

ALTERNATIVE CERTIFICATION TEACHING PROGRAMS IN TEXAS:
A HISTORICAL ANALYSIS

David K. Etheredge

Dissertation Prepared for the Degree of
DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY

UNIVERSITY OF NORTH TEXAS

May 2015

APPROVED:

Kathleen Whitson, Major Professor
Marc Cutright, Committee Member
Barrett Taylor, Committee Member
Janice Holden, Chair of the Department of
Higher Education and Counseling
Jerry Thomas, Dean of the College of
Education
Costas Tsatsoulis, Interim Dean of the
Toulouse Graduate School

Etheredge, David K. *Alternative Certification Teaching Programs in Texas: A Historical Analysis*. Doctor of Philosophy (Higher Education), May 2015, 73 pp., 1 table, references, 89 titles.

Before 1984, nearly 975 of teachers entered the teaching profession after graduating from a traditional university-based program. However, beginning in the mid-1980s, alternative routes leading to teacher certification began to emerge in the United States. As of 2010, nearly one-third of all new teachers graduated from an alternative preparation program. As alternative certification (AC) routes approach 30 years since establishment, programs continue to evolve and increase in enrollment. This study focused on the changes that have come about in the maturation of alternative certification programs in Texas since legislation was passed in 1985. The purpose of the study was to delineate the evolution of AC programs using a historical approach, the study used both primary and secondary resources as research tools and employed the use of eight interviews and the literature review for the collection of data. The prediction of future teacher shortages, the need for diversity in the profession the political view to privatize education, and economic recessions were all motivating factors for establishing alternative teacher programs. In the beginning, graduation from AC programs were perceived as not authentic teachers and not as prepared for teaching as graduates from traditional programs. AC programs have become a legitimate and viable option for educator preparation programs as they offer greater flexibility, staff/instructor diversity, and multiple approaches to instruction. This data suggests that AC programs in Texas have emerged as a real and sustainable option to traditional certification programs leading to certification and licensure.

Copyright 2015

by

David K. Etheredge

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

My appreciation goes to Dr. Kathleen Whitson, my committee chair and advisor, for her steadfast support and encouragement. Dr. Whitson was constantly available to me and expressed a belief in my success that others did not have. She was relentless in pushing me to produce a better product and I am fortunate to know her as a colleague and friend. My thanks also go to Dr. Marc Cutright and Dr. Barrett Taylor, my other committee members for their support and guidance.

Also, my wife, Susan Etheredge, provided me the support and opportunities I needed to pursue and complete this project. She always supported me in this endeavor and rarely complained as I spent years in class and at the library. Thank you for your unconditional love.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS.....	iii
CHAPTER 1 INTRODUCTION.....	1
Problem Statement.....	2
Purpose of the Study.....	2
Research Questions.....	4
Limitations.....	4
Delimitations.....	5
Researcher Bias.....	5
Significance of the Study.....	5
Definition of Terms.....	7
Organization of the Study.....	7
CHAPTER 2 LITERATURE REVIEW.....	9
History of Teacher Certification in the United States.....	10
History of Alternative Certification Programs in the United States.....	13
History of Alternative Certification Programs in Texas.....	22
CHAPTER 3 METHODOLOGY.....	30
Research Questions.....	31
Evaluation Methods.....	32
Data Collection.....	33
Limitations.....	34
Delimitations.....	35

Researcher Bias	35
Sampling	35
Interview Protocol	36
Interviews	37
Method of Analysis of Data.....	39
CHAPTER 4 DISCUSSION OF DATA	41
Introduction.....	41
Summary of Methodology.....	41
Discussion	42
Research Question 1	42
Research Question 2	47
Research Question 3	49
Research Question 4	51
Unintended Consequences.....	52
CHAPTER 5 SUMMARY	54
Introduction.....	54
Implications for Practice	54
Recommendations for Future Research.....	58
APPENDIX A INTERVIEW PROTOCOL QUESTIONS.....	60
APPENDIX B CONSENT FOR PARTICIPATION IN INTERVIEW UNIVERSITY OF NORTH TEXAS.....	62
APPENDIX C SCRIPT FOR SOLICITING INTERVIEW	65
REFERENCES.....	67

CHAPTER 1

INTRODUCTION

Before the state of New Jersey created the nation's first alternative teacher certification pathway in 1984, the pathway leading to teacher certification was dominated by traditional undergraduate programs in the education halls of universities and colleges (Chaddock, 1999). According to the National Center for Education Information, in year's pre-1984 nearly 97% of teachers entered the teaching profession after graduating from a traditional university-based program (Feistritzer, 2011). Beginning in the mid-1980s, alternative routes leading to teachers obtaining certification began to be established throughout the United States. Feistritzer (2011) reports that the number of teachers becoming certified in an alternative program has gradually increased. In the report, *Profile of Teachers in the U.S. 2011*, Feistritzer (2011) states, "new hires from alternative preparation programs really took off in the last five years, with 4 out of 10 new hires coming from these routes" and the "proportion of new hires between 2005 and 2010 coming from undergraduate teacher education programs dropped to 50%." In the state of Texas, educator preparation programs responsible for certifying teachers show a similar trend as in the academic years 2006-07 to 2010-2011, alternative preparation routes accounted for 12,571 certified teachers of the 26,432 that obtained certification.

Since the 1980s, the options available within educator preparation programs have steadily been on the rise with New Jersey, California, and Texas being the nation's first states to establish alternate routes (Chaddock, 1999). As alternative certification routes approach 30 years since initial establishment, programs continue to evolve in

required curriculum and content. This historical study focused on the beginnings of alternative certification and the changes that have come about in the maturation and variation of alternative certification programs in Texas since legislation was passed in 1985 which established it as an acceptable educational path to becoming a certified teacher in K-12 education.

Problem Statement

As alternative certification programs in Texas continue to trend upward in conferring teaching certificates, it is important to take a retrospective look at this type of educator preparation program in order to give insight to the differences in alternative certification programs from traditional programs. Also, with the proliferation of alternative certification programs, it begs the question of a need matching the numbers of teachers produced with openings in K-12 education. Moreover, since changes have been made in traditional teacher education as well as colleges and universities adding their own versions of alternative certification programs and post-bachelor teacher certification programs, the possibility exists of alternative certification programs having evolved to a point they no longer are truly alternative but rather a variation of the traditional teacher certification degree. A look at the establishment and development of alternative certification in comparison with traditional teacher certification is needed to evaluate the continual need of alternative certification.

Purpose of the Study

The purpose of the study was to delineate the establishment and evolution of

alternative certification programs for teachers in Texas since inception in 1985 using a non-emergent, historical method. "A non-emergent research design means you will pursue your focus of inquiry with qualitative methods of data collection and analysis, but that you will collect data, and then analyze it" (Maykut & Morehouse, 2002, pp. 59-60). Historical research is the process of gathering and organizing of background information in a field of study to gain insight into current/future trends (Busha & Harter, 1980). This historical approach was used to increase the understanding of the evolution of teacher certification programs. Historical research is also used to gather and interpret information from both primary and secondary sources (Wesner, 1994). Primary sources are materials from the past studied directly such as writings, interviews, and personal testimony while secondary sources are materials that researchers use to interpret information gathered from primary sources and thus are not a direct part of the history they discuss (Westminster Theological Seminary, 2014). The primary and secondary sources constitute data in historical research and oftentimes triangulated for verification of facts (Wesner, 1994). According to Berg (1998), historical research is significant because it can assist in uncovering the unknown since some events are not recorded. Additionally, it can help answer questions about the past and identify relationships to current events because historical research is not the mere accumulation of facts but an active account of past events helping communicate an understanding of past events (Berg, 1998). When searched and carefully reflected, historical research can provide patterns and offer critical insights of past events allowing the construction of relevant information (McNeill, 1985).

Since the establishment of alternative certification programs in Texas, research

studies have been focused on teacher effectiveness and student achievement and not the establishment of alternative certification programs and whether development has stayed true to original purpose. In the endeavor to organize and carry out this study, documentation was collected from primary and secondary sources. Additionally, individuals with notable knowledge of alternative certification programs were identified and interviewed to gain an understanding of the changes that have occurred since 1985. Collectively, these components built a historical analysis of alternative teacher certification programs in Texas.

Research Questions

The questions guiding this research sought to examine the evolution of alternative teaching certification programs in the state of Texas.

1. What were the motivating factors for establishing an alternative teacher certification process?
2. At its inception, what were the primary differences between the alternative certification program and the traditional certification programs offered by colleges and universities?
3. How has the alternative teacher certification program evolved?
4. Currently, what are the primary differences between the alternative teacher certification program and traditional teacher certification programs offered by colleges and universities?

Limitations

A limitation of the study is the interview process. Interviewing requires the researcher to gather self-reported data and assumes interviewees contain no bias in their responses (Busha & Harter, 1980). Additionally, it is impossible to know whether

or not the interviewee is communicating truthful statements (Walford, 2011). Moreover, people's memories are malleable and thus are subject to change over time. The logical error of survivorship bias could be a limitation. Subjects that agree to be interviewed may only accept because they have views with a strong urge to share as compared to others whose indifference or lack of passion may simply refuse to be interviewed. Also, the lack of primary resources could possibly be an obstacle.

Delimitations

The focus of inquiry was alternative certification programs in the state of Texas. The Region 10 Education Service Center (ESC) is one of 20 service centers created in 1967 that provide services to school districts within a defined geographic region. The focus was on Region 10 and how could represent the state because it contains urban, suburban, and rural school districts. The Region 10 ESC is located in Richardson, Texas, and serves nearly 650,000 students in over 8 counties.

Researcher Bias

I was employed for four years as an adjunct professor in the Teacher Certification and Preparation (TCP) program at Collin College. The program was classified as an alternative certification route to teaching and I taught classes in pedagogy and professional ethics and responsibilities.

Significance of the Study

Alternative routes leading to teacher certification continue to emerge as viable

options throughout the United States. According to the National Center for Alternative Certification (2010), teachers obtaining certification via an alternate route have dramatically increased in the last ten years resulting in nearly one-third of all new teachers hired in the United States coming out of an alternate program that led to certification. Furthermore, since the mid-1980s, alternate routes leading to certification have produced nearly 500,000 teachers in the United States. In Texas, the State Board of Education (SBEC) reports, “alternate routes for educator preparation have produced the largest number of teachers since 2004-2005” (Routes to Teacher Certification, 2013, p. 1). Moreover, in the academic year 2010-2011, 48% of the more than 26,000 teachers that received certificates came out of a Texas alternate program (Routes to Teacher Certification, 2013). In the granting of teaching certificates the only route that is trending upward in teacher production is the alternative (SBEC, 2011).

The findings of this study could aid school personnel and education policy makers in understanding educator preparation programs as they continue to evolve from the traditional routes to the various types of alternative programs. A historical approach can provide insight and understanding to what makes each respective route distinctive from the other. It is significant to understand that the various routes contain characteristics that categorize each distinctively from one another and must be maintained to remain as traditional or alternative so that as many options remain for prospective teachers. Future teacher training will likely contain aspects deemed as “best practices” drawn from all certification routes as suggested by Education Secretary Arne Duncan (Blankinship, 2010).

Definition of Terms

Alternative certification programs (ACP) - Teacher training offered by education service centers, school districts, community colleges, private vendors, and other entities, as well as colleges and universities, for individuals who already hold a baccalaureate degree (post-baccalaureate).

Post-baccalaureate programs (PB) – Teacher training offered by colleges and universities for individuals who already hold a baccalaureate degree.

Traditional certification programs (TCP) - Teacher training offered by colleges and universities as part of an undergraduate degree program.

Organization of the Study

Chapter 1 introduces the research, a brief review of the research design, a description of the purpose of the study, a problem statement, a review of the research questions, a portrayal of the significance of the study, and definitions of key terms.

Chapter 2 is a literature review divided into three main categories that provide a historical background of the following:

1. Brief history of teacher certification in the United States with a focus on Texas
2. History and emergence of alternative routes leading to teacher certification in the United States
3. History and emergence of alternative routes leading to teacher certification in the state of Texas

Chapter 3 outlines historical research methods and the use of interviews as a research tool, establishing an interview protocol with interview questions, primary and secondary sources, and various evaluation methods.

Chapter 4 summarizes the results of the study. The analysis and synthesis of materials (e.g. documentation and interviews) provides a topic of themes collected into a narrative account to provide a meaningful whole.

Lastly, Chapter 5 revisits the purpose of the study, summarizes the findings of the study and how those findings might influence future directions of alternative teacher certification programs. Additionally, the benefits of additional research were considered and what could have been done differently in the research study if more time and money were allowed.

CHAPTER 2

LITERATURE REVIEW

The purpose of the literature review was to better understand ideas comprising the scholarly writings on a topic (North Carolina State University Library, n.d.). In historical research, it is often the case information sources found in the literature review are also a part of data collection in the research study (Johnson, 2006).

Teachers of high quality in students' classrooms are possibly the most important factor of an excellent education (Roth & Swail, 2000). This factor proves so vital that if students are exposed to just one teacher of poor quality, regardless of the number of high quality teachers, the negative effects may threaten any future academic success (Wright, Horn, & Sanders, 1997).

As educators and policymakers confront the challenges of the 21st century, one challenge is the need to recruit, train, and retain high quality teachers in the United States largely due to the approaching retirement age for many teachers as well as the growing population of students enrolling in schools (Wenglinsky, 2000). It is the majority opinion of policymakers that current educator preparation programs need to increase graduates if the necessary quantities of required teachers are to be met (Wenglinsky, 2000). The economist, Hussar (1999) estimated by the year 2008-09, approximately 1.7 million to 2.7 million new teachers would need to be hired in the United States. In July 2006, the Center for Innovative Thought proposed the United States employed nearly 3 million teachers and in the next decade would have to hire 2 million new teachers to offset such challenges as enrollment increases and teacher retirement (CollegeBoard, 2006). In September 2011, U.S. Secretary of Education,

Arne Duncan, stated within the next decade the U.S. will need 1.6 million teachers (United States Department of Education, 2011). However, the predicted shortage of teachers was not a universal belief. Teacher shortages are not from retirement alone but likely for reasons such as dissatisfaction with teaching and job opportunities outside of the classroom (Ingersoll, 2003). In Texas, the Texas Higher Education Coordinating Board suggested in a 2002 strategic plan aimed at addressing the teacher shortage that Texas had enough certified teachers and the issue was not enough of them were working in education any longer due to salary and workplace environment (Texas Higher Education Coordinating Board, 2002).

The 1983 release of *A Nation at Risk*, with its highly critical assessment of U.S. students' poor performance in the fields of mathematics and science challenged the status quo of the education establishment by suggesting America was falling behind other nations to its own peril (National Commission on Excellence in Education, 1983). Shortly after the 1983 report, the upstart of alternative routes leading to teacher certification began. It was the passing of the federal No Child Left Behind Act of 2001 that jumpstarted the recruitment of additional teachers because of the stipulation that by the academic year 2005-06, all public school teachers of their respective subjects must be "highly-qualified" (Alternative Teacher Certification, 2004).

History of Teacher Certification in the United States

It is likely issues related to teacher education have been in the public discourse ever since people decided it would be worthwhile and a beneficial practice to begin some type of schooling for their youth (Lieberman, 2007). Though schools have existed

for centuries, it is difficult to pinpoint when the practice of formal teacher education and training began (McIntyre, 2009). According to McGucken (1932), "...the Jesuits began professional teacher preparation, including student teaching, in the mid-1500s in Europe (as cited in McIntyre, 2009).

In the article, "Teacher Certification in the United States: A Brief History", LaBue (1960) defines teacher certification as "...the legal authority for a person to teach in the public schools..." but acknowledges confusion with an actual definition has existed since Colonial times (p. 147). Furthermore, from the book, *The American Teacher*, "the history of certification is...confusing..." (Elsbree, 1939, p. 377). In America's infancy, during Colonial times up to 1789, minimal interest was given to teacher licensing as local entities were primarily responsible for qualifications and it was not until the 1800s that local control of licensing yielded to state agencies (LaBue, 1960). According to Roth and Swail (2000), prior to teachers' colleges in the late nineteenth century becoming established the practice of certifying teachers was carried out by local authority usually through normal schools. In the late 1800s, with American society increasing in population and demanding a higher educated citizenry, teachers colleges would emerge as a permanent fixture across the higher education landscape and emerge in harmony with departments of education in taking control of teacher licensing (LaBue, 1960; Rudolph, 1990).

The movement to centralize the certification of teachers under the direct control of the state as opposed to local authority emerged in the late nineteenth century (Angus, 2001). In the early years of the 20th century, 38 states permitted certificates only through the state thus laying the foundation for the current system (Angus, 2001).

In 1870, 98% of students in the United States were enrolled in a grade below that of high school (Angus, 2001). As students progressed into higher levels of learning, teachers had to be competent in subject areas. Up to this point in history, only New York, Michigan, and Pennsylvania required a standards-based exam to determine proficiency (Angus, 2001). As quickly as required examinations began, certification by exam declined in the early 1900s as the Progressive era took a foothold (Angus, 2001).

It would take until the 1930s before the focus shifted away from basic teacher licensing to a focus on improving the standards used to certify teachers (LaBue, 1960). It would be this focus on standards that would continue up to World War II and dominate discussions of teaching certification (LaBue, 1960). However, with the outbreak of World War II, schools faced a shortage of teachers nearly overnight as men left for war and women assisted in industrial efforts to win the war (Studebaker, 1944). Throughout the 1940s and into the early 1950s, the United States experienced teacher shortages that would result in emergency teaching certificates to be granted (Studebaker, 1944). As a result, teacher supply could not keep up with student demand and standards leading to certification lessened in quality and quantity as student enrollment dramatically increased (LaBue, 1960). In the post-war years, teachers decided to make an effort to determine teacher certification policy (Angus, 2001).

Shortly after the successful launch of *Sputnik* in 1957, the United States became reenergized in efforts to reform education and this resulted in much debate over teacher education from certification standards, certification by exam, development and role of unions, and overall locus of control concerning educational policy (Angus, 2001). Lieberman (2007) suggested that the majority of issues in teacher education tended to

center around initial certification and the importance of subject knowledge. Qualifications and standards leading to state certification were important as all states required them to teach in their respective schools (Lieberman, 2007). Most states required a prospective teacher to be a college graduate and to successfully complete a set of education-related courses in order to become eligible for state certification (Nadler & Peterson, 2009). However, Nadler, and Peterson (2009) suggested that a set of requirements actually shrinks the pool of available applicants but acknowledge the need of such requirements to ensure teacher quality. The focus on improvement of standards leading to a teaching certificate that would be granted by means of an institution's department of education would remain the focus through the launching of *Sputnik* in the 1950s to the release of the report *A Nation at Risk* (National Commission on Excellence in Education, 1983).

History of Alternative Certification Programs in the United States

In the study "Alternative Certification Isn't Alternative", Walsh & Jacobs (2007) and Finn and Petrilli (2007) submitted that the concept to establish an alternative route to teacher certification was easy to understand; advocates of alternative routes desired talented and well-educated people to gain access into the classroom despite not holding a teaching degree. The argument posited by Finn and Petrilli (2007) centered on newly hired teachers honing their classroom skills on-the-job in lieu of traditional theory, methods, and pedagogy classes.

In 1983, the state of New Jersey introduced the Provisional Teacher Program (PTP) and thus, "...created the first alternate route to the classroom" (Finn & Petrilli,

2007, p. 8). New Jersey's alternate program targeted candidates with the same qualifications as those of its traditional programs; a baccalaureate degree in their teaching field and a passing score on a subject matter assessment (Klagholz, 2000). Since candidates in the alternate program would not have completed the same formal education classes as their undergraduate counterparts, the program focused on teachers entering the classroom almost immediately while receiving support from experienced mentors in addition to completing one year of in-service training (Klagholz, 2000). With New Jersey's implementation of its Provisional Teacher Program, the connection between traditional educator preparation and certification was broken (Newman, 2009).

Soon to follow New Jersey's lead were other states such as California and Texas. Certification by alternate routes in the 1980s defended against forecasted teacher shortages in addition to slowing down the number of emergency certificates granted (Feistritzer, 2005). However, the need to avoid impending teacher shortages along with decreasing the number of emergency certificates handed out were not the only two factors driving the establishment of alternate routes.

In 1986, the state of Connecticut created the Alternate Route to Certification (ARC) to address areas of teacher shortage by targeting well-educated adults to become teachers (Connecticut Office of Higher Education, 2013). Areas of certification are dependent upon enrollment, critical needs in subject areas, and needs of school districts. The ARC curriculum consists of 2 sessions each year, a 9-week full-time summer program, and a weekend program from fall to spring. The curriculum includes subject-area instruction, pedagogy, classroom observations and student teaching.

As states began to implement alternate programs in the 1980s, alternate educator preparation programs began to cross state lines and emerge nationally. The Southern Regional Education Board (2011) examined several national alternative routes for teacher certification.

Teach for America is an alternative certification programs that was established in 1990 and funded by Ross Perot to train new teachers in “high-risk” areas such as science, math, special education, ESOL, and early childhood education in grades PreK-12 (2014). Princeton alum Wendy Kopp proposed in her senior thesis the idea of a national teacher corps to address the problem of educational inequity. Graduates would serve by committing to teach two years in an urban or rural public school. According to its website (www.teachforamerica.org), Teach for America trains more teachers for low-income communities than any other entity.

Troops to Teachers (www.troopstoteachers.net) was established in 1994 to recruit mature and motivated educators from the ranks of the military (2014). Funded by the United States of Education and administered by the Department of Defense through the Defense Activity for Non-Traditional Education Support (DANTES), this alternative program focused on preparing candidates to teach in high-demand areas such as math, science, and special education. Another focus was urban and rural schools experiencing teacher shortages.

The New Teacher Project (TNTP) was founded by former chancellor of Washington, D.C. public schools Michelle Rhee. As stated on its website (www.tntp.org), the goal of TNTP was to expedite the certification process for individuals such as recent graduates and career-changers to teach in urban schools

(2014). Similar to other alternative programs, a focus was to recruit those willing to teach in “high-need” subjects such as core subjects, foreign language, and special education in grades PreK-12.

Transition to Teaching was established in 2001 and funded by a grant from the United States Department of Education. According to its website (www2.ed.gov), the goals were to stop the use of uncertified teachers in the classroom by recruiting, training, and subsequently increasing the supply of teachers in “high-need” content areas such as math, science, special education, foreign language, and ESOL (2014).

In the 1991 *Economic Report of the President*, the council of economic advisers addressed the necessity of the United States having an effective educational system that included the following initiatives:

1. Programs of choice for students
2. School accountability
3. Alternative teacher certification programs

The report pointed out the, “... limitations commonly found in educator preparation programs...” and used the example of difficulties crossing state lines and maintaining a valid teacher certificate because states vary so much in credentialing (p. 46).

Additionally, the report targeted existing barriers that inhibit entry into certification programs and suggested, “...the solution to the problem of attracting talented teachers, however, is not to regulate the industry further but to open it up to the competitive process...” (p. 47).

Traditionally, colleges and universities have taken the initiative to train and certify classroom teachers (Dahlkemper, 2001). The passing of the federal No Child Left

Behind Act (NCLB) of 2001 requiring every classroom be staffed with a “highly qualified” teacher by the academic year of 2005-2006, influenced states to address the possibility of a teacher shortage in their schools. States predicted that traditional certification programs would not be able to keep up with the preparation of qualified teachers to fill classrooms (Adcock & Mahlios, 2005). Afraid of not being able to train and subsequently certify enough teachers, states turned to alternative means of certifying teachers (Dahlkemper, 2001). The American Association of Colleges for Teacher Education (2010, AACTE) reported, “There are now 125 state-defined alternative routes across all 50 states...” (p. 1).

In harmony with the NCLB Act of 2001 forecast of teacher shortages, the National Center for Education Information (2005) reported that alternative methods of certifying teachers actually began in the early 1980s. Alternative certification programs began when New Jersey approved the first alternative route to certification (Dahlkemper, 2001); however, despite their existence approaching 30 years, Nadler and Peterson (2009) found, “alternative certification of teachers is still controversial in the educational community” (p. 182). Supporters of alternative certification programs suggest career professionals and retirees who wish to pursue teaching are reluctant to enter a traditional college-based program because of the burdensome requirements and that alternative programs offer greater flexibility to prospective teachers (Dahlkemper, 2001). Critics offer a rebuttal saying alternative certification programs are nothing more than a pathway to emergency licensing and such programs are hampered by inconsistencies in set standards, course rigor, and teacher quality (Dahlkemper, 2001). Shen (1997) discovered the same debate between programs of alternative certification

and traditional certification by stating, “Proponents argue that the alternative route to teaching will improve the teaching force by reducing teacher shortage, raising teacher quality, and diversifying the teaching force” (p. 276). Conversely, challengers of alternative routes to teaching, “...maintain that the alternative certification policy degrades the professional status of teaching and ultimately hinders student learning” (p. 276).

In the study, “Teacher Preparation Research: Current Knowledge, Gaps, and Recommendations” the authors inquired as to what components and characteristics make up high-quality alternative certification programs (Wilson, Floden, & Ferrini-Mundy, 2001). Two findings from 11 studies concluded alternative certification routes performed well in recruiting, “diverse pools of prospective teachers in terms of age and ethnicity” (Wilson et al., 2001, p. 27). Moreover, graduates from alternative certification routes were found to teach in, “urban settings or teaching minority students” (Wilson et al., 2001, p. 27).

Alternative certification programs were to be a short-term strategy to deal with teacher shortages (Stoddart & Floden, 1995). However, as alternative certification became more prevalent, a dichotomy emerged with one pathway heavily dependent on the mastery of subject-area content and on-the-job training and another pathway stressing pedagogical mastery and professional training before entering a classroom (Stoddart & Floden, 1995). Though alternative certification has become a fixture in educator preparation, Stoddart and Floden (1995) suggests it was never intended to replace traditional university-based preparation programs and furthermore, “The choice between a traditional program and an alternate route is not a choice between some

professional preparation and no preparation” (pp. 7-8). To the contrary, the two routes are, “...instead, a decision about the timing and institutional context for teacher preparation and about the mix of professional knowledge and skills to be acquired” (Stoddart & Floden, 1995, p. 8). The two routes coexist because they rely on state-legislated agreements for program implementation (Ludlow & Wienke, 1994).

The trend towards increased numbers of teachers earning their certificates through alternative programs is likely to tick upward as the pursuit to offer high-quality schools remains high and appears to be driven by the following four goals (Kwiatkowski, 1999, p. 216):

1. Increase applicants in high-demand specialties such as math and science
2. Increase number of participants of under-represented teachers
3. Increase staffing levels of urban schools that are often housed in “difficult settings”
4. Decrease the need for emergency credentialing to meet teacher shortages

In 2001, the president of the National Center for Education Information, C. Emily Feistritzer, was asked by the organization Edutopia what comprises a good teacher education program. In summary, Feistritzer (2001) stated, “...getting prospective teachers into real-life classroom settings early with mentor teachers” (p. 1) allows teachers to experience firsthand the daily requirements of the profession with the benefit of a veteran teacher “on call” for assistance. Feistritzer (2001) followed by suggesting the mentor teacher is best suited for teaching the practical aspects of teaching (e.g. classroom management) and higher education personnel should handle the theoretical components (e.g. learning theories) of teacher preparation. In an issue of *Inside Higher Ed*, the consulting firm Eduventures conducted a survey targeting the

preparation of teachers and concluded future teachers become prepared best by getting the opportunity to train in real classrooms for the maximum amount of time (Lee, 2009).

Linda Milstein, director of community colleges for New Pathways to Teaching and vice president for outreach, business, and community development at Brookdale Community College, suggests teaching is not an easy profession and candidates must understand that to be successful students must be associated with a demanding program (Bradley, 2010). Milstein refers to New Jersey's alternate programs requiring a bachelor's degree, certificate of eligibility from the state for certification, and to pass the Praxis standardized test in the area that they want to teach (Bradley, 2010). Afterwards, "graduates receive a provisional certificate but must find a job, complete 200 hours of training, and work with a mentor" (Bradley, 2010, p. 7).

In a 2005 study, Adcock and Mahlios examined differences between traditional and nontraditional alternative programs and discovered traditional programs are more likely to require some type of mentoring and the completion of courses in human development and student teaching. On the other hand, the authors cautioned reading too much into comparisons because the structures of traditional programs compared to nontraditional programs are very dissimilar.

Since 1999, the profile of people aspiring to become teachers has changed, as more people are entering teacher preparation programs at the post-baccalaureate level, which would indicate the traditional model of secondary school graduates getting certified to teach through an institution's college of education route and may no longer become the norm (Angus, 2001). In an article entitled, *Taking the Alternate Route*, written for Community College Week, Bradley (2010) wrote that alternate programs

have strong appeal for college graduates because teaching careers offer a degree of stability in an uncertain economy. Furthermore, alternate programs value lifetime experience and maturity when considering applicants.

At Florida's Santa Fe College, candidates over the age of 50 are actively recruited into the career of teaching because according to Ed Bonahue, the college's interim provost and vice president of academic affairs, "most of them know what it is like to work with kids, because they have raised their own" (Bradley, 2010). Furthermore, due to continuing forecasts predicting teacher shortages approaching 20,000 by 2015 in Florida, Bonahue thinks the demand for qualified teachers will remain strong (Bradley, 2010).

Potential teachers possess many reasons in answering why they choose to switch careers to teaching. According to the Southern Regional Education Board's (2011, SREB) online resource (TheTeacherCenter.org), the non-profit identified five reasons people give as response to changing careers in mid-life:

1. Give back or "pay back" to the community that helped them become successful
2. Put prior experience to use as many have various "real-world" skills
3. change the meaning of "work" to an opportunity to mentor or guide young people
4. Follow one successful career with another such as the military
5. Share knowledge and passion of their own respective subjects in which they are experts

Not all prospective teachers possess all of the five identified reasons given by the SREB, and in some cases very few reasons may exist.

In Olson's (2011) article, "Teaching as a Second, or Even Third, Career", it is suggested that baby boomers are coming out of retirement because they feel the need to be challenged, be more involved with community, and sometimes are curious about the profession. Also, the article refers to a 2007 study from the business-higher education forum that suggests, "...public schools will need more than 280,000 new math and science teachers by 2015..." (p. 2).

The traditional route to becoming a teacher is to enroll in an institution's school of education and successfully complete classwork that culminates with a brief period of student teaching, and finally assessing competency via a state licensure exam (Spitalli, 2009). The traditional route can be difficult to transition into for current degree-holding adults (Spitalli, 2009). Facing teacher shortages in 2004, the state of Florida created Educator Preparation Institutes (EPI) that purposed to encourage midcareer professionals to become teachers and according to Spitalli (2009) permitted prospective teachers to obtain a temporary certificate that allowed up to three years of teaching full time while they pursued a professional certificate. Alternative certification programs have evolved since the inception of New Jersey's in the 1980s (Walsh & Jacobs, 2007). In the study titled, "Alternative Certification Isn't Alternative", the authors Walsh and Jacobs (2007) conclude the original purpose of alternative certification routes was the placement of highly-talented, smart individuals quickly into the classroom without the burden of completing any additional degrees.

History of Alternative Certification Programs in Texas

In Texas, people who wanted to become a classroom teacher were often turned

off by the college-based system of certification (Texas Education Agency, 1991). Policymakers sought to remove the barriers inherent in certification through traditional avenues, and legislatively mandated various alternative routes to certification to meet the demand of imminent teacher shortages (Texas Education Agency, 1991). In Texas, evidence projected a teacher shortage in the 1990s and the call went out to educational institutions with the capacity to train, teach, and certify teachers to explore additional avenues to expand the population of qualified teachers for the classroom (May, Katsinas, & Moore, 2003). Furthermore, May et al. (2003) state, “an alternative approach – a fast track to certification – has become a necessity for providing qualified teachers for the nation's schools” (p. 68).

When the United States Supreme Court in 1982 ruled in *Plyler v. Doe* that every Texas school must educate all children living within a school district between the ages of 5 and 17 regardless of immigration status, it would not be long before the need for additional bilingual teachers would be felt. According to the Center for Immigration Studies, from 1970-1990 the population of Texas increased from 11.2 million to 16.9 million (Bouvier and Martin, 1995). During the same time period approximately one million students enrolled in Texas schools. Additionally, the Center for Immigration Studies predicted in Texas that Hispanics would surpass all ethnicities in the classroom by 2015 and by 2020 will encompass over 45% of all students (Bouvier and Martin, 1995). In 1986, the Immigration Reform and Control Act (IRCA) granted amnesty to many immigrants and became a contributor to Texas's growth as approximately one million people came to Texas (Camarota, 2000).

The predicted need for bilingual teachers would not be the only driving factor for educator preparation programs to address. With the passing of such laws as the Education for All Handicapped Children Act of 1975 and the Individuals with Disabilities Act of 1984, the additional need for trained special education teachers would quickly call (U.S. Department of Education, n.d.). These laws provided the right of every child to a free and appropriate education under the 14th Amendment equal protection clause of the United States Constitution

In 1984, the Texas legislature passed House Bill 72 which enacted sweeping reforms of the public school system. Reforms resulting from the passage of HB 72 were a pay raise for teachers, revamped school finance methods, and other steps to improve academic achievement of students. With a critical teacher shortage predicted on the horizon (Texas Education Agency, 1991), one school district used the bill to establish an alternate educator preparation program.

In 1985, the Houston Independent School District (HISD) became the first alternative certification program in Texas and certified 276 teachers started in its inaugural year (Texas Education Agency, 1991). The program offered through the HISD was district-based and consisted of a limited amount of higher education course work in conjunction with district-based training (Texas Education Agency, 1991). The focus was on core and specialty subjects, vocational and special education, and administration positions such as superintendent and principal (Southern Regional Education Board, 2011).

In 1986, the Dallas Independent School District opened its version of an alternative certification teaching program known as Dallas Independent School District

Alternative Certification Program (Alternative Certification, 2013). The DISD-ACP program differentiates itself from other programs by offering guaranteed teaching positions within the district upon completion and a pre-paid internship salary “(An Alternative Approach to Teacher Retirement”, 2006).

According to the Texas Education Agency (1991) report, *Alternative Teacher Certification in Texas*, in a typical program the following occurred:

1. Intern is recruited and screened during the fall or spring of the year
2. Official baccalaureate transcripts from an accredited institution are submitted
3. Standardized test assessing basic reading, writing, mathematics skills completed
4. Upon passing of the exam, candidate enters pre-assignment training
5. At night, or during summer, intensive training and preparation (precedes classroom placement as official teacher of record) begins while intern keeps current job until mid-August (if needed)
6. During the full-year program, the new teacher (or intern) is carefully supervised and mentored by at least five individuals
7. After one year of internship, new teacher must pass a standardized test of certification
8. If successful in passing exam, recommendation to receive state certification is requested from program director and principal

The purpose of the program was to assist in providing an intensive, one-year program to alleviate teacher shortages in grades K-12. Since 1985, alternative certification programs have assisted in not only alleviating the aforementioned teacher shortages but also the need for a more diverse teaching pool with respect to gender, ethnicity, and high-need subject areas.

The general characteristics of interns in the Houston ISD program turned out to be a precursor to future national programs. Candidates were degreed graduates in

possession of a baccalaureate degree from an accredited, recognized institution of higher learning. Oftentimes, candidates were switching careers in the hope of giving back to the community. The majority of them were minority, and an unusually high number (30%) were male (Texas Education Agency, 1991).

Two other models of alternative programs emerged in the subsequent year (1986) and became known as higher education (university-based) and education service center-based (ESC) models as shown in Table 1 (Texas Education Agency, 1991).

Table 1

University and Education Service Center Based Models

Teacher Training Models	Requirements
Local school district	Training provided by district mixed with some higher education course work; internship with mentor
Higher education	Core of training provided through university course work; collaboration with university and local district for field-based internship with mentor teacher
Education Service Center (ESC)	Majority of training provided by consultants/specialists; limited higher education supervision; some higher education course work

Source: Texas Education Agency (1991). *Alternative teacher certification in Texas* (pp. 7-8).

In the higher education model, university course work provides the core of training to the student. The university and local school district partner in providing field-based instruction along with professional guidance through the use of a mentor.

In the Education Service Center or ESC model, the majority of instruction is provided through a regional, state-funded education service center and delivered by education consultants and teaching specialists. Though similar to a mentor, and

possessing similar credentials, service centers relied on a master teacher to assist the student.

Within four years of implementation, alternative certification programs numbered 13 across the state (Texas Education Agency, 1991) and all “included a number of pilots designed with greater flexibility in how they were implemented to respond to district needs...” (p. 9).

The growth of educator preparation programs fluctuated dependent upon type of program since the first approved alternative certification by way of the Houston ISD. According to data from the Texas Education Agency and the State Board of Education Certification, alternative certification programs lagged considerably to university-based alternative programs. Between the years of 1985-2000, a total of 68 university-based programs were approved in comparison to a total of 21 for alternative certification programs (Texas Education Agency, 2007). However, with the ability of community colleges and private entities to begin providing programs in the year 2000, alternative certification programs soared to 53 approvals compared to only 4 university-based in the years 2001-2007 (Texas Education Agency, 2007). Currently, 62% of the approved educator preparation programs in Texas offer an alternative path leading to certification (State Board of Educator Certification, 2014).

Presently, Texas remains proactive in its approach to teaching shortages by outlining directives in the Texas Education Code. In Section 21.049(a), alternative certification is specifically addressed as a method to providing qualified people into the teaching profession (Texas Education Agency, 2013a).

Texas continues to prioritize teacher recruitment in proactive attempts to reach out and obtain a diverse pool of candidates:

Texas Higher Education Coordinating Board shall develop and implement programs to identify talented students and recruit those students and persons, including high school and undergraduate students, mid-career and retired professionals, honorably discharged and retired military personnel, and members of underrepresented gender and ethnic groups into the teaching profession (Texas Education Code, Section 21.004(a)), Texas Education Agency 2013b).

Currently, in the state of Texas, certification is required [Texas Education Code, Section 21.003] and five basic requirements must be met for someone to become a certified teacher (Texas Education Agency, 2012).

1. Obtain a bachelor's degree from an accredited college or university
2. Complete an education preparation program approved by the state of Texas
3. Pass appropriate certification exam(s) for the subject and grade level desired to teach
4. Submit a state application after passing all necessary certification exam(s) and after completing all education preparation program requirements
5. Fingerprinting for all first-time applicants as part of a national criminal background check for the fee of \$42.25

Collin College (formerly Collin County Community College) on August 4, 2000, became the first community college in Texas to offer an accredited teacher certification program (Collin College, 2005). "The purpose of the alternative certification program was to prepare experienced workers to become middle and high school technology teachers," according to former Teacher Certification Program Director Brenda Kihl (personal communication, May 1, 2011).

In 2002, with the state of Texas granting permission for private programs to begin offering alternative certification teaching programs, proprietary entities began to open their doors to prospective students. Education Career Alternatives Program (ECAP,

2014) was the first state-based, for-profit approved alternative certification program (Education Career Alternatives Program, 2014) and serves the Dallas/Fort Worth area. In the same year, ACT-Rio Grande Valley became the second state-based, approved private alternative certification program (FAQs, 2014) serving south Texas. In 2003, IteachTEXAS of Denton opened and was the first alternative certification program to deliver all coursework online (Iteach, 2014).

As students navigate learning in the 21st century, educators will need to receive training to provide students with the skills to be successful. Educator preparation programs will continue offering various pathways to teacher certification whether it is through a traditional, undergraduate program or one of the more recent alternative programs providing hopeful teacher candidates a path to certification (United States Department of Education, 2011) because Texas is forecasted to have unfilled teaching positions in the areas of bilingual/English as second language, career and technical education, computer science, mathematics, science, and special education (United States Department of Education, 2014). As student populations increase in Texas, schools will continue to seek new educators to meet the demands of an ever-growing, diverse student enrollment (Lorenzo, 2013). With recent emphasis on science, technology, engineering, and mathematics programs (STEM), Texas schools continue to face the need to recruit, train, and place highly qualified personnel in classrooms (Lorenzo, 2013). Though alternative educator programs continue to morph to be more similar to traditional university-based certification programs, both provide avenues for aspiring teachers to obtain certification.

CHAPTER 3

METHODOLOGY

This study used a qualitative, historical analysis, non-emergent research design to study the establishment and evolution of Texas' alternative certification programs from 1985 to 2014. The study used both primary and secondary resources as research tools and employed the use of semi-structured interviews and the literature review for the collection of data to analyze and further understand this evolution.

Historical research is the process of gathering and organizing of background information in a field of study to gain insight into current/future trends (Busha & Harter, 1980) and will assist in understanding the evolution of teacher certification programs. Historical research is also used to gather and interpret information from both primary and secondary sources (Wesner, 1994). Primary sources are materials from the past studied directly such as writings, interviews, letters, and personal testimony while secondary sources are materials that researchers use to interpret information gathered from primary sources and thus are not a direct part of the history they discuss (Westminster Theological Seminary, 2014). Oral history is a primary source possessing unique benefits to the researcher. Oral history allows the researcher to conduct interviews and ask questions they are personally interested in while interviewees provide their own stories in their own words (Walbert, 2002). The primary and secondary sources constitute data in historical research and oftentimes triangulated for verification of facts (Wesner, 1994). According to Berg (1998), historical research is significant because it can assist in uncovering the unknown since some events are not recorded. Additionally, it can help answer questions about the past and identify

relationships to better understand current events because historical research is not the mere accumulation of facts but an active account of past events helping communicate an understanding of past events (Berg, 1998). When searched and carefully reflected upon, historical research can provide patterns and offer critical insights of past events allowing the construction of relevant information (McNeill, 1985).

A historical study was selected because of the desire to understand the origin and subsequent growth of alternative certification programs in Texas. Furthermore, this type of qualitative approach illustrates trends in alternative certification programs as compared to traditional certification programs, as well as lends insight to future possibilities of educator preparation programs.

Research Questions

The questions guiding this research sought to examine the evolution of alternative teaching certification programs in the state of Texas.

1. What were the motivating factors for establishing an alternative teacher certification process?
2. At its inception, what were the primary differences between the alternative certification program and the traditional certification programs offered by colleges and universities?
3. How has the alternative teacher certification program evolved?
4. Currently, what are the primary differences between the alternative teacher certification program and traditional teacher certification programs offered by colleges and universities

As alternative certification programs in Texas continue to trend upward in conferring teaching certificates, it is important to take a retrospective look at the various routes of educator preparation programs.

Evaluation Methods

Qualitative evaluation methods for historical research include the use of interviews, observations in the field, and various forms of documents (Patton, 2002). Interviews use a framework of open-ended questions to gain insight regarding, "...people's experiences, perceptions, opinions, feelings, and knowledge" (Patton, 2002, p. 2). Lastly, documents are oftentimes written and come in numerous forms including but not limited to publications, reports, and responses to surveys (Patton, 2002).

Data triangulation is the use of various sources of information to establish a level of "certainty" or validity to a study and is utilized often due to its ease of implementation for analysis through comparing information (Guion, Diehl, & McDonald, 2011). Furthermore, according to Yeasmin and Rahman (2012), triangulation is a process of verification by using multiple data sources (e.g. historical documents, print media, etc.) in studies of inquiry. In Thurmond's work (as cited in Guion et al., 2011), advantages of triangulation are increased confidence in collected data and increased clarity of the research problem while the primary disadvantage is the amount of time to identify additional resources that are oftentimes not readily available. By utilizing triangulation, the trustworthiness of research findings can be assessed through confirmation of findings with several data collection methods (Miles & Huberman, 1994) and triangulated data increases confidence by "minimizing the inadequacies of single-source research" (Yeasmin & Rahman, 2012, p. 159).

Information provided by interviewees and primary and secondary sources contained in the literature review, were compared to the study's four research questions. Complete responses provided by interviewees were categorized by question

number and manually written on a large whiteboard resulting in each interview question having eight responses. Upon examination, it was noticed that specific words and phrases were common among interviewee responses to each question. Subsequently, those words and phrases (descriptors) were coded by means of frequency and designated as emerging themes. Afterwards, the process was duplicated with the remaining primary and secondary sources of data contained in the literature review.

Data Collection

Documents, records, and oral histories can be classified as either primary or secondary sources (Berg, 1998). Primary sources are preferred because they contain direct, firsthand knowledge of information (Berg, 1998). Primary sources such as individual interviews, archived documents in the form of personal papers and school records, and original academic studies contribute to the literature review.

The use of interviews can be valuable because they provide depth and perspective to a topic (Patton, 2002). Interviews allow the person being interviewed to be more of a participant making a channel to the researcher while providing information from their experiences (DiCicco-Bloom & Crabtree, 2006). In this study, semi-structured interviews were used to foster open dialogue between interviewer and interviewees. Semi-structured interviews are widely used and valued because they allow the interviewer to delve deep into subject material by having a back and forth dialogue (DiCicco-Bloom & Crabtree, 2006). Interviews allow researcher and interviewees to experience human interaction through conversation (Walbert, 2002). Subjects interviewed consisted of higher education administrators directly associated with the

establishment and monitoring of alternative certification programs and secondary school administrators. The professional expertise of interviewees had four individuals with traditional-based preparation program knowledge, three individuals with alternative-based preparation program knowledge, and one with both traditional and alternative preparation program knowledge. Personal communication with various individuals related to alternative certification was used in the collection of data as a primary source. Personal communication was not considered the same as interviewing because despite providing information individuals were not asked to complete the interview protocol. Documentation from the Texas Education Agency and State Board of Educator Certification are additional primary sources.

Secondary sources are not as valued as primary sources but are useful because they provide a general awareness of a topic (Berg, 1998). Editorials, books, and numerous articles (peer-reviewed and non-peer-reviewed) found in the literature review help compare and contrast certification programs. Additionally, federal and state government research reports, expository essays, and issue briefs were used to gain knowledge. Research reports, essays, and briefs provided up-to-date information from practitioners in the arena of teacher certification and were drawn from governmental agencies, magazines, and newspapers. Finally, lectures from two university-based libraries provided insight on literature reviews and historical research.

Limitations

A limitation of the study is the interview process. Interviewing requires the researcher to gather self-reported data and assumes interviewees contain no bias in

their responses (Busha & Harter, 1980). Additionally, it is impossible to know whether or not the interviewee is communicating truthful statements (Walford, 2011). Moreover, people's memories are malleable and thus are subject to change over time due to past experiences. The logical error of survivorship bias could be a limitation. Subjects that agree to be interviewed may only accept because they have views with a strong urge to share as compared to others whose indifference or lack of passion may simply refuse to be interviewed. Also, the lack of primary resources could possibly be an obstacle.

Delimitations

The focus of inquiry was alternative certification programs in the state of Texas. The Region 10 education service center is one of 20 service centers that provide services to school districts within a defined geographic region. The focus was on Region 10 and how could represent the state because it contains urban, suburban, and rural school districts.

Researcher Bias

I was employed for four years as an adjunct professor in the Teacher Certification and Preparation (TCP) program at Collin College. The program was classified as an alternative certification route to teaching and I taught classes in pedagogy and professional ethics and responsibilities.

Sampling

Purposive sampling represents numerous non-probability sampling techniques.

The focus was on my judgment regarding choosing participants from a population. In qualitative studies, the identification of information-rich informants is desired because their knowledge about the research issues is believed to be greater than the average person (Hardon, Hodgkin, & Fresle, 2004). While purposive sampling can be advantageous with its multiple techniques available to me, the issue of bias can be problematic and disadvantageous.

Snowball sampling was the choice of techniques to identify and select interviewees. Snowball sampling is one type of purposive sampling that allows the researcher to select two persons of interest with a high level of knowledge in the respective research to be interviewed. Afterwards, the researcher could ask the initial two interviewees for additional subjects that might contain similar levels of knowledge and expertise (Hardon et al., 2004). Though one advantage of this type of sampling can be the ease and comfort of subsequent subjects likely having knowledge of one another, one issue that can be present as problematic is that the subjects are too networked thereby limiting variation (Hardon et al., 2004).

Interview Protocol

Eight open-ended, semi-structured interview questions were used in the development of the interview protocol. The interview protocol was as follows:

1. In your opinion, what should an educator preparation program require to earn a certificate to teach in Texas?
2. In your role as an educator, describe your experience with alternative certification programs in Texas.
3. What were the motivating factors that led to the establishment of alternative certification programs being a viable option in Texas?

4. In your opinion, what impact has alternative certification programs had on the teaching profession?
5. In your opinion, how do teachers earning a certificate via an alternative certification program differ from those earning a certificate via a more traditional certification route?
6. If you were the researcher for this study, whom would you recommend speaking with about alternative certification programs in Texas?
7. Would you recommend speaking with someone that may have a different perspective than you about alternative certification programs in Texas?
8. Would you like to express any additional comments about alternative certification programs?

Interviews

Interviews were conducted in a location chosen by the interviewee with the assumption they would be more relaxed and comfortable, thus providing the highest quality responses possible. A handout of the eight interview questions was provided for previewing as the interview protocol was reviewed. The interview was untimed and responses were provided orally from the interviewee. I recorded responses on an answer sheet before moving to the next question. In some instances, follow-up questions similar but not identical to those in the protocol were asked for clarification to a response. Upon conclusion of the interview, the opportunity to review written responses was provided and interviewees were notified that responses would remain confidential. The following people were interviewed:

- Adam Butterfield is an educator program advisor with the private company Texas Teachers. Mr. Butterfield recruits qualified people to the teaching profession for Texas Teachers and has just completed his fourth year of employment.

- Bob Lovelady is the Head of School at McKinney Christian Academy. Mr. Lovelady has over 25 years of education experience as a secondary school principal. He has experience supervising countless numbers of teachers that have completed teaching training from either traditional preparation programs or alternative preparation programs.

- Dr. Logan Faris is the principal at McKinney High School and has been in education for over 20 years. Dr. Faris has interviewed and hired numerous teachers coming out of either traditional or alternative preparation programs. Dr. Faris is a graduate from a post-baccalaureate program through Stephen F. Austin University.

- Amy Northcutt is a principal in the Sulphur Bluff ISD. Ms. Northcutt has been in education over 20 years as a classroom teacher and administrator. She works extensively with graduates from alternative educator preparation programs because her school district is located in a remote area of east Texas that experiences difficulty in recruiting and retaining certified teachers.

- Sabrina Belt is employed by Collin College and supervises dual-credit classes. Mrs. Belt is the former program director of the Teacher Certification Program at Collin College and has worked in higher education for over 10 years.

- Dr. Chris Kanouse is the program director of Educator Preparation at the Education Service Center Region 10. Dr. Kanouse has led the program since January 2004. Before coming to Region 10, she was employed at Texas A&M at Commerce working in their post-baccalaureate program.

- Dr. Mary Harris is a professor in the College of Education at the University of North Texas. Dr. Harris's expertise is in the areas of teacher preparation and

professional development with a focus on the early years of teaching. She directed the practicum experience for the UNT post-baccalaureate program from 2002-2008. Before arriving at UNT in 2002, Dr. Harris was at the University of North Dakota (1986-1999) and Kansas State University (1975-1986).

- Brian Garner is the superintendent of schools in the Riesel Independent School District. Mr. Garner has been in education for over 20 years as a classroom teacher, athletic coach, high school principal, and superintendent. He has extensive experience with graduates from alternative educator preparation programs from his years as principal in the Bland Independent School District because the school had difficulty recruiting and retaining certified teachers due to its rural location.

Method of Analysis of Data

Inductive analysis originates with answers but forms questions throughout the research process. The reason to employ inductive analysis of the data is to, "...allow research findings to emerge from the frequent, dominant or significant themes inherent in raw data..." (Thomas, 2003, p. 2). The goal was to construct an explanation by establishing clear links between research questions and research findings to capture themes (Thomas, 2003). An outcome of interviews and the knowledge obtained during interviews, words with common meanings were sorted into word lists. The word lists facilitated sorting the data into themes by marking specific words and phrases to construct patterns. Coding is analysis used to provide, "meaning to the descriptive or inferential information compiled during a study" (Miles & Huberman, 1994, p. 56). It is the process of identifying a set of data and "coding" words and phrases to a theme. For

this study, information provided by interviewees and primary and secondary sources contained in the literature review, were compared to the study's four research questions. Complete responses provided by interviewees were categorized by question number and manually written on a large whiteboard resulting in each interview question having eight responses. Upon examination, it was noticed that specific words and phrases (descriptors) were common among interviewee responses to each question. Subsequently, those words and phrases were coded by means of frequency and designated as emerging themes. Afterwards, the process was duplicated with the remaining primary and secondary sources of data contained in the literature review.

CHAPTER 4

DISCUSSION OF DATA

Introduction

This chapter presents findings of the study designed to provide a historical analysis of alternative teacher certification programs in the state of Texas. The four research questions addressed were:

1. What were the motivating factors for establishing an alternative teacher certification process?
2. At its inception, what were the primary differences between the alternative certification program and the traditional certification programs offered by colleges and universities?
3. How has the alternative teacher certification program evolved?
4. Currently, what are the primary differences between the alternative teacher certification program and traditional certification programs offered by colleges and universities?

Summary of Methodology

This study used a qualitative research design to study the evolution of Texas' alternative certification programs from 1985 to 2012. The study used both primary and secondary sources as research tools and employed the use of interviews and the literature review for the collection of data. A historical study was selected because of the desire to understand the origin and subsequent growth of alternative certification programs in Texas. Furthermore, this type of qualitative approach illustrates trends in alternative certification programs as compared to traditional certification programs, as well as lends insight to future possibilities of educator preparation programs.

Discussion

Research Question 1

The first research question investigated the motivating factors for the state of Texas to establish an alternative teacher certification process. The theme that emerged from the data most often was Texas faced an impending teacher shortage as the state's population was forecasted to increase dramatically in the 1980s and future decades (Wenglinsky, 2000; Hussar, 1999; CollegeBoard, 2006; U.S. Department of Education, 2011; Texas Education Agency, 1997). In each of the eight interviews, all respondents made reference to the establishment of alternative certification programs. As families relocated to Texas, school-aged children would enter schools at a faster rate than the traditional educator preparation programs could graduate certified teachers (Feistritzer, 2005). As population increased, alternative preparation programs began offering certification in areas of instruction based upon the needs of local districts. Requests would be for teachers at the elementary and secondary levels. Region 10 Education Service Center (ESC) in Richardson, Texas, responded to local north Texas school districts' requests for teachers certified in special education and bilingual education by offering an alternative educator preparation program in those two areas exclusively. "The educator program at Region 10 originated in 1992 because by listening to the needs of surrounding school districts for teachers in specific content areas we developed a program to meet those needs," said program director Dr. Chris Kanouse. These requests would correlate with the increase of special education students served in schools as special education laws increased dramatically in the decades following the passage of the Education for All Handicapped Children Act (1975) and other civil rights

legislation. Moreover, the need for bilingual teachers correlated with the population growth of various ethnic groups in Texas (Lorenzo, 2013). Over the years, Region 10 ESC added additional certification areas in nearly all areas of instruction recognized by the state of Texas because surrounding districts continued to request more areas of specialization be offered.

Furthermore, in August of 2000, Collin College (formerly Collin County Community College) implemented its alternative teacher certification program from Collin county school districts requests for more certified teachers in technology and computer science. “We started small but it did not take long for the program to expand offerings in more certification areas in response to area school districts wanting more certified teachers,” said former director Sabrina Belt. In the following years, Collin’s alternative program would offer certification in nearly all areas of teacher specialization. The establishment of alternative teacher certification programs to overcome predicted teacher shortages is more of a factor in smaller populated, rural school districts than larger, suburban and urban districts across the state. The Sulphur Bluff ISD is a rural district in northeast Texas. The majority of teachers in the district are composite certified because they must teach all subject areas in their field of study. “A science teacher at the secondary level teaches all science classes in my high school and in many cases, a teacher certified through an alternative program is the only option to fill the classroom,” mentioned principal Amy Northcutt. The needs assessment approach taken by alternative programs implies that this is an effective way to address the issue of teacher shortages.

Another emergent theme was the desire to recruit teachers with a diverse

background of work experience. Additionally, diversity meant the desire to attract more men and minorities into the classroom (Shen, 1997; Wilson et al, 2001; Kwiatkowski, 1999). In the interviews, all respondents suggested the teaching profession would benefit from more men and minorities in the classroom. “The workforce outside of education contained professionals with strong content knowledge in the areas of mathematics, sciences, and technology that schools could utilize,” replied McKinney High School principal Dr. Logan Faris. A motivating factor was to attract this diverse population with the establishment of an alternative route to teacher certification that would be characterized by coursework teaching the nuts and bolts of classroom teaching in a streamlined fashion and alternative programs offered a route that allowed candidates to become certified (Texas Education Agency, 2001). This streamlined process became more realistic when the No Child Left Behind (2001) legislation suggested teacher quality as the passing of a content examination. The result was people seeking a second career after retirement or a change in career to teaching had been given a pathway to certification. When legislation such as NCLB became law, it redefined teacher quality as “highly qualified” and subsequently placed a higher emphasis on content knowledge a teacher had to acquire to become certified. In addition to a bachelor’s degree, highly qualified meant new teachers had to possess a minimum of 24 hours (at least 12 at the junior and senior level) in their academic teaching field and pass a state content assessment. “The idea that a content examination could substitute for teacher preparation, and in some cases for student teaching, appealed to many career changers and retirees as they sought a quick way to begin earning a paycheck and re-establishing themselves in the workforce,” said former

principal Bob Lovelady.

Economics were a factor too in the establishment of an alternative route. The downturn in the economy leading to recessions resulted in cutbacks to the workforce and well-educated individuals found few job opportunities (Bradley, 2010). In the 1981 recession, despite a GDP increase, unemployment increased and educated people were without means of providing for families. The recession of 2001 brought about similar results when the dotcom industry of the late 1990s failed (Hull, 2010) and many professionals in the various fields of technology possessed expertise but no employment. Moreover, without a valid teaching certificate they could not seek employment as a classroom teacher. In an interview with former director of Collin College's alternative certification program Dr. Brenda Kihl, she stated, "when school districts began to emphasize technology as a method for delivering classroom instruction, professionals saw a chance to change careers and re-enter the workforce in an alternate career." Similarly, some of these professionals left the workforce via early retirement but desired to continue working in a different career (Olson, 2011). "Career changers and retirees not only had "real world" skills but oftentimes brought a higher level of maturity to the teaching profession," according to Riesel ISD school superintendent Brian Garner. Economics also brought an unintended outcome to the alternative certification pathway. As education funding from the state decreased for schools, districts needed a way to keep classrooms full of teachers. In a discussion with retired Princeton ISD superintendent of schools Frank Garner, "education cutbacks forced districts to lay off teachers and offer early retirement packages to others, those coming out of alternative certification programs were more attractive because they could

be paid a beginning teacher's salary" (personal communication, August 10, 2014).

Political factors as they related to the passage of legislation emerged as a theme. As alternative certification programs became established, competition resulted between alternative programs and traditional programs (Bradley, 2010). When alternative programs began in the 1980s, it was through school districts, community colleges, education service centers, and universities/colleges via post-baccalaureate programs. When private, for-profit entities became eligible in the year 2002 to offer an alternative pathway leading to teacher certification; traditional programs experienced decreased enrollments in their programs. In one interview, a stakeholder working in a traditional program believed an alternative certification pathway was a method to privatize the educator preparation process. Couple this belief with the NCLB legislation that redefined teacher quality and traditional colleges of education that offered educator preparation was in an unwanted spotlight because they had become substandard (Greenberg, Walsh and McKee, 2014). In a review of the nation's teacher preparation programs, the National Council on Teacher Quality concluded alternative certification programs have been a disappointing experiment (Greenberg et al., 2014). Private entities began competing against one another and their traditional counterparts for students and students became consumers that battled for the preparation program of their choice and oftentimes, the choice of programs was chosen by lowest cost, fewest classes, and shortest pathway to certification. However, some questioned the quality of alternative preparation programs and concluded, "...the only reason not to pull the plug on the experiment of alternative certification is that traditional teacher preparation continues to have persistent flaws and were traditional preparation to add the value that

it should, teachers produced by alternate routes would never be competitive for jobs anywhere” (Greenberg et al, 2014, p. 91).

Research Question 2

The second research question sought to answer the primary differences between alternative certification programs and traditional certification programs offered by colleges and universities at inception. The first theme to emerge addressed the differences in preparation for the classroom. The original philosophy behind alternative certification programs was teachers could receive a few weeks of classroom instruction and then begin teaching (Feistritzer, 2001; Adcock & Mahlios, 2005). In Texas, candidates entered pre-assignment training and classroom instruction would be comprised of teaching practices for a beginning teacher to be in the classroom (Texas Education Agency, 1991). Meanwhile, under the mentorship of several people, the prospective teacher would intern while in the classroom. Oftentimes, the classroom teacher was not yet certified during this phase of training. However, after completing a one year internship they could be recommended to take the Examination for the Certification of Educators in Texas (Texas Education Agency, 1991). “The traditional certification programs found in colleges and universities held strong to the belief that teachers be able to demonstrate teaching proficiency before entering the classroom,” said University of North Texas professor of education Dr. Mary Harris. Traditional certification programs viewed content knowledge to be proficient with a degree in a teacher’s teaching field (Texas Education Agency, 1991). Strong content knowledge in a teacher’s area of certification was important as demonstrated by the necessity of

passing a state exam and teachers should receive instruction in a preparation program grounded in educational theory and practices and this gained knowledge was just as important as a teacher's knowledge of content (Texas Education Agency, 1991).

The second theme that emerged as a difference between alternative and traditional programs was teachers having graduated from an alternative program were not "real" teachers. According to Adam Butterfield, a program director for Texas Teachers, "graduates from alternative certified programs are sometimes perceived to be not authentic." At inception, "alternative certification programs were viewed as an avenue to recruit, train, and put into classrooms teachers having strong content knowledge gained from life experiences," stated Sabrina Belt. Adults having worked in the "real world" would bring intangibles to the classroom that could only be obtained by working outside of the schoolhouse. These life experiences partnered with a degree would be more than enough to demonstrate knowledge of a subject. Traditional certification programs believed teachers should be fully certified by the state before entering the classroom if for nothing else than the protection of the children. The practice of licensing teachers before entering the classroom was an issue of professional credibility. Alternative certified teachers are not prepared for the teaching profession and subsequently are seen as unequal among peers and heavily scrutinized. Alternative programs provided little more than a highly accelerated preparation program that sent ill-prepared teachers into the classroom at the students' expense (Walsh & Jacobs, 2007).

Additional themes that emerged focused on supervision of teachers, certification requirements, and required coursework to complete the program. Before legislation

was passed for an alternate route, individuals wanting to teach had to receive a “deficiency plan” with a college or university and enroll full-time to complete a one or two year program usually as a full-time student (Texas Education Agency, 1991). At inception, a typical program in Texas required the submission of a baccalaureate degree, passage of a basic standardized test, pre-assignment training, and internship (Texas Education Agency, 1991). During the internship, supervision and mentoring is done by the following: the program supervisor, a district specialist, an on-campus mentor, and two formal appraisers (Texas Education Agency, 1991). After the one year internship, the new teacher must pass the EXCET assessment and receive recommendation for state certification from the building principal and program director (Texas Education Agency, 1991).

Research Question 3

The third research question looked into the evolution of alternative teacher certification programs. The data suggested alternative teacher certification programs evolved with the following themes. Alternative programs began nearly 30 years ago in Texas. They fulfilled a niche in teacher credentialing when the Houston ISD pioneered the first alternative teacher certification program to address the area of critical teacher shortage (Texas Education Agency, 1991). Now, alternative programs certify candidates in all teaching fields and more teachers complete their teacher training through an alternative certification as opposed to a traditional program (Texas Education Agency, 2007). What began as one approved alternative certification program in 1985 expanded into 21 by the year 1990 (Texas Education Agency, 1991).

Alternative programs submit to outside accreditation agencies and fulfill state requirements of offering a 300 hour program consisting of a set of standards for an alternative educator program (Texas Education Agency, 2013a). As alternative certification programs evolved into legitimate providers in educator preparation, competition among programs was introduced. From 1985-2000, the Texas Education Agency regulated the types of teacher preparation programs to university-based, education service centers, and local school districts (Texas Education Agency, 1991; Texas Education Agency, 2007). In the year 2000, legislation was passed granting permission for community colleges and private entities to begin offering educator preparation programs (Texas Education Agency, 2007). Consequently, for-profit entities began to emerge in numbers throughout the state adding to the number of alternative preparation programs. As of 2014, there are 94 approved educator preparation programs designated as alternative (State Board of Education, 2014). The data gathered suggest that competition has been a positive outcome because more teachers have entered the profession with required credentials, overall costs of a program has decreased, and educator preparation programs whether alternative or traditional have become more flexible in class scheduling and completion dates for certification (Angus, 2001; Texas Education Agency, 2007).

Proponents of traditional certification programs admitted alternative certification programs are legitimate and viable long term as another option leading to the classroom. In 1985, Houston ISD's alternative certification program enrolled 276 interns. By 1990, there were 1278 interns enrolled throughout the state in various alternative programs (Texas Education Agency, 1991).

Research Question 4

The fourth research question assessed the current primary differences in alternative certification programs and traditional certification programs. The data suggested that the two certification programs are more alike than different since the inception of alternative certification programs. Yet, differences still exist between the two pathways. The data implied alternative programs offered more program flexibility in comparison to their traditional program counterparts (Dahlkemper, 2001; Spitalli, 2009). The flexibility to complete coursework on weekends, weeknights, and hybrid to full online classes was a significant selling point to students and mentioned in interviews with respondents working directly in alternative certification programs. Furthermore, Adam Butterfield of the alternative preparation program Texas Teachers says, “the flexibility found in an alternative certification program allows students the opportunity to work and bring home a paycheck while completing program requirements.”

Another difference was the professional staff diversity found in alternative certification programs compared to traditional programs. Oftentimes, coursework in traditional certification programs was taught by faculty not currently working in schools but for the university or college. According to Sabrina Belt of Collin College, “in alternative certification programs, instructors are very likely to be working in schools as superintendents, principals, and other various administrative positions, thus bringing a practical approach to instructional content.”

Another difference was not between alternative certification programs and traditional certification programs directly but the multiple instructional approaches solely among alternative programs (Stoddard & Flodden, 1995; Lee, 2009; May et al, 2003).

Currently, state agencies oversee all aspects of educator preparation programs and provide program standards to each. Therefore, programs do not differ in what they teach but how they teach the provided standards.

Educator preparation programs have been influenced by legislation such as No Child Left Behind (2001) because required hours have increased since establishment. Currently, regardless of educator preparation program, all graduates must successfully complete 300 hundred clock hours of coursework/training, a minimum of 30 hours of student observation, either a one-year internship or 12-week student teaching practicum and pass two state-issued appropriate content-based exam and pedagogy/professional responsibilities exam before earning their certificates (Texas Education Agency, 2012).

Unintended Consequences

There were unintended consequences with the establishment of alternative certification programs. With the passing of legislation to allow for-profit entities to enter the educator preparation program arena, the number of programs surged as individuals coming out of the 2001 recession were seeking jobs. Though experienced in the workforce, newly certified graduates could be hired as first-year teachers and paid at entry level salaries as new teachers. In some locales, alternative programs graduated enough candidates that the teacher market for certain subject areas became flooded when the Texas legislature cut education spending. As local school districts in suburban areas began to cut teaching staff, alternative certified program graduates found themselves competing against many experienced teachers. In some cases,

alternative certification programs, such as Collin College's teacher certification program, were shuttered because the need did not exist any longer.

CHAPTER 5

SUMMARY

Introduction

This study was designed to research the history of alternative certification teaching programs in the state of Texas. Universities and colleges dominated educator preparation programs until the early 1980s when the state granted the Houston ISD permission to recruit and train individuals desiring to enter into the teaching profession. With the establishment of the Houston ISD program, an alternative pathway leading to teacher certification had become reality.

This study investigated the motivating factors for establishing alternative teacher certification programs in the state of Texas. The study also looked at the primary differences between alternative certification programs and traditional certification programs found in colleges and universities. These differences were examined at two different points in time of alternative certification programs; at inception and current status. Lastly, the study researched how alternative certification teaching programs evolved in the shadow of traditional certification teaching programs.

Implications for Practice

Upon conclusion of all interviews, there was consensus that alternative certification teaching programs in Texas have stepped out of the shadow of traditional certification teaching programs by offering a legitimate alternate educator preparation program leading to teacher certification and licensure. As noted by a director of one alternative program, the two times in life persons are most likely to decide to enter

teaching are as undergraduates preparing for an adult career or as adults contemplating a career change. There was also agreement among those interviewed that traditional certification programs continue to prepare young undergraduates to enter teaching while both programs offer viable routes leading to certification. Nonetheless, the findings suggest alternative certification programs are better suited for individuals needing an educator preparation program offering greater flexibility because of the need to retain employment. Professionals working directly with alternative programs and the recruitment of students routinely mentioned flexibility as a strong factor in an applicant's decision on choice of educator preparation program.

The returning adult student is more likely to choose the alternative certification route due to the time factor. Alternative certification programs are a fast-track to teacher certification and the ability for a person to complete the program as fast as possible was viewed as positive by some interviewed but as a liability by others. The growing numbers of those who choose the alternative certification route indicates a positive view by students.

Alternative certification programs have found a niche by focusing on graduates who want to enter teaching as a career change. Those interviewed working within AC programs commonly said applicants admitted to either desiring or needing a career change. The caveat to career changers becoming certified through an AC program is the number of school districts who by policy or by practice refuse to consider alternately certified teachers for employment. This was found most often in interviewing professionals in larger enrollment, suburban, and well-established school districts. In an effort to counter those school districts who deny employment to its graduates,

alternative certification programs have continued to serve those who seek alternative teacher certification by listening to its closest stakeholders in local school districts and offering certification in high-need areas of specializations. The findings of this study suggest alternative certification programs should continue to follow the needs-assessment approach in deciding which areas of specialization they need to offer.

State policies supported alternative certification programs benefitting from the flexibility of the Texas State Board of Educator Certification (SBEC) with regard to route of preparation leading to certification when elected state representatives passed legislation allowing the establishment of AC programs in 1985 and later in 2002 for private-based programs (Texas Education Agency, 2007). The SBEC requires an aspiring teacher to choose a preparation program from an approved program list. Teacher preparation programs differ in curriculum and course requirements. Alternative programs oftentimes offer more practical classes in education and choose to forgo the theoretical-based classes found in traditional programs. Alternative programs continue to take advantage of the SBEC's flexibility because when referring to certification, there are no differences between the Texas teaching certificate earned through an alternative program or a traditional program; the differences only lie in the route leading to certification (Alternative Certification for Teachers-San Antonio, 2014, "FAQs," para.6).

Furthermore, in a *New York Times* article, Brad Jupp a senior program aide to education secretary Arne Duncan predicted that it is a great time for individuals to enter teaching as a second career (Olson, 2011). According to Aaron Chowning, North Texas Christian Academy head-of-school and former graduate of an alternative certification program, this would imply that alternative certification programs need to continue

focusing on the future by considering the possibility of teaching fields will emerge that do not currently exist (personal communication, September 19, 2013). The area of online high school courses and totally online elementary through secondary schools are emerging as a viable alternative for homeschooling, students with special needs and rural populations. Per a principal in an interview, the addition of a specialty in online education would give alternative certification an edge in the instructional delivery system.

This study appeals to further research in all aspects of educator preparation programs and not only alternative certification teaching programs. National studies completed by Adelman, Michie, and Bogart (1986) and another by Shen (1997), begs the investigation into alternative certification teaching programs. Adelman et al. (1986) studied the quality of 20 alternative and retraining programs funded by the U.S. Department of Education. The study was conducted for federal policymakers and provided an initial, exploratory view into the range of alternative programs offered nationally at the time (Adelman et al., 1986). One criticism of the study was the sample of programs was not random and in all likelihood, led to overall bias in the findings (Feistritzer & Haar, n.d.). Shen (1997) conducted a study to compare the general characteristics (demographics, work experience, etc.) of teachers prepared via traditional college-based programs and alternative teaching programs. Though considered an untapped area of research at the time, the study was plagued by erroneous reporting of data by participants and thusly considered unreliable (Feistritzer & Haar, n.d.).

Recommendations for Future Research

The development of alternative certification programs might benefit from research on the retention rate of teachers coming out of an alternative certification program to see whether or not those individuals truly changed to a teaching career or viewed teaching as a transitional period between jobs and exited the profession within a few years. While this study provided evidence to support the idea of individuals changing careers to education, it did not address the length of time graduates continued in the profession. Comparison of data from different regions of the country as well as rural to urban to suburban would be interesting, but the value in the development of area programs might rely more on comparison of demographically similar areas. Quantification on success indicators as defined by the Texas Education Agency of alternatively certified teachers compared to traditionally certified teachers is needed.

A qualitative component on the satisfaction of the second career teachers who received alternative certification could assist in the continual improvement in the alternative certification programs. If they left, why did they leave? If they stayed why did they stay? What areas of education in preparation for the classroom would enhance their experience as new teachers and give them greater confidence?

As for this study, the researcher would have examined the motivating factors that led to the establishment of alternative certification teaching programs in other states. Did other states establish their respective alternative educator preparation programs in response to the same factors as Texas?

An additional area for study would be to examine how the hiring of graduates from alternative programs changed over time. It was noted in one of the interviews that

most school administrators get into mid-management coming out of the teaching ranks. As current administration responsible for hiring leave the profession, it is probable that some will be replaced by teachers leaving the classroom and seeking to enter administrative positions. With having personal experience with alternative preparation programs, it has not been determined if new administrators view graduates from alternate routes differently in the hiring process.

Ideally, teacher preparation whether alternative or traditional should be continually studied and evaluated. Those who teach children influence the future and their own preparation for that task should not be taken lightly. In the words of the educator Marva Collins, the founder of the former Westside Preparatory School in Chicago, when asked about teaching training responded, "What's wrong with you as a teacher? Don't try to fix the students, fix ourselves first. The good teacher makes the poor student good and the good student superior. When our students fail, we, as teachers, have failed" (Johnson, 2004).

APPENDIX A
INTERVIEW PROTOCOL QUESTIONS

1. In your opinion, what should an educator preparation program require to earn a certificate to teach in Texas?
2. In your role as an educator, describe your experience with alternative certification programs in Texas.
3. What were the motivating factors that led to the establishment of alternative certification programs being a viable option in Texas?
4. In your opinion, what impact has alternative certification programs had on the teaching profession?
5. In your opinion, how do teachers earning a certificate via an alternative certification program differ from those earning a certificate via a more traditional certification route?
6. If you were the researcher for this study, whom would you recommend speaking with about alternative certification programs in Texas?
7. Would you recommend speaking with someone that may have a different perspective than you about alternative certification programs in Texas?
8. Would you like to express any additional comments about alternative certification programs?

APPENDIX B

CONSENT FOR PARTICIPATION IN INTERVIEW UNIVERSITY OF NORTH TEXAS

Before consenting to participate in this research study, it is important to read and understand the following explanations of the purpose, benefits and risks of the study and how it will be conducted.

Title of Study: Alternative Teaching Certification Programs in Texas

Student Investigator: David K. Etheredge

Supervising Investigator: Kathleen Whitson, University of North Texas Department of Higher Education & Counseling

Purpose of the Study: The purpose of this study is to review the historical development of alternative certification teaching programs in Texas.

Study Procedures: Selected individuals will be interviewed one time answering a set of open-ended questions. The interview will last approximately 30 minutes and each participant will be given the opportunity to answer as they wish to the set of questions. Permission to record all answers during the interview and later sorted for common themes and phrases is being requested.

Risks: No foreseeable risks are involved in this study.

Benefits: This study is not expected to be of any direct benefit to you, but it is this researcher's hope to learn more about the historical development of alternative certification teaching programs in Texas and how they have evolved in contrast to traditional certification teaching programs. Additionally, an intentional focus will be on the motivating factors that led to the inception of alternative certification programs in Texas.

Compensation: None

Procedures for Maintaining Confidentiality: The confidentiality of your individual responses will be maintained in any publications or presentations regarding this study. The results of this study will not be released to anyone other than the individuals working on this research project.

Questions about the Study: If you have any questions about this research study, you may contact David K. Etheredge at (XXX) XXX-XXXX or Kathleen Whitson at (XXX) XXX-XXXX.

Review for the Protection of Participants: This research study has been reviewed and approved by the UNT Institutional Review Board (IRB). The UNT IRB can be contacted at (940) 565-3940 with any questions regarding the rights of research subjects.

Research Participants' Rights: Your signature below indicated that you have read or have had read to you all of the above and that you confirm all of the following:

- David K. Etheredge has explained the study to you and answered all of your questions. You have been told the possible benefits and the potential risks and/or discomforts of the study.
- You understand that you do not have to take part in this study, and your refusal to participate or your decision to withdraw will involve no penalty or loss of rights or benefits. The study personnel may choose to stop your participation at any time.
- You understand your rights as a research participant and you voluntarily consent to participate in this study.
- You have been told you will receive a copy of this form.

Printed Name of Participant

Signature of Participant

Date

For Student Investigator or Designee: I certify that I have reviewed the contents of this form with the subject signing above. I have explained the possible benefits and the potential risks and/or discomforts of the study. It is my opinion that the participant understood the explanation.

Signature of Student Investigator

Date

APPENDIX C
SCRIPT FOR SOLICITING INTERVIEW

Name of Possible Participant: _____

Phone Number/Email of Participant:

Contact by Phone:

Hello, my name is David Etheredge and I am a graduate student at The University of North Texas researching the history of alternative certification teaching programs in Texas. It is my understanding that you have professional insight on the certification of teachers in the state of Texas? If yes, would you agree to an interview conducted by me?

Date of Interview: _____

Time of Interview: _____

Interview Location: _____

[Repeat Date, Time, and Location]

Thank you for agreeing to be interviewed and I look forward to gaining some of your insight.

Contact by Email:

Greetings...my name is David Etheredge and I am a graduate student at The University of North Texas in the department of Higher Education and Counseling. Currently, I am conducting a research study that looks into the history of alternative certification teaching programs in Texas and how they have evolved in contrast to traditional certification teaching programs.

It is my understanding you have professional insight on the certification of teachers in the state of Texas. If you are agreeable, I would like to request a brief interview in person at a time and date of your convenience. I look forward to hearing from you soon.

David K. Etheredge
(XXX) XXX-XXXX

REFERENCES

- ACT-Rio Grande Valley. (2014). FAQs. Retrieved from www.actrgv.com
- Adcock, P., & Mahlios, M. (2005). *National alternative teacher certification programs: Their purpose, design, and participants*. Retrieved from <http://www.usca.edu/essays/vol152005/adcock.pdf>
- Adelman, N., Michie, J., & Bogart, J. (1986). *An exploratory study of teacher alternative certification and retraining programs*. Retrieved from www.eric.ed.gov/?id=ED277692
- Alternative certification. (2013). Retrieved November 12, 2013, from www.dallasisd.org/Page716
- Alternative teacher certification. (2004, September). *Education Week*. Retrieved from <http://www.edweek.org/ew/issues/alternative-teacher-certification/>
- Alternative teacher certification-San Antonio. (2014). *About ACT-San Antonio*. Retrieved from www.actsantonio.com/about/faq
- American Association of Colleges for Teacher Education. (2010). *Evidence of teacher effectiveness by pathway to entry into teaching*. Retrieved from www.aacte.org
- An alternative approach to teacher recruitment*. (2006). Retrieved November 12, 2013, from www.beyond-the-book.com/printVersion.jsp?channelType=successtories&created
- Angus, D. (2001). *Professionalism and the public good: A brief history of teacher certification*. Thomas B. Fordham Foundation. Retrieved from www.edexcellence.net
- Berg, B. (1998). *Qualitative research methods for the social sciences*. Boston, MA: Allyn & Bacon.
- Blankenship, D. G. (2010). *How should we teach our future teachers?* Retrieved July 31, 2013, from <http://www.nbcnews.com>
- Bouvier, L. & Martin, J. (1995). *Shaping Texas: The effects of immigration, 1970-2020*. Center for Immigration Studies. Retrieved from www.cis.org/TexasImmigration-1970-2020.
- Bradley, P. (2010). Taking the alternative route. *Community College Week*, 22(12), 6-8. Retrieved from <http://www.ccweek.com>
- Busha, C., & Harter, S. (1980). *Research methods in librarianship: Techniques and interpretations*. Academic Press: New York, NY.

- Camarota, S. (2000). *New INS report: 1986 amnesty increased illegal immigration*. Center for Immigration Studies. Retrieved from www.cis.org/articles/2000/ins1986amnesty/html
- Chaddock, G. (1999). *Bridging the teacher gap*. Retrieved from www.csmonitor.com/layout/set/print/1999/0827/p1s1.html
- CollegeBoard, Center for Innovative Thought. (2006). *Teachers and the uncertain American future*. Retrieved November 12, 2013 from www.collegeboard.com
- Collin College, (2005). *Teacher certification program receives prestigious award*. Collin College News Release. Retrieved from <http://www.collin.edu/news/>
- Connecticut Office of Higher Education. (2013). *Alternate route to teacher certification*. Retrieved from <http://www.ctohe.org/ARC/>
- Dahlkemper, L. (2001). *Are alternative certification programs a solution to the teacher shortage?* Retrieved from www.sedl.org
- DiCicco-Bloom, B., & Crabtree, B. (2006). The qualitative research interview. *Medical Education, 40*, 314-321. Doi:10.1111/j1365-2929.2006.02418.x
- Economic report of the President*. (1991). Washington, DC: Government Printing Office.
- Education Career Alternatives Program. (2014). *About ECAP*. Retrieved from www.ecapteach.com
- Elsbree, W. (1939). *The American teacher*. New York: American Book Company.
- Feistritzer, E. (n.d.). *Research on alternate routes education research*. National Center for Alternative Certification. Retrieved from www.stcloudstate.edu/tpi/initiative/documents/preparation/Research%20on%20Alternate%20Routes.pdf
- Feistritzer, C. Emily. (2001). *Thoughts on teacher preparation*. Edutopia. Retrieved from <http://www.edutopia.org/c-emily-feistritzer-teacher-preparation>
- Feistritzer, E. (2005). *Profile of alternate route teachers*. National Center for Education Information. Retrieved from www.ncei.com
- Feistritzer, E. (2011). *Profile of teachers in the U.S. 2011*. National Center for Education Information. Retrieved from www.ncei.com
- Finn, C., & Petrilli, M. (2007). Foreword: Alternative certification isn't alternative In K. Walsh, & S. Jacobs. *National Council on Teacher Quality*. Retrieved from www.edexcellence.net/institute/publication/order.cfm

- Greenberg, J., Walsh, K., & McKee, A. (2014). *Teacher prep review: A review of the nation's teacher preparation programs*. National Council on Teacher Quality. Retrieved from www.nctq.org/teacherPrep/review2014
- Guion, L., Diehl, D., & McDonald, D. (2011). *Triangulation: Establishing the validity of qualitative studies*. Retrieved from <http://edis.ifas.ufl.edu/fy394>
- Hardon, A., Hodgkin, C., & Fresle, D. (2004). How to investigate the use of medicines by consumers. World Health Organization. University of Amsterdam.
- Hull, J. (2010). *Cutting to the bone: How the economic crisis affects schools*. Center for Public Education. Retrieved from www.centerforpubliceducation.org/Main-Menu/Public-education/Cutting-to-the-bone-At-a-glance/Cutting-to-the-bone-How-the-economic-crisis-affects-schools.html
- Hussar, W. (1999). *Predicting the need for newly hired teachers in the United States to 2008-09*. National Center for Education Statistics. Retrieved from <http://www.nces.ed.gov/pubs99/1999026.pdf>
- Ingersoll, R. (2003). *Is there really a teacher shortage?* Retrieved from <http://repository.upenn.edu/gse-pubs/133>
- Iteach TEXAS. (2014). *Why Iteach-TX?* Retrieved from www.iteachtexas.com
- Johnson, J. (2004). Marva Collins. *National Endowment for the Humanities*. Retrieved from <http://www.neh.gov/about/awards/national-humanities-medals/marva-collins>
- Johnson, R. B. (2006). *Historical research*. Retrieved from www.southalabama.edu/coe/bset/johnson/lectures/lec13.htm
- Klagholz, L. (2000). Growing better teachers in the garden state: New Jersey's "alternate route" to teacher certification. Thomas B. Fordham Foundation. Retrieved from <http://www.edexcellence.net>
- Kwiatkowski, M. (1999). Debating alternative teacher certification: A trial by achievement. In M. Kanstoroom, C. Finn (Eds.), *Better teachers, better schools*. Thomas B. Fordham Foundation: Washington, D.C.
- LaBue, A. (1960). Teacher certification in the United States: A brief history. *Journal of Teacher Education*, 11, 147. DOI: 10.1177/002248716001100203
- Lee, S. (2009). *Evaluating teacher ed. Inside Higher Ed*. Retrieved from <http://www.insidehighered.com/layout/set/print/news/2009/07/24/teachered>
- Lieberman, M. (2007). *The educational morass: Overcoming the stalemate in American education*. Rowman & Littlefield Education: Lanham, MD

- Lorenzo, G. (2013). *Job outlook for teachers*. Lorenzo Associates, Inc. Retrieved from <http://www.edpath.com/GuidetoOL/joboutlookteachers.html>
- Ludlow, B. & Wienke, W. (1994). *Alternative Certification in special education: A qualitative study of two models*. Paper presented at the Annual National Conference of the American Council on Rural Special Education (ACRES), Austin, TX. Abstract retrieved from <http://files.eric.ed.gov/fulltext/ED369603.pdf>
- May, P., Katsinas, S., & Moore, L. (2003). Alternative teacher certification programs and Texas community colleges. In B. Townsend, J. Ignash (Eds.), *New direction for community colleges "The role of the community college in teacher education."* San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass.
- Maykut, P. & Morehouse, R. (2002). *Beginning qualitative research: A philosophical and practical guide*. New York: Routledge Publishing.
- McGucken, W. (1932). *The Jesuits and education: The society's teaching principles and practice, especially in secondary education in the United States*. Eugene, OR: Bruce Publishing Company.
- McIntyre, D. (2009). The history of teacher education as a discipline. In C. Klecka, S. Odell, R. Houston, & R. McBee (Eds.), *Visions for teacher educators: Perspectives on the association of teacher educators' standards*. R&L Education.
- McNeill, W. (1985). *Why study history? American Historical Association*. Retrieved from www.historians.org/about.aha-membership/aha-history-and-archives/archives/why-study-history-%281985%29.
- Miles, M., & Huberman, A. (1994). *Qualitative data analysis*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.
- Nadler, D., & Peterson, P. (2009). What happens when states have genuine alternative certification? *Education Next*, 9(1), Retrieved from <http://www.educationnext.org>
- National Center for Education Information (2005). *Alternative routes to teacher certification: An overview*. Retrieved from <http://www.ncei.com/alt-teacher-cert.htm>
- National Center for Alternative Certification (2010). *Alternative teacher certification: A state by state analysis*. Retrieved from www.teach-now.org/intro.cfm
- National Commission on Excellence in Education. (1983). *A nation at risk: The imperative for educational reform*.
- Newman, K. (2009, Spring). Teaching training, tailor-made. *Education Next*, 9(2). Retrieved from www.educationnext.org/teacher-training-tailor-made/

- North Carolina State University Library (n.d.). *Literature Review* [Audio/video tutorial]. Retrieved November 1, 2013 from <http://www.lib.ncsu.edu/tutorials/lit-review/>
- Olson, E. (2011). Teaching as a second, or even third, career. *The New York Times*. Retrieved from <http://www.nytimes.com/2011/09/16/business/retirementspecial/pursuing-teaching>
- Patton, M. Q. (2002). *Qualitative research and evaluation methods*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.
- Region 10 Education Service Center. Retrieved from www.region10.org
- Roth, D., & Swail, W. (2000). *Certification and teacher preparation in the United States*. Retrieved from <http://www.educationalpolicy.org/pdf/pre1%20certification.pdf>
- Routes to Teacher Certification: Educator Preparation Programs. (2013). *Texas legislative budget board staff*. ID: 384. Retrieved from <http://www.lbb.state.tx.us>
- Rudolph, F. (1990). *The American college & university: A history*. Athens: University of Georgia Press.
- Shen, J. (1997). Has the alternative certification policy materialized its promise? A comparison between traditionally and alternatively certified teachers in public schools. *Educational Evaluation and Policy Analysis*, 19(3), 276-283. DOI: 10.2307/1164466
- Southern Regional Education Board (2011). *Alternative certification for "career changers" and recent college graduates*. Retrieved from <http://theteachercenter.org>
- Spitalli, S. (2009). The new teacher. *American School Board Journal*, 196(9), 33-34. Retrieved from <http://www.asbj.com>
- State Board of Education (SBEC) (2011). *Growth of educator preparation programs in Texas*. Retrieved from <http://www.sbec.tx.us>
- State Board of Education (SBEC) (2014). *Approved educator preparation programs*. Retrieved from <http://www.sbec.tx.us>
- Stoddart, T., & Floden, R. (1995). *Traditional and alternate routes to teacher certification: Issues, assumptions, and misconceptions*. National Center for Research on Teacher Learning. Retrieved from <http://www.ncrtl.msu.edu/http/ipapers/html/pdf/ip952.pdf>
- Studebaker, J. (1944, December). Missing: 115,000 teachers. *Click*, 7(12). Retrieved from www.OldMagazineArticles.com

- Texas Education Agency (1991). *Alternative teacher certification in Texas*. [GE1 61102].
- Texas Education Agency (2007). *Growth of educator preparation programs in Texas*. Retrieved from <http://www.tea.state.tx.us>
- Texas Education Agency (2012). *Becoming a classroom teacher in Texas*. Retrieved from <http://www.tea.state.tx.us>
- Texas Education Agency (2013a). *Texas education code* [Section 21.049(a)]. Retrieved from <http://www.tea.state.tx.us>
- Texas Education Agency (2013b). *Texas education code* [Section 21.004(a)]. Retrieved from <http://www.tea.state.tx.us>
- Texas Higher Education Coordinating Board. (2002). *Texas strategic plan to address the teacher shortage*. Retrieved from <http://www.theccb.state.tx.us>
- Thomas, D. (2003). *A general inductive approach for qualitative data analysis*. Retrieved from www.frankumstein.com/PDF/Psychology/Inductive%20Content%20Analysis.pdf
- U.S. Department of Education. (n.d.). *History: Twenty-five years of progress in Educating children with disabilities through IDEA*. Office of Special Education Programs. Retrieved from <http://www2.ed.gov/policy/speced/leg/idea/history>
- U.S. Department of Education. (2011). *Our future, our teachers: The Obama administration's plan for teacher education reform and improvement*. Retrieved from <http://www.2ed.gov/inits/ed/index/html>
- U.S. Department of Education. (2014). *Teacher shortage areas nationwide listing 1990-1991 through 2014-2015*. Retrieved from <http://www2.ed.gov/about/offices/list/ope/pol/tsa.pdf>
- Walbert, K. (2002). *The value of oral history*. Retrieved from www.learnnc.org/lp/pages/762
- Walford, G. (2011). *Researching the powerful*. British Educational Research Association on-line resource. Retrieved from www.bera.ac.uk
- Walsh, K. & Jacobs, S. (2007). *Alternative certification isn't alternative*. National Council on Teacher Quality. Retrieved from www.edexcellence.net/institute/publication/order.cfm
- Wenglinsky, H. (2000). *How teaching matters: Bringing the classroom back into discussions of teacher quality*. Retrieved from: <http://www.ets.org/research/pic>

- Wesner, B. (1994, February). The value of historical research. *Parks & Recreation*, 29(2). Retrieved from <http://www.questia.com>
- Westminster Theological Seminary (2014). *Sources for historical research*. Retrieved from www.wts.edu/resources/westminster_center_for_theolog/paper_formatshtml/wc_churchhistory/sources_for_historical_research.html
- Wilson, S., Floden, R., & Ferrini-Mundy, J. (2001). *Teacher preparation research: Current knowledge, gaps, and recommendations* (Document R-01-3). University of Washington. Retrieved from Center for the Study of Teaching and Policy <http://www.ctpweb.org>
- Wright, S., Horn, S., & Sanders, W. (1997). Teacher and classroom context effects on student achievement: Implications for teacher evaluation. *Journal of Personnel Evaluation in Education*, 11, 57-67.
- Yeasmin, S., & Rahman, K. F. (2012). Triangulation' research method as the tool of social science research. *Bangladesh University of Professionals Journal*, 1(1), 154-163, Retrieved from: www.bup.edu.bd