</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>3.7</td>
<td>3.7</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>7.9</td>
<td>8.2</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>9.0</td>
<td>9.3</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>8.5</td>
<td>8.9</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>7.9</td>
<td>8.3</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>8.1</td>
<td>8.6</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>8.1</td>
<td>8.9</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>8.7</td>
<td>9.3</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>8.4</td>
<td>9.1</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>3.3</td>
<td>9.0</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>8.0</td>
<td>8.0</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>8.3</td>
<td>8.6</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>8.1</td>
<td>9.2</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>8.2</td>
<td>8.1</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>8.0</td>
<td>8.8</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>8.6</td>
<td>8.2</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>8.0</td>
<td>8.9</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21</td>
<td>8.2</td>
<td>8.7</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22</td>
<td>8.4</td>
<td>8.5</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
As shown in Table 1 the boys of the F group made more gain than did the girls of the same group. This might indicate that boys respond better to music integrated with their other interests; or the points in favor of the boys could mean that girls accept formal drill and un-related work more passively than do boys.

In the same group, a few of the pupils made the same score both times and Number Nine made a lower score at the conclusion of the study than he made before it. His score after the experiment is probably more accurate than the one before the experiment, because then he realized what the questions meant and answered each one more accurately.

It is to be noted that in the F group, boys Numbers Nine and Sixteen failed to make any progress. This lack of gain was probably due to the fact that they made so few contributions to the activities, although they apparently received much pleasure from taking part. The degree of improvement was also dependent upon the pupils background.

Of the thirty-eight children of this group, Table 1 indicates that according to the Silance Attitude Test, twenty-nine (or 76 percent) made gains, some of which were excessive. Most of the children who made the greatest gain in attitudes were not the ones who made the greatest progress, in the teacher's opinion, but the ones who made the greatest contributions. The scores reported in Table 2 are given as they came from the files and record the existing attitudes of the "Controlled Group."
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Pupil</th>
<th>Form A</th>
<th>Form B</th>
<th>Gain</th>
<th>Loss</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Boys</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>8.2</td>
<td>8.8</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>8.0</td>
<td>7.3</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>6.2</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>8.4</td>
<td>6.4</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>4.1</td>
<td>5.6</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>2.4</td>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>7.1</td>
<td>5.3</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>6.1</td>
<td>5.2</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>6.3</td>
<td>2.6</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>8.5</td>
<td>7.1</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>8.3</td>
<td>6.9</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>3.3</td>
<td>2.5</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>3.1</td>
<td>3.1</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>4.2</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>8.7</td>
<td>8.9</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>8.1</td>
<td>7.6</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>2.3</td>
<td>2.5</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>2.5</td>
<td>2.4</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Girls</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>8.5</td>
<td>8.4</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>8.5</td>
<td>6.9</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>8.5</td>
<td>6.7</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>5.6</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>7.9</td>
<td>5.9</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>8.3</td>
<td>7.3</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>7.7</td>
<td>4.6</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>9.0</td>
<td>9.2</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>9.7</td>
<td>9.9</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>8.8</td>
<td>8.8</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>7.9</td>
<td>6.8</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>8.2</td>
<td>5.8</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>6.2</td>
<td>6.2</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>7.0</td>
<td>5.2</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>7.0</td>
<td>6.1</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>8.2</td>
<td>6.8</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>7.4</td>
<td>5.7</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>8.3</td>
<td>6.1</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>8.4</td>
<td>3.2</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>7.2</td>
<td>5.7</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
These reported scores were very valuable in determining that the children of the "controlled group" had not made an improvement in attitudes. The scores for the two forms of the test given before and after the experiment revealed the changes discussed in the following paragraphs.

Table 2 reveals a definite loss in the attitudes of the children in the "controlled" or C group. The boys' percentage of loss was greater than that of the girls. The teacher assumed that this condition was due to the fact that girls usually respond more passively than boys to formal routine and drill.

Boy Number One and girls Numbers Eight and Nine made some gain regardless of the methods used. The teacher decided this improvement could be attributed to the fact that these children were musically talented and therefore responded to all music teaching.

Number Four of the girls and Numbers Three, Five, Fourteen and Fifteen of the boys likely registered a gain because they were members of the special interest groups and received individual music training.

Boys Numbers Seventeen and Eighteen of this C group failed to show a gain. Neither of them was in the special interest groups since they had good voices and a good sense of rhythm and pitch recognition. If they could have been in the F group, they most likely would have responded to the procedures used. These two boys were probably the best examples of what effects teaching methods have upon children.
Only eight children (or 21 percent) of the "controlled group" showed any gain and the possible reasons for this have already been explained.

The "controlled group," in all cases except three, made the lowest scores on the test. It is possible that these scores might have been lower except that the children were afraid to give the right responses -- to do so might have affected the marks they received in music. This group remained the weakest part of the test; the objective data presented does show evidence that there was a great loss in the attitudes.

In order to analyze further the attitudes of the two groups at the beginning of the study and to determine the improvement or loss made during the period of study, Table 3 reveals the number of pupils who fell in certain brackets of the Silance Attitude Test.

In the distribution, it is easily seen that there was not much difference in the attitudes of the "free group" and the "controlled group" in the first test. Table 3 also shows that there apparently was a grouping in the upper extreme among the girls. The boys of the "free group" had a tendency to leave the lower extreme on test two; the boys of the "controlled group" remained in the lower extreme.

The subjective evaluation of the experiment was based upon several informal tests, and upon the opinions of two co-workers in music and the classroom teachers of the two groups.
TABLE 3

DISTRIBUTION OF SCORES ON EACH FORM OF THE SILANCE TEST IN EACH GROUP

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Score Range</th>
<th>Form A F Group</th>
<th>Form A C Group</th>
<th>Form B F Group</th>
<th>Form B C Group</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Boys</td>
<td>Girls</td>
<td>Boys</td>
<td>Girls</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.5-9.9</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.0-9.4</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.5-8.9</td>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.0-8.4</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.5-7.9</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.0-7.4</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.5-6.9</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.0-6.4</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.5-5.9</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.0-5.4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.5-4.9</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.0-4.4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5-3.9</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.0-3.4</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5-2.9</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.0-2.4</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.5-1.9</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.0-1.4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td>14</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
These recorded observations have been very valuable in determining whether there was an improvement of attitudes.

Although quality of singing was not a part of this study, the teacher and co-worker judged the singing of the "free group" to be better than that of the "controlled group."

Neither was sight-reading ability an object of study, but it was the opinion of the teacher that the "free group" gained as much or more through actually using the tools of music building to put their songs on paper, and learning to play them than did the "controlled group" in their period of continuous drill.

Besides dealing with facts revealed by the tests, there are more subtle yet tangible bases for measuring pupil growth. These have to do with the community. If music does not reach beyond the classroom, it is not serving the best community interests. This functioning outside of school is one of the surest signs of growth.
CHAPTER IV

ACTIVITIES IN SPECIAL INTEREST GROUPS

Factors Associated with Causes

Inaccurate singers.—There are three main causes of monotonism: undesirable attitudes, lack of tonal imagery, and incoordination of the vocal cords. Other factors greatly influencing these are mentality, physical makeup, health, social adjustment, and home and school environment, both past and present.

Some educators believe that non-singers should be practically non-existent after the second or third year of school.\(^1\)

Many children do not realize the importance of singing each tone exactly on pitch. Too, there are those who feel that they are incapable of singing—timid, aggressive, or socially unadjusted. The source of this maladjustment may be found in an unhappy home environment. In the home, whether the parents are musical and sing, and whether they encourage the children to sing or tell them that they cannot sing are very important factors in developing the child’s musical attitude and ability. Therefore, pre-school training in the home is the basis for good singing.

\(^1\)"Course of Study in Music for Rural Schools," Report No. 19 of the Music Educator's Research Council, Music Educators' National Conference Yearbook (1936), p. 188.
Wright emphasizes the importance of pre-school training:

Monotones are not, therefore, necessarily musical deficiencies, but usually are merely musically retarded because of lack of proper or sufficient musical stimuli previous to school age.2

Usually, only a small number of children from any one grade possess unreliable voices. Among the number of inaccurate singers of the sixth grade of the Jacksboro Elementary School there was a predominance of boys. Whether this is true in other schools is unknown to the investigator. It was believed that the cause of the boys' inability to sing might be due to the anatomy of the voice box. Low voices (indicative of nose and throat trouble), few high voices, hoarseness, huskiness, breathiness, and nasality were common among this group. Adenoids were easily detected through diction in singing and speaking. Another important factor was the child's physical inability to hear and comprehend.

Gehrken says:

... Dull pupils ... will be encouraged to do as well as they can; but will not be treated harshly when they have reached the psychological limit beyond which they cannot go. And if they are not so enthusiastic about music as the others, the teacher will remember that all of us are normally more enthusiastic over something that we can do well than over something in which we are clumsy and uncertain.3

---


Rhythmic weakness.--Probably the most common cause for the lack of a sense of rhythm in children is due to the environment or home training of pre-school boys and girls. Overweight and fast bodily growth may also be causes. After children enter school, the teacher often exploits them in a rhythm band. All of the music time may be spent in practicing the rhythm band because it is expected to perform at every meeting of the P. T. A. Score planning is the responsibility of the teacher; children are not participants in the original scoring.

Activities in the Inaccurate-Singer Group

The selection of this group was based upon such considerations as marked inaccuracy in singing, persistent hoarseness, unusually low range, or a general attitude of apathy.

The first step was the collecting and making of informal tests which would serve as objective data for this special group of children; the plan involved some testing means to serve as a prognostic insight into the native abilities of the children. The scores were not measures of ability but were meant to give some index of the extent to which an individual could be motivated to use the abilities he possessed.

The following explanations will give the reader an understanding of the method used in choosing the children for the group:

"Excellent"--the singing was perfectly in tune.
"Good"—(1) It began on pitch and ended flat but was slightly higher during the progress of the melody; (2) it began below pitch and ended on a pitch not lower than one step below starting tone.

"Average"—The singing could be recognized as an attempt at the melody.

"Low"—Bits of the singing could be distinguished as belonging to the melody but had no real tonality.

"Very Low"—The singing had no recognizable tune.

The teacher tested only those children whose singing was outstandingly inaccurate. Twelve children, nine boys and three girls, were selected for the testing. Each pupil was called into private conference with the teacher and was subjected to the informal test. First, the melody alone was played; then the child sang the song without assistance from the teacher or the piano. In some cases it was necessary either for the teacher to play the melody a second time or for the child to make a second attempt to sing.

The same informal test was again administered, at the end of the second semester, to the same group of twelve children. Table 4 shows the results of Test 1 and Test 2. As shown in the scores of Table 4 all twelve of the deficient singers rated "Low" and "Very Low" on the first test; however, all except four rated higher on the second test. These four did make progress, and with an extension of time for their training period, they would probably have rated higher.
TABLE 4

SCORES MADE BY THE TWELVE INACCURATE SINGERS, BEFORE AND AFTER EXPERIMENT

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Score</th>
<th>Boys</th>
<th></th>
<th>Girls</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Test 1</td>
<td>Test 2</td>
<td>Test 1</td>
<td>Test 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Excellent</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Good</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average</td>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Low</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Very Low</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In order to determine whether the procedure with the "poor-singers" group would have any effect upon the children's attitudes, informal attitude tests were given before the real attempt at improving the singers' voices was begun; at the end of the experiment the same test was repeated. To present the results of these two tests, Table 5 has been made.

All children in the group were encouraged to believe that they could sing accurately if, hand in hand, they and the teacher worked together. The next objective was to find out in which key they could sing with ease. The song, America, was used to locate range of the voice; if the voice was particularly low, the key of G below middle C was tried.

A great deal of time was used in helping the most difficult cases, but the children were not over-worked or allowed
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Questions</th>
<th>Responses</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Very Much</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Test 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Do you like music?</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Do you like to keep time to music?</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Do you like to sing?</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Would you like to play an instrument in a good band?</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Do you hum, whistle or sing while alone?</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Do you like to sing with your home folks the songs you learn at school?</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Do you wish that you had more music at school?</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Do you like to sing, using Do, Re, Mi?</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. Do you enjoy reading stories about music and musicians?</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. Do your friends use school music at out-of-school picnics and parties?</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
to lose interest. "On the Beam" was a game in which the children added their tone as an imaginary radio beam sending its light up and down the rows. All "got on the beam" and sustained the tone by humming until the sign of release was given. Thus refreshed the remaining students began their individual singing again.

Numerous other games were played to help all the children sustain tones, feel the song as a unit, distinguish phrases and understand melodic patterns. "Guess What" was played to help visualize tonal patterns. A phrase of a song was placed on the board and if the children guessed what song it was from, they were allowed to attempt to sing the entire song. The teacher was kept quite busy thinking of different, simple songs to use.

Slow songs with wide skips were easiest for these inaccurate singers. "Taps" sung to the words "Day is Done" was used to sustain tones and give time for listening to and matching of tones. The soft tones and the mood of the song helped to blend all voices.

Sometimes the hand was used as a staff; the little finger was the first line of the staff. Simple songs were played on this staff by placing the right index finger in the spaces or on the lines of the staff as each note of a song was sung. Afterward, the children were encouraged to write the same song on a real staff drawn on the board.
Rounds were also helpful to the inaccurate singer. Often neutral syllables were used instead of words. This procedure permitted all tones to be clearly heard.

The game which was most enjoyed by the children was "Guess Who." The teacher handed out cards reading "yes" or "no." All the children then closed their eyes and listened to the song of the person who had received a "yes" card. The suggestion was made that some might peek; to overcome that problem, all children were asked to form the words with their lips. During this procedure the teacher was busy checking on how well each child formed his words and followed the melody line.

Simple songs were placed on the board, using the number of the tone of the scale to correspond with the tone of the word:

5 3 5 3
Tick, took, tick, took,
Sol, mi, sol, mi,

5 4 3 2 1
Goes the little clock
sol fa mi re do

It is considered necessary that a resume be given of the specific points stressed during the group study:

1. The child was helped to distinguish between high and low tones.

2. He was drilled on matching a specific tone ("match"
means to reproduce vocally the pitch just previously given).

3. Next, the child must match two and then three successive tones.

4. The child then sang a short phrase.

5. Lastly, he must be able to sing short phrases, and then three or one long phrase.

The teacher hoped to follow a procedure which could be used in a functional situation any time, any where, by any teacher.

Activities in the Rhythmic Group

To locate the pupil who lacked a sense of rhythm, the Lyon’s Elementary Rhythm Test, designed for grades four to eight, was administered. From the results of this test, the teacher determined whether the student was especially poor in rhythm recognition.

Ratings of test findings:

"Very Low" indicates the scores made by the lowest ten percent of the group.

"Low" includes the range of scores made by the next highest fifteen percent of the group.

"Average" indicates the range made by the middle fifty percent of the group.

"High" includes the range of scores made by the top fourth of the group, excluding the upper ten percent.

"Very High" indicates the range of scores made by the
top ten percent of the class.

The two groups of children in the sixth grade ranged from "Very Low" to "Very High." The results shown in the "free group" as compared to those shown in the "controlled group" are:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Free Group</th>
<th>Controlled Group</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Very Low</td>
<td>Very Low</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Low</td>
<td>Low</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average</td>
<td>Average</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High</td>
<td>High</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Very High</td>
<td>Very High</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Fig. 7.--Findings of the Lyon Elementary Rhythm Test

As indicated in Figure 6, this group was composed of eight members, six boys and two girls. The method of attack was to give specific and partially individual attention to the rhythmically deficient child during sessions of a special homogeneous group conducted informally and scheduled for a time outside that of the regular class period.

From the standpoint of the teacher, variety of approach to the problem of the rhythmically weak child was important in order to avoid the dullness of monotony in the training period. The plan continually borne in mind was a diagnosis

---

*The pupils chosen for the special rhythmic group.*
and cure by individual attention to children who presented these difficulties.

Establishing correct attitudes and preventing self-consciousness by giving a feeling of success were accomplished by making the activities very informal.

In the beginning each child definitely understood that he could introduce any instrument, bodily movement, music, dance, or whistle in his rhythmic activities; the point stressed and enforced by the teacher was that he must contribute something. The sessions were periods of play in which all must participate.

The first step was to introduce very simple, rhythmic music played on the piano. Some of the boys played tonettes, but their sense of tempo was poor.

The teacher even resorted to a trick introduced by two boys who presented negative attitudes in regular class periods. A hidden wire was stretched under desks. Often during songs the wire was strummed and most of the children attempted to locate it. The hidden wire was transported to the music room and stretched taut. It became an instrument for strumming very simple four-four beats.

One boy used a pop-gun to "pop" on each of the four beats to each measure. A staccato whistle was used on the one and three count of four-four time. Simple marching steps often filled an entire session; the step-slide and hopping was almost mastered.
Surprisingly, the boys created different forms of body-movement; an informal atmosphere prevailed throughout the entire group. There was rabbit dancing, shuffling of feet, and noddings of the head.

Each child was continually made conscious of the fact that he must contribute something and that his contribution could be of vital interest to him. One boy even twirled a rope in time to music. Tongues were clicked to rhythm. Any home-made instrument might be brought to "band."

All in all, the group was a boisterous one, with the teacher taking part. Every contribution and attempt to participate was recognized by the teacher, and the pupils became interested in what the other person was bringing to class.

Near the end of the semester, the same Lyons Elementary Rhythm Test was again administered to this group and the findings for the eight who had previously registered a "Very Low" were: Low, 2; Average, 5; High, 1.

The test was prognostic and not for measurement of actual accomplishments. More particularly its function was to determine whether individuals possessed sufficient possibility of success to warrant giving them special training.

Squire states:

We feel that one should capitalize on the enjoyment children gain from tapping out with a pencil or clapping with their hands the rhythm of the melodies which they sing.  

---

CHAPTER V

SUMMARY, CONCLUSIONS, AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Summary

The purpose of this study was to determine whether certain procedures might possibly overcome negative attitudes in two sixth-grade music classes; to evaluate pupil change in attitudes; and to present evidences that musically deficient children can benefit from special group activities in music.

In Chapter III evidence has been presented to show that there actually was an improvement in the attitudes of the children of the "free group" and a lack of improvement, in reality a loss, in the attitudes of children of the "controlled group." Objective evidence was used where possible; opinions of the teacher and her co-worker had to be used in other cases.

The point of view of this study has been that a program of creative music activity does not mean a disregard for all that is fine in music performance, music understanding, music appreciation, skills, and techniques. It may mean an even higher level of achievement for every child. The change is not in what teachers teach, but in how and when they teach.

Conclusions

No claim is made that this study was pursued under accurate scientific controls. Wherever they could be used, as in
the case of objective tests, they were maintained. Due to the nature of the experiment and to the use of tests yielding subjective data, a scientific summarization is impossible. Therefore, there are no sure means of knowing to what extent success was attained in this particular undertaking.

The following conclusions are based on the data offered in Chapter III and Chapter IV. From the measurable results of the tests given, both at the beginning and at the end of the experiment, there was evidence of growth in children's attitudes and also in their achievement. From the observable results in the "free group" much pleasure, interest, and excitement were derived from the musical activities, and such growth was observed by the administrators and other classroom teachers. The long range results of teaching and learning situations are not always immediately measurable.

Perhaps the most significant outcome of the experiment is the fact that thirty-two of the children did apparently improve in their attitude toward school music. Whether or not the methods used were a major influence, the work done with the children of the "free group" substantiates the idea that the possibilities of a learning situation are greater when pupils see a need and have a purpose for the activities involved.

The procedures and methods used throughout this study were hindered by the necessity of continuing regular class work at the same time that two methods with special groups
were being tried and compared. The experiment was undertaken with the idea of meeting the needs in one particular situation rather than of discovering a method for use in elementary schools in general.

It was also discovered that sympathetic understanding on the part of the teacher and skillful handling of each individual will bring about results in time, unless there is some physical disability. The establishment of correct attitudes and the giving of a feeling of success seemed to prevent self-consciousness. Any corrective measures should be very informal and given in connection with the child's attitude. Therefore, it is concluded that a definite relationship does exist between the pupil's contribution to music and the pupil's attitude.

Improvement on the child's part takes time. Success should not be given up if it fails to appear early. Limits should not be set as to how much improvement may be expected of children who are deficient in rhythm or pitch.

It is believed that if the "inaccurate singers" are corrected in the primary grades, the habit of poor singing will be less well-established and the corrections will be easier.

If, however, some reach the intermediate grades uncorrected, at least some special group training should be given them.

In conclusion it appears that the twenty minutes given three days a week to special groups were valuable in the
correction of the rhythmically weak children and the inaccurate singers.

Recommendations

It is recommended that more thought be given by the teacher to the methods of presenting all phases of music for more effective results. The administration should, if possible, allow the music teacher an extra amount of time to be used for conferences, voice training, ensemble work, and various other procedures which would be of benefit to the pupils.

A school music program which concerns itself with the development of favorable attitudes toward music must afford a wide variety of musical activities.

It is also recommended that music be made more functional and vital in the lives of children, because music that is important to them will be used outside of school, and the society in which they live will profit.
BIBLIOGRAPHY

Books


Articles


Gehrken, Karl W., "Courses of Study in Music for Grades 1, 2, 3," Music Educators National Conference, 1936.


Richter, Ada, "Imagination, the Key to the Child's Musical Interest," LXVII, 467.


Reports


Tests


Silence, Ella B., A Scale for Measuring Attitude Toward any School Subject, Form A and B, edited by H. H. Rammers of Purdue University, Lafayette, Indiana.