JAMES MACMILLAN’S *ST. JOHN PASSION*: THE ROLE OF CELTIC FOLK IDIOMS AND *THE REPROACHES*

Nathan Frank, B.M, M.M

Dissertation Prepared for the Degree of

DOCTOR OF MUSICAL ARTS

UNIVERSITY OF NORTH TEXAS

May 2014

APPROVED:

Jerry McCoy, Major Professor
Stephen Morscheck, Committee Member
Richard Sparks, Committee Member and Chair of Division of Conducting and Ensembles
James Scott, Dean of the College of Music
Mark Wardell, Dean of the Toulouse Graduate School
In 1829, Passion settings entered the secular concert hall with Felix Mendelssohn’s revival of Bach’s St. Matthew Passion in Berlin. The genre has fallen in and out of favor with composers because of the subject matter and Bach’s prominence in the setting. James MacMillan’s St. John Passion has established itself as one of the preeminent modern passion settings by manipulating past idioms such as chant, chorales, and other popular passion conventions in concert with his use of Celtic folk idioms. He creates a passion experience that strives for a spiritually Catholic influence. This approach has earned praise and harsh criticism.

MacMillan’s unique use of keening and the drone offers a uniquely Scottish passion that allows for Jesus’ crucifixion to be more poignant to the intended initial audience. In addition to his use of Celtic folk idioms, MacMillan uses added text; most central to this paper is The Reproaches. Movement eight (The Reproaches) is the emotional and musical climax of the work. This inclusion of text has shifted the climax, namely Jesus’s death and burial, to moments before his death. In addition, the value of the work as a liturgical work is lost by the inclusion of these texts, but a religious and spiritual essence remain.
Copyright 2014

by

Nathan Frank
## TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>LIST OF MUSICAL EXAMPLES</td>
<td>iv</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHAPTER 1. SIZE AND SCOPE OF THE ST. JOHN PASSION BY JAMES MACMILLAN</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHAPTER 2. JAMES MACMILLAN’S EARLY LIFE AND THE ST. JOHN PASSION</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHAPTER 3. THE ROLE OF CELTIC FOLK IDIOMS IN THE ST. JOHN PASSION</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHAPTER 4. THE ROLE OF JESUS AND THE REPROACHES</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHAPTER 5. CONCLUSION</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>APPENDIX: REPROACHES TEXT</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BIBLIOGRAPHY</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
LIST OF MUSICAL EXAMPLES

Example 3-1. Choral keening: James MacMillan, Movement 2 from *St. John Passion* mm. 62-73
....................................................................................................................................................... 13

Example 3-2. Solo keening: James MacMillan, Movement 2 from *St. John Passion* mm. 76-80
....................................................................................................................................................... 14

Example 3-3. Solo keening Jesus: James MacMillan, Movement 8 from *St. John Passion* mm. 66-79
............................................................................................................................................. 14

Example 3-4. Instrumental Keening, Violin: James Macmillan Movement 4 from *St. John Passion* mm 132-136
....................................................................................................................................................... 15

Example 3-5. Celtic Drone: James Macmillan movement 1 from The Seven Last Words of Christ mm 21-23
....................................................................................................................................................... 17

Example 3-6. Celtic Drone: James Macmillan movement 3 from *St. John Passion* mm 176-178
....................................................................................................................................................... 18

Example 3-7. Modified Celtic Drone and Instrumental Keens: James Macmillan movement 3 from *St. John Passion* mm 198-201
....................................................................................................................................................... 19

Example 3-8. The use of the Celtic Drone: James MacMillan, Movement 9 from *St. John Passion* mm. 1-9
....................................................................................................................................................... 20

Example 3-9. Modified Celtic Drone and Vocal Keens: James MacMillan, Movement 9 from *St. John Passion* mm. 20-23
....................................................................................................................................................... 21

Example 3-10. Modified Celtic Drone and Vocal Keens: James MacMillan, Movement 9 from *St. John Passion* mm 50-59
....................................................................................................................................................... 21

....................................................................................................................................................... 22

Example 4-2. Example 4-2 Halo of Strings Disappears: J.S. Bach , “Eli, Eli lama asabthani” *St. Matthew Passion*
....................................................................................................................................................... 23

Example 4-3. Chromatic Shrieks, First Clarinet: James MacMillan, Movement 8 from *St. John Passion* mm. 52
....................................................................................................................................................... 32

Example 4-4. Christ’s Anger: James MacMillan, Movement 8 from *St. John Passion* mm. 182-185
....................................................................................................................................................... 32
CHAPTER 1

SIZE AND SCOPE OF THE ST. JOHN PASSION BY JAMES MACMILLAN

In 2007, the London and Boston Symphony Orchestras commissioned James MacMillan to compose a work to celebrate the life and career of conductor Sir Colin Davis. The result was a Passion setting using the gospel of St. John¹ and the controversial Catholic text called The Reproaches. James MacMillan’s musical interpretation of the ancient Passion narrative draws musical devices from older compositional idioms and Celtic music, but offers a new account in 21st-century harmonic language. The work has been acclaimed as a landmark contemporary choral-orchestral work.

Although the St. John Passion by James MacMillan is one of the most profound large-scale choral/orchestral works written in the 21st century, very little has been written about it outside the realm of performance reviews. Since the London premiere in 2008, there have been subsequent performances, most notably in Berlin, Boston, Glasgow and Bath (the Glasgow Symphony and Boston Symphony were also part of the commission). Music critic, Keith Clark, states that “MacMillan has come up with a masterly work that has all the hallmarks of a 21st century classic… MacMillan is a master at ratcheting up the tension, building the drama, his subtle use of syncopation adding to the effect. But he can also turn his hand to the most lyrical, vulnerable music.”² Unfortunately, because of the performance demands, the St. John Passion is difficult to perform without employing a professional ensemble. In addition, following in the footsteps of previous composers, MacMillan maintains the convention of setting Jesus as a

¹ The Passion story in the Gospel according to St. John has long been controversial because it places blame for Jesus’s crucifixion on the Jews and not Pontius Pilate and the Romans.


http://www.musicalamerica.com/news/newsstory.cfm?hl=1&n=%7C%7C&t=&a=&p=&k=MacMillan%20has%20come%20up%20with%20a%20masterly%20work%20that%20has%20all%20the%20and%20archived=1&storyID=18092&categoryID=4.
baritone. In this case, it is a role that is quite difficult harmonically, rhythmically, and melodically. (The melody is built around a nearly two-octave range.) The role is filled with angularly weaving vocal lines that mimic both speech patterns and vocal laments. The role of Jesus was originally premiered by Cardiff “Singer of the Year” winner Christopher Maltman.

MacMillan’s use of the chorus is wide-ranging. There is both a large chorus and a small chorus, known as the Evangelist chorus. The larger chorus, originally sung by the London Symphony Chorus, represents the malicious crowd and a wide array of minor characters, as well as reflective, modern, and removed third person characters, representing modern Christians. The large chorus also serves as a drone as it accompanies the Evangelist chorus. The larger chorus should be composed of at least eighty singers of professional quality owing to the immensely thick orchestration and the division of the choir into sixteen parts. MacMillan states that if an amateur choir is used then the large chorus should incorporate 120 singers. The vocal lines of the larger chorus are quite difficult and the ranges can also prove to be problematic. Each of the four voice parts is active up to both its upper and lower limits. Also, intonation can be problematic because of the extended periods of complex unaccompanied singing that abut orchestral episodes. The narrator, or the voice of John, is represented by the Evangelist chorus. The size of the Evangelist chorus depends on the size of the orchestra and larger chorus. The Evangelist chorus requires a group of at least eight to at most twenty-four singers of professional caliber due to the especially difficult and complex harmonic and rhythmic vocabulary of the work. The melodic contour of much of the singing of the small narrator chorus owes its origin to chant and has the quality of a choral recitative.

The orchestra is set for a standard orchestra minus the battery of multiple percussionists.

---

3 The sopranos are asked to sing an upper Bb at a piano dynamic as well as notes in the bottom of the soprano range.
The orchestra consists of two flutes and piccolo (doubled by second flute), two oboes (second doubling English horn), bassoon, contrabassoon, four horns, three trumpets, two trombones, bass trombone, tuba, timpani, percussion (one player), chamber organ, and strings that are divided into three parts. The standard orchestra was used because Macmillan did not want to complicate the austere and lyrical writing of the chorus with bombastic percussion motifs.4

The passion text that MacMillan used is from the eighteenth and nineteenth chapters of the Gospel according to St. John in the Catholic edition of the Revised Standard Edition of the Bible. Two other sacred but not biblical texts play pivotal roles in this discussion. These texts are the Stabat Mater and Improperia.5 This masterwork, divided into two parts, is further divided into ten movements. The division of the ten movements is textually driven as they describe the ten different passion scenes. The first nine movements incorporate the choirs, a soloist, and the orchestra. The tenth and final movement is purely instrumental and is titled after a phrase in The Reproaches, “Sanctus Immortalis, miserere nobis” (My people, what have I done to you?).” Each of the sung movements, except movement 8, is completed with a Latin chorus. In MacMillan’s opinion, the Latin choruses “move the action from the vernacular into something that perhaps subliminally evokes the detachment (found) in Bach's chorales, but they come from my own Catholic tradition.”6 Dr. MacMillan has offered some insight on the St. John Passion through interviews, his personal blog, and a public blog on the website titled, The Telegraph. Through his blog, the reader can follow the compositional process from beginning to end. For instance, in the early stages of composition, MacMillan decided to add Latin choruses at the end of each

---

5 See appendix for full text of The Reproaches
movement. Concerning the second movement, he writes, “At the end of that movement, I'm going to have the choir singing the papal hymn *Tu es Petrus*: "You are Peter and upon this rock I will build my church.” Macmillan later reflects “There's a tongue-in-cheek association-presenting this flawed person, then all this papal glory simultaneously. But there's drama in that conflict, which goes right to the heart of the conflict in the church.” The triumphant papal hymn is sung by the larger chorus immediately after Peter and his human flaws (represented by his denial of Jesus) are introduced.

In order to teach, conduct, or perform this work effectively, it is important the conductor know what other influences are apparent in MacMillan’s compositional writing. These influences include his conservative Catholic theology and traditional Celtic music idioms. These major influences can be seen in his inclusion of the traditional Scottish elements of the Celtic drone and keening. In addition, a working knowledge of specific Celtic folk idioms and what they symbolize to Scottish culture is paramount to understanding James MacMillan’s visions for this work. Also, it is vital to have background knowledge of the added texts and whether this work is meant to be performed in a sacred or secular space.
CHAPTER 2

JAMES MACMILLAN’S EARLY LIFE AND THE ST. JOHN PASSION

James MacMillan was born in 1959 in Scotland and resided in Kilwinning, Ayrshire, a working class neighborhood forty miles south of Glasgow. This small coal mining and farming community was known for its brass band tradition and choral societies. His grandfather was a coal miner and played euphonium in one of the local bands. Because of the influential relationship with his grandfather, MacMillan started his music education as a trumpet player and then later joined a local choir. He recalls an early musical epiphany that displays his views on the connection of his spirituality to music in an interview.\(^7\)

I remember one of the very earliest musical experiences of mine, and certainly an experience which has made a huge impact on me, was being taken on holiday to visit relatives in Edinburgh and being taken along to the local Catholic Cathedral for a Sunday morning Mass. In those days, this is probably the early 1960s, the choir at St Mary's Cathedral in Edinburgh was conducted by Arthur Oldham, who was of course a friend of Benjamin Britten, was a renowned choral director at the Edinburgh Festival and various places. I just remember this heavenly music pouring out of the sanctuary during the celebration of Mass. [I was] thinking there was something transcendent, transporting about it. In a sense that [experience] went into the back burner of my mind as it were for years until I took up music. I remember thinking, if music is like this, [and it] can genuinely move the soul…it is indeed a powerful force. Therefore its association in my mind at an early stage with something spiritual seemed entirely natural and apt.

In 1977, he moved to Edinburgh to study composition with Rita McAllister. He later earned his doctorate in 1987 at Durham University. After his studies and a brief teaching career at Victoria University (1986-88) in England, he returned to Scotland to focus on composing.\(^8\)

James MacMillan has long been associated with addressing difficult and controversial topics because of his spiritual beliefs. MacMillan’s first major success was The Confession of

---


Isobel Gowdie for the BBC Scottish Symphony Orchestra. The work delved into the topic of witchcraft and the persecution of women in 17th-century Scotland, and led to other important commissions by the Welsh National Opera, and the London and Boston Symphonies. His most performed work, *Veni, Veni Emmanuel*, commissioned by Christian Salvesen for the Scottish Chamber Orchestra and premiered by percussionist Evelyn Glennie, incorporates fragments of plainchant (*Veni, Veni Emanuel*). The percussion concert, on which *Veni, Veni Emmanuel* was premiered, was dedicated to MacMillan’s parents and incorporates a wide array of percussion instruments creating “heartbeats which permeate the whole piece, offering a clue to the wider spiritual priorities behind the work, representing the human presence of Christ. Advent texts (*Veni, Veni Emanuel*) proclaim the promised day of liberation from fear, anguish and oppression, and this work is an attempt to mirror this in music.” Although *Veni Veni Emmanuel*’s text comes from Isaiah 7:14, Macmillan also finds inspiration for the percussion work from Luke 21: “There will be signs in the sun and moon and stars; on earth nations in agony, bewildered by the clamor of the ocean and its waves; men dying of fear as they await what menaces the world, for the powers of heaven will be shaken. And they will see the Son of Man coming in a cloud with power and great glory. When these things begin to take place, stand erect, hold your heads high, because your liberation is near at hand.” Near the end of the *Veni, Veni Emanuel*, the thoughts of liberation from fear, anguish and oppression switch from the Advent liturgy to the Easter vigil liturgy. Just as Advent is the waiting for the birth of Christ, the Easter vigil is the waiting for the rebirth or resurrection of Christ.

---


11 Ibid.
Macmillan’s other well-known sacred works are the *Strathclyde Motets, Mass of Blessed John Henry Newman, St. Anne Mass* and *Galloway Mass*. The *Strathclyde Motets* are very popular among choirs in the UK and are performed by professional and amateur choirs alike. Of the fourteen motets, many of them are written in a simple and more melodic style. The Mass of *Blessed John Henry Newman* was written for Pope Benedict’s visit to the United Kingdom in 2010. His setting of these works was the first sanctioned congregational setting of the new English translation of the Roman missal. The *St. Anne Mass* and *Galloway Mass* also are English settings of the Catholic missal for congregation and cantor.

His Roman Catholic faith also has inspired other works of note including his *Magnificat* and several other congregational masses he has written for the local church he serves in Glasgow. As well as serving as the music director at his church, both he and his wife serve as lay Dominicans. As a lay Dominican, he preaches at special events for the Catholic church as well as at masses. MacMillan grew up in a strict Catholic household that was concerned with social justice and the persecution of Catholics in Scotland.\(^{12}\) He was a follower of the tenets of liberation theology\(^{13}\) and religious pluralism MacMillan states:

> If I have a mission, I think it must involve acts of remembrance, of recollection, of rediscovery of the past or a re-animation of our heritage, of a reawakening of our culture.\(^{14}\) If this ingrained, unconscious hostility to that which is regarded as different from the supposed norm remains, the implications for multicultural progress are huge. The sense of threat and hostility is there and has huge implications for Scotland's potential.

These statements were extracted from his speech, “Shame on Scotland” given at the Edinburgh

---


Festival in 1999 and they were an attempt to reflect his belief that “Anti-Catholicism is a barrier to genuine pluralism.”

One notable collaboration displaying religious pluralism was *Raising Sparks*, a vocal cycle on a text by Michael Symmons Roberts for mezzo-soprano, flute, clarinet, harp, piano and string quartet. Both Macmillan and Roberts were raised during post Vatican II Catholicism, a time of Catholic religious pluralism, which played an important role in their spiritual formation. In 1965, the *Nostra Aetate* by Pope Paul the VI and his council stated: “Since the spiritual patrimony common to Christians and Jews is thus so great, this sacred synod wants to foster and recommend that mutual understanding and respect which is the fruit, above all, of biblical and theological studies as well as of fraternal dialogues.”

Roderick Dunnet describes *Raising Sparks* as, “dark as Mussorgsky, as awesome as Akhmatova. MacMillan makes Roberts' words flow as naturally as psalm-pointing. One moment he is as desolate as Rilke, the next as subtle as Sappho or a Tang dynasty poem… the effect is hypnotizing.” The work is centered on the Hasidic view of the creation story. It depicts God's love as a clay vessel which explodes, showering the universe with scattered "sparks.” Michael Symmons Roberts, a progressive Christian poet has won numerous awards for his books (*Raising Sparks*, *Corpus*, and *The Half Healed*) and his collaborations with MacMillan. MacMillan also has collaborated with Rowan Williams, the former Archbishop of Canterbury. Williams was the leader of the Church of England and the symbolic leader of the Anglican community worldwide.


James MacMillan met Rowan Williams when they and poet Michael Symmons Roberts collaborated on the creation of *Parthenogenesis* in 2000. *Parthenogenesis* is a musical theatre work that recounts the true story of a virgin birth that occurred in Hanover, Germany in 1944. The work does include numerous references to Mary and her virgin birth of Jesus, but also examines the wider issue of creativity in the confines of genetics. The subject raises an extreme range of responses. Genetics was hailed in wartime Germany as a Holy Grail, but it is also described as the ultimate blasphemy.\(^1\)

Like the *St. John Passion*, the previously mentioned works delve into the relationship of mankind and the presence of God. With these works, Macmillan looks to his Catholic heritage and focuses on musical transubstantiation. Macmillan states that "I believe it is God's divine spark which kindles the musical imagination now, as it has always done, and reminds us, in an increasingly dehumanized world, of what it means to be human."\(^2\)

---


CHAPTER 3
THE ROLE OF CELTIC FOLK IDIOMS IN THE ST. JOHN PASSION

Nigel Perrin of the King Singers writes, “MacMillan’s compositions are characterized by their theatrical quality. He is contemporary but very accessible, using an immediately identifiable musical language – there is almost a film score quality to his music. One can identify clear references to Scottish and Celtic folk music, and there is also, for me, a moving sense of MacMillan’s own deeply held Catholic faith.” The term Celtic itself is an enigma as it describes an ethno-linguistic group of clans from the Middle Ages. They were concentrated in what is now the United Kingdom, but they also stretched as far east as modern Hungary. Celtic languages are still spoken in Ireland, England, Scotland, and even in the Bretange region of France. In an interview with Richard McGregor, MacMillan explores the all-encompassing topic of Celtic as it refers to music. McGregor states,

“...There is little agreement on what the word actually means, whether linguistic, national, cultural, identity related, or with respect to its various manifestations. Nevertheless, general usage and MacMillan’s acceptance of its ‘characteristics’ as a defining term for aspects of his musical background mean that its significance and function as a definition need to be explored. In a sense it is a term that refers to music of Ireland and Scotland.”

The two most common Celtic folk idioms explored by Macmillan are keens and drones. The act of keening, in a basic sense, is an improvised solo vocal lament that has long been associated with mourning and funeral services. Keening can be traced back to 16th century Ireland and the Celtic parts of Scotland. Although keening is an important part of Celtic history, keening is not just a practice of the Celtic community. Keening has been observed in Asian,...

---

23 Breandán Ó Madagáin, Caointe agus Seancheolta Eile / Keening and other Old Irish Musics (Indreabhán: Cló Iar-
African, and other European countries. Charles Wagley provided an accurate depiction of keening after observing a Brazilian tribe mourn the death of a tribesman. Wagley wrote:

The body still in the hammock, was moved slightly to one side to accommodate the large number of visitors. His wife lay prostrate with grief in another hammock alongside the body. By noon, eight men were stomping out the dance of mourning. The wailing was stylized; it had a rhythm and it rose and fell almost as if it were a mournful song. I asked if the sounds they made were “songs of death.” “No,” they answered, “this is crying.”

The stylized cry in Ireland and Scotland dates to the Mna Caointe around 500 AD. These early keening groups had great power because mourners of the dead believed that there was a direct connection between the Mna’ Caointe, the deceased, and the higher power. In her dissertation titled *Keening Community: Mna Caointe, Women, Death, and Power*, Dr. Christina Brophy discusses the role of women in Irish society. She states,

Through their performances mna’ caointe invoked the otherworld and assumed the capabilities and characteristics of the transcendent. Mna’ caointe performed a religious ritual in which they mourned the dead as their own. When mourning members of the elite, mna’ caointe transformed themselves temporarily into, or took on the mantle of goddesses in the death/war form to demonstrated the grief of the land deprived of its mate, and to escort the dead to the otherworld. Necessary mediators, the disguises they used and the corresponding identities they assumed translated into social as well as religious power.

The practice of keening typically takes place the night before the funeral service and is different than the traditional Catholic wake. “Keening is thought to have been constituted of stock poetic elements (the listing of the genealogy of the deceased, praise for the deceased, emphasis on the woeful condition of those left behind, etc.) set to vocal lament. While generally

---


25 The mna’ caointe were a group of women that were believed to have a supernatural powers and were influenced by ancient pagan goddesses. Christina Brophy, “Keening Community: Mna Caointe, Women, Death, and Power in Ireland” (PhD diss., Boston College, 2010), 4-34.

26 Ibid. 31

carried out by one or several women, a chorus may have been intoned by all present. Physical
movements involving rocking, kneeling or clapping accompanied the keening woman ("Bean
Si") who was often paid for her services."28 By the late part of the sixteenth century, the Mna
Coainte and Bean Si became too powerful for religious authorities in the Catholic Church and
the Celtic Catholic councils began to enact religious laws against them. By the nineteenth
century, the formalized practice of keening had become extinct in Ireland and Scotland.29

In his article titled, “Contemporary British Composers 1. James MacMillan: A New
Celtic Dawn?”, Keith Potter expounds upon the juxtaposition of Scottish keening and 20th
century chromaticism, which is seen throughout the music of James MacMillan. Potter explores
the mingling of traditional aspects of Scottish keening and MacMillan’s avant-garde vocabulary,
thereby revealing how the combination intensifies the lamentations of the characters performing
the music. Keening plays an important role in depicting the text and making an ancient event
modern and relevant to the listener.30

Keening is prevalent throughout the St. John Passion, giving humanistic qualities to both
the Evangelist chorus and Jesus(see examples 3-1 and 3-2). It may be that the use of keening by
the Evangelist chorus was a musical device employed by MacMillan to foreshadow the death of
Jesus.

_________________________________________________________________________________
28 Ibid.
29 Ibid.
When looking at the unison evangelist keening lines, there are two notes that are central to the phrase (see Example 3-1). In this particular phrase, the primary keening note is C4 natural and the secondary keening note is F3 sharp, outlining the dissonant tritone. The next keening phrase, sung by Jesus, also employs the Celtic keening idiom. Instead of a C4 as the keening note, Jesus' keening note is a D4 with a secondary keening note of A3 outlining the consonant perfect 4th. This difference in outlining intervals, as well as the higher keening note, is MacMillan's displaying the difference between man’s fall from grace and his separation from his...
God. The tritone has a long history of being interval of malefaction, hence its alternate name, “diabolus in musica.”

Example 3-2. Solo keening: James MacMillan, Movement 2 from *St. John Passion* mm. 76-80

Although Jesus does employ this vocal lament in other movements of the work, the keening in the 8th movement titled *The Reproaches* is the most pungent and visceral. The harmonic language under the soloist is denser, and the instrumental articulation is sharper and more violent. The keening note is now C#₄ with secondary keening notes of F₄ sharp and G₄ sharp outlining the consonant perfect 4th and perfect 5th.

Example 3-3. Solo keening Jesus: James MacMillan, Movement 8 from *St. John Passion* mm. 66-79

Although keening is a vocal lament, MacMillan incorporates the compositional trait in the instrumental parts, as well. In the 4th movement “Jesus is condemned to death,” the larger
chorus slowly utters “Crucifixus etiam pro nobis: sub Pontio Pilato passus et sepultus est” (He was crucified for us under Pontius Pilate; He suffered and was buried) over the course of thirty-six measures. The text is extracted from the Credo of the Roman Mass, which is the longest and most important of the ordinary settings of the mass. The instrumentation over the solemn text is sparse, except for the truncated keens expressed by the flutes, oboes, clarinets, violins, cellos, trumpet, and finally a solo violin. It can be conjectured that this thinning of texture foreshadows the last breath of Jesus.

Example 3-4. Instrumental Keening, Violin: James Macmillan Movement 4 from *St. John Passion* mm 132-136

The Celtic drone is another nationalistic, important aspect of the composition, having a long and rich history in Scottish music. In Celtic music, instrumentally produced drones generally accompany melodies played on either the same instrument or another, and are usually tuned to the keynote of the melodies and often to its fifth. The term is best known in connection with bagpipes, which create one or more drones. The origin of bagpipes is unknown, but most scholars conjecture they were developed in the Middle and Far East over two-thousand years ago. In the 13th and 14th centuries, as people started to migrate west, they brought eastern instruments, such as primitive bagpipes and the shawm, to the West. Over several hundred years in Scotland, the instrument evolved into a martial instrument called the Highland bagpipe.

---

31 The Credo setting was originally part of the baptismal ceremony is widely considered the crux of Christianity


33 Gayle Page, Standard Banner, "Bagpipe competition set at Scot’s-Irish Festival," *Standard Banner*, September 09,
The 16th-century version of the Highland bagpipe has two drones (tenor and bass), the chanter and the blowpipe. The chanter is part of the bagpipe in which the melody is formed. The tenor drone is tuned an octave below the chanter and the bass drone is tuned an octave below the tenor drone. The highland bagpipes were first used as an instrument of war in the Battle of Pinkie Cleuth in 1547. Because the shrill penetrating sounds of the Highland bagpipe can be heard up to ten miles away, the bagpipes replaced horns and trumpets as the instrument of Scottish martial communication by the seventeenth century.

In wars between different clans, the piper was a key figure. While on the battlefield, the piper played martial melodies, reveilles and duty tunes to support the men in the actual fighting. The piper would be play music that was known to men with specific melodies commanding them charge and retreat. There also was a natural succession as the martial pipes were used to mourn the fallen soldiers from daily battles. By the late seventeenth century, the bagpipe became associated with funeral music. They also were used in services of remembrance, funerals and other days of mourning. One melody that is still popular today is *The Floo’ers o’ the Forest*. Also known as *The Lament*, it is still played for Remembrance Day in both the United Kingdom and Canada. The 16th and 17th centuries also saw the rise of the bagpipes in traditional Gaelic Scotland and the creation of the ceòl mór which included laments, battle songs, marches, popular songs, and reveille calls. The bagpipes were used as part of military service as late as World War 1 and World War 2.

The St. John Passion is not the first large scale work by Macmillan to incorporate these

35 Ibid.
36 Ceòl mór is an encompassing word meaning Gaelic Art and popular music that includes the highland bag pipes.
folk idioms. Macmillan has used them in his other sacred works most notably his Seven Last Words of Christ. Describing MacMillan’s earlier sacred work, The Seven Last Words of Christ, McGregor states, “A very similar alternating drone, also underpins the first movement of Seven Last Words (‘Father forgive them’) 37.

Example 3-5. Celtic Drone: James Macmillan movement 1 from The Seven Last Words of Christ mm 21-23 38

In example 3-5 for his Seven Last Words from the Cross, Macmillan employs a drone on F sharp₄ in the first violin part. The drone alternates between F sharp₄ and E₄ throughout the movement. The two alto parts alternate rising lines from F sharp₄ to C sharp₅ thus creating a constant open 5th between themselves and the first violin part. In addition both tenor parts accentuate the drone by rearticulating the first violin’s F sharp₄. The compositional technique of drones is used extensively throughout MacMillan’s St. John Passion and most notably in the

38 James MacMillan Seven Last Words from the Cross (London: Boosey & Hawkes, 1994).
music foreshadowing and depicting Jesus’ death.

One example of a foreshadowing drone can be found in an instrumental section in movement 3. In this scene, Pilate offers either to free Jesus or Barabbas. Pilate, portrayed by the basses in the large chorus, sings, “See, see I am bringing him out to you that you may know that I find no crime in him... Behold the man.” Pilate is giving the mob a choice between Barrabas, a common criminal, and Jesus. Before the crowd can answer, the music shifts to a more contemplative spirit. The woodwinds and brass, over a contrabassoon drone, play soaring melodies with a lyricism that is rarely seen in the work. The violins and violas play an undulating triplet pattern over the G drone in the cellos and basses. This brief section of music is intended to imply hope for the fallen Savior, as if the story is destined to change.

Example 3-6. Celtic Drone: James Macmillan movement 3 from *St. John Passion* mm 176-178

![Music notation]

After the Evangelist chorus advances the story, the music quickly changes and the foreboding drone disappears. The brass section plays truncated war calls, while the flutes, acting as a war fifes, play haunting reveilles. The tam-tam is struck, and the timpani propels the tempo

---

39 This scene is also a crucial moment in the different gospel translations. In the gospel of Matthew the word for ochlos was translated as a crowd, while in the gospel of John the implication for the world ochlos is “The Jews.” This scene is at the heart of biblical anti-semitic discussions. John Dominic Crossan, "Anti-Semitism and the Gospel," *Theological Studies*, 26 (1965): 189-214.
faster and faster until the turba chorus shouts a malicious fugue “Crucify, Him Crucify Him,”

while the strings and woodwinds personify the mob’s roar through keening. The altos and basses

sing a modified drone set to the text “Crucify” on repeated C naturals (C₄ and C₅).

Example 3-7. Modified Celtic Drone and Instrumental Keens: James Macmillan movement 3

from *St. John Passion* mm 198-201

James MacMillan also uses the drone as a device of lamentation. In the last chorale

movement, the drone is employed by the organ and the basses of the large turba chorus for fifty

measures. The text they underpin is “Christus factus est pro nobis obediens usque ad mortem,

mortem autem crucis” (Christ became obedient for us unto death, even to the death, death on the
cross).
Poignantly, the Evangelist chorus keens (in English) the final moments of Jesus’ life above the Latin drone, in the manner of medieval music using macaronic texts. This is especially poignant in measures twenty through twenty-three -- when they lament the vinegar placed in Jesus’ mouth -- and when they cry out one more time in measures fifty-one through fifty-eight.
Example 3-9. Modified Celtic Drone and Vocal Keens: James MacMillan, Movement 9 from *St. John Passion* mm. 20-23

Example 3-10. Modified Celtic Drone and Vocal Keens: James MacMillan, Movement 9 from *St. John Passion* mm 50-59
CHAPTER 4
THE ROLE OF JESUS AND THE REPROACHES

Throughout the history of the passion genre, certain expectations were placed on how the role of Jesus was presented. In his two surviving passions, Bach characterizes Jesus as a stoic and amicable figure who ultimately accepts the will of God. Jesus at times questions his people and their judgment, but overall Bach’s Jesus is gracious, and his divinity is painted through the use of a “halo of strings” provided by the first orchestra in the St. Matthew Passion.


The example above, “Er sprach: Gehet hin in die Stadt,” depicts Jesus’ poignant lines of betrayal to the disciples. Jesus prophetically speaks to disciples of this betrayal, but Bach’s Jesus never loses his reserve. The accompanied recitative is harmonically slow and moves from E-flat major to a closely related C minor. The radiant light personified by the strings accompanies Jesus through much of the work until he utters the Aramaic phrase, “Eli, Eli lama asabthani” or “My God, my God why has Thou forsaken me?” As Christ begins to question God, he gives in to

---

40 Johann Sebastian Bach, Matthauspassion BWV 244 (Leipzig: Ernst Eulenburg, 1925).
death and the halo of strings disappears.

Example 4-2. Example 4-2 Halo of Strings Disappears: J.S. Bach, “Eli, Eli lama asabthani” St. Matthew Passion\textsuperscript{41}

\begin{figure}
\centering
\includegraphics[width=\textwidth]{example42.png}
\caption{Example 4-2 Halo of Strings Disappears: J.S. Bach, “Eli, Eli lama asabthani” St. Matthew Passion\textsuperscript{41}}
\end{figure}

A similar approach to Bach’s musical portrayal of the character of Jesus is the gentle, caring and contemplative passion setting by 20\textsuperscript{th} century composer, Arvo Pärt. Jesus is again sung by a baritone and a heavenly aura is created around him through the minimalist compositional style of tintinnabuli. Arvo Pärt describes his compositions as,

\begin{quote}
An area I sometimes wander into when I am searching for answers - in my life, my music, my work. In my dark hours, I have the certain feeling that everything outside this one thing has no meaning. The complex and many-faceted only confuses me, and I must search for unity. Tintinnabulation is like this. . . . The three notes of a triad are like bells, and that is why I call it tintinnabulation\textsuperscript{42}.
\end{quote}

The pitch center for most of Pärt’s Jesus is the tone of E\textsubscript{3}. The predominance of a single triad above a drone provides a beautiful simple expression of the gospel of St. John and, if anything, subdues the questionable theology of the St. John Gospel.

\textsuperscript{41} Ibid.

\textsuperscript{42} Richard E. Rodda, liner notes to \textit{Arvo Pärt Fratres}, I Fiamminghi, The Orchestra of Flanders, Rudolf Werthen, Telarc 80387, CD, 1995.
In sharp contrast, James MacMillan’s version of the *St. John Passion* portrays a furious, accusatory Jesus who is filled with anger and contempt. His justification for Jesus’ strong tone is that, in addition to the Biblical texts that all of the Passion composers used, MacMillan also included text from the Catholic Reproaches, having been greatly influenced by his previously discussed Catholic background and his early life in Scotland.

MacMillan’s use of *The Reproaches* affords us a glimpse of his view of Jesus and Macmillan’s concepts of Catholicism. The text is a series of antiphons and responses that depicts Jesus Christ listing all of the faithful acts of God that he performed for the Jewish people as written in the Old Testament book of Exodus. Those acts of faith include feeding the Jews manna from heaven, leading them out of slavery in Egypt, and finally killing their captors. In *The Reproaches*, Jesus Christ cries out from the cross to reproach the people of Israel not only for the way they have rejected Christ’s acts of favor toward them in history, but also for their betrayal of him. In the Catholic faith, *The Reproaches* are used during Passion Week typically on Good Friday as part of the Veneration of the Cross.\(^{43}\) The history of *The Reproaches* is veiled in mystery. Many scholars conjecture they appeared in the Pontificale of Prudentius\(^ {44}\) in the 8\(^{\text{th}}\) century and had spread throughout Europe by the 11\(^{\text{th}}\) century. *The Reproaches* became a formal part of the Roman Catholic rite in the late 13\(^{\text{th}}\) century. The texts are in Greek and Latin and are normally sung antiphonally by cantors and two small choirs. The texts contain biblical allusions from the Old Testament book of Exodus, but also include other biblical allusions with the

\(^{43}\) Veneration of the cross is a ceremony in which Catholics pay homage and respect to the Cross on which Jesus was crucified. This veneration typically occurs on Good Friday and can be kneeling, bowing, or lying prostrate to the cross.

Micah 6:3
Popule meus, quid feci tibi? aut in quo constristavi te? responde mihi.
My people, what have I done to you? How have I offended you? Answer me!

Quia eduxi te de terra Aegypti: parasti Crucem Salvatori tuo.
I led you out of Egypt from slavery to freedom, but you have led your Savior, and
nailed Him to a cross.

Isaiah 5:2,40
Quid ultra debui facere tibi, et non feci? Ego quidem plantavi te vineam meam
speciosissimam: et tu facta es mihi nimis amara; aceto namque sitim meam potasti, et
lancea perforasti latus Salvatori tuo.

O what more would you ask from me? I planted you, my vineyard, but sour grapes you
gave me, and vinegar to drink, and you have pierced your Savior and pierced Him
with a spear.

The entire Reproaches were called into question by Pope Paul VI in 1961 as part of
Vatican II and later publicly denounced by the Nostra Aetate in 1965. In the Nostra Aetate, Pope
Paul VI and his council wrote:

True, the Jewish authorities and those who followed their lead pressed for the death of
Christ; still, what happened in His passion cannot be charged against all the Jews, without
distinction, then alive, nor against the Jews of today. Although the Church is the new
people of God, the Jews should not be presented as rejected or accursed by God, as if this
followed from the Holy Scriptures. All should see to it, then, that in catechetical work or
in the preaching of the word of God they do not teach anything that does not conform to
the truth of the Gospel and the spirit of Christ. Furthermore, in her rejection of every
persecution against any man, the Church, mindful of the patrimony she shares with the
Jews and moved not by political reasons but by the Gospel's spiritual love, decries hatred,
persecutions, displays of anti-Semitism, directed against Jews at any time and by
anyone.46

45 Latin and translation taken from the Latin Vulgate Bible.
46 “Declaration on the Relation of the Church to Non-Christian Religions: Nostra Aetate Proclaimed by his holiness
Pope Paul on October 28, 1965,” accessed March 10, 2014,
http://www.vatican.va/archive/hist_councils/ii_vatican_council/documents/vat-ii_decl_19651028_nostra-
aetate_en.html.
Although the Vatican did make a stand against anti-Semitism, *The Reproaches* were not taken out of the liturgy. They were made optional, and the Stabat mater text\(^{47}\) was given as an alternate textual choice. In 1979, the Episcopal Church abolished the text entirely, but the Catholic Church was not ready to make that decision. In 1980, John Sheerin, who was secretary on Catholic and Jewish relations for the United States council of Catholic Bishops, acknowledged this growing concern and said:

> For some time the daily press has reported Jewish concern about the singing of the Reproaches on Good Friday in Catholic churches. These are hymns considered by many Jews to be anti-Semitic. Some Catholics interpret them as Christ’s rebukes to Christians for their sins and ingratitude but I can see why Jews interpret them as a parody on a sacred Jewish prayer and a rebuke to the Jewish people. Several Catholic attempts to revise *The Reproaches* have been unsuccessful, but the American Bishops’ Liturgical Committee has asked parishes this year to substitute other hymns for these Reproaches. The Episcopal Church has removed them from their new book of prayers, but they will remain in the Catholic Sacramentary.\(^{48}\)

To add to the Episcopal sentiment, the Methodist committee on lectionary text wrote a special paragraph on *The Reproaches* in "The New Handbook of the Christian Year." The committee wrote:

> A special word must be said concerning *The Reproaches*. Traditionally these were used to dramatize the accusations that God brings against his people in the light of the passion and death of Christ. They ask questions that reveal our own rebellion and complicity in the sufferings of Christ and in the evil and sufferings in the world. Images from scripture are used concerning Israel and God’s hand in that holy history, but the accusations are clearly aimed at the faithlessness of all who would call upon God, particularly at all Christians in the church who presume to be grafted into the tree of Israel (Rom. 11:17-24). The accusations are like an inversion of the holy history we recite and recall in the Great Thanksgivings at the Lord’s table. We must all be aware, however, of the history of anti-Jewish sentiment which has often seen the crucifixion to be the work of the Jews. This is abhorrent, especially in the light of modern consequences of anti-Semitism and its continuing presence within the Christian community. For those situations where *The

---

\(^{47}\) A medieval text that depicts Mary’s suffering during and after Jesus’s crucifixion and eventual death.

Reproaches may give the impression of anti-Jewish convictions, they should not be used.49

The Vatican did clarify the meaning of the words, and MacMillan points out that there is “no way the Catholic Church thinks of these things now as attacks on Jews. Perhaps I was naive in thinking that understanding of these things would easily commute to the secular world, because it hasn’t.”50 Unfortunately for MacMillan and his master work the sacred and secular world continued to question the text.

The Reproaches is the emotional and musical climax of MacMillan’s passion. MacMillan leaves the listener questioning who the text is speaking to. Is the text speaking to modern-day Catholics as a metaphor for their failures as Christians? Again, the text is sung on Good Friday, and Catholics have found meaning in the liturgical texts, for some of them see themselves as the ones who betrayed Jesus. For MacMillan, he views them as reproaches to humanity for our falleness51 Biblical Scholar and music critic Hugh S. Pyper disagrees and recounts the evening of the St. John Passion premiere as a musical success with a disturbing message. Pyper states, “A particular problem arises from the inclusion of the Improperia, or Reproaches, a text which has been a point of controversy between Jewish and Christian interpreters and which makes direct demands upon its audience and their response.”52 He argues that MacMillan’s St. John Passion escalates the disagreement between Jewish and Christian interpreters and presents a choice between either an ethical or an aesthetic reaction to the work. Moreover, he proposes that a secular concert patron might discern that MacMillan is speaking for the majority of Christians.

49 Ibid.
51 Ibid.
To compound his use of *The Reproaches*, MacMillan chose to set the *St. John Passion* text rather than the three other gospel accounts. The St. John gospel account has recently been called into question as also being anti-Semitic. Theologian John Dominic Crossan\(^{53}\) states in his article, *Anti-Semitism and the Gospel* that:

Accordingly, the only proper translation for this special use of hoi Iousaioi ("the Jews") in John is: those among the authorities of the Jews who constantly opposed Jesus. The reason for this Johannine usage is fairly clear. Besides the ordinary deletion of specific designations such as “scribes, Pharisees, Sadducees,” etc, as the tradition moves deeper into the Gentile environment, there is the Johannine penchant for symbolism. Thus the term, “The Jews” is a loose ambiguous term for those who rejected Jesus in the earthly ministry and who engineered his death. To accept it otherwise involves numerous contradictions in the text. However, it is also a very dangerous symbolic term, and one cannot but wonder if it might be a root of anti-Semitism in the Christian subconscious.

MacMillan chose the St. John Gospel because it is “the one I tend to know the best...because they hear it every Good Friday. It’s unchanged,” and, “In fact, since my student days in Edinburgh I have regularly participated in the Gregorian or Dominican chanting of the Crucifixion story on that day. This simple music has had an overriding influence on the shape and character of my own Passion setting.”\(^{54}\)

Whether MacMillan’s passion is a liturgical passion is a question that must be addressed. The work was commissioned by the London Symphony Orchestra and Chorus for a performance in the Barbican concert hall. The work was premiered as part of a birthday celebration for the late Sir Colin Davis a month after Easter. It also includes musical demands that would stretch any amateur ensemble. In addition, the length would also be an issue for any modern day Good Friday service as the work is in excess of ninety minutes. The added Latin texts present an as

\(^{53}\) Crossan, a former Catholic priest, is a historian of early Christianity as well as a New Testament scholar. His focus of study has been the life and times of Jesus Christ. He advocates for an allegorical interpretation of the Bible rather than a literal one.

issue as they are all sacred but not entirely liturgical for the appointed days of holy week.

In contrast to the Bach passions, there are no chorales set to well-known Lutheran hymn tunes for the congregation to sing. Instead, there are Latin choruses at the end of each movement (exceptions are movements 8 and 10). Much like the Bach chorales, the Latin choruses comment or reflect on the previous movement, but they do not invite the congregation to sing in response. This lack of vocal response from the listener implies that it is a spiritual work but not a liturgical one. Finally, MacMillan even suggests the work is for a modern secular audience. In his interview with Nicolas Brown, Macmillan states there is a “need for explanation, as the work is for a modern secular audience, but that perhaps it is impractical to expect people to read biblical exegegis in their program notes.”

In addition, the audience reaction lends itself to a concert setting. Hugh S. Pyper wrote about the first performance:

This came home to me most clearly at the end of Part 1 of the Passion. This ends with the magically beautiful example of MacMillan’s keening strings and lamenting woodwinds encircling the solemn chanting of the choir of the Latin text of the Credo, “Crucifixus etiam pro nobis,” ending with the words ‘et sepultus est,’ dissolving into silence with a lone violin’s broken sobs. Naturally the audience then broke into applause in a way that was particularly jolting... the suggestion of applauding the burial of Christ raises concerns for those with a religious response to the text.

Hugh S. Pyper suggests, “The lonely angry Christ who is beset by an uncomprehending crowd mirrors the situation of the potentially misunderstood religious artist in the secular space of the Barbican. When words fail, his only hope is the redemptive power of music ... It is an anger that is not found in this form in John’s Christ and to that extent this setting is no longer St. John’s Passion, which is what I think troubled me.”

The lonely angry Christ is a not a vision of Jesus to which Christians ascribed. Jesus in

---

20th century culture has been called “Prince of peace”, “Light of the World”, “The Good Shepherd”, “Healer of the Sick”, “Son of God”, and “Savior of the World.” Many Christian denominations have one of these traditional views of Jesus. This is evident in the passages in the Gospels according to Mark and John. These passages depict Jesus’ death as a willing act; an act that God predestined from his Jesus’s birth.

Mark 8:31
31 Then he began to teach them that the Son of Man must undergo great suffering, and be rejected by the elders, the chief priests, and the scribes, and be killed, and after three days rise again.

Mark 10:32-34
32 They were on the road, going up to Jerusalem, and Jesus was walking ahead of them; they were amazed, and those who followed were afraid. He took the twelve aside again and began to tell them what was to happen to him, 33 saying, “See, we are going up to Jerusalem, and the Son of Man will be handed over to the chief priests and the scribes, and they will condemn him to death; then they will hand him over to the Gentiles; 34 they will mock him, and spit upon him, and flog him, and kill him; and after three days he will rise again.

Mark 10:38
38 But Jesus said to them, “You do not know what you are asking. Are you able to drink the cup that I drink, or be baptized with the baptism that I am baptized with?”

Mark 10:43-45
43 But it is not so among you; but whoever wishes to become great among you must be your servant, 44 and whoever wishes to be first among you must be slave of all. 45 For the Son of Man came not to be served but to serve, and to give his life a ransom for many.

Mark 14:22-25
2 While they were eating, he took a loaf of bread, and after blessing it he broke it, gave it to them, and said, “Take; this is my body.” 23 Then he took a cup, and after giving thanks he gave it to them, and all of them drank from it. 24 He said to them, “This is my blood of the covenant, which is poured out for many. 25 Truly I tell you, I will never again drink of the fruit of the vine until that day when I drink it new in the kingdom of God.”

John 10:17-18
17 For this reason the Father loves me, because I lay down my life in order to take it up again. 18 No one takes[a] it from me, but I lay it down of my own accord. I have power
to lay it down, and I have power to take it up again. I have received this command from my Father.”

These passages are the crux of Christianity as they imply divinity and Jesus’ willingness to be sacrificed to be the savior of mankind. A sacrifice that Jesus knew was predestined. Many of the 20th century monikers given to Jesus, paint a picture of Jesus as calming gentle spirit who was divine and lived a life of Godly perfection. Macmillan’s Christ doesn’t seem to follow this mold. Through The Reproaches, we see Jesus as an angry, forlorn man who is not ready to accept the will of God. The instrumental music accompanying The Reproaches in the 8th movement is pointed, angular, and chromatically dissonant. It is also rhythmically dense with duple subdivisions clashing against triple subdivisions. By this point, Jesus’ music has become more disjunct including leaps of tritones, sixths, and sevenths. An example of this tension is when Jesus casts blame upon the Jews and implores, “I led you out of Egypt, from slavery to freedom, but you led your Saviour to the cross.” The music is especially pungent and intensely chromatic during the repetition of this accusatory text. The chromatic instrumental lines intensifies the anger of Jesus, such as when He shrieks repeatedly, “But you have led your Saviour to the cross.” The ascending chromatic line occurs twelve times, thereby representing the twelve lost tribes of Israel.

---


57 John 12:32-33: “And I, when I am lifted up (exalted) from the earth, will draw all people to myself. He said this to show the kind of death he was going to die.”

58 Hebrews 2:10: “For it was fitting that he, for whom and by whom all things exist, in bringing many sons to glory, should make the pioneer of their salvation perfect through suffering.”
Example 4-3. Chromatic Shrieks, First Clarinet: James MacMillan, Movement 8 from *St. John Passion* mm. 52

As the movement progresses, the musical intensity is raised with each phrase that Jesus cries toward the Jewish crowds until its climax in measure 182. Unaccompanied, the voice of Jesus implores them to answer why they betrayed him. This final cry, “Answer me,” of the 8th movement is marked quintuple forte and offset by a drone in the cellos and basses a tritone lower. This final, unresolved outrage of Jesus leaves the listener to think that Jesus is at his wits end with the Jewish crowds.

Example 4-4. Christ’s Anger: James MacMillan, Movement 8 from *St. John Passion* mm. 182-185

James Macmillan’s depiction of Jesus may be in conflict with traditional Christian thought, but it does find common ground with Reza Aslan’s view of Jesus. Aslan is part of a group of modern theologians who are part of movement searching for the “Historical Jesus.”
This renewed endeavor has been in existence since the 18th century and examines the gospels, as historical documents. They also examine the historical and cultural context in which Jesus lived. Before this quest for a historical Jesus, the bible was viewed as a divine document and it must be interpreted as the literal word of God. It was the supreme authority and was considered sacrosanct. This interpretation dates back to the Protestant Reformation of the sixteenth century and its beginnings can be attributed to Martin Luther and John Calvin. The movement of literal interpretation spread throughout Europe because of the invention of the printing press and the sudden availability of bibles. This view is still held by many evangelical Christians.

The Historical Jesus movement found its origins in the age of Enlightenment of the 17th century and recognizes the theory of cultural and historical relativity. Historical theologians look at the Bible as both a historical document as well as a metaphorical one. This movement has created several different views of Jesus including: Apocalyptic Prophet, Charismatic Healer, Cynic Philosopher, Jewish Messiah, Prophet of Social Change, and Jesus, The Zealot. Of all the views of Jesus by the Historical Jesus movement, the most relevant to Macmillan’s *St. John Passion* is Jesus, the Zealot.

Reza Aslan extols the theory that Jesus was part of the 1st century movement called Zealotry. The movement was a political movement that urged Jews of Judea to revolt against the Roman state of occupation.

Indeed, the Jesus that emerges from this historical exercise—a zealous revolutionary swept up, as all Jews of the era were, in the religious and political turmoil of first-century Palestine—bears “little resemblance to the image of the gentle shepherd cultivated by the early Christian community. Consider this: Crucifixion was a punishment that Rome reserved almost exclusively for the crime of sedition. The plaque the Romans placed above Jesus’s head as he writhed in pain—“King of the Jews”—was called a titulus and, despite common perception, was not meant to be sarcastic…. Every criminal who hung on a cross received a plaque declaring the specific crime for which he was being

---

59 Robert Price et al., *The Historical Jesus: Five Views* (Downers Grove: InterVarsity Press, 2009), 1-312
executed. Jesus’s crime, in the eyes of Rome, was striving for kingly rule (i.e., treason), the same crime for which nearly every other messianic aspirant of the time was killed. Nor did Jesus die alone. The gospels claim that on either side of Jesus hung men who in Greek are called lestai, a word often rendered into English as “thieves” but which actually means “bandits” and was the most common Roman designation for an insurrectionist or rebel. Three rebels on a hill covered in crosses, each cross bearing the racked and bloodied body of a man who dared defy the will of Rome. That image alone should cast doubt upon the gospels’ portrayal of Jesus as a man of unconditional peace.  

This notion of Jesus as an earlier instigator of the Zealotry movement is in contradiction with traditional Christian views with Jesus. Aslan’s discoveries primarily come from a first century document discovered in Palestine as well as the gospels. He theorizes that the real Jesus of Nazareth was a man like any other and was not above having human emotions. This would in part explain the sadness and contempt that Jesus displays in The Reproaches, an explanation that proposes that Jesus was both human and divine. But Macmillan exacerbates the tension of the scene and the furious rebel is displayed by the use of sharply chromatic, dissonant and disjointed music.

---

CHAPTER 5

CONCLUSION

In 1829, Passion settings entered the secular concert hall, with Felix Mendelssohn’s revival of Bach’s *St. Matthew Passion* in Berlin. The genre has fallen in and out of favor with composers because of the subject matter and Bach’s prominence in the setting. James MacMillan’s *St. John Passion* has established itself as one of the preeminent modern passion settings by manipulating past idioms such as chant, chorales, and other popular passion conventions in concert with his use of Scottish nationalistic traits. He creates a passion experience which strives for a spiritually conservative Catholic influence. This track has earned both harsh criticism and praise.

MacMillan’s unique use of keening and the drone offers a uniquely Scottish passion that allows for Jesus’ crucifixion to be more poignant to the intended initial audience. In the case of the *St. John Passion*, they both are rhetorical devices that foreshadow or depict the death of a Christ. The Celtic elements also allow for Jesus to be more human than divine as both keening and drones were part of the laymen funeral practice and are ingrained in the Celtic subconscious. The positive reception of the *St. John Passion* work has lead MacMillan to write his second passion according to St. Luke. The St. Luke will have its American premiere at Duke Chapel in 2014.

In addition to his use of Celtic folk idioms, MacMillan uses added text; most central to this paper is *The Reproaches*. Movement 8 (*The Reproaches*) can be considered to be the emotional climax of the work. At this point, Macmillan’s vocal writing is at its most angular, pointed, angry, and thematic. Jesus keens from his cross and cries out admonishments to the Jewish people. This powerful display of composition is amazingly expressive as it makes Jesus
more human than divine. Through this movement, we see the flaws of Jesus, and it calls into question his infallibility. This inclusion of text has shifted the climax from Jesus’s death and burial to moments before his death. “MacMillan gives Christ elaborate, declamatory passages full of anger and bitterness. This is not a saviour going submissively to the cross, but a furious rebel.”61 Also the value of the work as a liturgical work is lost by the inclusion of these texts, but a religious and spiritual essence remain. The lack of the theological knowledge by the audience only gives The Reproaches more power and gravitas.

APPENDIX

REPROACHES TEXT
Agios athanatos eleison imas.
Sanctus immortalis, miserere nobis.
Holy Immortal One, have mercy on us.

Ego propter te flagellavi Aegyptum cum primogenitis suis; et tu me flagellatum tradidisti.
For you scourged your captors, their first born sons were taken, but you have
taken scourges and brought them down on Me.

Popule meus, quid feci tibi? aut in quo constristavi te? responde mihi.
My people, My people what have I done to you, how have I offended you? Answer me!

Ego eduxi te de Aegypto, demerso Pharaone in mare rubrum; et tu me tradidisti principibus
Sacerdotum.
From slavery to freedom I led you, drowned your captors. But I am taken captive
and handed to your priests.

Popule meus, quid feci tibi? aut in quo constristavi te? responde mihi.
My people, My people what have I done to you, how have I offended you? Answer me!

Ego ante te aperui mare, et tu aperuisti lancea latus meum.
Your path lay through the waters, I opened them before you, my side you have laid
open and bared it with a spear.

Popule meus, quid feci tibi? aut in quo constristavi te? responde mihi.
My people, My people what have I done to you, how have I offended you? Answer me!

Ego ante te praeivi in columna nubis: et tu me duxisti ad praetorium Pilati.
I led you, held securely, My fire and cloud before you, but you have led your
Savior, hands bound to Pilate's court.

Popule meus, quid feci tibi? aut in quo constristavi te? responde mihi.
My people, My people what have I done to you, how have I offended you? Answer me!

Ego te pavi manna per desertum; et tu me caecidisti alapis, et flagellis.
I bore you up with manna, you bore me down and scourged me. I gave you saving
water, but you gave me soured wine.

Popule meus, quid feci tibi? aut in quo constristavi te? responde mihi.
My people, My people what have I done to you, how have I offended you? Answer me!

Ego te potavi aqua salutis de petra; et tu me potasti felle, et aceto.
I gave thee the water of salvation from the rock: and thou has given Me gall and vinegar to drink.

Popule meus, quid feci tibi? aut in quo constristavi te? responde mihi.
My people, My people what have I done to you, how have I offended you? Answer me!
Ego propter te Chananaeorum Reges percussi: et tu percussisti arundine caput meum. The kings who reigned in Canaan, I struck way before you. But you have struck my crowned head, and struck it with a reed.

Popule meus, quid feci tibi? aut in quo constristavi te? responde mihi. My people, My people what have I done to you, how have I offended you? Answer me!

Ego dedi tibi sceptrum regale; et tu dedisti capiti med spineam coronam. I gave thee a royal scepter: and thou hast given to My head a crown of thorns.

Popule meus, quid feci tibi? aut in quo constristavi te? responde mihi. My people, My people what have I done to you, how have I offended you? Answer me!

Ego te exaltavi magna virtute; et tu me suspendisti in patibulo Crucis. I gave you a royal scepter but you gave me a thorn crown. I raised you up in power, but you raised me on the Cross.

Popule meus, quid feci tibi? aut in quo constristavi te? responde mihi. My people, My people what have I done to you, how have I offended you? Answer me!

Agios O Theos. Agios ischyros. Sanctus Deus Sanctus fortis. Holy is God, Holy and Strong,

Agios athanatos eleison imas. Sanctus immortalis, miserere nobis. Holy Immortal One, have mercy on us.
BIBLIOGRAPHY


Bach, Johann Sebastian Matthauspassion BWV 244. Leipzig: Ernst Eulenburg, 1925.


