I. C. 7321 May 1945

UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF THE INTERIOR HAROLD L. ICKES, SECRETARY

BUREAU OF MINES R. R. SAYERS, DIRECTOR

INFORMATION CIRCULAR

ACCIDENT EXPERIENCE IRON-ORE MINES - LAKE SUPERIOR DISTRICT 1940-43



INFORMATION. CIRCULAR

UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF THE INTERIOR - BUREAU OF MINES

ACCIDENT EXPERIENCE
IRON-ORE MINES - LAKE SUPERIOR DISTRICT1/
1940-43

By Frank E. Cash2/ and Reuben D. Larsen3/

INTRODUCTION

The iron-ore ranges in the Lake Superior district are the Marquette in Michigan, Menominee and Gogebic in Michigan and Visconsin, and the Vermilion, Mesabi, and Cuyuna in Minnesota. These ranges produce about 85 percent of the iron ore mined in the United States. Accident experience in connection with this production is better than that of the regions producing the remaining 15 percent. Production and shipments vary slightly from year to year but closely approximate each other over a period of years.

During the 4-year period 1940 to 1943, inclusive, 323,667,599 long tons of iron ore was shipped from the Lake Superior district. 4/ Michigan and Wisconsin shipped 65,386,608 tons, or 20.2 percent of the total, and employed approximately 15,000 men; Minnesota shipped 258,280,991 tons, or 79.8 percent of the total, and employed approximately 10,000 men. The tons produced per man employed is much greater in Minnesota than in Michigan and Wisconsin owing to the large open-cut production in Minnesota.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

This consolidated report was made possible through the cooperation of the operating companies in furnishing their annual accident data for use at the Lake Superior Mining Section, National Safety Council annual meeting, and to them the authors express their appreciation. These data were first compiled and presented in 1941 to cover the 1940 experience.

MINING METHODS

In Minnesota, most of the ore is produced from open-cuts. In Michigan and Wisconsin, the mining methods used, in the order of their relative production, are top slicing, sublevel caving, and open stoping; only a small tonnage of ore is mined from open-cuts.

^{1/} The Bureau of Mines will welcome reprinting of this paper, provided the following footnote acknowledgment is used: "Reprinted from Bureau of Mines Information Circular 7321."

^{2/} Supervising engineer, Bureau of Mines, Duluth, Minn.

^{3/} Safety supervisor, The M. A. Hanna Co., Iron River, Mich.

The average number of operating mines in the region during the 4-year period was 120, of which 64 were open-cut and 56 underground operations. Twenty-five of the underground mines employ the top-slicing method of mining, 16 sublevel caving, and 15 open stoping.

ACCIDENT EXPERIENCE

These accident data were largely taken from those furnished by the operating companies and assembled and published by the Lake Superior Mining Section of the National Safety Council. 2 However, they are supplemented, for purposes of comparison, by figures published by the Bureau of Mines in the report of the National Safety Competition and Annual Survey of Metal Mines Accidents. 5 This discussion of the data is based entirely on observations and opinions of the authors.

The period from 1940 to 1943 was a one during which increased production was necessary, and the manpower shortage, although not acute, was definitely a liability as regards improving accident experience.

Table 1 gives (by years and totals for all mines) the shipments, man-hours worked, days lost as the result of accidents, fatal and total permanent disability accidents, and temporary accidents, with frequency and severity rates, for the 4-year period.

The frequency rate is the number of lost-time accidents per million manhours worked, and the severity rate is the number of days lost because of accidents per thousand man-hours worked. A lost-time accident is considered to be one that causes loss of time beyond the day or shift on which the accident occurred. In calculating severity, temporary disabilities are weighted according to actual calendar days of disability, including holidays and Sundays; whereas, deaths and permanent injuries are weighted according to the United States Bureau of Mines "Scale of Time Losses for Weighting Deaths and Permanent Injuries", adopted from the American Standards Association.

			Days lost					· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·
	Gross tons	Man-hours	account		Partial	Tempo-	Fre-	
Year	shipped	worked	accidents	Fatal	permanent	rary	quency	Severity
1940	63,948,846	31,217,310	139,303	*17	7	359	12.27	4.46
1941	80,747,859	41,239,423	200,114	25	13	515	13.41	4.85
1942				34	12	745	17.23	5.76
1943	85,962,168	51,863,102	273,157	*34	25	1,035	21.09	5.27

TABLE 1. - Accident Data, all mines, 1940-43

57

1323,667,599 170,232,507

^{*}Includes 1 total permanent.

^{5/} Percy A. Carmichael (1941 and 1942 proceedings) and Reuben D. Larsen (1943 and 1944 proceedings), Lake Superior Mining Section, National Safety Council.

^{6/} W. W. Adams and others.

Along with the increase in man-hours worked, the frequency rate increased each year, and the severity rate increased for the first three years but showed a slight improvement for 1943. During the 4-year period, there were 108 fatalities, 2 total permanent total-disability accidents, 57 partial-permanent, and 2.654 temporary disabling accidents; these are tabulated and discussed as to causes, types of operations, and methods of mining. Of the 110 fatal and total disability accidents, falls and slides of ground were responsible for 49, or 44.5 percent; haulage accidents (belt, truck, and locomotive) were next, with 8, or 7.3 percent of the fatal accidents. Other causes, in order of number of resulting accidents, were: Explosives, 6; machinery (moving), 5; loading equipment (shovels, scrapers, etc.) 5; persons falling (shafts, raises, chutes, and banks), 5; railroad cars and locomotives (surface), 5; persons falling (slipping and stumbling), 4; falling material (shafts, chutes, and raises), 4; electrical shocks and burns, 4; suffocation (natural gases), 3; cages and skips (shafts and raises), 3; handling material, 2; runs of ore and rock (chutes and bins), 2: falling material other than ground, 1; drilling equipment, 1; not classified, 3.

There was one fatal accident for each 2,942,433 tons shipped, one partial permanent disability for each 5,678,379 tons, and one temporary disability for each 121,955 tons shipped. For each fatality, there were 0.5 partial-permanent and 24.1 temporary-disability injuries.

As a means of comparison, table 2 lists the frequency rates for the ironore mines in the United States, the frequency and severity rates for the metal
mines entered in the National Safety Competition, and the iron-ore mines in
the Lake Superior district for the years 1940 to 1943, inclusive. The table
shows that the Lake Superior district has had better frequency and severity
rates each year (except the severity rate in 1942) than either of the other two
groups.

TABLE 2.	- Comparison	of	frequency	y and	severity	of
*	accidents	in	iron-ore	mines	, 1940-43	

	Iron-ore mines,	Metal-mines e	ntered in	Iron-ore	mines,
	United States	National Safety	Competition	Lake Superi	ior District
Year	Frequency	Frequency	Severity	Frequency	Severity
1940	19.63	14.47	6.09	12.27	4.46
1941	23.08	20.14	6.85	13,41	4.85
1942	24.40	20.62	5 .5 5	17,23	5.76
1943	24.79	24.21	6.27	21.09	5.27

Table 3 gives the accident data (including totals and combined figures) for the 4-year period, by years, in the Lake Superior District, divided as to type of operation.

Although all accidents are potentially serious, and their occurrence must be decreased to improve accident experience, once an accident happens, the lost time, suffering, reduction in production, and expense are largely reflected in severity rather than in frequency.

TABLE 3. - Accident data, by methods, all mines, 1940-43

	Man-hours	Days		Partial			l
Type of operation	worked	lost	Fatal	permanent	Temporary	Frequency	Severity
Miscellaneous development	338,574	214	0	0	3	8.86	0.63
General shops	15,141,613	17,646	2	3	77	5.41	1.17
Open-cuts and concentrator					_		
plants	60,399,554	276,869	34	23	61 6	11.14	4.58
Top slicing	38,665,669	199,413	52	13	780	21.08	5.16
	, , , , ,	125,675	17	7	349	19.25	6.48
Sublevel caving		257,458	35	11	829	24.10	7.09
All operations		877.275	110	57	2,654	16.57	5.15

TABLE 4. - Accident disability, 1940-43

	Fata]*	Partial p	ormanent*	Temporary				
	,	Days		Average		Average			
Type of operation	Accidents	lost	Accidents	days lost	Accidents	days lost			
Miscellaneous development	0	-	0	-	3	71.3			
General shops	2	6,000	2	658.3	78	35•4			
Open cuts and concentrator plants	314	6,000	23	1,767.4	616	52.3			
Top slicing		6,000	13	1,197.5	7,80	66.5			
Stoping	17	6,000	8	1,245.0	349	42.9			
Sublevel caving	35	6,000	11	1,082.7	828	43.9			
All operations		6,000	57	1,393.1	2,654	52.2			

^{*} Weighted disabilities.

^{**} Including 2 permanent total disabilities.

For comparison in this paper since the accidents have occurred, severity is used for the weighting figure.

Under "type operations," "miscellaneous development" is all underground work and includes prospecting, extensive rock drifting, and shaft sinking and raising. "General shops" are those doing the general repair work for a group of mines. In most instances, the shop experience is included with the individual mine. "Open cuts and concentrator plants" cover the open-cut mines and their concentrating plants, whether the plants are locally or centrally located and operated. "Top slicing," "stoping," and "sublevel caving" are the various methods of mining used underground.

As shown, the most hazardous operation is sublevel caving, in which both frequency and severity rates are higher than in other operations. Although limited in extent, "miscellaneous (underground) development" is shown as having the best accident experience. The frequency and severity rates for all operations in the region for the 4 years are favorable when compared with other iron-ore and metal-mine operations in this country.

In table 4, the accidents are listed under the various type of operations, and the average length of disability per accident is shown for each type of operation.

All fatalities and the partial permanent disabilities are weighted, the former at 6,000 days, and the latter varies with the extent of the disability.

There are two noticeable figures. One is found under "open-cut and concentrator plants," where operations are virtually all mechanical and the average weighted days lost under partial permanent disabilities is two to three times as great as in other types of operations. The other is that the average duration of temporary disabilities is greatest in top slicing, which is one of the least hazardous of underground mining methods, and least in sublevel caving, where the hazards, as shown by the 4-year figures, are the greatest.

Table 5 lists fatal, partial-permanent, and temporary disabling accidents by years and causes for all mines.

These accident data were obtained from the 26 operating companies over a period of 4 years. There are differences in company methods of compiling accident data; and although certain local procedures answer the purposes of the individual company, it is often difficult to classify an accident as to cause. A number of the accidents listed as unclassified would probably fall in one of the other classifications, had the descriptions been more definite and complete.

Table 5 gives a complete, detailed picture of accidents and their causes under the various type operations for the 4-year period.

531 - 5 -

TABLE 5. - Accidents, by years, divided as to causes and types of operation, 1940-43

	[deve	lop	neous ment	Gen	eral	l sh	орв	con	cent	ts a	rs	40	To slic	ing		10	Stop	ing			cavi	ng	40			erati		Mata
Falls and slides of ground (rock and ore)	F	40 4	- 47	2 43	40	41 4	42 4:	ਤ -	40	41	42 3	43	<u>40</u> 3	$\frac{41}{1}$	42 5	43	40 2	41	42 4	±3	40	41	42 7	43 2	10		42 17	13	Total 49
	PP T	-	- :		-	-	-	-	-	-	4	8	17	22	62	58	2	12	17 1	17	4	42	1 47	63	2 26	0	130	146	378
Haulage (belt, truck, and locomotive)	F PP T	-	- :		=	<u>-</u>	= :	-	=	2 1 9	2 18	1 20	- 6	- 1 6	:	- 8	- 2	- - 2	1 5 1	10	- 2 1	1 12	- 1	1 18	0 2 9	3 2 29	2 1 24	3 0 56	8 5 118
Explosives	F PP T	:	- :	= =	=	-	- :	-	=	=	=	1 - 4	- 2	1 1	=	1 - 3	-	:	:	-	2 x 1 1	=	1 2 4	1 - -	2x 1 3	0 1 1	1 2 4	3 0 7	6: 4 15
Machinery (moving)	F PP T	-	- :		=	1	1 2	1 2	1	1	- 2	1 1 14	:	:	1	- 1 13	-	1	- 1	1 5	=	- 8	-	- 19	1 0 2	1 3 8	1 1 4	2 3 63	5 7 77
Loading equipment (shovels, scrapers, etc.)	F PP T	- -	- :	- - -	=	<u>-</u>	- :	-	1	1	1 8	1 1 14	1	- 8	1 9	1	=	=	:	- 7	- 1	1 5	10	- 2 1	0 2 2	2 0 13	2 0 27	1 3 23	5 5 65
Persons falling (shafts, raises, chutes, and banks).	F PP T	-	- :	= =	=======================================	=	- :	-	-	-	1 6	-	- 1	-	1 2	- 6	- - 4	3	1 1	-	-	2 -	11	3	0 0 5	2 0 3	3 0 20	0 0 23	5 O 51
Railroad cars and locomotives (surface)	F PP T	-	- :		=	<u>-</u>	- : - :	1x	=	1 1 5	2 -	- 5 4	- -	- -	- -	-	- 1	<u>-</u>	- 1	-	-	-	-	1 - -	0 0 1	1 1 5	2 0 1	2x 5 4	52 6 11
Persons falling (stumbling and slipping)	F PP T	-	- :		-	-	- ; - ;	3	=	13	1 11	3 34	- 3	- 12	- 17	34	-	<u>-</u>	- 5	- 7	-	12	=	- 21	0 0 3	0 0 37	1 0 33	3 0 99	4 0 172
Falling material (shafts, chutes, and raises)	F PP T	<u>:</u>	- :	= =	-	=	- :	-	=	:	- -	-	- -	3 -	- 6	- 7	=	<u>-</u>	:	-	1	<u>.</u>	-	16	1 0 1	3 0 0	0 0 6	0 1 13	4 1 20
Electricity (shock and burns)	F PP T	-	: :	= =	-	=	<u>-</u> :	-	=	1	-	2 -	- -	1 -	-	-	=	-	- - 4	1 2	<u>-</u>	- 1	-		-	1 1 1	0 0 4	3 0 3	4 1 8
Suffocation (natural gases)	F PP T	=	- :		=	<u>-</u>	= :	-	=	-	11	- -	-	=	=	-	-	=	-	1	=	2 -	-	-	- - -	2 0 0	0 0 11	1 0 1	3 0 12
Cages and skips (shafts and raises)	F PP T	- -	- :		-	-	- :	-	=	-	=	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	1 8	1 -	=	=	- 1	1 1	:	=	1 0 9	2 0 1	3 0 10
Handling material	F PP T	-	- :	= =	=	<u>-</u> -	- 1		=	- 3	1 -	- 11	- 2	=	- 24	23	- 1	- 1	- 10 2	-	1 4	:	- 20	30	0 7	0 0 4	1 0 54	0 1 88	2 1 153
Runs of ore and rock (chutes and bins)	F PP T	-		=	=	- -	- :	-	=	=	=	-	:	1	:	-	-	- - 1	:	7	=	:	=	- - 4	-	1 0 1	=	1 0 11	2 0 12
Falling material (other than ground)	F PP T	=		: :	=	<u>-</u> -	- : 1 -	-	-	=	:	2 14	=	1 13	1 -	26	=	<u>-</u>	:	5	-	=	-	- 17	-	0 1 13	1 0 1	0 2 62	1 3 76
Drilling equipment	F PP T		- ·	: :	=	<u>-</u>	3 -	-	 -	-	1	1	=	-	=	3 -	-	1	1 1	=	=	-	=	- 3	-	0 1 0	1 2 4	0 4 3	1 7 7
Flying objects	F PP T	-	 	: :	-	-	- -	-	=	-	2	3 11	- 1	1	2	1 12	, - -	1	- - 4	- 8	:	1	-	- 27	0 0 1	0 3 0	0 4 5	0 4 58	0 11 64
Hand tools	F PP T	- - -		- - -	-	- - 1			-	- - -	1 11	- 1 7	:	:	:	14	=	=	<u> </u>	-	=	- - -	- 7	-	- -	0 0 1	0 1 18	0 1 25	0 2 44
Mines fires	F PP T	-		: <u>-</u>	-	-	<u> </u>	-	=	- - -	=	-	:	=	=	=	=	=	=	-	-	-	=	- 5	=	=	= 1	0 0 5	0 0 5
Not classified	F PP T	-	1 1	1	6 2	- 24 1	4 16	-	2 54	- 80	93	- 143	- 87	68	108	98	16	- 23	- 77 2	8 1	- 36	127	- 97	- 58	2 0 299	0 0 323	1 0 390	0 0 344	3 0 1,356
Total	F PP T		0 0 0 0 1 1		0	1	0 1 0 2 1 25	. 1	4 1 57 1	4	13 4 164	14	3 1 119	6 4 130	8 3 228	5 5 303	2 2 29	0 3 12 1	4 1 2 33 14	οl	3	13 1 207 1	8 3 198	6 4 276	7	25 13 515	12	34 25 035	110 57 2,654

X - Includes 1 total permanent.
F - Fatal.
PP - Partial permanent.
T - Temporary disability.

⁵³¹

Aside from the "not-classified" accidents, there are 19 listed causes of the accidents. Falls and slides of ground caused the greatest number of fatal and temporary-disabling accidents. Haulage came next as a cause of fatal accidents; but accidents due to persons slipping, stumbling, and falling ranked second in the total number of accidents. Railroad cars and locomotives caused only 22 accidents, but these were very severe and resulted in 5 fatalities (including one permanent total disability) and 6 partial-permanent disabilities. Electricity caused 13 accidents, four of which were fatal and one of which was a partial permanent disability. Flying objects caused 75 accidents, with no fatalities, but resulted in loss of sight of 11 eyes. Mines fires, which are too frequent, caused only 5 temporary disabling injuries.

SUMMARY

On an average, 120 iron mines are operated by 26 companies in the Lake Superior district, which annually produces about 85 percent of the iron ore mined in the United States. Individual open-cut mines produce 20,000 to 20,000,000 tons annually, and the underground mines from 100,000 to 1,000,000 tons a year.

The accidents in the district, although relatively fewer and less severe than in other metal-mining districts, have increased in frequency during each of the four years 1940-43, inclusive, with a similar increase in severity for the first three years but a slight decrease in 1943. This condition has been experienced in practically all of these operations.

"Miscellaneous development," usually considered hazardous work, although covering the relatively small number of 358,574 man-hours, occasioned only 3 lost-time accidents, which resulted in 214 days of disability. The accident rates for the 4 years were frequency, 8,86, and severity, 0.63.

"General shops" covers a total of over 15 million man-hours with 82 accidents, divided as follows: 2 fatal (1 total permanent disability), 3 partial permanent, and 77 temporary disabilities. The frequency rate increased from 1.63 in 1940 to 7.76 in 1943, with a total 4-year rate of 5.41; the severity rate increased from 0.03 in 1940 to 2.26 in 1942 and dropped to 2.03 in 1943 for a total 4-year rate of 1.17.

Under "open cuts and concentrator plants," the hours worked increased each year, with a corresponding increase in the frequency rate each year, an increase in the severity rate for the first three years, and a slight decrease in 1943. During the 4-year period there were 34 fatal, 23 partial-permanent, and 616 temporary disabilities. The frequency rate increased from 6.88 in 1940 to 14.82 in 1943, for a total average rate of 11.14 for 4 years. The severity rate increased from 2.65 in 1940 to 6.03 in 1942 and dropped to 4.59 in 1943 for a 4-year average rate of 4.58.

Under "top slicing," the hours worked increased each year. During the 4-year period there were 22 fatals, 13 partial-permanent, and 780 temporary disabilities. The frequency rate decreased from 16.90 in 1940 to 15.53 in

I.C. 7321

1941 and increased to 27.46 in 1943 for an average 4-year rate of 21.08. This 4-year average rate is higher than the rate under "stoping" and lower, than that for "sublevel caving." The severity rate under "top slicing" increased from 4.76 in 1940 to 5.94 in 1942 and decreased to 4.23 in 1943, for a 4-year average rate of 5.16. This 4-year average severity rate is the lowest of the underground operations.

Under "stoping," over 19-million man-hours were worked during the 4 years, during which 17 fatal, 7 partial-permanent, and 349 temporary injuries occurred. The frequency rate increased from 11.59 in 1940 to 24.91 in 1943; the 4-year average rate was 19.25. The severity rate decreased from 5.56 in 1940 to 1.08 in 1941 and increased to 11.44 in 1943 for a 4-year average rate of 6.48.

Under "sublevel caving," a total of 36,306,153 man-hours was worked, during which 35 fatal, ll partial-permanent, and 829 temporary disabilities occurred. The frequency rate increased from 18.61 in 1940 to 29.74 in 1945; the 4-year average rate was 24.10. The severity rate increased from 6.93 in 1940 to 9.40 in 1941 and decreased to 5.20 in 1943; the 4-year average rate was 7.09. As shown by the figures, sublevel caving had the highest average frequency and severity rates for the 4-year period.

Over 170 million man-hours were worked in all the operations. The over all frequency rate increased from 12.23 in 1940 to 21.09 in 1943, and the severity rate increased from 4.27 in 1940 to 5.76 in 1942 and decreased to 5.27 in 1943. The 4-year average frequency rate was 16.57, and the severity rate was 5.15.

Most of the mines are highly mechanized and during the past h year produced increasing tonnages of iron ore with a minimum of repair and replacement to mechanical equipment. Permanent installations of mechanical and electrical equipment usually are well-guarded.

In most of the underground mines, electric cap lamps are furnished and employees are required to wear hard hats and safety-toe shoes; for certain classes of work, safety goggles are furnished, and wearing is mandatory.

With the exception of the very small producers, the companies have safety supervisors and safety inspectors. The small companies usually rely on the superintendent to combine safety work with his operating activities.

Most of the companies operating underground mines maintain rescue equipment and train personnel in its use.

Previous to 1940, most of the companies provided first-aid training for their employees, and a number of them had 100 percent employee first-aid training. Since 1940, very little first-aid training has been done in the district.

531 - 8 -

Most companies have some form of printed or mimeographed operative and safety rules. Most open-cut mines require the wearing of protective shoes or boots in summer, but in severely cold weather some allow their employees to discontinue their use. Protective hats are worn in a few open-cut mines.

A number of companies provide goggles, and some issue the correctivevision type. A few companies require their use throughout the shift for all employees, but many leave it up to the individual to wear them when necessary or leave it to the supervisory force to require their use for selected types of work.

All underground hauling is done with electric locomotives, a few of which are storage-battery types. Haulage in open-cut mines is by belt, electric and steam locomotives, and most often, trucks. About half of the underground mines have stench-warning systems for emergency use.

Loading in open-cut mines is done largely by electrically operated shovels, with an occasional steam- or gasoline-operated shovel operating in some mines. In the underground mines, virtually all ore is dragged by electrically operated scrapers into chutes or cars.

Open-cut drilling is done largely by gasoline or electrically operated well- or wagon-type drills, with a few gasoline-operated augur-type drills for soft material. In the underground mines, compressed air-operated percussion-type drills are generally used, and virtually all drilling is done wet.

In open-cut mines, blasting is done with dynamite and some "nitramon," which is detonated with electric blasting caps or electric blasting caps and detonating fuse. The explosive in use underground is dynamite with fuse and detonators, except in extremely wet places, shaft sinking, and heavy blasting; a limited amount of blasting is done electrically.

Most of the underground mines have two or more openings and are ventilated mechanically. A few mines have excellent ventilation systems with provision for heating the air in cold weather; others are not so well ventilated.

In general, a determined effort is being made by the mining companies in the Lake Superior district to minimize accidents incurred in mining iron ore. Compared to other metal mines in this country, this district's accident experience is favorable, but, even so, it can and should be improved. Such improvement can be realized by a closer coordination of effort by employees and management.

531 - 9 -