THE USE OF THE TROMBOLES IN BEETHOVEN'S
SYMPHONIES NO. 5, 6, 9, AND
SCHUBERT'S SYMPHONY NO. 8

THESIS

Presented to the Graduate Council of the
North Texas State University in Partial
Fulfillment of the Requirements

For the Degree of

MASTER OF MUSIC

By

Denver D. Seifried, B. S.

Denton, Texas

January, 1968
TABLE OF CONTENTS

LIST OF ILLUSTRATIONS ........................................ iv

Chapter

I. ORCHESTRAL USAGE OF THE TROMBONE
   BEFORE BEETHOVEN ........................................ 1

II. THE USE OR THE TROMBONE IN BEETHOVEN'S
    FIFTH, SIXTH, AND NINTH SYMPHONIES ................. 30

    Beethoven's Symphony No. 6
    Beethoven's Symphony No. 9

III. THE USE OF THE TROMBONE IN SCHUBERT'S
     UNFINISHED SYMPHONY. .................................. 62

IV. CONCLUSION .................................................. 81

BIBLIOGRAPHY .................................................... 86
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Figure</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4. Schütz, Christmas Oratorio, &quot;Intermedium V,&quot; Measures 1-6</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Schütz, Christmas Oratorio, &quot;Intermedium V,&quot; Measures 7-11</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Schütz, Christmas Oratorio, &quot;Conclusion,&quot; Measures 1-6</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Buxtehude, Ihr Lieben Christen Freut Euch, &quot;Chorus No. 3,&quot; Measures 1-6</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Bach, Cantata No. 2, Measures 1-14</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. Bach, Cantata No. 2, Measures 15-19</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15. Haydn, The Creation, &quot;Chorus No. 28,&quot; Measures 1-3</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure</td>
<td>Beethoven, Symphony No.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------</td>
<td>-----------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure</td>
<td>Page</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------</td>
<td>------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>32. Beethoven, Symphony No. 2, Second Movement, Measures 501-509.</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>33. Beethoven, Symphony No. 2, Second Movement, Measures 523-530.</td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>34. Beethoven, Symphony No. 2, Fourth Movement, &quot;Chorus No. 3,&quot; Measures 594-601.</td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37. Beethoven, Symphony No. 2, Fourth Movement, &quot;Chorus No. 4,&quot; Measures 695-698.</td>
<td>57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>39. Beethoven, Symphony No. 2, Fourth Movement, &quot;Chorus No. 6,&quot; Measures 859-863.</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40. Schubert, Symphony No. 8, First Movement, Measures 58-67.</td>
<td>67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>41. Schubert, Symphony No. 8, First Movement, Measures 68-74.</td>
<td>68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>42. Schubert, Symphony No. 8, First Movement, Second Subject, Measures 44-47.</td>
<td>69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>43. Schubert, Symphony No. 8, First Movement, Measures 81-87.</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>44. Schubert, Symphony No. 8, First Movement, Measures 110-114.</td>
<td>71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>45. Schubert, Symphony No. 8, First Movement, Measures 153-176.</td>
<td>72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>46. Schubert, Symphony No. 8, First Movement, Main Theme, Measures 176-182.</td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>47. Schubert, Symphony No. 8, First Movement, Measures 333-345.</td>
<td>74</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure</td>
<td>Page</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------</td>
<td>------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>48. Schubert, Symphony No. 8, Second Movement, Measures 32-42</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>49. Schubert, Symphony No. 8, Second Movement, Measures 91-97</td>
<td>76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>50. Schubert, Symphony No. 8, Second Movement, Measures 93-104</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>51. Schubert, Symphony No. 8, Second Movement, Measures 116-123</td>
<td>78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>52. Schubert, Symphony No. 8, Second Movement, Measures 286-290</td>
<td>79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>53. Beethoven, Symphony No. 5, Fourth Movement, Measure 280</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>54. Schubert, Symphony No. 8, Second Movement, Measure 238</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CHAPTER I

ORCHESTRAL USAGE OF THE TROMBONE
BEFORE BEETHOVEN

The primary purpose of this thesis will be to examine the orchestration of the trombone section in the Viennese symphonies of the early Romantic period. In order to fully understand the function of the trombone section in these symphonies, a review of the trombone's usage in previous centuries is in order.

The trombone is the only brass instrument which has passed through five or six hundred years of use, but has undergone little visible change or improvement since its original development. Unlike the other members of the brass family, the trombone has been chromatic from its initial development in the fifteenth century.¹ The trumpet and the horn had to rely on the natural overtones until early in the nineteenth century. It was not until 1818 that Heinrich Stözel and Friedrich Blühmel jointly took out a patent for the valve.²

The earliest name which has been found for the trombone appears to be the fourteenth-century Spanish term, sacabuche, which meant "draw-pipe." In Old French saquier, to pull, and boter, to push, were combined to form saqueboute. The term utilized in Old English to denote the trombone was sackbut. In Middle High German busino was used; this was modified to busune during the Middle Ages. Finally, posaune was the term employed in Germany to denote the trombone after the sixteenth century. The term trombone, as it is used today, came from the Italian word tromba and the augmentative suffix one; when combined these terms meant "big trumpet."  

The earliest known trombone which survives was made by Jörg Neuschel of Nürnberg and was dated 1557. In order to understand the shape and construction of trombones made before the Neuschel model of 1557, one must rely upon artists' representations of the trombone. The first painting to picture a trombone was by the Italian artist, Matteo di Giovanni, who died in 1495.

---

4 Bate, op. cit., pp. 130-131.
5 Bate, op. cit., p. 8. A photographic reproduction of the Neuschel trombone dated 1557 appears on Plate VIII-D.
Woodcuts by the two artists Virdung (1511) and Agricola (1528 and 1545) picture early sixteenth-century trombones which were built before the Neuschel instrument. These early instruments were made of hammered brass and were joined together in the middle by brazing.\(^7\)

In England trombones appeared as early as 1495 in Henry VII's private band, which contained four sackbutts. When Henry VIII came to the throne he increased the number of sackbutts to ten. Sackbutts were combined with cornetti, and together they were used at church and court functions.\(^8\)

The trombone was also utilized in court functions on the Continent during the sixteenth century. At the wedding ceremony of Duke William V of Bavaria and Princess Renate of Lorraine in 1568, two trombones were employed in a six-part motet by Orlando di Lasso.\(^9\)

With its warm and yet sombre tone, the trombone was occasionally used by sixteenth-century church composers, who employed it because it could blend with and support voice parts.\(^10\) The first church composer to write independent parts for stringed and wind instruments was the Venetian

\(^7\)Carse, *op. cit.*, pp. 252-253.
\(^10\)Bate, *op. cit.*, pp. 216-217.
master, Giovanni Gabrieli. In his *Sacrae Symphoniae* (1597) he combined trombones, *cornetti*, and *violini* together in contrasting groups:

![Musical notation]

Fig. 1--Gabrieli, *Sacrae Symphoniae*, "Sinfonia," measures 21-25.

---


Note that in Fig. 1 the instruments are used in an imitative style of counterpoint typical of the sixteenth century; furthermore, the instruments are treated as voice parts. In other parts of the *Sacrae Symphoniae*, Gabrieli used the trombones in antiphonal fashion; however he was not too interested in tonal contrasts between the groups. Similar instruments were often utilized for the antiphonal groups; thus the contrast between the groups was more acoustical than tonal.\textsuperscript{13}

The seventeenth-century music historian Praetorius stated that in 1618 there were four kinds or "sorts" of trombones in use:\textsuperscript{14} (1) alto or discant trombone in Eb or F; (2) ordinary trombone (tenor) in Eb; (3) quart-quint trombone (bass) in Eb or F; (4) octave trombone (contrabass) in BBb. Praetorius also spoke about the chromatic potential of the trombone:

> Before all other wind instruments, the trombone is especially good for use in all kinds of combinations and ensembles, for it can be made to produce every tone a little sharp or flat. This is accomplished not only by the attaching or removal of crooks (crommettes) or other detachable tube sections (polettes), but also just with the lips and breath; for a skilled trombone player is able to modify the pitch of every chromatic tone of the range by means of his embouchure and mouth-piece, and without making use of crooks. This cannot be brought about on instruments with finger holes.\textsuperscript{15}

\textsuperscript{13}Bate, op. cit., pp. 216-217.


\textsuperscript{15}Ibid., p. 32.
Toward the end of the seventeenth century another trombone was added to the four types listed by Praetorius; this was called a "treble" trombone and was pitched the interval of a fourth or fifth higher than the alto (discant) trombone. The treble trombone was pitched one octave higher than the tenor trombone; thus the trombone choir (soprano, alto, tenor, bass, and contrabass) was complete by the end of the seventeenth century. It should be noted that the contrabass trombone was not mentioned before 1618. This instrument was quite large and was difficult to blow and to manipulate; a practical contrabass trombone was not developed until the nineteenth century.

An important orchestral function of the trombone was its use in opera by composers of the seventeenth century; two such composers were Monteverdi and Cesti. Monteverdi's opera Orfeo, performed at Mantua in 1607, employed a large orchestra containing five trombones. The use of five trombones by Monteverdi was not typical of that age; Monteverdi seems quite advanced when compared with his contemporaries.

---

16Carse, Musical Wind Instruments, p. 253.
17Sachs, op. cit., p. 326.
In *Orfeo*, Monteverdi used the instruments in small combinations instead of scoring them in constant tutti. The trombones were grouped with *cornetti* or the organ; furthermore, the trombones were also combined with the bass viols or double-basses.\(^1\) In Fig. 2, p. 8, an example from *Orfeo*, the trombones were combined with a regal organ\(^2\) in homophonic support of the chorus. In Fig. 3, p. 8, he scored the *tromboni* as a choir complete in itself without the aid of other instruments. Bate stated that only four trombones were employed in *Orfeo*;\(^2\) however, the "Sinfonia IV" (Fig. 3, p. 8) had five implied parts. In the preface of the score Monteverdi listed four (*quattro*) tromboni. In the third act he stated that five (*cinque*) tromboni were needed in certain passages of this act.

Gacchini used four trombones in several *ritornelli* in the opera *La Liberazione di Ruggiero dall'Isola d'Alcina*\(^2\) (1625), and Cesti employed the trombone in certain

---

\(^1\)Carse, *History of Orchestration*, p. 40.


\(^2\)Bate, *op. cit.*, p. 217.

Fig. 2--Monteverdi, Orfeo, Act III, "Coro di Spiriti Infernali," measures 512-516.

Fig. 3--Monteverdi, Orfeo, Act III, "Sinfonia IV," measures 167-171.
movements of *Il Pomo d'Oro* (1667). Speaking of the seventeenth-century opera composers, Carse states the following:

It seems strange that composers should have for so long neglected to make more use of trombones in their opera orchestras. While constantly struggling with the imperfections of natural horns and trumpets, they only began to include trombones in opera scores with any regularity after the middle of the eighteenth century and kept them out of the concert orchestra till some time after the beginning of the next century.24

The sound of the trombone in the seventeenth century was very mellow and soft as compared to that of today, these qualities being the result of very small bell flares25 and thick metal tubing. The soft, mellow tone of the seventeenth-century trombone blended well with voices, which justified its use in operas and oratorios of this period.26

The style of Giovanni Gabrieli was carried into the Baroque by his pupil Heinrich Schütz (1585-1672). Schütz was one of the first Germans to combine wind instruments

---


24 Ibid., pp. 18-19.

25 Bate, op. cit., p. 8. See Plate VIII-A and B for a photographic reproduction of two seventeenth-century trombones.

with voices. In his *Christmas Oratorio* (1664) Schütz used two trombones in the orchestral accompaniment. In the "Intermedium V" from this work, the trombones were scored as a descant against the four bass voices:

![Musical notation](image)

Fig. 4—Schütz, *Christmas Oratorio*, "Intermedium V," measures 1-6.

---

Fig. 5—Schütz, Christmas Oratorio, "Intermedium V," measures 7-11.

After the basses enter (Fig. 4, measure 6), the trombones and voices move together in homophonic style; however, the trombones do not double the voice parts exactly. In the "Conclusion" the trombones double the strings (Fig. 6, p. 12). In Fig. 6 the first trombone doubles the viola exactly while the second trombone mainly doubles the second violin an octave lower.
Beschluß
der Geburt unseres Herrn und Seligmachers Jesu Christi
instrumentaliter concertat ab 8:
Chorus 4 Vocum in Complemento cum 4 Instrumentis.

Fig. 6—Schütz, Christmas Oratorio, "Conclusion," measures 1-6.
Dietrich Buxtehude's employment of the trombone was similar to that of Gabrieli and Schütz. In his compositions he normally paired the trombones with another instrument (usually a tenor stringed instrument) for a complete movement (Fig. 7, p. 14); however, he seemed to have little concern for the individual tone quality of each instrument. His style was essentially a choral style that he adapted to instruments. One interesting point about Buxtehude's orchestration was his use of trumpets and trombones "in sordini."\(^2\)

During the Baroque very few physical changes were made in the trombone. The standard family of trombones in the Baroque was composed of the alto, tenor, and bass trombones; and these instruments usually doubled the contralto, tenor, and bass voices when used to reinforce voice parts.\(^2\) The soprano (discant) voice was doubled by the cornetti or the slide trumpet.\(^3\)

The utilization of trombones changed very little from the time of Monteverdi to the time of Bach. Bach used the

\(^2\)Ibid., pp. 109-110.


\(^3\)Anthony Baines, "Trumpet," *Grove's Dictionary of Music and Musicians* (London, 1954), VIII, 567. The slide trumpet is a natural trumpet that has been provided with a slide similar to the trombone slide. The slide filled some of the gaps in the natural overtone series.
Fig. 7—Buxtehude, Ihr Lieben Christen Freut Euch

Nun, "Chorus No. 3," measures 1-6.
trombone in a very conservative manner, mainly to reinforce voice parts in his cantatas.\textsuperscript{31} Bach scored the trombones as a choir of three or four trombones, and the use of a single trombone part was quite infrequent in his music. Terry states the following concerning Bach's utilization of the trombone: "Bach's employment of it was timid and consistent."\textsuperscript{32}

Bach used the trombones in only fifteen of the cantatas, and the trombone appears nowhere else in his music. In twelve of the cantatas he employed the trombones to double each voice part. In \textit{Cantata No. 2} the four trombones double the four voice parts exactly (see Fig. 8, p. 16 and Fig. 9, p. 17); however, in \textit{Cantatas Nos. 25, 118, and 135} he departed from the typical usage and gave the trombones parts separate from those of the chorus. In \textit{Cantatas Nos. 25 and 118} the trombones were given a harmonized chorale, and in \textit{Cantata No. 135} a trombone supplemented the continuo in the cantus of a chorale.\textsuperscript{33} To summarize Bach's use of this instrument, Terry states: "Of its orchestral capabilities, which Mozart and Beethoven were soon to reveal, there is in his scores no glimmer of recognition."\textsuperscript{34}

\textsuperscript{31}Bate, \textit{op. cit.}, p. 218.
\textsuperscript{33}Ibid., pp. 40-41.
\textsuperscript{34}Ibid., p. 41.
Ach Gott, vom Himmel sieh dar ein und laß dich's doch
Ah God, in mercy look from heav'n and save us by

Fig. 8—Bach, Cantata No. 2, measures 1-14
Fig. 9—Bach, Cantata No. 2, measures 15-19

Georg Friedrich Handel used the trombone mainly in the oratorio orchestra. Bate states this about Handel's use of the trombone:

With Handel the use of the trombone is rather more "orchestral" though still infrequent. He may, we suspect, have had some difficulty from time to time in finding competent players, and certainly after his day the instrument was for some long while to be found only in private bands under Royal or noble patronage. 35

35 Bate, op. cit., p. 218.
It is noted that trombone parts were omitted in the early editions of Handel's *Saul* and *Israel in Egypt*; however, trombone parts were included in the *Handel-Gesellschaft* editions of these works because of the research done by the editor, Chrysander. It was very common in this period to place the trombone parts in an appendix of the full score. Their use would be *ad libitum*; they could therefore be included at the discretion of the conductor. This practice continued into the early nineteenth century before the trombones were given a permanent place in the orchestra score.\(^36\) Neither Bach nor Handel used the full potential of the trombone. Both of these composers seemed to be engrossed in writing clarion parts for the trumpet, which might be the reason for the neglect of the trombone in their works.\(^37\)

During the late Baroque the trombone was also found in the United States of America. In 1746 the Moravian colony in Pennsylvania acquired a consort of trombones (soprano, alto, tenor, and bass). The Moravian trombone choir performed at weddings, pageants, funerals, church, and community affairs; however it had as its model the seventeenth-century German *Stadtpfeiffer* (town pipers).

\(^{36}\)Hate, *op. cit.*, p. 218.

Performing from the church belfry on Easter morning was the most important musical service of the year, and the trombone choir was selected to fulfill this occasion.38

In the Baroque period the trombone was restricted to music of the church or to music for special occasions such as the opera.39 Carse states the following concerning the use of this instrument in the eighteenth century: "Until the close of the 18th century the trombone was hardly what we would now call an orchestral instrument."40 It was not until the last half of the eighteenth century that the trombone was given important parts in operas by two composers, Gluck and Mozart; furthermore, the military bands finally adopted the trombone.41 This instrument did not appear in the military band until the last decade of the eighteenth century. Two reasons were given for such a late usage in the military bands: (1) the trombone was difficult to manipulate while marching, owing to its awkward hand slide; (2) the trombone, by tradition, was employed only at church or court functions.42

39 Geiringer, op. cit., p. 179.
40 Carse, Musical Wind Instruments, p. 256.
In England (1784) a commemoration was planned to honor Handel. Burney stated that in order to fill the huge Westminster Abbey a large orchestra containing several trombonists was to be employed. The trombone had not been used in England for many years, and a search was started in England and on the Continent for trombonists. After much searching it was finally discovered that his Majesty's military band contained six musicians who played the three different types of trombones (tenor, bass, and double bass).\textsuperscript{43} Farmer stated that the military bands caused a revival in the utilization of the trombone late in eighteenth-century England.\textsuperscript{44}

The standard choir of trombones used in the Classical period was composed of the Eb alto, the Bb tenor, and the Eb or F bass; and little change in construction was made during this period except for a few odd changes called for by the military bands. One such change was a backward facing bell which allowed the troops marching in the rear to hear the band.\textsuperscript{45}

Concerning the trombone's use in the Classic opera,


\textsuperscript{44}Farmer, \textit{op. cit.}, p. 64.

\textsuperscript{45}Geiringer, \textit{op. cit.}, pp. 179-180.
Bekker states:

The action in opera also influenced the organization of the orchestra. It sometimes required unusual instruments, like the trombone, use of which in the concert orchestra was not customary. When Gluck wanted to portray an oracle, the sacred sound of the trombones proved to be the only instrumental color suitable to the words of the singing god, as they were to the voices of the Dieu infirnaux in Alcestes. A similar need induced Mozart to employ the trombone in Don Giovanni, where they characterized the appearance of the commander's ghost, and in The Magic Flute where they represent the solemn calls of the priests.46

Until the time of Gluck the trombone was used to reinforce voice parts or to strengthen the ensemble in tutti passages. Gluck admired the tone quality of the trombone section; hence he gave this section important parts in his operas.47 He utilized the alto, tenor, and bass trombones as a harmonic background, scoring them in closed position; their parts were written quite high when compared to the normal range of the trombone (see Fig. 10, p. 22).48

Note in Fig. 10 that the bass trombone did not usually have the lowest tone of the chord; instead, it was placed on one of the higher chord tones, giving the bass tone to

47 Schwartz, op. cit., p. 214.
48 Carse, History of Orchestration, p. 159.
Fig. 10—Gluck, Iphigenie auf Tauris, Act III, Scene iv, "Recitativo," measures 4-9.

the bassoon, celli, and bass viols. This employment of the bass trombone was typical with Gluck.49 In the following...

49 Schwartz, op. cit., p. 214.
example the trombones are used as a harmonic background; however they are placed in open position:

Fig. 11- Gluck, Iphigenie auf Tauris, Act II, Scene iv, "Anime," measures 11-20.
Gluck's style of trombone writing set the pattern for composers of future generations and is still in use at the present time.\footnote{Schwartz, op. cit., p. 214.} He also scored passages for unison trombones, but it was the custom of the day to play this instrument much softer than is done today. These unison parts probably did not become overpowering since early trombone players did not play above a present-day mezzo-forte.\footnote{Carse, History of Orchestration, p. 159.}

During the Haydn-Mozart era the trombones were still confined to operas, oratorios, and Masses. These three types of compositions were associated with the church, the state, or the privately owned theater; but in the concert orchestra the trombone was still unknown. Neither Haydn nor Mozart used this instrument in their symphonies.\footnote{Bate, op. cit., p. 219.}

In his operas Mozart needed different instruments to express or illustrate words, moods, and feelings; thus in the opera Don Giovanni the trombones were employed to represent the Commander's Ghost (see Fig. 12, p. 25):\footnote{Bekker, op. cit., p. 85.}
Fig. 12—Mozart, Don Giovanni, Act II, Scene xv, "Andante," measures 1–7.
He also attempted to use the wind instruments on a part which was not doubled by the strings:

Fig. 13--Mozart, Don Giovanni, Act II, Scene xi, "Adagio," measures 1-12.
Mozart used some carefully contrived blends of tone color, combining such colorful instruments as bassoons, basset horns,\(^5\) and trombones:\(^6\)


\(^5\)The basset horn is a tenor clarinet in F.

Haydn used the trombone in The *Creation* and The *Seasons*; however, these two works were not primarily vocal works when compared with the oratorios of Georg Friedrich Handel. Haydn's oratorios were mainly orchestral works enhanced by a chorus and soloists. 56 Like Mozart, he gave the trombones an independent part instead of using them to double the strings or voices (see Fig. 15, p. 29).

In the eighteenth century the trombones were utilized in opera, oratorios, Masses, and military music; but its use in the symphonic orchestra was yet to come. This instrument had to wait until the Symphony No. 5 of Ludwig van Beethoven before it became established as an orchestral instrument.

56 Bekker, *op. cit.*, p. 49.
Fig. 15—Haydn, The Creation, "Chorus No. 28," measures 1-3.
CHAPTER II

THE USE OF THE TROMBONE IN BEETHOVEN'S
FIFTH, SIXTH, AND NINTH SYMPHONIES

At the beginning of the nineteenth century, the standard orchestral trombone section in Germany consisted of an alto trombone in Eb, a tenor trombone in Bb, and a bass trombone in F. The French and Italian composers used only a pair of tenor trombones and no alto or bass trombones. Later in this century the alto trombone was to become extinct, being replaced by a tenor trombone; thus the orchestra consisted of two tenors and a bass trombone. This is the normal symphonic trombone section which is still used at the present time.¹ The function of the trombone section remained almost unchanged from its usage in eighteenth-century opera. Trombones were employed mainly for harmonic support; however they occasionally reinforced a bass melody when suitable.²

Ludwig van Beethoven was very fond of the trombone, having written the Three Egalon for Four Trombones (this work was performed at his funeral by a choir of trombones).

¹Carse, History of Orchestration, p. 218.
²Ibid., pp. 229-230.
Having been bound by the custom of the time which permitted the trombone to be used only in opera and court music, Beethoven did not employ them in the first four symphonies. The first symphonic utilization of the trombone came in 1808 in his Symphony No. 5 in C Minor. Trombones were also employed in the Symphony No. 6 in F Major; however in this symphony only a pair was used. The only remaining symphony to employ the trombones was the Symphony No. 9 in D Minor which contained parts for alto, tenor, and bass trombones.

Schwartz makes the following dramatic statement concerning the trombones' initial appearance in the fourth movement of the Symphony No. 5:

Developing this marvelous musical structure, theme following theme, Beethoven seems not to need trombones. Through three movements he gives utterance to the greatest of his musical thoughts without once bringing in trombones. But after a prolonged pianissimo of strings and tympani, when the air is supercharged with electric expectancy, suddenly there is a twitch of the strings, a change of rhythm, and the theme of triumphant joy for the fourth movement is stated in one of the most remarkable passages in all music. Then apparently Beethoven seemed to realize the inadequacy of all other instruments or combinations of instruments to express the exultant joy which surged in his thoughts and soul. What a triumphal entry for any instrument into the symphony! Although few instruments have been shut out from the symphony so long, no other instrument has ever had such a triumphal entry into these exclusive ranks. After this sensational debut, it is no wonder the trombone ever afterward found its place in the symphony secure.


4Ibid.

Figures 16 and 17 are the first eleven measures of the fourth movement; it is this entrance to which Schwartz has referred:

Fig. 16—Beethoven, Symphony No. 5, fourth movement, measures 1-5.
Fig. 17—Beethoven, Symphony No. 5, fourth movement, measures 6-11.

In Fig. 16, p. 32, the trombones doubled the horns in measures one to four except for the first note which has them doubling the trumpets. In measure three the second
trombone part contained an F while the horns and trumpets played a G. This F could not be played by natural horns or trumpets; therefore this note was given to the trombones. It needed to be sounded very powerfully since it was the seventh of the chord. Beethoven used the bass trombone to duplicate the bass part except in bar eight (Fig. 17, p. 33) where he simplified the bass trombone part by omitting the eighth note run. Throughout these first eleven measures he scored the trombones in three-part harmony which strengthened the harmonic background.

Grove spoke of this section also:

At this point the whole orchestra, including the three trombones, hitherto silent, the double bassoon, and the piccolo, and the drum, all noisy elements at Beethoven's command in those simpler days, burst like a thunder-clap into the major key and into a triumphal march.

To Beethoven the brass section represented dramatic force; when he wished to reduce the sound of the orchestra, the brass section was the first to be eliminated from the score. His handling of the brass instruments was not welcomed by all critics. "Spohr could not endure the 'unmeaning noise' of the finale of the Fifth Symphony."

---


7 Ibid.


Beethoven also employed the trombones to emphasize rhythmic accents:

**Fig. 18—Beethoven, Symphony No. 5, fourth movement, measures 122-126.**
In Fig. 18, p. 35, the trombones played *forte* chords on the first beat of each measure; and a great portion of Beethoven's orchestration used the trombones in this capacity playing what might be called "glorified timpani" parts. The trombones usually remained in the background supplying the harmonic foundation and the rhythmic pulse; however, they were occasionally scored on important bass melodies:

Fig. 19—Beethoven, *Symphony No. 5*, fourth movement, measures 112-116.
In Fig. 19, p. 36, the short motive was doubled by the bassoons, and in measure 115, the horn was also added. This short motive played by the trombones, bassoons, and horns comes from the 'cello accompaniment to the second subject.\footnote{Theodore Thomas and Fredrick Stock, \textit{Talks About Beethoven's Symphonies}, edited by Rose Fay Thomas (New York, 1930), pp. 87-88.}

![music notation]

Fig. 20--Beethoven, \textit{Symphony No. 5}, fourth movement, second subject, measures 46-48.

For the closing theme of the recapitulation, Beethoven used the alto and tenor trombones to double this theme in octaves,\footnote{Ibid., p. 80.} while the bass trombone doubled the 'cello and
contrabass part:

Fig. 21—Beethoven, Symphony No. 5, fourth movement, measures 279-284.

In Fig. 22, p. 39, the trombones were utilized to strengthen the ensemble which was building to a climax before entering the coda. The tenor and alto trombones were scored in
octaves to bring forth the dissonance of the diminished chords in measures 289, 291, and 292:

Fig. 22—Beethoven, Symphony No. 5, fourth movement, measures 285-293.

The alto trombone was in its most powerful range while being doubled by the tenor an octave lower; thus this chromatic
trombone line was very powerful and prominent.

In summary of the *Fifth Symphony* the trombones were used for: (1) a harmonic foundation in the tuttis and climaxes; (2) rhythmic stress; (3) occasional melodies, but usually doubled by other instruments. The trombones were always marked *forte or fortissimo*; and if a diminuendo came, they were removed from the orchestration:

![Musical notation](image)

**Fig. 23**—Beethoven, *Symphony No. 5*, fourth movement, measures 330-335.

The trombones were scored in *three-part harmony*, in both closed and open positions. Unisons and octaves were also
utilized especially on melodic phrases or important parts which needed emphasis. The bass trombone doubled the bass part; modifications were made when fast notes or repeated notes occurred in this part. Bekker stated the following concerning the employment of the brass section in the Fifth Symphony: "The brass is used in complete groups with all the effects of splendour which is peculiar to it."\(^\text{12}\) In the finale Beethoven wanted to reinforce the volume of sound; thus he added the trombone which symbolized majestic greatness to him.\(^\text{13}\)

Beethoven's Symphony No. 6

The next Beethoven symphony to use trombones was the Symphony No. 6 in F Major (Pastorale). This symphony, composed in 1807 and 1808, and the Symphony No. 5, composed from 1805 to 1807, were first performed on December 22, 1808.\(^\text{14}\) In the Symphony No. 6 only one alto and one tenor trombone were employed. In this type of scoring the trombones were unable to form complete chords by themselves; and Beethoven used just two trombones because he did not want them to stand out or weigh too heavily on the ensemble. The entire symphony was written and orchestrated in a light


\(^{13}\)Ibid.

\(^{14}\)Thomas and Stock, *op. cit.*, pp. 76 and 92.
style; thus three trombones would have dominated while two blended perfectly.\textsuperscript{15}

The trombones were not used until the end of the fourth movement, "The Storm." Hector Berlioz declared: "Then, the trombones burst forth, the thunder of the kettledrums becomes redoubled in violence, it is no longer merely rain and wind, but an awful cataclysm, the universal deluge— the end of the world."\textsuperscript{16} Fig. 24, p. 43, shows the entrance that Berlioz is referring to in the above quote; and the storm scene continues in Fig. 25, p. 44. In this passage (Fig. 24 and 25) the trombones were scored in octaves to support the \textit{fortissimo} diminished seventh chord which represented the violent storm taking place in this movement.


Fig. 24—Beethoven, Symphony No. 6, fourth movement, measures 103-106.
Fig. 25--Beethoven, *Symphony No. 6*, fourth movement, measures 107-109.
In the fifth movement Beethoven continued to use the pair of trombones:

Fig. 26—Beethoven, Symphony No. 6, fifth movement, measures 52-56.

In Fig. 26 the trombones were utilized to supply harmonic emphasis to the main theme being played by the first violins and clarinets. In measure 54 the alto trombone doubled the
first bassoon at the octave while the tenor trombone doubled the second trumpet, and then in measure 55 the tenor trombone moved to an octave doubling of the bass tone. Later in this movement the trombones were spread apart two octaves:

Fig. 27—Beethoven, Symphony No. 6, fifth movement, measures 225-230.
By measure 230 (Fig. 27, p. 46) they finally reach a closed position. In the Sixth Symphony Beethoven made very limited use of the trombones, employing them strictly for harmonic support, and not giving them any melodic function. It appeared that he was afraid to delegate to the trombones an important role in this symphony, feeling that they would dominate in this lightly scored work.17

Beethoven's Symphony No. 9

Beethoven seemed to have abandoned the trombones after the Fifth and Sixth Symphonies. Sixteen years after the Fifth Symphony, in 1824, he again used the trombones in a symphonic composition, the Ninth Symphony.18 Schwartz stated the following reasons for utilizing the trombones in this symphony:

Probably the reason for using trombones in this orchestration was that he was writing for an extra-large orchestra. Or, more probably, he felt this "Ode to Joy" theme required the peculiar talents of trombones. In any event, three trombones were used.19

In the first movement Beethoven did not exploit the trombones; in the second movement scherzo they were used in a limited manner. The first trombone entrance did not come until the Trio of the scherzo, and Vaughan Williams

17 Gevaert, op. cit., p. 255.
18 Schwartz, op. cit., p. 219.
19 Ibid.
spoke very candidly about this entrance: "A blare on the trombone, its first appearance, announces a new section and a new theme: in technical language the 'Trio' of the scherzo." Only the bass trombone appeared in this first entrance:

Fig. 28—Beethoven, Symphony No. 9, second movement, measures 408-415.

---

20 Ralph Vaughan Williams, Beethoven's Choral Symphony (London, 1953), p. 34.
Grove also spoke about this entrance (Fig. 28): "The bass trombone wakes up from its long sleep and utters its first note, a high D, fortissimo, to welcome it (the Trio)." 21

Later in the Trio the bass trombone doubled a running bass line. The bass trombonist was given several places to breathe; thus he did not play every note but mainly on the strong beats of this rapid passage:

![Musical score image]

Fig. 29—Beethoven, Symphony No. 2, second movement, measures 483-490.

21 Grove, Beethoven and his Nine Symphonies, p. 359.
Immediately after the preceding passage (Fig. 29, p. 49) the bass trombone doubled the 'celli, violas, and clarinets:

Fig. 30—Beethoven, Symphony No. 2, second movement, measures 491-498.
The melody which the bass trombone sounded (see Fig. 30, p. 50) was the main theme of the Trio:

Fig. 31--Beethoven, Symphony No. 2, second movement, main theme of Trio, measures 414-418.

It is not until measure 501 of the scherzo that all three trombones were employed (see Fig. 32, p. 52). Grove declared the following concerning this entrance (Fig. 32):

In the Coda---after the repetition of the first portion of the Trio---the whole orchestra comes into play; and the effect of a great crescendo and diminuendo, with the grand clang of horns and trombones, and trumpets in low register (somewhat unusual with Beethoven), is truly splendid.23

22 Thomas and Stock, op. cit., p. 194.

23 Grove, Beethoven and his Nine Symphonies, p. 361.
Beethoven kept the trombones playing during the diminuendo; however, he removed the alto and tenor in measure 507, leaving the bass trombone to double the 'cello on the strong beats of the measures 507-509. At the end of the
Trio the trombones were again utilized at a diminuendo, playing pianissimo octaves:

Fig. 33—Beethoven, Symphony No. 2, second movement, measures 523-530.
The trombones were not employed in the third movement; Beethoven waited until the Choral Finale—Schiller's Ode to Joy—before he used them again. In the fourth movement the trombones remained silent for 594 measures until the bass trombone was finally sounded in the No. 3 Chorus. Vaughan Williams states: "Then the trombones sound (for the first time since the scherzo) and the men's voices declare the brotherhood of man." The bass trombone doubled the men's voices in unison for the first eight measures:

---

**Fig. 34**—Beethoven, Symphony No. 2, fourth movement, "Chorus No. 3," measures 594-601.

24 Vaughan Williams, op. cit., p. 47.

25 Grove, Beethoven and his Nine Symphonies, p. 384.
The theme stated by the men's voices and the trombone (Fig. 34, p. 54) is the second theme of this movement; several measures later the tenor and the bass trombones were again used to double the men's voices:

![Musical notation]

Fig. 35—Beethoven, Symphony No. 9, fourth movement, "Chorus No. 3," measures 611-617.

In this example the bass trombone doubled the melody an octave lower while the tenor trombone doubled the voices at the unison.

In Chorus No. 4 the trombone supported the second theme of the fourth movement (see Fig. 36, p. 56). The second theme, stated by the clarinets, trumpet, alto voices, second violins, and the trombone, was combined contrapuntally with the first theme stated by the flutes, oboes, and soprano voices (see Fig. 36, p. 56). This chorus

---


27 Grove, Beethoven and his Nine Symphonies, p. 385.

28 Moore and Heger, op. cit., p. 45.
continues, the trombones being used to double the alto, tenor, and bass voice parts (see Fig. 37, p. 57). Throughout this movement, Beethoven employed the trombones in much
the same manner as did the Baroque composers. Bach and Schütz also used these instruments to reinforce the voice parts as did Beethoven in this fourth movement.
In the coda Beethoven scored very heavily and used a large number of instruments. Grove stated the following concerning the instrumentation of the coda: "The noisy military instruments here re-appear in the score." Grove must have been referring to the enlarged percussion section plus the complete brass section present in the coda.

Beethoven continued to reinforce the alto, tenor, and bass voices with the trombones (see Fig. 38, p. 59); furthermore, these instruments returned to a rhythmic function, usually placing emphasis on the strong beats (see Fig. 39, p. 60). In the final twenty measures the orchestra alone concluded the movement, and the trombones continued to supply harmonic punctuations on the strong beats until the final chord.

Looking at the three Beethoven symphonies containing trombone parts, it must be noted that the trombones were most often used in tutti passages marked forte or fortissimo. When scored forte in three-part harmony, they gave an expression of heroic pomp, majesty, and loftiness. In this style of writing the trombones acquired the quality of trumpets and produced a very proclaiming sound; thus Beethoven used the trombones in such grand and pompous movements as the finale of the Fifth Symphony, the fourth


Fig. 38—Beethoven, *Symphony No. 9*, fourth movement, "Chorus No. 6," measures 879-883.
Fig. 39—Beethoven, Symphony No. 9, fourth movement, "Chorus No. 6," measures 859-863.
movement of the Ninth Symphony, and the violent thunderstorm in the Sixth Symphony.

In the three symphonies studied, the trombones were used to (1) function as tympani, whereby they supplied harmonic and rhythmic punctuations on the strong beats of the measure; (2) increase the sound in a climactic passage; (3) occasionally double a melody; (4) double voice parts as in the Ninth Symphony. Very little use was made of the trombones in piano passages, and the most important melodic role for the trombone came in the fourth movement of the Ninth Symphony where it doubled the voice parts. Only when the trombone was utilized to double voice parts did Beethoven score interesting melodic parts for it. The trombones were employed in only three symphonies; however these symphonies were of a character which fully utilized the trombones' heroic and majestic qualities. It would be a great mistake to use the trombones in other Beethoven symphonies not already scored for them as Harty stated:

Many instruments of the orchestra have undergone change since Beethoven's time except the trombone. It is the only instrument that has not altered in timbre because its mechanism hasn't changed. It is no improvement but a horrible atrocity to introduce trombones into scores of Beethoven where they do not already exist...

CHAPTER III

THE USE OF THE TROMBONE IN SCHUBERT'S UNFINISHED SYMPHONY

During the first twenty-five years of the nineteenth century the trombone became an increasingly important member of the symphony orchestra. Both Beethoven and Schubert used a trio of trombones consisting of an alto, tenor, and bass;¹ and toward the middle of the nineteenth century the alto trombone fell into disuse because of its shrill tone quality.² The contrabass trombone was revived in the early years of the nineteenth century. It had fallen into obscurity in the seventeenth century because a practical model could not be produced. It must be remembered that the seventeenth-century contrabass trombone was twice the size of a Bb tenor trombone and was very difficult to manipulate; consequently in 1816, Gottfried Weber suggested that a contrabass trombone be built with a double slide mechanism.³ With the use of a double slide, the

¹Geiringer, op. cit., pp. 238-239.
²Sachs, op. cit., pp. 326-327.
³Ibid.
contrabass trombone was more compact in size; and in Paris (1830) Halary built a contrabass trombone with a double hand slide mechanism.\(^4\) The *quart* and *quint* bass trombones were also abandoned in favor of the German invented *tenor-bass* trombone in Bb-F. This trombone used a thumb valve to lower the fundamental pitch the interval of a perfect fourth.\(^5\)

During the first half of the nineteenth century, two trombone virtuosi, Carl Trougott Queisser and Fredrick August Belcke became very popular in Leipzig and Berlin. Belcke was also involved with some improvements of the bass trombone during 1829, including the addition of a thumb valve to change the key of the bass trombone. The instrument used by Queisser was a *wide-bore* Eb trombone similar to the present day Bb tenor (large bore). Belcke probably performed on the bass trombone in F; but later, he switched to the Bb instrument. In 1839 it was announced that Carl Queisser had tested a new attachment that would allow the pitches of low Eb, D, and C to be played merely by pressing the left thumb; therefore this device meant that the *quart* and *quint* trombones could now be replaced by a trombone

\(^4\)Geiringer, *op. cit.*, pp. 238-239. See Bate, *The Trumpet and the Trombone*, p. 53, Fig. 15a, for a drawing of the contrabass trombone produced by Halary of Paris.

with a thumb valve. This new trombone was called a trombone with quartventil.6

The careers of these men were made known by a music newspaper in Leipzig, the Allgemeine musikalische Zeitung; there were many articles and reviews written in this paper concerning Belcke and Queisser. These men lived during the period of great virtuosos such as Paganini and Liszt, and these two trombonists were taken just as seriously as any other virtuosos. The great popularity of the trombone started in France at the turn of the century (1800) and spread throughout Europe, and by 1830 the trombone was also in great demand in France and Germany. A work could hardly be performed without trombones, even if the original score did not call for them; however, after the death of Queisser in 1846, the trombone rapidly disappeared from the solo scene.7

The trombone continued to be used in the symphonic medium; hence the other composers who followed Beethoven, such as Schubert and Schumann, accepted the trombone as a regular member of the symphony orchestra.8 In his early symphonies Schubert used basically the Classical orchestra of the Haydn-Mozart period. The orchestra of the early

---

6 Mary Hasmussen, "Two Early Nineteenth-Century Trombone Virtuosi," Brass Quarterly, V (Fall, 1961), 3-12.
7 Ibid., pp. 12-17.
8 Schwartz, op. cit., p. 219.
Schubert period contained strings, usually pairs of winds, two horns, two trumpets, and timpani; however, in the late symphonies Schubert employed three trombones. Prout stated: "Schubert had a great predilection for the trombones, which he mostly treated with extreme felicity." The trombones were used much earlier in his concert overtures, such as the D major Overture written before 1812.

In Schubert's symphonic works the themes were not developed. Instead, they were lyric song melodies which needed a great deal of repetition instead of development; these repetitions were also needed to bring forth an illusion of symphonic action. For this purpose he favored the woodwinds, the horns, and the mysterious colors of the trombones. In the late symphonies the trombones were used to sustain soft harmonic backgrounds which, heretofore, had been very uncommon. They were also employed to add intensity to certain chords and to build climaxes.

The first Schubert symphony scored for trombones was the Symphony No. 8 "Unfinished" in B minor. This work was

---


11 Abraham, op. cit., p. 34.


begun on October 30, 1822; however Schubert completed only two movements plus one page of a third movement (scherzo). In November of 1822 he set this work aside and never returned to finish it; the work was not performed until December 17, 1865.14

In the first movement of the Symphony No. 8 Schubert made considerable use of the trombone section. Here he followed the example set by Beethoven, employing the trombones to add intensity to tutti passages (see Fig. 40, p. 67). This was an excellent place to use the trombones, since he had placed a measure of silence in bar 62. A G tonic major chord is expected; instead, a C minor chord was blared out by the entire orchestra strengthened by the trombones. This was followed by a series of agitated chords (see Fig. 41, p. 68).

Fig. 40—Schubert, *Symphony No. 8*, first movement, measures 58-67.
Fig. 41--Schubert, Symphony No. 8, first movement, measures 68-74.
These chords (see Fig. 41, p. 68) contrasted very sharply with the lyrical second subject:

\[ \text{Fig. 42--Schubert, Symphony No. 8, first movement, second subject, measures 44-47.} \]

In this agitated passage (Fig. 40 and 41) the bass trombone and the first trombone were used in octaves; together they reinforced the basses and celli. The complete trombone section was scored in a very powerful register, which brought great force upon this fortissimo passage. Daubeny stated that in double forte passages the trombone's tone became noble and arresting in the register which was utilized in this passage (Fig. 40 and 41). 16

Occasionally Schubert scored the trombones on syncopated rhythms instead of restricting them to timpani-styled parts (see Fig. 43, p. 70). In this example (Fig. 43) the first and second trombones were combined with the

16 Daubeny, op. cit., pp. 97-98.
Fig. 43—Schubert, Symphony No. 8, first movement, measures 31-37.

clarinets and horns. The flutes and oboes sounded the syncopated figure which was then answered by the trombones, horns, and clarinets. The syncopated figure played by the
trombone came from the accompaniment to the second subject (see Fig. 42). The bass trombone was scored on a simplified version of the bass part until measure 85; however, in this passage the trombones were not scored together as a section since the bass trombone had a part independent from the first and second trombones.

Schubert's scoring of trombones on soft chords was particularly novel and effective:

Fig. 44—Schubert, Symphony No. 8, first movement, measures 110-114.

17 A. Brent Smith, Schubert: 1. The Symphonies (London, 1926), p. 34.

18 Carse, History of Orchestration, p. 229.
The trombones were scored in open position and at a pianissimo dynamic, even calling for a diminuendo. In this passage (Fig. 44) he has shown that the trombones need not always be scored forte in order to be effective or useful.

Important melodies were also given to the trombones; thus in the development section the main theme recurred in the bass trombone part:

Fig. 45—Schubert, Symphony No. 8, first movement, measures 168-176.
Leibowitz and Maguire declared the following concerning this passage (Fig. 45): "The pedal effects are carried out by the brass; however, the third trombone participates in the unison melody."\(^{(19)}\) In measure 176 the whole trombone section announced the main theme doubled by the 'celli and basses:

Fig. 46—Schubert, Symphony No. 8, first movement, main theme, measures 176-182.

The following example again illustrates the pianissimo usage of the trombones (see Fig. 47, p. 74). These two chords are scored in closed position for the trombones and in the lower range of the instrument. According to Daubeny, when the trombones are scored pianissimo in minor, great gloom and sadness is portrayed.\(^{(20)}\) Also note that the upper strings do not double the winds on these chords; thus

---


\(^{(20)}\) Daubeny, *op. cit.*, pp. 97-98.
Fig. 47—Schubert, Symphony No. 8, first movement, measures 333-345.

Schubert is not afraid to use the winds by themselves, even in a delicate passage such as the above example.
In the second movement Schubert continued to employ the trombones. In their first entrance of this movement the first and second trombones were used in a melodic capacity. The woodwinds doubled the first and second trombones while the bass trombone doubled the unison strings.  

Fig. 48--Schubert, Symphony No. 5, second movement, measures 32-42.

21 Smith, op. cit., p. 41.
The melody was scored in the second trombone part while the first trombone moved in parallel sixths and thirds to the melody line. Again, the trombones were scored in their most powerful registers. Later, the entire trombone section was utilized in an elaborate contrapuntal treatment of the second subject: 22 (Also see Fig. 50, p. 77.)

Fig. 49—Schubert, Symphony No. 8, second movement, measures 91-97.

22 Ibid., p. 44.
The trombones, 'celli, basses, and bassoons stated the second theme in octaves while the violins supplied the counterpoint. In bar 103 (see Fig. 50) note that the first
and second trombones were employed on short, sforzando chords while the bass trombone repeated the second theme. The scoring of the trombones on short, detached chords was also an innovation of Schubert. 23

Schubert occasionally used the bass trombone as the bass of a woodwind choir:

![Music notation image]

Fig. 51—Schubert, Symphony No. 3, second movement, measures 116-123.

In this example the bass trombone supplied a bass part for the flutes, oboes, and bassoons, again at the dynamic level of piano. In the coda the bass trombone was again utilized to support the woodwinds (see Fig. 52, p. 79); in fact,

23 Eate, op. cit., p. 219.
Fig. 52--Schubert, Symphony No. 8, second movement, measures 286-290.

this passage called upon the bass trombonist to play a
triple piano. Smith declared the following concerning this
utilization of the bass trombone (Fig. 52).

What a daring orchestration is there in this passage!-
two clarinets, two bassoons, supported by the third
trombone, an instrument hitherto regarded rather as a
navvy [unskilled], very good for hard work but out of
place in the conversations of gentlefolk. And how
convincingly Schubert disproves that fallacy.  

\[24\]Smith, op. cit. p. 43.
Schubert made several advancements in the symphonic usage of the trombone section. His most important contribution was the scoring of trombones on piano and pianissimo passages; heretofore, they had been restricted to forte and fortissimo employment in symphonic music.\(^{25}\) Gordon Jacob stated:

The trombone is an extremely powerful instrument and the trio of trombones gives great weight and sonority to the orchestral tutti. It is, however, a mistake to confine the trombone to loud passages. Their pianissimo is extremely effective and can be toned down to a very quiet level of sound.\(^{26}\)

Schubert also scored the trombones on short, detached chords,\(^{27}\) and he gave increased melodic roles to the trombone section. The bass trombone was also given melodic activity, and it occasionally provided the bass part of a woodwind choir.

\(^{25}\) Bate, op. cit., p. 219.

\(^{26}\) Jacob, The Elements of Orchestration, p. 59.

\(^{27}\) Bate, op. cit., p. 219.
CHAPTER IV

CONCLUSION

Beethoven made a considerable demand upon the upper range of the alto trombone player. In the Symphony No. 5 a high F was scored for the alto trombone:

\[ \text{Fig. 53--Beethoven, Symphony No. 5, fourth movement, measure 80.} \]

Here, as elsewhere, Beethoven scored the first trombone (alto) part at a higher tessitura than did Schubert. Schubert scored a conservative A as the highest alto trombone note in his Symphony No. 8:

\[ \text{Fig. 54--Schubert, Symphony No. 8, second movement, measure 238.} \]

\[ ^{1}\text{Edward Kleinhammer, Art of Trombone Playing (Evanston, 1963), p. 45.} \]
In examining the three Beethoven symphonies and the single Schubert symphony, it is evident that some progress was made by Schubert in the usage of the symphonic trombone section. Beethoven used the trombone mainly to supply rhythmic accents and to provide a harmonic background for the orchestra. This type of scoring showed little improvement over Gluck's utilization of the trombone section in the opera orchestra around 1760. In the Symphony No. 9 Beethoven even reverted to the style of trombone writing practiced by J. S. Bach and Schütz; thus in several of the choruses from the Symphony No. 9, the trombones were employed to double the voice parts in much the same manner as did Bach or Schütz. Rauscher stated the following concerning Beethoven's use of the trombone:

It is rather disheartening to examine trombone parts of old scores. So much neglect, so many ill-considered, seemingly last-minute compromises, and such a lack of consideration for the practical problems of the player are evident that one is led to think that trombonists of the past must have been social outcasts, supermen, or nonentities. Anyone who questions the validity of the last sentence need only obtain a score of Beethoven's Ninth Symphony and listen to a performance of the work while limiting his attention to the trombone part. 2

Even though Rauscher did not consider Beethoven's trombone parts overly inspiring, at least one can be thankful that Beethoven initiated the trombone into the symphony orchestra.

Schubert continued in much the same manner as Beethoven; however he did use the trombones for soft harmonic backgrounds, which was a departure from Beethoven's constant *forte* and *fortissimo* scoring. Schubert also increased the role of the bass trombone, giving this instrument more melodic activity; and it was also used as a bass for the woodwinds. Schubert also scored the trombones on independent parts which were not doubled by the other instruments of the orchestra; however Schubert is not without critics of his trombone writing in his symphonies and overtures. Abraham stated the following concerning Schubert's use of the trombones:

> The massive style of some of the concert overtures and certain portions of the last two symphonies is partly due to his frequent use of this instrument, which at times, however, leads to an overloading of the texture and thus sorely upsets the orchestral balance.³

The imbalanced condition which Abraham referred to was partly due to the fact that Schubert probably did not hear the late works performed.⁴ Other writers such as Baines were highly critical of the majority of the nineteenth-century composers' scoring for the trombones:

> Nevertheless the majority of the 19th-century composers limited themselves to a deplorably stereotyped manner of using it [the trombone] for violent reinforcement of tutti passages and, in soft passages, merely for background harmonies. Hence, thanks to the preponderance

³Abraham, *op. cit.*, p. 36.
⁴Ibid.
of 19th-century music in concert programmes today, it is with these least interesting sides of the trombone that audiences are most familiar. A more realistic view was taken by Carse, who declared the following concerning the employment of the trombone by the Romantic composers:

The idea of giving trombones independent thematic matter, although by no means unknown, was as yet underdeveloped, nor was it always successfully or confidently carried out when attempted, yet it was in this period that composers began to treat the trombone as an independent voice, and took the first steps to promote the instrument to a proper and worthy position in the organization of the orchestral body.

The primary reason for the lack of interesting parts for the trombone can be traced to one problem of the early Romantic period: "As a body the brass group still suffered greatly from the want of more flexible upper voices than could be supplied by either natural horns or trumpets; thus, the effect of unmixed brass-tone was one which was largely denied to early nineteenth-century composers." Beethoven and Schubert were simply hindered in their brass orchestration because valved trumpets and horns were not in use at this time. Because of this the fully chromatic trombone had to suffer; also, these early Romantic composers must have lacked adequate knowledge of the trombone and its potential. Players such as Queisser or Belke bear witness

---

6Carse, History of Orchestration, pp. 249-250.
7Ibid., pp. 229-230.
to the fact that there were skillful and talented performers on the trombone during the first half of the nineteenth century; such trombonists as these must have felt very bored when performing a symphonic trombone part. The trombone and the trombonist had to wait until the late nineteenth century before the trombone was adequately utilized in the symphonic score.
BIBLIOGRAPHY

Books


___________, *Orchestra of the 18th Century*, Cambridge, W. Heffer and Sons, 1940.
The Orchestra from Beethoven to Berlioz,

Daubeny, Ulric, Orchestral Wind Instruments Ancient and

Einstein, Alfred, Schubert, New York, Oxford University
Press, 1951.

Farmer, H., The Rise and Development of Military Music,
London, William Reeves, 1912.

Galpin, F. W., A Textbook of European Musical Instruments,

Gevaert, F. A., A New Treatise on Instrumentation, trans-
lated by E. F. E. Suddard, Paris, Henry Lemoine and
Co., 1910.

Grove, George, Beethoven and his Nine Symphonies, London
and New York, Novello, Ewer and Co., 1890.

Jacob, Gordon, The Elements of Orchestration, New York,
October House, 1952.

Kleinhammer, Edward, The Art of Trombone Playing, Evanston,

Kunitz, Dr. Haas, Die Instrumentation, Vol. VIII, Leipzig,
Veb Breitkopf and Hartel, 1959.

Leibowitz, Rene and Jan Maguire, Thinking for Orchestra,

Marcuse, Sibyl, Musical Instruments, Garden City, New York,

Moore, Earl and Theodore E. Heger, The Symphony and the
Symphonic Poem, Ann Arbor, Michigan, Edward Brothers,
1957.

Nettl, Paul, Beethoven Encyclopedia, New York, Philosophical
Library, 1955.

Paetkau, David H., The Growth of Instruments And Instrumental


Praetorius, Michael, Syntagma Musicum, Vol. II, translated


**Articles**


**Encyclopedia Articles**


Unpublished Materials


Scores


Beethoven, Ludwig Van, *Symphony No. 5*, London, Ernst Eulenburg, no date.

--- Symphony No. 6, London, Ernst Eulenburg, no date.

--- Symphony No. 2, London, Ernst Eulenburg, no date.


Don Giovanni, K. 527, Leipzig, Ernst Eulenburg, no date.

Schubert, Franz, Symphony No. 8 (Unfinished), London, Ernst Eulenburg, no date.

Schütz, Heinrich, Historia von der Freuden- und Gnadenreichen Geburt Gottes und Mariens Sohns (Christmas Oratorio), London, Ernst Eulenburg, no date.