A CRITICAL STUDY OF THREE
VIOLONCELLO SUITES

BY J. S. BACH

THESIS

Presented to the Graduate Council of the North Texas State College in Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements for the Degree of Master of Music

By

Marjorie Meacham, B. M.

173383
Fort Worth, Texas
January, 1950
TABLE OF CONTENTS

LIST OF ILLUSTRATIONS ........................................ iv
PREFACE ........................................................... ix

PART I
HISTORICAL BACKGROUND

Chapter
I. GÖTHEN PERIOD, 1717-1723. .............................. 1
II. THE VIOLONCELLO FROM 1570 TO 1720 ................. 6

Evolution of the Violoncello
Early Eighteenth Century Bow
The Viola Pomposa:

III. BAROQUE SUITE FORM. .................................. 13

PART II
ANALYSIS OF MUSIC

Chapter
I. SUITE I, G MAJOR. ........................................ 19
II. SUITE III, G MAJOR. ...................................... 39
III. SUITE VI, D MAJOR ....................................... 64

BIBLIOGRAPHY ..................................................... 82
## LIST OF ILLUSTRATIONS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Figure</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Phrasing of Principal Idea</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Fritz Gaillard Edition</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Julius Klengel Edition</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Bach Gesellschaft Edition</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Malkin Edition</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Use of Open A String</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. Use of Open D String</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. Casals' Trill</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11. Bach Gesellschaft Edition (Mordent)</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12. Malkin Edition</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15. Other Editions</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16. Three Note Melodic Pattern</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17. Sequence</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18. Malkin Edition</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20. Klengel Edition</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure</td>
<td>Edition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22</td>
<td>Bach Gesellschaft Edition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23</td>
<td>Bach Gesellschaft Edition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24</td>
<td>Malkin and Klengel Editions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25</td>
<td>Gaillard Edition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26</td>
<td>Bach Gesellschaft Edition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27</td>
<td>Malkin and Klengel Editions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28</td>
<td>Gaillard Edition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29</td>
<td>Gaillard Edition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30</td>
<td>Malkin Edition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31</td>
<td>Klengel Edition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>32</td>
<td>Bach Gesellschaft Edition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>33</td>
<td>Casals' Trill</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>34</td>
<td>Legato Bowing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35</td>
<td>Gaillard's Suggested Fingering</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36</td>
<td>Gaillard Edition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37</td>
<td>Klengel Edition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>38</td>
<td>Malkin Edition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>39</td>
<td>Gaillard and Malkin Editions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40</td>
<td>Klengel Edition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>41</td>
<td>Use of Thumb</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>42</td>
<td>Preparation for Figure 41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>43</td>
<td>Double Trill</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>44</td>
<td>Final Chord</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>45</td>
<td>Bach Gesellschaft and Gaillard Editions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>46</td>
<td>Malkin Edition</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Figure

47. Melodic Line .................................. Page 48
48. Phrasing ........................................ 48
49. Bach Gesellschaft Edition .................... 49
50. Gaillard Edition .................................. 49
51. Malkin and Klengel Edition .................... 49
52. Casals' Recording ................................ 49
53. Bach Gesellschaft and Other Editions ........ 50
54. Casals' Recording ................................ 50
55. Melodic Sequence ................................ 51
56. Casals' Bowing ................................... 52
57. Casals' Bowing ................................... 52
58. Gaillard's Bowing ................................ 52
59. Malkin Edition ................................... 53
60. Klengel Edition ................................... 53
61. Gaillard Edition ................................... 54
62. Rhythmic Pattern ................................ 54
63. Gaillard Edition ................................... 55
64. Malkin Edition ................................... 55
65. Klengel Edition ................................... 55
66. Phrasing in Casals and Gaillard Editions ... 57
67. Phrasing in Bach Gesellschaft, Malkin, and Klengel Editions ... 57
68. Gaillard Edition ................................... 58
69. Malkin Edition ................................... 58
70. Klengel and Bach Gesellschaft Editions ..... 58

vi
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Figure</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>71.</td>
<td>Trill</td>
<td>59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>72.</td>
<td>Uses of the Tie</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>73.</td>
<td>Bowing Problem</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>74.</td>
<td>Bowing Suggestion</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>75.</td>
<td>Second Section</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>76.</td>
<td>Theme</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>77.</td>
<td>Variation of Theme</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>78.</td>
<td>Fingering</td>
<td>65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>79.</td>
<td>Klengel Edition</td>
<td>66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>80.</td>
<td>Casals' Recording and Malkin Edition</td>
<td>66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>81.</td>
<td>Bach Gesellschaft and Gaillard Editions</td>
<td>66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>82.</td>
<td>Casals' Bowing</td>
<td>66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>83.</td>
<td>Thumb Position</td>
<td>67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>84.</td>
<td>Fingering</td>
<td>67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>85.</td>
<td>Extended Thumb Position</td>
<td>68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>86.</td>
<td>Tie</td>
<td>71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>87.</td>
<td>Gaillard and Klengel Editions</td>
<td>72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>88.</td>
<td>Malkin Edition</td>
<td>72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>89.</td>
<td>Bach Gesellschaft Edition</td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>90.</td>
<td>Casals' Recording</td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>91.</td>
<td>Malkin Edition</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>92.</td>
<td>Gaillard Edition</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>93.</td>
<td>Bach Gesellschaft Edition</td>
<td>76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>94.</td>
<td>Turn in Klengel Edition</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>95.</td>
<td>Casals' Recording and Gaillard Edition</td>
<td>79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure</td>
<td>Description</td>
<td>Page</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>96.</td>
<td>Other Editions</td>
<td>79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>97.</td>
<td>Gaillard Edition</td>
<td>79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>98.</td>
<td>Casals' Recording</td>
<td>79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>99.</td>
<td>Casals' Recording, Klengel, Gaillard Editions</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>100.</td>
<td>Malkin Edition</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>101.</td>
<td>Malkin, Klengel Editions, and Casals' Recording</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>102.</td>
<td>Gaillard Edition</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
PREFACE

This thesis is a critical study of three violoncello suites of Johann Sebastian Bach from the performer's point of view. Its purpose is to determine the comparative differences and similarities of several well known editions including the Bach Gesellschaft edition and the Pablo Casals recording. It will explain a few of the many discrepancies and provide adequate reasons for given suggestions and preferences concerning dynamics, tempi, ornamentation, bowing styles, and other elements of performance. By stating a brief historical background of the evolution of the violoncello and the development of musical form and style, it is possible to conceive Bach's ideas and intentions as he wrote the collection of six suites.

Perhaps one of the most significant features is the virtual absence of published material on these suites and the lack of any stylistic or comparative study to aid the student performer. Also there is no original manuscript and the only source of information is the copy made by his second wife, Anna Magdalena, which has been reproduced on microfilm and in the Bach Gesellschaft edition.
PART I

HISTORICAL BACKGROUND

CHAPTER I

GOTHEN PERIOD, 1717-1723

In a space of fifty years, almost all aspects of music underwent a striking change all over Europe. Secular instrumental music was just beginning to emerge into a definite, independent existence, and for the first time it rivaled vocal music in the Baroque period. Its importance can be traced in the development of new instrumental forms and new independent styles, in the improvement of instruments, and in the greater amount of instrumental music written. The central change in structure was one from counterpoint to harmony, and melodic invention had become of greater importance with more stress laid upon the dynamics of music.\(^1\)

The culmination of the Baroque period with its unfolding growth and expansion is represented in the music of Johann Sebastian Bach, born at Eisenach on March 21, 1685. His importance in the history of music lies in the fact that, starting with instrumental music, he developed

\(^1\)J. A. Fuller-Maitland, *Age of Bach and Handel*, p. 120.
all forms and species of composition in an entirely new and independent manner. The old vocal style, which was founded exclusively on polyphony, was exhausted. Bach created a new vocal style based on instrumental principles which was carried to the summit of perfection. Bach's contrapuntal ingenuity has never been surpassed and rarely equaled; yet his harmonic style is on a par with his great contrapuntal skill. These two elements of musical style combined with his extraordinary architectural sense of form are evident in the tremendous output of organ music for which Bach is best known.

Because the world has so identified him with organ music, it seems almost incredible that he should have accepted a position in which he was almost cut off from it and where his duties would mainly lie in a department of music which at that time was more backward than any other. This post was that of Kapellmeister in a small court at Göthen for Prince Leopold of Anhalt-Göthen, a position which Bach held from 1717 to 1723. The Prince was a great lover of music and esteemed Bach so highly that he even insisted on his accompanying him on all his journeys.

Bach's duties consisted merely of directing the Prince's

chamber music, and he had nothing to do with church music or organ playing.

Bach's reasons for leaving his post at Weimar are hardly definable, for there he had a good organ at his disposal and ample resources for performance of choral and instrumental works on a large scale. Göthen had no adequate organ or choir, and not even a theatre to draw upon for instrumentalists and singers. It is conceivable that this may have been an inducement, and that he felt that an opportunity worthy of him was to be found in this hitherto slenderly cultivated branch of art. The essential fact is that he applied himself with marvelous energy to make the best use of the special opportunities which Göthen afforded him. Under these circumstances most of the great secular instrumental works can be narrowed down to this period, though it was not until some time after he had settled there in 1717 that his productivity in this new line of art can be safely referred to. It is probable that he spent the first few years assimilating and learning from practical experience the works of experts in several different forms of secular instrumental art which had been cultivated in the old style of instrumental counterpoint.

The year 1720, in which his first wife died, is noteworthy as the beginning of the period when Bach's mind was specially projected toward secular instrumental music. There seems little doubt that most of his works for solo
violin and violoncello, unaccompanied, date from this time.\textsuperscript{3} Without exaggeration these works may be said to be absolutely unique in the whole range of music. Their immense scope and interest sets them aside from any composition of the kind, for none other will lend itself in such a degree of interpretation, expression and richness of thought. Of Bach's experiences with stringed instruments and his powers as a performer not much can be decisively asserted. It is known that one of his first artistic experiences was his father's playing of a stringed instrument and teaching him as a child. One of his first duties at Weimar was that of playing in the Duke's band. He expressed his liking for playing on the viola because he was on the inside of the harmonic structure where he could feel more a part of the composition.\textsuperscript{4}

Because of the pre-eminent influences of the organ style, Bach's string music was definitely affected and there was sufficient reason in the fact that in his boyhood the style of violin music was but slightly differentiated. Though the violin, as well as other members of its family, had been cultivated throughout the seventeenth century, its technical resources were evolved only by very slow degrees. The true capabilities of the string family had not been fully realized so as to serve as the basis of an independent instrumental style.

\textsuperscript{3}H. H. Parry, \textit{Johann Sebastian Bach}, p. 168.  
\textsuperscript{4}Ibid., p. 169
Thus the most persistent influence in determining Bach's procedure was the organ style, even when he was writing for an instrument so radically and uncompromisingly different as the violin or violoncello. But of these radical differences of nature Bach was neither unaware nor inapt to take advantage. The special technical requirements and interpretation needed to fully realize his stringed music seemed to be the extraordinary difficulties which his solo music presented.

Instrumental music of the Göthen Period.
Six Brandenburg Concerti
Six sonatas for violin, unaccompanied
Six suites for violoncello, unaccompanied
Three sonatas for viola da gamba
Four "overtures" for orchestra.
Six sonatas for violin and cembalo
Six French suites
Six English suites
CHAPTER II

THE VIOLONCELLO FROM 1570 TO 1720

Evolution of the Violoncello

Long before the days of such unique masters of choral art as Palestrina, Lassus, and Gibbons, men had begun to realize that there were possibilities of new efforts and a wide extension of artistic resources to be drawn out of music for instruments. Even while these great composers of the sixteenth century were busy enriching the world with their choral masterpieces, other men were making crude experiments in instrumental music. Because of the concentrated attention upon the development of artistic methods which were more suitable for the human voice, instruments had naturally been in the background. They had been very imperfect in construction, and had almost nothing to do with really refined art in any independent form. The early imperfect types of viols which had long been in use, were by degrees improved under the influence of man's growing appreciation for beauty and refinement of tone, and the earliest representatives of the unique school of Italian violin-makers were already busy with their inimitable work. There being no established independent instrumental style or forms of writing, the music for these instruments was in an
undeveloped state. There is a large quantity of such music for stringed instruments which represents the crude and primitive types of later sonatas and suites. The backward condition of the technique of performance on stringed instruments accounts for a great part of the crudity and absence of expression in the music written for them. Development in workmanship, technique, and composition was quite slow and laborious; the progress of both invention and execution has been to a great extent interdependent.

Along in the sixteenth century the chest of viols began to break up into a great variety of sizes, so as to answer the requirements of the subtle variations of pitch of the singing voice. Before this sorting into sizes, the bass viols were of very large dimensions and huge awkward construction, some with bridges, some without, some with C-shaped sound-holes placed high up in the upper bouts, but all preserving their formidable proportions so as to modify the shrill tones of the violin which had already made its appearance. These were the leading types of bass instruments contributed by Germany to the development of the violoncello. In the workshop of Andrea Amati in Cremona, Italy, the violoncello came into existence with his completion of two instruments between 1560 and 1570.

Although the bass violin or violoncello came into existence together with the tenor and treble violins, nearly a century elapsed before the instrument took its proper
rank in the family of stringed instruments. The immediate predecessor of the violoncello was the viola da gamba, a six-stringed instrument which was the established bass of the chamber and orchestra music of the seventeenth century. It was the popularity of this easily handled instrument that resulted in detaining the violoncello from claiming its place among the violin family, even though the violoncello was superior in power and quality. The violoncello was looked upon as useful only to reinforce the double bass. When music sought the public platform in churches and concert room, the louder voiced violin family became in greater demand and gradually replaced the gentler viols.

Toward the latter half of the seventeenth century attempts were made to improve the violoncello from its former cumbersome proportions. Players and composers were awakening to the possibilities of the violoncello in chamber music and as a solo instrument. Domenico Gabrielli seemed to have been one of the first to cultivate the violoncello as a solo instrument. Of particular interest are his pieces called *Ricercare* for violoncello without accompaniment as they are in the same category as Bach's celebrated six suites for violoncello solo.¹ One of the reasons that the violoncello had been kept out of general use was the irrational system of fingering first used by the seventeenth century

---

chamber players. Since the instrument is tuned in fifths, and since the fingers of the performer are only able to reach a major third, the hand has great difficulty in commanding the scales. It was not until the middle of the eighteenth century that these technical difficulties were sufficiently overcome to enable the violoncello to supplant the viola da gamba in the orchestra. A change for the better came with a Frenchman, Berteau, who introduced the use of the thumb of the left hand as a medium for reaching the higher positions of the violoncello.

The first to convert the prevailing awkward ways of violoncello fingering into a logical, practical system and publish a method of fingering and bowing was a Frenchman, Duport (1749-1819). For this reason Duport may be called the Corelli of the violoncello, and technically he appears to have surpassed the great father of violin playing. In place of the violin fingering which had been proven to be poorly adapted to the violoncello, he substituted another, the rule being that in the lower positions of the hand only the first and second fingers might stretch a whole tone, the rest of the fingering by semi-tones. The positions were divided into four fractions with a convenient system of shifting, the violin fingering being retained only in the higher positions where the thumb acts as a movable nut. However, it must be remembered that this modern system of fingering was not employed during Bach's time.
Early Eighteenth Century Bow

Another great influence on the early style of violoncello playing was the type of bow used in the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries. Since the Tourte bow was not invented until the latter part of the eighteenth century, the art of bowing employed during the period in which Bach wrote his six violoncello suites differs considerably from our modern method. There was no radical difference between the bow for the viola da gamba and that for the violoncello, although pictorial evidence seems to indicate that the latter was somewhat shorter. The delicacy, strength, and lightness of the viola da gamba bow also applies to the violoncello bow, but the principal distinction from the modern bow is in the tension of the hair which is preserved by the outward arching of the stick, as in the viol bow, and not by the strengthening of an inward curve. With the outward arc, the tension of the hair becomes greater to resist this pressure; with the modern bow the reverse happens, for as the pressure is increased the tension naturally decreases as the hair approaches the stick.

Allied to the lightness of the seventeenth and eighteenth century bow is its firmness which gives a great crispness in staccato effects and in very rapid detached notes. It also helps to give a clearness to the phrasing and sweetness to the tone and is a valuable factor in the playing of music involving the holding of two or more parts. The greatest
disadvantage to this non-elastic bow is that it could not produce various shades of tones, only piano and forte. As the violin and violoncello came into prominence as solo instruments, Corelli and Vivaldi made slight improvements leading toward the highly perfected Tourte bow. The Corelli bow was the actual type that was in use during the Gothen period when Bach wrote the famous suites.

The Viola Pomposa

Unlike our modern composers, J. S. Bach drew from many sources for his stringed instruments. Both necessity and inclination prompted this unusual employment of instruments where he supplemented the violin with the violino piccolo, the viola with the viola d'amore and violetta, and the violoncello with the viola da gamba. The imperfect technique of the players of the recently developed violin family impelled him to employ the older more familiar instruments or to invent new ones. Thus Bach experimented with the viola pomposa, a five-stringed instrument he is said to have invented to facilitate the playing of quick and high violoncello passages. This instrument had the violoncello stringing with an additional fifth string sounding e'.

There seems to be considerable confusion over the true identity of the viola pomposa, particularly in regard to its similarity to the violoncello piccolo. Many contemporary writers claim that the viola pomposa was actually invented by Bach, some express doubt, and a few, such as Charles S.
Terry, declare that Bach neither employed nor invented the instrument. The chief difficulty in distinguishing between the two instruments is the fact that both are tuned alike and were designed to make good the deficiencies of a bass instrument actually invented by Bach for which he wrote extensively in his orchestral and ensemble groupings. The importance of the discussion lies in the possibility of the sixth violoncello suite being written for viola pomposa as many authors claim. Terry states:

Both Schweitzer and Spitta suppose that the sixth suite was written for viola pomposa—that is, for Bach's violoncello piccolo. Their assumption is based on the fact that the original manuscript has the heading:

_Suite 6me a cinq acordes_

The tuning is that of the five-stringed violoncello piccolo. A good deal of use is made of the top string, but otherwise there is little to distinguish the suite from the other five. Nor is there evidence, or indeed in the circumstances, likelihood, that the instrument existed at the period (c. 1720) when the suite was composed.2

The critical fact in this investigation is not necessarily which instrument was designated to perform the suite, but that it was composed for a five-stringed instrument similar to the violoncello.

CHAPTER III

BAROQUE SUITE FORM

A succession of dances of contrasting rhythm, but all in the same key and in the same binary design, formed the basis of the baroque instrumental suite. Often this form assumed the name of sonata or partita when it was written for solo instruments, an ensemble of strings, or harpsichord. The movements of the suite were derivations of old dances, but by the eighteenth century most of them had lost their dance-like qualities and were standard instrumental forms, consisting of rhythmic patterns often of considerable complexity.

Several countries contributed to the development of the suite as it was established during Bach's time. Italy contributed the early development, the church sonata (sonata da chiesa), England the Gigue, France the great wealth of dance types of the seventeenth century, and Germany the conception of the suite as a unified and definite musical form. ¹ The origin of the suite is usually looked for in the frequent combinations of two dances, one in duple time, the other in triple time, such as the Pavane and Galliard which occurred

throughout the sixteenth century. It is rather difficult
to trace fully the process of selection of movements for
the suite. The Pavane and Galliard dropped out of fashion
very early, and the Allemandes and Courantes came in, soon
becoming an established nucleus to which often a Sarabande,
other dance movements, and the Prelude are joined.

The standard scheme of movements of the suite as it
occurs with Bach is the Allemande, Courante, Sarabande, an
optional dance, and the Gigue. The optional group may be
one of several dances of various types, chiefly the Minuet,
Bourree, or Gavotte. The dance movements are invariably in
binary form, either symmetrical (with both sections of about
the same length), or asymmetrical (with the second section
expanded). The optional group, being simpler in style and
more clearly suggestive of dance types, forms a contrast
with the other movements. These optional dances originated
in the French ballets of the late seventeenth century and
retained, even in the latest Bach suites (1735) their char-
acter as actual dance music. The other movements are of
much older types which originated in the sixteenth century
and at the time of their adoption as the constitutional
elements of the suite (1650) had already lost their dance
connotations. They had become idealized types, rhythmically
weakened but elaborate in texture and style.  

\(^2\)Ibid., p. 716.
There are many distinct characteristics upon which each movement of the suite is mainly based. The origin of the Allemande, which usually comes first in the simple suite form, is obscure, although it is maintained that it is not based upon any dance. However, of more importance are its characteristics, some of which are moderately slow quadruple time with regular, smooth motion, and quiet and sober character. To this the Courante, which almost invariably follows the Allemande in the mature suite, is supposed and intended to supply a contrast, but it cannot be maintained that it always does so successfully. It usually is in three-four time, of quick, light, and direct movement, full of rapid passages of simple character, with simple rhythm and free from complication. In both the Allemande and the Courante there is no pronounced and persistent rhythm, and the pace, though not necessarily quick, scarcely even comes within the range of motion or style characteristic of definitely slow movements; thus the Sarabande is an obvious source of contrast.

The Sarabande, which was of Spanish or possibly Moorish origin, has a pronounced and at the same time simple rhythmic principle. Usually this dance is written in a harmonic style rather than in a contrapuntal one, and the chords are full, moving in a simultaneous manner as blocks of harmony. The general effect of the Sarabande is noble and serious, and the music is more concentrated
than in any other member of the group of movements. It is thus in various respects the central point of the suite.

In the more concise examples of the suite the Sarabande is followed by the final Gigue, but it is common practice to interpolate other movements. A very great variety of dances is introduced at this point. The most familiar are the Gavottes, Bourrees, Minuets, and Passepieds.

The final movement of the suite, the Gigue, is in most cases actually of light and rapid style. It is usually based on some triple meter, but even this is not invariable. The old practice of concluding a work with a fugue is illustrated here by the common occurrence of fugal treatment in this member alone. However, the fugal treatment is an accessory to the usual form of the suite movement.

The most important accessory which is commonly added to this nucleus is the Prelude. It appears in a variety of forms and under many different names. It is worth noticing that all six introductory movements of Bach's partitas have different names. The chief point in relation to the other movements is the systematic avoidance of the binary form. Often it is a sort of rhapsody or irregular group of arpeggios and other figures based on simple series of chords.

The sonata is not an outgrowth from the suite although both were descended from kindred stock and many works exhibit suggestions and traits of both forms. However, it is remarkable how soon the distinct types came to be
generally maintained, for it must be remembered that com-
posers did not attain the ultimate distinct outlines of
sonatas and suites with a definite purpose and plan before
them. Working with particular materials they were led
almost unconsciously to differentiate the two forms.

The ground principle or subject in the sonata and suite
is altogether different; while sonata movements constantly
increased in complexity, suite movements remained almost
stationary. They were based upon the whole of several
movements. In the sonata the subjects are concrete and
stand out in a marked manner, both in contrast to one
another and to their immediate context. It is important
that this be fully and clearly recapitulated. Contrastingly,
the suite subject does not stand out at all prominently, but
is only a well-marked presentation of the type of motion and
rhythm which is to prevail throughout the movement. To this
there is no contrasting subject or episode, and a definite
recapitulation is no part of the scheme at all.

It is obvious that the suite as an art-form is far
more elementary and inexpansive than the sonata. In fact,
it attained its maturity long before the complete develop-
ment of the later form. It was the first instrumental
form in which several movements were combined into a com-
plete whole. It was the first in which the ecclesiastical
influences which had been so powerful were completely sup-
planted by a secular type of equally high artistic value.
Lastly, it was the highest representative instrumental form of the contrapuntal period, as the sonata is the highest of the harmonic period.
PART II

ANALYSIS OF MUSIC

CHAPTER I

SUITE I, G MAJOR

Prelude

The outstanding characteristic of the introductory movement is the arpeggiated sequence that forms the whole of this rhapsodic form. This sixteenth note pattern is repeated twice in each measure placing emphasis on the first and fifth notes, the resulting impression being the melodic importance of the first five notes. This five note segment creates a harmonic impression by including all of the chord tones. The remaining three notes assume only an accompanying value, filling in the space between the chord changes and acting as a transition to the next harmony. The result is the overlapping of phrases carrying out the continuous effortless motion that is characteristic of the movement.
This idea of phrasing does not necessarily limit the bowing styles; however, it does influence the selected methods. A very sustained harmonic feeling is the essential quality desired, thus the fewer bow changes required the easier this result is accomplished. In his recording Pablo Casals uses a long legato bow including all of the eight notes in the sequence on one stroke. The only suggestion the Bach Gesellschaft edition gives for this articulation is the first three notes on one slur, leaving the remaining notes to be played separately or to the discretion of the performer. The disagreeing factor in each edition is the varied ways in which the editors handled the second group of sixteenth notes. Some of the ideas that are utilized are shown below.
The selected method for the young performer would probably be one where the bowing is broken up considerably. The Malkin edition requires a well developed bow arm with perfect control.

As this sequence changes later on into scale-wise patterns and other diatonic progressions, the general rule is to emphasize the harmonically important tones, always giving special attention to the first note of the half measure groups. This tone is often the tonic of the chord and should be played with more weight on the bow and even with a slight extension of its value.

Usually the dynamic markings indicated in the editions affect the bowing in such a manner that in long crescendo
passages the bow changes become more frequent. There are three definite ideas here, one being a five-three note combination and the others a four-four or eight-eight combination. The majority of the editors create an effect of destroying the rhythmic feeling of four beats to a measure by this unevenly distributed bowing. On the other hand they possibly employ this altered bowing to compensate for the bowing arm of the less expert cellist. Here are two of the examples.

![Fig. 6. --Gaillard edition](#)

![Fig. 7. --Malkin edition](#)

The idea from the Casals recording is a four note phrase; however, it is very difficult to detect the bow change even with the change on the strong beat. He definitely does not use the phrasing as shown in Figure 6. The only clue to Bach's true intentions is the slurring of the first three notes as found in the Bach Gesellschaft edition.

That there is considerable variation in dynamic markings is quite understandable since the Bach Gesellschaft
edition gives no suggestions in this matter. Most of the deviation comes in the beginning point for the crescendi. Fortunately the editors generally agree on the dynamic level in the beginning and ending.

It is interesting to note in the Casals recording his perpetual use of the open strings. He seldom avoids them—only in exceptional passages where he desires the muted effect of the higher positions, often that of the D string. The resonant quality of the open string is usually preferred. An example of the use of the resonant open strings is in the last section of the movement where both the A and the D strings are used in a like manner. In both situations the open string is used as a ground tone, and although it is repeated only on every other sixteenth, its resonance carries through and gives the impression of a held note. The two note phrase should be played almost as double stops, leaving no space between notes and even allowing the two tones to actually overlap. Each tone should be left very reluctantly.

FIG. 8.—Use of open A string
Fig. 9.--Use of open D string

The melodic sequence as shown in Figure 8 is made up of the four moving notes in a half measure, the half measure falling across a bar line. The brief phrase is included on the second and third beats and the fourth and first beats. Slight emphasis is placed on the first note of each segment.

Allemande

The Allemande, the oldest of the dance movements, has probably progressed farther from its original form than any of the other movements. It is performed with extreme freedom, and is rhythmically very flexible. It is almost impossible to set on actual metronome marking because of this. The given marking in the Malkin edition is $\frac{3}{2}=72$; however, this may prove a little slow, for the Casals recording is played with a marking of $\frac{3}{2}=80-84$, a tempo pleasing both to performer and listener. A movement of this length may easily drag and become tiring.

The principal idea of the Allemande is one of legato movement, each note being important and given resonance and body. The more important chord members and the notes falling on the strong beat are stressed even more; a slight extension of note value is allowed here.
In order to reach the ultimate in legato expression, Casals has extended his bowing often into half measure phrases, lessening the chance for audible bow changes. The exception for this legato style comes only in the height of a crescendo where, for the purpose of special emphasis, he separates each note with long, broad strokes, still keeping in mind a sustained line. This bowing also occurs in the cadences.

The Bach Gesellschaft edition uses a simple four note phrase, changing on the beat, while Malkin and Gaillard employ a five-three, or two-three note bow pattern which is intended to create a legato effect, eliminating the change on the regular beat.

The ornamentation in the Allemande has proven a subject of disagreement in all the editions. The Bach Gesellschaft edition has only a limited number of ornaments of which all but one is written "tr". Casals plays all of the trills alike starting on the upper auxiliary and using a seven note trill.

![Fig. 10.—Casals' trill](image)

It was customary in the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries to begin the trill by an addition of a prefix,
a practice which Bach used rather consistently. He either clearly wrote out his ornamental passages or left definite directions as to their realization.

The Klengel and Malkin editions have a written trill on the sixteenth note following the dotted eighth note in the fourth and fifth measures, while Casals places the short trill on the dotted eighth as is indicated elsewhere in the movement. This consistent method is more acceptable because the trill naturally relieves the pause on the longer note and there is more time for a fuller trill to be realized. Casals adds more trills in the first section than are indicated in any of the editions. He trills on every dotted eighth note in the first section with the exception of the last two.

In the eighth measure of the Allemande there is considerable disagreement as every edition has a different specification for the ornament. Here are the various ideas.

Fig. 11.—Bach Gesellschaft edition (mordent)

Fig. 12.—Malkin edition

Fig. 13.—Gaillard edition
The editions of Casals and Klengel use no ornament here.

In the second section the Malkin edition employs trills in the seventh, sixth, and fifth measures from the end on the second eighth note of the measure where they have not been included in any of the other editions. This is merely a matter of individual preference and is certainly not from authoritative sources.

This movement should begin forte and remain at this level throughout the greater part of the two sections. The crescendi are usually rather long, building up through at least two measures. This creates a forceful beginning to the suite as this movement is ordinarily the first in the regular suite form.

A rather usual occurrence appears in the Gaillard edition three measures from the first double bar on the second beat. There is a discrepancy in the actual notes printed. The usual A is replaced by a B natural in this edition alone. This is very likely a misprint.

Fig. 14. -- Gaillard edition  
Fig. 15. -- The other editions

Courante

This contrasting movement of simple character and
rhythm should be performed in a very light, carefree manner. The first eighth note appearing on a weak beat is played very broadly, not losing the character of an up beat. The same applies to the corresponding up beat of the second section.

The important melodic element of the movement is a three note pattern that is woven through the form in frequent intervals. This pattern must be played with distinct emphasis on each appearance, never too short, but with resonance and breadth of style.

![Three note melodic pattern](image)

Fig. 16.--Three note melodic pattern

Other notes of special importance are chord tones following on the strong beats. In a sequence such as the one in Figure 17, the fourth sixteenth is the melodically strong note in the ascending line.

![Sequence](image)

Fig. 17.--Sequence

Before each double bar this sequence builds up to a grand crescendo closing with the pattern of three eighth notes.
All the editions with the exception of the Bach Gesellschaft agree on the use of the staccato eighth note. Even though the dot is used the staccato should be sonorous and not too short.

The ornaments in the Courante are not a problem of discussion as each edition agrees where the ornaments should be placed and concerning their realization. It was customary of the period for each trill to begin on the upper auxiliary.

Malkin, contrary to Klengel and Gaillard, marks a forte in the beginning of his edition which in general belief destroys some of the delicate character that is usually associated with the Courante. Of course, his over all idea is on a larger scale with the dynamic level of the whole movement on a louder plane than the other editions. Casals is inclined to agree with the other two editors and performs the Courante in contrast to the more noble movements which appear both before and after the dance.

Casals performs the Courante with a metronome marking of \( \frac{3}{100} \) while Malkin has \( \frac{1}{108} \) in his edition. The more lively tempo will lend more contrast.

Sarabande

In the fourth movement, the Sarabande, there are found fewer changes and discrepancies among the editions than in any of the other movements. The editors are more inclined to agree on the many aspects of style and performance.
The basic idea of this dance is a rigid form not subject to as much alteration and individual concept as the Allemande, Gigue, and other movements. The most prominent characteristic is its melodic content combined with a generally harmonic style and a peculiar rhythmic principle of strong emphasis of the second beat. This particular Sarabande is very true to form and molds itself well into the prescribed pattern. It is this strictness of design that simplifies its interpretation.

The Bach Gesellschaft edition definitely has a tendency toward under editing. Although all four of the editions agree amazingly well on the bowing aspect, the Bach Gesellschaft does not indicate as many slurs, leaving a number of small passages with each note articulated separately. In the absence of an original manuscript, there is no way of determining how Bach actually intended this movement to be played. Because this is of a serious and noble style, the separated notes are probably in order and facilitate the achievement of a broader effect.

In each measure a decided emphasis is placed on the second beat which is usually a chord, trill, or any note of long value. The tempo moves in a walking six and is played very legato and deliberately. The metronome indication will vary from \( \text{J} = 76 \) to \( \text{J} = 88 \) because of the extremely flexible tempo.

This central point of the suite tends to solidity,
and though played quietly, it does not necessarily need to be lowered to a soft dynamic level except to achieve contrast. Malkin suggests that on the repeat the mezzo forte should drop to a piano in the second section.

The trills are also played very deliberately, beginning slowly on the upper auxiliary unless it is played on a chord where the main note is sounded first before the trill begins. In none of the editions has the trill been written out.

The use of the open string in this slow movement has a remarkable effect and is desired if the tone is produced effectively. In the period in which these suites were composed there was very little, if any, vibrato employed; the open string resonance was utilized on every possible opportunity.

Minuet I and II

At this point in the suite it was customary for the composer to interpolate other movements before the final Gigue. The Minuet was one of the more common forms used as it presented a distinct contrast following the Sarabande.

The first measure exemplifies the contrast of ideas in the four editions concerning the bowing problem.

Fig. 18.--Malkin edition
This degree of variation runs consistently through both Minuets, and there is little background evidence on which to judge or base an opinion as to the best edition. Again the performer must consider style and his ultimate aims for performance.

Of great importance are the separate, short notes, some of which are marked staccato. Even in this light movement these should be played a little broadly and should not be too crisp and short. A considerable amount of bow may be used here giving a more resonant quality to the detached notes. The Bach Gesellschaft edition does not suggest staccato notes which gives an understanding that a broad stroke is desired.
This edition employs many two note slurs, phrasing the measure in a definite three. An example of this appears in the second and third measures.

![Musical notation](image)

Fig. 22.--Bach Gesellschaft edition

Klengel agrees with this to some extent only he separates the last two notes in the measure.

Casals' performance resembles the Malkin edition, the bowing and dynamics being somewhat similar. He adds two grace notes, as does Klengel, to the end of the trill in the fourth measure. In reality this is actually a modern trill and Bach did not intend for the trill to be interpreted this way unless he designated the anticipation himself. Bach was very particular with his ornamentation and he either clearly wrote out his ornamental passages or left clear, definite direction as to their realization.

The second minuet which appears in contrast to the first has only one distinct bowing pattern according to the Bach Gesellschaft edition and that is of three notes slurred and three separate. This pattern is continued throughout the movement, the slurs often coming in different places in the measure. In agreement with this idea is Julius Klengel whose edition has captured the same style
under a different disguise. The slurs are similar except that detached notes have slurs as well as dots indicating a somewhat quieter style of performance in the first section.

The second section is marked mezzo forte and the dotted notes are free from slurs in the Klengel edition, allowing for a stronger dynamic margin. Gaillard and Malkin prefer to slur the latter part of each measure regardless of the increased dynamic level.

Klengel, Malkin, and Gaillard do not follow the Bach Gesellschaft edition in the cadence before the first double bar. Here are the different notations of this measure.

**Fig. 23.**—Bach Gesellschaft edition

**Fig. 24.**—Malkin and Klengel editions

**Fig. 25.**—Gaillard edition
In the fifth and seventh measures from the end of Minuet II the same problem arises. In the Bach Gesellschaft edition the third beat of the seventh measure is a quarter note E flat and in the fifth measure a D natural. There is no repeated note as in the Malkin and Klengel editions.

Fig. 26. -- Bach Gesellschaft edition

Fig. 27. -- Malkin and Klengel editions

Fig. 28. -- Gaillard edition

Casals follows the Bach Gesellschaft example.

In the Malkin edition the given metronome marking is $J = 104$, however the recording of Minuet I is much faster, $J = 120$, and the resulting effect is probably more desired. The original marking of $J = 104$ is more appropriate for the second Minuet in its quieter, more relaxed style.
Again the contrasting theme of Minuet I enters and is played without repeats to conclude the movement.

**Gigue**

This concluding movement has been altered considerably from its original form and new independent ideas interwoven into its design. The most striking difference of opinion comes in the first measure and the subject of contrast is the fourth note in the first measure of the movement. The Gaillard edition takes the liberty of tying over this $E$ natural to the $E$ before, thus leaving out the accented beat in the measure. The really significant reaction to this comes when it is discovered that Casals also utilizes this alteration and he, too, ties over the third and fourth notes, not only in the first measure but wherever two like notes are repeated. The Malkin and Klengel editions do not recognize this editing but designate the constant repetition of eighth notes as the Bach Gesellschaft authorizes.

Fig. 29. -- Gaillard edition  
Fig. 30. -- Malkin edition  
Fig. 31. -- Klengel edition
After studying these three examples, there is found very little agreement on any of the details except the actual notes. It is evident that the bowings do not agree or hardly resemble each other, the tie is definitely an added feature not approved by many sources, and the dynamics differ considerably. This odd assortment of ideas constitutes the many editors' conceptions of the Gigue.

Perhaps the real clue to the actual choice of ideas is the realization of the original dance character of the Gigue, the light, airy quality, rhythmic and precise. The missing beat, as a result of the tie, does lend an individual air that proves quite refreshing, and the rather short, detached eighth notes add a decided lilt to its character. Klengel believes in a little more pompous a style, beginning his edition forte and continuing this dynamic range rather consistently. Malkin agrees to this somewhat but Gaillard and Casals prefer the more delicate approach which is definitely more in character of the form.

In the fourth measure the trill on the B natural in this chord is an extended trill through the complete half of the measure. Here Casals and Klengel actually agree by
both placing an anticipation-appoggiatura grace note figure before the fourth beat as illustrated in Figure 33.

```
\begin{music}
\\text{\textbf{Fig. 33.--Casals' trill}}
\end{music}
```

This movement of strict binary form finds contrast an important element to lessen the prominent repetitions. Dynamic contrast and complete change of mood is employed by all editions. The B section of the second part should be very legato with a quiet, slurred bow for four measures, breaking in again to the light, frolicking Gigue.

Casals records the Gigue at a slower tempo, $\text{\textit{J}} = 88$, than Malkin designates, $\text{\textit{J}} = 104$. Though the tempo Casals has chosen is easily adaptable to the Gigue style, a crisper tempo might be desired.
CHAPTER II

SUITE III, C MAJOR

Prelude

This C major suite is probably better known than any of the other six suites and is played more frequently. It is quite evident that these suites are not familiar to the ordinary music lover, for they were late-comers in winning appreciation. It was Pablo Casals who placed this collection in the repertory of every serious cellist, as he first showed, in the early years of the century, what artistry could do to bring them to life. With this significant fact in mind, Casals' interpretation of the third suite takes its stand as the height in musical understanding and expression.

The broadly stated theme of the Prelude appears boldly in the first measure in the simple form of a descending C major scale. No other suite can claim such a dynamic introduction nor a principal theme of such power and forcefulness. Each note in the first measure is played with a separate, firm stroke and much deliberation and freedom. The last four sixteenths are broader and very sonorous, each note fingered and no open G string. The open G in the next measure is the climax of the passage, and from there the tone diminishes rather suddenly until the D is actually
played piano. The broken, four-note chord that Gaillard places on the first C is merely a matter of individual taste and has been added only in this edition. Malkin slurs the sixteenths in the first measure; however, this is not conducive to the emphatic entrance that is characteristic of the usual performance. A considerable amount of emphasis is placed on the first C, and it should be marked with a dash as Malkin has indicated.

Complete contrast envelops the next few bars as each phrase is carefully interwoven, and the quiet, uninterrupted line is performed at the dynamic level of piano, the crescendo appearing several measures later. Here Casals uses the well known device of overlapping his phrases and grouping the notes in uneven design. This neglecting to change bows on the beat produces a flawless, legato line that is desired for this type of passage. Gaillard also employs this technique.

Fig. 34.--Legato bowing

As the piano passage starts on its ascending line, the suggested fingering here is to shift upon the G string, making the shift on the B natural and using the first finger twice. The fingering that the Gaillard edition suggests is
a very unsure method and one not usually practiced in violoncello technique. It is known as the "crawling" system, for the fingers move around in and out of position to each other and the hand. This fingering is illustrated in Figure 35 where the fourth finger stretches a whole step in place of the customary half step.

![Fig. 35.--Gaillard's suggested fingering](image)

The ascending line reaches a climax in measure six and the style changes to one less mild and the bowing to one of broader concept. The first note in the sixth measure is extended somewhat in value; as the rhythm moves on, the lost time is made up in the latter part of the measure where each note is separated.

Klengel has chosen a separated bowing style throughout most of these first six measures, contrary to any other source; however, this may be explained by the absence of any piano marking and the continued forte level he maintains. The contrast in dynamics and bowing has been rather traditional although the Bach Gesellschaft is not responsible for this suggested idea.

The general effect of the first section of the Prelude is one of moving from one important note to another with
rhapsodic freedom. The stronger chord tones are emphasized consistently, revealing the harmonic background more clearly. The greater part of this section is made up of an almost undeviated scale pattern pursued through clearly defined changes of harmony. As this harmony moves through the key, it modulates smoothly to its relative minor key where the movement is of a freer and more improvisatory character.

In the twenty-seventh measure the Klengel edition employs a style of bowing as illustrated in Figure 37 which Casals uses, and which is preferred over the Malkin edition. Here are three suggestions.

Fig. 36.--Gaillard edition

Fig. 37.--Klengel edition

Fig. 38.--Malkin edition

The separated notes on the first two beats should be playd
with more intensity of tone than can be produced by playing actual staccato notes. For this effect the tip of the bow is used in a light brush stroke controlled from the shoulder.

Malkin does not make any changes or contrasts in bowing styles here, and he continues with the slurred, legato bowing. Throughout the complete movement he employs this style not even separating the notes in the broad crescendi or in the climax at the end of the movement. This edition is the only one which requires such strict legato technique.

There is obviously more contrast and interest in the editions that have two different ideas interwoven into the design. The Bach Gesellschaft edition uses the slur sparingly and almost hesitantly as though to aid in a broader interpretation of the movement. In the long, arpeggiated middle section, only the first three notes are slurred according to the Bach Gesellschaft edition, leaving the last sixteenth note of each group separated.

The principal idea in this sonorous rhapsodic pattern is its intensity and continuous line that builds its melodic and tonal structure. This line must remain unbroken until it gradually subsides into a piano level and slips back to the original pattern that introduces the movement. There are two suggestions concerning the bowing problem here.
The bow change comes in Figure 39 on the melodically important note each time, emphasizing the note on the A string that is frequently slighted. On the other hand the bowing, as in Figure 40, changes on the pedal G which is a very important tonal element in this type of figure. This furnishes a strong, sturdy bass and is somewhat easier to execute. The bow change must neither be felt nor heard. In the Bach Gesellschaft edition the first three notes of each group are slurred and the last note is separated, resulting in a very choppy effect. This bowing is certainly not effective, especially in a section that logically builds up to a forceful climax.

The thumb is employed here as the only reliable method to insure just intonation. It is true that this is a rather low position for the thumb, the spread of the hand being very wide and the stretch difficult. The thumb plays only the A string tone, sounding the repeated D's, C's, and B's.
Fig. 41.--Use of thumb

This position is prepared in the preceding measure where the first and third fingers are extended as shown in Figure 42.

Fig. 42.--Preparation for Figure 41

As this section of free arpeggiated movement gradually subsides to a pianissimo, the scalewise introductory theme weaves itself into the established framework bringing with it a well defined bowing style. Each note is separated in the Casals recording, and the mounting crescendo is climaxed by a series of broken chords played with great strength and breadth of style. In the last seven measures each sixteenth is played with the deliberation and sonority that exemplifies the style of the whole movement.

The trill on the third measure from the end should be played a double trill and started on the upper auxiliary, another sixth, E flat and C. The open D string will help facilitate this difficulty. The double trill is indicated
only in the Bach Gesellschaft and Klengel editions and is present in the Casals recording. On the end of the trill an anticipation and appoggiatura are attached before this final resolution.

![Fig. 43. -- Double trill](image)

The concluding measure consists of a four note C major chord.

![Fig. 44. -- Final chord](image)

The tempo at this movement will be approximately \( \frac{3}{8} = 72 \).

**Allemande**

The three introductory sixteenth notes in this Allemande are of extreme importance as they establish the key, the tempo, and the gay style of this movement. They are played forcefully, in strict rhythm, detached, and with a broad bow style.

In the first measure the C major theme is established by a variation of the descending scale used in the Prelude.
Once the bowing pattern is established for this theme it is used through the whole of the movement, for the rhythmic pattern also remains constant. A discussion on the bowing style can not be considered until it is decided how the sixteenths should be played, which ones are detached, the dynamic level, and the tempo. Three of the editors handled this problem as is illustrated in Figure 45 and Figure 46.

![Fig. 45. --Bach Gesellschaft and Gaillard editions](image1)

![Fig. 46. --Malkin edition](image2)

The Klengel edition resembles the Gaillard edition only where there is a dot over all the separated notes. Casals uses a similar style to that of Figure 46. He prefers the strong beat emphasized and the separated notes of more breadth than the staccato might indicate. The brisk tempo encourages the light, trivial treatments of the sixteenths, and Casals, in order to steady the beat, gives slight attention to the last note in each group. The resulting melodic and rhythmic effect is that illustrated in Figure 47.
This principle is used throughout the movement.

The second entrance of the three thematic sixteenth notes comes at the last of the first measure and in the form of an echo at a piano level.

Another example of the melodically important notes, as illustrated in Figure 47, is in the fourth measure from the first double bar where the phrasing clarifies any doubt concerning this line.

In each case the pick-up is phrased with the next beat.

The second section of the Allemande proceeds as the first only in the dominant key. In both sections four staccato sixteenth notes appear frequently; these are of primary importance in the melodic structure. These should be played as detached notes, clearly defined and deliberately.

Also in the second section are two discrepancies in the
actual notation. On the first beat in the third measure from the end there are several conflicting ideas.

Fig. 49.--Bach Gesellschaft edition

Fig. 50.--Gaillard edition

Fig. 51.--Malkin and Klengel editions

Fig. 52.--Casals' recording

Since both Casals and the Bach Gesellschaft edition agree on the rhythmic element, this idea achieves preference over the other editions. Even these two sources do not agree on the second note, A or C; however the C is probably harmonically better than the A.
In the second measure from the end, Casals alters the notation on the second beat by substituting the figuration in Figure 53 for that in Figure 54.

![Fig. 53. --Bach Gesellschaft and other editions](image1)

![Fig. 54. --Casals' recording](image2)

The editions agree on the general dynamic markings by beginning both sections forte and indicating sudden contrasts frequently. There are many crescendi indicated, the important ones coming directly before the double bars.

The occasional trill is a brief one since it usually appears on the sixteenth note; it must always begin on the upper auxiliary.

The tempo that Malkin suggests is $\text{\textfrac{1}{4}} = 92$.

**Courante**

This Courante is in the same genial mood as the Allemande, although there are almost no contrasts in rhythm within the established framework. Although it is in close relationship to the two previous movements, it is not so
fully developed and is less expansive in its gestures. Whereas the melodic element of the preceding movements consists principally of scalewise treatment, the line in this movement is based on descending arpeggiated sequences played briskly and in a detached, well defined manner.

The first note in each section is a well emphasized up beat, somewhat broader than the following few notes. It is fully as important as the first beat of the measure. A better tone quality for this thematic line may be acquired by using the middle of the bow and keeping a firm balance between the first and fourth fingers of the right hand. All staccato notes must be brushed and not be articulated too shortly or dryly. It must be remembered that these are unaccompanied suites and the solo instrument is responsible for all of the tone and resonance that is produced.

\[ \text{Fig. 55.--Melodic sequence} \]

The Courante begins forte and remains at this level except where a sudden contrast is desired as in measure eight.

In about the twelfth measure of the first section the bowing style used by Casals and Gaillard changes to that as shown in Figure 56.
This type of staccato has almost a sticky effect and is well suited for this type of line where the tempo moves along at a considerable rate of speed.

Another type of bow that Casals prefers is the one shown in Figure 57 as in contrast to the two note slur that Gaillard suggests.

Casals plays the passage in the upper half of the bow with firm pressure on the first finger on the bow. The repeated C is slighted somewhat with the emphasis falling on the changing note pattern which outlines the harmonic structure.

The Klengel and Malkin editions suggest a contrasting forte followed by piano marking for each measure in the
brief section that is illustrated in Figure 57 and 58. The performer should exercise care in choosing this idea or the one that Casals suggests, a long crescendo, because of the probability of destroying the structural line. In this case the performer must consider both knowledge and feeling.

The second section of the Courante is almost an exact repetition of the first section, and it begins in the customary dominant key. The bowing style and general harmonic and melodic structure is the same.

As in all the suites, the ritard in the final cadence comes only on the second repeat.

The metronome marking for this movement as suggested by Malkin is \( \frac{1}{4} = 108 \); however, Casals does exceed this somewhat.

**Sarabande**

The key of the Sarabande is well established in the first measure by the resounding C major chord appearing on the first beat. It is interesting to notice the various ways the chord has been notated, all three designating the same manner of performance.

\[ \text{Fig. 59. -- Malkin edition} \]  
\[ \text{Fig. 60. -- Klengel edition} \]
The Gaillard edition is more specific leaving no doubt as to the length of the lower part of the chord and at the same time giving the impression that it begins on the first beat and not before as the Klengel edition suggests. Even though the notation in the Malkin edition is correct and the manner of performance is understood, the other editions are more exacting and particular.

The rhythmic framework of the movement is well established in the first measure, and although elaborated upon in the following measures, it moves in this definite pattern.

The style of the dotted rhythm must be decided upon, particularly the manner in which the sixteenth is played. There are two different ideas concerning this in the editions, for the Casals performance establishes an accepted way which is obviously more desired. In Figure 63 is the
Gaillard method of playing the sixteenth, placing a dot over the note and breaking the slur to the following B. The Sarabande is usually a movement of great dignity, almost of deliberate aria style, and the dotted sixteenth is hardly appropriate, detracting from the legato style.

The Gaillard edition differs from the other by setting forth the melodic line rather than creating a harmonic impression and emphasizing the double stops. He holds the accompanying notes only through the designated eighth note value, ignoring the sustained harmonic impression that the other editors agree upon.

Fig. 63.---Gaillard edition

Fig. 64.---Malkin edition

Fig. 65.---Klengel edition

Notice how Klengel sustains the whole note D. Casals used the Gaillard idea throughout the complete movement and holds the lower notes of every double stop only an eighth value. This undoubtedly tends to a more melodic approach which may be desired in this instance.
Casals treats the bowing in such a manner that certain progressions that are inherent in later thematic groupings stand out. Although he changes the bow on every quarter note value, this phrasing is ordinarily undiscoverable to the listener. Casals does not join notes and passages by accident or chance but bows so as to bring out to best advantage the distinct character of each voice. His playing of this suite is clear and simple, and yet at times sounds almost like a string quartet.

In the second measure from the first double bar, Casals substitutes a B for the written C on the last sixteenth of the second beat. None of the editions agree with this, and it can hardly be accepted as correct.

In the Malkin edition there is an octave G written in on the second beat before the double bar, whereas Klengel, Casals, and Gaillard prefer the single, first line G. Another discrepancy such as this is on the eighth bar after the first double bar where Casals plays only the low D the first time, but includes the complete four note chord on the repeat. The same problem arises on the last measure of the movement as Casals makes the distinction between the first playing and the repetition.

This movement is performed very slowly, $\frac{3}{4} = 66$.

Bourree I and II

The two Bourrees are sharply contrasted, the first
showing a sort of courtly dignity characterized by the Baroque restraint. The first theme, precisely stated, is performed in an exacting manner of strict tempo, a neat staccato, and careful phrasing. The two measure phrases are easily distinguished, each beginning on a fourth beat pick up. The phrasing in the fifth measure creates a problem in need of discussion since there seems to be some disagreement over the bowing style. The two distinct ways vary to the degree that the passage can hardly be recognized as the same when performed both ways.

![Fig. 66.--Phrasing in Casals and Gaillard editions](image)

![Fig. 67.--Phrasing in Bach Gesellschaft, Malkin, and Klengel editions.](image)

This is strictly a matter of individual choice. Although the idea in Figure 67 is more in keeping with the style of the movement, the other phrasing is a well chosen contrast and is often preferred.

The rhythmic pattern as set up in the first theme is
the framework on which the movement is based, thus the style in which it is played must be carefully thought through and then applied to the whole of the two Bourrees. Casals performs the theme by slurring the first two eighth notes on the fourth beat and playing each note in the first measure detached.

The second section must be treated in the same manner although it is actually more of a variation on the theme and it differs somewhat from the original line. The crescendo is a device that is used to an advantage here.

There are several ideas concerning the bowing of the passage eight measures from the end of Bourree I.

![Fig. 68.--Gaillard edition](image1) ![Fig. 69.--Malkin edition](image2)

![Fig. 70.--Klengel and Bach Gesellschaft editions](image3)

Casals' choice is that of the Gaillard edition.

Another added feature upon which Gaillard and Casals agree is the brief trill that they both add to the first beat of the second bar.
The second Bourree is of perfect contrast to the first in tempo, key, and mood. The theme itself is a minor variation of the original line written in scalewise progression.

It should be performed at a very soft dynamic level with measured long phrases, very quietly, and much slower.

The second part moves ahead and the style resembles the first Bourree a little more. The short, staccato notes are used once more and the piano level gradually increases to a forte at the climax of two crescendi.

In the Gaillard and Malkin editions is the suggestion that the repeat of each section of Bourree II be played even more softly than the first time. All of these contrasts help to create interest and vary the monotony of the many repetitions. Also the retard never appears at the close of a section until on the repeat.

Bourree I is played about \( \frac{3}{4} = 84 \); however, Bourree II is taken considerably slower.

Gigue

This movement of perpetual motion requires the performer to reveal a considerable amount of virtuosity, and is far too light and gay to be held for long in serious
contemplation. Of great importance to its style is the placement of accents which tends to alter the monotony of its rather unusual length and to emphasize its frollicking character. The first two notes are very short and firm and well in tempo. The metric scheme is in a general four measure phrases idea, one beat to a measure, with the accent often misplaced on the third beat as in the third and fourth measures.

Although Casals does not observe this suggestion, Gaillard uses a device that is very well placed and certainly adds a considerable amount of interest to the rhythmic element. He ties over the third beat to the first in the eighth and ninth measures, omitting the strong beat as illustrated in Figure 72.

Fig. 72.--Uses of the tie

Gaillard suggests this each time the same note is repeated over the bar line.

The main theme to this Gigue is the augmentation and mirror imitation of the theme of the Prelude in the same suite. Each uses the ascending scale in its pure form, branching away from it occasionally but always reverting to it.
A second theme enters in the twenty-first bar and, although very simple in structure, it presents an impression of virtuosic style and increasing intensity. The problem here is the bowing, for in the fifth bar the directional change of the pedal tone demands an opposite type of bowing. The passage begins with an up bow on each melodic note and a down bow on the pedal D, with each note articulated separately. At the beginning of the fifth bar a double down bow must be made to start the bow in the opposite direction. The string crossing is much easier and smoother is played in the manner shown in Figure 73.

![Fig. 73.--Bowing problem](image)

In order to accomplish this change smoothly the bow must move swiftly across the open D, creating as much resonance as possible, and as the open string rings free, the bow is picked up and brought back for another down bow as quickly as possible.

Each of the four editions suggests slurring the notes in two note groups, although Casals does not choose to do so.

The climax of each section comes sixteen bars from the
end where the double stops are played almost brutally, very detached, and near the frog of the bow. On the final appearance of the minor theme the staccato chords in the first two measures may be taken with all down bows with great force as a effort to culminate strength for the concluding statement of this theme.

\[
\begin{align*}
\text{Fig. 74.} & \quad \text{Bowing suggestion} \\
\end{align*}
\]

A sudden contrasting piano marking nine bars later allows more consideration for a broader crescendo to end each section.

The second section begins as a variation of the descending scales and should be bowed in two-note groups.

\[
\begin{align*}
\text{Fig. 75.} & \quad \text{Second section} \\
\end{align*}
\]

Twenty-four measures after the first double bar a variation of a previously appearing theme is heard. The original theme can be found eight measures before the double bar and is the one already mentioned that begins the concluding crescendo of each section.
Both themes must be treated alike. The variation also is played very softly, briskly, and the last note somewhat accented, as Casals indicated, whenever either theme appears.

Malkin gives the metronome marking as $\frac{\text{bpm}}{4} = 84$ which is approximately the same as the Casals recording.
CHAPTER III

SUITE VI, D MAJOR

Prelude

Under the title of the suite is an explanatory note:

A cing cordes, accordies en

This quotation is significant of the fact that this particular suite was written originally for a five stringed instrument, the fifth string being the E a fifth above the standard violoncello tuning. Although it has been customary to play the D major suite on the violoncello, it is certainly evident by the extensive use of the high register that this could have been composed for an instrument with a higher natural range.

Its extreme virtuosic element makes it rather unpopular to the average cellist, yet it is really one of the most pleasant ones to listen to from the standpoint of the melodic line, the rhythmic interest, and the harmonic structure.

The tempo of the Prelude is a deliberate one, taken freely at the metronome marking of \( \frac{\text{j}}{=104} \). The repeated notes in the first two measures are not articulated to the
degree that each note is detached and well defined; rather the line is almost unbroken and only the changing melodic tones disturb the continuity of the pedal D. The slight articulation that is present is created by the changing of strings even though the same D is sounded. Here is the fingering used for this effect.

\[\text{Fig. 78.--Fingering}\]

Although the third note in the triplet is marked staccato, the effect desired is a slight emphasis used to designate its melodic value. Casals does not detach the note, but he does broaden his stroke and plays the note on a separate bow.

The second measure is a repetition of the first and is played piano in contrast to the forte entrance of the theme in the preceding measure.

In the third measure the triplet grouping of the measure remains the same although the rhythmic feeling is destroyed by the cross bowing that Casals uses. Klengel, Gaillard, and the Bach Gesellschaft edition prefer the triplet feeling, and only Casals and Malkin agree on the overlapping by the bowing.
A better example of Casals' logical phrasing is in the fifth measure where he bows according to the structural quality of the music.

He reconstructs the phrasing with his bowing to meet the need of inherent thematic groupings.

The use of the thumb position simplifies the more difficult passages that would otherwise require extensive shifting and "crawling" of the hand and fingers. In the
tenth measure the thumb technique may be employed, allowing this passage to be played in one position and the hand to remain stationary for two measures.

![Fig. 83.--Thumb position](image)

This passage appears frequently during this movement, often at a much higher range as in measure twenty-one. Here the only possibility for good intonation is in the use of the thumb, for it is written much too high to be played by shifting back and forth on the A string.

The preceding measure illustrates the facility of a passage where it is fingered across on the D string.

![Fig. 84.--Fingering](image)

Figure 84 also illustrates the bowing that Casals uses for this type of passage.

Beginning with measure twenty-three more proof is evident that this suite was originally written for a five-stringed instrument. The fingering that must be used,
because of the absence of an open \( E \) string, places the hand in a very awkward extension position.

![Extended thumb position](image)

Fig. 85.--Extended thumb position

Throughout this complete section of about eight measures the thumb remains on the \( E \) placed firmly across both the \( A \) and \( D \) strings. This \( E \) is a pedal tone ringing through the changing harmony and is set apart from the moving melodic line made up of the first and third eighth of each count.

Casals plays this Prelude extremely freely, moving from one melodically important note to another and pausing at will to extend the value of an occasional tone. The elasticity of the rhythmic element aids and facilitates the shifting about in the higher positions considerably. The hand must be perfectly relaxed in the higher register to insure good intonation, and this condition cannot be maintained if there is any impulse to rush or hurry through a passage.

On the twenty-second measure from the end, Malkin suggests a very good fingering that simplifies the technical aspect of this rapidly articulated scale passage. He moves down from the high \( C \) scalewise on the \( A \) string...
until the thumb can be placed on the E. From there the next two measures are played in position moving across the four strings.

In a passage such as this one where smooth finger action is of great importance, the fingers should be kept curved over the strings with as little up and down motion as possible. The lowest notes in the arpeggios are usually given a little more time and the highest notes may be brought out also.

An unusual feature about the Bach Gesellschaft edition is the notation in the alto clef in place of the tenor clef that is now customary to use. The cellist of today is not trained to read the alto clef, thus this notation has little practical value.

The last entrance of the repeated note passage on the open A string is played forcefully as though to leave a final impression by the culmination of all effort to emphasize this pattern.

The three note chords seven measures from the end are all played with a down bow and a considerable amount of space between strokes. The last five measures of arpeggiated motion are played slowly and emphatically, gradually diminishing to a piano level and a final retard on the last measure.
Allemande

The principal idea in this slow movement is one of melismatic figuration or of ornamented melodic line. It moves freely, void of any strict rhythmic feeling. As the line moves about the upper range of the violoncello the dynamics follow in parallel sequence, never climbing to a level beyond a forte and usually remaining at the lower level of mezzo piano.

This movement is the ultimate in legato expression, flawless shifting, and controlled bowing. Every note is perfectly articulated with a singing resonant quality. The trills are deliberately and smoothly executed, usually beginning on the upper auxiliary. The broken chords are very broad, and the crossing of the strings is never a sudden motion; it is more of a rolling motion of the elbow.

The phrasing of this movement is one of a continuous line rather than a series of shorter patterns molded together to form a whole. The bowing is so arranged that the changes appear in the midst of moving lines where they are easily concealed. The changes are seldom found in obvious places, but conform to the interwoven patterns of the music.

In a movement of such sustained character as this one, the fingering may become a problem, for all obvious shifts must be omitted and the fingers are forced from a
less formal pattern of movement to a "crawling" or stretching motion. The extension position of the hand comes into important play here in the Allemande, for it becomes an important element of security. In this position the thumb should remain opposite the second finger with the neck in between. In big stretches it is desirable that the first finger should be stretched back almost vertically and placed with the outer edge of its tip upon the string.

Casals takes advantage of this slow movement and includes a few appropriate portamento shifts. This may be easily overdone in a composition of this period, for it is hardly considered as a characteristic of the period.

In his recording Casals seldom observes the tied notes that are held over after a chord as all of the editions suggest. This probably aids somewhat in the establishing of a rhythmic pulse.

![Fig. 86.--Tie](image)

**Courante**

Although Malkin indicates the metronome marking for this movement to be $\frac{1}{1} = 103$, Casals moves the tempo ahead
considerably, performing it at about $J = 120$ or even faster. The recording does not give the impression of rushing even in the very rapid sixteenth note passages, and it prevents this rather long movement from dragging. The rapid tempo may be handled very easily if the performer finds important notes to stress and on which to relax for a moment. The rhythm cannot be kept perfectly steady to the extent that each note falls meticulously in its place.

The first note, an eighth pick up, is somewhat broader than the following staccato eighths, and the dot over it detaches it from the first beat. The sixteenth notes are always slurred and the remaining notes in the measure are played very short, still retaining much of their resonance.

The editions are in very close agreement on the bowing style. The first measure of each edition illustrates their close similarity.

![Fig. 87. Gaillard and Klengel editions](image)

![Fig. 88. Malkin edition](image)
The only discrepancy that is at all evident is in the slurring of the sixteenth notes to the following eighth and this is of little importance as long as the eighth is short and played in the same style as those appearing later in the measure.

The five measures of continuous sixteenth notes should be slurred one bow to a measure if the tempo is near that which Casals chooses, even though some of the other editions suggest the slurring of four notes to a bow. This style is inclined to be too choppy and is not at all necessary unless the tempo drags considerably.

Six measures before the first double bar the later editions break away from the Bach Gesellschaft suggestions of four notes to a bow by slurring six notes and following the structural lines and natural grouping of the phrases.

This section ends forte with a ritard only on the repetition.
The second section is played a little faster, the metronome marking falling at about \( \frac{3}{4} \times 126 \). This moving ahead facilitates the long phrases which are played all on one bow in many cases. This is true particularly in the long ascending scale passages.

The second section is very similar to the first section, both played very freely and in a frolicking style of perpetual motion. The majority of the bowing is near the middle of the bow, using a controlled spiccato stroke. The bow moves nearer the frog for the more brilliant parts and back out to the middle for the soft passages. One of the bowing problems will be to move the bow near the frog or the point so as to allow enough bow for the long slurs.

**Sarabande**

The expressive movement played in majestic slow aria style, is the culmination of harmonic progression combined with a finely woven contrapuntal line. The chordal style is the underlying element of performance that requires a person of individual artistry to interpret, understand, and play this Sarabande. Of all the movements of the suite this is probably the most difficult to perform in an artistic manner.

Each chord must be played deliberately, crossing the strings slowly and leaving the lower strings to vibrate
freely. The slower tempo will facilitate the shifting, and Casals has chosen one even slower than the tempo Malkin suggests. He plays the first half of the movement at $J = 84$; however, fourteen measures from the end he moves ahead, using the tempo Malkin indicated in his edition, $J = 96$. The Sarabande cannot be played in a strict rhythm, for its charm and musical appeal is realized in the stressing of certain phrases or even separate tones, allowing more time and expression to be concentrated at these points.

The movement is in the customary binary form, AABB, with the repeats seldom written out but always indicated. However, Malkin fails to include this in his edition, probably because of considerable length of the movement with repeats.

There is a difference of opinion concerning the actual notation of the sixth measure as is shown in the following illustrations.

Fig. 91.—Malkin edition

Fig. 92.—Gaillard edition
Fig. 93.--Bach Gesellschaft edition

Klengel indicates both melodic lines in his edition, and Casals plays the B natural which is melodically better because the B forms the climax in the line.

Another contrast in the editions is the notation of the lower notes of the chords. Klengel and Gaillard are very particular in their editing, leaving no doubt that the lower notes are not held as long as the upper notes. Of course it is impossible to hold all three notes at once, and the Bach Gesellschaft and Malkin editions consider this as established fact.

The latter part of the second section is phrased in groups of two quarter notes, the emphasis always being placed on the first note. The double stops in this section move from one to another with as little motion as possible, leaving no breaks between the bow changes.

Gavotte I and II

This gay movement of folk-like quality is played in a carefree, cheerful manner and in a frolicking tempo of about $\frac{1}{\text{beats}} = 72$. Although the rhythm is far from steady, it reveals a dancing effect, always driving ahead to contrasting rhythmic patterns and dynamic levels. Time is
usually lost on the sweeping chords, for they are played deliberately, and where there are only three notes all are played simultaneously. The many double stops and broken chords give the impression of more than one instrument, perhaps even a string quartet.

The separate eighth notes in this movement are played very briskly, and although not necessarily staccato, the notes are well detached. The scalewise passages are played on one bow, but the two note patterns are bowed in short two note slurs. This phrasing is a very natural impulse on the part of the performer, and all of the editions agree on the general idea and style of this movement.

The broken chords that appear in a series are all played down bow as in the thirteenth measure from the end of Gavotte I.

Klengel places a turn over the last beat of the second measure from the end. This is the only edition that has this trill, so it must be purely a matter of individual taste.

![Fig. 94. -- Turn in Klengel edition](image)

The Gavotte II is played somewhat faster, $\frac{3}{4}=80$, and later on in the second section it moves ahead to $\frac{3}{4}=88$. 
Casals begins this Gavotte in a detached style like the first one; however, Klengel employs a contrasting legato style and a softer dynamic level.

The middle section in the second Gavotte is slurred in two note groups and played in strict tempo. The phrase is repeated in half voice and the movement remains at this level until the end.

The repetition of the first Gavotte is rather startling after this quiet interlude.

Gigue

The style of this movement is very similar to the preceding Gavottes, spirited, gay, and of sparkling, dancing rhythm. Although of harmonically and melodically simple structure, the changing rhythmic element lends a fresh, invigorating mood. Casals performs this movement in a different style from that of most of the editions, following the Gaillard edition in his slurring, dynamics and phrasing. The chief difference comes in the treatment of staccato notes, for even in this frolicking dance, he manages to slur many of the small groups which the other editions have marked staccato with separate bows. An example of the two distinct differences in the editions is evident in the first measure.
Every time this figure appears Casals slurs the groups of eighths, leaving the last note short and free from the following group.

Casals fails to follow the Gaillard bowing style in the fifth measure as he does not slur all three notes but plays the passage as illustrated in Figure 98.

The bowing that Casals uses is more appropriate for this type of moving figure.

In the scalewise passages of sixteenth notes, Casals takes plenty of time between groups, particularly in the higher register as though to set the hand for each group of six notes.
There is a variation in actual notes in measure eighteen. Casals plays a sixteenth note figure here as Klengel and Gaillard indicate, but the Malkin edition continues in a straight eighth note line.

![Fig. 99. Casals' recording, Klengel, Gaillard editions](image)

A similar problem occurs in the fourteenth measure from the end of the Gigue. In this case the question is concerning the rhythmical division of the measure.

![Fig. 100. Malkin edition](image)

![Fig. 101. Malkin, Klengel editions, Casals' recording](image)

![Fig. 102. Gaillard edition](image)
In the twenty-first and twenty-third measures the three consecutive chords are all played with down bows, very strongly and rhythmically. The first chord of each group contains three notes and is played with all three strings sounding simultaneously. A chord such as this need not be broken even though the balance of the strings may be sacrificed somewhat.

The movement draws to a close and ends with a crescendo to a double forte. The descending arpeggio in the last measure broadens to the last quarter and is played with each note staccato and well emphasized.

Probably the most difficult problem dealt with in the performance of these suites is the question of interpretation in general. Every interpreter must try at least to see the music as the composer and his contemporaries saw it, and having done that must employ his own imagination and his individual artistry to make his knowledge of the past creative.
BIBLIOGRAPHY

Books


Scores

Bach, J. S. *Sechs Sonaten*, edited by Julius Klengel, Leipzig, Breitkopf and Hartel, no date.


**Records**

