

379  
N81  
No. 335

GUIDANCE FACTORS IN THE SELECTION OF STUDENTS  
FOR THE STUDY OF INSTRUMENTAL MUSIC  
IN THE PUBLIC SCHOOLS OF  
TULSA, OKLAHOMA

THESIS

Presented to the Graduate Council of the North  
Texas State Teachers College in Partial  
Fulfillment of the Requirements

For the Degree of

MASTER OF SCIENCE

by

Kenneth Hayes, B. S.

Tulsa, Oklahoma

August, 1940

88312

88312

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Chapter	Page
I. THE PROBLEM . . . . .	1
II. TRENDS AND PHILOSOPHIES . . . . .	4
The Philosophy of Musical Opportunity	
Educational Values of Music	
Educational Values in Instrumental Music	
Who Should Be Given Instrumental Instruction?	
The Foundation of the Instrumental Program.	
Psychological Influences	
III. SELECTION FACTORS . . . . .	12
Traits of the Instrumentalist	
Music Capacity Tests	
Intelligence Tests	
Academic Grades	
Vocal Music Record	
Tests of Temperament	
Manual Dexterity	
Preparatory Instruments	
Adaptation	
Laboratory Exposure	
The Exploratory Course	
IV. GUIDANCE IMPLICATIONS . . . . .	48
V. SUMMARY AND RECOMMENDATIONS . . . . .	51
APPENDIX. . . . .	55
BIBLIOGRAPHY. . . . .	56

## CHAPTER I

### THE PROBLEM

#### Statement of Problem

Instrumental music classes in the public schools of Tulsa, Oklahoma, have experienced a phenomenal growth during the past twenty years. Prior to this period, opportunity for instrumental music expression was limited to the high school band and orchestra, which rehearsed outside of school hours. No instruction other than this was provided and the student who wished to play in the school band or orchestra studied first from private instructors.

Last year approximately fifteen hundred students participated in instrumental music activities which ranged from the beginning classes in the elementary schools to the symphonic bands and orchestras of the high schools. The Board of Education has an estimated investment of \$30,000 in instruments and the value of student-owned instruments is approximately \$85,000. The schools are providing free instruction to every student who wishes to study and who can procure the necessary equipment.

Two weaknesses in this system are evident. There is no scientific approach to the problem of guidance in the selection of these students or the instruments which they choose. Every year many children who begin the study of an instrument

fail, either because they lack the capacity to do the work or because they choose an instrument to which they are not suited. There is no attempt to discover students with unsuspected ability and to encourage or assist them in developing this ability.

#### Scope of the Study

In this study the investigator has examined a great many devices for measuring capacities and aptitudes which are known to the profession. He has attempted to evaluate these procedures in the light of sound educational philosophy. He has set forth a plan which he believes will materially improve the instrumental program through discovering unsuspected musical capacity and through sound guidance in the selection of suitable instruments.

#### Reliability of Data

The investigator has based the program on the philosophy of music education of such authorities as Mabelle Glenn, James L. Mursell, Peter W. Dykema and Will Earhart. In the field of measurement of musical capacity he has relied on the work of Carl E. Seashore and Jacob Kwalwasser. In the study of physical and mental adaptation, a great many well known instrumental educators have contributed information. Included in this group are Joseph Maddy and William D. Revelli of Michigan University, Charles J. Lamp, Director of Instrumental Music, San Francisco, Lawrence W. Chidester of Tufts College, Gerald R. Prescott of the University of Minnesota,

Traugott Rohner of Northwestern University and Roger Fenn of the University of Tulsa. In addition, the investigator has sought opinions from many prominent professional musicians and from many outstanding private teachers. To this has been added the results of years of experience in adaptation as practiced by the investigator and his colleagues. Concerning the principles of guidance, he has referred to Arthur J. Jones and Carl E. Seashore.

#### Need for the Study

During the past two years the investigator has directed inquiries to more than a hundred instrumental music instructors from all over the nation in an effort to find some comprehensive program of guidance. From the response received, it would appear that the profession in general is committed to a "survival of the fittest" plan which depends on high-pressure promotion to secure large numbers of students from which organizations are selected.

This system has resulted in much waste of the taxpayer's money for instruction, waste of the parent's money for instruments and waste of the student's time and energy.

If the teaching of instrumental music is to continue to enjoy the confidence of the people and of the education profession, a well-rounded program of guidance based on sound educational philosophy is imperative.

## CHAPTER II

### TRENDS AND PHILOSOPHIES

#### The Philosophy of Musical Opportunity

Our country today is almost universally committed to the philosophy that a love and appreciation of music contributes greatly to the capacity for abundant living. To this end progressive music educators have adopted the slogan, "music for every child--every child for music." Consistent with the American ideal of equal opportunity for all, every child should be given the opportunity to participate in musical activities of his choice to the point that is fixed by his individual interest and capacity. It then becomes the responsibility of the school to discover, encourage, and develop, in school hours and at school expense, every child's interest in music. This program undoubtedly will serve democracy well.

#### Educational Values of Music

Mursell sums up the educational values of music under four points. Music education is a progressive reconstruction of experience; music education is an enterprise in fuller living; music education has an essential place in creative democracy.<sup>1</sup>

---

<sup>1</sup>James L. Mursell and Mabelle Glenn, The Psychology of School Music, p. 357.

Music education as a progressive reconstruction of experience.--If the aim in music education is technique to be gained by formal drill, then most of its educational value is lost. Technique is only a means to an end, the ability to read music, to sing or play an instrument being only the means by which we reach a deeper appreciation of music through the creation of music. This is accomplished by the setting up of music projects.

Music education as discipline.--Music study should not be so easy that there is nothing challenging. The disciplining value in music comes in making the music so enjoyable that hard work is a pleasure. "Discipline in music comes from an association of inspiration with effort."<sup>2</sup> When the goal is so attractive that the hard work necessary to reach that goal is a thrilling experience, then it is educationally well worth while.

Music education as an enterprise in fuller living.--Dewey says that education is not a preparation for life. It is life itself.<sup>3</sup> Education is not so much concerned with giving the child something he will be able to use in later life as it is in providing him with a real life experience in the present. The child should not be preparing to be a musician, but he should be at his own level a child musician.

---

<sup>2</sup>Ibid., p. 364.

<sup>3</sup>John Dewey, Democracy and Education, p. 59.

Music education as an agency for creative democracy.--

Cooperation and service are the basis of democracy, and in no other school activity do we see a better example of democracy at work. In activities of this kind, the individual must think not only of himself, but of his relation to the whole group, an attitude which is necessary to good citizenship.

Educational Values in Instrumental Music

When measured by these aims as a yardstick, good instrumental music teaching should take on an added importance and responsibility in the educational structure. "Learning to play an instrument is essentially a voyage of discovery in music making."<sup>4</sup> The instrument then should be a gateway to countless joys in music, and the urge to master its technical difficulties a desire to enjoy the music which employs these technical problems. From the first, each lesson should be based on genuine enjoyment of interesting music. The mastering of an instrument comes through a will to learn and not through any imposed schedule of drill. The enthusiastic hard work that is being done throughout the country by school bands and orchestras is evidence that the instrumental program is creating this attitude.

Instrumental music certainly lives in the present. The increasing number of grade school bands and orchestras that play as organizations from the beginning attest the truth of that statement.

---

<sup>4</sup>Mursell and Glenn, Ibid., p. 302



### Who Should be Given Instrumental Instruction?

The best answer to that question is: all who wish it and who can profit by it. A program which attempted to provide instrumental instruction for everyone would be extravagant and impractical. The school and the music educator faces a genuine problem which must be approached intelligently.

There should be a place in some phase of music study for every human being, and it is one of the school's responsibilities to help each student discover himself in music. It is the investigator's conviction that no student should be denied an opportunity to pursue any phase of music for which he has a genuine interest if it is at all possible to provide it.

### The Foundation of the Instrumental Program

The proper background of approach to the study of instrumental music in the public school is by way of properly directed vocal experience. Many real problems in the teaching of a musical instrument could be solved more easily in vocal classes.

The feeling for phrases seems to be a real barrier to the instrumental students who are struggling with the mechanical problems of an instrument, and who are most likely to read note for note. In vocal classes this is not such a serious problem, for through rote experience and a well-directed program of phrase study, and with the help of the text, a

phrase-wise approach is built up that can be carried over into the instrumental class.<sup>5</sup>

An instrumental instructor who did not find it necessary to struggle with rhythmic troubles would have a great advantage. To build rhythm thoroughly we must start with large bodily movement. The vocal work from the primary grades provides this in rhythmic and singing games. If a program along eurythmic lines is carried through the lower grades, by the time a student is ready for instrumental work he should have developed a keen feeling for the rhythmic structure of music. The rhythm of phrases is more closely associated with the voice. The analysis of song form, the scansion of the poetry of music, the bodily movement to the rhythm of the phrase give to the student a rhythmic sense that no amount of counting and foot-tapping can do.

The vocal student comes to the instrumental class with some knowledge of the mechanics of the score. This is a tremendous help at a time when the student is likely to be burdened with the mechanics of manipulating a new instrument. This alone would be a great economy in a program which at best is expensive.

#### Psychological Influences

Of much importance to an instrumental program in the schools is a knowledge of the psychological development of the child. Each phase of the development of the child may

---

<sup>5</sup>Ibid., p. 308.

be benefitted by some form of instrumental work. A well planned program should be adapted to the capabilities of the normal developing child.<sup>6</sup>

The sensory period.--This period of development extends from infancy to about third grade age. It is a period of rapid physical growth in which the child is lacking in delicate physical and mental coordination. He is interested in concrete objects and experiences, in activity rather than goals to be attained. It is an age of imitation, observation and imagination. At this time the ear is easily trained and much attention should be paid to this important phase of the child's musical education. Rhythmic movement is a source of great pleasure and here should begin the development of the capacity for rhythmic response. Rhythm games, eurythmics, folk dances, and other physical accompaniments to music, will prove valuable to the instrumental program. The motor senses develop very rapidly. Seashore states that the fundamental capacities are early developed to their maximum.<sup>7</sup> It has been noted that during this period little children adapt themselves easily to rhythm instruments, and take great joy in rhythm orchestras.

The associative period.-- This stage of development is

---

<sup>6</sup>M. Letitia, "Instrumental Music in the Psychological Development of the Child," Music Educators National Conference Yearbook for 1935, p. 238.

<sup>7</sup>Carl E. Seashore, Psychology of Music, pp. 2-5.

ably described in the following quotation:

The associative or drill period is distinguished by comparatively slow physical growth. . . .The finer adjustments and coordinations of the body and of the mind are now accomplished with greater ease; physical feats requiring dexterity and skill are easily performed. There is a great endurance, strong vitality, and excellent resistance to mental fatigue. Memory is quick, sure, and lasting. Never again will there be more susceptibility to drill and discipline. There is interest in the product of activity and no longer in the activity for its own sake. The child is associating the experiences gained through sense development and is classifying them into usable related groups.<sup>8</sup>

This is the time for beginning the study of instruments. "It is the time for independent sight reading, interpretation and formal drill, never to be so potential, so rich in possibilities as now."<sup>9</sup> The child will acquire with ease at this period technical skill which will serve him well through the adolescent period. He has a spirit of teamwork, and through working with others he learns that habits of loyalty, obedience, and unselfishness serve him well.

The adolescent period.--This period begins at junior high school age and continues on through high school. It marks the change from childhood into maturity, and is accompanied by great changes mentally and physically. It is a period of rapid physical growth and an inclination to mental and physical indolence. The adolescent is dominated by

---

<sup>8</sup>Horatio Parker and others, Teacher's Manual, Vol. II, of The Progressive Music Series, p. 4.

<sup>9</sup>M. Letitia, *ibid.*, p. 240.

emotions, and he possesses strong social, moral and religious convictions. At this time the student is struggling to find himself, and he needs strong leadership and sympathetic understanding. It is not a time for drill, but rather the playing of much music of a fine type. Since he is growing physically, many instruments that up until now were physically beyond him, are now within his reach. It is a good time for experimenting with various instruments to find out which one he wants to devote his energies to mastering.

## CHAPTER III

### SELECTION FACTORS

#### Traits of the Instrumentalist

What are the necessary traits that make a successful instrumentalist? Rohner answers the question in this way:

Briefly, they are five: (1) the sensory traits of pitch, intensity, etc., (2) the motor traits of coordination, and to a large extent rhythm, (3) the intellectual traits, the ability to learn, imagination, etc., (4) the character traits of persistence, drive, stick-to-itiveness, and (5) the physiological traits, shape of teeth, size of lips, fingers, hands, etc., peculiarly desirable for each of the instruments. The better one is equipped with each of these traits, the greater is the potentiality for success in playing an instrument.<sup>10</sup>

These traits integrate with each other and tend to work together as a whole; therefore it is difficult to assign a given value to each trait. What a good instrumentalist lacks in one trait may be more than offset by another in which he is particularly strong.

Some educators place great stress on the sensory traits and base their selection of instrumental students on tests which attempt to measure innate sensory capacity.<sup>11</sup> Others consider that the intellectual traits are the most important consideration and select their students from intelligence

---

<sup>10</sup>Traugott Rohner, "How Can We Measure Musicality," The School Musician, May 1937, p. 18.

<sup>11</sup>Hazel M. Stanton, "Prognosis of Musical Achievement," Psychological Monographs, Vol. XXXIX, No. 2, (1928), pp. 135-44

tests.<sup>12</sup> Still others insist that the only basis for successful selection is that of physiological adaptation.

A study of some of these selection devices will follow.

### Music Capacity Tests

#### The Seashore Measures of Musical Talent

The Seashore Measures of Musical Talent is one of the oldest batteries of music tests. It is made up of a series of six tests given by means of a phonograph.

The sense of pitch.--This consists of one hundred pairs of tones of different pitch. The subject is asked to state whether the second tone is higher or lower than the first tone.

The intensity discrimination.--This is made up of one hundred pairs of tones in which one tone is louder than the other. The subject is asked to tell whether the second tone is louder or softer than the first.

The sense of time.--This is composed of one hundred pairs of time intervals represented by clicks, the subject being required to state whether the second time interval is longer or shorter than the first.

The sense of consonance.--This consists of fifty

---

<sup>12</sup>Travis B. Shaw, "Modern Trends in the Organization and Direction of Public School Bands," The School Musician, January, 1937, p. 14.

comparisons between two tone clangs, the subject to decide whether the second is better or worse than the first in regard to smoothness and beauty of tone.

Tonal memory.--Two sets of unrelated tones are heard, one tone in the second set being changed, the subject being asked to identify the changed tone.

Sense of rhythm.--This consists of fifty comparisons of rhythm patterns. Two pairs of rhythm patterns are heard and the subject is asked to tell whether the second pattern is the same or different from the first.

#### Educational Significance of the Seashore Tests

There has been considerable difference of opinion as to the reliability of the Seashore tests. Probably the most extensive study of reliability has been reported by Larson.<sup>13</sup> Twelve hundred students selected at random from the fifth, sixth, seventh, and eighth grades of the public schools of Lincoln, Nebraska, and Iowa City, Iowa, were used for this experiment. From these results the investigator concluded that the tests were reliable enough to warrant their use as a means of measuring musical capacity.

Stanton made a study of validity of the Seashore Measures at the Eastman School of Music over a period of four years. As a result of this investigation, in 1924 the

---

<sup>13</sup>Ruth Crewdson Larson, "Studies on Seashore's 'Measures of Musical Talent'," University of Iowa Studies, Vol. II, No. 6, (1930) pp. 16-33.



faculty voted unanimously that only students with a passing grade on the Seashore tests be permitted to enroll at the school.<sup>14</sup>

Regarding its use Seashore makes this statement:

I have always protested against the use of an average of these six measures, or any other number of the same kind, and have insisted upon the principle of a profile in which each specific measure stands on its own. Again for the same reason I have insisted that even the most superficial rating for selection or placement in musical training or adjustment should be based upon a careful case history and a reliable audition with the profile of measurements in hand. That has always been the procedure in the Eastman School. The experimenter works in the attitude of a physician who takes note of blood pressure, heart action and metabolism.<sup>15</sup>

#### The Kwalwasser-Dykema Music Tests

These tests are much more recent and are made in a battery of ten to be given by means of the phonograph.

Tonal memory test.--This test is made up of twenty-five pairs of tonal patterns in which the subject tells whether the pairs are alike or different.

Quality discrimination.--Thirty groups are given, in which a theme is played twice either by the same instrument or by a different one, the subject being asked if the tone quality is the same or different.

Intensity discrimination.--Thirty pairs of tones or

---

<sup>14</sup>Hazel M. Stanton, *ibid.*

<sup>15</sup>Carl E. Seashore, "The Psychology of Music," Music Educators Journal, December, 1937, pp. 25-26.

chords which differ in intensity are given, the subject stating whether the second is louder or softer than the first.

Tonal movement.--This is composed of thirty four-tone patterns to completed by a fifth tone, the subject to decide whether the fifth tone should be higher or lower than the fourth.

Time discrimination.--Twenty-five groups of three tones each are heard, the first and third being equal in length and the second being equal or different, the subject to state whether the second tone is equal or different in length.

Rhythmic discrimination.--Twenty-five pairs of rhythm patterns are played, the subject to decide whether they are the same or different.

Pitch discrimination.--Forty items are given in which a tone is sustained for three seconds with the pitch changing or remaining constant, the subject deciding whether it has changed or remained the same.

Melodic taste.--This test is made up of ten phrases played twice, each with a different ending, the subject to judge which is the more musical ending.

Pitch imagery.--Twenty-five tonal patterns are given in notation, the subject to tell if they are the same or different from the way they are played on the phonograph.

Rhythm imagery.--Twenty-five rhythm patterns are given in notation, the subject to tell if they are the same or different from those played on the phonograph.

#### Educational Significance of the Tests

Whitley has made probably the best report on the Kwalwasser-Dykema tests. This investigation shows that the Kwalwasser-Dykema tests are shorter, less fatiguing and more interesting because they are more varied and they use actual musical material. The reliability of these tests is found to be lower than the Seashore, due probably to the brevity of each test.<sup>16</sup>

Burns questions the predictive value of both the Kwalwasser-Dykema and the Seashore tests. In this investigation both tests were given to two hundred children in grades four to six. In correlating these tests with actual achievements of the children, he found an error of about thirty per cent regarding prediction. Thirty per cent of those who rated high in the tests failed in classes and thirty per cent of those who failed the tests were successful in instrumental classes.<sup>17</sup>

There is much chance for error here, however, for other influences, such as will-to-work, physiological adaptation,

---

<sup>16</sup>Mary T. Whitley, "A Comparison of the Seashore and the Kwalwasser-Dykema Music Tests," Teachers College Record, XXXIII, (May, 1937) p. 731.

<sup>17</sup>Samuel T. Burns, "Value of Prognostic Tests for Instrumental Pupils," School Music, XXXI (March, 1931), pp. 6-9.

and working conditions were not considered. Burns did find the tests valuable in interesting children and parents in instrumental study. He concluded that these tests are valuable for selection but that they are not reliable for elimination.

Apparently the error commonly made in employing the tests is in using them for something for which they were not intended. The authors of such tests clearly state that they are not intended to be used as a means of selecting or rejecting candidates for the study of music. At best, they can throw some light on the subject's innate capacity to take advantage of musical opportunity.

#### The McCreery Rhythm and Pitch Test

This test is representative of a number of simple musical capacity being sponsored by instrument dealers and manufacturers. It is very brief, being composed of but two parts.

Rhythm recognition.--Ten pairs of two-measure rhythm patterns are to be tapped with a drum stick, the subject to decide whether they are the same or different.

Pitch recognition.--This test is to be played on the piano. The first part is made up of eight pairs of tonal patterns, the subject to decide whether they are the same or different. The second part is made up of eight pairs of tonal patterns, the subject to tell whether the second pair is higher or lower than the first. The third part is made up of eight pairs of melodies of from two to four measures in

length, the subject to decide whether the second melody is the same or different from the first. The fourth part consists of eight pairs of chords, the subject to say whether they are the same or different. The fifth part consists of eight pairs of chords which are unlike, the subject to judge whether the second chord is higher or lower than the first.<sup>18</sup>

The test must be of low reliability, in the opinion of the investigator, being too brief. Since the rhythm and tonal patterns must be played by the administrator of the test, this admits other possibilities of error. However, it is intended only as a dragnet and as a psychological means of encouraging students and parents. It requires only twenty-five minutes to administer and no technical knowledge of giving or interpreting tests is necessary. Its value for diagnosis is questionable.

#### Intelligence Tests

Mursell states that "we may properly take the position that musicality functionally understood as successful dealing with music does in fact exhibit a fairly close relationship with general intelligence."<sup>19</sup>

With this idea in mind some school base their selection of instrumental students on intelligence tests.<sup>20</sup>

---

<sup>18</sup>C. L. McCreery, Rhythm and Pitch Test,

<sup>19</sup>James L. Mursell, "Intelligence and Musicality," Education, LIX, (May, 1939), pp. 559-568

<sup>20</sup>Shaw, *ibid.*

As a rule good musicianship and high intelligence go hand in hand but if we are to deny the ". . . academically inferior but musically talented students the opportunity to study instrumental music are we not committing a grave injustice to society as well as to the individuals concerned?"<sup>21</sup>

Lamp reports that "a combination of scores on pitch discrimination, tonal memory, and the Terman group intelligence test is found to predict performance on brass horns sufficiently well to be of some assistance in guidance."<sup>22</sup>

Undoubtedly a knowledge of a student's intelligence quotient can be of help in the consideration of what we may expect from a prospective student.

#### Academic Grades

The question of whether academic grades should be taken into consideration is not a simple one to answer. Poor academic grades may reveal many things. They may mean low intellect, and in that case the student may be handicapped in instrumental music work as well as in academic subjects. If this is true, we must rely on a thorough study of other characteristics to estimate his chances of success. Poor grades may mean a poor adjustment to the academic curriculum. Perhaps band work is just what the student needs. There should

---

<sup>21</sup>Lawrence W. Chidester, "Something More About Modern Bands," School Musician, February, 1937, p. 22.

<sup>22</sup>Charles J. Lamp, The Determination of Aptitude for Specific Instruments, p. 75.

be no reason to deny him band or orchestral opportunity because he has failed to take advantage of an opportunity in an unrelated field. In the experience of the author, many times the study of instrumental music has changed the entire school outlook of a student.

### Vocal Music Records

A poor record in vocal music may not be an indication that a student would be unsuccessful in instrumental music but it would be reason enough to raise a question. Sometimes the will to achieve is so strong that almost insurmountable difficulties are overcome. Several instances are reported by colleagues, supporting the author's own experience, in which students who were classified as "non-singers" acquired an ability to sing after successful instrumental study.

The vocal teacher can supplement the testing with observations that will make it more intelligible. Information concerning habits of work, of citizenship, and of home influence, and a knowledge of the student's temperament will make a valuable contribution to an understanding of the student.

### Tests of Temperament

Various attempts have been made, mainly in America to measure temperamental and moral traits by means of standardized tests. Perhaps the most widely used of such tests are those devised by Downey, which include a number of exercises in handwriting. The subject is required to write at his ordinary speed, then as quickly as he can, then as slowly as he can, then to change the style of his writing as much as possible, and so on. The tests are alleged to indicate such characteristics as carefulness,

decisiveness and persistence; but the results obtained with them by various investigators, both in America and in Britain, have been somewhat disappointing.<sup>23</sup>

Some teachers have a knack of analyzing traits of temperament that others never seem to acquire. Observation over a period of several months should give the teacher a good insight into the temperament of the student. Here, again, the vocal teacher should be of material assistance to the instrumentalist.

### Manual Dexterity

Common sense suggests that there is a group factor of dexterity; that people who are neat fingered in one particular kind of manual work tend to be neat fingered in general. So far however, the verdict of common sense has not been confirmed by the results of scientific inquiry. . . .A test that will reveal the capacity required for one activity will not detect the capacity required for another.<sup>24</sup>

There are several tests of motor response such as the Minnesota Tests.<sup>25</sup> These require special laboratory equipment, much of which is expensive. They also require specialized skill in testing and interpreting. There are no indications as yet that they are valid.

A simple, common-sense way to estimate manual dexterity and motor response is through careful observation during the study of preparatory instruments and during the laboratory

---

<sup>23</sup>Angus Macrae, Talents and Temperaments, pp. 89-90.

<sup>24</sup>Ibid., p. 70.

<sup>25</sup>Donald G. Patterson and others, Minnesota Mechanical Ability Tests, pp. 41-85.



exposure. Although not objective, the probability of accuracy of these suggested methods is greater.

### Preparatory Instruments

The use of preparatory instruments in the grade schools has reached considerable proportions during the past five years. The Texas State Department of Education makes this statement concerning them:

In keeping with the modern trend in instrumental music, it is recommended that those children who show any inclination toward this field be given instrumental instruction as early as possible. The rhythm bands and toy symphonies in the lower grades are highly desirable and should be followed by an exploratory course in instrumental music with an inexpensive instrument such as the Saxette. The Saxette course provides an ideal method of teaching the rudiments of music and offers parents a positive way of discovering whether he will take the interest in music that would warrant a later investment for some instrument suitable to his likes and needs.<sup>26</sup>

These instruments are sometimes called "pre-band" or "pre-orchestra" instruments. In reality they are not "pre-band," "pre-orchestra," or "pre-anything." They are instruments which justify their inclusion in the music program because of the musical satisfaction which they provide. They help to bridge the gap between the rhythm bands of the primary grades and the instrumental classes of the fifth grade, but they are as much an aid to the vocal program as to the instrumental. They focus attention upon pitch discrimination,

---

<sup>26</sup>Texas State Department of Education, The Teaching of Music in Texas Public Schools, Vol. XIII, No. 10, p. 36.

recognition of rhythmic patterns, melodic phrasing, elementary theory, part singing and playing.<sup>27</sup>

The use of these instruments is definitely limited when under the direction of a teacher who does not understand their technique or purpose in the music education program. Emphasis must be placed on correct tone production, good tone quality, and independent reading.

Under expert attention this class may become a laboratory for the observation of musical skills. Character traits such as persistence, drive, enthusiasm, and willingness to cooperate,--all traits which can not be measured by any test yet devised--may be carefully observed over a period of several months. Qualities of temperament sometimes elusive of analysis may be studied. Physical characteristics, grace and precision of movement, finger dexterity, tongue response, may be measured. Not forgetting a most important consideration, home influence usually manifests itself during an exposure of this kind.

Chidester and Small have made a recent study of preparatory instruments which may lead to improvements in their design. They subjected them to rigid scientific laboratory tests to determine their effectiveness from a standpoint of intonation, dynamic range, tone quality and ease in blowing. From their reports it would seem that the most effective

---

<sup>27</sup>Lawrence W. Chidester and Arnold M. Small, "The Preparatory Instruments," Music Educators Journal, March, 1940, p. 23-24.

instrument on the market today is the Recorder, a foreign made instrument which is substantially more expensive than the others tested. Slightly less effective but still practical from a utilitarian as well as from an economical standpoint, are three American-made instruments, the Saxette, Tonette, and Clarolet. From the standpoint of dynamic range they were rated in order, the Clarolet, the Saxette, and the Tonette. From the standpoint of ease in effective tone production they were rated in order, the Tonette, the Saxette and the Clarolet.<sup>28</sup>

These instruments are distinctly democratic, being so simple and inexpensive that they are easily within the reach of all. The school could make them available at no expense or for a very small rental fee, to a large number of students by procuring extra mouthpieces and using one set in a number of classes.

By the time a student has completed this course, the instructor should be ready to recommend an instrument of particular type or the pursuit of some other phase of music. The student should have reached a decision as to whether he wanted to continue his study with a band or orchestral instrument and with the advice of the instructor should have decided what instrument he should study. Both parent and student should be convinced as to the student's ability to the extent that they feel safe in making an investment in further study.

---

<sup>28</sup>Ibid.

### Adaptation

Before a student begins the study of a musical instrument there are two things that should be carefully considered. Does the student have sufficient musical and intellectual capacity to profit from the expenditure of time which it will require? Is the instrument which he is to study adaptable to his physical, mental and emotional make-up?

With a profile chart at hand indicating intelligence rating, musical capacity, personality analysis, vocal music records, and records of preparatory instrument study, the instructor should be able to intelligently attack the problem of adaptation to a specific instrument.

In the section that is to follow, the investigator expects to draw from many sources, to develop a picture of what the ideal prospect for each instrument should be, physically, mentally and musically. A few points are included which may help to "sell" the instrument to the parent or student. Outlines of this nature have been criticized because they are not based on scientific methods of research. For the most part these studies seem to elude scientific methods of research. Until such time as scientific principles may be evolved, the investigator will continue to attack the problem with all the information available through the teaching experiences of the profession.

One of the most important considerations and the least obvious is that of temperament. Many students begin the study of instruments which will never offer them a very great degree

of satisfaction because they are by temperament unsuited to this type of instrument.

The deliberate, slow-moving type of individual will be handicapped unless he is understood and treated as such. He should not be given an instrument which plays rapidly moving parts. His normal rate of motion will be inadequate, and in this situation he will appear to be abnormally dull-witted. Working on an instrument that requires a rapid response will not increase his speed, but will make him self-conscious and less confident of his ability. He would be more at home with an instrument which does not demand a rapid technique, such as the oboe, the bassoon, the string bass or tuba, perhaps even the cello or trombone.

The quick-moving, restless child will not be satisfied with an instrument which moves slowly. He needs something which will challenge him and keep him busy, such as the piccolo, the flute, the violin, the clarinet, the drum, and to some extent the cornet.

A student who shows signs of having a lack of ambition and cooperative spirit would probably do better work if he studied an instrument which would afford him some competition. In a large section such as the clarinets or cornets in the band, or the violin or cellos in the orchestra, the ambitious set the pace and the lazy student soon finds that if he is to maintain his position he must exert some energy. In a small section such as the oboes, bassoons, bass clarinets or baritone, there is little competition and much responsibility.

A good leader in other activities usually makes a good cornet or violin player providing other qualifications are present. Usually the "rough and ready" type of boy will enjoy the trombone because of the boisterous parts assigned to it. An ambitious student with a good musical capacity should like one of the more unusual instruments such as the bassoon or oboe, which will challenge them and in which their efforts may be easily recognized. Students who like to sing the inside parts in vocal music usually make good horn or viola players. The student who is interested primarily in melody will enjoy the flute or violin.

"To a certain extent the type of company, both social and musical which the child will keep in later years is influenced by the instrument he selects to play."<sup>29</sup> Whether or not a student plays after leaving school except as a profession, is determined largely by two factors. Will he have sufficient leisure time to devote to music, and will he have the opportunity to play? Few people play by themselves, so if the student expects to make music after school days are over, he should choose an instrument which has ensemble possibilities. In the past few years, thousands of amateur bands and orchestras have come into being all over the country. Because this opportunity is not always available, and because there are fewer obstacles to gathering in smaller groups, an instrument suitable for small ensembles will afford more opportunity for

---

<sup>29</sup>M. Emmett Wilson, "What Instrument For Your Child?" The Parents Magazine, Vol. XII, (March, 1937), p. 28.

playing. Certain instruments lend themselves more readily to small ensembles, and the literature available at the present time further limits them.

The strings, perhaps, have the greatest amount of literature available, and since a combination of strings is easily adapted to any situation, the string ensemble is the most common. Everywhere, adult string groups meet regularly to play trios, quartets, and quintets from the masters. The strings are somewhat less exacting in their demands of practice time to keep in condition, if the individual is satisfied to play for his own enjoyment. Any member of the string family is at home in any orchestral combination, however small or for whatever purpose.

In this respect the woodwinds are next in usefulness, especially the flute and the clarinet. There is an increasing amount of interesting music written for the woodwind ensemble. The woodwinds are at home in either band or orchestra.

The brass instruments form an important part of the band but in the orchestra their number is limited and as an ensemble there are not so many possibilities. There is an increasing amount of literature being written for the brass ensemble but the nature of the instruments makes them less adaptable for every situation.

The violin.--This is the most useful instrument of the string section, since it has so many possibilities for

combination with other instruments. Early association with the violin is very important in order to develop the fine coordination between fingers and ear that makes a good violinist. Most authorities agree that for class study the fourth grade is early enough. Unless provision is made for grade school orchestras, there is little need of beginning the classes before the fifth grade. Without the stimulus of regular orchestra work the class has a tendency to lag after two years of study. A student with a love of music and a background of musical tradition in the family is a good subject. A year or so of piano study would be a decided advantage but should not be considered necessary. The student should be mentally alert and should possess keen pitch discrimination and rhythmic feeling.

As to the matter of fingers, there is some disagreement. Lamp reports that his investigations reveal little correlation between finger taper and string performance.<sup>30</sup> However, ten violin instructors of outstanding success, when questioned, unanimously expressed the belief that the hand should be of fairly good size with rather long slender fingers, and that a student with broad finger tips worked under a decided disadvantage. The little finger of the left hand should be straight and must reach at least to the first joint of the fourth finger. The arms should be at least of average length, although this can be adjusted to a great extent by selecting

---

<sup>30</sup>Lamp, *ibid.*, p. 72.



the correct size violin. Children of the same age vary so much in size and arm and finger length that great care should be observed in getting the right size.

The viola.--"The viola should be furnished by the school and 'planted' judiciously."<sup>31</sup> The instrument requires long arms and a broad span of hands and fingers and for this reason is rarely adaptable for grade school pupils. Berlioz advises against using undersized violas because of their false resonance.<sup>32</sup> The practice of restringing violins so that they may be tuned like a viola hardly seems to be worthwhile. The tone quality is never good, and results equal to these could be obtained by using third violins in the orchestra. For this reason it would seem advisable that the school own the instruments and that students be transferred from the violin. In this way players may be developed more rapidly. Music for this instrument is confined largely to inner parts, and good musicians with a liking for harmonic parts should enjoy it. Since the orchestral parts are not always interesting, an opportunity to play solos, or work with a string quartet helps greatly to maintain interest.

The cello.--This instrument is next to the violin in importance in the string section, and, like the violin, it has many possibilities in combination with other instruments.

---

<sup>31</sup>George J. Abbott, Instrumental Music in the Public Schools, p. 4.

<sup>32</sup>Hector Berlioz, Modern Instrumentation, p. 28.

It is a fine solo instrument for which much good literature has been written. Few organizations ever have enough good cellists, and for that reason a musician of moderate ability should find a place in the orchestra with the cello. Piano or violin experience is an advantage, the pianist having already learned the bass idiom, and the violinist seeming to carry over a certain amount of string ability. The cello student needs a good sense of pitch, rhythm and harmony. A musician who enjoys a legato type of music would be attracted to the cello. The prospect should have a fairly large left hand, a good finger span and strong fingers. In the experience of the investigator, girls are at no disadvantage in playing the cello. The instrument is bulky, although not heavy, and a student of at least average size would be able to handle it easier than a small child. Cellos of three-quarter or half size are available for very young students. Some instructors object to them because their use makes necessary a later adjustment when they are ready for the full size, but this should be no more a stumbling block than the change from small to large violins. To insure a good cello section for the orchestra, the school should own at least part of the cellos.

The Double Bass.---The double bass as an orchestral instrument is not difficult to master if the student is adapted to it. Obviously not many grade school students are physically able to manipulate even a small size string bass. Players on

these instruments must therefore be developed after they reach junior high school. Since the instrument is bulky and rarely used as a solo instrument, few school students will be interested in owning one. The school usually furnishes the basses and must develop players quickly for the orchestra. For this reason, musical experience is at a premium; pianists are likely material for transfer, because they are already familiar with the bass clef and bass parts.

The problem of moving it makes the string bass more practical for boys, although girls make good performers. The prospect should have good pitch discrimination, especially in the lower range. He should have fairly long fingers and a wide, strong hand. He should be rather tall and robust with long arms. A student of slow, steady, controlled temperament seems to fit the instrument.

The flute.--The flute is an instrument that is adapted to every medium of playing--solo, ensemble, band, orchestra, home or church. It is a melodic instrument which is often asked to play rapid passages, consequently a quick thinker is needed. It is dignified and worthy of the most musical student. "It has a fine, beautiful, melodious richness of tone that eventually seems to be reflected in the character of its players."<sup>33</sup> The prospective student should have good rhythmic and pitch sense. The fingers should be long enough

---

<sup>33</sup>Frank L. Reed, "Advantages of Flute Study to Grade School Music Students," The Baton, April-May, 1940, p. 7.

to reach all of the keys without pulling the left hand out of position. An ability to whistle is usually an indication that the child can produce a tone on the flute. Lips that are subject to cracking and chafing sometimes are a handicap. Lips should be firm and smooth without scars, dips or recessions. A protruding lower jaw will interfere to some extent. Good lung development is needed but this will develop with study. Some instructors recommend clarinet study before the flute, but the investigator has found that in some instances this is a disadvantage because the firm embouchure developed in playing the clarinet is difficult to adapt to tone production on the flute. Special care must be exercised in developing a correct embouchure and assistance outside the beginning ensemble may be necessary. The flute because of its musicianly nature, and because it is small and easy to carry, is an ideal instrument for girls.

The piccolo.--In most respects the piccolo should be treated as the flute. Being smaller and more difficult to play with good tone quality it probably should be undertaken only by the flute player. Eventually both instruments should be mastered and it is much easier to approach the piccolo through the flute.

The clarinet.--This is an ideal instrument for a great many grade school boys and girls. The modern band uses more clarinets than any other instrument and the orchestra uses

from two to four clarinets. It is also useful in many small combinations. The development of the modern clarinet has been influenced greatly by the demands of small school students. Now, a child of average arm and finger length can easily manipulate the instrument. Many students not well suited to any other of the winds can play the clarinet. The first clarinet parts are rather florid and quick thinkers are needed for them, but most of the lower parts written for school organizations are not so rapid. In selecting the clarinet player, the mouth formation should be checked carefully. A receding lower jaw is no disadvantage if it is not too much so. The lower lip should be ample enough to cushion the reed. The lower front teeth must not have sharp points that will lacerate the lips. The prospect should be able to control the muscles in the corners of the mouth to prevent air from escaping or cheeks from puffing out. The finger tips should be padded enough to cover well the holes on the instrument. Students should have excellent rhythmic ability, and good pitch discrimination is important because of the great difference in pitch that can be made merely by manipulating the embouchure. Large classes of clarinet beginners should be encouraged so that transfers may be made from this instrument to the saxophone, the oboe, the English horn, and the alto and bass clarinets.

Alto and bass clarinets.--These instruments are so similar to the clarinet that transfers are easily made. Saxophone

players also may transfer much of their training to these instruments. Since the parts are much more legato, a slow-moving student with a good sense of rhythm may profitably change to bass and alto clarinets.

The oboe and English horn.--These two are so similar that they will be treated together. The second oboe performer usually plays the English horn when it is needed. The oboe is not an instrument for young children and it is doubtful whether children below junior high school age should attempt it. This makes the rapid development of oboe players very important. Transfers from the clarinet or saxophone are recommended although the investigator has made successful transfer from piano and violin. Even temperament, patience and dependability are desirable qualities because the instrument and its reed are difficult to adjust and at times are exasperating. The chief difficulty is in tone production rather than finger manipulation so a good pitch discrimination is an asset. The reed problem is the most serious one because reeds are expensive and difficult to keep in adjustment. Most oboe players find it necessary to make their own reeds, an art which requires some mechanistic ability. The student should have fairly even teeth; the lips should be long enough to cover the teeth well; the reed is easier to control if the lower lip is fairly thick. The prospect should be able to compress his lips and blow air through a small opening in the front, keeping the sides

closed tightly. Most instructors find that girls are at no disadvantage; as a rule they are more discriminating in the matter of tone quality. Playing an oboe means long, hard work, but it has its rewards in recognition and opportunity.

The bassoon.--Since a fairly good-sized student is needed, it is not advisable to start a grade school student on the bassoon. Quick development is desirable and a transfer from another reed instrument is a good answer to the problem. Large hands with a wide span and long fingers with thick pads are needed to manipulate this instrument. The reed problem is serious and the player should learn to make his own reeds, consequently, some mechanistic ability is an asset. Good pitch discrimination in the lower range is needed. The slow-moving, easy-going boy will find his match in this droll instrument. Much literature is being written for the bassoon as solos and in combination with other instruments. A few years ago a bassoon was an oddity in the school band or orchestra; now it is considered a necessity.

The saxophone.--This instrument is the enigma of the instrumental program. Few concert orchestras have any place for them and many bands do not make use of them, but at the present time dance bands are built around them. Naturally many students are attracted to them. Since the dance band performer must also play the clarinet, and since the clarinet should be mastered first because of the smaller size mouthpiece which makes tone production more difficult, it

seems logical to begin on the clarinet and add the saxophone when it is needed. The investigator welcomes four discreet saxophones to his symphonic band of sixty players because he feels that they are valuable in blending reeds and brasses. Of the saxophone family, the alto is the most useful, the tenor being next in order. Leeson recommends eight saxophones for the band of fifty players. His instrumentation includes four altos, two tenors, one baritone and one bass.<sup>34</sup>

The saxophone prospect should be told that there are not at present many organizations open for him. The saxophone demands less physically and musically than most of the other instruments.<sup>35</sup> If the hands are not too small and the fingers too short, if the mouth is not too small or the lower teeth too rough, if the senses of pitch and rhythm are at least average, the student has a good chance of playing the saxophone well.

The cornet.--The cornet is the favorite of the band and there are always many students who have a burning desire to play this instrument who are not equipped to play it well. Sometimes their interest can be diverted to some other instrument but often there is nothing that can be said or done that will change their minds. This situation has its advantages because, of the group that begins, some who are not

---

<sup>34</sup>Cecil Leeson, The Saxophone Comes of Age, p. 14.

<sup>35</sup>Prescott and Chidester, *ibid.*, p. 33.



good prospects will succeed in spite of that, and those who do not are prospective transfers to baritone and tuba.

The fine cornet player must have a good sense of pitch, but the investigator has seen surprisingly good work done by students whom the vocal teacher called "non-singers." There has been much disagreement over the cornet player's lips. Lamp's report based on progress made by various types of individuals, reveals that lip texture rather than thickness, is the chief factor in tone production.<sup>36</sup> Firmness of flesh and the ability to make the muscles firm seem to be the chief consideration. All authorities seem to agree that unusual thickness, especially in the upper lip is a disadvantage. The muscles are located on the rim of the lip therefore the "red" of the lips should not protrude too much. The prospect should be able to manipulate the lip muscles and the tongue quickly and easily. A rapid repetition of the letters p, t, will reveal this ability or the lack of it. The lower jaw should not protrude or recede too much; the underslung jaw is likely to develop undue pressure on the upper teeth. Even, medium-sized teeth are desirable; irregular or protruding front teeth, especially where they come in contact with the mouthpiece, usually result in bruised, sore lips and make improbable endurance in playing. Revelli insists

---

<sup>36</sup>Lamp, *ibid.*, p. 69.

that a prospect be able to produce a good lip buzz with the cornet mouthpiece alone, before he is allowed to work with the instrument.<sup>37</sup>

Children with crippled hands or arms, unable to play any other instrument may play the cornet, providing they can manipulate well the first three fingers of the right hand. Girls have proved that they can play the cornet quite as well as boy.

The trumpet.--The trumpet is somewhat similar to the cornet but the physical problems involved in holding a longer, heavier instrument, and the increased resistance to tone production make it not so practical for younger students as the cornet.

The French horn.--Only a good musician and a hard worker will master the horn. It requires more than average musical capacity and perserverance. The student with a love for good music, who would be proud to play one of the less common instruments will attach himself to it.

There is much disagreement as to what age horn instruction may begin. Gutstein says that it may begin ". . .as soon as the player is able to hold the instrument without dropping it."<sup>38</sup> He states that many horn players have begun their

---

<sup>37</sup>William D. Revelli, "The Teaching of Brass Instruments," Etude, June, 1940, pp. 383.

<sup>38</sup>Herbert Gutstein, "The French Horn in the School Band and Orchestra," The Baton, February, 1937, p. 6.

work successfully at from eight to ten years of age. Newton recommends that the student become proficient on the cornet before transferring to the horn.<sup>39</sup> The investigator has found the progress of the average grade school horn player in class, so slow that the junior high school student with cornet experience in the grades soon out-distances him. The horn prospect must have an excellent pitch discrimination and a feeling for inner harmony parts. Much of the horn parts are rhythmic, so the prospect should have a good feeling for rhythm. A marked ability for sight singing is a good symptom.

The style of embouchure used will determine what type of mouth formation is desirable. The most widely used is the German embouchure in which the inner surfaces of the lips produce the tone. This is especially adaptable to the lower horn parts. Moderately thick lips are somewhat of an advantage to this style embouchure. Many horn players, especially in the schools, are employing a cornet embouchure. For this style embouchure, moderately thin lips are no handicap, but whether thick or thin the lips must be very mobile because the horn makes more use of the upper partials of the harmonic series and these are more difficult to control. Protruding front teeth will probably interfere with good tone production. Girls make good horn players and can acquire a dependable embouchure although they do not as a rule, develop so powerful a tone as boys.

---

<sup>39</sup>L. G. Newton and T. Campbell Young, The Book of the School Orchestra, p. 83.

The trombone.--The trombone is more closely related to vocalization than any of the other wind instruments. Its range is the same as the adult male voice and consequently is near to the singing experience. The parts assigned to it are often rugged and they appeal to the "rough and ready" type of boys. Because of its construction which makes possible all degrees of pitch, an excellent aural perception is essential. Trombone parts are often more rhythmic than melodic so the prospect should have at least a fair rhythmic ability. The arm length is often the deciding physical factor in the selection of the young player. The arms should be long enough to reach the seventh position. A large, strong hand that will enable him to hold the instrument properly is much more important at the beginning.

A slight receding jaw is an advantage. The front teeth should be fairly regular, although the large mouthpiece is more lenient in this respect than the small mouthpiece of the cornet or the horn. A fairly large mouth and ample lips are needed to develop a full tone. A large, strong boy is decidedly the best prospect, although sometimes a girl makes a good performer.

The baritone or euphonium.--These instruments are for use exclusively in the band and they should be assigned to students who are interested in the activities connected with the band. The prospect must be dependable because the section is small and important and the stimulus of competition

is lacking. He should have a fairly good sense of rhythm as well as pitch. Good physical build and lung development are assets. The teeth should be regular where they come in contact with the mouthpiece and the lips should be full in order to develop a rich tone. Cornet players who are having difficulty with tone production may be successful with this instrument if the teeth formation conforms to the mouthpiece requirements. The instrument is naturally one for boys although girls sometimes excel. It would be better not to attempt it until junior high school age unless the boy is particularly well-developed.

The tuba.--The tuba is not so much limited to adults as its size would indicate. The music world was amazed a few years ago to hear a boy of pre-school age play a giant sousaphone with remarkable fluency. By using a stand which entirely supports the weight of the instrument, younger students can play the sousaphone successfully. This instrument is another possibility for transfer of surplus cornet students who may have tone production difficulties. The mouthpiece is large but easy to "lip", and many students whose teeth or lips are unsuited for smaller brass instruments may play the tuba. Biddle reports that girls make good tuba players even to the extent of marching with the band.<sup>40</sup>

The ideal bass prospect is one of good physique with

---

<sup>40</sup>Mark Biddle, "Do Girls Make Good Bass Players?" School Musician, January, 1940, p. 18.

ample lung development. A large mouth with full lips makes possible a full powerful tone. A pianist can transfer a knowledge of the bass clef to the new instrument. The slow, steady thinker will find this instrument more suited to his needs than any other brass instrument because the parts written for it move more slowly.

Percussion.--The belief still exists that if a student does not have enough musical capacity to play string or wind instruments that they may play drums. For this reason there are probably more students who discontinue the study of drums than any other instrument. The study of drums involves much hard, technical work with no melody except that played by other instruments when they play with the band.

The drummer must be able to play any of the percussion family and in order to play tympani he must have a good sense of pitch. Drumming in all forms requires a neatness of attack, a skillful manipulation instead of physical exertion, consequently, some of our best drummers are girls. The basic instrument of the percussion group is the snare drum, therefore this should be the beginning instrument. The prospect should have a quick muscular and mental reaction and should display ability to execute rhythmical beats. The pianist often makes a good drummer. Because of the high "mortality" rate for drum students, large numbers should be started in the fifth and sixth grades with drum sticks and practice pads. The class is easier to handle if they work

on practice pads, and many parents are saved the cost of a drum by waiting until the student shows some indication that he will be able to continue.

### Laboratory Exposure

The term as used in this treatise refers to the technique of placing the student in a situation in which he comes in contact with all of the instruments. This contact may be for a few minutes or it may be over a period of several days.

The student should have the opportunity to see and hear all of the instruments. By using an orchestra or band the prospect can hear the instruments in relation to the organization. Following this the prospect should be given a chance to handle and experiment with playing the instruments. In this way he can find out first hand what the instrument can do. The important thing is that the instructor can observe his contact with various instruments, and can explain to him their advantages. While he does this he may weigh minutely each factor--physical size, manual dexterity, tongue response, teeth formation, etc., with accurate testing of mouthpieces and arm and hand measurements needed for individual instruments.

During this exposure the instructor should endeavor to assist the student in finding the instrument which will afford him the greatest measure of success and satisfaction. It is very important that no student be "high-pressured" into selecting an instrument which has no appeal to him. If he

has his heart set on an instrument for which he apparently is not adapted, it would be better to let him try it. A six weeks course on a rental instrument will usually do one of two things. It may convince the student that he has the wrong instrument, in which case he is usually willing to allow the instructor to advise him. It may convince the instructor that he made the mistake instead of the student. The strongest factor in instrucional success is usually a genuine desire to learn to play the instrument.

#### The Exploratory Course

The exploratory course is the proving ground for testing the selection of instruments. The first six weeks will reveal many things. Weaknesses in physical adaptation soon make themselves evident to the instructor. Often the wisdom of a transfer to another instrument is clearly indicated. If the selection has been a wise one, that is even more evident.

The six weeks rental plan has operated in Tulsa, Oklahoma, for eight years and with such good results that approximately eighty per cent of the beginning students used the plan last year. Parents have been willing to invest in instruments at the end of the exploratory period, confident that most of the risk has been eliminated.

Because of financial limitations, the school system has been unable to finance the plan, The four music merchants of the city have cooperated splendidly with the program.



When the Board of Education can finance the initial expenditure, the program can be made self-supporting and at the same time less expensive for the student. This has been done successfully in many cities.

## CHAPTER IV

### GUIDANCE IMPLICATIONS

The following statements of the principles underlying guidance are made by Jones:

Guidance is founded upon the principle of the conservation of human life and human energy. . . . Guidance is based on the fact that human beings need help. . . . Guidance involves personal help that is designed to assist a person go somewhere or to do something.<sup>41</sup>

Seashore relates this to music in this very concise paragraph:

Modern organized efforts in the direction of occupational guidance of the young take three forms--education for general culture, vocational training and avocational training. The vocational guidance is of leading interest in the public mind--the problem of placing each youth in the occupation for which he is best fitted. But avocational guidance is coming to be recognized; first, because we are confronted seriously for the first time in the modern world with the problem of educating for leisure--how to spend spare time; and second, because in the arts we find the most marked exhibitions of talent or lack of talent, and the pursuit of arts is and should be far more of an avocational nature than vocational. This is particularly true of music. The real emphasis needs to be laid at the point of educational guidance whether it be for vocation or avocation. If the educational guidance is well done the other two will take care of themselves.<sup>42</sup>

Music as a professional career is limited to four fields --the concert artist, the conductor, the teacher, and the composer. The musical capacity required for each of these

---

<sup>41</sup>Arthur J. Jones, Principles of Guidance, p. 3.

<sup>42</sup>Seashore, Psychology of Music, p. 286.

fields varies greatly and the educational preparation is very different. Guidance toward them is of great importance because there is involved expensive preparation, the expenditure of much time, and success or failure. Since those who choose these professions make up but one per cent of the number who study music, from the viewpoint of public education it is relatively unimportant. Guidance in the public schools is concerned more with appreciation of music and the pleasure of self-expression.

Seashore states the educational objective underlying scientific guidance in this way:

It is the function of the educator to keep each child busy at his highest natural level for successful achievement in the field for which he has reasonable aptitude and in which he will find a reasonable outlet for self-expression, in order that he may be happy, useful and good.<sup>43</sup>

Educational guidance in music should be based on measurement of musical capacity. It should consider many things such as intelligence, family background, determination to achieve, economic conditions, health and physical development, vocational aims, temperament, habits of industry, motor response, and history of past musical opportunities. Measurements must be analyzed in the light of, and supplemented by, all pertinent information. It should be progressive, beginning with the earliest musical experience, each step in the development pointing the way to the next.

---

<sup>43</sup>Ibid., p. 293.

The program of musical guidance will serve society well by guiding the student to his highest level of self-expression and successful achievement.

## CHAPTER V

### SUMMARY AND RECOMMENDATIONS

The profile chart offers the most scientific method of approach to the problem. The instructor, taking into consideration the evidences of musical and intellectual capacity, the physical, mental and emotional factors, the observations of previous musical experience, and the desires of the parent and child should be able to intelligently advise the student in the selection of an instrument. The chart should be cumulative and should influence the direction of each step in the musical education of the child.

The Kwalwasser-Dykema tests offer the best means of testing innate capacity because they are more interesting, less fatiguing to the students and are more easily administered. The results of these tests will be important in discovering and in encouraging students to enroll in a preparatory instrument course.

The Otis "Self-Administering Tests of Mental Ability", now a part of the testing program of the Tulsa school system, should be used as additional information for the profile chart.

Academic grades are not valid as a means of selecting instrumental students.

The vocal music record should prove helpful as a means of checking the musical capacity tests.

Reliable tests of temperament are not available but personal analysis by the vocal teacher and the instructor in instrumental music should prove valuable.

The Saxette course is not only a satisfying musical experience but it affords the instructor an excellent opportunity to observe rhythmic sense, finger dexterity, and tongue manipulation. It is a splendid means of encouraging students to continue instrumental study.

The laboratory method of adaptation provides an accurate means of physical check and enables the child and the parent to become more familiar with the instruments before the selection is made.

The fifth year is the logical time for the beginning of class and ensemble work. Younger students are often successful with private lessons but before this time class lessons seem to be impractical. Because of physical and musical limitations, class work in the fifth grade should be limited for the most part to four fundamental instruments, the violin, clarinet, cornet and drums. Exceptions may be made when conditions seem to justify it. Flutes, trombones, baritones and sometimes horns, tubas and cellos may be added in the sixth grade. At the beginning of junior high school, if selections are carefully made, any of the band or orchestral instruments may be safely undertaken.

An exploratory six weeks course is an additional check and will reassure parent, student and instructor. The ideal

situation would be one in which the school owned the instruments and loaned or rented them to the student. The rental plan in cooperation with local merchants has proved satisfactory. At the end of this period, one of three steps should be indicated. The student might safely invest in the instrument and continue; a further experiment should be made with a different instrument; the student should enroll for some other music course.

The problem of adjustment should be constantly before the instructor. Physical and musical limitations make themselves apparent; surplus cornet, clarinet and violin students in the grade school must be transferred to other instruments in the junior high school. As old or inadequate instruments are replaced, transfers to a more needed or more adaptable instrument may be effected.

#### Recommendations

1. A music profile chart should be adopted for all students beginning with the fourth grade.
2. Administer parts of the Kwalwasser-Dykema tests at the end of the first semester of the fourth grade. These tests to include (1) Tonal memory, (2) Rhythm discrimination, (3) Pitch discrimination, (4) Pitch imagery, (5) Rhythm imagery.
3. Saxette classes should be offered at the beginning of the second semester of the fourth grade.
4. Students who are to continue instrumental work should

select instruments through the laboratory exposure method at the beginning of the fifth grade.

5. A six weeks exploratory plan should follow, at the end of which time there should be a conference of parent, student and instructor to decide the further course.



APPENDIX

Music Profile Chart

Name \_\_\_\_\_ School \_\_\_\_\_

Grade \_\_\_\_\_ Home Address \_\_\_\_\_ Phone \_\_\_\_\_

Age \_\_\_\_\_ Date of Filing \_\_\_\_\_

Otis Score \_\_\_\_\_

K-D Scores	Saxette Record
Tonal Memory _____	Rhythmic response _____
Rhythm Discrimination _____	Sight reading _____
Pitch Discrimination _____	Tone quality _____
Rhythm imagery _____	Tongue control _____
Pitch imagery _____	Manual dexterity _____

Vocal Teacher's Rating

Melodic feeling \_\_\_\_\_ Rhythmic feeling \_\_\_\_\_  
Intonation \_\_\_\_\_ Sight reading \_\_\_\_\_  
Work habits \_\_\_\_\_  
Personal characteristics (energetic, indolent, sensitive,  
nervous, timid, persistent, aggressive, etc.) \_\_\_\_\_

Musical Experience

Piano \_\_\_\_\_ (extent) Other instruments \_\_\_\_\_

Vocal organizations \_\_\_\_\_

Began study of \_\_\_\_\_ (instrument) Date \_\_\_\_\_

Transferred to \_\_\_\_\_ (instrument) Date \_\_\_\_\_

Member of band or orchestra \_\_\_\_\_

Dropped \_\_\_\_\_ (date) Reasons \_\_\_\_\_

Instructor \_\_\_\_\_

## BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Abbott, George Jacob, Instrumental Music in the Public Schools, Boston, C. C. Birchard and Co., 1935.
- Barnard, Floyd P., "String Bass, Foundation of the Orchestra," School Musician, January, 1937, 22.
- Beattie, John W., and others, Music in the Junior High School, Boston, Silver, Burdette and Co., 1930.
- Berlioz, Hector, A Treatise on Modern Instrumentation and Orchestration, London, Novello and Co., 185-?
- Biddle, Mark, "Do Girls Make Good Bass Players?" School Musician, January, 1940, 18.
- Bingham, Walter Van Dyke, Aptitudes and Aptitude Testing, New York, Harper and Brothers, 1937.
- Bowen, Catherine Drinker, "What Shall They Play?" Woman's Home Companion, December, 1938, 5.
- Burns, Samuel T., "Value of Prognostic Tests for Instrumental Pupils," School Music, XXXI, (March, 1931), 6-9.
- Chidester, Lawrence W., "Something More About Modern Bands," School Musician, February, 1937, 22.
- Chidester, Lawrence W., and Small, Arnold M., "The Preparatory Instruments," Music Educators Journal, March, 1940, 23.
- Dewey, John, Democracy and Education, New York, The MacMillan Co., 1924.
- Drake, Raleigh M., "The Place and Use of Music Tests," Education, LIX (May, 1939), 544.
- Earhart, Will, The Meaning and Teaching of Music, New York, M. Witmark and Sons, 1935.
- Ford, Glen J., "How We Give Every Child Pre-Instrumental Instruction," School Musician, May, 1937, 16.
- Gutstein, Herbert, "The French Horn in the School Band and Orchestra," The Baton, February, 1937, 6.
- Hertz, Edwin A., "Tests in Instrumental Music," The Baton, April, 1936, 5.

- Jones, Arthur J., Principles of Guidance, New York, McGraw-Hill Book Co., Inc., 1930.
- Kwalwasser, Jacob, Tests and Measurements in Music, Boston, C. C. Birchard and Co., 1927.
- Kwalwasser, Jacob, and Dykema, Peter W., K-D Music Tests; Manual of Directions, New York, Carl Fischer Inc., 1930
- Lamp, Charles Joachim, The Determination of Aptitude For Specific Instruments, Berkeley, University of California, Unpublished dissertation, 1933.
- Larson, Ruth Crewdson, "Studies on 'Seashore's Measures of Musical Talent'," University of Iowa Studies, Vol.II No. 6, 1930.
- Larson, William S., "Practical Experience with Music Tests," Music Educators Journal, March, 1938, 31.
- Leeson, Cecil, The Saxophone Comes of Age, Chicago, National School Band Association, pamphlet, 1939.
- Letitia, M. "Instrumental Music in the Psychological Development of the Child," Music Educators National Conference Yearbook for 1935. 238.
- Macrae, Angus, Talents and Temperaments, New York, D. Appleton and Co., 1933.
- McAlister, Gladys M., "Instrumental Music for Crippled Children," Music Educators Journal, October-November, 1937, 28.
- McCreery, C. L., Elementary Rhythm and Pitch Test, Chicago, Lyons Band Instrument Co., 1937.
- Miller, Charles H., "The Seashore Tests in the Rochester Schools," Educational Music Magazine, March-April, 1938, 31.
- Mursell, James L., "Intelligence and Musicality," Education, LIX (May, 1939), 559.
- Mursell, James L., and Glenn, Mabelle, The Psychology of School Music, New York, Silver, Burdette and Co., 1931.
- Newton, L. G. and Young, T. Campbell, The Book of the School Orchestra, London, Oxford University Press, 1936.
- Parker, Horatio, and others, Teacher's Manual, Vol.II, The Progressive Music Series, Boston, Silver, Burdette and Co., 1916.

- Patterson, Donald G., and others, Minnesota Mechanical Ability Tests, Minneapolis, The University of Minnesota Press, 1930.
- Prescott, Gerald R., and Chidester, Lawrence W., Getting Results With School Bands, Published jointly by Carl Fischer Inc., New York, and Paul A. Schmitt, Minneapolis, 1938.
- Reed, Frank L., "Advantages of Flute Study to Grade School Music Students," The Baton, April-May, 1940, 7.
- Revelli, William D., "The Teaching of Brass Instruments," Etude, June, 1940, 382.
- Rieder, Kathryn Sanders, "What Instrument for Your Child?" Parents Magazine, September, 1939, 22.
- Rohner, Traugott, "How Can We Measure Musicality?" School Musician, May, 1937, 16.
- Seashore, Carl E., Psychology of Music, New York, Mc-Graw-Hill Book Co., 1938.
- Seashore, Carl E., Manual of Instructions and Interpretations for the Measures of Musical Talent, New York, Columbia Phonograph Co., Educational Department, 1919.
- Seashore, Carl E., "The Psychology of Music," Music Educators Journal, December, 1937, 25.
- Shaw, Travis B., "Modern Trends in the Organization and Direction of Public School Bands," School Musician, January, 1937, 17.
- Stanton, Hazel M., "Prognosis of Musical Achievement," Psychological Monographs, Vol. XXXIX, No. 2 (1928), 135.
- Texas State Department of Education, The Teaching of Music in Texas Public Schools, Vol. XIII, No. 10, 36.
- Whitley, Mary T., "A Comparison of the Seashore and The Kwalwasser-Dykema Music Tests," Teachers College Record, XXXIII (May, 1937), 731.
- Wilson, M. Emmett, "What Instrument For Your Child?" Parent's Magazine, XII (March, 1937) 28.
- Woods, Glenn H., Public School Orchestras and Bands, Boston, Oliver Ditson Co., 1920.