A COMPARISON OF THE USE OF MUSIC IN THE HOLY EUCHARIST
OF THE ROMAN CATHOLIC CHURCH AND THE SABBATH MORNING SERVICE
OF THE JEWISH SYNAGOGUE IN THE MIDDLE AGES

THESIS

Presented to the Graduate Council of the
North Texas State University in Partial
Fulfillment of the Requirements

For the Degree of

MASTER OF MUSIC

By

Sandra K. Simmons, B. M.
Denton, Texas
July, 1971
Simmons, Sandra K., *A Comparison of the Use of Music in the Holy Eucharist of the Roman Catholic Church and the Sabbath Morning Service of the Jewish Synagogue in the Middle Ages.* Master of Music (Musicology), August, 1971, 52 pp., 2 tables, bibliography, 15 titles.

The problem with which this investigation is concerned is that of comparing the medieval musical traditions of two of the world's most influential religions. The similarities are discussed in two major categories: the comparison of liturgical texts and ritual, and the comparison of the music appearing in each ritual.

This study has one main purpose. That purpose is to demonstrate how, through musical traditions, each religion has developed through the influence of the other.

Samples of the liturgies from the musical portions of the services were obtained from prayer books and references dealing with those religions. Investigations of English translations from the Latin and Hebrew revealed a close identity between the two, not only in scriptural uses, but also in prayers and responses.

Musical examples demonstrating similar elements in Hebrew and Christian worship were found in the extensive research of A. Z. Idelsohn and Eric Werner. Due to the dispersal of
world Jewry, the best examples of Hebrew medieval music were obtained from the most isolated Jewish communities, such as those of Yemen. Musical similarities included modes, melodic formulas, and hymns and songs.

This report concludes that the musical portions of the services of Christianity and Judaism in the Middle Ages were strikingly similar, and their subsequent musical development was strongly influenced by their coexistence.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>LIST OF TABLES</th>
<th>iv</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>LIST OF ILLUSTRATIONS</td>
<td>v</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## Chapter

### I. HISTORY AND COMPARISON OF LITURGICAL TEXTS AND RITUAL. 1
- Introit
- Gloria
- Lessons
- Credo
- Sanctus
- Agnus Dei
- Communion

### II. MUSICAL COMPARISONS 21
- Modes of the Bible
- Prayer Modes
- Cantillation of the Scriptural Lessons
- Psalmody
- Prayers
- Hymns and Songs

### BIBLIOGRAPHY 50
# LIST OF TABLES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I. Teamin and Ecphonetic Neumes</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. Music Motifs of the Teamin</td>
<td>32-33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure</td>
<td>Description</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>The Pentateuch Mode</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>The Mode of the Prophets</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>The Mode of Job</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>The Mogen Ovos Mode</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>The Adonoy Moloch Mode</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>The Pentateuch Mode</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Adonoy Moloch (Idelsohn)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>The Mogen Ovos Mode (Idelsohn)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>The Ahavoh-Rabboh Mode</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>The Yishtabach Formula</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>The Biblical Accents</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>The Epistle and Gospel</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>Gloria and Sh'ma</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>Sanctus and Alenu</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CHAPTER I

HISTORY AND COMPARISON OF LITURGICAL

TEXTS AND RITUAL

The music of the Jews as a religious and ethnic people has its beginning with the institution of the race itself. Throughout the Old Testament references are made to the use of music in their worship and their recreation (for example, see Exodus 15). They had a natural love and ability for music and tradition which enabled them to preserve their folk and religious melodies and pass them down from generation to generation through the centuries. "It is remarkable that the great susceptibility and fondness for music which the ancient Hebrews evidently possessed have been preserved by their race until the present day."\(^1\) The religious music developed around the Temple services, and after the time of David changed very little until the destruction of the second Temple in 70 C. E.\(^2\) The liturgy was centered around the daily sacrifices in Jerusalem and reading from the Torah. Special melodies were ascribed to individual portions of the Holy Scriptures that figured in the service. Each melody was made up of either two modal motifs or, perhaps, three or four


\(^2\)C. E. stands for Common Era, a synonym of the Christian A. D.
modal motifs sung in alternation. These motifs had to be flexible enough to permit their use for different texts of varying syllabic lengths. Most of them were given descriptive names so that singers and instrumentalists would intone the right mode upon seeing them.³

Musical instruments, actually an entire orchestra, were used in the Temple services along with a choir. There were stringed instruments, wind instruments and percussion instruments (the only one which has survived in present day use in the Synagogue is the most unmusical of them all, the Shofar or ram's horn, heard only on high holidays). A choir of at least twelve male singers between the ages of thirty and fifty sang with the orchestra. Each singer had five years' training, although boys of the Levites were permitted to sing in the choir also.⁴

The distinctiveness of Jewish music of the Temple and later of the Synagogue results from two main concepts as set forth by Idelsohn. First, the Jewish people are a Semitic-Oriental people and are influenced by ethnic forces. Secondly, their music has unique qualities supplied by the life and sentiments of a deeply religious people. "Its distinguishing characteristics are the result of the spiritual life and struggle of that people."⁵

---

⁵ Ibid., p. 24.
Gradenwitz asserts that in all probability the majority of the Temple motifs and melodies were folk songs. The Levites (that tribe of the twelve sons of Jacob chosen to carry out the musical portions of the service) only modified those folk tunes and sanctified their use. This practice of borrowing from existing secular melodies is common to most religions through the ages.

The Temple was not open to laymen, only men of high rank and birth. Representatives (An'she Ma'amad) of the districts and settlements of the country were sent to attend the services in Jerusalem. These men frequently took back to their homes the melodies and motifs they had heard. In this way it is likely that many of the traditional Temple melodies carried over into the Synagogue. Besides that fact, writings from the first century C. E. tell of singers in the Temple choir also participating in Synagogue services in another section of the Temple in Jerusalem.

After the destruction of the second Temple, Jewish instrumental music largely disappeared. Cantillation (the chanting of the prose sections of the Bible) became the foundations of the synagogal service, along with the singing of Psalms and prayer intonation.

---

7Ibid.
Rabbinic sources explain the strict prohibition of any instrumental music in the Synagogue as an expression of mourning for the loss of the Temple and land, but the present writer (Eric Werner) has been able to show that a certain animosity against all instrumental music existed well before the fall of the Temple. It seems that the enmity towards instrumental music was a defense against the musical and orgiastic mystery cults in which Syrian and Mesopotamian Jews not infrequently participated.

Around the time of the writing of the Talmud (second century C. E.) each synagogue had a Rosh Ha-Keneset (head of the synagogue), a Chazzan (one who insured order during the service and took rolls of the Torah from their chest to read to the congregation) and the Cantor (precentor of the synagogue). The teachers from the third century tell that the Synagogue was the lodging place for strangers. Separate apartments were made for them for private devotions and services.

The liturgy consisted mainly of the Shemoneh Esreh (a series of prayers sometimes referred to as the Amidah--to stand--because they are said standing), the Sh'ma Yisrael (Deuteronomy 6:4-9), readings from the Pentateuch, the Prophets, the Psalms, "a homily of Scriptural explanation," the Kaddish (the famous prayer of praise and sanctification; one of the

---


10 William Rosenau, Jewish Ceremonial Institutions and Customs, 2nd edition, revised (Baltimore, 1912), p. 70.
doxologies), and a benediction. The liturgy of the twentieth-century Synagogue is essentially the same. In spite of centuries of scattering and influences of other races and religions, their liturgy has remained very near its beginning.

What distinguished the Jews in the Age of Faith, what kept them one in their scattering, was not theology but ritual, not a creed that Christianity had merely extended and that Islam could substantially adopt, but a ceremonial law of such burdensome complexity that only this proud and high-strung people showed the humility and patience required to obey it. Christianity sought unity through uniform belief, Judaism through uniform ritual.

This statement speaks also for the musical parts of Jewish ritual. It is this devotion to ritual and the natural attraction to music which explains the continuity and preservation of the traditional modes and chants, which gradually developed in the post-biblical centers of Jewry—Palestine and Babylonia.

Christianity was originally considered a sect of Judaism (called the "unlearned ones") by both Romans and Jews. Its liturgy was patterned after Synagogue and Temple liturgies, although more from the former than the latter. Gradually the schism grew between Judaism and Christianity, even though as late as 318 C. E. some Christians still inscribed the word

12 Ibid.
13 Werner, op. cit., p. 315.
"Synagogue" on their church buildings. Maxwell gives the following two reasons for early Christian development from the Synagogue more than from the Temple or any other source: (1) most Jews of the Diaspora had never seen worship in the Temple due to its restrictions of birth and rank. Neither had any Gentile Christians seen the Temple services. (2) At the time of Christ, Temple and Synagogue existed alongside each other. Forty years after the death of Christ the Temple was destroyed and never rebuilt—the Synagogue remained. Synagogues and Christian places of worship were like neighborhood churches.

Many scholars think that not only the liturgy, but also the music of Christian services was borrowed almost exclusively from the Synagogue. This belief is not a new concept. An Italian Jewish poet of the thirteenth century (Manuello ha-Romi), writing in polemics of the Church's imitation of Jewish prayers and songs, noted: "What says our music to the Christians? 'Stolen, yea stolen was I from the land of the Hebrews.' (Genesis 40:15)"

Like the Jews in their synagogal practices, the early Christians rejected instrumental music in their services. Only song was thought "worthy of direct approach to the

---

17 Werner, The Sacred Bridge, p. 132.
Divinity."¹⁸ Apostolic and post-apostolic literature explains that it was rejected for the same reasons the Jews had rejected it--instrumental music was a part of the orgiastic cults of Syria and Mesopotamia.¹⁹

Comparable to the cantor, or precentor, of the Synagogue was the Psalmista of the Christian Church (before the seventh century C. E. neither had regular choirs, but after that time both formed choirs as a result of students desiring them in the Talmudic academies of Babylon and in the monastic orders of Christendom).²⁰ The cantors and psalmistas faced Jerusalem, or the East, as they sang prayers and chants.

The "Church" in the West became the Roman Catholic Church. It grew from a few persecuted martyrs to a religious and political power never equalled in its influence by any other force in history.

If art is the organization of materials, the Roman Catholic Church is among the most imposing masterpieces of history. Through nineteen centuries, each heavy with crisis, she has held her faithful together, following them with her ministrations to the ends of the earth, forming their minds, molding their morals, encouraging their fertility, solemnizing their marriages, consoling their bereavements, lifting their momentary lives into eternal drama, harvesting their gifts, surviving every heresy and revolt, and patiently building again every broken support of her power.²¹


¹⁹ Ibid.


²¹ Durant, op. cit., p. 44.
The Church was, in the first century after Christ's death, a simple association of believers (an *ecclesia* or gathering). Each church was headed by one or more *presbyteroi* (elders, priests) with acolytes or deacons to assist them. As the Church grew in size and complexity, it became necessary to elect a bishop (*episcopos*) to coordinate its functioning. By the fourth century there were archbishops governing the bishops. Over them all were patriarchs in Constantinople, Antioch, Jerusalem, Alexandria and Rome. Gradually the Church split into an eastern and a western division, the western having as its head the Bishop of Rome (the Pope). It was this Roman Catholic Church which so affected the music of the western world.

After the Church was established, it was a full century before any fixed canons appeared. During this time the Christian scriptures, letters, and memoirs of the Apostles (the Gospels), were taking form, and they early took precedence over the Old Testament scriptures. Prayers and Psalms still remained very near those of the Synagogue. To these were added the elements of the sacramental fellowship of the experience of the Upper Room. The day of worship was changed from the Sabbath to Sunday (the day of the resurrection of Christ, instead of the day of his death--Friday).

---


23 Maxwell, *op. cit.*, pp. 3-4.
In 150 C. E. Justin described Christian services to have been comprised of the following: readings from the Old Testament and the New Testament followed by a sermon by the leader, offering of bread and wine, prayer of the faithful, the kiss of peace, thanksgiving prayer and communion. The liturgy was a fusion of Synagogue and Upper Room activities. "At the time of Gregory, . . . , the mass consisted of groups of various chants which later became the Proper of the Mass. Various liturgies were in use in various geographical areas." The chants and modes were gradually codified so that they corresponded to different parts of the musical settings of the mass. The so-called Gregorian Chant, or Old Roman Chant, coexisted with French Gallican, Spanish Mozarabic, and Milanese Ambrosian and was doubtlessly influenced by some or all of them. Gregorian Chant outlived the French and the Spanish chants and was adopted as the universal chant over the Ambrosian. The mass took its final shape in the eleventh century, and its liturgy has not been radically altered since, except on feast days.

Sachs outlines the Sunday services of the mass in the following excerpt:

While the priest betakes himself to the altar, the singers begin the antiphona ad introitum . . . . The Mass itself has five principal sections, called after their initial words Kyrie, Gloria,
Credo, Sanctus and Agnus. The first section, a prayer for mercy, consists of nine invocations in Greek, the language of the Eastern Church: three Kyrie eleison (Lord, have mercy upon us), three Christe eleison (Christ, have mercy upon us), and again three Kyrie eleison.

Thereupon the priest intones the Gloria in excelsis Deo (Glory be to God on High), and the choir continues Et in terra pax hominibus bonae voluntatis (And peace on earth to men of good will). The Gloria is followed by an Epistle from the Apostles and a Lesson from the Gospels.

The third main section opens with the priest's intonation of the confession of faith, Credo in unum Deum (I believe in one God), and is taken up by the chorus on the following words Patrem omnipotentem (The omnipotent Father). It includes the sections Et incarnatus est (And was incarnated) and Crucifixus (Crucified), which are often independent movements in polyphonic settings of the Mass.

The Offertory and, as a prayer of thanks, the Preface are heard while the holy water is being prepared. The Preface leads without a break into the Sanctus, Sanctus, Sanctus (Holy, Holy, Holy) with the Osanna, or Hosanna in excelsis and the Benedictus qui venit in nomine Domini (Blessed be he who cometh in the name of the Lord; and the three fold Agnus Dei qui tollis peccata mundi (Lamb of God who beareth the sins of the world) concludes the Mass, but has the Communion as an epilogue after the partaking of the wafer.

At last, the priest dismisses the congregation by chanting the words Ite missa est with the choral response Deo gratias (Go, [the congregation] is dismissed. Thanks to God.) It is from the word missa that the Mass has its name.26

Liturgically the texts of the Mass and the Sabbath Morning Service show many similarities. Sometimes the comparison must be made by formal structure of prayers and practices when the texts are not similar enough for comparison otherwise. However, there are definitely some major similarities between

the two liturgies, and they can usually be found easily without presupposition. The arrangements of prayers and chants are in different orders, but the link is there. Taking the order of the Mass, the separate sections can be discussed.

**Introit**

The introit is part of the Proper of the Mass (that is, those portions which change from Sunday to Sunday according to the liturgical calendar). The texts of the introits to the four Sundays preceding Easter (Quadragesima) can be compared with the rabbinical commentary (Pesiqta Rabbata—the "Great Commentary") for the lessons on the four special Sabbaths preceding Passover.

The first Sunday of the Quadragesima, corresponding to the fourth Sabbath before Passover, has as its introit the "Invocabit," Psalm 91:15. The Pesiqta Rabbata for the lessons of the fourth Sabbath quotes Psalm 91:5 and 15 in connection with a part of the lessons (although the lessons themselves deal with scriptures found in Exodus and Ezekiel). The second Sunday, corresponding with Sabbath Zakhor (Remember), has as its introit "Reminiscere," Psalm 25:15. The point of comparison comes from the subject of remembrance (in the Hebrew lesson for Zakhor the first word of Deuteronomy 25:15). The third introit is "Oculi mei," Psalm 25:15, which corresponds to the previous Sabbath (Zakhor). Sabbath Parah (Heifer) has as its text Ezekiel 36:20, but the Pesiqta Rabbata quotes Psalm 25:15 in connection with Ezekiel 36:20. The fourth Sunday of the
Quadragesima has the introit, "Laetare Jerusalem" (Isaiah 66:10-11). It has also a Verse, Psalm 122:7; a Gradual, Psalm 122:1; and another Verse, Psalm 122:7. Sabbath *Rosh Hodesh* (New Moon) quotes Isaiah 66:1-24. Furthermore, the Pesiqta Rabbata for that lesson quotes Psalm 122. Werner and Venetianer (in Ursprung und Bedeutung der Prophetenlektion) agree that these "juxtapositions are the results of historical interplay."27

**Gloria**

There is no present-day comparison of the Collect or the Kyrie, but the Gloria has a definite point for comparison. The Gloria is a doxological form of praise known as the "Greater Doxology." It is bound by a fixed-word form, and is part of the Ordinary of the Mass.28

Glory be to God on high, and on earth peace to men of good will. We praise Thee, we bless Thee, we worship Thee, we glorify Thee. We give thanks to Thee for Thy great glory, O Lord God, heavenly King, God the Father Almighty. O Lord God, Lamb of God, Son of the Father, that takest away the sins of the world, have mercy upon us. Thou that takest away the sins of the world, receive our prayer. Thou that sittest at the right hand of the Father, have mercy on us. For Thou only art holy; Thou only art the Lord; Thou only, O Jesus Christ, with the Holy Ghost, art most high in the glory of God the Father. Amen.29

27 Werner, *The Sacred Bridge*, p. 196.


29 Ibid., p. 443.
The doxological forms in Hebrew Sabbath morning liturgy are very similar in that they are responses of praise to the same God. There is no singular "Gloria" as such, but the Sh'ma' (Deuteronomy 6:4), the responses to the Kedusha (thrice-holy; the Kedusha corresponds to the Sanctus in the Roman liturgy), and such doxologies as "Praised be His name whose glorious kingdom is for ever and ever" and "Praised be the Lord to whom all praise is due for ever and ever" make up the same kind of liturgical function.30

Lessons

Following the Gloria in the Sunday morning Mass are the Epistle (read from the Apostolic section of the New Testament) and Lesson (read from the section of the New Testament known as the Gospel). Each of these, parts of the Proper of the Mass, is followed by choral responses, such as the Gradual and Allelujah. Similarly, in the Synagoga service, one finds a reading from the Torah (read from the Pentateuch section of the Old Testament) followed by the Haftarah (read from the section known as the Prophets).31 Each of these is followed by choral responses in the same manner as the Epistle and Lesson of Roman Catholicism.

Credo

The Credo, or Creed, of the Sunday morning service is intoned as a part of the Ordinary of the Mass. The text is

30 Werner, The Sacred Bridge, pp. 276-277.

31 The Universal Jewish Encyclopedia, VII, Isaac Landman, ed. (New York, 1942), p. 82
a sort of pledge of allegiance, stating the beliefs of the Church.

I believe in one God, the Father Almighty, Maker of heaven and earth, and of all things visible and invisible. And in one Lord Jesus Christ, the only-begotten Son of God, born of the Father before all ages. God of God, light of light, true God of true God, begotten not made, consubstantiated with the Father, by whom all things were made. Who for us men, and for our salvation, came down from heaven and was incarnate by the Holy Ghost of the Virgin Mary. AND WAS MADE MAN. He was crucified also for us, suffered under Pontius Pilate, and was buried. And the third day He rose again according to the Scriptures, and ascended into heaven. He sitteth at the right hand of the Father, and He shall come again with glory to judge the living and the dead, of whose kingdom there shall be no end. And I believe in the Holy Ghost, the Lord and giver of life, who proceedeth from the Father and the Son, who together with the Father and Son is adored and glorified, who spoke by the Prophets. And in one holy Catholic and Apostolic Church. I confess one baptism for the remission of sins, and I look for the resurrection of the dead and the life of the world to come. Amen.32

Comparable to the Credo of Christian liturgy is the 'Alenu of the Jewish faith. It is found in all the Jewish services near the end of the devotions. In the Sabbath morning service, it can be found in the additional service (called Musaf). It combines the ideas of God's unity and His selection of Israel as His Kingdom on earth. On the Sabbath the prayer is chanted as an individual composition.33

It is for us to praise the Lord of all, to proclaim the greatness of the Creator of the universe for He hath not made us like the pagans of the world, nor placed us like the heathen tribes of the earth; He hath not made our destiny as theirs, nor cast our lot with all their multitude.

32Wienandt, op. cit., p. 444.
33The Universal Jewish Encyclopedia, I, pp. 166-167.
We bend the knee, worship and give thanks unto the King of kings, the Holy One, blessed be He.

He stretched forth the heavens and laid the foundations of the earth. His glory is revealed in the heavens above, and His might is manifest in the loftiest heights. He is our God; there is none besides Him; as it is written in His Torah: Know this day, and consider it in thy heart that the Lord is God in the heavens above and on the earth beneath; there is none else.

We therefore hope in Thee, 0 Lord our God, that we may soon behold the glory of Thy might, when Thou wilt remove the abominations from the earth and when all idolatry will be abolished. We hope for the day when the world will be perfected under the kingdom of the Almighty, and all mankind will call upon Thy name; when Thou wilt turn unto Thyself all the wicked of the earth. May all the inhabitants of the world perceive and know that unto Thee every knee must bend, every tongue vow loyalty. Before Thee, 0 Lord our God, may they bow in worship, they all accept the yoke of Thy kingdom and do Thou rule over them speedily and for-evermore. For the kingdom is Thine and to all eternity Thou wilt reign in glory; as it is written in Thy Torah: The Lord shall reign for ever and ever. And it has been foretold: The Lord shall be King over all the earth; on that day the Lord shall be One, and His name One.4

Many Jewish martyrs of former times went to their deaths saying the 'Alenu.

The Offertory, part of the Proper of the Mass, is subject to text changes on feast days and other special occasions. The texts, for the most part, are taken from New Testament scriptures. The Offertory is purely a Christian institution in its form of collecting money from the congregation; however, its original function of offering the bread and wine is taken from the Temple sacrificial services. There is no comparison of text or ritual in Jewish liturgy, but there is an offertory in the

Musaf (additional service) of the Sabbath morning. The service stems from Temple days, and part of its text comes from the Pentateuch. The first part is a prayer of meditation commemorating the offertory of the ancient Temple.

Our God and God of our fathers, may there come before Thee the remembrance of our ancestors as they appeared in Thy sacred Temple in the days of yore. How deep was their love of Thee as they brought Thee their offerings each Sabbath day. We pray Thee, grant us of the spirit of knowledge and the fear of the Lord that lived in their hearts. May we, in their spirit of sacrificial devotion, fulfill our duty toward the rebuilding of Thy Holy Land, the fountain of our life, that we may ever be a blessing to all peoples of the earth.35

The second part of the offertory service fluctuates only on Sabbath Rosh Hodesh (New Moon); the rest of the time it remains constant. It is another prayer describing the Sabbath and the commandment in the Torah concerning the bringing of an offering. The prayer concludes with a plea for the restoration of Israel.

Thou didst establish the Sabbath and didst accept its offerings, prescribing the order of its service. They that delight in the Sabbath have a glorious heritage; they who partake of it, merit life's highest joy, and they that love its observance have thus chosen true distinction. At Sinai our forefathers were commanded to keep the Sabbath; and Thou didst ordain, O Lord our God, that they bring the additional Sabbath offering as set forth in the Torah. May it be Thy will, O Lord our God and God of our fathers, to lead us joyfully back to our land, and to establish us within its borders where our forefathers prepared the daily offerings, as is written in Thy Torah, through Moses, Thine inspired servant.36

35 Sabbath and Festivals Prayer Book, p. 140.
36 Ibid., pp. 140-141.
The scripture from the Torah (Numbers 28:9-10), called the "Sabbath Offering," is then intoned.

Sanctus

The Sanctus-Benedictus of the Mass follows the offertory. It proclaims God as Lord of all who live in heaven or on earth. It praises God and those who follow Him. It is very similar to the Jewish Kedusha.

Holy, holy, holy, Lord God of Hosts. Heaven and earth are full of Thy glory. Hosanna in the highest. Blessed is he that cometh in the name of the Lord. Hosanna in the highest.37

The Kedusha is part of the Amidah (required benedictions found in every service) and can be found in the Sabbath morning service during the first recitation of the Amidah and in Musaf just before the Sabbath offering. It is the Jewish prayer of sanctification, and is both chanted aloud and said silently. It has a striking resemblance to the Sanctus of the Roman rite in its central portion.

We will revere Thee and sanctify Thee in the mystic utterance of the holy seraphim who hallow Thy name in the sanctuary as described in the vision of Thy prophet:

And the seraphim called unto one another saying:
Holy, holy, holy is the Lord of hosts;
The whole earth is full of His glory.
His glory pervades the universe; His ministering angels inquire of one another: Where is the place of His glory? In response they give praise:
Praised be the glory of the Lord from His heavenly abode.
From His heavenly abode may He turn in mercy and bestow grace unto the people who, reciting the Shema evening and morning, twice daily, proclaim in love the unity of His name, saying:
Hear, O Israel: the Lord our God, the Lord is One.

He is our God; He is our Father, our Sovereign and our Deliverer. In His mercy He will again make known in the presence of all the living that He will be your God.

"I am the Lord your God."

As it is written in holy Scripture:

The Lord shall reign forever; Thy God, O Zion, shall be Sovereign unto all generations. Hallelujah.

Unto all generations we will declare Thy greatness, and to all eternity we will proclaim Thy holiness. Our mouth shall ever speak Thy praise, O our God, for Thou art a great and holy God and King. Blessed art Thou, O Lord, the holy God. (the holy King). 38

Agnus Dei

The only comparison between the Agnus Dei of Roman Catholicism and a certain prayer of Judaism is general subject matter. Both say the same thing, but the Agnus Dei is written in a more or less poetic form due to its repetition three times of the first phrase and the similar lengths of the words of the second phrase (see example below). The Hebrew prayer is written in prose.

Furthermore, the Agnus Dei falls near the end of the service just before communion, whereas the corresponding Jewish prayer is part of the Amidah (occurring twice, once in the Sabbath morning service, once in Musaf).

The text of the Agnus Dei is very simple and short. Its entreaty is to Christ.

Lamb of God, that takest away the sins of the world, have mercy on us.
Lamb of God, that takest away the sins of the world, have mercy on us.
Lamb of God, that takest away the sins of the world, grant us peace. 39

38 Sabbath and Festivals Prayerbook, p. 139.
The corresponding prayer in Jewish liturgy is the Birkath Kohanim (part of the Amidah). It is a petition for peace and is translated as the "Priestly Blessing."

Grant peace, well-being and blessing unto the world, with grace, loving kindness and mercy for us and for all Israel, Thy people. Bless us, O our Father, all of us together, with the light of Thy presence; for by that light Thou has given us, O Lord our God, the Torah of life, loving kindness and righteousness, blessing and mercy, life and peace. O may it be good in Thy sight at all times to bless Thy people Israel with Thy peace.

Blessed art Thou, O Lord, who blessest Thy people Israel with peace.

Communion

The communion service is a Christian institution with no comparable function in Judaism. It does, however, stem from the sacrificial rites of the Temple. According to the teachings of Christianity, the crucifixion of Christ took the place of animal sacrifice at the Temple altar. This was symbolized by the sharing of bread and wine at the Passover supper of Jesus Christ and his followers, the bread supposedly representing His body, the wine His blood. In the Roman tradition only the Priest partakes of the wine; the congregants share in taking the bread.

The Synagogue offers no animal sacrifice, but the ancient sacrificial prayer of the Temple has been retained in the liturgy through the 'Aboda ("worship"). It is part of the Amidah and, therefore, appears twice in the Sabbath morning ritual. It is a prayer of supplication for God to accept the prayers and offerings of Israel.

40 The Universal Jewish Encyclopedia, IV, p. 23.
O Lord our God, be gracious unto Thy people Israel and accept their prayer. Restore the worship to Thy sanctuary and receive in love the supplications of Israel; and may the worship of Thy people be ever acceptable unto Thee. O may our eyes witness Thy return to Zion. Blessed art Thou, O Lord, who restorest Thy divine presence unto Zion.  

The liturgies of Judaism and Christianity have developed side by side over the centuries, and obviously have influenced one another. It would be useless in many cases to try to decide which text was developed first since there is usually no evidence to support one text or the other. The important thing is what Eric Werner calls the "sacred bridge" between two widely opposing ideologies.

42 Ibid., p. 106.
CHAPTER II

MUSICAL COMPARISONS

The purely musical aspects of Jewish and Christian services do not always correspond with their liturgical similarities; that is to say, where the texts of two prayers might be almost identical, their musical renditions may be complete opposites. On the other hand, the musical rendering of a Christian prayer might be very similar to the music of a Jewish hymn. They compare on completely different concepts. The musical similarities can be categorized into four broad areas: cantillation of the scriptural lessons, psalmody, prayers, and hymns and songs. In order to discuss any or all of these categories, one must first understand the underlying laws of musical construction of both religions, the modes.

The conception of eight modes seems to have originated with the calendar, as far as can be seen from the earliest accessible sources. Hittite, Babylonian, and Syro-Byzantine documents make this quite clear. But it was in Egypt that composition by using modes developed into a well-defined system. It is believed that the Jews learned this practice while exiled in Egypt and later expanded and perfected the practice to suit their own cultural and spiritual needs. Gradenwitz asserts

that it was the Jews who passed the modes on to the Greeks. Werner explains that Jewish modes originated through constant repetition of monophonic melodies or motifs until they gradually crystallized into modes.

No use of chordal or harmonic construction is made by the peoples of the Near East. Unison melody is prevalent, occasionally embellished by instrumental accompaniment parallel to the chief melodic line with improvised ornaments (heterophony). The melodic lines of all Near Eastern music are based upon modes. Judaism, too, uses certain stereotyped melodic patterns which, by repetition and association, crystallized in the course of centuries into a system of modes.

In the Middle Ages, the Jewish modes were thought of as "devices to attune the human soul to the various emotions expressed in the Scriptural and post-Biblical poetry of Judaism." Later they were mere musical "habits," imitations of Arab *lahanim* (modes). In the late Middle Ages (around the same time Gregorian Chant was crystallizing) the modes developed fully into the patterns that "have dominated Jewish melodic creation ever since."

Constantine granted freedom of worship to Christians in 313 C. E. through the Edict of Milan. This edict served to encourage the formation of Christian liturgy and song. A *schola cantorum* was organized in Rome under Pope Celestine I

---

44 Gradenwitz, *op. cit.*, p. 41.
(422-432) whose purpose was the composition and study of chant and the training of church musicians. Pope Gregory the Great (reigned from 590 to 604) according to legend, reorganized and expanded the school and had the chants classified and organized.48

In the eighth century, a system of eight ecclesiastical or Church modes was gradually adopted for the chants. Clendenin asserts that probably many of the melodies had to be rewritten to fit into one of the modes, but a great many had developed in such a way that they could be satisfactorily analyzed according to the eight-mode system.49 According to Werner, the first (Dorian), third (Phrygian) and fifth (Lydian) modes of Gregorian chant are common to all modal systems.50

Jewish modes are characterized by a method in which certain beginning, middle and concluding tones are joined and contrasted in the melody. (Within the modes is the freedom of emotional expression and variation.)51 The Jewish modes can be divided into two large groups: the modes of the Bible, and the prayer modes.

**Modes of the Bible**

Only those portions of the Bible which are to be read publicly are given melodies. These books are: the Pentateuch,

---

51 Gradenwitz, *op. cit.*, p. 41.
the Prophets, Esther, Lamentations, Ruth, Ecclesiastes, Song of Songs, Psalms, and in some areas, Job. The other books which are not set are Proverbs, Ezra, Nehemiah, and Chronicles.\textsuperscript{52} The melodies of the public service are based on melodic motifs. These motifs are in the form of diatonic tetrachords and rarely exceed the range of a fifth or a sixth.\textsuperscript{53}

According to Idelsohn there are specific modes assigned to the two major sections of the Bible--the Pentateuch and the Prophets--as well as specific modes for the other books which are chanted. The Pentateuch mode is based on two disjunct tetrachords, $e$ to $a$ and $b$ to $e$. It corresponds to the Gregorian Phrygian.

\begin{figure}[h]
\centering
\includegraphics[width=0.5\textwidth]{pentateuch_mode}
\caption{The Pentateuch Mode}
\end{figure}

This mode is said to express dignity and elevation of spirit. The mode of the Prophets, also built of two disjunct tetrachords, is identical in most Jewish communities with the Dorian of the Church modes.

\begin{figure}[h]
\centering
\includegraphics[width=0.5\textwidth]{prophets_mode}
\caption{The Mode of the Prophets}
\end{figure}

\textsuperscript{52}Idelsohn, \textit{op. cit.}, pp. 37-38.

\textsuperscript{53}Gradenwitz, \textit{op. cit.}, p. 66.
Most Jewish folk melodies are based on the mode of the Prophets. The mode of Ruth is built on the Pentateuch mode, but its motives are more lyric. Ecclesiastes is chanted in the Ruth mode. The poetical portions of the Bible (the Song of the Sea, Exodus 15; the Ten Commandments, Exodus 20:2-17; and the Blessing of Moses, Deuteronomy 33) are chanted in special modes which were designed to fit the poetry. In various communities throughout the world, these poetical modes differ. Lamentations is chanted within the scale of the Prophetic mode with very short melodic lines, and its character is one of depression.

The mode of Job is based on a single tetrachord, $f$ to $b$-flat.

![Fig. 3--The Mode of Job](image)

Idelsohn attributes the shortness of this mode to the two-part phrase construction of the verses of Job. The short forms of these verses are well-suited to a bi-partite melodic structure. The music of the Psalms generally uses the modes of the prayers with which they are associated in the service.\(^{54}\)

On the other hand, Saminsky names only two modes for the cantillation of the Bible. The first he calls the Mogen Ovos mode. It is used in the chanting of the Prophets. Its

\(^{54}\)Idelsohn, *op. cit.*, pp. 39-60.
counterpart in Gregorian Chant is the pure Aeolian, or the Aeolian with a lowered second (hence, the Phrygian).

![Fig. 4--The Mogen Ovos Mode](image)

The Adonoy Moloch mode corresponds to the Mixolydian mode, or in some cases to the Dorian.

![Fig. 5--The Adonoy Moloch Mode](image)

It is in this mode that the Pentateuch is chanted.\(^5^5\)

A third version of the modal structure, similar to that of Idelsohn, is given by Rosowsky.

\[\ldots\text{, within almost every Jewish group there exist six distinct modes of cantillation for single Books and groups of Books of the Bible. Thus, Esther, Lamentations and the Prophets, each have a special mode of cantillation. So has also the group of Books comprising Ruth, Ecclesiastes and the Songs of Songs. On the other hand, many Jewish communities have two modes of cantillation for the Five Books of Moses (Pentateuch, Tora): one for ordinary Sabbath and another, involving a few chapters, for the High Holidays (Rosh Hashana and Yom Kippur).}\]^6

---

\(^{55}\) Saminsky, \textit{op. cit.}, pp. 22-32.

He further states that the Pentateuch mode for Sabbath cantillation is based on a pentatonic scale with added pien-tones\textsuperscript{57} which result in a Mixolydian mode.\textsuperscript{58}

\begin{figure}[h]
\centering
\includegraphics[width=0.5\textwidth]{pentateuch_mode}
\caption{The Pentateuch Mode (Rosowsky)}
\end{figure}

Prayer Modes

Idelsohn names five Tefilla or prayer modes commonly used in synagogal worship. The first of these, the Adony Moloch, is derived from the Pentateuch mode. The scale is Hypodorian instead of Dorian, although in some communities it is more Mixolydian in character.

\begin{figure}[h]
\centering
\includegraphics[width=0.5\textwidth]{adony_moloch}
\caption{Adonoy Moloch (Idelsohn)}
\end{figure}

It is said to be suitable for "devout prayer" because of its soulful character. The Selicha mode is based upon the Prophetic mode and is used for prayers of repentance and lamentation. The Viddui mode is for prayers of confession and is a derivation of the Job mode; it never goes above a fifth or sixth. The fourth

\textsuperscript{57}Pien-tone is a Chinese technical term for ornamental notes. For a theoretical explanation of their derivation, see \textit{Harvard Dictionary} (p. 677), or p. 481 of Rosowsky.

\textsuperscript{58}Rosowsky, \textit{op. cit.}, pp. 477-516.
Prayer mode, the **Mogen Ovos** mode, is used for the seven benedictions of the **Amidah** on the Sabbath. It is based on the pure minor with the fifth as the predominant tone.

![Fig. 8--The Mogen Ovos Mode (Idelsohn)](image)

The fifth Prayer mode is called **Ahavoh-Rabboh**, unique in that it has no counterpart in the Church modes. Two tetrachords, \(e f g\)-sharp \(a\) and \(b c d\) \(e\), form its structure, and it is considered a mode of excitement and faith in God.\(^{59}\)

![Fig. 9--The Ahavoh-Rabboh Mode](image)

Eric Werner agrees with Idelsohn in the recognition of the **Adonoy Moloch**, **Mogen Ovos**, and **Ahavoh-Rabboh** modes. He adds, however, one more melodic formula to these three, the **Yishtabach** formula.

![Fig. 10--The Yishtabach Formula](image)

\(^{59}\)Idelsohn, *op. cit.*, pp. 72-89.
This, he says, is for prayers of praise. 60

In contrast to the above descriptions, Saminsky cites the use of the Mogen Qvos mode as a prayer mode, as well as the mode of the Prophets. The Adonov Moloch mode, he says, is used as a prayer mode or the Pentateuch mode. The only modes he considers as strictly used for prayer or non-Biblical cantillation are the Ahavoh-Rabboh mode and a mixed-scale mode constructed out of the harmonic minor and the Mogen Qvos mode. 61

Obviously there is much confusion and disagreement among scholars concerning the Jewish modes, but in spite of this array of opinions, some conclusions can be drawn. Most of the modes correspond in some way with the Church modes, usually the Dorian, the Aeolian or the Mixolydian. Since both Christian and Hebrew musical scales reached the culmination of their development in the late Middle Ages, it is not unreasonable to assume that there was considerable mutual influence. Even though melodic motifs and modal forms had been present in the Temple centuries before the ascendency of the Church, gradual changes and developments resulted from either the Diaspora (the scattering of the Jews after the destruction of the second Temple), liberties taken by synagogal precentors, or the Churches' use of the synagogues during the first centuries of its establishment.

61 Saminsky, op. cit., pp. 24-35.
Cantillation of the Scriptural Lessons

The Talmud (in Megilla 32a) expresses the necessity of chanting Scripture. Although the cantillation practices of the Yemenite Jews (whose tradition is the oldest), the Ashkenazim (west European) and the Sephardim (former Spanish Jews) differ, a common source is apparent—namely in the three successive systems of Jewish ecphonetic notation. The first of these three systems was the Proto-Palestinian, which came into use in the fifth century C. E. in Palestine. It consisted only of dots and a few strokes, similar to the ancient Syrian system. The second emerged in Babylon during the late seventh and eighth centuries. In this system the respective accents were indicated by the first letters of their names. The last system, developed by the Tiberian Masorites, was the best and hence the one that endured.\(^6\)

The actual signs of the system of ecphonetic notation developed by the Masorites are called teamin. They appear above and below the text to aid the cantor.

The text of the Jewish Scriptures is annotated with signs known as the biblical accents. In Hebrew they are called teamin. These signs indicate the accent of the words, the manner of rendering the word or phrase, and the tune to which the passage in question is to be cantillated.\(^6\)

The tunes are actually melodic formulas. One sign may indicate one of several different melodic formulas, depending upon the


\(^{63}\)Rothmuller, op. cit., p. 101.
book of the Bible being chanted. Since each book or group of books has its own mode, the exact form of the signs will also vary.64

Church chant notation had followed similar development; that is, the use of ecphonetic notation (such as the dasian notation used in the anonymous Musica Enchiridias) preceded the development of any kind of mensural notation. However, at the same time the chants were being sung from neumes in the Church, the Synagogue had retained its teamin. They are still in use for the lessons. The following chart compares the teamin and Church ecphonetic neumes.65 66

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Hebrew Accent</th>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Corresponding Latin Neumes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>~</td>
<td>Zarqa</td>
<td>Podatus</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Munach</td>
<td>Gravis</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Gershayim</td>
<td>Strophicus</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Darga</td>
<td>Oriscus</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Atnach</td>
<td>Clivis</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Mahpah</td>
<td>Acutus</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Shalshelet</td>
<td>Quilisma</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Zaqef qatan</td>
<td>Climacus</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Segolta</td>
<td>Triangula</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Tipcha</td>
<td>Gravis</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

TABLE I--Teamin and Ecphonetic Neumes

66 This is not to say, however, that the Jews did not use the newer notational forms (e.g. neumes, staves, and so forth) in their non-liturgical practice.
The neumes, although similar in appearance to the *teamin*, serve a completely different function. Each neume represents only one, two, or even three consecutive notes at one time, whereas each Hebrew accent represents a short musical motif. The following chart shows the most common motif used for each of the accents given above.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Sign</th>
<th>Music Motif</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Zarqa</td>
<td>˘</td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Zarqa motif" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Munach</td>
<td>˘</td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Munach motif" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gershayim</td>
<td>˘</td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Gershayim motif" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Darga</td>
<td>˘</td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Darga motif" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Atnach</td>
<td>˘</td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Atnach motif" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mahpah</td>
<td>˘</td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Mahpah motif" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shalshelet</td>
<td>˘</td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Shalshelet motif" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zaqef qatan</td>
<td>˘</td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Zaqef qatan motif" /></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
TABLE II--Music Motifs of the Teamin

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Sign</th>
<th>Music Motif</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Segolta</td>
<td>:.</td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Segolta Music Motif" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tipcha</td>
<td>ᵇ</td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Tipcha Music Motif" /></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

These motifs may vary slightly depending upon the accents preceding or following them.

The Torah, always of primary importance, is read from the parchment (that is, the scroll) which has no vocalization or punctuation written in. Therefore, the cantor must know beforehand the order of the formulas and their application to the text. On the other hand, the Prophetic lesson (Haftarah) can be read from texts which are vocalized and/or accentuated.\(^{67}\)

The teamin given above are only a few of the many teamin used throughout the Scriptures. They are taken from a group known as the system of prose accents (the other group is the system of poetical accents), and can be found in the Pentateuch.\(^{68}\) The following example shows a verse from the Pentateuch as it would be chanted by the precentor according to the Biblical accents.

\(^{67}\) Werner, The Sacred Bridge, p. 55.
\(^{68}\) Rosowsky, op. cit., p. 5.
"Now the earth was un-formed and void and darkness was upon the face of the deep and the spirit of God hovered over the face of the waters."

---

Fig. 11—The Biblical Accents

The lessons of the Church are also chanted, but in a style which is much less melodic. It tends to be more of a recitation on a single note. Even though the texts of the Epistle and Gospel vary from Sunday to Sunday, the recitation tones do not (although there is a separate reciting-tone formula for each of them). They are shown below in the order given in the Liber Usualis. 69

69 Libra Usualis (Belgium, 1938), pp. 104-107.
Psalmody

It must be understood that psalmody is a form rather than simply the texts of the Psalter set to music. Werner's explanation of psalmody is concise and complete.

The term psalmody is understood to mean a type of musical setting which is governed by a coordination of syntactic and melodic accents. Not only do texts of the Psalter belong to this category but also any scriptural or liturgical passage, chanted in a manner whereby the structure of the sentence determines the length, the flow, and the phrasing of the syllabic melody... Here the individual word is of little relevance; it is the whole sentence with its caesura and cadence which represents a musical unit.70

The poetic dichotomy of biblical diction, or *parallelismus membrorum*, is responsible for the forms of psalmody--i.e., the Response, Antiphon, Refrain-psalm, and others.71 In the Psalter itself four main formal schemes are suggested by the syntax:

(a) **direct**, plain in which strophic arrangement is not apparent;
(b) **acrostic**, in these the verses or half-verses are arranged

---

70 Eric Werner, *The Sacred Bridge*, p. 129.
71 Ibid.
in alphabetical sequence (for example, Psalm 119); (c) refrain-psalms, each verse ends with the same refrain (as in Psalm 136); (d) hallelujah psalm, it begins or closes with the word "hallelujah" (see Psalms 145-150). These, by their different formal schemes, suggest different musical renderings.\textsuperscript{72}

Christian and Jewish psalmody of the early centuries of the Common Era and the Middle Ages were very similar. These close similarities were due to the fact that the first Christians were predominantly Jews. They followed Jewish liturgy very closely, inserting Christian teachings throughout. They knew the Psalms and their chants by heart; furthermore, they found them easily adaptable to various languages (Syriac, Greek, and later, Latin) without substantially changing them.\textsuperscript{73} In the Roman Empire, the psalms were at first sung in Greek (the universal dialect), and later in Latin.\textsuperscript{74}

The first psalmody appearing after the lesson, in the ordinary of the Mass, is called the Gradual. In the early Christian era, the scriptural lessons of the Mass were read from a pulpit called the ambo. Between the lessons, psalms were sung by a singer standing on the gradus (step) of the pulpit. Therefore, the first psalmody after the lesson became known as Gradual (from gradus). At first only one singer chanted the

\textsuperscript{72}Ibid., p. 133.

\textsuperscript{73}Alfred Sendrey, and Mildred Norton, David's Harp (New York: 1964), p. 250.

\textsuperscript{74}Ibid., p. 254.
psalmody, but later two or three chanted, "their elevated place on the step harking back to Hebrew Temple practice, in which the Levites sang psalms while standing on the fifteen steps of the sanctuary."\(^\text{75}\)

Graduals have an introductory refrain, then a verse of the psalm. The refrain is begun by a soloist and continued by the choir. The verse is sung by a soloist with the choir coming in on the last phrase. This kind of gradual occurs in seven of the eight modes; many in the second mode are variants of a single melodic outline. Another group of graduals, written in the fifth mode, have melodies that often sound as though they might be in F\(_\text{major}\) due to the frequent use of the f a c triad and the flatted b.\(^\text{76}\) Grout brings up the question of melodic formulas, which would suggest an even closer link with the chant of the Synagogue.

Certain melismatic formulas recur in different graduals; some of the melodies are made up almost entirely of such formulas joined together, in the same manner as the tracts and the Hebrew synagogue chants.\(^\text{77}\)

The tracts are much less florid than the graduals. Tracts represent the last remnants of psalms originally sung between the lessons by a soloist. Along with the Gradual and Allelujah, the melodies of the Tracts belong to the oldest and most venerable documents of the Latin Church and can be traced back to

\(^\text{75}\)Ibid.


\(^\text{77}\)Ibid., p. 44.
origins in the Jewish Synagogue. All Tracts are written either in the second or the eighth mode, using the same, or nearly the same, melody. This restriction is nonexistent in other groups of Gregorian melodies. Tract melodies consist of short formulas connected in a very elaborate manner. They are the longest chants in the liturgy due to their long texts and melismas. Generally the Tracts written in the second mode have texts of penitence and sadness; also they are longer and more serious. The ones in the eighth mode usually have texts of hope and assurance. This might be because of the minor third in mode two as opposed to the major third of mode eight. The Tract, Eripe me, Domine ("Deliver me, O Lord") from the Good Friday service is a fine example of the somber mood of those Tracts written in the second mode. Sicut cervus ("Like as the hart") from the Holy Saturday service exemplifies those Tracts written in mode eight. The forms of the Tracts in both modes are very similar to psalm tones in that they have reciting notes, and they are divided by a mediato. The Tracts are sung in the Mass on days of mourning and atonement, as well as on Ember Saturdays. They occur between the lessons and after the gradual, replacing the allelujah.

Reciting tones and psalm tones are standard formulas for psalm recitation. There is one tone for each of the eight

---

78 Egon Wellesz, op. cit., pp. 127-128.
79 Grout, op. cit., p. 43.
80 Wellesz, op. cit., p. 127.
modes plus an extra one called *Tonus peregrinus*, or "foreign tone." These are among the oldest chants in the liturgy. The psalms are always sung antiphonally in the Offices to one or another of the *psalm tones*. A *psalm tone* consists of four major parts: (a) *initium* (the same as reciting tones); (b) *tenor*; (c) *mediato* (a semicadence in the middle of the verse); and (d) a *terminato* or final cadence. The final verse is generally followed by the *Doxology* or *Gloria Patri*. 81

By the middle of the first century C. E., a common practice of psalm singing was prevalent throughout Christian communities of Asia Minor. It was the simplest synagogal form "in which one person intoned the entire psalm, half verse by half verse, and the congregation responded after each in unison with a refrain or an acclamation." 82

St. Ambrose, Bishop of Milan, in the fourth century undertook to make Latin psalmody more attractive to the congregation. He introduced congregational participation in hymns and psalms. A solo figure, similar to the Hebrew cantor, intoned portions of the sacred text and was answered by choral refrains from the massed congregation. The trained soloist soon overlaid (as did the Jews) his chant with melisma, making the refrains become too highly ornamented for congregational participation so that they were taken over by a trained chorus. 83

81 Grout, *op. cit.* , p. 41.
82 Sendrey, *op. cit.* , p. 250.
In the Synagogue of the Middle Ages, psalms were sung and recited in antiphonal form: "the leader, priest or Levite intoned one part of the verse, the congregation repeated it or sung the next part."84 This form of rendering the psalms is still employed by western and eastern Jewry alike (especially in the Hallel—Psalms 113-118).

A second form of Hebrew psalmody, choral antiphonal singing carried over from the Temple into the Christian Church, but was permitted by the Jews only outside the Synagogue.85 Under Ambrose choral antiphonal psalmody attained its prominence. Two half-choruses were formed—a male choir and one composed of boys—and they alternated the verses in their respective vocal ranges. Soon a short introductory piece called an antiphon was added which was usually taken from the psalm itself and repeated throughout as a refrain.86

Sendrey gives the following account of the development of the allelujah response. In the Synagogue and the Church the allelujah response at the end of the psalms became an expression of high emotion. Singers often reached such a fervor that they dropped the consonants so that the word "allelujah" became A E U I A (those letters were later superseded in the Church by those of the doxology, seculorum amen: E U O U A E).87 Actually, the abbreviation E U O U A E had nothing to do with the allelujah

84Saminsky, op. cit., p. 20.
85Sachs, op. cit., p. 94.
86Sendrey, op. cit., p. 255.
87Ibid., p. 261.
response but was a mere "shorthand" in manuscripts to indicate the closing words of the Gloria Patri, "seculorum amen." Furthermore, it is doubtful that Christians or Jews reached such a fervor in their singing that they dropped all consonants in the word "allelujah" as it would be most difficult to pronounce.

In the Church ritual the alleluia was sung by the soloist, repeated by the choir, and extended by a long vocalization, called the Jubilus, on the final A. This in itself formed a song of praise prompted by a boundless exaltation.

Jews never added the allelujah to psalms where it was not already present in the text, but the Christians did.

Pope Gregory (came to the papal chair in 590) instituted sweeping reforms in Church music. The psalms were simplified and dignified, and hymns were discouraged. Psalms were sung in unison following the natural prose rhythms of the texts. The notes became of more equal lengths and required trained choirs; at that point Gregory started his famous Schola Cantorum in Rome to standardize the training of singers and teachers throughout the Christian world.

With the rise of polyphony in the eleventh century, the close ties between Jewish and Christian musical renditions were severed.

---

88 Ibid.
89 Ibid., p. 262.
90 Ibid.
91 Ibid.
Prayers

The second oldest type of ritual music in Judaism is the cantillation of prayers. This cantillation is not based on teamin but on melody types. The prayer formulas vary according to the traditional themes and motifs of each service. The actual singing is very melismatic, very virtuosic, and retains the barest outline of the original motif (usually primarily in the closing formula). These free melodies are known as hazzanut (derived from chazzan--the name for the professional precentor who sings the prayers).  

The rise of precentors came in the last few centuries before the Common Era. Unlike the Temple whose precentors were Levites and priests, the Synagogue had laymen to intone the chants. They were first called shaliach-tsibur (the messenger of the community), and theirs was an office of honor. They were chosen by the elders of the Synagogue, and their original function was to recite the prayers and laudations for the congregation. As people became better acquainted with the prayers and modes and became better educated, more and more precentors appeared. Moreover, we find that the people visiting from other communities were honored with this function. Since everybody participated in the service, and everybody might be the precentor provided that he knew the texts, and since even visitors could come to any synagogue and without any preparation chant the prayers, we conclude that the modes of the prayers were generally known and of a popular character, folk song.

92Apel, Harvard Dictionary, p. 446.
93Idelsohn, op. cit., pp. 102-103.
94Ibid., p. 103.
Although the prayers were fixed in both form and content by the time of Christ, they were not committed to writing until the fourth or fifth century C. E. Until that time they were handed down by oral tradition. 95

The prayers are all chanted in free rhythm with no artistry allowed due to the dogmatic preciseness of the texts. They may be chanted by a choir or by a soloist. 96 "It is an ancient Jewish custom to turn toward Jerusalem when praying, while those in Jerusalem turn to the Temple site." 97

The famous prayers of the Synagogue are the Sh'ma Yisrael ("Hear, O Israel") and its surrounding eulogies, the Amidah (eighteen benedictions), the Alenu ("It is our duty"), and the Kaddish ("Great Doxology"). 98 The Sh'ma is the Hebrew prayer of creed, and the best known of all the prayers. It is a combination of three biblical passages: Deuteronomy 6:4-9, Deuteronomy 11:13-21, and Numbers 15:37-41. 99 In the Sh'ma the leader sings the whole first line, and the congregation responds with the second line of verse. 100

Christian prayers, although related in form to those of the Synagogue so that all could take part, underwent a separate development to fit the worship of Jesus Christ. 101

95 Maxwell, op. cit., p. 3.

96 Werner, The Sacred Bridge, p. 182.


98 Werner, The Sacred Bridge, p. 182.

99 Ibid., p. 5.

100 Idelsohn, op. cit., p. 21.

101 Maxwell, op. cit., pp. 3-4.
Chanted prayer in the Roman Church is represented by the Gloria, the Credo, Sanctus, and the Lesser Doxology (or Gloria Patri). Like the corresponding prayers in the Synagogue, the texts of these prayers are only partly scriptural, having originated for the most part in the first four centuries of the Common era. "They are without meter or rhyme and represent the basis and mainspring of the daily worship."  

The oldest Roman Gloria melody was a simple psalmodic recitation. In the first verse it had an intonation, tenor, and cadence. The melodic material from the first verse was used in the other verses in the following manner: the short verses used the cadence melody; longer verses used the intonation plus the cadence; still longer verses used the whole formula; finally one or two parts were repeated, if necessary. Later Glorias were more or less free compositions. As a rule, they were syllabic in style. The verses were essentially independent of each other, but there were frequent melodic correspondences between them.  

The following illustration is a musical comparison of the Roman Gloria and a Yemenite Sh'ma.  

Fig. 13--Gloria and Sh'ma

---

102 Werner, The Sacred Bridge, p. 182.
104 Werner, The Sacred Bridge, p. 562.
The note values are different because of the syntax of the texts, but the flow of the melodies is quite similar.

The Credo was one of the last portions of the Ordinary of the Mass to be established. It was adopted into Roman liturgy in the eleventh century. The Credo is typically syllabic with a two-part formula; the \textit{tuba} (or reciting tone) of the first part is G and of the second part, A. Occasionally a second cadence is introduced which recites on G, leaving the \textit{tuba} succession G-A-G.\footnote{Reese, op. cit., p. 184.}

The text of the Sanctus forms one larger unit with that of the Benedictus in the Roman tradition of chant. The form of the melody falls into three periods; the first is the beginning of the Sanctus, the second begins with "Pleni sunt coeli," and the last begins with "Benedictus." The form is loosely an A-B-B as the melodic material of the third period is usually based upon that of the second. The first three utterances of the word "Sanctus" are often treated melismatically, but the style of the piece as a whole is either syllabic or moderately neumatic.\footnote{\textit{Ibid.}} The example below illustrates the melodic similarities between a Roman Sanctus and a Jewish Alenu.

\begin{center}
\textbf{Fig. 14---Sanctus and Alenu}\footnote{Werner, The Sacred Bridge, p. 504.}
\end{center}
The Gloria Patri, or Lesser Doxology (the "Greater Doxology" is the Gloria examined above), is sung after each psalm and uses the same psalm melodic formula for its tune. It therefore falls into simultaneous categories of doxological form and psalmody.

**Hymns and Songs**

There is little room for comparison of Christian and Jewish hymns of the Middle Ages due to the fact that hymns, although attaining early prominence in the Christian tradition, were not introduced into the Synagogue until the sixth century C. E.

The term "hymn" was first used to describe all songs in praise of God. Later the hymn became identified with new songs that arose in response to the needs of the new faith, Christianity. Some were taken from the New Testament, but a greater number (Sendrey says a majority) was taken from earlier scripture and given a Christian interpretation. Davison gives a contrary opinion of the origin of Christian hymns.

In the early Christian era, the term "hymn" was applied to all songs in praise of the Lord; later it was restricted to newly written poems, as distinguished from the scriptural Psalms and canticles.

---

108 Ibid., p. 176.
110 Sendrey, op. cit., p. 251.
Sendrey gives an interesting account of the origin of Christian hymns.

... communal singing among the early Christians was sometimes marked by spontaneous outbursts of praise, as one or another worshiper gave vent to the collective feeling in an improvised chant. The spiritually charged temper of the times caused such spontaneous outpourings to be regarded by the members as inspired and their texts were carefully written down, to serve along with the traditional Hebrew psalms and other Scriptural canticles as a basis for the primitive Christian liturgy.112

Hymns were first introduced into Rome by St. Hilary of Gaul. He reportedly had heard hymn singing in Asia Minor, where he had been banished for six years by the Emperor Constantine in 356 C. E. After presenting some of the Eastern hymns St. Hilary wrote others of his own in Latin. His contemporary, Pope Damascus I, also wrote Latin hymns.113 The oldest extant Christian hymn book is the Codex Alexandrinus of the fifth century. It was compiled for the precentor only and contains psalms and other canticles taken from the more poetic passages of the Pentateuch and the Prophets.114

Ambrose wrote many hymns and encouraged others to write hymns. His hymn, *Te Deum Laudamus*, is strikingly similar melodically to the ancient Jewish chant from the Prophet Zechariah, "Rejoice greatly, O daughter of Zion."115

---

Antioch and Constantinople were centers of hymn-writing. Many heretical ideas (including the use of strict meters) taken from the pagan world were brought into hymns, so that eventually "all songs contrary to the essence of Jewish tradition were branded heretical by the early Church fathers . . . ."116

According to Werner two major factors governed the origin of the Jewish hymn. The first governing factor was non-Jewish prohibition of post-biblical doctrine in the Synagogue. New prayers began to appear in disguise in order to deceive the oppressors. The second factor governing the origin of the Jewish hymn was the attraction of the musical services of Christianity. The radiant church services made Jews aware of their own artistic poverty. Therefore, with these two influences so strongly weighing upon them, Jewish poets (paytanim) began composing numbers of hymns.117 The first attempts at hymn-writing were simple like those of the Syrian and Greek Churches. Many of these original hymns appear in the Sabbath morning service.118 Many of the paytanim (from the Greek poietes, or poet) were chazzanim by profession. The most important of these hymn-writers were Yose ben Yose, Hannai, and Eleazar ha-Kalir. All three lived before the ninth century, although little more is known of them.119

117 Werner, The Sacred Bridge, pp. 234-236.
118 Ibid.
119 Rothmuller, op. cit., p. 96.
After the ninth century a number of fixed-melody chants appeared. Most of them (such as the famous Kol Nidre) were borrowed from non-Jewish music—in the case of the Kol Nidre, which is borrowed from Gregorian chant. Also in this category are the zmiroth, songs to be sung at home at mealtimes (prayers) or when telling of the Haggadah (Hebrews' captivity and deliverance from Egypt).120

The music of Judaism and Christianity has borrowed and benefited from one another since the institution of the latter. The music, more than the liturgical texts or common root, has bound two separate worlds together in a close kinship. It should be understood that each benefited from the other, and neither of them would have followed the important course of development that it did without the influence of the other. Although they are now widely different in ideologies and music, many of the basic similarities still exist, and Christianity can plainly trace its deepest roots in music and liturgy back to the Synagogue.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Books


**Articles**


Publications of Learned Organizations

**Sabbath and Festivals Prayer Book**, The Rabbinical Assembly of America and the United Synagogue of America, 1959.


Dictionaries and Encyclopedias


