

379  
N81  
No. 434

AN ANALYSIS OF THE COURSE OF STUDY FOR  
INSTRUMENTAL MUSIC COURSES IN THE HIGH SCHOOLS OF TEXAS

THESIS

Presented to the Graduate Council of the North  
Texas State Teachers College in Partial  
Fulfillment of the Requirements

For the Degree of

MASTER OF SCIENCE

By

William Harmon Howard, B. M.

Comanche, Texas

June, 1941

90515

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

Chapter	Page
I. INTRODUCTION. . . . .	1
Purpose of Study	
Scope of Study	
Need for this Study	
Organization	
II. HISTORICAL BACKGROUND OF THE INSTRUMENTAL MUSIC COURSES IN TEXAS HIGH SCHOOLS . . . . .	6
III. ANALYSIS OF THE PRESENT PRESCRIBED INSTRUMENTAL MUSIC COURSES IN TEXAS HIGH SCHOOLS. . . . .	14
Purpose	
Content	
Credit Requirement	
Educational Principles	
Materials	
Programs of Other States	
IV. CONCLUSIONS . . . . .	37
V. SUGGESTIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS . . . . .	41
APPENDIX A . . . . .	52
APPENDIX B . . . . .	55
BIBLIOGRAPHY . . . . .	67

## CHAPTER I

### INTRODUCTION

#### Purpose of Study

"The tremendous growth of instrumental music in the schools during the past few years has been so outstanding that it has come to be recognized as one of the most important school activities."<sup>1</sup> The State Department of Education in Texas has given recognition to this activity by outlining a course of study for the subject of instrumental music and by granting credits for the courses.

The rapidity of the development of instrumental music and the outlining of a course of study has raised several questions: Does the establishment of a particular method of teaching improve the position of instrumental music in the educational system? Are individual differences provided for under the outlined program of work? Is the credit basis the proper one upon which to build courses in music? Does the outlined course provide a carry-over interest into adult life?

The purpose of this survey was to analyze the course of study in instrumental music prescribed by the Texas State Department for the high schools of the state and to determine

---

<sup>1</sup>Nell Parmley, The Teaching of Music in Texas Public Schools, Bulletin 406, State Department of Education, Austin, Texas, p. 32.

whether or not a coordinated and well-rounded program of education in instrumental music is being offered in the schools of Texas. It was hoped, furthermore, that, by comparing this program with others elsewhere, this analysis might show whether or not Texas is following any general trend in instrumental music education.

#### Scope of Study

The basis for this survey consisted of the course of study prescribed by the Texas State Department of Education for the schools which have accredited courses in instrumental music and of a survey of replies made to inquiries sent by this writer to state departments of education and to a number of city school systems in the United States. The particular states and cities were selected because they were widely separated, both as to geographic location and population. Replies, however, came from only ten states--Iowa, Wisconsin, Pennsylvania, Alabama, Michigan, Massachusetts, Indiana, California, Mississippi, and Georgia--and from the city school systems of Newton, Springfield, Quincy, and Worcester, Massachusetts; from Chicago, Illinois; and from San Francisco and Sacramento, California. Since these states and cities represented the southern, eastern, middle-western, and western sections of the country, it was felt that this wide range was sufficient to increase the validity of this survey and analysis.

In analyzing the state program, these factors will be considered: the content of the work offered, the time devoted to the work, the place it occupies in the curriculum, the educational theories underlying the establishment of instrumental music instruction in the public schools.

#### Need For This Study

Such an analysis seems pertinent to the present time for two reasons: first, recognition of the importance of instrumental music courses in the schools; second, recognition of the fact that instruction in instrumental music should be in accordance with the latest scientific knowledge in the fields of psychology and pedagogy.

Proof that the Texas State Department of Education recognizes the importance of instrumental music courses is found in these statements:

Musical instruments have played an important role in the development of the social life and customs of all peoples in all times, and the tremendous growth of instrumental music in the schools during the past few years has been so outstanding that it has come to be recognized as one of the most important school activities. Instrumental music as a subject in the modern school curriculum has many educational qualifications and is fast proving itself worthy to be classed as a major subject.<sup>2</sup>

The high school orchestra is rapidly becoming one of the most important institutions in secondary education.<sup>3</sup>

Every school should have a band. It serves both the school and the community.<sup>4</sup>

---

<sup>2</sup>Ibid., p. 32.

<sup>3</sup>Ibid., p. 34.

<sup>4</sup>Ibid., p. 40.

Because instrumental music is "fast proving itself worthy to be classed as a major subject" in the school curriculum, the course of study which prescribes methods and materials for instruction in the subject should be examined.

If instrumental music retains its position in our educational system, the teaching of it must continue to improve psychologically and pedagogically. Music teaching has long neglected many of the fundamental principles of applied psychology. Keen educators demand that instrumental music teaching make greater use of the latest scientific knowledge available.<sup>5</sup>

Furthermore, says Claude B. Smith, Director of Instrumental Music in the Evansville, Indiana schools,

instrumental music, unfettered by traditions or by stereotyped materials and methods, and endowed with freshness and novelty, offers greater possibilities than any other educational force now in operation... a good instrumental music program, considered from all angles, does seem to include many of the admirable present day trends in educational development.<sup>6</sup>

There is a need, therefore, for an analysis of the instrumental music program prescribed for the high school students of Texas; for the program can be evaluated only after a careful survey is made in the light of educational principles.

---

<sup>5</sup>David Mattern and Norval Church, "Instrumental Activities," Thirty-fifth Yearbook, National Society for the Study of Education, Part II, Music Education (Public School Publishing Company, Bloomington, Ill., 1936, p. 75.

<sup>6</sup>Claude B. Smith, An Outline of the Instrumental Music as a Vital Factor in Progressive Education, p. 2.

## Organization

This study is organized as follows:

Chapter I states the problem, the scope of the survey, and the need for a study of the instrumental music program offered in the high schools of Texas.

Chapter II gives the historical background of the development of instrumental music education in the schools of Texas.

Chapter III is an analysis of the present course of study prescribed by the State Department of Education for the schools of Texas, and this analysis includes a comparison of the Texas course with the courses of some states and cities.

Chapter IV presents the conclusions drawn from the analysis made in Chapter III.

Chapter V presents the writer's suggestions and recommendations concerning the present course of study.

The Appendix contains the inquiry sent to the different state departments of education and to the city school systems; it also contains the replies received from them.

## CHAPTER II

### HISTORICAL BACKGROUND OF THE INSTRUMENTAL MUSIC COURSES IN TEXAS HIGH SCHOOLS

Music is a spontaneous outburst of emotions, but there have been two schools of thought about this manner of expression. Among the early settlers in Texas, some people regarded music as the work of the devil, and others regarded it as a form of diversion. The well-to-do class delighted in musical entertainment, but the poor, as a rule, abhorred it.

Men of this class had little equipment, little education, and few home diversions. Their only contact with music had been through the church; and even there it was not regarded very favorably... it was almost uniformly true that the 'poor white' was antagonistic to music except that suggestive of psalm tunes.<sup>1</sup>

One religious organization even made public its opposition to the use of instruments:

The conference which selected the Methodist missionaries for Texas passed a resolution in 1838 that the introduction of instrumental music and the conducting of music in our churches by choirs is injurious to the spirituality of singing and is inconsistent with the directions of our Disciples.<sup>2</sup>

---

<sup>1</sup>Lota M. Spell, Music in Texas, p. 24.

<sup>2</sup>Ibid., p. 29.



Musical instruments were brought into Texas by the wealthier settlers, and in 1831, The Mexican Citizen, one of the earliest newspapers printed in Texas, contained a cutlery and hardware advertisement in which, among the articles offered for sale, there were German harps, and violin strings.<sup>3</sup> Violins, guitars, flutes, harps, and accordians were the common instruments, although there were some pianos in use.<sup>4</sup>

Music teachers came to Texas<sup>5</sup> with the other colonists; usually there was a woman member of some prominent family who could play a musical instrument, and gave music lessons. But there were men teachers, too, and some of them established studios in Houston as early as 1838.<sup>6</sup> But, since instrumental music and dancing were usually associated, the religious organizations condemned the former as injurious to the morals of the people, and instrumental music remained the pleasure of the well-to-do class of pioneer society.

But the singing school and the camp-meetings stimulated interest in music, and, gradually, instrumental music was tolerated and finally accepted.

Probably no factor was as important in the development of music education in Texas as the German settlers who came

---

<sup>3</sup>Ibid., p. 34.

<sup>4</sup>Ibid., p. 27.

<sup>5</sup>Ibid., p. 26.

<sup>6</sup>Ibid., p. 27.

to the state about the middle of the nineteenth century. "After 1845 the number of Germans increased rapidly. Groups settled in Austin, LaGrange, San Antonio, New Braunfels, and Fredericksburg. Among those who came were trained musicians and instrument makers."<sup>7</sup> Their singing societies exercised a powerful influence in establishing a solid foundation for the musical culture of Texas. Instrumental music was equally popular with these immigrants: "in Houston, Galveston, San Antonio, and in the smaller places, bands were formed of Germans and directed by Germans."<sup>8</sup> These settlers were responsible for the introduction of music education in the public schools of Texas; it was through their influence that music was made a subject in the curriculum of the first public schools established in the state--the schools of Galveston in 1845. Other communities in which the Germans were numerous did the same for their schools.

Musical education at public expense was vocal music, however; and the teaching of instrumental music, which seems to have been done only in private schools for girls, was confined to instruction on the guitar and piano; for this a fee was charged. As a matter of fact, education or training in instrumental music has been almost consistently a private enterprise. But just as vocal music has always preceded instrumental music, education in the two kinds of

---

<sup>7</sup>Ibid., p. 34.

<sup>8</sup>Ibid., p. 41.

of music has proceeded in the same manner. Music education in the public schools was long confined to education in singing; now education in instrumental music has become one of the subjects taught in the public schools.

"In 1917, the United States Bureau of Education approved the accrediting by high schools of work done under private teachers."<sup>9</sup> This action opened the door for the introduction of instrumental music courses in the public schools of Texas. As has been stated, instrumental music courses had always been offered in the private schools. Many of the school systems in the state availed themselves of the opportunity offered them by the ruling of the United States Bureau of Education which allowed them to give credit for private instruction in instrumental music. Galveston, Port Arthur, Beaumont, and El Paso were the first schools to secure recognition from the state accrediting agency for such work, and it was not long before bands and orchestras were added to the school activities for which credit was given.

Music education in every phase, from the elementary grades to the high schools, was in a chaotic state in the schools of Texas at this date. Each school which offered any work in music or gave credit for work done under private teachers had its own plan of work, and this was outlined by the teacher or supervisor in charge of music. Bands and

---

<sup>9</sup>Ibid., p. 114.

orchestras were classed as extra-curricular activities; where they did exist in the schools they were composed of pupils who had ability to play an instrument, and they were directed after school hours by someone who was interested in music. This director may or may not have been connected with the school in any way, and, as the services of both himself and the members of the groups were voluntary, the organization of the work was in a more or less haphazard state. Nevertheless, these voluntary undertakings led to the establishment of regularly accredited courses in the high schools.

In 1917 the State Department of Education took over the accrediting of high school work for college entrance, and one member of the department was entrusted with the task of working out a course of study for music education and of setting up standards of accrediting theoretical courses. For fifteen years the State Department, without any special funds for such work, attempted to carry on a general supervision of the music taught in the schools. But much of the time there was no single individual in the department who was either a theoretical or practical musician.

Private teachers, meanwhile, aware that their status was being threatened by the movement toward the inclusion of music as a subject in the public schools, to be taught at public expense, began to organize an association which

would establish standards for the teaching of music. Local organizations were formed in the cities of San Antonio, Dallas, and Austin in 1915; and in that same year a state organization was also formed at Dallas.<sup>10</sup>

The problem of standardizing the courses in music in order that there might be a recognized basis for accrediting them involved the problem of certification of teachers. As music had always been considered merely an "extra" or cultural factor, any one who had had some training in music or had a diploma from some music school set himself up as a teacher. In the public schools, as a matter of fact, when there was no specially trained teacher hired, the music was turned over to some member of the faculty who had special ability in the field. This was particularly true in the case of teachers of instrumental music, of orchestras and bands. Until a fairly recent date, any teacher who held a second-grade certificate could teach music in the public schools, although a teacher holding a special music teacher's certificate, which also required two years of college work, could not teach any other subject. This situation was not remedied until 1936; and since that time the requirements have been steadily raised until now there are definite standards for the teachers of music. Beginning September, 1941, all new full-time teachers of music must present a Bachelor's Degree

---

<sup>10</sup>Ibid., p. 115.

with a minimum of 42 semester hours in music. For an instrumental major, 12 hours must be in major instrument, 8 hours in minor instruments, 4 hours in voice, 6 hours in Music Education and 12 hours in Theory, Methods and Literature of Music.<sup>11</sup>

Since 1934, the State Department of Education has emphasized music education in the schools, and, in cooperation with some of the outstanding music teachers<sup>12</sup> of the state, has been revising and working out a standardized and comprehensive program which at present provides a four year graded course of study for band and orchestra and for other instrumental music. The four year's work carries a two-unit college entrance credit.

An important factor in the development of high school courses in instrumental music was the Texas Band Masters' Association, which was organized in 1922. The activities of this organization undoubtedly resulted in the granting of credits for band and orchestral work in the schools.<sup>13</sup> Various organizations, such as the State Federation of Music Clubs, the State Federation of Women's Clubs, and many local civic groups also devoted time and effort to the establishment of instrumental music courses in the

---

<sup>11</sup>Parmley, op. cit., p. 17.

<sup>12</sup>Ibid., p. 5.

<sup>13</sup>Lota M. Spell, op. cit., p. 120.

high schools. The influence of the contests sponsored by the National School Band-Orchestra Association is recognized by the State Department of Education:

For the past fifteen years the National School Band and National School Orchestra Association and many outstanding state organizations have jointly sponsored the development of school band and orchestra contests, both state and national. This contest program has provided the necessary incentive and the spark that has fired the enthusiasm of the nation to develop finer bands and orchestras.<sup>14</sup>

One factor which contributed to the establishment of courses in instrumental music in the school curriculum was, strange to say, the interest in football. A band was a necessary adjunct to any football team, but it was soon learned that a well-balanced, directed band was more effective in promoting enthusiasm than the voluntary, poorly balanced organization. It was logical, therefore, that the schools should build up a musical organization that was a necessary accompaniment of the football game.

In this chapter there has been presented the historical development of the establishment of courses in instrumental courses in the high schools of Texas. The influence of many factors, both major and minor, has been noted, and in the following chapter an analysis will be made of the program in instrumental music now offered in the high schools of Texas.

---

<sup>14</sup>Parmley, op. cit., p. 32.

## CHAPTER III

### ANALYSIS OF THE PRESENT PRESCRIBED INSTRUMENTAL MUSIC COURSES IN TEXAS HIGH SCHOOLS

The purpose of this survey was, as stated in Chapter I, twofold: first, to ascertain whether or not, in the light of an analysis of the course of study prescribed for instrumental music, a coordinated and well-rounded program of music education is being offered in the schools of Texas; second, to determine whether Texas is following any general trend in the United States in instrumental music education. In making this analysis, therefore, the following factors have been considered: the purpose and content of the course, the credit or unit requirement, the materials prescribed, the educational principles involved, and the type of program offered by some other states.

#### Purpose

The purpose of the course in instrumental music--band and orchestra--is threefold and is given in the course of study as:

1. To develop the fullest appreciation of standard band and orchestra music.
2. To disseminate a general knowledge of music peculiar to band and orchestra use, such as types of tempo, note evaluation, expression, tone quality.



3. To develop to the fullest extent the individual's ability in instrumental technique.<sup>1</sup>

### Content

To achieve this threefold purpose, the course of study provides an outline of required work for each semester of the four years and prescribes the materials to be used. As the work is grouped under three general headings for each semester, except for the first, only the first year's work in orchestra is given here in detail.

#### First Semester.--

Text: The Victor Method of Class Instruction for Band and Orchestra--Book 1.

1. Rudiments of music:  
The work for the first semester should provide assignments for the study of musical characters including notes and rests and their time values; measures; characters of repetition; the tie; the dot; time or measure signature; measure accent; sharps; flats; key signatures; scales.
2. Individual, group, or unison study material:  
Whole, half, quarter and eighth notes and rests; dotted half and quarter notes; ties; slurs; dynamics; simple syncopation; 4/4, 3/4, 2/4, and  $\phi$  time, or measure, signatures; studies and ear-training in two, three, and four parts; scales and exercises in simple key signatures. Sight-reading of any music of a grade of difficulty not beyond the study material for this semester.
3. Study of individual's instrument:  
Detailed preliminary instruction including correct handling and care of instrument; explanation of principles involved in the student producing the tones from the instrument; fundamental instruction on proper positions, breathing, forming

---

<sup>1</sup>Parmley, op. cit., p. 32.

of embouchure, and fingering, for wind instruments; fundamental instruction on proper position, fingering, and bowing, for the string instruments.

4. Positions for string instruments:  
First position for violin, viola, and violincello; half, first, intermediate between first and second, second, intermediate between second and third, and third positions for contra-bass.

Second Semester.--

Text: The Victor Method of Class Instruction for Band and Orchestra, Book 2.

1. Individual, group, or unison study material:  
Major scales, and chords in various keys; chromatic scales; studies on terms of expression, including dynamics and tonal shading; phrasing; rhythm and expression; note values through sixteenth notes, including quarter and eighth note triplets; single and double dotted notes; 2/4, 3/4, 4/4, 6/8, and  $\phi$  time or measure signatures; syncopation in various rhythmic patterns and time signatures.
2. Continued study on individual's instrument:  
Lip slurring on brass instruments; exercises for overcoming difficulties with awkward fingerings on reed instruments; simple exercises on double stops, pizzicato, and studies on various sharp keys for the string instruments.
3. Positions, for string instruments:  
First position for violin and viola; first, fourth, third, second, and the half position for the violincello; intermediate position between the third and fourth positions, fourth and fifth positions for the contra-bass.<sup>2</sup>

The outlines for the second, third, and fourth years in orchestra are merely enumerations of techniques, as is the first course for the year's work. The outline for band

---

<sup>2</sup>Ibid., pp. 35-36.

instruction follows that for orchestra, except that item four is omitted in the first semester and item three, in the succeeding semesters. As a matter of fact, the outline is nothing more than an outline of the material presented in the textbook, and the semester division is apparently based upon the traditional set-up of formal education, which divides work into periods and grants credits upon that basis. That policy, furthermore, is based upon the assumption that the average pupil can do a certain amount of work in a given time, and it has been applied to the new subjects added to the curriculum.

However, instrumental music courses are not given the same credit as is given to other courses in music, such as harmony, or history and appreciation in music, or to the academic subjects. Whereas a year's work in one of these subjects carries one unit of credit for thirty-six weeks of work, with five forty-five minute recitation periods per week and an equal amount of outside preparation, the same amount of work in instrumental music carries only one-half unit credit; but, since half credits will not be granted, the student must take two years of work in instrumental music to get one unit credit.

#### Credit Requirement

When the division into courses is surveyed in the light of the credit or unit granted, the inconsistency of the plan becomes apparent. As outlined, the course covers

four years of high school work, each year consisting of thirty-six weeks, with not less than five forty-five minute periods per week and an equal amount of outside preparation. A year's work carries one-half unit of credit, but no credit will be granted until the student has completed two years of the work outlined in the course. It seems illogical to impose this restriction of two years' work and at the same time to divide the work into semester units; for music, which is an art, is not a subject to be regimented along traditional lines of formal education. The present set-up provided by the outline seems to stress the credit factor which is based upon time rather than upon accomplishment. Perhaps this is deemed necessary, in view of the fact that college entrance requirements specify credits or units instead of ability, and the high school courses must be adapted to meet these requirements. Nevertheless, the problem arising from the imposition of this rule is large, and the credit requirement is a disturbing factor.

Presumably the State Department of Education, when adding any subject to the curriculum, has followed, perhaps from necessity, the traditional method of organizing it upon the credit basis. But in so doing--in outlining content, prescribing materials, and specifying credit under certain conditions--it has created a more serious problem. It is quite obvious that this course of study establishes only one method of teaching instrumental music in the

schools of Texas. Standardization of these courses by insistence upon strict adherence to one method is emphasized by this statement concerning the use of the textbook:

In preparing this course, the required text has been selected because it presents sufficient unison, sectional, and individual material for each individual player regardless of instrument. In that manner each student is given equal training, and is only thereby entitled to equal credit, and on the same basis that equal credit is granted to students enrolled in any other affiliated subject taught in Texas High Schools.<sup>3</sup>

And the regimentation is carried even further, for, among the items listed as necessary for presentation to the visiting supervisor, is: "a definite statement as to the exact portion of the text covered."<sup>4</sup>

#### Educational Principles

In view of the fact that the present period is one of research and experimentation in methods in teaching, it would seem that the establishment and enforcement of a particular method of teaching a subject, particularly one that is an art, might well make education in instrumental music static rather than dynamic. Furthermore, it is quite doubtful that the ideal method of teaching instrumental music has yet been perfected.

In establishing a course of study for instrumental music in high school, it is necessary to keep in mind that

---

<sup>3</sup>Ibid., p. 41.

<sup>4</sup>Ibid., p. 24.

the course should meet the needs of two groups of students: first, the large group of students for whom music will be an avocation; second, a small group of students for whom music will be a vocation. The first group will not become professional musicians, while the second presumably will. The Texas course of study, by placing emphasis upon standardization, seem to fail in recognizing the needs of these two groups. The courses are arranged in sequential order of Band or Orchestra I, II, III, and IV, and there is no provision for the small ensemble that attends to the needs and musical advancement of the individual. Such an organization would take of the needs of either one of the two groups. On the one hand, the talented musicians, or those with vocational interests would have the opportunity in such a course to proceed at an advanced rate, and the professional aspect could be given consideration in the instruction. On the other hand, such a course could be devoted to the amateurs in music.

Such a course would, as a matter of fact, provide a carry-over into adult life. A carry-over implies more than an appreciation of music or the knowledge of instrumental technique; it means a continuation of playing skill and a participation in musical activities after the student has left school. Bands and orchestras are large organizations, however, and it is not often that individuals, after leaving school, are able to find such groups and to participate in

them. An ensemble included in the courses offered in instrumental music would go far toward providing a carry-over into adult life; it is much easier for adults to form into small musical groups than to establish, to find, or to fit themselves into large ones.

It is true that the four string textbooks of the Victor Series, which is the adopted text, do have extra pages for special ensemble work; but whatever is done in that line must be in connection with band or orchestra or else it must necessarily fall under the heading of voluntary extra-curricular activity on the part of students and teacher.

In making this analysis of the instrumental music courses in Texas, a comparison of this state's course of study with those of some other school systems is necessary. It seems appropriate at this point in the discussion to present the program of instrumental music prescribed for the senior high schools of Commonwealth of Pennsylvania and to comment on some of the differences existing between the two courses of study.

### INSTRUMENTAL MUSIC<sup>5</sup>

#### Aim

The highest aim of instrumental music is to develop appreciation of music; appreciation that

---

<sup>5</sup>Course of Study in Music Education for Elementary and Secondary Schools, Bulletin 44, Department of Public Instruction, Commonwealth of Pennsylvania, Harrisburg, pp. 101-105.

may be evidenced in (1) discrimination between the good and the bad music; (2) a desire to play good music well; (3) a desire to hear good music well played; (4) the promotion of specific musical groups and events; (5) the furthering all possible ways of a general interest in music.

To accomplish this type of appreciation through the playing of instruments, the many factors that pertain to musical performance must be taught, and playing skills developed. To nourish a musical nature and develop playing skills, good music must be well performed.

#### Outline of High School Instrumental Course

- A. Beginning string class
- B. Beginning wind class
- C. Intermediate ensemble
- D. Orchestra
- E. Band
- F. Chamber

Note: If groups A and B are too small to warrant a teacher's time, they may be combined into a mixed class. If a sufficient number of applications for the teaching of any one instrument (orchestra, band, or piano) is received, a class for its teaching should be organized.

#### Materials, Including Bibliography\*

##### Procedure

##### 1. Exploration

Since only a small percentage of persons have been found to possess such talent as to warrant special training in instrumental music, ways and means should be established to determine the location and extent of talent. Ways and means may fall under two heads:

- (a) careful and analytical observation in school vocal music and
- (b) exploratory periods given to actual study of instruments

---

\*A number of books are listed for use by the teacher and by each of the groups. There is evidently no prescribed text. It does not seem necessary to list them.



- (1) careful and analytical observations  
It is the duty of each music teacher to so study the child that a comprehensive and fact-sustained, judgment of inclinations, talents, and interests may be the basis of actual and effective encouragement or discouragement of specific musical pursuits.
- (2) exploratory periods for instrumental study  
Schools are encouraged to possess themselves of instruments that may be loaned to students for restricted periods of time....Such instruments as bassoon, tuba, French horn, double bass, 'cello, oboe, and tympani may rightly be considered as those which the schools should furnish. One of each of the other instruments might well be school owned also... (and) should be loaned only for very brief exploratory periods.

## 2. Development:

Instrumental training in the high school is sufficiently rich to warrant its being placed on a five day per week basis and given credit toward graduation. Laboratory credit may be given for satisfactory progress during daily meetings. Full credit should be allowed when regular systematic outside preparation is required. Instrumental units should, if possible, be so graded that each student may enter a group in which he may learn best and to which he may contribute most. The following organization of instrumental units is suggested as ideal for the high school. This organization is designed to occupy the full time of a teacher of instrumental work.

### (a) beginning string class

the grouping of school and student owned basses, 'cellos and violas and student owned violins should form a class of from sixteen to thirty pupils that should meet daily during school time.

### (b) beginning wind class

the grouping of school and student owned wind and percussion instruments should form a class of from sixteen to thirty who should be met daily during school time.

Note: A beginning string or wind class should meet as such for a minimum period of one semester and a maximum period of one school year, after which the members should go on into the intermediate ensemble or drop music, after having found no liking or talent for it.

(c) intermediate ensemble

Students unable to enter advanced band or orchestra, but who have passed beyond the class level are placed in an intermediate group where special attention is given to the development of the individual player. They should be met daily during the school day. In this group, program should play a very small part in the selection of music for study.

(d) orchestra

The high school orchestra is composed of the advanced string instrument players together with a portion of the advanced players of wind and percussion instruments. While the players in this unit must still be taught many rudiments of technique, musical performance for the groups own satisfaction and for school activities will play a more important part in the choice of music, etc....

(e) chamber music

The teacher should organized his players into smaller ensembles that may meet with him only occasionally. Each chamber music or small ensemble unit should meet frequently outside of school. A most genuine love for music will come to the pupils who pursue chamber music study. The educational values to small ensemble players is great and at the same time something is thus being done to take music back into the home. ✓

A comparison of the two courses of study indicates that whereas in Texas the emphasis is placed upon the method of teaching, in Pennsylvania it is placed upon the program of instrumental music. The Texas course of study is concerned with the textbook, and with the division of the material into semester drill work or technique for the purpose of granting one credit for two years' study. Granted that knowledge of instrumental technique is absolutely necessary,

one wonders whether such a four-year outline of group drill work constitutes a well-rounded program of music.

Modern educational theory stresses the fact that the child is the dominant factor and that the individual is entitled to an opportunity to reach his greatest possible growth. To provide this opportunity, it is necessary to adapt the work along the lines of individual differences, remembering at the same time individual similarities.

The Texas course of study seems to be based upon the assumption either that there are no individual differences and needs or else that they are of minor importance. The credit factor, which has been discussed from one aspect, enters into this. A year's work carries one-half unit of credit, but no credit will be granted until the student has completed two years of the work outlined in the course. Now music courses are elective and are supposed to be open to all who want to participate in them. But what about these students who may possess more technical proficiency than others and are, as a matter of fact, ready to enter the second or perhaps the fourth year class? Those ready for the second year are compelled to enter the first year class; the ones who are, according to ability, actually fourth year students will be placed in the third year group. Unless they do this, which, by the way, forces them into the position of repeaters, they will obtain no credit for one year's work. Should they be compelled to forego the

opportunity to develop their abilities to the fullest extent and to remain in a beginning or a junior class in order to avoid the penalty of loss of credit? It may be said that a child who is interested in music will pay no attention to the matter of credit; unfortunately, as teachers know by experience, this is not true. The emphasis placed upon the accumulation of credits necessary to fulfill diploma requirements has its effect.

In connection with this, one might point out that one of the avowed purposes for establishing music courses in schools was to further in all ways a general interest in music because it makes an important contribution to a well-rounded life. If, because of the credit factor, individual differences are ignored or subordinated, the chief purpose of music education becomes a meaningless statement.

Pennsylvania seems to have based its instrumental music program upon the individual rather than upon materials, credits, and methods--standardization of courses, in other words. First, the music teacher studies the child's inclinations, talents, and interests in order to have a basis for encouraging or discouraging periods given to the actual study of instruments to be used. Furthermore, beginning classes in wind and string instruments are conducted for at least one semester or a maximum of two, and at the end of that time students who have found that they dislike instrumental music or have no talent for it, drop the study.

An intermediate ensemble group is provided for those students who have passed this beginning class level and yet are not far enough advanced to enter band or orchestra. In this intermediate section, special attention is given to the development of the individual player. It is advised that instrumental units should be so graded that each student may enter a group in which he may learn best and to which he may contribute most.

Another state, Indiana, seems to be concerned with a program of instrumental music rather than with particular materials, method, and credits. The state has no course of study, evidently leaving that in the hands of the individual school systems. These directors seem to outline their courses in plans of handling classes through private lessons, kindred instrument classes, and heterogenous instrument classes.

Book I of the Victor Series, the prescribed textbook for the Texas schools, contemplates separate classes for the different instruments, these classes to be continued for at least a semester. Furthermore, the first twenty-nine pages are devoted to individual instruction. There can be no objection to the plan of separate classes for each instrument; in fact, some educators consider this to be the ideal plan.<sup>6</sup> But the teacher in the average Texas school immediately encounters difficulties when he attempts

---

<sup>6</sup>Mattern and Church, op. cit., p. 75.

to put this contemplated plan into execution. The present schedules of the average school in Texas do not permit either individual lessons or daily classes composed of one kind of instrument. Furthermore, the course of study specifies daily classes of at least forty-five minutes for five days a week, and this eliminates the scheme of conducting classes on alternate days. Only in large school systems with a large number of teachers would it be possible to adhere to the textbook's plan of handling classes.

#### Materials

The Texas course of study is merely an outline of the techniques to be taught each semester of the four years of work, and the exercises given in the textbook must be used by the classes. The striking thing about these exercises is that the plan seems to be that the student shall study, practice, and learn every conceivable pattern of notes and every combination of musical characters, with the idea that such training will enable him to handle easily these patterns, combinations, and musical selections when he is called upon to play selections. In other words, a mass of musical knowledge and numberless skills is taught in a more or less unrelated way, under the presumption that the student will sort them out and apply them when he meets them under other conditions.

This method is like the old plan of teaching children to read by having them first learn their abc's, and it is entirely at variance with modern educational principles, which establish the fact that children learn most readily and effectively when they are confronted with actual situations. In music, it is true, exercises and fundamentals are necessary; but here, as in anything else, exercises should be only a means to an end.

Modern educators stress the "functional" aspect of learning--that learning naturally starts with the learner's recognition of a meaningful, interesting problem. But the exercises prescribed are isolated, unitary study problems. The instrument is treated as a mechanical problem, and not as a musical opportunity. Such procedure, according to some outstanding music educators, is wholly unsound.

The true solution of the problem of mechanics is to make it incidental to the creation of musical effects. This means that we do not lay out a sequence of formal exercises as a separate unit in our work. Rather we encourage the pupil to try to produce musical effects, and when he finds that he cannot do what he would like to do, we give him just the specific help he needs, then and there.<sup>7</sup>

Furthermore, "technique comes not by mechanical repetition and drill, but by listening to, and thinking about the music one makes and would like to make."<sup>8</sup>

---

<sup>7</sup>James L. Mursell and Mabelle Glenn, The Psychology of School Music Teaching, p. 303.

<sup>8</sup>Ibid., p. 315.

The attack upon technique through drill on formal exercises is entirely wrong. It is based directly upon a conception of learning as habit building, and of skill as a mechanical structure of movement habits....A technique is not built by working at formal drill exercises, but by creating musical effects better and better. Where exercises are used at all, the following principles should be controlling: (a) an exercise should never be used except in direct connection with a felt difficulty in producing a musical result desired by the pupil; (b) an exercise should never be used for its own sake;....but always to give the pupil the right feel of motor control in a movement cycle actually demanded by some phase in a composition he is studying.<sup>9</sup>

The materials or exercises prescribed by the Texas course are directly at variance with these psychological principles. Furthermore, this emphasis on drill in instrumental technique definitely imperils the interest in music. Every piece of musical learning should be presented to, and undertaken by, the class as an appealing project. Every student has the right to expect to spend much of his time on musical selections, and it behooves the director, therefore, to select exercises which are absolutely necessary, in order that more interesting work can be used as soon as possible.

Interest is a vital factor in the learning process. Interesting, worthwhile music should be used from the very start; yet the exercises in Book I of the Victor Series definitely violate this psychological principle. They are not connected with actual playing situations, and they are dull, empty acrobatics. As a result, the students are inclined to lose interest in music because they seem to be

---

<sup>9</sup>Ibid., p. 250-251.



making slow progress. Slow procedure is necessary, but this impression upon the mind of the pupil can be eliminated if the material provides some melodic interest as well as exercises in fundamentals.

In theory the Texas course of study would seem to give the instructor considerable leeway in the choice of and use of materials:

The work assigned for each semester can be accomplished by devoting two class periods a week to these assignments in addition to the daily band or orchestra rehearsal. In schools where it is impossible to schedule these additional class periods, the work may be accomplished by devoting from fifteen to twenty-five minutes of each daily rehearsal period; and the balance of the period may be used for working on any other material the instructor desires.<sup>10</sup>

But the instructor finds it impossible to find any other materials into which he can fit the prescribed exercises, and, since the course of study stipulates strict adherence to the textbook, the net result is violation of one of the principles of musical education: "there should be proper integration of functional organizations, such as the band or orchestra, with the technical units represented by class instruction."<sup>11</sup>

The material given the beginner in Book I of the series cannot possibly constitute a meaningful aesthetic project, for it is obviously designed to bring out technical problems

<sup>10</sup>Parmley, op. cit., p. 33.

<sup>11</sup>Mattern and Church, op. cit., p. 90.

which are separated from any musical undertaking or experience. The purpose of any drill exercises should be to "give the pupil a meaningful synthetic experience at the earliest possible moment."<sup>12</sup>

Another psychological principle is that a beginning student should not be overwhelmed with new and complex experiences which transcend his powers. Some of the exercises in Book I would seem to violate this principle. The playing range, for instance, is widened too quickly, and beginners are unable to play the extremely high and extremely low notes in the exercises; even advanced players often find it difficult to encompass both extremes. In this connection, teachers have found that the low tones which are presented for the cornets and some other instruments will, in actual playing of musical selections, seldom be used. Skips are introduced too early, and the students are unable to make the necessary adjustments of lips, jaws, and physical factors. Too much technical information is contained in this book for beginners; some of it is applicable only to work in later years, but the succeeding books omit it.

It must be admitted that no printed materials go slowly enough in a progressive manner to fit all students. Nor can any stereotyped material fit every occasion. No matter what books are used, it will often be found

---

<sup>12</sup>Mursell and Glenn, op. cit., p. 50.

advantageous to alter the order of the lessons, to substitute, or to add other exercises. However, a course of study which specifies in detail the type of work to be done each semester, and which insists upon strict adherence to the textbook schedule, hampers the teacher in his efforts to meet new situations or to conform to the psychological principles involved in learning.

Nearly every teacher....emphatically deploras the need of organized materials. But there is so much variation in every locality that no plan can be listed that will fit every situation....No materials can be shoved down the throat of any thoughtful teacher as being just the thing for fifth grade beginners, concert band warming-up exercises, etc. The average teacher appreciates attempts at classifications but reserves the right in all cases to adapt the work locally as seems best. If it were possible to lay out stereotyped progressive materials that always worked, there would be little excuse for a teacher.<sup>13</sup>

Nor this does not mean that a textbook is not necessary; on the contrary, the investigator believes that every student needs an instruction book of some kind designed to develop enough technique on his instrument to enable him to become a member of a band or an orchestra. But one of the criteria for evaluating any textbook or materials is that they have sufficient flexibility to permit the teacher to use them in accordance with the modern educational principles that learning starts when the learner is confronted

---

<sup>13</sup>Claude B. Smith, An Outline of Instrumental Music as a Vital Factor in Progressive Education, p. 7.

with a meaningful experience, and that "all learning should proceed in terms of objectives limited to the range of the pupil's vision and desire."<sup>14</sup>

#### Programs of Other States

The analysis of the prescribed instrumental courses in Texas high schools was undertaken not only to determine whether or not this state is offering a well-rounded program in this field but also to determine whether Texas is following any general trend in instrumental music education. A survey of replies made to the inquiries sent out by this writer reveals the following:

The state of Iowa has no standardized courses for band or orchestras; evidently the local systems work out their own courses.

The state of Georgia has no stated requirements for the work done in instrumental music. The State Department of Education reports, however, that more bands are being organized in the schools and that interest is growing.<sup>15</sup>

Mississippi has no required course of study for instrumental music; a list of standard courses is offered to the teacher in the individual schools, and evidently he may choose what he likes. What the term "standard" means is not indicated.

---

<sup>14</sup>Mursell and Glenn, op. cit., p. 65.

<sup>15</sup>Letter from The State Department of Education to the writer.

Wisconsin, like Iowa, has no course for the state as a whole and no supervisors.

Massachusetts does not have any syllabus in music for any of the grades, but many of the larger cities have definite syllabi. The city of Newton is building its courses of study from year to year, the director of music reports; the city of Springfield adjusts its courses to the personnel; the city of Worcester is at present formulating its course of study.

Michigan has no required course of study in instrumental music.

California has no state course of study, and secondary school courses of study are prescribed by local governing boards. In San Francisco the board is revising its music curriculum. At present the choice of material used is left to the individual instructor.<sup>16</sup> Sacramento is revising its course of study.

The city of Chicago, Illinois, is likewise revising its music course, but around what factors or requirements is not stated.

The Pennsylvania course of study has been presented in this paper, and the differences between it and the Texas course of study have been discussed.

---

<sup>16</sup>Letter received from Director of Music in San Francisco Public Schools.

The state of Indiana has no required course of study. The choice of materials and the plan of conducting classes is evidently left to the director in the individual school system.<sup>17</sup>

This sample survey indicates that there is no general trend toward any one method, any particular type of material, or any definite program. It does seem significant that these states have, on the whole, left to the individual school systems the task of constructing courses of study and programs which will meet the local situation.

The outstanding feature of the Texas course of study in instrumental music is that it establishes one method of teaching, a method which is based upon the materials prescribed. But does this establishment of method and material constitute a program of music education?

As stated at the beginning of this chapter, this analysis has been based upon several factors. Certain problems and facts have been revealed in the course of this survey, and the conclusions with respect to these findings will be presented in the succeeding chapter.

---

<sup>17</sup>Claude B. Smith, op. cit., pp. 15-18.

## CHAPTER IV

### CONCLUSIONS

The purpose of this survey was to analyze the course of study in instrumental music prescribed by the Texas State Department of Education for the high schools of the state and to determine, on the basis of the findings of such an analysis, whether or not a coordinated and well-rounded program of education in instrumental music is being offered and whether Texas is following any general trend in instrumental music education.

The analysis, which has taken into consideration various factors, has been presented in the preceding chapter, and the conclusions presented here are based upon the facts revealed.

1. The course of study, by establishing one method of teaching and prescribing the materials used, has standardized the instrumental music courses.

2. The standardization of these courses has been based upon the traditional policy of granting credits--a policy which assumes that, by using one method and one set of materials, students are given equal training.

3. The standardization of instrumental music courses on this basis conflicts with the principles of modern educational authorities. This conflict is evidenced not only

in the type of exercises and materials prescribed for beginning classes, but also in the organization of the work almost entirely around subject matter instead of around the needs of the students. The course of study is merely an outline of the facts and skills to be taught during the four years, and as such, it does not constitute a program of music courses.

4. In prescribing the materials and method, the Department of Education seems to have failed to consider the needs of two groups of students: the large group of students for whom music will be an avocation and the small group for whom music will be a vocation. The materials and method prescribed are adapted to the second group rather than to the needs of the majority.

5. The outline of work for the first semester contains a large amount of theoretical and technical information which will not be used until the student has advanced to succeeding books in the prescribed series, and these books omit the information. Information and theory should parallel the need for its use.

6. The insistence upon adherence to the prescribed materials handicaps the teacher in any attempt to meet the needs of a local or new situation.

7. The method established and the materials prescribed by the course of study contemplate that beginning instruction should be in classes composed of like instruments.



This in itself is good, but it is a plan not feasible for the average schools in Texas: the daily schedules will not permit it, and classes cannot be conducted on alternate days because the course of study stipulates that daily classes of at least forty-five minutes' duration will be taught. If this restriction were removed, better results in teaching might be achieved in following the method and the materials prescribed.

8. The course of study makes no provision for instrumental groups as ensembles, thereby not only neglecting an opportunity to develop the individual player but also ignoring the chance to provide a carry-over interest in music into adult life.

9. So far as the stated purposes of the course in instrumental music are concerned, and these are given in the preceding chapter, it may be conceded that the second will be realized and the first may be achieved, but the third will, in all probability, fall far short of the goal.

10. It would seem that the course of study does not provide a well-rounded program of instrumental music in that it does not make sufficient provision for the needs of two groups of students or for individual needs and fails to provide an opportunity for carry-over into adult life, as has been explained in the preceding chapter.

11. From the survey made of the systems in other states and cities, it is evident that there is no general tendency

to establish methods or to prescribe materials to be used in all of the schools of the state. Whether the state of Texas, in attempting to standardize instrumental courses by establishing a particular method of teaching, and by prescribing certain materials, has taken an advanced step, is a moot question. The facts discussed in the preceding chapter and the conclusions drawn from them would seem to warrant the statement that the present solution to the problem of establishing a program of instrumental music in the schools is not a satisfactory one on the whole.

## CHAPTER V

### SUGGESTIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Modern educators contend that the course of study should be a continuous process and not a fixed thing. In accordance with this principle and the light of the conclusions drawn from this study, the writer makes the following suggestions and recommendations:

1. The policy of strict adherence to successive page numbers in the prescribed materials should be relaxed in order that the teacher may meet new problems and local situations.

2. The materials and exercises for the first year classes should be revised to conform as nearly as possible to the accepted educational principle that facts and technical skills should be used in meaningful situations or in related ways.

On the fly leaf of Book I of the Victor Method is a full page of definitions and titles, "terms of expression". The list contains ninety-five musical terms of foreign words and phrases with the meaning or musical use in English. A check of the exercises in the book shows that only six of the terms are used in the actual playing situations; these terms are: "andante", "andantino", "allegro",

"allegretto", "maestoso", and "DaCapo". The remaining eighty-nine should be eliminated from Book I because there is no functional need for them.

Beginning on either page two or three, depending upon the instrument used, eight pages, is a mass of information entitled "Rudiments of Musical Theory." This consists of an explanation of the lines and spaces used in writing music and other topics, such as the characters, the clef, the seven clefs, notes and rests and their time values, a table of comparative values of the notes, notes and corresponding rests, measures, characters of repetition, explanations of important signs and characters, the tie, the dots, the tie and the dots, the double dot, the rests (dotted), time and measure, division of time, table of characters denoting the different species of time, measure accent, the scale, the diatonic scale, alternation of the pitch of natural notes, enharmonics, the seven sharps, the seven flats, sharps and flats, key signatures, accidentals, the diatonic scale, how to construct major scales, table of major scales, the minor scale, Harmonic scale of A, Melodic minor scale of A, table of minor scales. Some of this information should be eliminated for the reasons below.

(a) Since the music to be played by each instrument is written in the appropriate clef for that instrument, the inclusion of information about the other clef is useless and confusing.

(b) The table of comparative values of the notes includes a diagrammatic representation of note values, embracing sixteenth, thirty-second, and sixty-fourth notes. The exercises in the first book require the use of only half, whole, quarter, and eighth notes. The inclusion of the other material is unnecessary and confusing.

(c) The same may be said of the presentation of the rests and the table of comparison of the notes and rests.

(d) The following time signatures are presented:  $2/4$ ,  $6/8$ ,  $3/4$ ,  $3/8$ ,  $12/8$ . The following are not used in the playing situations in the book:  $6/8$ ,  $9/8$ ,  $3/8$ ,  $12/8$ .

(e) A section of the text is taken up with an explanation of repetition and the characters used to show repetition. As the beginning student is unable to play the exercises even once, it is too much to burden him with technical information on repetition.

(f) Dotted eighth, dotted sixteenth, and dotted thirty-second notes are explained in a table; yet they do not appear in the exercises. This again violates the principle that unless something is to be put into use, there is no need to present it.

(g) There is a table of double dotted notes. There are no double dotted notes used in the exercises in the book; therefore this table should be eliminated.

(h) The same is true of the double dotted rests.

(i) There is an explanation of measure accent. As this is a matter for advanced students only, it has no place in the first book. Need and use should be coordinated.

(j) Similarly, the beginning student, who cannot at the time even produce a tone upon his instrument, is burdened with trying to learn things of which he has no conception: the scale, the diatonic scale, alteration of the pitch of natural notes, enharmonics, sharps and flats, how to construct major scales and minor scales, harmonic minor scales and melodic minors, and other topics. Much of the above is not even used in the first book.

It is contended that such information should not be presented until it is needed by the student. To thrust upon him the whole theory of written music at one time may not only discourage him, but it is not in harmony with the functional principle of learning.

3. The exercises in the first book of the prescribed series, particularly in the first twenty-nine pages, should be further revised and simplified. Exercises containing melodic interest should be introduced so that the student will feel that he is making some progress, thereby stimulating and retaining his interest in the work.

(a) The exercises for cornet, trombone, baritone, and BBbflat bass begin with extremely low tones; not only are these tones little used in actual playing situations,

but they lie below the first octave of the fundamental of the instrument and are hard to produce. Advanced students play these tones with difficulty, and it is not clear why beginners should be burdened with them in the second or third lesson. On the BBb flat bass these are the most difficult tones of the whole range of the instrument to produce, the higher tones being the easier. Ordinarily, beginners start with the tones easiest to produce and gradually add to the range. From this approach, which is the natural one, the low tones should be the last ones to be attempted. In Book I they are among the first. This makes the teaching of BBb flat bass players difficult and discouraging.

(b) The playing of the extremely low tones upon a slide trombone involves the use of the fourth, fifth and sixth position of the slide which are the most difficult to play. The natural procedure would be to start with the slide in the closed or first position, which is the easiest, and then to add the second, third, fourth, and so on as the player becomes more proficient.

(c) The starting of cornet players upon the extremely low tones causes the lips to become habituated to the low tones. The muscles are relaxed and become "set" to vibrating at the lower notes. When efforts are made to increase the range upward extreme difficulty is encountered on account of the reluctance of the muscles to increase the rate of vibration. As the lower tones are seldom used in

music and the higher tones are used constantly, there seems little reason to teach the lower tones at first. Most of the playing of music for the cornet involves the tones from G second line, treble clef, upward. The method in use in the schools teaches the tones from G, second line, treble clef, downward.

(d) After the student has been grooved in the playing of low tones he is expected to advance rapidly in the playing of higher tones. The third lesson is a drill on the lowest tones in the range of the cornet. The student is expected to acquire in the fourth, fifth, and sixth lessons of one page each of material, the ability to play upward to F, fifth line, treble clef. This lacks one tone of being an octave above his ceiling in lesson three. In the seventh lesson he is expected to play G above the staff, treble clef, this being a full octave above his highest tone in lesson three. This advance is too rapid and the average beginner can not extend his playing range at that rate. In the seventh lesson for cornets on page twenty-eight, exercise number six, the student is expected to play two full octaves, a tremendous feat almost impossible of performance by the average student who has had less than two months practice on his instrument.

(e) It may be pointed out that in the case of some of the higher tones the notes are written in octaves, the student being allowed to play the lower or the higher as



he is able. It has been found by this writer in actual teaching experience that this presentation of double notes for beginners is confusing. Since the beginner is plagued with trying to select the correct harmonic of certain fundamentals in order to produce the correct pitch, it is almost certain that he will not be able to skip octaves until he is an advanced player.

(f) The first twenty-eight pages of Book I are planned according to the principle of individual instruction. Consequently there is no necessity for the playing of any certain tone as in unison exercises. It seems that the logical method would be to teach first the tones that are produced most easily by the beginner on his instrument. Procedure should be from the simple to the complex, from the easier to the more difficult. Accomplishment is one of the surest stimulants to interest and continued efforts. Attempting the too difficult or the impossible is a sure route to discouragement and loss of interest. It is recommended that the exercises in the first few lessons in Book I be revised with the above principles in mind.

(g) Unison exercises begin on page twenty-nine; then intervals are introduced on page thirty-four and follow each other rapidly. In less than two pages the beginner is given exercises in seconds, thirds, fourths, fifths, sixths, sevenths, and octave intervals. No more deadly exercise could be devised for beginners. In the first place, the

technical difficulties are too great; difficulty in managing the "embouchure" on the cup-shaped mouth piece instruments is almost paralleled by the difficulty in manipulating the fingering of the keyed instruments. In the second place, these exercises have no melodic appeal, an appeal which is an essential element in exercises for beginners.

(h) On pages thirty-six and thirty-seven are 'studies' and 'melodies'. These exercises are like preceding ones, written octaves. In general it may be said that the upper notes are too high and the lower octaves are too low for beginners. Although they are called melodies, no beginner could possibly distinguish a tune in these exercises. There is practically nothing in them to sustain his interest in playing.

(i) On page thirty-eight the 'tie' is introduced. A beginner has difficulty in counting and playing even the simplest of time patterns. The tie thus complicates his problem. It should not be introduced until the player has developed more accuracy in the execution of time patterns, and is able to comprehend the reason for the use of the tie.

(j) On pages forty and forty-one are several exercises of consecutive quarter notes. The exercises are comparatively lengthy and continue unbroken too long for the average beginner. The range of the notes is exactly two octaves for the brass instruments and almost the entire register for the woodwinds. There are numerous skips of

more or less difficulty. The exercises should be broken up into smaller ones with frequent stops for the players to breathe and rest.

(k) In many of the so-called 'melodies' in Book I the same time pattern is used in all the measures in one exercise. This is monotonous. There should be a variety of simple time patterns in order to break the monotony.

(l) What has previously been said about the introduction of theory in musical information when it is needed is reiterated here. In the first book it will be found that bass clef instruments are expected to play in 'keys' before the players have any knowledge of flats or sharps. It is recommended that beginners not be given 'keys' until they have a working knowledge of accidentals. The transition from accidentals to 'key' is a logical and easy step.

(m) On page fifty-seven and part of page fifty-eight is a long, continued succession of eighth notes. These exercises should be broken up for rest and breathing.

(n) "Alla breve" is introduced on page sixty-three. It has been found that beginners who have reached this part of the book are still none too sure of their playing of even simple time figures. "Alla breve" complicates matters considerably. It would be better to postpone it to one of the succeeding books when its true relation to 4/4 time can be thoroughly grasped.

4. Some of the theoretical and technical information contained in the first book of the series should be transferred to succeeding books where need for and use of the information will be coordinated.

5. Since conditions in the average school will not permit the teaching of kindred instrument classes for beginners it is suggested

(a) that the methods and materials be revised to meet the needs of heterogeneous classes, or

(b) that the course of study eliminate the requirement of daily classes and permit kindred instrument classes on alternate days.

6. The course of study should make provision for instrumental groups such as ensembles, which will not only afford an opportunity for the individual ability but will stimulate a carry-over interest in music into adult life.

7. Emphasis on the credit factor, in the matters of hours, weeks, and years of class periods, should be lessened. A student should enter the group in which he can learn best and to which he may contribute most. If, because of previous training or because of individual ability, he is ready to enter the second or third year class in band or orchestra, he should be placed in the advanced section without being penalized by loss of credit because he has not spent the required amount of time in beginning classes. An examination should easily take care of this, and credit should be

given on the basis of accomplishment, not upon the amount of time stipulated in the course of study.

APPENDIX A

INQUIRY SENT TO VARIOUS STATE DEPARTMENTS OF  
EDUCATION AND TO CITY SCHOOL SYSTEMS

Comanche, Texas  
March 10, 1940

Superintendent of Schools  
\_\_\_\_\_ City

Dear Sir:

I am making a survey of courses of study for instrumental music, and any information you may give me will be greatly appreciated, but I particularly desire the following help:

Does your Board of Education outline a required course of study for instrumental music in your high schools?

If there is a required course of study please send it to me. If a charge is made for the material please send it to me by parcel post C.O.D.

If there is no required course of study, will you please tell me how you organize the instrumental music courses or program.

Yours very truly,

W. H. Howard

Comanche, Texas  
March 10, 1940

State Department of Education  
\_\_\_\_\_ State

Gentlemen:

I am making a survey of courses of study for instrumental music, and any information you may give me will be greatly appreciated, but I particularly desire the following help:

Does the State Department of Education outline a required course of study for instrumental music in high schools?

If there is a required course of study please send it to me. If a charge is made for the material please send it to me by parcel post C.O.D.

If there is no required course of study, will you please tell me how you organize the instrumental music courses or program.

Yours very truly,

W. H. Howard



APPENDIX B

COPIES OF REPLIES RECEIVED TO THE INQUIRY

Department of Public Instruction  
Eugene B. Elliott, Superintendent  
Lansing, Michigan  
March 29, 1940

We have your request for a course of study of music. There is no required course of study of instrumental or band in Michigan.

Sincerely yours,

N. E. Borgerson  
Director of Publications

Quincy Public Schools  
Quincy, Mass.  
April 4, 1940

We have no outline of the required course of study for instrumental music in form suitable for distribution. Am sorry not to be able to comply with your request.

Sincerely yours,

Margaret Tuthill  
Ass't. Supervisor of Music

March 21, 1940

Mr. W. H. Howard  
Comanche, Texas

Dear Sir:

We are formulating a course of study at present for instrumental music (band and orchestra).

Arthur J. Dann  
Director of Music Education  
Worcester, Massachusetts

(Copies of post cards received in answer to survey)

Springfield Public Schools  
Springfield, Massachusetts  
Department of Music  
Administration Building

March 25, 1940

Mr. W. H. Howard  
Comanche, Texas

Dear Mr. Howard:

We do not have a required course of study of instrumental music. We adjust our courses to the personnel.

Sorry that we cannot be of assistance to you.

Very truly yours,

John F. Ahern  
Supervisor of Music

Sacramento City Unified School District  
Sacramento, California

March 27, 1940

W. H. Howard  
Comanche, Texas

Dear Sir:

Sorry to say that we cannot send to you the required course of study of instrumental music (band and orchestra). For we are revising the same.

Yours very truly,

George von Hagel  
Supervisor of  
Instrumental Music

GvH:MKS

Georgia State College for Women  
Milledgeville

April 3, 1940

W. H. Howard  
Director of Music Education  
Comanche, Texas

Dear Mr. Howard:

There are no requirements for instrumental music in the schools of Georgia. More bands are being organized this year and interest is growing. Very few stringed instruments are taught or played.

An all state orchestra performed at the G. E. A. this year, but most of the members were from Atlanta.

Sincerely yours,

Max Noah  
Director of Music

MN:DMB

Georgia State Program for Improvement of  
Instruction in the Public Schools

March 27, 1940

Mr. W. H. Howard  
Comanche, Texas

Dear Mr. Howard:

We do not have a required course of study of instrumental music. Mr. Max Noah, Editor of Music News, Georgia State College for Women, Milledgeville, Georgia, can give you information of what is taught as his work is connected with the music festivals of the state.

Very truly yours,

Celia McCall

CM/ms

State of Iowa  
Department of Public Instruction  
Jessie M. Parker, Superintendent  
Des Moines

March 30, 1940

Mr. W. H. Howard  
Comanche, Texas

Dear Mr. Howard:

Your communication of March 20 received. Will say in reply that we have no standardized course for bands and orchestras in Iowa.

I am sorry that we can not give you any more definite information at this time.

Yours very truly,

Jessie M. Parker  
Superintendent of Public  
Instruction

By

J. P. Street, Deputy

JPS/mls

The Commonwealth of Massachusetts  
Department of Education

February 2, 1940

W. H. Howard  
1821 Chestnut  
Denton, Texas

Dear Mr. Howard:

Massachusetts has no syllabus in music for any of the grades, but many of the larger cities have definite syllabi.

If you write to the director of music in Boston, Quincy, Wellesley, Fall River, Newton, Worcester, and Springfield you will receive the desired information.

Very truly yours,

Martena McDonald  
Supervisor in Education  
Field of Public School Music

MMcD:AU



San Francisco Public Schools  
Offices of Directors and Supervisors  
Civic Auditorium  
San Francisco

March 25, 1940

Mr. W. H. Howard  
Comanche, Texas

Dear Mr. Howard:

I regret very much that it is impossible for us to send you an outline of a required course of instrumental study in our secondary schools.

Our secondary course of music study is now in process of revision and it will be at least a year before we have a new official course. At the present time there is no required course of instrumental study. The choice of material used in any of the work is left to the individual instructor. Among the methods used are The World of Music, the Lockhard method, and one developed by Dr. Charles J. Lamp, Supervisor of Instrumental Music in our system.

Trusting that this information will be helpful, I am,

Very cordially yours,

Charles M. Dennis  
Director of Music

CMD:dj

BOARD OF EDUCATION  
City of Chicago

March 26, 1940

Mr. W. H. Howard  
Comanche, Texas

Dear Mr. Howard:

Because of the fact that our courses of study are in the process of reorganization it is impossible for me to comply with your request.

Sincerely,

HELEN HOWE  
Director of Music

HH:RMB

SCHOOL DEPARTMENT  
City of Newton  
Newtonville, Mass.

March 26, 1940

Mr. W. H. Howard  
Comanche  
Texas

My dear Mr. Howard:

Our course of study for instrumental music-band and orchestra-is just in preparation, that is, we are building it from year to year.

However, I am pleased to enclose the course of study thus far prepared in our full-time courses of History and Appreciation. Others are in preparation.

Yours very truly,

Haydn M. Morgan  
Director of Music Education

HMM/KM

THE STATE OF WISCONSIN  
Department of Public Instruction  
Madison

February 7, 1940

Mr. W. H. Howard  
1821 Chestnut St.  
Denton, Texas

Dear Mr. Howard:

The Legislature of Wisconsin has not seen fit to appropriate any money for curriculum construction or for music or art supervisors in the State.

Besides this, our budget has been cut so drastically that it is impossible for our general supervisors to carry on the research necessary for preliminary work in revising curricula.

For these reasons you can readily see why Wisconsin does not have at present a revised course, or, for that matter, any required course in the State as a whole for either music or art.

Very truly yours,

Lois G. Nemac  
State School Supervisor

LGN/lw

## BIBLIOGRAPHY

### Books

Mursell, James L., and Glenn, Mabell, The Psychology of School Music Teaching; Silver, Burdett and Co., Boston, 1931.

Smith, Claude B., An Outline of Instrumental Music as a Vital Factor in Progressive Education, Rubank Inc., Chicago, Ill., 1936.

Spell, Lota M., Music in Texas, Austin, Texas, 1936.  
(no publisher's name is given in this book)

### Bulletins

Course of Study in Music Education for Elementary and Secondary Schools, Bulletin 44, Department of Public Instruction, Commonwealth of Pennsylvania, Harrisburg, Pa., 1933.

Parmley, Nell, The Teaching of Music in Texas Public Schools, State Department of Education, Austin, Texas, Bulletin, 406.

Thirty-fifth Yearbook of the National Society for the Study of Education, Part II, Music Education, Public School Publishing Company, Bloomington, Ill., 1936.