AD/AP/Tech.Note No. 8

ACCELERATOR DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT

BROOKHAVEN NATIONAL LABORATORY
Associated Universities, Inc.
Upton, New York 11973

Accelerator Physics Technical Note No. 8

"ACCELERATOR PHYSICS CODE COMPARISON"

Zohreh Parsa

October 1987

ACCELERATOR PHYSICS CODE COMPARISON

Zohreh Parsa

Brookhaven National Laboratory

Upton, New York 11973

ABSTRACT

We present a comparison between results obtained from accelerator physics codes used in the design and analysis of accelerators.

I. INTRODUCTION

Comparison of accelerator codes have been the topic of investigation and speculation by many (for sample notes on code comparisons see past issues of the Proceedings of Accelerator conferences). There are several beam optics programs that have been considered as standard codes for design and analysis of accelerators. For example, we have used programs SYNCH (as standard) and MAD for the design and analysis of the AGS - Booster and the proposed Super Conducting Super Collider (SSC).

In Section II, we Tabulate the parameters obtained from the recent Vax - Version of SYNCH* (Table I) for comparison with those obtained from program MAD - Versions 6.01 (Table II) and 4.03 (Table III) for the same sample (AGS - Booster) lattice. Comparison of the parameters in Tables I-III (e.g. items 6) shows a good agreement between the values of the tune shifts (Q_x, Q_z), lattice functions etc. for $\Delta(P)/P = 0$ but somewhat differs for $\Delta(P)/P \neq 0$. The difference become larger when the sextupoles (e.g. Eddy Current) are included in the input lattices since they are handled differently by these programs.

Table II, was obtained using the recent Vax Version of SYNCH* which includes the correction to the chromaticity calculation that was not included (and was inaccurate) in the CDC and previous VAX versions of SYNCH. The effect of the chromaticity calculation correction is two fold:

- 1) In finding the closed orbit for off momentum, CDC - Version produces the wrong bending angles except for zero - gradient rectangular magnet.
- 2) In computing chromaticity for bending magnets with nonzero exit and entrance angle one term in the chromaticity formula had the wrong sign, resulting in the wrong sextupole strength correction.

Thus, we recommend the use of the parameters obtained from the corrected Version of SYNCH for the design, analysis or code comparison, since the data produced from the CDC Version of SYNCH is inaccurate.

In conclusion, the parameters obtained from several beam optics programs agree for $\text{DELTA}(P)/P = 0$, but there still are differences in the results obtained from programs SYNCH [1] and MAD [2] for $\text{DELTA}(P)/P \neq 0$.

Acknowledgement

We thank Dr. E. Courant for the information on SYNCH and note that, this code comparison was made at his recommendation for the presentation at the Oct. 15, 1987 A.P. meeting.

* available in BNLDAG::DUA0:[PARSA1.SYNCH]SYNSEP.EXE

[1]. A. A. Garren, principal author.

[2]. F. C. Iselin, principal author.

TABLE I

SYNCH VAX - Version 987

SYNCH RUN BST

AGS-BOOSTER

14-OCT-87 15:40:17

1. $\Delta(P)/P = -0.0100$:

CIRCUMFERENCE =	201.6976 M	QX =	4.87006	QY =	4.88460
		QX' =	-5.03758	QY' =	-5.60968
		THETX =	6.28318530 RAD		
		THETY =	0.00000000 RAD		
RADIUS =	32.1012 M				
(DS/S)/(DP/P) =	0.0393852				
MAXIMA	BETX(21) =	13.84289	BETY(18) =	13.65464	
DX(35) =	3.00980	DY(52) =	0.00000		
MINIMA	BETX(18) =	3.50410	BETY(47) =	3.63202	
DX(1) =	0.44193	DY(52) =	0.00000		
MAXIMA	XCO(1) =	-4.89001	YCO(52) =	0.00000	
MINIMA	XCO(35) =	-29.66112	YCO(52) =	0.00000	

2. $\Delta(P)/P = -0.00800$:

CIRCUMFERENCE =	201.7137 M	QX =	4.85992	QY =	4.87337
		QX' =	-5.01543	QY' =	-5.54011
		THETX =	6.28318530 RAD		
		THETY =	0.00000000 RAD		
RADIUS =	32.1037 M				
(DS/S)/(DP/P) =	0.0399131				
MAXIMA	BETX(21) =	13.84715	BETY(18) =	13.65237	
DX(35) =	2.99672	DY(52) =	0.00000		
MINIMA	BETX(18) =	3.51844	BETY(47) =	3.64632	
DX(52) =	0.46227	DY(52) =	0.00000		
MAXIMA	XCO(52) =	-3.99552	YCO(52) =	0.00000	
MINIMA	XCO(35) =	-23.70182	YCO(52) =	0.00000	

3. $\Delta(P)/P = -0.00600$:

CIRCUMFERENCE =	201.7300 M	QX =	4.84985	QY =	4.86229
		QX' =	-4.99358	QY' =	-5.47090
		THETX =	6.28318530 RAD		
		THETY =	0.00000000 RAD		
RADIUS =	32.1063 M				
(DS/S)/(DP/P) =	0.0404352				
MAXIMA	BETX(21) =	13.85156	BETY(18) =	13.65018	
DX(35) =	2.98438	DY(52) =	0.00000		
MINIMA	BETX(18) =	3.53273	BETY(47) =	3.66060	
DX(52) =	0.48223	DY(52) =	0.00000		
MAXIMA	XCO(52) =	-3.05855	YCO(52) =	0.00000	
MINIMA	XCO(35) =	-17.75746	YCO(52) =	0.00000	

4. $\Delta(P)/P = -0.00400$:

CIRCUMFERENCE =	201.7465 M	QX =	4.83984	QY =	4.85137
		QX' =	-4.97202	QY' =	-5.40198
		THETX =	6.28318530	RAD	
		THETY =	0.00000000	RAD	
RADIUS =	32.1089 M	GAMMA(TR)=(	4.94155,	0.00000)	
(DS/S)/(DP/P)=	0.0409518				
MAXIMA	BETX(21) =	13.85613	BETY(18) =	13.64807	
DX(35) =	2.97275	DY(52) =	0.00000		
MINIMA	BETX(18) =	3.54698	BETY(47) =	3.67487	
DX(52) =	0.50183	DY(52) =	0.00000		
MAXIMA	XCO(52) =	-2.07984	YCO(52) =	0.00000	
MINIMA	XCO(35) =	-11.82661	YCO(52) =	0.00000	

5. $\Delta(P)/P = -0.00200$

CIRCUMFERENCE =	201.7632 M	QX =	4.82989	QY =	4.84061
		THETX =	6.28318530	RAD	
		THETY =	0.00000000	RAD	
RADIUS =	32.1116 M	GAMMA(TR)=(	4.91098,	0.00000)	
(DS/S)/(DP/P)=	0.0414633				
MAXIMA	BETX(21) =	13.86084	BETY(18) =	13.64603	
DX(35) =	2.96178	DY(52) =	0.00000		
MINIMA	BETX(18) =	3.56119	BETY(47) =	3.68911	
DX(52) =	0.52109	DY(52) =	0.00000		
MAXIMA	XCO(52) =	-1.06010	YCO(52) =	0.00000	
MINIMA	XCO(35) =	-5.90789	YCO(52) =	0.00000	

6. $\Delta(P)/P = 0.0000$

CIRCUMFERENCE =	201.7800 M	QX =	4.82000	QY =	4.83000
		QX' =	-4.92970	QY' =	-5.26488
		THETX =	6.28318530	RAD	
		THETY =	0.00000000	RAD	
RADIUS =	32.1143 M	GAMMA(TR)=(	4.88124,	0.00000)	
(DS/S)/(DP/P)=	0.0419701				
MAXIMA	BETX(21) =	13.86571	BETY(52) =	13.64403	
DX(35) =	2.95145	DY(52) =	0.00000		
MINIMA	BETX(18) =	3.57537	BETY(35) =	3.70334	
DX(1) =	0.54003	DY(52) =	0.00000		
MAXIMA	XCO(52) =	0.00000	YCO(52) =	0.00000	
MINIMA	XCO(35) =	0.00000	YCO(52) =	0.00000	

7. $\Delta(P)/P = 0.00200$

CIRCUMFERENCE =	201.7970 M	QX =	4.81017	QY =	4.81955
		QX' =	-4.90893	QY' =	-5.19663
		THETX =	6.28318530	RAD	
		THETY =	0.00000000	RAD	
RADIUS =	32.1170 M	GAMMA(TR)=(	4.85229,	0.00000)	
(DS/S)/(DP/P)=	0.0424725				
MAXIMA	BETX(21) =	13.87071	BETY(52) =	13.65707	
DX(35) =	2.94173	DY(52) =	0.00000		

```

MINIMA    --- BETX( 18) =    3.58950    BETY( 21) =    3.71581
DX( 52) =    0.55866    DY( 52) =    0.00000
MAXIMA    XCO( 35) =    5.89831    YCO( 52) =    0.00000
MINIMA    XCO( 52) =    1.09981    YCO( 52) =    0.00000

```

8. DELTA(P)/P = 0.00400

```

CIRCUMFERENCE =    201.8142 M    QX =    4.80040    QY =    4.80925
                                QX' =   -4.88841    QY' =   -5.12853
                                THETX =    6.28318530 RAD
                                THETY =    0.00000000 RAD
                                GAMMA(TR)=(    4.82407,    0.00000)
RADIUS =    32.1197 M
(DS/S)/(DP/P) =    0.0429707
MAXIMA    --- BETX( 21) =    13.87587    BETY( 52) =    13.67025
DX( 35) =    2.93261    DY( 52) =    0.00000
MINIMA    --- BETX( 18) =    3.60361    BETY( 21) =    3.72813
DX( 52) =    0.57700    DY( 52) =    0.00000
MAXIMA    XCO( 35) =    11.78824    YCO( 52) =    0.00000
MINIMA    XCO( 52) =    2.23873    YCO( 52) =    0.00000

```

9. DELTA(P)/P = 0.00600

```

CIRCUMFERENCE =    201.8316 M    QX =    4.79069    QY =    4.79911
                                QX' =   -4.86812    QY' =   -5.06055
                                THETX =    6.28318530 RAD
                                THETY =    0.00000000 RAD
                                GAMMA(TR)=(    4.79656,    0.00000)
RADIUS =    32.1225 M
(DS/S)/(DP/P) =    0.0434650
MAXIMA    --- BETX( 21) =    13.88116    BETY( 52) =    13.68358
DX( 35) =    2.92405    DY( 52) =    0.00000
MINIMA    --- BETX( 18) =    3.61768    BETY( 21) =    3.74028
DX( 52) =    0.59506    DY( 52) =    0.00000
MAXIMA    XCO( 35) =    17.67094    YCO( 52) =    0.00000
MINIMA    XCO( 52) =    3.41617    YCO( 52) =    0.00000

```

10. DELTA(P)/P = 0.00800

```

CIRCUMFERENCE =    201.8492 M    QX =    4.78104    QY =    4.78913
                                QX' =   -4.84806    QY' =   -4.99265
                                THETX =    6.28318530 RAD
                                THETY =    0.00000000 RAD
                                GAMMA(TR)=(    4.76971,    0.00000)
RADIUS =    32.1253 M
(DS/S)/(DP/P) =    0.0439557
MAXIMA    --- BETX( 21) =    13.88659    BETY( 52) =    13.69704
DX( 35) =    2.91603    DY( 52) =    0.00000
MINIMA    --- BETX( 18) =    3.63171    BETY( 21) =    3.75227
DX( 52) =    0.61285    DY( 52) =    0.00000
MAXIMA    XCO( 35) =    23.54750    YCO( 52) =    0.00000
MINIMA    XCO( 52) =    4.63157    YCO( 52) =    0.00000

```

11. $\Delta(P)/P = 0.01000$

CIRCUMFERENCE =	201.8669 M	QX =	4.77144	QY =	4.77930
		QX' =	-4.82823	QY' =	-4.92482
		THETX =	6.28318530	RAD	
		THETY =	0.00000000	RAD	
RADIUS =	32.1281 M	GAMMA(TR)=(4.74349, 0.00000)			
(DS/S)/(DP/P)=	0.0444431				
MAXIMA	BETX(21) =	13.89216	BETY(52) =	13.71064	
DX(35) =	2.90853	DY(52) =	0.00000		
MINIMA	BETX(18) =	3.64572	BETY(21) =	3.76410	
DX(52) =	0.63039	DY(52) =	0.00000		
MAXIMA	XCO(35)=	29.41897	YCO(52)=	0.00000	
MINIMA	XCO(52)=	5.88440	YCO(52)=	0.00000	

END OF SYNCH RUN BST

TABLE II

"MAD" VERSION 6.01/03:

MAD6.01 OUTPUT FOR THE BOOSTER LATTICE WITHOUT SEXTUPOLES [SF, SD, SV=0]

1. For $\Delta(P)/P = -0.01$:

TOTAL LENGTH = 201.780000	QX = 4.869524	QY = 4.882689
	QX' = -4.974135	QY' = -5.314419
ALFA = 0.397978E-01	BETAX(MAX) = 13.981287	BETAY(MAX) = 13.795012
GAMMA(TR) = 5.012688	DX(MAX) = 3.039104	DY(MAX) = 0.000000
	XCO(MAX) = 29.938897	YCO(MAX) = 0.000000
	XCO(R.M.S.) = 16.640292	YCO(R.M.S.) = 0.000000

2. FOR $\Delta(P)/P = -0.008000$:

TOTAL LENGTH = 201.780000	QX = 4.859582	QY = 4.872144
	QX' = -4.965049	QY' = -5.304147
ALFA = 0.402414E-01	BETAX(MAX) = 13.957912	BETAY(MAX) = 13.764037
GAMMA(TR) = 4.984983	DX(MAX) = 3.020217	DY(MAX) = 0.000000
	XCO(MAX) = 23.879696	YCO(MAX) = 0.000000
	XCO(R.M.S.) = 13.311186	YCO(R.M.S.) = 0.000000

3. FOR $\Delta(P)/P = -0.006000$:

TOTAL LENGTH = 201.780000	QX = 4.849659	QY = 4.861603
	QX' = -4.956066	QY' = -5.294075
ALFA = 0.406801E-01	BETAX(MAX) = 13.934668	BETAY(MAX) = 13.733463
GAMMA(TR) = 4.958030	DX(MAX) = 3.002033	DY(MAX) = 0.000000
	XCO(MAX) = 17.857561	YCO(MAX) = 0.000000
	XCO(R.M.S.) = 9.983220	YCO(R.M.S.) = 0.000000

4. FOR $\Delta(P)/P = -0.004000$:

TOTAL LENGTH = 201.780000	QX = 4.839755	QY = 4.851065
	QX' = -4.947183	QY' = -5.284184
ALFA = 0.411142E-01	BETAX(MAX) = 13.911553	BETAY(MAX) = 13.703278
GAMMA(TR) = 4.931783	DX(MAX) = 2.984527	DY(MAX) = 0.000000
	XCO(MAX) = 11.871112	YCO(MAX) = 0.000000
	XCO(R.M.S.) = 6.655764	YCO(R.M.S.) = 0.000000

5. FOR $\Delta(P)/P = -0.002000$:

TOTAL LENGTH = 201.780000	QX = 4.829868	QY = 4.840531
	QX' = -4.938396	QY' = -5.274457
ALFA = 0.415441E-01	BETAX(MAX) = 13.888567	BETAY(MAX) = 13.673471
GAMMA(TR) = 4.906198	DX(MAX) = 2.967673	DY(MAX) = 0.000000

XCO(MAX) = 5.919019 YCO(MAX) = 0.000000
 XCO(R.M.S.) = 3.328215 YCO(R.M.S.) = 0.000000

6. FOR DELTA(P)/P = 0.000000:

TOTAL LENGTH = 201.780000 QX = 4.820000 QY = 4.829999
 QX' = -4.929702 QY' = -5.264883
 ALFA = 0.419701E-01 BETAX(MAX) = 13.865707 BETAY(MAX) = 13.644032
 GAMMA(TR) = 4.881238 DX(MAX) = 2.951449 DY(MAX) = 0.000000
 XCO(MAX) = 0.000000 YCO(MAX) = 0.000000
 XCO(R.M.S.) = 0.000000 YCO(R.M.S.) = 0.000000

7. FOR DELTA(P)/P = 0.002000:

TOTAL LENGTH = 201.780000 QX = 4.810150 QY = 4.819471
 QX' = -4.921099 QY' = -5.255452
 ALFA = 0.423924E-01 BETAX(MAX) = 13.842974 BETAY(MAX) = 13.629735
 GAMMA(TR) = 4.856865 DX(MAX) = 2.935830 DY(MAX) = 0.000000
 XCO(MAX) = 5.887179 YCO(MAX) = 0.000000
 XCO(R.M.S.) = 3.329428 YCO(R.M.S.) = 0.000000

8. FOR DELTA(P)/P = 0.004000:

TOTAL LENGTH = 201.780000 QX = 4.800317 QY = 4.808946
 QX' = -4.912583 QY' = -5.246156
 ALFA = 0.428113E-01 BETAX(MAX) = 13.820366 BETAY(MAX) = 13.615495
 GAMMA(TR) = 4.833046 DX(MAX) = 2.920797 DY(MAX) = 0.000000
 XCO(MAX) = 11.743710 YCO(MAX) = 0.000000
 XCO(R.M.S.) = 6.660591 YCO(R.M.S.) = 0.000000

9. FOR DELTA(P)/P = 0.006000:

TOTAL LENGTH = 201.780000 QX = 4.790501 QY = 4.798424
 QX' = -4.904152 QY' = -5.236988
 ALFA = 0.432270E-01 BETAX(MAX) = 13.797883 BETAY(MAX) = 13.601316
 GAMMA(TR) = 4.809750 DX(MAX) = 2.906327 DY(MAX) = 0.000000
 XCO(MAX) = 17.570742 YCO(MAX) = 0.000000
 XCO(R.M.S.) = 9.993989 YCO(R.M.S.) = 0.000000

10. FOR DELTA(P)/P = 0.008000:

TOTAL LENGTH = 201.780000 QX = 4.780703 QY = 4.787905
 QX' = -4.895804 QY' = -5.227943
 ALFA = 0.436398E-01 BETAX(MAX) = 13.775524 BETAY(MAX) = 13.587203
 GAMMA(TR) = 4.786948 DX(MAX) = 2.892402 DY(MAX) = 0.000000
 XCO(MAX) = 23.369382 YCO(MAX) = 0.000000
 XCO(R.M.S.) = 13.330097 YCO(R.M.S.) = 0.000000

11. FOR DELTA(P)/P = 0.010000 :

TOTAL LENGTH = 201.780000	QX = 4.770922	QY = 4.777389
	QX' = -4.887536	QY' = -5.219016
ALFA = 0.440499E-01	BETAX(MAX) = 13.753287	BETAY(MAX) = 13.573160
GAMMA(TR) = 4.764614	DX(MAX) = 2.879003	DY(MAX) = 0.000000
	XCO(MAX) = 29.140701	YCO(MAX) = 0.000000
	XCO(R.M.S.) = 16.669372	YCO(R.M.S.) = 0.000000

TABLE III

"MAD" VERSIN 4.03

MAD403 OUTPUT FOR AGS BOOSTER LATTICE WITHOUT SEXTUPOLES [SF,SD,SV=0]

1. FOR DELTA(P)/P = -0.010000 :

TOTAL LENGTH = 201.780000	QX = 4.869536	QY = 4.882249
	QX' = -4.974658	QY' = -5.291287
ALFA = 0.397978E-01	BETAX(MAX) = 13.981250	BETAY(MAX) = 13.796343
GAMMA(TR) = 5.012688	DX(MAX) = 3.039108	DY(MAX) = 0.000000

2. FOR DELTA(P)/P = -0.008000 :

TOTAL LENGTH = 201.780000	QX = 4.859589	QY = 4.871899
	QX' = -4.965323	QY' = -5.292399
ALFA = 0.402414E-01	BETAX(MAX) = 13.957891	BETAY(MAX) = 13.764777
GAMMA(TR) = 4.984983	DX(MAX) = 3.020219	DY(MAX) = 0.000000

3. FOR DELTA(P)/P = -0.006000 :

TOTAL LENGTH = 201.780000	QX = 4.849663	QY = 4.861481
	QX' = -4.956193	QY' = -5.288761
ALFA = 0.406801E-01	BETAX(MAX) = 13.934657	BETAY(MAX) = 13.733831
GAMMA(TR) = 4.958030	DX(MAX) = 3.002034	DY(MAX) = 0.000000

4. FOR DELTA(P)/P = -0.004000 :

TOTAL LENGTH = 201.780000	QX = 4.839756	QY = 4.851017
	QX' = -4.947229	QY' = -5.282268
ALFA = 0.411142E-01	BETAX(MAX) = 13.911549	BETAY(MAX) = 13.703424
GAMMA(TR) = 4.931783	DX(MAX) = 2.984527	DY(MAX) = 0.000000

5. FOR DELTA(P)/P = -0.002000 :

TOTAL LENGTH = 201.780000	QX = 4.829869	QY = 4.840520
	QX' = -4.938405	QY' = -5.274067
ALFA = 0.415441E-01	BETAX(MAX) = 13.888566	BETAY(MAX) = 13.673504
GAMMA(TR) = 4.906198	DX(MAX) = 2.967673	DY(MAX) = 0.000000

6. FOR DELTA(P)/P = 0.000000 :

TOTAL LENGTH = 201.780000	QX = 4.820000	QY = 4.829999
	QX' = -4.929702	QY' = -5.264883
ALFA = 0.419701E-01	BETAX(MAX) = 13.865707	BETAY(MAX) = 13.644032
GAMMA(TR) = 4.881238	DX(MAX) = 2.951449	DY(MAX) = 0.000000

7. FOR DELTA(P)/P = 0.002000:

TOTAL LENGTH = 201.780000	QX = 4.810150	QY = 4.819462
	QX' = -4.921105	QY' = -5.255196
ALFA = 0.423924E-01	BETAX(MAX) = 13.842973	BETAY(MAX) = 13.629764
GAMMA(TR) = 4.856865	DX(MAX) = 2.935830	DY(MAX) = 0.000000

8. BEAM DELTA(P)/P = 0.004000:

TOTAL LENGTH = 201.780000	QX = 4.800318	QY = 4.808910
	QX' = -4.912603	QY' = -5.245338
ALFA = 0.428113E-01	BETAX(MAX) = 13.820363	BETAY(MAX) = 13.615603
GAMMA(TR) = 4.833046	DX(MAX) = 2.920797	DY(MAX) = 0.000000

9. FOR DELTA(P)/P = 0.006000:

TOTAL LENGTH = 201.780000	QX = 4.790504	QY = 4.798347
	QX' = -4.904188	QY' = -5.235560
ALFA = 0.432270E-01	BETAX(MAX) = 13.797876	BETAY(MAX) = 13.601548
GAMMA(TR) = 4.809750	DX(MAX) = 2.906328	DY(MAX) = 0.000000

10. FOR DELTA(P)/P = 0.008000 :

TOTAL LENGTH = 201.780000	QX = 4.780707	QY = 4.787774
	QX' = -4.895849	QY' = -5.226062
ALFA = 0.436398E-01	BETAX(MAX) = 13.775511	BETAY(MAX) = 13.587601
GAMMA(TR) = 4.786948	DX(MAX) = 2.892404	DY(MAX) = 0.000000

11. FOR DELTA(P)/P = 0.010000 :

TOTAL LENGTH = 201.780000	QX = 4.770928	QY = 4.777190
	QX' = -4.887580	QY' = -5.21701
ALFA = 0.440499E-01	BETAX(MAX) = 13.753267	BETAY(MAX) = 13.573763
GAMMA(TR) = 4.764614	DX(MAX) = 2.879005	DY(MAX) = 0.000000