THE INTIMACY OF DEATH: MAHLER’S DRAMATIC NARRATION IN

KINDERTOTENLIEDER

AnnaGrace Strange, B.M.

Thesis Prepared for the Degree of

MASTER OF MUSIC

UNIVERSITY OF NORTH TEXAS

May 2014

APPROVED:

Margaret Notley, Major Professor
Mark McKnight, Committee Member
Deanna Bush, Committee Member
Frank Heidlberger, Chair of the
Division of Music History, Theory, and
Ethnomusicology
James C. Scott, Dean of the College of
Music
Mark Wardell, Dean of the Toulouse Graduate
School

There has been relatively little scholarship to date on Mahler’s Kindertotenlieder. The writings about this song cycle that do exist primarily focus on the disparate nature of the poems and justify Kindertotenlieder as a cycle by highlighting various musical connections between the songs, such as keys and motivic continuity. Mahler, however, has unified the cycle in a much more complex and sophisticated way. His familiarity with Wagner’s music and methods, and his mastery of the human voice and orchestral voices allowed him to weave a dramatic grief-laden narrative.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

LIST OF TABLES ...........................................................................................................................v

Chapters

1. INTRODUCTION ....................................................................................................................1
   
   Paradigm Shifts
   
   Poetic and Musical Background: Kindertotenlieder’s Inception
   
   Review of Literature
   
   Wagnerian Musical Ideals
   
   Gestures in the Creation and Enhancement of Narrative in Kindertotenlieder
   
   Methodology

2. READING BETWEEN MUSICAL LINES: GRIEF, NARRATION, AND VOICE IN KINDERTOTENLIEDER .........................................................................................................................26
   
   Kindertotenlieder Texts and Mahler’s Modifications
   
   Song 1: “Nun will die somn’ so hell aufgeh’n!”
   
   Song 2: “Nun seh’ ich wohl, warum so dunkle Flammen”
   
   Song 3: “Wenn dein Mütterlein”
   
   Song 4: “Oft denk’ ich, sie sind nur ausgegangen”
   
   Song 5: “In diesem Wetter, in diesem Braus”

3. CONCLUSION ..........................................................................................................................61

BIBLIOGRAPHY ..........................................................................................................................62
# LIST OF TABLES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Nun will die Sonn’ so hell aufgeh’n</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Nun seh’ ich wohl, warum so dunkle Flammen</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Wenn dein Mütterlein</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Oft denk’ ich, sie sind nur ausgegangen</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>In diesem Wetter</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CHAPTER 1

INTRODUCTION

As one of the most prolific conductors of opera in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries, Mahler had a close knowledge of operatic repertoire and, in particular, of Richard Wagner’s music dramas. With this knowledge came a keen awareness of Wagner’s treatment of the human voice, the orchestra as voice, and his theories about these voices.\(^1\) Mahler’s use of the human voice in his symphonic works and orchestral lieder was unparalleled, and he served as a primary agent in the development of the orchestral lied. In his orchestral lieder, Mahler took Wagner’s grand and dramatic style and adapted it for the lied, a genre that had previously been considered a type of chamber music. In doing so, he was able to create a sense of narrative that went beyond a surface reading of the poems he set. *Kindertotenlieder* is a prime example of bringing Wagnerian ideals to the lied in the service of such a narrative.

In this project, I examine the ways that Gustav Mahler incorporated Wagnerian vocal and dramatic techniques and ideas in music for a chamber orchestra with the aim of constructing a narrative out of seemingly disparate poems. My use of “voice” refers to the actual human voice, that of the singer/persona, and the orchestra’s voice or voices. Furthermore, my definition of narrative is a story, the story of a progression and development within the persona’s psyche.\(^2\)

Chapter 1 discusses the renewed interest in chamber genres around the turn of the twentieth century. Genre concepts are important for understanding Mahler’s role in the development of the orchestral lied, especially because he lived and worked in a musical culture that focused on large genres. It is also important to consider *Kindertotenlieder*’s inception and

\(^1\) Richard Wagner, *Opera and Drama*, trans. William Ashton Ellis (Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1995), 155-167. There are many places where Wagner discusses the notion of voice and orchestra, for instance pp. 155-167, where he addresses the orchestra’s “faculty of speech.”

\(^2\) This definition is distinct from one that entails the movement of that persona, or character, through a constructed world in time and space.
place in Mahler’s oeuvre, as well as some of the questions as to why Mahler would have composed songs on the death of children. A review of current literature and some examples of interpretive methods are also presented. Because Mahler’s works abound with both literal and metaphorical voices, I explore some theories of the voice. This chapter also discusses Wagner’s theories as they relate to Kindertotenlieder, including those having to do with the role of the orchestra and the use of physical gesture.

Chapter 2 considers how the songs function individually and as a whole. The texts and Mahler’s settings of the texts reveal that he did not arbitrarily choose five poems on a common theme. Rather, he consciously chose particular texts to create a narrative. Inevitably, listeners must interpret meaning beyond that provided immediately by the poems. Mahler’s treatment of the various voices and types of voices he conjures in Kindertotenlieder—lyric, narrative, orchestral, and singing voices—fosters interpretation of the songs as a cycle. In addition to the texts and Mahler’s setting of them, considerations of genre, voices, and Wagnerian techniques reveal the story of a persona whose psyche and emotions evolve and eventually dissolve during one of the most painful of all human experiences, the death of and grieving for a loved one.

Paradigm Shifts

Music in the nineteenth century underwent rapid development. Boundaries were pushed in ways that resulted not only in the formulation of new genres, but also in ever-expanding techniques of composition and performance. Composers began to achieve greater public prominence. For example, Liszt and Paganini had cult-like followings because of their extreme virtuosity as performers. The orchestra increased in size and instrumentation as composers sought to create innovative sounds and musical experiences. In reaction to Beethoven, Wagner
said that the symphony could go no farther, and that the only logical progression was to combine all of the arts in what he termed the “Gesamtkunstwerk.” The tone poems of Strauss and Liszt and the music dramas of Wagner were new genres in which musical expression was pushed to extremes.

In the late nineteenth century, large orchestral works had become the outlets for “progressive” tendencies. Yet, fin-de-siècle Vienna and other cities at that time saw a re-emerging of chamber music, as well as the development of orchestral lieder. With this shift in musical outlets for progressivism, chamber music again became a genre for complex compositional experimentation and avant-garde expression. Carl Dahlhaus notes this in Nineteenth Century Music when he writes that “the transition…from musical modernism to contemporary music was tied to a shift of emphasis in the system of musical genres, a shift which, with perverse logic, turned apparently backward-looking genres into bearers of progressive tendencies.” While lieder had traditionally been performed in homes and salons, the orchestral lied allowed the genre to be brought to a wider audience. Orchestral lieder were by no means as intimate a genre as piano lieder, but in cultivating orchestral lieder, Mahler still sought the intimate experience associated with piano lieder. For Kindertotenlieder in particular, he even specified that it should be performed in the Kleiner Musiksaal of the Musikverein—the smallest performance space in that venue. Mahler’s specifications thus entailed that a small orchestra be used. While an orchestra might easily overpower a voice, Mahler’s stipulations allowed the listener to experience the individual orchestral voices, and allowed him to use those orchestral

---
3 Wagner, Opera and Drama, 34, 53, 66, 68 159, 162.
6 Although Mahler did not give an exact number of players per part, it could be easily assumed that there would be perhaps as few as six first and second violins, four violas, and four cellos, with individual players for the wind and brass parts.
voices as a means to a narrative end. The more intimate genre was appropriate for treating such a somber topic as the death of children.

The only chamber music in Mahler’s oeuvre is an incomplete piano quartet and certain orchestral lieder. Although Mahler obviously excelled in the composition of symphonies, he often used chamber textures in his large orchestral works. Furthermore, prior to Kindertotenlieder, Mahler had primarily set folk poetry or poetry that he himself had written in a folk style. In fact, it was not until Lieder eines fahrenden Gesellen that Mahler purposefully set out to compose orchestral lieder. With Kindertotenlieder, there is an obvious shift in the style of poetry. The narrative construction in Kindertotenlieder is less obvious than in some of his earlier lieder; the methods and means of textual, musical, and narrative unification are more complex.

Poetic and Musical Background: Kindertotenlieder’s Inception

Friedrich Rückert (1788-1866) was a prolific and respected German poet and professor of Oriental languages. In addition to Kindertotenleider, Mahler set five other poems by Rückert that were later paired with two “Wunderhorn” poems and published as Sieben Lieder aus letzter Zeit. Rückert began writing Kindertotenlieder in reaction to the death of two of his children, and created approximately 425 poems from the end of 1833 to June 1834. This immense output was only published after Rückert’s death in 1872, perhaps due to the intensely personal content of the poetry. The editor, Professor Heinrich Rückert (the son of Friedrich), arranged the poems in four
distinct categories. This 1872 edition of the poems is the edition with which Mahler would most likely have been familiar. From over four hundred poems, Mahler selected five seemingly disparate texts from the second section (Sickness and Death), and the fourth section (Solace and Exaltation). Other than the fact that they treat the common theme of the death of children, no explicit narrative thread connects them. In this cycle (1901-4), however, Mahler created a story in five songs told from the perspective of a single persona. He did this through his selection of texts and through the ways in which he set the texts and used the orchestra and the singer to guide interpretation.

When Mahler began setting Rückert’s poems to music, he neither had children nor was he married. Why and how would an unmarried man start to compose songs in which the subject was a grieving father? When asked how he went about composing them, Mahler said, “I placed myself in the situation that a child of mine had died. When I really lost my daughter, I could not have written these songs any more.”

While connections between a composer’s life and work are often tenuous, death was certainly no stranger to Mahler, for five of his siblings had died. As the second of fourteen children, Mahler no doubt experienced and remembered the familial turmoil and grief occasioned by the death of his siblings. No death had a more painful effect on the child Mahler than that of his brother Ernst. Alma Mahler noted that “[Mahler] loved his brother Ernst and suffered with him all through his illness up to the end. For months he scarcely left his bedside. . .

---

8 Vorwort to Friedrich Rückert’s Kindertotenlieder (Frankfurt am Main: Sauerländer, 1872), 3; as cited and discussed in La Grange, 826. These categories are, (1) “Lied und Leid” (Song and Suffering), (2) “Krankheit und Tod” (Sickness and Death), (3) “Winter und Frühling” (Winter and Spring), and (4) “Trost und Erhebung” (Solace and Exaltation).
9 Peter Russell, Light in Battle with Darkness: Mahler’s Kindertotenlieder (Germany: Peter Lang, 1991), 5.
11 Interestingly, Ernst is also the name of Friedrich Rückert’s son, one of the two children for whom Rückert wrote Kindertotenlieder.
To all else he was blind.” Furthermore, death, or at least its imminence, was a common theme in Mahler’s life, as he had to confront his own unexpected and threatening health concerns. Although the death of his daughter and mother occurred after the composition of Kindertotenlieder, the work nevertheless stands as a testament to the life of a composer who repeatedly experienced death and mourning.

After composing three of the five songs in 1901, in 1902 Mahler married Alma Schindler, with whom he had two children. Because of their children, Alma believed setting Kindertotenlieder to music to be a bad omen and became dismayed when Mahler resumed work on the cycle and finished it in 1904. Mahler composed a work in which he brought the intimacy and complexity of the chamber music-like idiom to bear on the death, grief, and afterlife-centered texts.

Review of Literature

The combination of Wagnerian elements and a chamber-orchestra setting in Kindertotenlieder supports an interpretation of the cycle as a narrative whole. In part because the orchestral lied is still a relatively new genre, it has received little critical attention, and usually

---

14 Pollock, 328.
15 Mahler did not compose these songs in a short period of time, and the sequence in which he composed them remains uncertain. However, it is widely accepted that songs 1, 3, and 4 were composed in 1901 with songs 2 and 5 being completed in 1904. See “Gustav Mahler: Works” In Grove Music Online. Oxford Music Online, http://www.grovemusic.com (accessed 26 November 2013).
16 Russell, 3. As quoted in Russell, Alma Mahler said “I can understand setting such frightful words to music if one had no children, or had lost those one had. Moreover, Friedrich Rückert did not write these harrowing elegies out of his imagination: they were dictated by the cruellest loss of his whole life. What I cannot understand is bewailing the deaths of children, who were in the best of health and spirits, hardly an hour after having kissed and hugged them. I exclaimed at the time, ‘For heaven's sake, don't tempt Providence!'”
only as it evolved from the traditional piano-accompanied lied. Mahler was steeped in Wagner’s music dramas but also sympathetic toward the renewed cultivation of small chamber genres by colleagues such as Schoenberg. Mahler’s familiarity with Wagner’s compositional techniques is manifest in Kindertotenlieder, but surprisingly, the Wagnerian elements in Kindertotenlieder have not been discussed, and the chamber elements have been only briefly addressed.

Scholars frequently cite Kindertotenlieder as the first songs in which Mahler abandons the folk-like poetry he set in his Wunderhorn lieder for lyric poetry: the Rückert texts and the texts he later uses for Das Lied von der Erde. Moreover, taking his early lieder as a point of departure, writers often note that Mahler conceived Kindertotenlieder as a coherent song cycle. Most of the literature on Kindertotenlieder, however, is devoted to a systematic exploration of individual songs and makes no real connections between them other than observing the common theme of death. This occurs despite the explicit instructions that Mahler gave for Kindertotenlieder to be performed as a whole and without interruption between songs, an instruction that supports my interpretation of the cycle as one meta-narrative. Although many scholars have treated narrative and meaning in music, explorations of the pertinence of these concepts to Kindertotenlieder have been limited. It is often assumed that a narrative or story is...

20 One pertinent example of this type of discussion is found in La Grange, Gustav Mahler, 825-846.
21 Concert etiquette before the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries allowed applause between songs or movements. While this did not disappear entirely in the early twentieth century, this type of concert experience would certainly not be conducive to an effective experience and understanding of the work as a whole.
22 A brief list of works relating to meaning and narrative in music follows: Carolyn Abbate, Unsung Voices:
readily apparent in texted works or works with attached programs, but even in works that set texts such as *Kindertotenlieder*, meaning is not always self-evident.\(^2^3\) Texts themselves may be interpreted in numerous ways, and the fusion of text and music is even more multivalent than the text alone. Even though this was the first group of songs that Mahler conceived as a whole, the poems that he selected for *Kindertotenlieder* seem disparate. Existing discussions of the cycle’s unity tended to focus on musical elements such as a key scheme and motivic continuity or on general notions of a common theme or mood throughout the songs.\(^2^4\) While these are important considerations, closer study of the texts and of Mahler’s music shows a more complex unification of the cycle.

As suggested above, most of the scholarship on *Kindertotenlieder* has focused on analyzing musical continuity between the songs or on specific musical features in individual songs. The texts themselves tend to be regarded as secondary and are not necessarily examined in light of how they function as the basis of a narrative whole, or how their setting impacts the story being told. When the texts are discussed they are usually treated either in a broad and general way, such as by focusing on the common theme of death, or in great detail regarding

---

\(^{23}\) For further discussion on a composer’s role as an interpretive force/voice in the setting of a text, see Cone, *The Composer’s Voice*, 19.

their musical setting. Henry Louis de la Grange’s discussion of *Kindertotenlieder* exemplifies the first approach. He only briefly mentions the text and approaches each individual song based almost solely on its musical features. De la Grange also mentions the history of the composition and the various psychoanalytical theories that have been proposed in connection with the cycle’s inception. In contrast, Peter Russell’s *Light in Battle with Darkness: Mahler’s Kindertotenlieder* exemplifies the second approach. Russell’s examination of *Kindertotenlieder* is one of the most detailed and provides close commentary on the texts, both regarding the source poems and Mahler’s selection and modification of them. He takes each individual song and dissects the text and the relationship between the text and the music. Russell approaches each song from a position that meaning can be found in the emphasis on the contrast between, on the one hand, literal light and eternal light and, on the other hand, the darkness of death and grief. He points to the numerous places in the text that refer to these concepts and to their representations in the music. For example, to Russell, the use of the harp in m. 11 and of the glockenspiel in m. 20 in the first song is a symbol for the introduction of piercing rays of light in a song cycle that is otherwise very much dominated by despondent themes.

Donald Mitchell’s discussion of *Kindertotenlieder* in *The Mahler Companion*, “Mahler’s ‘Kammermusikton’,” is narrower in focus than his analysis in *Songs and Symphonies of Life and Death*, where he provides a more detailed and probing exploration of *Kindertotenlieder* in the form of “annotations and interpretations.” In both sources, Mitchell discusses the idea of *Kindertotenlieder* as chamber music, and in his contribution to *The Mahler Companion* he makes a number of valuable points about Mahler’s use of dramatic gestures in the context of a chamber-

---

25 The authors whose primary focus is more specific than a general discussion are as follows: Henry-Louis de la Grange, “Five Kindertotenlieder,” in *Gustav Mahler*; Mitchell, “Mahler’s ‘Kammermusikton,’” 217-231; Russell, *Light in Battle with Darkness*.
26 Russell, 70-72.
27 Mitchell, *Songs and Symphonies of Life and Death*. 
music-like setting. Another observation by Mitchell also has a bearing on this thesis: he notes that the first and fifth songs of the cycle provide a narrative frame for the whole. His use of “frame” suggests that the first song sets up a narrative that is completed in the final song or dénouement. Mitchell states that for him, the definition of frame and narrative are “indissoluble” and that his idea of narrative in Mahler is “not ending up where one had started.” He views the middle songs, based on the common theme of loss and grief, as filling a musical space between the first and last songs, the songs that create a sense of wholeness. He explores this concept in greater detail in *Songs and Symphonies of Life and Death*, where he gives specific musical examples to support his arguments. For example, to Mitchell, the reintroduction of the glockenspiel in the fifth song (m. 93) is a point of “recapitulation.” His approach to the cycle as such connects the forms of Mahler’s lieder and his symphonies, with *Kindertotenlieder* as an important point of evolution towards Mahler’s ultimate fusion of song and symphony in *Das Lied von der Erde*. Mitchell asserts that the first song will not only generate the inner movements but also function as a real first movement in song-cycle terms, one that both anticipates and yet also balances the weight of the finale. He even explores the first song as a quasi-sonata with a “development” of sorts occurring in the third strophe. While his approach thus supports the idea of the cycle as a narrative whole, he infrequently considers the role of the text in such a narrative.

---

29 According to Merriam Webster’s dictionary, “dénouement” is a dramatic term that refers to what is essentially the conclusion of narrative. It is the point at which tensions and conflicts are resolved and anxieties are released. It is derived from the French word “dénouer” (to untie) and “nodus” (knot). Therefore, it is literally the “untying” of the complexities of a narrative plot.
31 Ibid. 220-221.
32 Mitchell, *Songs and Symphonies of Life and Death*, 78.
In *Mahler’s Voices*, Julian Johnson briefly considers the possibility of an all-encompassing narrative in *Kindertotenlieder*, but most of his book is devoted to defining concepts of voice in Mahler’s music, including the calling forth and constructing of a voice and issues of genre and voice. Particularly interesting in his discussion of *Kindertotenlieder* is the notion that the lyrical persona of the poems evokes a presence (that of the child) by revoking the passing of time in speaking of the past.\(^{34}\) The work closest to my thesis, however, is Jeffrey Thomas Hopper’s dissertation on the Rückert lieder, which provides detailed discussion of the texts but also of the way in which Mahler sets them. Hopper’s survey of Mahler’s lieder analyzes intrinsic qualities such as melody, harmony, rhythm, expressive directions, etc. as a means to interpret extrinsic meaning, the goal also in my treatment of the *Kindertotenlieder*.

Because my discussion of *Kindertotenlieder* relies heavily on Wagner’s ideas and Mahler’s use of human and orchestral voices, some theories about the voice are pertinent here. The semiotics of music is an immense and complex field, but a couple of concepts are worth mentioning as foundational to this discussion. In lieder, additional layers of meaning arise merely by virtue of the fact that a voice is not simply speaking, but rather is articulating words at prescribed pitch points. A sung text is a doubly powerful means of communicating, as the music possesses the ability to work in conjunction with or against the text. The potential for a musical-textual binary opposition enhances the voice’s communicative power.\(^{35}\)

In his book, *A Voice and Nothing More*, Mladan Dolar furthers this idea when he discusses the voice’s role in singing: “the voice is endowed with profundity: by not meaning anything, it appears to mean more than mere words, it becomes the bearer of some unfathomable

---

\(^{34}\) Johnson, 71.

\(^{35}\) Binary opposition is a common concept in literary theory and semiology. A binary opposition occurs when understanding of a pair of opposing entities comes not so much through the intrinsic meaning of one of the parts, as through the similarities and differences in the pairs’ relationship to each other. A binary opposition uses opposition as means of enhancing and clarifying definition.
originary meaning which supposedly gets lost with language.”\textsuperscript{36} The sounding of the voice itself suggests meaning. Music can emphasize the voice in a way that obscures what would otherwise easily be conveyed in the text alone.\textsuperscript{37} It fetishizes the voice and makes the meaning of the words secondary. This perspective on the singing voice, as an object infused with meaning apart from the meaning of the text, is pertinent to Mahler’s practices in \textit{Kindertotenlieder}. Although there are no instances in \textit{Kindertotenlieder} of pure vocalization, Mahler’s writing for voice in \textit{Kindertotenlieder} suggests meaning apart from the text, as in the final stanza of the fourth song. In singing, the father’s voice betrays the surface meaning of the text, and the hopeful anticipation of which he sings is undermined in his music and that of the orchestra.

Dolar explores the voice not only as a means of conveying meaning and a source of aesthetic pleasure but also as an object. The human voice is as present as it is elusive. The point of vocal emanation, the vocal cords, is concealed from view, yet it is what we rely on to construct, give, and ascribe meaning to our world.

It is the material element recalcitrant to meaning, and if we speak in order to say something, then the voice is precisely that which cannot be said. It is there, in the very act of saying, but it eludes any pinning down…it ‘expresses itself’ and itself inhabits the means of expression…the voice is the flesh of the soul.\textsuperscript{38}

It might seem that the voice as conveyor of meaning and voice as object of aesthetic pleasure are disparate. However, they are in fact compatible. The voice is a complicated entity and its relationship to music offers insight into one of the most remarkable aspects of Mahler’s music—the use of literal and metaphorical/orchestral voices.

\textsuperscript{37} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{38} Dolar, 15, 71.
The fetishizing of the voice, however prominent, ought not to be the goal of the music or of singing. Michael Poizat comments on the notion that a character or persona is the ultimate goal and describes this dramatic and narrative character as follows:

…a ‘locus,’…[from] which the quest for the voice ventures forth. What this means is that it is not the particular traits of a character that will determine the musical material…rather—and this may seem paradoxical—it is the desire for…vocal jouissance that fundamentally will determine the nature of the character chosen to sing the music, who becomes in a way the mouthpiece, or more precisely the outer envelope of the underlying desire that is bound up with the voice. It might be said that characters do not sing but are sung.39

The sung text and the accompanying music follow from the character and its goal of vocal embodiment and jouissance. Therefore, in Kindertotenlieder, the characteristics of the father are not necessarily based on the music, and the music is not necessarily based on traits of the father’s character. Rather, the music is centered on the psychological essence of the father and his grief’s search for a vocal outlet of expression. When thoughts and emotions are given occasion to reach the goal of vocal embodiment, the objectification of the voice and the additional layers of signifiers that arise through a sung text increase the importance of the performer, for the performer is the outlet through which the persona’s psyche is conveyed to the audience.40

One of the aspects of the voice that enhances the listener’s experience of that voice is something that Roland Barthes calls “the grain of the voice.” In his essay of that name, Barthes attempts to define what it is that we call the “grain” of someone’s voice—the quality that is unique and that defines a person’s singing. He says this:

…the ‘grain’ of the voice is not – or is not merely – its timbre; the significance it opens cannot better be defined, indeed, than by the very friction between the music and

---

39 Michael Poizat, The Angel’s Cry: Beyond the Pleasure Principle in Opera (Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 1992), 144. The concept of “jouissance” is widely diversified and deep in interpretation and meaning. In this paper, and in Poizat’s book, the idea of “jouissance” is something that is beyond the idea of pleasure and delight. Poizat distinguishes the two in ascribing the quality of moderation to pleasure, and a profound and intense emotional turmoil and ecstasy to the idea of “jouissance.”

40 The characters being the point of musical and narrative iteration is akin to Wagner’s idea of a poetic aim as the driving source of that which dictates the drama.
something else, which something else is the particular language (and nowise the message). The song must speak, must write – for what is produced at the level of the geno-song is finally writing.\footnote{Roland Barthes, “The Grain of the Voice.” in \textit{Image, Music, Text}, trans. Stephen Heath (New York: Hill and Wang, 1978), 185. In his essay, “The Grain of the Voice,” Barthes acknowledges that what he is trying to describe is ultimately beyond his capacity to express. However, he deems the term “grain” to be an appropriate description, and that while ascribing an actual definition is nigh impossible, the concept is nevertheless something that one intrinsically senses in a performer’s voice. The geno-song is what Barthes refers to as mechanics of the singing voice in its expression of language. It is how the melody functions in its use of language—its sounds and signifiers. It is, “the apex (or that depth) of production where the melody really works at the language – not at what it says, but the voluptuousness of its sounds-signifiers, of its letters – where melody explores how the language works and identifies with that work” 182.}

Wagner similarly highlights the importance of this when he says that “for truly it is not the sense of the word which engages us at the entry of the human voice but the character of the human voice itself.”\footnote{Richard Wagner, “Beethoven”, in \textit{Actors and Singers}, trans. William Ashton Ellis (Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1995), 102.} Even though the qualities of a performer’s voice may be difficult to describe in words, contemplating them is useful when considering their impact on the voice, or soul, of the persona and on the listener’s experience of the drama.

Poizat makes pertinent observations regarding the voice and the idea of vocal loss, something that occurs even in the sounding of the voice. It sounds, and then is immediately lost, or absent. Poizat also asserts that “the voice, by definition, is something that is lost: it may be lost in the distance, or in an uproar. Everyone loses it under the impact of emotion, in moments of amazement, particularly when emotion is aroused by the voice of the Other.”\footnote{Poizat, 93. In this case the “Other” to which Poizat is referring can be marked as the force that serves to invoke and interpret the voice.} Ultimately, the loss of voice translates into Poizat’s notion of “lack,” an idea that centers on viewing the world in terms of what an “other” does not possess that we do possess.\footnote{Ibid., 146. This idea is not original to Poizat and ultimately stems from Freudian psychology.} Often this transforms into a focus on what we do not have, and what we lack in relation to the world around us. This results in our focus being shifted to loss, a focal point in narrative construction in \textit{Kindertotenlieder}. 
This idea of lack or absence finds a further point of reflection in *Kindertotenlieder*. Hans Heinrich Eggebrecht and Hermann Danuser have observed that *Kindertotenlieder* exemplify a characteristic of much of Mahler’s music. It is what they have termed the “as if” (*als ob*) quality.

Mahler’s music often behaves “as if” something were the case: the visionary episode, whether of reminiscence or anticipation, is a fragile statement of how things might have been, or might become, a musical space in marked contrast to the ‘reality’ that precedes and follows it. ⁴₅

The emphasis on absence in *Kindertotenlieder* is enhanced through the use of the subjunctive mood in every song. In doing this, the text speaks in a mood that implies uncertainty, indicates possibility, and/or that highlights that which is other than reality. For example, in the first song, the father sings that it is, “as if no misfortune had befallen in the night.” The second song holds that the children’s eyes gazed with such intensity as if they engraved themselves into the father’s heart and mind. ⁴⁶ Through the use of the subjunctive in all of the songs, there is an apparent loss of concrete reality.

**Wagnerian Musical Ideals**

The Wagnerian elements of *Kindertotenlieder* support an interpretation of the cycle as a whole. The incorporation of such compositional techniques into an intimate chamber setting provided the ideal means to convey the distressing narrative that Mahler creates through his selection and setting of texts. Before examining the texts and songs themselves, I shall discuss

---


⁴⁶ Ibid., 71-2. Additional examples include the following: Song 2: The eyes are transformed to be *as if* they were stars in spite of desiring to remain with the parents (*wir möchten bleiben*). Song 3: The father takes notice of the place in the doorway where his daughter’s presence *would be* (*wo würde*). Song 4: The father is self-delusional and says that it is *as if* the children have gone outside. Song 5: The father says that he *would have* never let the children go outside, with the final stanza finding the children resting *as though* they are in their mother’s house.
Mahler’s understanding of Wagner and the particular ideas that will play a role in my method of revealing narrative in *Kindertotenlieder*.

Richard Wagner was not only one of the nineteenth century’s most renowned composers, but he was also a prolific author. His writing influenced both his contemporaries and future generations. Wagner was aggressively anti-Semitic and believed that Jews could contribute nothing of value to society. Thus it seems contradictory that Mahler, a Jew, would take such great interest in Wagner’s writings. But in the philosophical climate of Vienna at the time, Wagner stood as a pinnacle of musical progressivism for many of the young people who were seeking to rebel against Viennese cultural norms.

Mahler became familiar with Wagner’s music and writings at an early age. In 1877, while a student at the conservatory in Vienna, Mahler joined the Academic Wagner Society, a society that was devoted to providing an environment for diverse philosophical discussions and for the promotion of Wagner’s music. Mahler held Wagner and Wagnerian ideals in high regard, and his acquaintance with Wagner’s ideas and music was intensified by his conducting career. In fact, Wagner’s music dramas were some of the most prominent works of Mahler’s conducting repertoire, and it was for his conducting of Wagner that Hans von Bülow came to greatly respect and admire Mahler’s abilities. The pinnacle of Mahler’s conducting career was assuming the position as director of the Vienna Hofoper. In fact, Mahler chose to conduct Wagner’s *Lohengrin* during his trial week for the post of director at the Hofoper.

---

Central to understanding what Wagner wanted to change in opera is the knowledge of what he took issue with in the operas of his day, namely, that the drama had been sacrificed in order to showcase the music.

I declare aloud the error in the art-genre of Opera consists herein: that a means of expression (music) has been made the end, while the end of expression (the drama) has been made a means […] the aim of opera has thus ever been, and still is to-day, confined to music.\(^\text{49}\)

Wagner held that operatic productions should be an amalgamation of all arts – drama, music, text, scenery, costuming, etc. – the idea to which he assigned the term Gesamtkunstwerk. For Wagner, the drama was all-important, and all arts should exist to serve the drama as a whole. As such, Wagner felt that dividing the opera into different vocal numbers was detrimental to the drama. An absence of division among the musical sections would enable unity of form. This unity of form was dependent upon unity of content and of “artistic expression.”\(^\text{50}\) Wagner also believed that the “poetic aim” was to be the overarching goal that dictated the way the music drama was to unfold. All dramatic forces must act in accordance with this poetic aim, so as not to disturb the unity of the work. Wagner held that a disturbance of this unity of form and artistic expression places music as the end, as opposed to a means to the end, which is drama.

One of the most commonly known Wagnerian theories concerns the concept of leitmotifs. Simply, these motives are musical figures connected with specific characters, situations, objects, and/or emotions. Often they appeared in conjunction with the entity to which we are meant to connect them, and sometimes they were musically “foreshadowed” before the entity was manifest on stage. Wagner also states that these “melodic moments” (leitmotifs) can and should be so subtle that the audience is not necessarily aware of them. Rather, through the

\(^{49}\) Wagner, Opera and Drama, 23-24.
\(^{50}\) Ibid., 171.
orchestra’s articulation of them, they should evoke and preserve emotional responses and be capable of easy recollection as we experience the drama that is unfolding.

Wagner finds a profound connection between musical motives and thought and emotion. For Wagner, thought is a by-product of emotion, and the resulting thought morphs back into an emotion. Wagner states this:

A musical motive can produce a definite impression on the feeling, inciting it to a function akin to thought, only when the emotion uttered in that motive has been definitely conditioned by a definite object, and proclaimed by a definite individual before our very eyes […] wherefore the concurrent sounding of such a motive unites for us the conditioning, the non-present emotion with the emotion conditioned thereby and coming at this instant into voice…Music cannot think: but she can materialize thoughts, i.e. she can give forth their emotional-contents as no longer merely recollected, but made present.  

The idea of thoughts as the bond between an absent and a present emotion ties in nicely with what Mahler is doing in exposing the psyche of the grieving father in Kindertotenlieder. Musical material meant to create associations and thought processes in listeners, whether they realize it or not, does indeed affect their emotional responses. Even if the audience is not necessarily conscious of meaningful musical moments, leitmotifs may still hold sway over their thought and emotion.

The concept of leitmotifs led to an increased role of the orchestra in the music and in the construction of the drama. The orchestra was no longer to be a mere accompaniment to the vocalist, and the music was not to occur at a point where the drama comes to a halt for a particular emotion to be highlighted and the vocal abilities of the performer emphasized. Rather the orchestral music itself became a voice, and thus integral to the drama. This notion was not new to the genre of lieder. Often the piano or accompanying instrument became a voice in a song. However, the orchestra’s role in the accompanying of song differs from piano

---

51 Ibid., 164.
52 Ibid., 163.
accompaniment in that, not only does the orchestra assume a role in the story-telling, but also it is a more powerful manifestation of musical and physical dramatic gesture. According to Wagner, the orchestra itself becomes a character. It is the all-knowing voice; it can foreshadow or reflect upon dramatic action or emotion and expose the psychological state of the singer’s character. Wagner wrote as follows:

The orchestra indisputably possesses a faculty of speech, and the creations of modern Instrumental-music have disclosed it to us…now that in the Word-verse melody we have brought it that which it could not speak out, and have assigned to it, as carrier of this kindred melody, the office in which—completely eased in mind—it is to speak out nothing but what its nature fits it alone to speak: now, we have plainly to denote this speaking-faculty of the orchestra as the faculty of uttering the unspeakable […] as pure organ of the feeling, it speaks out the very thing which word-speech in itself can not speak out.

He also states, “where the drama prepares its future course in inner moods as yet unuttered,—there may these still unspoken moods be spoken by the orchestra in such a way, that their utterance shall bear the character of a foreboding necessitated by the poet’s aim.”

The orchestra as the all-knowing “character” can perhaps be equated with the most accurate manifestation of the poetic aim. It is a character in the drama, and the audience partakes in its knowledge, a knowledge that speaks about the characters and their environment. To the performers, the orchestra is merely a naturally occurring entity within their reality. The orchestral voices are a character that the performer is unaware of; the performer’s voice and the orchestral voices merely naturally-occurring facets of each other’s worlds. We as the audience, however, are observers of the complete drama. Wagner states the following:

53 Ibid., 155.
54 Ibid., 159.
55 Ibid., With the incorporation of Wagnerian ideals into Kindertotenlieder, the orchestra, as an all-knowing entity, might also be equated with the complete musical persona, and a participant in the ultimate goal of realizing the poetic aim. The poetic aim is the all-knowing aim of the work as a whole. For an additional discussion of the complete musical persona, see Cone, 17-18.
At their hand (the orchestra) we become the constant fellow-knowers of the profoundest secret of the poet’s aim, the immediate partners in its realizement between them, as foreboding and remembrance, there stands the verse-melody as the borne and bearing individuality, conditioned by an emotional-surrounding consisting of moments of utterance drawn alike from its own prompting and from those of others, already experienced or yet to be experienced.  

As will be discussed, the listener experiences the orchestral voice as all-knowing in *Kindertotenlieder*, while the father interacts with the orchestra as a facet of his reality.

In *Opera and Drama*, Wagner discusses ways in which the orchestra and the singers’ voices are mutually influential. Often in Wagner there is a “role reversal” in that the voice takes on a role akin to an instrument in the orchestra and the orchestra takes on vocal qualities, not necessarily in the sense of melodic contour and timbre, but in the orchestral declamations, interlinking motives, and musical gestures that suggest a metaphorical voice. This metaphorical voice serves as an interpretive force as it subsumes, subverts, exemplifies, comments upon, and expresses the text or the dramatic action. Regarding the dual role of orchestra and voice, and the notion of voice in Mahler’s music, Julian Johnson states:

> Taken as a whole, his music moves backward and forward across a liminal area located between sung text and instrumental melody, working at the border between the linguistic and the purely musical, the thetic and the semiotic. There is, then, no simple opposition in Mahler’s music between vocal and instrumental music.

This blurred boundary between a definition of literal voice and metaphorical voice results in this:

> …a constant renegotiation of the idea of voice between singing and playing, between the projection of a musical subject through the presence of an actual, flesh-and-blood singer on the stage and its construction in the discursive interaction of instrumental voices. The contrast is not absolute or fixed but, rather, part of a more complex dialectic. The individual lyrical subjectivity projected by the singer and the song is taken up in the discursive, objective process of the orchestra.

---

56 Wagner, *Opera and Drama*, 172.
57 See Wagner’s discussion in *Opera and Drama*, 316 ff.
59 Ibid.
As I discuss below, *Kindertotenlieder* is replete with examples of the singing voice and the orchestral voice reversing roles and/or being united as an entity.

**Gestures in the Creation and Enhancement of Narrative in *Kindertotenlieder***

While a singing voice articulating at prescribed pitch points and instrumentalists playing notes written on a page are the basis of making music, the use of musical and physical gesture in performance can enrich an audience’s experience and understanding of the narrative. The sounds of the orchestra are not the only musical force with the capacity to convey the ineffable. Physical gesture comes to the fore as a force able to enhance narrative. In lyric narration, the type of narration associated with poetry and lieder, the use of physical gesture is not necessarily considered to be of vital importance in conveying meaning. However, Mahler’s setting of the texts necessitates the use of physical gestures on the part of the performer, and the difficulty of some of the songs exemplifies this method of dramatic narrative. The premiere performance even saw a review that attests to the dramatic nature of the songs:

> In his *Kindertotenlieder*..., Gustav Mahler has treated a subject that is in part related to [Otto] Naumann’s [*Der Tod und die Mutter*, a large-scale choral work performed at the same Festival]; but there is no doubt that in his choice of resources he reveals himself the superior artist since, in order to *stage this miniature domestic tragedy*, he needs only a small orchestra and a single vocal soloist.60 (emphasis mine)

Gesture in singing, in its most basic form, is the vocal utterance. Although it is itself a gesture, the vocal utterance is also enhanced by other gestures and musical figures, as well as physical gestures and gestures that are natural by-products of the physicality of performance. Wagner claimed that physical gesture itself is something that, though inaudible, offers an additional narrative and dramatic commentary.61 What the eye sees, and what the ear hears work

---

61 Wagner, *Opera and Drama*, 159.
together to evoke the thought-emotion cycle in the listener and to aid in the construction of dramatic narrative. The preparation and justification for gesture’s realization comes from the “impatient longing” evoked by the orchestra.62 The fulfillment of the listener’s longing comes in the full realization of the poetic aim—a manifestation that finds its complete realization in the “highest, most lucid vindication of the word-verse-melody through the perfected language of the orchestra in alliance with gesture.”63 Furthermore, according to Wagner, the heightened importance of gesture entailed by the drama necessitates that the emotion behind the gesture should be evident in the outward bodily appearance of the performer.64

The performer must therefore embody the character, thus resulting in a heightened role for the performer in the dramatic construction of narrative. It is a Wagnerian ideal that Mahler certainly incorporated in Kindertotenlieder through the music itself. As I note, certain aspects of the vocal part that require the performer to inhabit the character in order to achieve an effective performance of the work. Wagner wrote this:

> the bodily gesture, as determined by an inner emotion which proclaims itself in the certain members most capable of expression, and finally in the features of the face…the eye was thus aroused by the gesture in a way which still lacked its fitting counterpart, of a message to the ear: but this counterpart is needful, for rounding the expression into one completely understandable by Feeling.65

Even the notion of appearance is important. For example, the orchestral postlude of the fifth song is lengthy, and raises issues as to how the singer presents himself. Ought he to gaze into the distance? Or should he fold his hands, and merely wait for the song to be over? Should he close his eyes, in reflection?

---

62 Ibid., 166.
63 Ibid., 161.
64 Ibid. It should also be noted that while Wagner is referring to gesture as it pertains to the production of an opera/music drama, Mahler is creating and using gestures in something non-operatic for the creation and enhancement of dramatic narrative.
65 Wagner, Opera and Drama, 159-160.
One of the most remarkable performances that best illustrates the idea of the singer becoming the point of initial iteration is from the BBC Proms in 2009 with the Gustav Mahler Jungendorchester, Matthias Goerne, and Jonathan Nott. Goerne’s embodiment of the grieving father is dramatic. He does not sing stoically as merely the vehicle of pre-constructed poetic and narrative ideas; he becomes the character of the father. His gestures and the way he enunciates the text suggest congruence with the persona. His facial expressions do not merely convey the physical effort of singing but also manifest the emotional culmination of text and song. His voice is captivating and the listener is led to believe both in hearing and seeing, that Goerne himself is the father, and that the severity of emotion that overcomes him has led him to communicate through song.

The act of physical gesture in *Kindertotenlieder* can be found in the act of embodiment not only by the vocal performer but also the orchestra. As will be noted in the discussion of the songs, Mahler gave very detailed and dramatic instructions for the vocalist and the orchestra. He elicits gesture through the instructions he gives, as well as through the qualities of the music itself. For example, in the fifth song, the very nature of the notes Mahler composed necessitates overtly dramatic bodily movement to play the notes and maintain a cohesive musical line in the orchestra. The thinner texture of *Kindertotenlieder* accentuates the voice of the orchestra. Individual instruments are clearly seen and more audible in the weaving of texture, timbre, and dynamics. With a smaller number of instruments, the harmony is not blurred. It is clear, and

---


67 The notion of the human impulse to sing in the midst of psychological and emotional extremes is an idea evident throughout opera. All of opera literature is centered on this notion. The primary foundation of an aria is to focus, musically and textually, on one emotion and state of mind of the character. Like arias, lieder are a substantive manifestation of that desire. And while I am by no means equating Kindertotenlieder with an opera, or even the songs with arias, I am implying that when all other means of expression have been exhausted, communication through song during emotional duress remains what may be the only viable means of giving voice to thought and feeling. In Kindertotenlieder, under the duress of grief the father finds no other means of expression than that of song.
individual voices can be heard in their roles in constructing the harmony. While some might argue that narrative in lieder is constructed through the music and text alone, it in fact also comes about, as previously mentioned, through the visual presentation of the performing forces and the way they move and interact with each other.

Finally, Wagner placed great importance on the role of harmony in constructing a narrative. Wagner held that the emotional substance of a melody and the effect it has on the listener were brought forth based on the underlying harmony. Paradoxically, Wagner also held that the orchestra both constructed the harmony as well as served as the vessel and bearer of harmony’s “realized thoughts” in fulfilling the poetic aim. As the following chapter will discuss, this foundation for melodic, and thus emotional display plays an important role in Kindertotenlieder, particularly in the second song.

Methodology

As a starting point, I consider the texts. Mahler’s careful selection of poems and both his modifications and musical settings of them inform the narrative. After discussing each text, I work my way through the music, remarking on the often subtle ways that Mahler constructs narrative. The afore-mentioned theories of voice serve as foundational in understanding the human voice and Mahler’s abilities to use it. For example, one of the ideas that I use in considering Mahler’s creation of narrative is the previously addressed notion of physical gesture. The use of physical gesture in Kindertotenlieder has not found a place in current scholarship, yet

---

68 The idea of harmony was a central concept in Wagner’s writings. He writes, “The sounding-out of the harmony to a melody, is the first thing that fully persuades the feeling as to the emotional content of the melody…we now have to consider the orchestra not merely, as I termed it above, as the conqueror of the waves of harmony, but as itself those conquered waves. In it the harmonic element, that conditions the melody is turned…into an at all times characteristic accessory-organ for realizing the poetic aim….the orchestra is harmony’s realized thought, in its highest, living-est mobility” (Wagner, Opera and Drama, 150, 154).

69 Wagner, Opera and Drama, 154.
Wagner viewed physical gesture as integral to dramatic narrative. Mahler’s understanding of Wagner results in the incorporation of gesture in *Kindertotenlieder*, a facet that affects the performers, listeners, and ultimately, the story. I show how Mahler’s use of the literal (human) and metaphorical (orchestral) voices, and his incorporation of Wagnerian ideals weave together a narrative from seemingly disconnected poems.

Mahler became familiar with Wagner’s writings in his youth, and had an intimate performing knowledge of his music dramas as a conductor. His understanding of Wagner’s ideas resulted in the incorporation of them into his own music. Mahler used the human voice in his oeuvre more frequently than did other composers of the day. He uses the voice in his symphonies, and often in such a way that the voice is an integrated part of the orchestral texture. Conversely, Mahler often used instruments, and instrumental solos as individually “singing” voices. Sometimes the human voice and orchestral voice(s) are found as interchangeable forces in the musical texture and are not mutually exclusive in their ability to serve as a dramatic force in the construction of musical narrative. Often, in *Kindertotenlieder* Mahler’s composition for the voice objectifies it so that meaning can be ascribed without the need of the accompanying texts, through music as well as the physicality of gesture. As I address in the following chapter, *Kindertotenlieder* exemplifies Mahler’s understanding of the intrinsic power of the literal human voice. Moreover, Chapter 2 reveals how Mahler used the human voice and orchestral voice(s) and Rückert’s poetry to weave a dramatic narrative of grief.
CHAPTER 2

READING BETWEEN MUSICAL LINES: GRIEF, DRAMA, AND VOICE IN

_KINDERTOTENLIEDER_

This chapter contains a brief discussion of aspects of the texts, followed by an exploration of the songs themselves. I take what Mahler does with musical elements (orchestration, texture, melody, harmony, etc.) and draw out extrinsic meaning. While these songs provide a wealth of points that could be discussed, I present the substance of the songs that suggest Mahler’s creation of a narrative through his use of literal and metaphorical voices and through his application of Wagnerian compositional principles. Rückert’s poetry is rudimentary and its constructs are simple, but Mahler raises Rückert’s chronicle of grief to a high level of sophistication. Regarding Rückert’s collection of _Kindertotenlieder_ poems, Russell says that there is “a fundamental weakness of many of the _Kindertotenlieder_: they are versified thoughts, prosaic reflections in rhymed form, rather than the expression of profound and compelling feelings. Some are banal, maudlin, or sentimental, to our taste; others again are spoilt by self-pity or petulance.” Stated in a different way, the poetry of _Kindertotenlieder_ is unusually raw in its content and construction. It was these raw and perhaps amateur-sounding poems that Mahler chose for his chronicle of grief. The fact that Mahler’s setting of the poems avoids the rigidity of the poems’ structure helps to make this cycle a unified experience. The songs seamlessly blend into each other, the settings of the text seeming to emanate from the orchestra and from the persona as spontaneous iterations. What makes _Kindertotenlieder_ a distinctive experience is Mahler’s use of musical and performance gestures to enhance the drama and narrative he weaves.

70 Russell, 46.
The texts that Mahler selected reveal not only their common theme but also a story as suggested by Mahler’s instructions in the preface of the score: “These five songs form a complete and indivisible whole, and for this reason their continuity must be preserved (by preventing interruptions, such as for example applause at the end of each song.)”\(^7^1\) Listeners and even the performers are meant to experience something whole and almost sacred. That Mahler specifies the small chamber-music hall of the Musikverein as the performance venue underscores the intimacy of the texts being set.\(^7^2\)

An additional aspect of the texts of Kindertotenlieder that Mahler chose becomes apparent if one considers those that he overlooked. Before Kindertotenlieder, Mahler’s songs and texted symphonic movements often defined the persona through images of nature in the poetry. The feelings of the persona were seen in relation to and as ultimately subject to the supremacy of the outside world. Russell notes that nature imagery is common in Rückert’s Kindertotenlieder but that Mahler overlooked those texts in favor of more introspective texts.\(^7^3\) The fact that Mahler chose not to use some of the more blatantly nature-centric Kindertotenlieder attests to the different focus he had in mind in this cycle. He conceived a story that takes place within the persona’s psyche rather than one that emphasizes the persona’s place in the natural world. This is not to say that images of nature do not appear at all in the texts he selected. On the contrary, the texts he chose contain images of nature that may, however, be seen as representing the inner world of the persona and as defining and contextualizing that persona’s trauma. Never before were Mahler’s texts and music as emotionally intimate as they were in Kindertotenlieder.

\(^7^1\) La Grange, 831.
\(^7^2\) Mitchell, “Mahler’s ‘Kammermusikon,’” 228.
\(^7^3\) Russell, 56.
Kindertotenlieder Texts and Mahler’s Modifications

Mahler modified each of the texts that he selected. A simple example may be found in the first stanza of the first song, where Mahler changed “Sonne” to “Sonn’,” and “aufgeh’n” to “aufgeh’n.” Some of what he chose to repeat or to modify contributed to his implicit narrative. In the first song, Mahler changed “auch” to “nur,” a change that increases our sense of the persona’s isolation (stanza 2, m. 26). The change of “Lämpchen” to “Lämplein” might seem insignificant, since both are diminutive forms of “lamp”; however, Mahler’s alteration of this word is in line with his wish for the singer to hold the second syllable, as this is an easier syllable for the singer to sustain. Although this may seem insignificant, it attests to Mahler’s attention to detail and to the importance he placed on effective text setting. As I demonstrate, the repetition of the phrase “O Augen” in Song 2 proves significant both musically and within his narrative (stanza 1, mm. 10-13). While Mahler modified all the poems in one way or another, he made the most changes in the third, “Wenn dein Mütterlein.” Mahler’s restructuring gave the poem a new meaning; of all of the poems Mahler chose, this is the only one that specifies the gender of one of the children, a detail that he accentuated.

Song 1: “Nun will die Sonn’ so hell aufgeh’n!”

The importance of the first song in establishing listeners’ expectations of the cycle as a whole should not be underestimated. The text and the music set in motion listeners’ sense of the profound loss that the persona will experience throughout the song cycle. Moreover, Mahler’s

74 Ibid., 68.
76 Mahler’s song starts with the second stanza of Rückert’s original poem, but eliminates the last three lines. He then follows with the first half of the first stanza. The song concludes with the three lines that he had eliminated from the second stanza.
manipulation of the ritornello in the first song also introduces the listener to the persona’s gradual psychological decline throughout all five songs.

The text for the first song, given in Table 1, consists of four stanzas that Mahler sets in a modified strophic form, the modifications occurring in the setting of the third stanza and in his inclusion of an orchestral interlude. The text itself features antithetic parallelism, whereby the second line of the couplet expresses a meaning that is in direct contrast to the first.

Table 1: Nun will die Sonn’ so hell aufgehen

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Rückert:</th>
<th>Mahler:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Nun will die Sonne so hell aufgehn</td>
<td>Nun will die Sonn’ so hell aufgeh’n</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Als sei kein Unglück die Nacht geschehn.</td>
<td>Als sei kein Unglück, kein Unglück die Nacht gescheh’n!</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Das Unglück geschah auch mir allein, Die Sonne, sie scheinet allgemein.</td>
<td>Das Unglück geschah nur mir allein! Die Sonne, die Sonne, sie scheinet allgemein!</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Du mußt die Nacht nicht in dir verschrenken, Mußt sie ins ew’ge Licht versenken.</td>
<td>Du mußt nicht die Nacht in dir verschränken, Mußt sie ins ew’ge Licht versenken!</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Translation:

| Now will the sun rise so brightly, As if no misfortune occurred in the night! |
| The misfortune fell only on me! Yet the sun shines everywhere! |
| You must not enfold the night within you. You must immerse it in eternal light. |
| A little lamp has gone out in my tent! Hail to the joyous light of the world! |

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Changes:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Stanza 1: “Sonne” to Sonn’;” “aufgeh’n” to “aufgeh’n;” repeat of “Unglück;” “geschehn” to “gescheh’n”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stanza 2: “auch “ to “nur;” repeat of “die Sonne”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stanza 3: “die Nacht nicht” to “nicht die Nacht;” “verschrenken” to “verschränken;” “ewige” to “ew’ge;” repeat of “ins ew’ge Licht”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stanza 4: “Lämpchen” to “Lämplein;” repeat of “Heil;” repeat of “dem Freudenlicht der Welt”</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

77 Rushing, 20. The formatting of all subsequent tables are based on this same source. Furthermore, the changes that Mahler makes to Rückert’s texts are noted in a bold font.

78 Kindertotenlieder (New York: Dover, 1990). All translations are based on those in the Dover score, but I modified these when I deemed it appropriate to do so.
As in a binary pair, the second line of the couplet, by virtue of its opposition to the first, serves to define it. For example, the first and second lines of text juxtapose the words “brightly” and “night,” and the third and fourth lines juxtapose “alone” and “everything.” These are opposing concepts that enhance and strengthen the meaning of each other.

The father’s grief in Kindertotenlieder is apparent from the outset. On the basis of the text alone, he appears to be living in reaction to tragedy. He states that the misfortune has befallen him alone (mm. 25-28), and he seems to make futile attempts at consoling himself (mm. 48-59). His first three phrases also indicate his propensity at times to deny what has happened when he says that it is “as if” no misfortune had occurred (mm. 11-15). Through this monologue the viewer is given immediate access into what is occurring. It would seem that his mind is wandering, that he is lost in the process of trying to understand what has happened. The father’s distress makes him seem to oscillate between his personal pain and the objective world outside himself. For example, although he acknowledges that a “little lamp” was extinguished in his life (mm. 68-71), he also comforts himself and “hails” the joyous light of the world (mm. 74-82).

The use of the orchestra further suggests what is happening in the father’s psyche, particularly in the weaving of the oboe and horn in a ritornello and in the ultimate fading away of the horn. Although a ritornello is generally more staunchly structured than the material that appears here, I am using the term loosely to describe the recurring material between the stanzas.

The ritornello, striking in its use of only two instruments, is a significant feature in the first song. Traditionally, a ritornello returns throughout a piece of music, as happens here too, although significant changes occur each time that the ritornello returns in both the oboe and horn. In Wagnerian fashion, the ritornello in Kindertotenlieder may be seen to fulfill a leitmotif’s role of “forboding,” if the oboe and horn are understood as a microcosm and a foreshadowing of what

---

79 Hopper, 155.
is to come in the cycle as a whole. Modifications of the ritornello lead to the eventual disappearance of the horn and attest to Mahler’s remarkable use of orchestral voices. The modifications of the ritornello are all the more noticeable since only two instruments participate in this material. The oboe, unwavering and increasingly insistent throughout all appearances of the ritornello, may suggest the certainty and objective existence of death. Furthermore, the modification of the horn’s role and its eventual disappearance suggests what the cycle as a whole will express, the psychological undoing of the father; grief (the oboe) ultimately overcomes the persona (horn).

The listener encounters a stark, sparsely textured, and musically dismal landscape when the song opens with the ritornello for oboe and French horn alone. Each instrument articulates its own musical ideas. Any consonance between them seems almost to be an inadvertent by-product. In the first and second stanzas, the oboe is to play in a “klagend” or lamenting manner (mm. 1-4 and 22-25); this first appearance of the ritornello is the only one in which the horn presents its full ritornello material (mm. 1-4). The oboe line is intensely chromatic and, with the horn, tentatively indicates the key of D minor, outlining a D minor chord in m. 4; the sense of D as tonic is strengthened in m. 11 when the harp enters with a low D and the voice sings the third scale degree in its natural and then its sharped form. If we understand the oboe to represent grief, the oboe can be said to “mimic” the father in his grief when, perhaps out of sympathy, it echoes the singer’s musical material in mm. 9-10. After the oboe’s imitation of the father’s line, the music shifts to a much warmer sounding, major-mode harmony. The warmth of the harmony is supported by the introduction of the strings, particularly the cellos and violas, as well as the harp, which makes it all the more unusual that Mahler instructs the vocal performer to sing with a

---

80 Wagner, Opera and Drama, 330.
81 Russell, 70.
“restrained voice” (mit verhaltener Stimme; mm. 11-15); it would seem logical for the voice to settle into a fuller and warmer style of singing. However, even with the warmer major-mode harmony, the voice sings only half steps. The singer’s chromatic line may be construed as indicating the persona’s mental capacity and inability to think in anything greater than the smallest of intervals. Although chromaticism is conventionally associated with pain, in Kindertotenlieder it conveys a more precise sense of anguish as the persona pitifully attempts to console himself. The chromaticism that follows finally seems to find some stability in m. 20, the first structural tonic and the place at which the glockenspiel enters for the first time, a bright sound in the otherwise dark timbre. The sense of tonal resolution quickly dissipates in the ritornello dialogue between the horn and the oboe.

Mahler gives additional and unusual musical instructions to the oboe, horn, and cellos, particularly in the second stanza. These instructions show the conscious decisions Mahler made to use the singer’s voice and the orchestral voices for a dramatically effective end. In the second measure of the second ritornello (m. 23), the oboe and horn are instructed to play “ausdruckslos” (expressionless). While the oboe states the original ritornello material, the horn falters in its second statement (mm. 22-25). The father speaks of the tragedy that has occurred to him alone (mm. 25-28), and the oboe again imitates the father’s grief in mm. 28-31. Mahler indicates that the lack of expression in the oboe and horn is to be transferred to the cellos, one of the mellowest and warmest instruments in the orchestra (mm. 32-41), instructing the cellists in the second stanza to play without expression, “immer mit Dämpfer, ohne Ausdruck” (always with the mute, without expression). Using a mute on a stringed instrument creates a more veiled, eerier timbre. The lack of expression in the oboe, horn, and cellos supports an inference that the text is referring to the impartiality of death. Beginning in the same measure (m. 32), the violists double
the vocal line, but in contrast to the cellists, they are instructed to play “immer mit Dämpfer aber ausdrucksvoll” (always with the mute, but full of expression). The cellists are instructed to sound apathetic; that the violists play the same material that the vocalist sings humanizes the expressive quality of their instruments.

The music for the third stanza differs most from that for the others (m. 48). By the time the ritornello for the third stanza begins in m. 40, the oboe is instructed to play “heftiger sehr hervortretend” (aggressively coming forward more), and although the horn is present, it is not as part of the original ritornello dialogue with the oboe. When the horn does enter in m. 44, it plays an augmented version of the original vocal line, as though the horn is beginning to resign itself to the perspective of the persona. In contrast with earlier stanzas, here the vocal line moves upward in contour, and it is the first time in the text that the persona speaks in the second person. It is unclear if the persona is addressing someone else, or if he is instead speaking to himself in an attempt to console himself. The strings enter with the pick-up to m. 52 with material similar in contour to the initial vocal statement, and if we view the oboe as representing the reality of grief, the oboe is again found to react to the father’s desires to reverse the finality of what grief represents by playing an inversion of the singer’s musical line (mm. 47-51). The subsequent section in the violins competes with the vocal line; it is a separate melodic idea and is even marked “mit großem Ausdruck” (with great expression; mm. 52-59). This brief passage in the violins eventually carries over into a dramatic orchestral interlude, an undulating and overpowering expression of the words “ew’ge Licht” (eternal light, mm. 58-67), the rapidly shifting dynamics and the interweaving of the instruments creating a pulsating effect. This “eternal light” passage, marked “mit leidenschaftlichen Ausdruck” (with passionate expression),

82 “Du müßt nicht die Nacht in dir verschränken, mußt sie ins ew’ge Licht versenken.” (You must not enfold the night in you. You must immerse it in eternal light.)
which begins with the violins in m. 52 and concludes with the flutes in m. 67, seems to leave the vocal persona shaken and overcome with grief.

The persona appears to be even more intensely traumatized in the fourth stanza, and the ritornello is even more transformed. Entering as the orchestral interlude is fading (m. 63), the fourth stanza begins with the oboe, marked fortissimo, stating the original ritornello material alone while the horn rests. When the voice re-enters with stanza 4 in the pick-up to m. 68, it continues the flute’s line but can complete only the first phrase of the text. The voice, horns, bassoon, clarinet, and oboe all come to rest on a held note, as though time freezes because the “light” of which the persona sings has gone out (m. 72). At this point, the first violins enter with the material that the persona is unable to sing, playing the consequent phrase to the voice’s antecedent. In m. 74, the voice interjects words that Mahler marks to be sung “mit Erschütterung” (with emotional upset). To fulfill this instruction, the performer must act the father’s role. The voice, shaken and quiet and as though able to sing only in musical fragments, completes the consequent phrase in m. 75, before briefly pausing and restating the final words again (mm. 79-82).

The final seven measures are hauntingly inconclusive. The repetition of the text at the end suggests finality, but the music does not. The voice cadences on the third scale degree of D minor, and although the low instruments play the tonic D, this merely punctuates the emptiness that the music has created. The finality of the text and the desire for musical continuation may be seen as representing the antithetic parallelism of the text: the finality of death contrasts with the persona’s unwillingness to be at peace with it; thus the imminence of death and the father’s resistance to its reality enhance and strengthen the meaning and effect of each other. The first song has introduced not only Mahler’s masterful use of orchestral and literal voices, but also
Kindertotenlieder as a narrative of a different sort, one of intensely personal utterings by the father accompanied by a reduced orchestra.

Song 2: “Nun seh’ ich wohl, warum so dunkle Flammen”

The text of the second song is a sonnet (see Table 2), thus one octave and one sestet.83 Whereas the text of the first song has an antithetic parallelism structure, the second text represents a synthetic parallelism, in which the second pair of lines expands or completes an idea presented in the first. For example, the first two lines of the first stanza note the father’s recognition of the children’s eyes, whereas the final two lines speak of his further understanding of the eyes. Each successive stanza also serves to clarify and complete the preceding one.84 Furthermore, in a sonnet, the sestet typically enhances or clarifies what is expressed in the octave. The structure of this entire song is thus in a sense a synthetic parallelism, just as the third and fourth lines of the stanza complete an idea in the first two lines, each stanza completes the previous one, and the sestet clarifies and completes the octave.

The text of this song centers on the eyes of the persona’s dead children. The father has moved from focusing on his inner sense of loss and the universality of death to focusing on the children’s eyes. In fact, one of Mahler’s primary modifications of the text is to repeat the words “O Augen!” (O eyes!). This is significant in the structure of the poem, as it disrupts the pairs of lines and breaks the rhyme scheme of the octave. The children’s eyes represent the children, and the father’s focus on them highlights the absence of both the children and their eyes. The father is also lamenting that he was not able to see clearly, that he was blind to what was happening to his children (mm. 22-28). One of the most remarked-upon points in the text occurs in the third

---

83 Rushing, 26.
84 Hopper, 309.
and fourth stanzas, at the beginning of the sestet (m. 38). The children’s eyes speak for them and attest to the truth of their absence.

### Table 2: Nun seh’ ich wohl warum so dunkle Flammen

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Rückert:</th>
<th>Mahler:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Nun seh’ ich wohl, warum so dunkle Flammen</td>
<td>Nun seh’ ich wohl, warum so dunkle Flammen</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ihr sprühtet mir in manchem Augenblick, O Augen, gleichsam um in einem Blicke</td>
<td>Ihr sprühtet mir in manchen Augenblick, O Augen! O Augen! Gleichsam um <strong>voll</strong> in einem Blicke</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zu drängen eure ganze Macht zusammen.</td>
<td>Zu drängen eure ganze Macht zusammen.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dort ahnt’ ich nicht, weil Nebel mich umschwammen,</td>
<td>Dort ahnt’ ich nicht, weil Nebel mich umschwammen,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gewoben vom verblendenden Geschicke, Daß sich der Strahl bereits zur Heimkehr schicke</td>
<td>Gewoben vom verblendenden Geschicke, Daß sich der Strahl bereits zur Heimkehr schicke, Dorthin, <em>dorthin</em>, von wannen alle Strahlen stammen.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dorthin, von wannen alle Strahlen stammen.</td>
<td>Dorthin, von wannen alle Strahlen stammen.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ihr wolltet mir mit eurem Leuchten sagen:</td>
<td>Ihr wolltet mir mit eurem Leuchten sagen:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wir möchten nah dir immer bleiben gerne, Doch ist uns das vom Schicksal abgeschlagen.</td>
<td>Wir möchten nah dir bleiben gerne, Doch ist uns das vom Schicksal abgeschlagen.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sieh’ recht uns an! Denn bald sind wir dir ferne.</td>
<td><strong>Sieh’ uns nur an</strong>, den bald sind wir dir ferne!</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Was dir noch Augen sind in diesen Tagen, In künft’gen Nächten sin des dir nur Sterne.</td>
<td>Was dir <strong>nur</strong> Augen sind in diesen Tagen: In künft’gen Nächten sin des dir nur Sterne.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Translation:</td>
<td>Changes:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Now I see clearly, why such dark flames Flashed at me, at many a moment</td>
<td>Stanz 1: “O Augen” repeated; “<strong>voll</strong>” inserted before “in einem Blicke”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>O eyes! O eyes! If you wanted to concentrate The whole sum of your strength (in a single look).</td>
<td>Stanz 2: “<em>dorthin</em>” repeated</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yet I never suspected, because mists enveloped me,</td>
<td>Stanz 3: “<strong>immer</strong>” omitted</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>All woven by the deceitful loom of fate, That those beams would already be sent home To the place from where all beams come.</td>
<td>Stanz 4: “sieh’ recht uns an” to “<strong>Sieh’ uns nur an</strong>;” “dir noch Augen” to “dir nur Augen”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>You wanted with your shining light to say: “We would like to stay near you, but it is denied us by fate.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Only look at us, for soon we will be far away from you! What are these days but eyes to you, In nights to come will be to you only stars.”</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Despite the traditional formal structure of the poem, Mahler’s syllabic setting makes it seem almost as if the persona is simply speaking, indeed rambling. The frequent expressive markings that Mahler gives to the voice enhance the sense that the persona is talking to himself, uninhibited by logic (See m.15—“zart/gently;” m. 17—“warm/softly;” m. 26—“fließend/ floating;” m. 38—“zurückhaltend/ holding back”). The meter and tempo are also frequently manipulated, as in the ritardando in m. 28 moving into m. 29, where the instructions are “a tempo; etwas bewegter” (original tempo, somewhat more agitated). The rambling effect that Mahler creates is enhanced by the voice often straining to hit the notes of its upper register, a dramatic physical gesture because of the strain on the part of the singer (mm. 30, 44, 62, and 66).

Wagner’s ideas about harmony are especially pertinent to this song. For Wagner, the poetic aim dictated the harmony, the harmony dictated the melody, and the harmonic support of a melody created the melody’s emotional content. As Wagner notes, when the melody of the song is derived from the harmony, and the two are thus almost the same, a confusing and unsettling experience results. The second song, in which harmony and melody are enmeshed in a regenerating cycle of each producing the other, evokes a sense of yearning like that in Tristan und Isolde. That a motive associated with the children’s eyes is used to create this sense of longing speaks to the father’s ardent desire for his children.

The lack of tonal clarity is the musical correlative of the persona’s inability to see clearly; the beginning of the second song quickly establishes the mood of the song as a whole, suggesting an unstable harmonic foundation and creating a desire for musical resolution that will last throughout the song. The voice finished the first song in a rising musical gesture, and the cellos open the second song with a similar rising musical gesture leading to a motive that will be repeated throughout the song, which I will call the “Augen motive.” The motive is brief but

---

85 Wagner, Opera and Drama, 149, 150.
disquieting (mm. 1-4) and it leads into a painfully dissonant appoggiatura. The upward resolution of this appoggiatura is similar to the resolution that occurs at the opening of the prelude to 

*Tristan und Isolde.*

Indeed, the harmonies of the entire second song are Tristan-esque and they frustrate ultimate resolution. This appoggiatura figure is the basis of the song’s harmonic and melodic structure, and the appoggiaturas and German sixth chords result in an indirectly defined tonal center.

Although a few brief moments are tonally clear, overall the harmonic and melodic style does not promote clarity. Because of the tonal wandering, the musical transition into the text of the third stanza (beginning in m. 38) is satisfying, creating a level of musical culmination that is unrivaled in the rest of the cycle. The modulation is up a third (from B-flat to D). So profound is this modulation that the listener cannot help but experience relief and expect fulfillment of the longing evoked throughout the rest of the song. It would seem logical that the musical transformation created by modulation might occur at the point where the father speaks of the transformation of the children’s eyes into stars, but ironically, this musical transformation does not occur there. Rather, it begins at the point where the father begins quoting the children’s eyes as they speak (m. 38). This suggests that the transformation voiced by the orchestra is not so much a reflection of the eyes’ transformation into stars as perhaps a musical representation of the persona’s transformed insight into what has happened to his children as he narrates what his children’s eyes would say.

86 Hopper, 224. The “Tristan-Chord” as it is called, originated in Wagner’s *Tristan und Isolde.* It is heard in the very opening, and at various points throughout. It consists of the intervals of an augmented fourth, augmented sixth, and augmented ninth above the lowest note. While there are numerous ways that scholars have sought to analyze this chord and its function, it has frequently been noted to represent longing and desire—a yearning that is not ultimately fulfilled until the end of the work. Fulfillment of the passionate desire only comes in death, and is musically resolved in what is known as the “Liebestod” (love-death). See also Julian Johnson, *Mahler’s Voices,* 74.

87 Agawu, “Kindertotenlieder, No. 2,” 93.
The orchestra conveys the transformation in the third stanza through a musical sign of change, modulation. Despite the father speaking as the eyes of his children, the statement that the children’s eyes make is nevertheless tinged with the lyric persona’s grief. At the point in the text and music where the child’s eyes begin to speak, the rate of declamation notably increases and the musical figures become faster and more convulsive; the harmonies also change more frequently, creating a sense of forward drive and angst in the music and text until the music comes to a sudden halt in mm. 66-67. The persona’s realization of the eyes’ transformation into stars seems to render him motionless, as his final line of text cadences inconclusively, and the music is suspended on a German sixth chord, just as the child’s eyes are now suspended as stars in the heavens (mm. 67-68). The voice has participated in the most unsettling cadence in the cycle, while the orchestra goes on to remember and re-create the sense of longing at the outset of the song. When the orchestra begins the appoggiatura “Augen” motive again, pain and yearning are imposed upon the listener as the truest reality (mm. 67-74). Perhaps this inconclusiveness represents the father’s unwillingness to accept the fate of his children, or perhaps the father has merely been awakened out of his state of frenzied rambling and is left speechless. He has nothing to say and nothing to feel but the unfulfilled longing that the music continues to evoke. Mahler finishes the song with an unsatisfying cadence: an apparent D-flat dominant seventh chord resolves to the C minor tonic.\(^{88}\)

Furthering the aural image of the father’s mental instability are his undulating and unexpected dynamics. After a crescendo to what should be one of the most dramatic points in the song, the vocal line is given a subito pianissimo (m. 66). The sudden change in dynamic requires a great deal of effort on the performer’s part, to such an extent that witnessing the realization of

---

88 The codetta of the final movement of Schubert’s C major quintet, and the third movement of Brahms’s piano quintet both emphasize and cadence using the motion of D-flat to C.
this dynamic shift has a powerful effect both on the sound and on physical gesture that the audience sees. The subito pianissimo might be considered the point at which the father truly realizes the absence of his children’s eyes. His voice hits the note, outlines the rest of the triad, and falls away in a painfully inconclusive cadence (mm. 65-67).

Mahler’s use of silence increases the sense of the father’s mind faltering and of the general unsettledness in the second song. Thomas Clifton notes that silence is key in the production and control of musical tension, for silences, whether they are by-products of the previous musical material or precursors of the music to come, enhance tension already created by an absence of tonal clarity. Furthermore, although musical and spoken discourses differ in certain important respects, both make rhetorical use of silence. Silence can be used for emphasis, to suggest reflection, as a sign of anticipation, to indicate intimacy, or perhaps simply because the singer needs to breathe. Moreover, as Clifton observes, musical silence “affords metaphoric comparison to spontaneous narrative, mimicking hesitation, inexpressibility, and advancing a sense of intimacy and language-like communication.” Another important function of silence is to interrupt. The silences in the second song of Kindertotenlieder are both interruptive and unsettling, and they draw the listener all the more deeply into the music.

There are six distinct points of silence in the score, created by rests in the orchestra in mm. 3, 37 (the beginning of the sestet), 38, 45, 69, and 71. The fact that the silences are heavily weighted to the second half of the song suggests the father’s increasing inarticulateness and the fragmented nature of his thoughts. Although there are other places where silence can be construed, the beginnings of these measures call for rests throughout the orchestra. These

91 Ibid., 273.
92 Ibid., 253.
silences focus the listeners’ attention on their relationship to the piece being performed. For example, at the opening of the song (m. 3), a regular rhythmic cycle and musical backdrop have not yet been established, and the unexpected moment of silence rivets the listener’s attention. A silence so early in the song after such marked dissonance enhances the sense of instability and the longing created in the previous two measures. The second silence occurs immediately before the introduction of the personified eyes (m. 37). Up to this point, the song has been in common time. This measure, however, begins with a silence, and the 3/2 time signature slows the sense of time. This elongation of time continues in the next measure, despite the return to common time, through the use of augmentation (mm. 38-40). The next silence occurs in m. 45: the measure before a key change to G minor. The silences continue even after the father has finished an inconclusive cadence in m. 67. The sustained augmented sixth chord in m. 68 is followed by a silence in m. 69 that gives way to the final series of “Augen” motives. Time seems increasingly extended as both the rhythm and the harmonic rhythm slow, and more and more voices become silent. m. 71 contains the final moment of silence and begins the ritardando and final statement of the augmented sixth chord and its uncertain resolution in m. 73.

There is another implied kind of “silence” created by a crescendo to forte in the three-note pick-ups to the appoggiatura chords immediately followed by a subito piano or pianissimo on the chord itself (for a few examples, see mm. 2, 4, 11, 13, and 20). The expectation of a dramatic arrival on the chord is thwarted, thus drawing the listener even more closely into the song’s story. The music takes on the rambling qualities of the text, the unpredictability of the silences making the music sound fragmented. This suggests the father’s struggle to convey his emotions and speak coherently. The silences increase the listener’s sense of the longing that the

93 Clifton, 163.
father feels for his children, they enhance the tonal ambiguity of the second song, and they make the father’s psychological state seem more and more fragile.

Song 3: “Wenn dein Mütterlein”

The text of the first song presented the father as intensely self-absorbed, whereas in the second song he seemed to focus his attention more outside himself, on his children’s eyes. The text of the third song expresses a further transition in the father’s focus as now he is fixated on the absence of his daughter from her place in the home. Despite this more outward focus, the music continues to seem “stuck” in the father’s psyche. The father perceives everything, including his daily routine, in light of his loss. In this, the only text that is specific about the gender of a child, the father sings of his daughter, and of the place that she used to occupy in the door, her absence, and the painful impact her absence has on his everyday life. Mahler altered the texts of all the Kindertotenlieder but changed that of the third song the most. He took bits and pieces of Rückert’s original poem and wove them together to create something different. Mahler’s song starts with the second stanza of Rückert’s original poem, but eliminates the last three lines (see Table 3). He then follows with the first half of the first stanza, and the song concludes with the three lines that he had eliminated from the second stanza.

Because of the heavily metaphorical language up to this point in the cycle, there have only been vague indications that the children are gone. After the eyes of the children are transformed into stars in the second song, the metaphor gives way to reality in the third song. An emphasis on sight and clarity comes through in the third song as the father speaks of looking to see where his daughter used to be (mm. 21-33).

---

Rushing, 32.
### Table 3: Wenn dein Mütterlein

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Rückert:</th>
<th>Mahler:</th>
<th>Translation:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Wenn zur Tür herein</td>
<td>Wenn dein Mütterlein</td>
<td>If your dear mother</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tritt dein Mütterlein</td>
<td>Tritt zur Tür herein,</td>
<td>Comes in the door,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mit der Kerze Schimmer,</td>
<td>Und den Kopf ich drehe,</td>
<td>And I turn my head,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ist es mir als immer,</td>
<td>Ihr entgegen sehe,</td>
<td>To look across at her,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kämst du mit herein,</td>
<td>Fällt auf ihr Gesicht</td>
<td>It is not on her face</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Huschtest hinterdrein</td>
<td>Erst die Blicke nicht,</td>
<td>That my glance falls first,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Als wie sonst ins Zimmer.</td>
<td>Sondern auf der Stelle</td>
<td>But on the place</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Träum ich, bin ich wach,</td>
<td>Näher, näher nach der Schwelle,</td>
<td>Nearer to the threshold,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oder seh’ ich schwach</td>
<td>Dort, dort wo würde dein Lieb’ Gesichtchen sein,</td>
<td>There where your</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bei dem Licht, dem matten?</td>
<td>Wenn du freudenhelle</td>
<td>Dear little face would be</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Du nicht, nur ein Schatten Folgt der Mutter nach.</td>
<td>Trätest mit herein</td>
<td>If you, bright with joy, came in</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Immer bist du, ach,</td>
<td>wie sonst, mein Töchterlein.</td>
<td>With her</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Noch der Mutter Schatten.</td>
<td></td>
<td>As usual, my little daughter.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| Wenn dein Mütterlein                                                  | Wenn dein Mütterlein                                                  | If your dear mother |
| tritt zur Tür herein,                                                  | tritt zur Tür herein,                                                  | Comes in the door, |
| Mit der Kerze Schimmer,                                                | Mit der Kerze Schimmer,                                                | With her candle’s glimmer, |
| Ist es mir als immer,                                                  | Ist es mir als immer,                                                 | For me it is as always |
| Kämst du mit herein,                                                   | Kämst du mit herein,                                                   | If you entered with her, |
| Huschtest hinterdrein                                                  | Huschtest hinterdrein                                                 | You slip into the room |
| Als wie sonst ins Zimmer!                                              | Als wie sonst ins Zimmer!                                             | Behind her as usual! |
| O du, o du des Vaters Zelle,                                            | O du, o du des Vaters Zelle,                                           | You, in your father’s cell, |
| Ach, zu schnelle, zu schnell                                          | Ach, zu schnelle, zu schnell                                          | Ah, too quickly, |
| Erlosch’ner Freudenschein!                                              | Erlosch’ner Freudenschein!                                             | Too quickly extinguished |
| Wenn dein Mütterlein                                                  | Wenn dein Mütterlein                                                  | Glem of joy |
| tritt zur Tür herein,                                                  | tritt zur Tür herein,                                                  | |
| Mit der Kerze Schimmer,                                                | Mit der Kerze Schimmer,                                                | |
| Ist es mir als immer,                                                  | Ist es mir als immer,                                                 | |
| Kämst du mit herein,                                                   | Kämst du mit herein,                                                   | |
| Huschtest hinterdrein                                                  | Huschtest hinterdrein                                                 | |
| Als wie sonst ins Zimmer!                                              | Als wie sonst ins Zimmer!                                             | |
| O du, o du des Vaters Zelle,                                            | O du, o du des Vaters Zelle,                                           | |
| Ach, zu schnelle, zu schnell                                          | Ach, zu schnelle, zu schnell                                          | |
| Erlosch’ner Freudenschein!                                              | Erlosch’ner Freudenschein!                                             | |

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Changes:</th>
<th>Changes:</th>
<th>Changes:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mahler starts with the second stanza of the poem, but omits the last three lines. He then uses the first half of the first stanza, deletes the second half, and ends with the three lines previously omitted from the end of the second stanza.</td>
<td>Stanza 1: repeat of “näher,” “dort,” and “tartest mit herein”</td>
<td>Stanza 2: reversal of opening to read “Wenn dein Mütterlein/Tritt zur Tür herein” to match Stanza 1; last three lines repeat of “O du, der Vaterzelle” to “des Vaters Zelle,” insertion of “ach,” repeat of “zu schnelle” and “erlosch’ner Freudenschein”</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

As in the other songs, the text uses the subjunctive mood to refer to a hypothetical situation, to that which is other than reality. For example, the father says “Wenn dein Mütterlein tritt zur Tür herein” (*If* your dear mother comes in the door, mm. 8-9), “dort, wo würde dein lieb’ Gesichtchen sein” (there, where your dear little face *would* be, mm. 24-26), and “Kämst du mit
“herein” (if you entered with her, mm. 48-49). The father longs for his daughter; so strong is his focus on his daughter’s absence that it initially deters him from acknowledging her mother, who in effect is also absent.

The father’s understanding of his daughter’s absence is expressed musically: the lack of tonal clarity in the second song gives way to highly structured, straightforward counterpoint and predictable and fairly forthright tonal idioms in the third. In fact, the third song is so basic and rigid in its construction that the persona seems to be paralyzed with grief. In what is ritornello-like material, the woodwinds in particular suggest the father’s rumination as they incessantly cycle through the same music. The music is densely contrapuntal, and despite the fluid movement of the musical lines seems suspended in musical time and space, the scant texture conveying the daughter’s absence as felt by the father. The bass line of the song outlines simple harmonies, and as in the first movement of Brahms’s *Requiem*, there are no violins, producing a darker timbre that is enhanced further by the use of the English horn, which is deeper and darker in tone than the oboe. The contrapuntal lines in the winds are juxtaposed with a dry string pizzicato that wearily treads along in dirge-like mourning.

At the opening of the song, the emotional trauma of the father leaves him able to speak only in fragments, a few measures at a time (mm. 8-9, 12-15, and 17-18). But the voice’s shorter phrases give way to longer phrases as the father’s despair increases. The singer is also given the expressive marking “Schwermütig” (melancholy; m. 8). To sing in a melancholy manner requires some physical manifestation of the sentiment, and Mahler enhances the dramatic narrative of the song by requiring this from the performer. But the rigid and seemingly emotionless first phrase gives way to an outpouring of grief that seems to overwhelm the father, for he sings one of the longest vocal phrases of the cycle (mm. 21-33). The division of the text in
this musical phrase is such that if the singer were to take a breath, it would be in the middle of a word and thus disrupt the phrase. The only logical place for the performer to take a breath is in m. 24, before the word “dort,” a climactic point in the text and in the music. The subsequent line of text and music are such that by the end of the phrase, it becomes apparent that the performer is physically drained, at the end of his breath (mm. 25-33). This point of obvious exhaustion on the part of the vocalist is the point at which the A section returns in the orchestra and the contrapuntal cycle begins again. The voice reenters in m. 40, with music that is analogous to that in mm. 21-33.

The father’s grief is escalating, and he is no longer in control of his emotions. In m. 55, Mahler instructs the performer to sing “mit ausbrechendem Schmerz,” or “with pain breaking out.” Mm. 54-64 are a distressing moment in the vocalist’s portrayal of the father. To convey pain breaking out entails a distortion of the face and perhaps even the body to be truly effective. The notes marked forte are near the upper limit of the vocalist’s range, and the effort required to hit them, to articulate the text, and to maintain the continuity of the musical line would easily convey an “outbreak of pain,” a dramatic manifestation of the father’s grief. Moreover, there is a contrast between the father’s forte outbreak and the softly marked, sparse orchestral accompaniment that enhances the intensity. In m. 64, the winds and strings return to the material from the beginning, and life is as it was at the beginning of the song; the noticeable absence of the daughter and the plodding procession of grief continue. Coming to a half cadence on the dominant of C minor, the third song finishes in such a way that it requires the next song.
Song 4: “Oft denk’ ich, sie sind nur ausgegangen”

The stark rigidity of the third song conveys the father’s apparent coming to terms with
the absence of his daughter. But this changes in the fourth song as the music and text present an
even greater conflict than before between the father’s reason and his emotion. The father seems
to experience an increasing state of panic. Perhaps in denial of the reality of what has happened
to his children, he returns to his use of metaphor. Despite the father’s presentation of what he
believes must be logical, it is obvious to the listener that he is becoming increasingly out of touch
with reality. The text of the fourth song seems straightforward: three stanzas, each of which is
divided into pairs of rhymed couplets (see Table 4).\textsuperscript{95} The second couplet in each stanza shows
the father’s lack of a grip on reality as he tries to tell himself not to be anxious. The father is even
more emphatically removed from the children, and the children’s absence is magnified in that
they are not just out of the father’s sight but rather out of the house entirely.

The manipulation of time and phrasing in the fourth song is remarkable, and reflects the
persona’s rapidly and abnormally changing emotions. The elision of phrases and the
incorporation of 3/2 measures throughout the song transform Rückert’s rather simplistic poem
into a musical embodiment of the persona’s oscillating emotions. Each stanza contains two
measures that are in a 3/2 time signature, but where those measures occur differs between
stanzas. For example, in the first and second stanzas, the first 3/2 bar falls as the final measure of
the first line of text (mm. 8 and 26), lingering on the word “ausgegangen” (gone out). The next
instance of the 3/2 measure in stanza 1 occurs immediately prior to the third line of text (m. 14),
emphasizing the flat-VI chord, with the congruent 3/2 measure in the second stanza occurring
before the third line of text (m. 35). The third stanza delays the use of the 3/2 bar until mm. 53

\textsuperscript{95} Rushing, 37.
when the persona says the word “Haus” (house). This is followed by another 3/2 bar only four measures later (m. 58) that again occurs immediately before the third line of text.

The listener should note the progression in the father’s thinking during the stanzas, as he begins by thinking that the children have gone out but finally recognizes that he will one day join his children. In the first stanza, the father states that he thinks that the children have merely gone
out (mm. 5-8). The second half of the stanza reveals the father’s labile emotions when he consoles himself by saying “Der Tag ist schön! O, sei nicht bang! Sie machen nur einen weiten Gang” (The day is beautiful! Oh, don’t be anxious! They are only taking a long walk; mm.15-21). While it could be inferred that the father is telling his children to remain calm, the more reasonable assumption is that the father is in fact talking to himself. The second stanza opens with the father speaking to himself and trying more emphatically to convince himself that “yes, surely they have merely gone out” and will soon be returning home (mm. 23-24). An additional difference is that the children have moved from simply taking a “long walk” (stanza 1), to a walk that is on “yonder heights,” even more removed from the presence of the father (mm. 36-43).

The text of the third stanza again progresses to the point at which the father calms his fears by saying that the children have indeed gone out ahead “of us” (mm. 46-49), presumably referring to his wife and him (mm. 46-49 and mm. 58-62). The statements of reassurance in the first two stanzas are replaced by a more resigned acceptance of the fact that the children are gone forever (mm. 50-54) and the father’s recognition that he will one day join the children where the day is beautiful (mm. 58-62). By the end of the third stanza it would seem that reason has won, save for the fact he has still not mentioned that the children are dead. Rather, the father speaks metaphorically in an attempt to comprehend the tragic reality of where his children are. Furthermore, the beautiful day that the father speaks of in the first and second stanza is transformed into a beautiful day that exists only where his children are, on yonder heights, something that is attested to by the orchestral voice.

---

The accompanimental voices of the fourth song open as an undulation of tones that evokes a sense of wandering. Mahler instructs that the bass line is to be played “deutlich” (clearly). This fourth song opens with a warmer, richer timbre and texture than did previous songs, almost to the point of sounding hopeful. This sense of optimism quickly disappears when the voice enters in mm. 5-6 over an E-flat minor sonority. By m. 13, the tonality has shifted to G-flat major for the second half of the first stanza. This is the point at which the father begins to reassure himself about where the children are. In this, the “b” portion of the stanza (and all subsequent stanzas), the vocal part is set in a higher register than before.

Furthermore, Mahler changes the accompaniment of the third line each time it appears. The first time that this change occurs is particularly noticeable as it is demarcated with the insertion of a 3/2 measure (mm. 14-15). The lower strings cease what had been an almost incessant eighth note movement, and the remaining orchestral voices move in chorale-like conjunction with the voice (mm. 15-18). Hopper notes that because of the suspension of moving eighth notes in the third phrases of the stanzas, it seems as though the progression of time, or the pulse, is reliant upon the persona’s voice. Furthermore, because of the voice’s register and because Mahler marks the dynamic for the voice as pianissimo, mm. 15-18 are difficult to perform. An audible and visible exertion is required of the performer, which will make him appear strained. Moreover, in spite of the optimism of the text in mm. 15-18, the awkwardly conceived melody enhances the distress of the persona. As though unable to complete his thought, in m. 21 the singer tapers off in an unsettling elision with the natural continuation of his phrase in the second and first violins respectively (mm. 22). The father interrupts the possibility of a solid cadence when he begins the second stanza in m. 23. The second stanza is much like the first, save for its sparser texture and the absence of the moving eighth notes in the low strings.

---

97 Hopper, 290.
Mahler again reduces the accompanimental forces in the third line of text, leaving the oboe in dialogue with the persona and playing an inversion of his music (mm. 37-39). The end of the final phrase of stanza two is elongated by an additional measure, at which point, as though unable to continue his train of thought, the singer again accedes his musical phrase to the solo first violin, the musical phrase then continuing and eliding with the beginning of the third stanza (mm. 43-46).

In the third stanza, the orchestra again serves as the all-knowing voice, revealing the truest feelings of the persona. The music does not in any way underscore the resigned sentiment conveyed in the text, but rather is more unstable and anxious—the orchestral voice is much more active than in previous stanzas—with a more ominous quality in the timbre and harmony. The clarinets participate in a dialogue of moving eighth notes and quarter notes, the harp has accented quarter notes on every beat, and the bass line is now a series of nearly constant eighth notes (mm. 46-54). There is a slight difference in the beginning of the third stanza from those of the previous two. In mm. 48-49, what had previously been only a half note is now two half notes tied together, creating a similar effect to what had previously been a 3/2 measure in stanzas one and two (mm. 8 and 26). Here, the persona lingers on the word “vorausgegangen” (gone out ahead; mm. 48-49). The appearance of the first 3/2 bar in stanza 3 is delayed until m. 53, and emphasizes the word “Haus” (house; m. 53). The persona’s pause on the thought and idea of the children having gone out ahead of him and of their absence from the home almost seem to entangle the father so that he cannot get past those words. The orchestral interlude between the first and second portions of the third stanza has also increased to the point that a Neapolitan chord is emphasized for four measures (mm. 55-58) before the voice returns with the “b” section of the phrase in mm. 58-59 (orchestral interlude, mm. 54-58). The father even speaks of his own
impending absence when he says that he and the mother will overtake the children on "yonder heights" (mm. 58-69). In contrast to the dynamics in the first two stanzas, the voice is now raised a degree to piano. The father’s increasing distress and attempts at self-consolation rise to the climactic point in the song, just six measures before the end (mm. 65-66). In the first and second stanza, the voice was unable to complete any of its final lines of music. In the third stanza, as though mustering all the energy and emotion that he can, the persona sings increasingly loud, and rises chromatically and sequentially to a high F, before descending by steps to the final note, B-flat. The persona’s completion of a final musical phrase is satisfying, although again, he inconclusively cadences on the fifth scale degree.

The voice’s final note is enhanced by the dynamics of the orchestra, and in particular by the dramatic leap up to a high B-flat, and subsequent descending glissando in the first violins (m. 68). While the voice sings the final note, the other instruments are marked from piano to pianississimo (m. 69). Furthermore, Mahler marks that the orchestra is to play “zögernd” (reluctantly). It is noteworthy that he does not simply mark “ritardando.” The more precisely human marking “reluctantly” suggests greater nuance to the performers. The resolution of the final cadence comes when A-flat move to the third scale degree, G. While the underlying bass note of the final cadence is indeed the tonic E-flat, the prominence of the fifth scale degree makes the cadence sound inconclusive.

Song 5: “In diesem Wetter, in diesem Braus”

The hope and promise of the beautiful day on the distant heights referred to in the fourth song is made a distant memory in the fifth song. The beautiful day has been overpowered by an intense and battering storm, and the children remain beyond the father’s protection. The nature of
the storm is vital to understanding this song, and it is the first thing the persona refers to. This storm is no ordinary rain shower, but rather a “tumult” and a “horror.” There are five stanzas, and although Mahler modifies some of the original words in the poem, the major modification that he makes to Rückert’s original poem is to repeat the first stanza after the third, and before the final and thus fifth stanza (See Table 5).98

Table 5: In diesem Wetter

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Rückert:</th>
<th>Mahler:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>In diesem Wetter, in diesem Braus,</strong></td>
<td><strong>In diesem Wetter, in diesem Braus,</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Nie hätt’ ich gesendet die Kinder hinaus;</em></td>
<td><em>Nie hätt’ ich gesendet die Kinder hinaus;</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Man hat sie hinaus getragen,</em></td>
<td><strong>Man hat sie getragen, getragen hinaus</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Ich durfte dazu nichts sagen.</em></td>
<td><strong>Ich durfte nichts dazu sagen.</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>In diesem Wetter, in diesem Saus,</strong></td>
<td><strong>In diesem Wetter, in diesem Saus,</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Nie hätt’ ich gelassen die Kinder hinaus,</em></td>
<td><em>Nie hätt’ ich gelassen die Kinder hinaus,</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Ich fürchtete, sie erkranken,</em></td>
<td><strong>Ich fürchtete, sie erkranken;</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Das sind nun eitle Gedanken.</em></td>
<td><strong>Das sind nun eitle Gedanken.</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>In diesem Wetter, in diesem Graus,</strong></td>
<td><strong>In diesem Wetter, in diesem Graus,</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Hätt’ ich gelassen die Kinder hinaus,</em></td>
<td><em>Nie hätt’ ich gelassen die Kinder hinaus,</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Ich sorgte, sie stürben morgen,</em></td>
<td><strong>Ich sorgte, sie stürben morgen,</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Das ist nun nicht zu besorgen.</em></td>
<td><strong>Das ist nun nicht zu besorgen.</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>In diesem Wetter, in diesem Braus,</strong></td>
<td><strong>In diesem Wetter, in diesem Graus!</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Sie ruhn als wie in der Mutter Haus,</em></td>
<td><em>Nie hätt’ ich gesendet die Kinder hinaus,</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Von keinem Sturme erschrecket,</em></td>
<td><strong>Man hat sie hinaus getragen,</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Von Gottes Hand bedecket.</em></td>
<td><strong>Ich durfte nichts dazu sagen.</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>In diesem Wetter, in diesem Saus,</strong> In diesem Braus,**</td>
<td><strong>In diesem Wetter, in diesem Saus,</strong> In diesem Braus,**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Sie ruhn, sie ruhn als wie in der Mutter,</em></td>
<td><em>Sie ruhn, sie ruhn als wie in der Mutter,</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Der Mutter Haus.</strong></td>
<td><strong>Der Mutter Haus.</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Von keinem Sturm erschrecket,</em></td>
<td><em>Von keinem Sturm erschrecket,</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Von Gottes Hand bedecket,</em></td>
<td><em>Von Gottes Hand bedecket,</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Wie in der Mutter Haus,</em></td>
<td><strong>Wie in der Mutter Haus,</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Wie in der Mutter Haus!</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

98 Rushing, 41-2.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Translation:</th>
<th>Changes:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>In this weather, in this tumult,</td>
<td>Stanza 1: “Man hat sie hinaus getragen” to “man hat sie getragen, getragen hinaus;” “dazu” and “nichts” are reversed.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I would never have sent the children out,</td>
<td>Stanza 2: no changes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>They have been carried, carried out.</td>
<td>Stanza 3: Second line prefaced with “Nie’”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I could say nothing about it.</td>
<td>Stanza 4: A repetition of Stanza 1, but with “Graus,” not “Braus” at the end of the first line.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In this weather, in this storm,</td>
<td>Stanza 5: is Rückert’s Stanza 4; in the first line, “in diesem Saus” inserted before “in diesem Braus;” “ruhn” to “ruhn” “sie ruhn” and “der Mutter” are repeated; in the third line “Sturme” without the final “e’” extension at the end with “sie ruhn”, sie ruhn wie in der Mutter Haus, wie in der Mutter Haus!”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I would never have let the children out.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I feared they would fall sick, Those are now vain thoughts.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In this weather, in this horror,</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I would never have let the children out.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I worried that they would die tomorrow,</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>That is nothing to worry about now.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In this weather, in this horror!</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I would never have sent the children out.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>They have been carried out,</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I could say nothing about it!</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In this weather, in this storm, in this tumult,</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>They are sleeping as though in their mother’s house,</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Frightened by no storm,</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sheltered by God’s hand,</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>They are sleeping as though in their mother’s house!</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Each stanza opens with the father’s acknowledgement of the terrible weather, the first two lines of text nearly identical in each. Except for the change Mahler makes in stanzas two and three where he alters “sent” to “let,” the only difference between the first halves of the stanzas is in the word Rückert uses for storm. In the first stanza he uses “Braus” (tumult; m. 19), and in the second stanza, “Saus” (storm; m. 34). The third stanza uses “Graus” (horror; m. 53), and the final stanza uses both “Saus” and “Braus” (mm. 104 and 106). By using so many different words for “storm,” Rückert conveys the severity of the storm. Even the articulation of the different words for “storm” has a visceral affect, for both the performer as he enunciates and the audience’s as it aurally experiences of the words. Mahler’s choice to repeat the first stanza before

---

99 The repetition of the first stanza changes the original “Braus” to Graus.” “Saus” is often difficult to translate, but has been translated here as “storm.”
the final stanza emphasizes the father’s terror of the children being carried out of the home and his inability to prevent it.

The father seems to project the storm of emotion he feels into a physical storm that has arisen without his knowledge. He says that if he had known of the storm, he never would have sent the children out (mm. 20-23). The notion in the first stanza that the father “sent” the children out suggests his sense of responsibility, that perhaps he could have taken measures to protect the children from the storm. He then immediately acknowledges that the children have been taken out, and that there is nothing he could have done about it (mm. 24-27). The confusion and malice of the storm have left him unsure as to whether he in fact sent the children out or they were taken from him by force. However, in mm. 24-26 Mahler has the persona repeat the word “carried.”

While it could be argued that he did this for purely musical reasons, it also serves as a point of emphasis by affirming that the children were taken against the father’s wishes, and that his psychological turmoil has left him utterly helpless.

The father’s thoughts about his children evolve again over the course of the song. For example, it was noted that the father struggles in the first stanza with knowing whether he sent the children out or they were carried out (mm. 17-31), but in the second stanza, he knows that the children are gone and that it was useless to fear they would fall sick (mm. 32-44). As in the other stanzas, the father speaks in the subjunctive in the third stanza in saying that he feared the children would die, but that it is nothing to worry about now (mm. 51-65). All of these ruminations bring the father back to his original thought in the repetition of the first stanza: “nie hätt’ ich gesendent die Kinder hinaus, man hat sie getragen hinaus. Ich durfte nichts dazu sagen!” (I would never have sent the children out, they have been carried out. I could say nothing

100 “Man hat sie getragen, getragen hinaus” (they have been carried, carried out).
about it; mm. 74-91). The fifth and final stanza is drastically different in the way Mahler set it, and it will be addressed as the culmination of the narrative and as the final point of this chapter.

The fifth song is the most musically dramatic in the cycle and provides an excellent example of performative gesture helping to construct a narrative. From the outset the orchestra appears and sounds as if it is the very embodiment of the storm of which the father sings. This results in not only an aural but also a visual experience for the audience. The visual aspect comes from the physical exertion necessary to perform the music, especially on the part of the string players: the disjunct melodic lines entail exaggerated bodily movements. Furthermore, the interweaving of the lines means that different orchestral forces play the melodic fragments at different times, a type of writing that manifests itself as a dramatic musical and physical gesture. For example, the second violins and the violas participate in a dialogue at the opening of the fifth song (mm. 1-4). The octave leaps in conjunction with the pizzicatos (second violins only) are difficult to play because they require the crossing of three strings. Achieving the desired dynamic makes this even more difficult. The pizzicatos in the second violins require additional physical effort because of the rapid transition from the pizzicato to the arco octaves.

Although it opens in the key of D minor, the song becomes tonally less clear. When the voice enters singing the tonic pitch repeatedly, it sounds dissonant against the orchestral accompaniment due to the chromatic lines in the orchestra (m. 17). The very opening is a torrential onslaught of sound. The flutes, violins, and violas play on the off-beat with the violins and violas in a continuous dialogue that outlines the first and fifth scale degrees (mm. 1-6). At the bottom of the texture, the cellos and basses have a repeating descending line. The basses play pizzicato, and the cellos are given trills and accents on every note (mm. 1-6). Mahler’s instructions to the orchestra are again unusual, for he instructs it to play “Mit ruhelos
schmerzvollen Ausdruck” (with restlessly painful expression). It is not difficult for a singer to manifest a restlessly painful type of expression; to ask a group of instrumentalists to play in a restless and painful way is unusual. The fulfillment of these instructions requires the performers to project the emotion through their bodily gestures. The notion of playing an instrument with painful expression is particularly unusual in that this direction essentially asks the instrumentalists to play with a quality (pain) that can only be achieved with a human voice.

What might be termed the “primary melody” in the opening appears in the oboe and English horn (mm. 5-8). Together these instruments outline D minor before they begin a chromatic descent that is taken over by the violins in m. 9, and that Mahler varies through octave displacement (mm. 7-11). The dynamic markings in the opening and throughout the song ebb, flow, and surge, much like a real storm. The undulation of the dynamics along with the variety of accents creates a surging effect as the orchestra expresses the storm. An additional effective technique for evoking painfulness is to stipulate that the strings be played on the bridge (“am Steg”), creating a sound that is metallic and uncomfortable to the ear (mm. 18 and 25). The strings also begin the song with mutes on, producing a gruff sound and an eerie timbre.

Throughout the song the vocal line is awkwardly constructed and in a sense “painful” to sing. The voice enters in m. 17 and sings a repeated D before jumping up an octave and chromatically descending back to the third scale degree. Mahler’s instructions to, and the way that he composed for, the singer manifest the persona’s grief. The expressive markings of “schmerzlich” (painfully; m. 28) and “klagend” (in a lamenting manner; m. 54) indicate that the singer is indeed to portray the character and emotions of the father. The intense chromaticism in the surrounding instrumental voices increases the difficulty of the vocal line. The voice and orchestra are in an incongruous relationship, the voice in its own realm but also consumed by the
storm/orchestra. In this state it becomes merely another force in the storm/orchestra. In successive stanzas the father’s vocal line rises progressively higher in pitch, the rise in pitch suggesting the persona’s increasing panic (mm. 17-23, 32-38, 51-57, and 74-76). Like the father’s psyche, his speech is frayed and broken. Not only the orchestra but also the disjunct and fragmented statements of the vocal line reflect the persona’s psychological state.

The importance that Wagner placed on the function of harmony as the foundation from which the melody and the audience’s emotional responses are derived is profoundly relevant to the fifth song. The lack of cohesion between the voice and the orchestra is particularly noticeable in the repetition of the first stanza that begins in m. 74, the climax of the storm, and what seems to be the culmination of the persona’s grief. The orchestral texture is dense and chromatic, the dynamics are overpowering, and the vocal line diverges even more from the other orchestral voices than in previous stanzas. The incompatibility of the vocal line with the orchestral lines suggests the father’s dissociation from the world around him. He has reached a point in grieving that makes him oblivious to his surroundings, absorbed in the storms of his own emotions. For the performer to achieve the degree of detachment from the orchestra called for in the fourth stanza requires an immense amount of effort. This effort is exponentially increased by the fact that the orchestra is instructed to play “Stetig steigernd” (constantly rising to a climax; m. 73). There is no single pinnacle; instead the orchestra becomes increasingly overpowering. The persona, consumed by the deafening crescendo in the orchestral voices, finishes the stanza and cadences on a B-flat. This note is incompatible with the surrounding harmony, conveying the persona’s detachment from the world (m. 91). The orchestral voices speak most powerfully in this section. Like the father’s grief, it has become an increasingly formidable force. It is the voice of pain, and throughout the cycle, has appeared as the voice of reality, regardless of what the
persona says. In the midst of the storm’s climax, the piccolo pierces through the orchestral texture in both reminiscence and foretelling of the piercing “rays of light.”

Acute sounds, first in the piccolo (mm. 77-82) and then the glockenspiel in mm. 93, 95, 97, and 98 reappear as moments of transformation. Beginning in m. 92, the musical and psychological storm begins to dissolve. The chromatic eighth note pattern that underscored the cascades of stormy billows is now transformed into the gently rocking foundation of a lullaby (mm. 98-139). The eighth note figure is firmly grounded in D major, a complete contrast to the keys of the previous songs, as well as to the roaming tonality of the fifth song’s musical storm. The voice enters in m. 100 and simply outlines an inverted D major triad. The harmonies Mahler uses are straightforward but still colored with some chromaticism. From the beginning of the lullaby in m. 99 until m. 119, there is a noticeable absence of low-register instruments. But with the introduction of bass voices in m. 119, harmonic solidity returns to give the listener a sense of rest.

As mentioned above, the final stanza of the song makes a dramatic shift in tone and content. While the father still speaks of the storm, he does not do this in the context of its devastating effects. Rather, the persona speaks of the rest that the children now have despite the storm. He focuses on his children resting as though in their mother’s house, not frightened by the storm and protected by the hand of God, a protection that he feels he was unable to give. The final stanza is in the style of a lullaby, but to whom is it being sung? Is it a lullaby that the father sings to himself? Or perhaps he is singing to his children as they “sleep” the sleep of death. Again, as though unwilling to face reality, the persona uses the metaphor of “sleep” rather than

---

101 Mitchell, *Songs and Symphonies of Life and Death*, 83. Peter Russell also discusses the symbolic function of the glockenspiel on pp. 70, 107, and 108 of his book.
102 Mahler instructs that this portion of the song is to be played “Langsam. Wie ein Wiegenlied” (slowly, like a lullaby).
directly confronting the death of his children. Whatever his purpose in singing a lullaby, this marks a point of childlike regression. The shift from the “little light” being extinguished in the father’s “tent” in the first song to the children finding ultimate rest and protection in their mother’s house expresses the father’s psychological disintegration, as he now acknowledges his inability to protect them.

The persona’s repetition of the second line of the fifth stanza, with the children resting as though in their mother’s house, is important in constructing the father’s character at this point in the cycle (mm. 118-124). Until now, the father’s world revolved around the children—their place in his home and his role as their protector and provider. Now the father has detached himself and speaks of the children as though they rest in their mother’s house, rather than his, and are not sheltered by his own hand, but by the hand of God. Yet this is not the final musical thought that Mahler gives the listener. While the father’s last statement focuses on the children resting as though in their mother’s house, the orchestra seems to reveal the father’s final thoughts by reiterating the musical material in which he expressed that his children were sheltered by the hand of God, the Father (mm. 125-129). The postlude again shows the important role the orchestra plays in the cycle’s narrative. From mm. 125-139, the orchestra gradually dies away. Mahler could have simply given the instructions for a diminuendo, an effective means of eliciting the effect of dying away and an appropriate conclusion to a lullaby. But he goes one step further and tells the orchestra not only to diminuendo, but also to “die away” (“Morendo dim.” m. 136). Like the children, and the father’s psychological and emotional stability, the orchestra perishes and fades into a nearly inaudible final cadence. The regular eighth note pattern in the orchestra that underpinned the lullaby becomes increasingly fragmentary and slow,
eventually augmenting to quarter notes as the pulsations of life cease and all orchestral voices fade away (mm. 137-139).

The lullaby at the end of the song contains one more point of commentary essential to the narrative of the father. As one of the tenderest and most innately comforting of song types, a lullaby provides a familiar conclusion to what has been a disquieting and disturbing song cycle. After the textual and musical journey that came before, the lullaby in its simplicity is all the more powerful. Based on the music alone, it would seem that the storm has ceased and that with the lullaby the father finds resolution. In the text, however, there is no mention of the storm being over. The father only says that in the storm and tumult the children are not frightened by it, and that they are sheltered and sleeping. The fact that the storm continues in the text supports the idea that the father has not achieved peace and that his psyche, like the storm, still rages in grief. His grief is merely masked by what the father projects the children to be experiencing. It is not the father’s discovery of peace that brings him to sing this austere lullaby but rather his acquiescence to the pain of his loss. The lullaby therefore becomes a double metaphor, for the children’s death, as well as for the final dissolution of the father’s emotional well-being as he acquiesces to his grief.
The notion of absence has been prominent throughout Kindertotenlieder, the absence of the children in death, and ultimately the absence of the father’s psychological stability. The final absence in the fifth song is the sense of loss and emptiness experienced by the listener. Despite the seemingly peaceful lullaby conclusion, listeners are left without a sense of peace, as the tragedy of the cycle as a whole overwhelms them. The audience has witnessed a severe expression of mourning and has been admitted into intimate and painful realms of grief.

As mentioned above, the creation of dramatic narrative in Kindertotenlieder does not have a place in current scholarship. Yet, it has been made apparent that through Mahler’s selection of texts, the use of unusual musical directions, and through the music itself, that he intended to construct a dramatic narrative. With the incorporation of Wagnerian and dramatic techniques into a chamber-like genre, Kindertotenlieder is even more profoundly effective if experienced in a live performance. Although Kindertotenlieder is an intensely moving aural experience, if the audience is able to see the physical realization and display of the dramatic nature of the music, the encounter with grief is all the more poignant.

What is the narrative of Kindertotenlieder? The father does not move through time and space. Rather, in what is more or less a suspension of time, the narrative evolves in the character’s emotional and psychological state. Through Mahler’s creation of drama in so intimate a genre, Kindertotenlieder is a manifestation of what is perhaps the greatest and most profound narrative of all, the one that the human psyche creates in response to so dreadful an experience as the death of one’s own children.
BIBLIOGRAPHIC SOURCES

Primary Sources

Score


Poetry


Secondary Sources

Books and Websites


Journal Articles


