TRANSPORT BY INTERMITTENCY IN THE BOUNDARY OF THE DIII-D TOKAMAK

by


NOVEMBER 2002

GENERAL ATOMICS
DISCLAIMER

This report was prepared as an account of work sponsored by an agency of the United States Government. Neither the United States Government nor any agency thereof, nor any of their employees, makes any warranty, express or implied, or assumes any legal liability or responsibility for the accuracy, completeness, or usefulness of any information, apparatus, product, or process disclosed, or represents that its use would not infringe privately owned rights. Reference herein to any specific commercial product, process, or service by trade name, trademark, manufacturer, or otherwise, does not necessarily constitute or imply its endorsement, recommendation, or favoring by the United States Government or any agency thereof. The views and opinions of authors expressed herein do not necessarily state or reflect those of the United States Government or any agency thereof.
TRANSPORT BY INTERMITTENCY IN THE
BOUNDARY OF THE DIII-D TOKAMAK

by
J.A. Boedo,* D.L. Rudakov,* R.A. Moyer,* G.R. McKee,† R.J. Colchin,‡
M.J. Schaffer,Δ P.G. Stangeby,§ W.P. West,Δ S.L. Allen,# T.E. Evans,Δ
R.J. Fonck,† E.M. Hollmann,* S. Krasheninnikov,* A.W. Leonard,Δ
W. Nevins,# M.A. Mahdavi,Δ G.D. Porter,# G.R. Tynan,* D.G. Whyte,* and X. Xu#

This is a preprint of an invited paper to be presented at the
44th Annual Meeting of the Division of Plasma Physics,
Orlando, Florida, November 11–15, 2002, and to be published
in Phys. Plasmas.

*University of California, San Diego, Energy Research Center and
Mechanical and Aerospace Engineering Dept., La Jolla, California.
†University of Wisconsin, Madison, Wisconsin 53706.
‡Oak Ridge National Laboratory, Oak Ridge, Tennessee.
ΔGeneral Atomics, San Diego, California.
§University of Toronto, Toronto, Canada.
#Lawrence Livermore National Laboratory, Livermore, California.

Work supported by
the U.S. Department of Energy under
Contract Nos. DE-AC03-99ER54463, DE-AC05-00OR22725,
W-7405-ENG-48, and Grant Nos. DE-FG03-95ER54294, and
DE-FG02-89ER53296

GENERAL ATOMICS PROJECT 30033
NOVEMBER 2002
ABSTRACT

Intermittent plasma objects (IPOs), featuring higher pressure than the surrounding plasma, are responsible for ~50% of the $E \times B_T$ radial transport in the scrape off layer (SOL) of the DIII-D tokamak in L- and H-mode discharges. Conditional averaging reveals that the IPOs are positively charged and feature internal poloidal electric fields of up to 4000 V/m. The IPOs move radially with $E \times B_T / B^2$ velocities of ~2600 m/s near the last closed flux surface (LCFS), and ~330 m/s near the wall. The IPOs slow down as they shrink in radial size from 4 cm at the LCFS to 0.5 cm near the wall. The skewness (i.e. asymmetry of fluctuations from the average) of probe and beam emission spectroscopy (BES) data indicate IPO formation at or near the LCFS and the existence of positive and negative IPOs which move in opposite directions. The particle content of the IPOs at the LCFS is linearly dependent on the local density and decays over ~3 cm into the SOL while their temperature decays much faster (~1 cm).
I. INTRODUCTION

Recent evidence\textsuperscript{1-3} indicates that the far scrape-off layer (SOL) density and temperature profiles in various tokamaks and other devices are often non-exponential and flat, enhancing the plasma-wall contact beyond what would be expected from exponential profiles and suggesting that perpendicular transport in these conditions is much larger than expected.

A candidate for the additional edge/SOL transport, intermittency in the fluctuations corresponding to events above the standard deviation, has been extensively documented in linear devices,\textsuperscript{4,5} stellarators,\textsuperscript{6} and tokamaks\textsuperscript{7,8,9} and its statistical properties examined\textsuperscript{10,11} via the probability distribution function\textsuperscript{12} (PDF). The fluctuations depart from a Gaussian distribution, featuring skewness\textsuperscript{12} and kurtosis\textsuperscript{12} due to the intermittent events. Furthermore, it has been proven that the statistical properties of the fluctuations are alike and near-Gaussian in the shear layer while deviating from Gaussian into the SOL\textsuperscript{13} of tokamaks (JET), and stellarators\textsuperscript{12} (ATF, W7-AS). The intermittency has been analyzed using conditional averaging tools in both linear devices\textsuperscript{4,5} and tokamaks,\textsuperscript{14,15} with the result that coherent structures propagating radially are responsible for much of the radial transport. Comparative work at the devices TJ-I and TJ-IU concluded that intermittency bears a substantial part of the transport and most importantly, that the various properties of the intermittency (power spectra, PDF moments, etc.) are self-similar in tokamaks and torsatrons. Work in the JET tokamak\textsuperscript{16} focused on the power spectra of the fluctuations, demonstrating that its decay as $1/f$ was localized in the spectral region where intermittent transport is dominant and interpreting the result as an indication of closeness to instability thresholds. On the other hand, very recent work\textsuperscript{17,18,19} on the Alcator-C device has mostly focused on transport analysis of the SOL and demonstrated the need of very large diffusion coefficients if convection is not considered.
Additionally, there is an extensive body of work imaging the edge of various devices with fast cameras\textsuperscript{19,20} which show that moving plasma filaments exist in the edge/SOL. However, although the preponderance of intermittency and the concomitant fast convective transport in confined plasmas has been established\textsuperscript{4,6,17,18}, no detailed work on the dynamical characteristics and origin nor on the scaling with plasma parameters has been done until the present work.

We build on recent work\textsuperscript{20,21,22} and present here data from DIII-D showing that the fast, intermittent, convective radial transport in the DIII-D in parameters with non-Gaussian fluctuation statistics featuring rich radial structures that partly correspond to the simultaneous presence of both positive and negative intermittent events in a narrow region near-or-at the separatrix. The results of a density scan in L-mode are also shown indicating that the particle content of the intermittent events and their frequency increase with the local density. Radial transport and thus the plasma–wall contact are enhanced by the intermittent transport. Although the source of the intermittency is not addressed in this paper, we present strong evidence that the phenomena occur at/near the last closed flux surface (LCFS). These findings provide a strong motivation to further investigate the conditions under which large cross-field convective transport exists in the SOL.
II. EXPERIMENTAL SETUP

The experiments were carried out on the DIII-D tokamak\textsuperscript{24} in a variety of discharges with plasma current $I_p = 1.0$ MA and toroidal field of $B_T = 2.0$ T at the major axis, $R = 1.7$ m. Discharges with neutral beam heating power of up to 2 MW, featuring both low (L) and high (H) confinement modes, with double- and single-null divertor geometry (at the bottom of the vacuum vessel) and with standard and reversed $B_T$ directions were investigated. Otherwise identical H- and L-mode discharges, shown in Fig. 1, were analyzed in particular detail for comparative studies. In some discharges, the density was increased in a stepwise manner from $\langle n_e \rangle / n_{GW} = 0.26$ to 0.6, as shown in Figs. 1 and 8, while a reciprocating probe at the midplane (Fig. 2) was inserted at various times, illustrated by the vertical lines in Fig. 1, to assure coverage at various densities.

![Graph](image-url)

**FIG. 1.** Time evolution of two discharges in DIII-D showing from top to bottom, density, plasma current, injected power, radiated power and $D_\alpha$ signals. The transition to H-mode occurs at 2.15 s in one of the discharges (black lines) as indicated by the leftmost vertical line. The probe is inserted at the times marked by the two thick rightmost vertical lines.
The principal measurements were made by a fast scanning probe array featuring five tips (Fig. 2 upper inset) that sense Langmuir probe current \( I \), saturation current, \( I_{sat} \), and floating potential, \( V_f \). The measured ion saturation current \( I_{sat} \), given by the expression
\[
I_{sat} = (1/2)A_{pr}en_e c_s = (1/2)A_{pr}en_e \left[ k \left( T_e + T_i \right) / m_i \right]^{1/2},
\]
\( T_e \) and \( T_i \) are the ion and electron temperatures respectively, \( A_{pr} \) is the tip area and \( n_e \) is the electron density) allows calculation of the electron density if \( T_e \) is known (assuming \( T_e = T_i \)). One tip functions as a fast \( T_e \) diagnostic, using current excitation about the floating potential with bandwidth of 150 kHz, and thus is able to resolve the temperature inside the structures. These measurements were combined to infer the electron density \( n_e \), by using the equation above, and the poloidal electric field, \( E_\theta = \left( V_{f1} - V_{f2} \right) / \delta \theta \), for probe tips separated a distance \( \delta \theta \). Time resolution down to 1.0 \( \mu \)s has been achieved. The probe scans 15.2 cm horizontally from the outside wall in approximately 250 ms along the path indicated in Fig. 2. The calculation of \( E_\theta \) assumes that the temperature and
sheath drop are identical in both tips and that the intermittent objects are larger than the separation between the tips. The last assumption is justified later using beam emission spectroscopy (BES) data. The plasma potential $V_p$ was calculated as $V_p = V_f + 3.0kT_e$. The $D_\alpha$ sensor array, also shown in Fig. 2, provided independent, radially-resolved (1 cm) signals at 10 $\mu$s resolution. The BES system, which measures density and its fluctuations, was configured as a $5 \times 6$ fiber array as seen in Fig. 2, and was located at the edge of the plasma in the midplane to provide fast (1 $\mu$s) 2-D imaging of the density. The measurements can be are mapped onto the magnetic surfaces, displayed in Fig. 2, calculated by the toroidal equilibrium fitting code EFIT.$^{27}$
III. GENERAL DESCRIPTION OF THE INTERMITTENCY

Intermittency, i.e. occasional bursts in a signal, is quite evident in many edge diagnostics in tokamaks. If the bursts occur preferentially in one direction, i.e. bursts are mostly positive in $I_{sat}$, an asymmetry is conveyed to the various signals that affects their statistical characteristics and introduces a deviation from the Gaussian distribution. The deviation translates into a skewness $\gamma$ (i.e., positive $n_e$ bursts generate positive skewness) of $\sim 1$ (a Gaussian distribution would feature a skewness of zero) in the SOL density signals, as shown in Fig. 3. Signal statistics for both the L- and H-mode show significant and similar skewness in the SOL. It is crucial to notice that the skewness changes sign at or near the LCFS, within the error bars of EFIT, indicating that negative events are present, corresponding to drops in the density signal from its average level.

![Image of skewness vs $\Delta R_{LCFS}$](image)

**FIG. 3.** The skewness of the density signal from BES shows marked deviation from Gaussian behavior in the SOL and the presence of negative bursts near the LCFS.

The intermittency in the density can be visualized by comparing two frames (2-D images) from BES, separated in time by 6 $\mu$s as shown in Fig. 4, where the LCFS is indicated by a solid vertical line. The radial motion of a positive density feature, marked by a dashed circle in both frames, is indicated by vertical dashed lines. Notice that the
object has a radial and poloidal spatial extent of roughly 2 cm. From the two frames it is clear that the object is moving poloidally and radially with speeds that can be easily estimated at $V_\theta = 5 \text{ km/s}$ and $V_r = 1.5 \text{ km/s}$. These compare well to Langmuir probe results.

FIG. 4. Two frames from BES showing 2-D density plots. There is a time difference of 6 $\mu$s between frames. A particular structure, marked with a dashed circle and shown in both frames, demonstrates poloidal and radial motion.

To separate these coherent objects from other fluctuations, standard conditional averaging tools, introduced in the TEXT tokamak by Filippas\textsuperscript{14} and later in various devices,\textsuperscript{4,6} were used to quantify the observations. A $2.5 \times \text{rms}$-level threshold was used to discriminate the intermittent events in 5 ms long time series of $I_{sat}$. These were then binned for 100 $\mu$s about the maximum of each event, accumulated and averaged, producing the results seen in Fig. 5. The conditional averaging tool, applied to $I_{sat}$ with the parameters described, corresponds to $\sim 40$ events at the LCFS. The selected time windows result on averaging over frequencies higher than those associated to time scale of the binning window (or correspondingly, to structures that are smaller than the selected scale, which is in this case $\sim 2 \text{ cm}$). Lower frequencies or larger spatial scales than the
selected windows will appear as a d.c. offset in the averaged data. The existence of an event in $I_{sat}$ is used as the condition to select time slices in the $E_\theta$ and $V_f$ signals at the same time slice.

FIG. 5. Conditional average results for (a) $T_e$, (b) $E_\theta$, (c) $V_f$, (d) $V_p$ showing that (1) the plasma structures are charged positively, (2) contain and convect substantial amounts of energy and (3) a positive radial electric field exists inside them.

The results from conditional averaging of the $T_e$ trace, shown in Fig. 5, indicate that the temperature in the intermittent plasma objects (IPOs) [Fig. 5(a)] is 150 eV, nearly three times that of the background (50 eV) and their potential [Fig. 5(d)], calculated as $V_p = V_f + 3kT_e$ [$V_f$ shown in Fig. 5(c)], is 400 V and positive with respect to the surrounding plasma (120 eV), suggesting that a predominant electron loss occurs at the IPO boundaries. Furthermore, the burst in plasma potential shown in Fig. 5(d) indicates that the IPOs (with dimensions of roughly 3 cm $\times$ 3 cm in the poloidal plane) contain an internal radial electric field, $E_r = -\nabla V_p$, that can be estimated as $E_r = \Delta V_p / \delta r = 200$ V/cm and results in internal rotation at a $V_{th} = E_r / B_T$ speed of $1.33 \times 10^4$ m/s. In the above measurements, the only assumption is that we can resolve the temperature in
these objects fast enough and that the plasma potential can be calculated as
\[ V_p = V_f + 3kT_e. \]

Furthermore, conditional averaging performed on the probe data near the LCFS, and shown in Fig. 6, agree with the skewness data (Fig. 3) by showing the presence of both positive and negative events. These events are comparable in size, indicating that the local density profile experiences bursts and dips that fuse, break and mix in this narrow region at the LCFS. This results in the skewness, a measure of asymmetry in the probe and BES signals, data going to zero. Furthermore, the \( E_{\theta} \) data also shows (Fig. 6) that while the positive events proceed to move into the SOL with velocity \( V_r = (E_{\theta} \times B / B^2) \), the negative ones move inward towards the core, as has recently been predicted.\(^{29}\) Important implications of this result are that 1) the edge plasma is being diluted by the lower density events moving inward and 2) the negative events can move impurities into the plasma core.
FIG. 6. Conditional averaging reveals that both positive and negative IPOs exist at/near the LCFS. However, the opposite signs of the measured $E_\theta$ indicate that the negative IPOs travel inwards towards the core while the positive IPOs propagate into the SOL.
IV. L-H MODE COMPARISON

Results from conditional averaging of probe data from otherwise identical L- and H-mode discharges (Ref. Fig. 1) showing the typical (average) IPOs, are shown in Figs. 7(a,b) by superimposing traces from various radii and indicating (arrow) the direction of increasing radius. The H-mode discharges used in this experiments are close to the L-H threshold and, therefore, are not high performance H-mode discharges, where the SOL transport is further suppressed.

Three properties of the data are immediately apparent: 1) the density excursion is 2-3 times the background density, 2) the amplitude of the pulses for similar radius is much larger for L-mode conditions than for H-mode conditions, and 3) the amplitude of the pulses decays rapidly with radius. Evaluation of the total particle flux convected by the
IPOs is of utmost importance to assess their relevance to the radial transport. The flux can be calculated as \( \Gamma_{\text{Int}} = n_e \left( E_0 \times B / B^2 \right) \) and the result is shown in Fig. 7(c,d) for L- and H-mode conditions using the same vertical scale in both plots. Three properties are again quite apparent: 1) the flux excursion is large and nearly five times the background, 2) the flux for similar radius is much larger for L-mode conditions than for H-mode conditions, and 3) the flux decays rapidly with radius.

The relevance of the IPOs to total \( E \times B \) radial transport in the SOL is obtained in L- and H-mode at various radii by calculating \( \Gamma_{\text{Intermittent}} / \Gamma_{\text{Total}} = \left( \frac{n_e \left( E_0 \times B / B^2 \right)}{\text{Intermittent}} / \frac{n_e \left( E_0 \times B / B^2 \right)}{\text{Total}} \right) \). The results indicate that: a) intermittent events above the 2.5 \( \times \) rms level are responsible for \(-50\%\) of the transport at all radii where we have measurements, b) there is a continuum of event sizes and, c) although the relative relevance of intermittency is unchanged with radius, its absolute amplitude decays rapidly with radius due to the decay of the structures themselves.

It is important to notice that the intermittency under study here, residing in the 1–200 kHz band, is part of the \( E \times B \) electrostatic turbulent particle flux, \( \tilde{\Gamma}_r \), that depends on the rms value of the density, \( \left\langle n_e^2 \right\rangle^{1/2} \), poloidal field, \( \left\langle E_\theta^2 \right\rangle^{1/2} \) and their cross-correlation. Since \( \tilde{\Gamma}_r \) has been characterized extensively in many devices such as CCT,\(^{30,31}\) PBX-M,\(^{32,33}\) DIII-D,\(^{34}\) TEXT,\(^{35,36}\) TEXTOR\(^{37,38}\) it can therefore be stated that the general properties of the intermittency, such as its response to sheared electric fields that de-correlate turbulent transport resulting in reduced transport and enhanced confinement conditions, have been indirectly characterized.
V. L-MODE DENSITY SCALING

Since the interaction of the plasma with the far wall has been reported to increase with discharge density,\textsuperscript{30} and the IPOs can provide a mechanism for fast convection of particles, it is of interest to explore the scaling of the IPO properties. L-mode discharges with density steps from $\langle n_e \rangle/n_{GW} = 0.25$ to $0.6$ were chosen due to the prominence of the intermittency and the absence of edge localized modes (ELMs). Conditional averaging was applied to the probe data for the various density steps and the results are displayed in Fig. 8. The radial dependency over $\sim$5 cm is also shown by superimposing traces as before. As the discharge density is increased, the IPO density, displayed on insets Fig. 8(a-d), also increases. Thus the density of the IPOs increases with the discharge/edge density.
FIG. 8. L-mode discharges where the density was increased stepwise (central frame) allow comparison of IPO density vs discharge/edge density (insets) and a relation of proportionality is found.
The IPOs decay as they travel into the SOL to address the question of how fast the decay is, conditional averaging was applied to density and temperature data with 1 cm radial resolution. Radial profiles of the averaged (line) and IPO peak (dots) density/temperature are shown in Fig. 9(a,b) for L-mode conditions and their difference highlighted. It can be noted in Fig. 9(a) that the peak IPO density is about 70% of the background density and both decay with radius with a decay length, $L_n$, of 2.7 cm. Quite different behavior is seen on the temperature, where the IPO peak temperature decays to that of the background profile within 1 cm. Therefore, the IPOs quickly thermalize with the background.

![Figure 9](image_url)

**FIG. 9.** Radial profiles of (a) the IPO peak density from conditional averaging (circles) and the average density profile (line) and (b) the IPO peak temperature (circles) and the average temperature profile (line). The peak IPO density decays with the same scale length as the background profile while the peak temperature decays much faster.
The relative importance of the IPO density can be evaluated as a function of \( \langle n_e \rangle / n_{GW} \) by calculating the IPO intensity \( \left[ n_e^{\text{peak}} - \langle n_e^{\text{aver}} \rangle \right] / \langle n_e^{\text{aver}} \rangle \) for various radii in the SOL, as shown in Fig. 10. Despite the fact that the particle content (or density excursion) of the IPOs increases with density (as seen in Fig. 8), the IPOs relative contribution to the density is fairly constant with radius and density at about 50%-70%. These results indicate a scaling of the IPO intensity with transport. The decay of the IPOs can be understood in light of recent analytical work\(^{31,32}\) where they are modeled as structures elongated along the magnetic field which are being drained at the divertor plates. The IPO density and temperature is predicted to be:

\[
n(r,t) = n(r) / \left(1 + t/\tau_T\right)^{2\alpha/\alpha T}
\]

and

\[
T(t) = T_0 / \left(1 + t/\tau_T\right)^2
\]

where \( \alpha_T = \alpha S_E; \tau_T = 2/\left(\alpha_T T_0^{1/2}\right) \), \( \alpha \) measures the net parallel current to the divertor plates, \( S_E \) is the sheath energy transmission factor and \( T_0 \) is the temperature of the IPO as it detaches from the LCFS. Since \( 2\alpha/\alpha_T = 2/\alpha S < 1 \), comparison of Eqs. (1) and (2) shows that the temperature decays much more rapidly in time than the density, just as observed in the experiment. The quick reduction in the amplitude of the bursts and density profiles is, therefore, in agreement with a strong sink in the divertor.
FIG. 10. The normalized intensity of the IPO density for various radius is features independence from the discharge density (in $n/n_{GW}$ units).
VI. PROGRESS ON THEORETICAL UNDERSTANDING

Efforts to understand the intermittency and its implication for radial transport are being vigorously pursued in two fronts: 1) analytical and numerical studies of the dynamics of the IPOs independent of their origin, and 2) full nonlinear simulations of the boundary that study both IPO creation and dynamics. The work on dynamics\textsuperscript{29,39,40,41} intends to provide an understanding of how the IPOs will transport particle and heat in the SOL without getting involved in the physics of their creation while non-linear modeling work,\textsuperscript{42,43,44,45} such as the code BOUT, tries to address the issue of IPO formation and transport and the nonlinear interaction of the IPOs with the background plasma and each other. The analytical work has made successful predictions such as typical IPO radial velocities and fluxes and the IPO density and temperature decay [Eqs. (1) and (2)]. Output from the BOUT code for L-mode conditions has been analyzed and compared to probe data. The simulation features very strong intermittency and radial profiles of the skewness of the density were computed, as shown in Fig. 11, for two density cases [$\langle n_e \rangle/n_{GW} = 0.25$ (in red) and $\langle n_e \rangle/n_{GW} = 0.5$ (in black)]. The agreement with the experimental skewness shown Fig. 3 is quite remarkable, featuring the crossing of zero at the LCFS and the signature of negative IPOs slightly inside the LCFS. Thus, although in an early stage, the study of edge/SOL intermittency is progressing rapidly.
FIG. 11. Profiles of skewness for low (red) and high (black) densities in L-mode conditions. The skewness crosses zero near the LCFS and towards the core and it is high elsewhere. Negative skewness indicates negative IPOs.
VII. CONCLUSIONS

Intermittency is present in the boundary of the DIII-D tokamak in both L- and H-mode discharges, as indicated by data from various diagnostics. Structures featuring higher density and temperature than the surrounding plasma originate at or near the LCFS and travel radially in the SOL, transporting particle and energy. Although the amplitude of the IPOs in L-mode increases with density at the LCFS, they carry a fairly constant fraction (50%-70%) of the local density at all radii and densities measured. Furthermore, the IPOs feature higher temperature than the background plasma at the LCFS, but they thermalize within a short distance of the LCFS, in agreement with analytical predictions. In L-mode, the IPO phenomenon is important in determining the structure of the SOL and it results in an enhanced plasma-wall contact. However, the presence of ELMs in H-mode, carrying more energy and particles than the IPOs, transiently dominates the structure of the SOL and the plasma-wall interaction. The H-mode data for this work has been evaluated between ELMs.
References


ACKNOWLEDGMENT

This research was supported by the U.S. Department of Energy under Contract Nos. DE-AC03-99ER54463, DE-AC05-00OR22725, W-7405-ENG-48, and Grant Nos. DE-FG03-95ER54294, and DE-FG02-89ER53296. Discussions with K.H. Burrell, J. Terry, D. D’Ippolitto and the technical support of L. Chousal and R. Hernandez are acknowledged.