THE FUNDAMENTAL UNITY IN BRAHMS’S HORN TRIO, Op. 40

JongKyun Kim, B.M., M.M.

Thesis Prepared for the Degree of

MASTER OF MUSIC

UNIVERSITY OF NORTH TEXAS

August 2007

APPROVED:

Timothy L. Jackson, Major Professor
Stephen Slottow, Committee Member
David Schwarz, Committee Member
James C. Scott, Dean of the College of Music
Sandra L. Terrell, Dean of the Robert B. Toulouse School of Graduate Studies

Different sections or movements of a piece are associated with each other and contain the composer essential thought. A vague affinity of mood and a resembling theme or form testifies to the relationship. However, the evidence is insufficient to reveal the unification of the different sections or movements since these are under restraint of external music proofs. In order to figure out the relationship, thus, identical musical substance should be discovered.

In the study the substantial evidence, which can be called unity or unification, is mainly discussed. The unity is illustrated with Brahms’s Horn Trio, Op.40 that is one of the Brahms’s significant works. The unity found in the Horn Trio is based on the internal structure and structural voice-leading notes. The unity in the Horn Trio is the fundamental structural unity that is divided into initial ascent and voice exchange, and fundamental voice-leading motive. The fundamental unity seriously affects the master piece and penetrates the movements as a whole. Further, it reveals the hidden connections to the historical background of the Horn Trio and the philosophy of Brahms for the music.

Even though a piece consists of several sections or movements, the entire piece presents homogeneity. The identity of the composer's underlying philosophical thought suffices to discern the musical unity in a piece. Thus, the investigation of unity is one of the critical ways to understand not merely a piece but also the philosophy of a composer. The study will help to enhance the audience’s interpretation of music.
Copyright 2007

by

JongKyun Kim
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like to express my gratitude to my professors, Timothy L. Jackson, Stephen Slottow, and David Schwarz for serving on my committee and spending many hours reviewing my work. In addition, I would like to thank my parents for their endless support and devotion.
## TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ACKNOWLEDGEMENT</td>
<td>iii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LIST OF MUSICAL EXAMPLES</td>
<td>v</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Chapter</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I.  INTRODUCTION</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. PROBLEMS IN THE HORN TRIO</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recall of the Natural Horn</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-Sonata Form in the First Movement</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Using Traditional German Folksong</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III. OVERVIEW OF THE HORN TRIO</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The First movement</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Second movement</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Third movement</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Finale</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV. FUNDAMENTAL STRUCTURAL UNITY</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Initial Ascent</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Voice Exchange</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V.  FUNDAMENTAL VOICE-LEADING MOTIVE</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Concept of the Fundamental Voice-Leading Motive</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Fundamental Voice-Leading Motive: E-flat – F-sharp – G</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Fundamental Voice-Leading Motive in the First Movement</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Fundamental Voice-Leading Motive in the Second Movement</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Fundamental Voice-Leading Motive in the Third Movement</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Fundamental Voice-Leading Motive in the Finale</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Fundamental Voice-Leading Motive in the Entire Work</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VI. CONCLUSION</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BIBLIOGRAPHY</td>
<td>109</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>German folksong, “Dort in den Weiden steht ein Haus”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1</td>
<td>The first movement, mm. 1-16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2</td>
<td>The first movement, mm. 29-40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3</td>
<td>The first movement, mm. 130-146</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4</td>
<td>The first movement, mm. 197-234</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>The first movement, mm. 76-84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.6</td>
<td>The first movement, mm. 166-174</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.7</td>
<td>The second movement, mm. 1-4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.8</td>
<td>The second movement, mm. 13-17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.9</td>
<td>The second movement, mm. 160-177</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.10</td>
<td>The second movement, mm. 227-242</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.11</td>
<td>The second movement, mm. 287-314</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.12</td>
<td>The first movement, mm. 56-74</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.13</td>
<td>The second movement, mm. 349-362</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.14</td>
<td>The third movement, mm. 1-5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.15</td>
<td>The third movement, mm. 43-46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.16</td>
<td>The third movement, mm. 15-25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.17</td>
<td>The third movement, mm. 55-66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.18</td>
<td>The third movement, mm. 67-79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.19</td>
<td>The third movement, mm. 67-68 and mm. 26-33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.20</td>
<td>The Finale, mm. 1-20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.21</td>
<td>The Finale, mm. 44-68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.22</td>
<td>The Finale, mm. 57-96</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CHAPTER I

INTRODUCTION

The Schenkerian analysis of a tonal piece may reveal its fundamental structure and harmonic progression. Although the fundamental structure, or background, does not show foreground motives, it is still valuable for analysis. Since it can shed light on the unifying factors, progressing from the background to the foreground structure can also reveal voice-leading features such as linear progressions, arpeggiations, and neighboring tones, which may exist at each level. In addition, prolongations, voice exchanges, and initial ascents from one level to the next may explicate the relationships between each structural level. Consequently, Schenkerian analysis is focused on the analysis of structural levels that ultimately reveal individual features, relationships between structural levels, and thus overall structural unity.

In a multi-movement work, the movements may be structurally, motivically, and thematically related to each other creating unity through these relationships. One of the reasons a multi-movement piece may be regarded as a single large structure is that all the movements are conceived as a unified piece. Consider the *attacca* procedure whereby two or all the movements are performed together without pauses. In Beethoven’s Fifth Symphony and his first “Razumovsky” Quartet Op. 59, the technique is used.¹ A more advanced example of the idea is found in Liszt’s symphonic poems. As Veijo Murtomäki quotes from Gerald Abraham’s book, *The Symphonies*, he calls it “The ‘four-movements-in-one’ obstinately remains four.” Murtomäki believes that the

most sophisticated device is continuous variation in which the beginning and the ending are only joined by following through a developmental process.\(^2\) In the middle of twentieth century, Rudolph Réti in *Thematic Process in Music*, insists that the different movements of a classical symphony are built from one identical thought.\(^3\) His observation of unity concerns surface thematic variety which is supported by a less apparent unity. However, Réti also strives to find the unity at a deeper level in structural consistency and thematic key relations. Deryck Cooke discovered internal unity in Beethoven’s late five quartets.\(^4\) He extends the concept of unity derived from Réti to cover these five multi-movement pieces. By using Réti’s varied devices for transformation, Cooke treats the five different pieces as a single phenomenon. Cooke believes that all of the five quartets obviously are planned together in spirit and technique. Recent two contemporary scholars, Timothy L. Jackson and Veijo Murtomäki, have discovered the unity between different pieces, mainly symphonies. Jackson in *Tchaikovsky: Symphony No. 6*, introduces a new concept, “the meta-symphonic narrative,” which means that a narrative may continue through a composer’s single genre,\(^5\) thereby further developing the concept of unity.

\(^{2}\) Murtomäki, 30-31.


Brahms’s Horn Trio is a unique piece in the Romantic literature not only because of its instrumentation but also because the first movement is in a different form than most of Brahms’s initial movements in multi-movement pieces. The Horn Trio, one of Brahms’s most personal works, written when he was in an unstable situation due to his absence from home and the recent death of his mother.

The goal of this study is to investigate and clarify the fundamental unity that arises in the foreground, middleground, and background structures of Brahms’s Horn Trio, Op. 40. Through analysis, I will show that the movements are structurally and motivically related, ultimately creating fundamental unity. This is a unique situation in his chamber music whereby Brahms has assigned all four movements to the same E-flat tonic. Because all four movements share the tonic, and the whole piece unfolds within E-flat, the four movements might be closely connected to each other. Within Brahms’s chamber music, the Piano Trio, Op. 8 is the only other piece, which is designed with all four movements in the same tonic, B (the first and third movements are in B major and the second and fourth movements are B minor pieces). To my knowledge, this thesis provides the first demonstration of large-scale unity in the Horn Trio; furthermore, by explaining the fundamental unity revealed in this piece, it may be possible to understand Brahms’s method of creating unity in other chamber pieces.

In Chapter II, I will provide a historical background for the work, touching upon various issues surrounding its history. For example, some scholars have insisted that the Horn Trio is emotionally associated with the death of Brahms’s mother. This idea is worth discussing because it has been a point of contention among scholars. I will also explore the non-sonata form for the first movement, the use of the old-fashioned horn,
and the incorporation of traditional German folksong. Consideration of all of these features, which are uncommon to chamber music style, will also contribute to further understanding of the piece.

Though my analysis is mainly based on the Schenkerian approach using graphs, a conventional analysis can also provide insight into the piece; therefore, in Chapter III, I will provide overall view of the Horn Trio. In addition to delineating the musical features, more traditional analysis facilitates an overview of the Horn Trio, providing insight into the structure and themes of each movement.

The main topic of the thesis, the creation of fundamental unity of the Horn Trio, is primarily discussed in Chapters IV and V. The study of fundamental unity is divided into two parts, structural unity and unity produced by voice-leading motives. I will discuss structural unity, which encompasses initial ascent and voice exchange, in Chapter IV. The initial ascent and voice exchange are common structural features of the Horn Trio, as will be shown in the background graph. I will explain the fundamental unity of the structure and graphically illustrate several sections of the movements.

In Chapter V, I will address in more detail the fundamental voice-leading motive, specifically the linear progression, E-flat – F-sharp – G, a motive which provides the strongest sense of unity between movements. Not only is the motive found in each movement, but it is also spans the entire piece. The characteristic of the motive and its historical background are discussed and illustrated. The purpose of Chapter V is to clarify this fundamental voice-leading motive, further elucidating structural aspects of each movement.
CHAPTER II

PROBLEMS IN THE HORN TRIO

Brahms’s Trio for Violin, Horn, and Piano, Op. 40 is one of the most well-known pieces in the nineteenth-century chamber-music repertoire. However, the Horn Trio has many features unusual in the chamber music style of its time. In addition to using traditional German folk song, Brahms calls for the use of the natural horn and avoids sonata form in the first movement. In this chapter, I will address each of these issues.

Recall of the Natural Horn

Using a horn rather than a cello for the trio is a unique choice for this piece, making it the first horn trio written by a major composer. The horn had been occasionally used for chamber music until the middle of the nineteenth century by composers such Mozart and Beethoven, who employed it for their brass quintets. However, before Brahms’s Horn Trio, the horn was only used in brass or woodwind ensembles. Furthermore, Brahms uses the horn with two different instrumental groups, the cello and piano, and the horn part does not serve a subsidiary or accompanimental role but is equal in importance to the other instruments. In this regard, Brahms can be credited in as the creator of the Horn-Trio genre.

In 1982, a Hungarian composer, György Ligeti, presented his new composition, Horn Trio. He subtitled the work, “Hommage a Brahms” to acknowledge Brahms’s

---

6 Examples include Mozart’s Quintets in E-flat K 407/386c (horn, violin, two violas and cello) and K. 452 (piano, oboe, clarinet, bassoon, and horn); Beethoven’s Quintet Op. 16; and Schubert’s Octet D 803.
contribution to the Horn-Trio genre. Brahms’s indication to use a natural horn rather than a valve-horn is another special feature of the work. His choice of the natural horn is significant because, by the middle of the nineteenth century, the valve-horn was already prevalent in Europe. The valve-horn has characteristics such as ease of performance, accurate pitch, and musical agility. These benefits of the valve-horn made the natural horn nearly disappear. This study will investigate why Brahms uses the old-fashioned horn.

Many Brahms scholars have insisted that the Horn Trio is associated with the death of Brahms’s mother in 1865. For example, Melvin Berger emphasizes the effect that his mother’s death had on Brahms and calls attention to the expression of his sorrow in the Horn Trio. According to Berger, until Brahms finished his Horn Trio, his mind was filled with grief and memories of his mother.7 In addition, Michael Musgrave also asserts the relationship between the Horn Trio and the death of Brahms’s mother. He also emphasizes that the third slow movement has a character of deep sadness expressing Brahms’s feelings after her passing.8

These scholars insist that in order to memorialize his mother in the Horn Trio, Brahms uses the horn he learned in his childhood and also includes a traditional German song for the second movement and finale. Hella Baumann, in his article, “The Horn as a Symbol,” discusses the significance of the horn in music history. He states that among many emotions that are associated with the horn, such as nostalgia, vigilance, and the pastoral sound, one of the most obvious connotations is sadness and


grief from farewell or death. Baumann points out that Schubert’s song “Auf dem Strom,” which uses a poem of Ludwing Rellstab (1799-1860), is unique because of the unusual combination of soprano voice, piano and horn. Baumann also states that Schubert employs the horn as an accompaniment to the voice, and that the text of the poem represents sorrow as a result of two lovers parting.9 The soprano sings in counterpoint with the horn melody while both are accompanied by the piano. Even though this instrumental combination is unusual, the mournful mood and feeling of the song is conveyed through the sound of the horn.

Brahms also used a horn for his choral work, *Vier Gesänge*, Op. 17 (1859-60) comprised of four part songs for women’s choir, two horns, and a harp. Brahms selected four different author’s poems, which come from varied historical periods. The texts of all four poems mainly concern ‘death’ and ‘grave.’ His use of the horn combined with women’s voices and harp, effectively represents ‘death’, which is a central theme in the all of the poems.

**Non-Sonata Form in the First Movement**

The first movement of the Horn Trio begins with a lyrical theme in the violin with a homophonic piano accompaniment. It is a repeated form, A (mm. 1-76) – B (mm. 77-130) – A’ (mm. 130-166) – B’ (mm. 167-186) – A’’(mm. 199-233) – coda (mm. 234-266). Non-sonata form in the first movement of a multi-movement piece is rare in the Classical and Romantic periods. Indeed, the Horn Trio’s opening movement is unique within Brahms’s own chamber music. Out of all of Brahms’s twenty-four chamber music

---

pieces, the Horn Trio is the only piece in which the first movement is not in sonata form.\textsuperscript{10} Although it can be considered a rondo form, the thematic development is too weak for the piece to be considered a Rondo Sonata form. Indeed, throughout the movement, the idea of repetition is more emphasized than development. Thus, it best considered a Rondo form because its theme and features are repeated several times in each part, varying in key and length. Hence, many music scholars have different opinions about the form of the Horn Trio’s first movement. Karl Geiringer asserts that the first movement is a “repeated Andante piece” that has two episodes,\textsuperscript{11} while Malcolm MacDonald regards it as an extended ternary form, A – B – A – B – A.\textsuperscript{12}

According to MacDonald, the initial A – B – A parts should by themselves display a strong ternary form in order for the first movement to be considered an extended ternary form. The construction of the three parts, however, is very weakly delineated. Therefore, I regard Geiringer’s assertion as appropriate because each statement of the theme has a strong episodic character and the bridge sections between each part are simple.


\\[\text{\textsuperscript{11} Karl Geiringer, \textit{Brahms, His Life and Work} (London: George Allen and Unwin Ltd., 1948), 231.}\]

\\[\text{\textsuperscript{12} Maclcom MacDonald, \textit{Brahms} (New York: Schirmer Books, 1990), 175.}\]
Using Traditional German Folksong

The second movement and the finale of the Horn Trio are commonly considered in the hunting-horn style. Characteristics of this style include duple time signature, fast tempo, and the use of the traditional German folksong, all of which are common features of this piece. The second movement and the finale are based on the German folksong, “Dort in den Weiden steht ein Haus” (Ex. 2.1). The duple rhythm and ascending melodic line are significant points associated with the German folksong and the Horn Trio. The folksong is also used in the slow third movement, in mm. 59 to 61 in the Horn and mm. 63 to 65 in the Violin, employed very sorrowfully (Ex. 3.17). Some scholars including Robert Dearling have suggested that the German folksong is one of Brahms’s mother’s favorite songs and this may be the reason Brahms inserted the folksong into the third movement, which is regarded as a lamentation for his mother’s death. This assertion, however, has not yet been proven.

---

CHAPTER III

OVERVIEW OF THE HORN TRIO

The First Movement

As stated in Chapter II, the form of the first movement differs from that of most multi-movement chamber pieces in the Classical and Romantic periods by using a varied thematic rondo form rather than sonata form. Brahms, in this movement, emphasizes one of the more unusual aspects of the Horn Trio, the absence of a development, as will be demonstrated. The developmental process becomes the variation of the A and B sections, in which the themes return without essential change. In the first movement, marked Andante, we hear the first theme of the A section played dolce in the low ranges of the violin and horn (Ex. 3.1). In Section B, the time signature is changed to 9/8 and we hear a number of alterations in key, texture, and rhythm (Ex. 3.5).

The overall form of the first movement is A – B – A’ – B’ – A” (A in mm. 1-76, B in mm. 77-117, a bridge in mm. 118-130, A’ in mm. 130-166, and B’ in mm. 167-186, a bridge in mm. 187-199, A” in mm. 199-233, and the coda in mm. 234-266). Thus, there are three A sections, two B sections, and a coda, but no development. The A section is elegant and flowing in contrast to the B section, which is slightly faster and more restless.14 While the material of the two bridges is based on the B theme and could be considered part of the B section, the coda takes up the first theme of the A section.

14 Berger, 97.
A, A’, and A”

Despite having different forms, each of the A sections shares common themes. The first A section can be further divided into three subsections: a in mm. 1-29, b in mm. 30-55, and a’ in mm. 56-74. Thus, the A section can be considered a small ternary form. Both the a and a’ subsections contain the first theme of the A section that is shown in mm. 1-8 (Ex. 3.1): the first theme starts with an ascending fifth interval (B-flat and F) and two non-harmonic notes, the anticipation and neighboring-tone, mainly lead the melody. The piano accompanies the two-voice lyrical duet of the violin and horn in homophonic style. The theme of the a subsection is mainly supported by a dominant chord (prolonged until m. 29) until the b subsection. Thus, a primary tonic chord, the E-flat major triad, is first expressed at the beginning of Subsection b in m. 29 (Ex. 3.2). In the initial statement of Subsection a, the horn is the dominant voice, playing in a range and timbre that accentuates the natural sound of the instrument (Ex. 3.1).

The second theme of the A section, Subsection b, consists of the two different patterns in a descending motion: the stepwise long-valued note pattern and the leaping short-valued note pattern in the violin in mm. 31-37, the example 3.2. Because of the varied characteristics, the second theme of the A section is more expressive rather than the first theme. In contrast to Subsection a, Subsection b is in a three-voice contrapuntal style. While the form of Subsection a is a two-voice lyrical duet accompanied by the piano, in Subsection b, the three instruments play the theme and imitate each other. In m. 29, the theme appears first in the piano on B-flat (Ex. 3.2). It is then taken up by the violin a perfect fourth higher on E-flat in m. 31. Finally, the horn plays the theme on B-flat, a perfect fourth lower in m. 37 (Ex. 3.2).
The structure and form of the A’ and A” sections differ from the previous A section even though they contain the same first theme. While the A section consists of two different themes, the A’ and A” sections use only the first theme of the A section and are, therefore, much shorter.

The A’ section in mm. 130-166 consists of only the two subsections of the A section: Subsection a and a’ the b section being omitted. At the beginning of the A’ section in mm. 130-138, the first theme is played in the horn accompanied by the piano in E-flat major, the same key as the A section. The theme is taken up by the violin in mm. 138-146, but is varied. This varied theme plays a lively part in the section (Ex. 3.3). After Subsection a in the A’ section, Subsection a’ immediately follows. Subsection a’ is identical with Subsection a in the A section. Specifically, the melody and texture in mm. 151-164 are exactly same as mm. 61-74 in the A section. At the beginning of Subsection a’, between mm. 146-158, the parts are exchanged: the melody in the violin in the A section is played by the horn in the A’ section, and the melody in the horn in the A section is played in the violin in the A’ section.

The beginning of the double-bar line, the indication “Tempo I,” and the dominant chord—the initial chord of the A section—are the obvious clues that A’ follows, beginning with the upbeat to m. 130. Especially noteworthy is the return to a strong dominant at m. 131, which parallels the emphasized dominant of the beginning of the movement. See the beginning of the example 3.3. In addition, the texture and key of the A’ section are similar to the A section. However, because the varied theme in Subsection a replaces Subsection b in the A section, the A’ section is comparatively simple and short.
The A" section in mm. 200-233 is shorter even than the A’ section. During the A" section, the first theme of the A section appears once in the horn but the main key, E-flat major, is changed to G-flat major. The horn melody with the piano part in homophonic style evokes the initial A section. In the first half of the A" section between mm. 220-233, the top voice of the piano chromatically ascends with the violin, while the bottom voice chromatically descends with the horn. The opposite chromatic progression’s goal is the modulation to E-flat major at the beginning of the coda. Thus, in the A" section, the function of bridge is more emphasized rather than the restatement of the theme.

B and B’

In the B and B’ sections, the main characteristics are shifts of meter, key, and the fluent melodic line with syncopated rhythms. There is a shift in meter between the A and B sections from a 2/4 duple meter to a 9/8 triple meter. In addition, the key of the B section is changed to minor keys: the B section is in G minor and the B’ section is in B-flat minor. Due to the triple meter and the minor keys, the B and B’ sections are more lively and delicate as indicated by the marking Poco pui animato. While the first statements of the theme in the A sections are heard in the horn, the themes in the B and B’ sections are placed in the violin. The character of the themes in the B and B’ is based on a long legato phrase with syncopated rhythms in chromatic stepwise motion, and is, therefore, more suitable for violin than horn (Ex. 3.5). As in the A, A’, and A” sections, the violin and horn form a two-part counterpoint accompanied by the piano in mm. 76-84 in the B (Ex. 3.5) and in mm. 166-174 in the B’ sections (Ex. 3.6).
Although the B’ section is a little shorter than the B section, both B and B’ sections are close to each other: both sections contain the same theme; the instrumentation of the two sections is similar; and the bridge section in mm. 118-130 in the B section is based on the materials from mm. 187-199 of the B’ section. However, the key of the B section differs from the B’ section. As stated above, the key of the B section is G minor, but the key of the B’ section is B-flat minor. The key relationship between the B and B’ sections and its function in the first movement will be discussed in Chapter V.

The Second Movement

In this movement, Brahms uses a Scherzo form. Since Beethoven began replacing the Minuet with the Scherzo, the Scherzo was commonly used in late-Classical and Romantic symphonies.\(^{15}\) Scherzos are normally quick in tempo and light and playful in character. They are typically followed by a contrasting Trio, after which the first section of the Scherzo returns. By employing the Scherzo-Trio form in the Horn Trio, Brahms reveals his roots in the conventions of the German Classical and Romantic musical traditions.

The second movement is marked Scherzo Allegro in 3/4 meter and consists of two parts: the Scherzo in E-flat major and the Trio in A-flat minor with a da capo ending. The first section of the Scherzo presents an energetic and delightful theme in a fast tempo in primarily stepwise motion (Ex. 3.7). In contrast, the Trio is more melancholic in

character, featuring an elegant melody in a slow tempo (Ex. 3.11). The clear contrast of the two themes might be a distinct aspect of this movement.

Although the second movement is in the same E-flat major key area as the first and final movements -- its theme later reappears in the final movement -- it contrasts with the other movements in tempo and mood. Another distinguishing factor is the use of staccato. The staccato applies to all the instruments so that the mood becomes light and cheerful. Thus, this movement may be the most light-hearted movement in the entire piece.

The Scherzo Section in E-flat Major

The outline of the Scherzo section is as follows: an initial statement appears in the first section in mm. 1-80 and contains all of the motives that will be used throughout; a developmental section in mm. 81-163 that develops two of the motives from the first section; an altered restatement of the first section in mm. 163-226; and finally, a coda in mm. 227-286. If one were to look at the Scherzo by itself, i.e., without the Trio, the form could easily be heard as a typical sonata.

The initial statement comprises two motives, consisting of ascending and descending melodic lines which are all quarter notes in mm. 1-4 (Ex. 3.7) and a descending chord progression, III – V/V – V7 – I, in mm. 13-17 (Ex. 3.8). The first motive, labeled x, consists of octaves played staccato, and contrasts with the thick harmonic texture of the second motive, y (Exx. 3.7 and 3.8). During the first statement, the piano mainly plays the ascending and descending motive accompanied by the violin and horn. The same instrumentation can be found in the restatement in mm. 163-226.
(Ex. 3.9). In contrast to the first movement, where horn and violin preside over the x and y motive respectively, the Scherzo section in the second movement is dominated by the piano.

These two main motives in the previous statement in mm. 1-80 evolve in the development section in mm. 81-163. The x motive is repeated in varied registers of all the instruments and the y motive is extended. However, the development section is continually dominated by the delightful initial statement because it still employs the melodious pattern and staccato articulation of the motive x.

After the development, the x and y motives appear unexpectedly in mm.163-170, and announce the beginning of the restatement (Ex. 3.9). The themes of the restatement resemble the initial statement, but the texture differs. Because the three instruments play at the same time after the y motive, and the violin and horn imitate the piano, the restatement texture is thicker and richer than the initial statement.

The coda in mm. 227-286 is dominated by strong syncopated rhythms that are based on a combination of chromatic stepwise and leaping motion in the low register of the piano (Ex. 3.10). The chromatic stepwise and rising-third leaping motions in the piano emphasize the last weak beat in m. 227, which is tied to the next whole note to produce a syncopated rhythm. After four measures, the syncopated rhythm that appeared within two measures is now compressed within the reduced duration of single measures (see circles in Ex. 3.10). While the piano plays the syncopated rhythmic pattern (mm. 231-234), the violin also plays on the last weak beat in the measure so as to emphasize the syncopated rhythm in the piano. Moreover, the strong articulations, such as combinations of f and sfz, and crescendo, support the syncopated rhythm in
this passage. (later in the third movement, this syncopated rhythmic pattern leads to a significant climax.) While the violin, horn, and piano imitate each other as if in conversation in mm. 251-266, the syncopated rhythm is also, therefore, the most notable feature of the coda.

The Trio Section in A-flat Minor

The Trio, Molto meno Allegro, contrasts with the previous Scherzo section in tempo, character, and texture. Primarily, the Trio section is in a slow tempo and the violin and horn play the theme in rubato style. Even though Brahms did not indicate a precise tempo in the Trio section, its tempo is much slower than the initial tempo. The theme of the Trio features a lyrical and melancholy A-flat minor sonority. The theme is first placed in the violin and horn, doubled primarily in thirds and fourth (mm. 287-298), and the piano imitates it in mm. 299-311 (Ex. 3.11).

The Trio section closely resembles characteristics from other movements, namely the first and third movements. Indeed, the Trio theme is more similar to the theme of the third movement than to that of the Scherzo. Likewise, the texture is analogous to the melodic texture of the first movement. For instance, while the theme of the Scherzo section is played in octaves between the violin and horn, in the Trio, the violin plays the theme in its low register with the horn playing above the violin's melody, similar to Subsection a' in the A and A' sections of the first movement in mm. 56-74 (Ex. 3.12) and mm. 151 to 161. At the end of the Trio, rhythmic energy is gradually lost as the tempo slows down to prepare for the return of the Scherzo (Ex. 3.13).
The Third Movement

As suggested by Daniel Gregory Mason, the third movement is one of the most deeply felt and delicately written of all of Brahms’s slow movements.16 Brahms uses 6/8 meter based on the eighth-note in slow tempo – a meter that has certain “archaic” pastoral connotations, as does the horn itself. This particular movement echoes the profound distress that Brahms experienced following the death of his mother, projecting a tragic and dark mood.17 The descending line in mm. 1-4 in quarter- plus eighth-note rhythms (Ex. 3.14) is also found in Brahms’s other works.18 In Horn Trio, this figure resembles a slow walk towards death, in which one gradually loses the energy and willingness to live. Additionally, the third movement has often been associated with Brahms’s German Requiem, Op. 45 (1866-68) composed in the years following the Horn Trio. Indeed, the two pieces can be considered a pair.19

Compared with the other two slow parts of the Horn Trio (the first movement and the Trio in the second movement), the third movement is mystical and impressive in scope, despite being only eighty-six measures long. The third movement offers a thoughtful rest between the aggressive second and fourth movements, aptly titled


17 Berger, 96-97.


19 Geiringer, 310.
“hunting movements”. There is a smooth transition from the second movement into the third; this effect may be partly attributed to the first-inversion tonic chord used in the introduction to the third movement, before the theme begins in m. 5. Using the unstable first-inversion tonic at the opening of the movement is a technically effective way to mitigate the unfamiliar feeling of the ensuing theme and create a smooth transition into the contrasting third movement. The unstable inversion becomes stable on the root position of the tonic chord in m. 5 (Ex. 3.14).

The third movement, *Adagio mesto*, in 6/8 meter and E-flat minor, exhibits the following A – B – A’ – B’ – A” – coda form: Section A in mm.1-18 comprises a four-measure introduction, ten-measure theme, and a four-measure closing section; Section B in mm.19-42 an eight-measure contrapuntal theme and a sixteen-measure imitative contrapuntal development; Section A’ in mm. 43-58 includes a four-measure introduction; Section B’ comprises mm. 59-68; and Section A” comprises mm. 69-76, leading to the coda in mm. 77-86.

**A, A’, and A”**

The A section in mm. 1-18 may be divided into three parts: an introduction in mm. 1-4, the theme of the A section in mm. 5-15, and a closing section in mm.15-18, similar to the first four-measure introduction. Because the introduction, heard in the piano, is repeated in the closing section, the theme is encompassed by the introduction and its restatement. Near the end of the A’ section (mm. 43-58), however, the introduction is

---

20 Notley, 250.
removed and does not resurface in the A" section (mm. 69-76). As shown in example 3.18, the introductory material does not resurface until the beginning of the coda (mm. 77-86) when it is played in the low register of the piano (the coda starts with the introductory material the piano).

In the introduction, Brahms uses the piano’s low range, quiet articulations, and the *una corda* pedal to create a solemn and quiet mood (Ex. 3.14). The theme, a three-part texture from mm. 5-10, is repeated once in mm. 11-15 before reaching the closing section.

All of the material in the A section, with the exception of the closing material, returns in the A’ section in mm. 43-60; however, the introduction and the closing section are altered. In mm. 43-44 (Ex. 3.15), the introduction overlaps with the end of the B Section theme in the violin. The closing section, which is stated in mm. 15-18 in the previous A section (Ex. 3.16), is now substituted for by two measures of a descending passage in the piano (mm. 57-58 in Ex. 3.17).

The A" section in mm. 69-76 is based on a fragment of the A theme, which consists of a descending-fourth interval and ascending chromatic stepwise motion followed by a descending motion (Ex. 3.18). Despite being the shortest section, the A" section reaches the point of climax for the entire third movement in mm. 69-76. Here, the fragment (see the circle in m. 69 in Ex. 3.18) is repeated in the violin and horn at the highest pitch and dynamic levels of the movement. Moreover, the effect of the shifting from E-flat minor to E-flat major at m. 69 and 73 in the A" section reinforces the climax in m. 73, despite the previous appearance of E-flat major in the B’ section.
One of the most noteworthy aspects in both the B and B’ sections is the use of fugato technique. The B section begins with a theme played by the solo horn in mm. 19-20 (Ex. 3.16). The theme is imitated by the violin in m. 21 and the piano in m. 23. The B’ section begins in mm. 59-60 with the German folk melody, “Dort in den Weiden steht ein Haus,” stated by the horn, followed by the melody stated by the violin in mm. 63-64 (Ex. 3.17). The theme from the first B section is restated by the right hand of the piano against a pedal point in the left hand beginning in m. 61 (Ex. 3.17). While the violin, horn, and piano play polyphonically in the B section, in the B’ section the two instruments, violin and horn, play countermelodies against the piano as a duet.

In the B section, the unusual metric combination of a duple 6/8 meter in the violin and horn against a triple 3/4 meter in the piano in mm. 28-31 creates hemiola. In addition, in the B’ section, the right and left hand of the piano also create the hemiola in m. 68 (Ex. 3.19). Although the hemiola rhythmic combination appears in both the B and B’ sections, it functions differently within each; the hemiola in the B section consists of contrapuntal melodies of the solo instruments and leaping chord-progressions of the piano, each chord in long durational values (see mm. 28-31 in Ex. 3.19). However, the hemiola in the B’ section differs from the previous hemiola. The hemiola is created by piano without the two solo instruments, and the ascending chord progression from bass clef to soprano clef in the piano is filled with tension and energy (see the end of m. 67 and m. 68 in Ex. 3.19). It is similar to the coda in the second movement. In this section, the German folksong enters in the Horn in mm. 59-64 and is taken up by the Violin in mm. 63-65 (Ex. 3.17).
The Finale

As opposed to the third movement, which is sorrowful and tragic, the Finale is filled with spirit and energy, as the tempo marking *Allegro con brio* suggests. The tension and darkness built up in the third movement is entirely resolved by the joyful and playful mood maintained throughout the Finale.

The two main characteristics of the Finale are the use of the hunting-horn style and the traditional German folksong. As stated in Chapter II, the horn part in the second movement and the Finale is in a lively ‘hunting-horn style,’ characterized by a non-legato technique, quick tempo, and ascending and descending stepwise motions. However, the most significant characteristic of the hunting-horn style is the horn call itself. The violin and horn play a leaping melody of perfect fourths at the end of the first theme in mm. 16-22, announcing the beginning of the hunt (see the circles in Ex. 3.20). This horn call is typically symbolic of the pastoral topic. The leaping figures and staccato articulation in the first theme of the accompanying piano part resemble the gallop of a horse and the unusual accents on the unstressed beats create a delightful rhythm in the theme (Ex. 3.20).

The first theme also employs the old German folksong, “Dort in den Weiden steht ein Haus.” Even though the original melody is in a minor key with shorter phrases, the first theme of the movement imitates not only the source melody (mm. 1-8 in Ex. 3.20) but its mood as well. This same theme is also found in the B’ section of the third movement; however, in contrast to its use in the Finale, the folksong tune in the third movement differs from the original melody due to changes in tempo, rhythm, and articulation (see the beginning of Ex. 3.20).
The Finale can be understood as a sonata form although it does not exactly follow the typical sonata plan because it has such a short development. Typically the outer movements of a work like the Horn Trio are in sonata form; but while the first movement is not in a sonata form, Brahms’s use of it in the Finale reflects common practice. The form for the Finale is as follows: the exposition extends from mm. 1 to 98; the development from mm. 99 to 167; and the recapitulation from mm. 167 to 267; and the coda is from mm. 277 to 295.

Exposition

The exposition can be divided into three sections: the first group, mm. 1-43; the second group, mm. 44-82; and the closing section, mm. 83-93. As stated above, the theme of the first group is derived from the old German folksong, which consists of an ascending fourth interval followed by ascending stepwise motion. The theme of the first group appears first in the violin with a piano accompaniment featuring unusual offbeat accents in both parts (Ex. 3.20). The violin theme is repeated an octave higher doubled in the horn in m. 9. During the first group, the violin covers an extremely wide range of about three and a half octaves.

The second group is initiated by a short introduction with a repeated B-flat in the horn. While the horn repeats the B-flat, the violin imitates the ascending arpeggio passage in the piano in mm. 45-47 (Ex. 3.21). After the imitation between piano and violin, the violin and horn play an ostinato pattern whereby the piano dominates in mm. 52-60. Here, the piano repeats the previous melody in mm. 45-52 in homophonic style. During this section (mm. 45-60), the ranges of all the instruments are remarkable: from
mm. 49-52, both hands of the piano are in the treble clef, especially in mm. 56-60, while the other instruments are heard in their lower registers for the entire movement. For the next three measures (mm. 61-63), the voices of all instruments invert so that the piano plays in a low register and the two other instruments are heard in the upper registers. The gap between these two voice groupings is quite wide, but the registral span creates varied tone colors and sonorities (Ex. 3.21). In the first half of the second group (mm. 44-66), a syncopated rhythm which is derived from the violin and piano in mm. 49-52 is revealed in the piano. The syncopated rhythm moves to the violin and horn in mm. 61-66 and becomes accelerated. The two solo instruments make hemiola with piano so that it increases tension; however, in the following subsection, mm. 67-82 (Ex. 3.22), the tension is gradually resolved by the sequence of the lyrical ascending melody in the violin and its opposite descending echo in the piano. The horn and the left hand of the piano gently support two contrasting voices in the violin and upper part of the piano.

The closing section in the exposition (mm. 83-93 in Ex. 3.22) is noted for being less densely imitative and contrapuntal, because there is only one melodic line written in the piano and violin, while the horn plays a pedal point. One of the impressive features in the closing section is the re-grouping of meter. The original time signature of the movement is 6/8, which is divided into two groupings of three eight notes. However, in the closing section the duple meter is changed to a triple meter of 3/4 by the piano and the alternation between 6/8 and 3/4 of the violin (Ex. 3.22).
Development

The development in mm. 99-167 is not only shorter but also simpler than the exposition because it does not contain intense syncopated rhythm and the last twenty-five measures are played by only two instruments, namely, the horn and piano. The development is divided into the following sections: A section in mm. 102-109, B section in mm. 109-143, and C section in mm. 143-167. Section A can be regarded as a short introduction. While the violin plays a variation of the first group of the exposition, the horn presents the leaping melody in perfect fifths, which resembles the horn call in mm. 16-22. In the exposition, the horn call followed the first group theme; however, in the development, the two main themes appear simultaneously in mm. 102-109 (Ex. 3.23). Differing from the previous section, the B section has a new theme, a long descending melody with legato articulation, played by the violin beginning in m. 111 (Ex. 3.24). While the horn supports the violin with the same rhythmic values and articulation, the piano accompanies the new B theme with staccato articulation derived from the opening of the finale. After the first statement of the B section’s theme in the violin (mm. 111-118), the left hand of the piano part imitates the new theme in the bass, beginning in m. 121 (Ex. 3.24). In m. 131, the violin plays a compressed sequential version of the new theme, reaching the highest register in the movement in m. 142 (Ex. 3.25).

As stated above, in the last twenty-five measures, C section, the horn plays the horn call accompanied by ascending arpeggios in the piano. The B theme returns in mm. 156-161, inserted between the statements of the horn call (Ex. 3.26).
Recapitulation

The recapitulation, in mm. 167-267, follows the paradigm of sonata form. The first and second groups of the exposition, with their respective closing sections, are repeated in the recapitulation. The E-flat first group occurs without any change in theme and instrumentation; however, in the recapitulation, the second group does not modulate to B-flat major (as it had done in the exposition) but remains anchored in E-flat major conforming to traditional sonata form. After the bridge in mm. 250-276, the coda follows in mm. 277-295, based on the restatement of the first group’s theme. The Finale concludes as the violin and horn melodically play the ascending theme accompanied by the piano in homophonic style.
CHAPTER IV

FUNDAMENTAL STRUCTURAL UNITY: INITIAL ASCENT AND VOICE EXCHANGE

Initial Ascent

Initial ascent (*Anstieg*) is one of the fundamental structural aspects in the Horn Trio that provides unity. With the exception of the first movement, which opens with a prolongation of the dominant chord, the last three movements begin with initial ascents to the primary tone (*Kopfton*); as we shall see, the initial ascent assumes motivic-structural significance in each movement.

The Concept of Initial Ascent

The initial ascent signifies an ascending line at the opening of the work or movement that arrives at the *Kopfton* of the *Urlinie* (or fundamental line). In order to reach the primary tone, notes typically ascend in stepwise motion as in example 4.1b. Sometimes, however, the initial ascent forms an *arpeggio* rather than stepwise motion as in example 4.1a. The stepwise motion, however, can be considered to fill in the *arpeggio* motion by means of passing tones. The main consequence of the initial ascent is that the last note of the progression should be the primary tone. In *Free Composition*, Heinrich Schenker states that the primary tone of the fundamental line is the only possible goal for an initial ascending line.\(^{21}\) Thus, the possible ascending linear progressions of the initial ascent are as follows: scale degrees \(1 - \frac{3}{2} - \frac{5}{3} - \frac{4}{3} - \frac{5}{4}\).

\(^{21}\) Schenker, Heinrich. *Free Composition* translated and edited by Ernst Oster. (New York: Longman,1979), 45 (paragraph number 120).
Even though the last note of the initial ascent can be supported by a tonic chord or non-tonic chord, the beginning note of the initial ascent starts on one of the notes of the tonic chord.\textsuperscript{22}

The tones of the initial ascent, with the exception of its last note, are not regarded as tones of the fundamental line. The initial ascent is used to highlight the fundamental line; the notes of the initial ascent do not have the same function as those of the fundamental line because, as Schenker states, the primary tone is the goal of the initial ascent. As a result, the notes of the initial ascending line, with the exception of the primary tone, can be understood as an inner voice not on the same level as the fundamental line. In other words, the motion of the initial ascending line moves from the inner to the upper voice to reach the primary tone.\textsuperscript{23} Schenker illustrates the concept of an initial ascending linear progression in the opening theme of Schubert’s \textit{Wanderers Nachtlied}. Op. 4 in \textit{Free Composition}.\textsuperscript{24} The primary tone is achieved in m. 3, where the \textit{Urlinie} begins.

In \textit{Free composition}, Schenker observes that the primary tone has two contrary features, a stationary retained -- tone function and moving linear progressions generated:\textsuperscript{25} motionless primary tone conflicts with the natural descents from it. Thus,

\textsuperscript{22}Roger Kamien, “Non-Tonic Settings of the Primary Tone in Beethoven Piano Sonatas,” \textit{The Journal of Musicology} 16 (Summer, 1998): 379-382.

\textsuperscript{23}Schenker, 45 (paragraph number 120).

\textsuperscript{24}Ibid., in supplemental music examples, p. 12, Fig. 37a.

\textsuperscript{25}Ibid., 38-39 (paragraph number 93).
the ascending linear progression firmly emphasizes the conflict because the last note of
the ascending linear progression functions both as the goal of the initial ascent and as
the primary tone of the fundamental line. As a result, there is a conflict between the
retention of the goal, or primary tone, of the initial ascending line and the natural
diminution, or descent, from the primary tone of the fundamental line to scale degree 1.
In other words, tension is created between the strong pull to the point of arrival or
attainment of the goal of the initial ascent and the tendency of the primary tone to
descend to lower scale degrees. Therefore, tension is created between the fundamental
line and the inner voice-leading line of the initial ascent itself.

The initial ascent can be divided into two categories based on the chord supporting
the primary tone: tonic support of the primary tone or non-tonic support of the primary
tone.\textsuperscript{26} The tonic setting of the primary tone is based on the prolongation of the tonic
chord; by contrast, the non-tonic setting of the primary tone occurs when the primary
tone is supported by a non-tonic chord, which highlights the inner tension between the
initial ascent and the fundamental line. Example 4.1a and 4.1b both have initial ascents
in which the primary tone is supported by a tonic chord. On the other hand, the goal
tone of the initial ascent in example 4.2 is supported by a non-tonic chord. Because the
primary tone here is supported by a non-tonic chord, vertical tension is created at the
beginning of the fundamental line.

In \textit{Free Composition}, Schenker cites Schubert’s song, “Der Schiffer,” to illustrate
various compositional strategies for the initial ascent. In this example, he states that the
initial ascent virtually depicts the breathing ("breathing coolness in the moonlight,

\textsuperscript{26} Kamien, 379-382.
dreaming sweetly here in silence"). Here, we can assume that the initial ascent retards the appearance of the primary tone of the fundamental line at the beginning of the music. Even though the initial ascent may be based on a tonic chord, the primary tone is occasionally supported by a non-tonic chord, highlighting the vertical tension (as in Ex. 4.2). As previously observed, the last note of the initial ascent functions both as a goal tone and the primary tone.

The Initial Ascent in the Horn Trio

The first movement starts with the prolongation of the dominant chord where there is no initial ascent; however, the other three movements begin with an initial ascent to the primary tone.

The second movement has a long introduction in mm. 1-13. The introduction is supported by the prolongation of the tonic chord in mm. 1-9. The E-flat that dominates the introduction is the beginning note of the initial ascent, moving through the passing tone E to F-sharp in m. 12 (Ex. 4.3). The F-sharp, in turn, leads the ascending linear progression to G in m. 13, where the primary tone of the fundamental line is achieved. The motive, E-flat − F-sharp − G (excluding the passing tone E-natural) is a significant ascending linear progression throughout the work and later becomes structurally significant in the third movement as will be demonstrated. The last note of the initial ascending line, G, becomes not only the goal note of the initial ascent but the primary tone. As previously stated, the emphasis on G as the goal of an ascending linear

27 Schenker, 46 (paragraph number 123) and its supplemental music example, p. 12, Fig. 39-1.
progression and the tendency of G as the primary tone to gravitate toward scale degree \( \hat{2} \), creates tension. This tension serves to emphasize the primary tone and is one of the compositional effects of using the initial ascent. In order to underline the initial ascent in the upper voice, the ascending linear progression also appears in the lower voice part. Both the upper and lower voices move in unison arriving on the primary tone G (m. 13) supported by the mediant chord. The mediant chord, rather than the tonic chord, supports the primary tone. However, in the non-tonic chord setting (the primary tone is supported by non-tonic chord), the horizontal melodic line is emphasized rather than the harmony of the mediant chord that supports the primary tone. The emphasis on the horizontal melodic line is bolstered by the prolongation of the tonic chord that supports it over mm. 1-9 compared to the shorter duration of the median chord in mm. 13-15. The initial ascent is restated in the A' section.

As in the second movement, the initial ascent in the third movement is shown in the upper voice of the introduction in mm. 1-5 (Ex. 4.4). However, because the main key of the third movement is E-flat minor, the second and third notes are changed to F (passing tone) and G-flat, which is locally the primary tone of the fundamental line. This initial ascent forms part of a larger ascending linear progression that occurs over the span of mm. 1-61; on a larger scale, the fundamental line is picked up in m. 61 arriving on G-natural (Ex. 4.5). The same notes that formed the basis of the initial ascent in the second movement, E-flat \( \rightarrow \) F-sharp \( \rightarrow \) G now appear on a larger scale in the third movement. In the background graph of the third movement (Ex. 4.5), the first note of the initial ascent, E-flat in m. 1, moves to G-flat, the enharmonic equivalent of F-sharp, in m. 47 where the A section reappears. As stated above, the final note of the large-scale
ascending linear progression, G-natural, is attained in m. 61. In addition, while this large-scale ascending progression resembles the notes of the initial ascent in the second movement, the meaning is closer to a motivic function rather than an initial ascent. While the lower voice doubles the initial ascending line in the upper voice in the second movement, the lower voice in the third movement does not follow the initial ascending line in mm. 1-5. Instead of doubling the initial ascending line, the lower voice participates in a voice exchange with the opposite descending line, G-flat, F, and E-flat, in contrary motion (see the beginning of A and A' sections in Ex. 4.5). This voice exchange becomes a prominent structural feature in the entire third movement and will be discussed further in the voice exchange section of Chapter IV.

The initial ascending line E-flat – F – G in the Finale, mm. 1-17 (Ex. 4.6), also resembles the initial ascent in the second movement, mm. 1-13 (Ex. 4.3). The openings of the two hunting-style movements are based on a similar initial ascent, shown in the middleground graph, including a long prolongation of the tonic chord that supports the ascending line and a non-tonic chord setting of the primary tone. However, the two initial ascents differ structurally. The Finale’s introduction consists of a consequent and antecedent emphasized by tonic to dominant motion in mm. 1-7 and mm. 9-15 (Ex. 4.6). The progression of E-flat to F in mm. 1-7 and its repetition in mm. 9-15 is supported by this motion from tonic to dominant. Therefore, the ascending progression from E-flat to F is longer than the initial ascending progression from E-flat to F-sharp in the second movement (Ex. 4.3). On the larger scale, the supporting harmony in the lower voice, shown in the background graph of the Finale (Ex. 4.6), can be regarded as a tonic chord prolongation.
Voice Exchange

Aspects of Voice Exchange and Its Function

Although we can trace the use of voice exchange as far back as the twelfth century, its significance was mainly recognized starting from the nineteenth century. In its origin, voice exchange was used as a means of prolonging a portion of organum from a three- or four-voice motet. Within this context, voice exchange is more accurately explained as a “phrase exchange” whereby phrases are alternated rather than notes. This kind of construct is demonstrated in thirteenth-century English conductus that featured voice exchange. At least two dozen extant examples of English motets in three- and four-voices use this technique exhaustively in both strict and varied form. 

Schenker can be credited for recognizing the importance of voice exchange and giving it its due in the discourse of contemporary music theory and analysis. The voice exchange can be divided into two different categories: diatonic voice exchange and chromatic voice exchange. The diatonic voice exchange is the exchange of two notes without alteration of the actual notes themselves. In the chromatic voice exchange of two notes, one or both have been altered chromatically (Ex. 4.7).

In Free Composition, as Schenker comments in reference to J. Cruger’s Chorale, even though chromatic voice exchange features a kind of linear continuity, it is not considered to be a cross-relation. One of the main functions of voice exchange is to prolong a chord (the Klang). The voice exchange effects a prolongation of the harmony, while at the same time linearly inverting the interval of a third to that of a sixth or vice-


29 Schenker, 92-93 (paragraph number 250).
versa (Ex. 4.8). In order to extend a passage, some of nineteenth-century composers used a number of 6-10 voice exchanges. Moreover, an extended voice exchange over long spans of music may help to unify a piece.

Voice exchange is often associated with the bridge section in sonata form where it may span one theme and lead to another, or it may encompass a group of themes. The analytical application of an extended chromatic long-range voice exchange (i.e., occurring over a large span of music) is especially helpful in the analysis of bridge sections where the change of theme is often achieved through modulation. The second pair of notes in a chromatic voice exchange often represents the move to another key area. It should be noted that voice exchange is a method of prolongation, and as such is not an entity unto itself receiving “organic development.” With that said, it can appear in augmentation, diminution, and with change of register.

The purpose of this chapter is to clarify a motivic approach to both diatonic and chromatic voice exchanges as a technique that elucidates structural aspects of an entire movement. Motivic voice exchange is not a characteristic melodic idea so that it could be used like conventional motive which is employed to develop a larger musical idea. Generally, it is related to structural levels rather than the surface of the music. In order


31 Ibid., 218-219.

to be a motive voice exchange, it should be used motivically, i.e., repeated and developed of various structural levels. Therefore, motivic voice exchange might create structural unity and become one of its motivic aspects. In the following section, we shall consider how voice exchange is employed with repetition and extension in the structure.

The Prolongation of a Chord by means of Voice Exchange in the Second Theme of the First Movement

The first theme of the first movement presents the typical Urlinie progression, scale degree $\hat{3}-\frac{5}{2}-\hat{1}$. The second theme, which we will examine now, is built on the voice-leading procedure of voice exchange (Exs. 4.9a and 4.9b).\(^{33}\) While voice exchange is not the principal characteristic, it does represent an important motivic aspect in the second theme. The voice exchange in mm. 77-82 is represented by diagonal lines between voices representing the middleground (Ex. 4.9b). In m. 76, the F-sharp of the upper voice ascends to A-flat, which is then exchanged with C in the lower voice at m. 79, and again at m. 81. This voice exchange between A-flat and C is based on stepwise motion encompassing the interval of a major third in each of the voices.

This motivic type of voice exchange occurs in the B' section in a similar fashion in Ex. 4.10. While the second theme in the B section (mm. 77-117) is in the key of G minor, the second theme in the B' section (mm. 167-186) is in the key of B-flat minor, a minor third higher. Thus, the motivic voice exchange also occurs between E-flat and C-flat, which is the same basic construct, C and A-flat. It is transposed a minor third higher (Ex. 

\(^{33}\) The form of the first movement is A – B – A′– B′– A″– coda. The first theme is presented by A, A′ and A″ and the second theme by B and B′.
4.10). Noteworthy is the fact that the two voice exchanges participate in a kind of paired voice exchange, thus representing the paired voice exchanges form a symmetrical construct. In other words, the music begins with the interval of a sixth C and A-flat and these notes are exchanged with A-flat and C at m. 79; then, the voices return to the original sixth (Ex. 4.9b). Because the starting notes of the voice exchange return to their initial notes at the end, the two voice exchanges are closely related. Hence, the paired voice exchanges in the B and B' sections are followed by yet another motivic voice exchange involving E-flat and B-flat, and G-flat and B-flat (Ex. 4.10).

Various other voice exchanges appear in sections B and B'. After the previous motivic progression in section B, the dominant harmony in G minor, which had been prolonged over ten measures (mm. 105-116 in Ex. 4.11), is connected to the tonic harmony in m.117. Numerous voice exchanges appear in the prolongation of the dominant in sections B and B'. During the dominant prolongation of mm. 105-116 in the B section, for example, the bass line descends and ascends by stepwise motion as numerous diatonic and chromatic voice exchanges occur at the foreground level (Ex. 4.11).

In the B sections, the voice exchange has special significance not only as a beginning motive, but also for the section as a whole. To elaborate, the B theme is built on a voice-exchange structure and the section contains numerous voice exchanges at the later structural levels. It is important to note that the function of the voice exchange in the B section is to prolong the harmony; additionally, because the voice exchange is an important motivic component in the B, its usage here can also be seen as a “motivic” function of voice exchange.
The Structural Function of Voice Exchange in the Third Movement

The motivic voice exchange in the B and B' sections of the first movement is repeated several times as the harmony is prolonged. The motivic-function voice exchange in the third movement, by comparison, is much more extended. Of central concern here are the ways in which the voice exchange, involving G-flat and E-flat presented in mm. 1-5 (Ex. 4.4), is then massively extended across mm. 5-42 in example 4.13. In addition, the extended voice exchange of mm. 5-42 is inverted again in the recomposition of the beginning section. This voice exchange naturally represents a deeper-level construct. There are two different extended voice exchanges, consisting of the same components as in sections A and B of the third movement. They are identified in mm.1-5 of the middleground graph.34 One of them is a foreground voice exchange that occurs between mm. 1 and 3 (Ex. 4.4). The lower voice of each of these voice exchanges starts on G-flat, the third of the tonic chord. In m. 3, G-flat in the lower voice moves to E-flat (i.e., the root of the tonic chord). In the upper voice, E-flat ascends to G-flat from mm. 1 to 3. Here, this voice exchange is a foreground construct.

The other voice exchange, which occurs over a longer stretch of music, is found between mm. 1-5. Although this more extended voice exchange contains the same notes as the shorter voice exchange, it is more significant than the previous one because it involves tones of the fundamental-structure, namely the primary tone (scale degree 3) in the upper voice. Additionally, it is built using the ascending upper-voice progression, E-flat – F – G-flat (see the asterisks in Exx. 4.4 and 4.5). In the fifth

34 See the music score of the third movement, Ex. 3.14 and the middleground graph of the third movement, Ex. 4.4.
measure, the lower voice E-flat becomes the structural tonic for the entire third movement. Additionally, the ascending structural line E-flat – F – G-flat in the upper voice creates symmetry with the descending line G-flat – F – E-flat in the upper voice (Ex. 4.5). Motivic voice exchanges similar to section A are also found in section B (mm. 20-42). The latter begins with the interval of the fifth, B-flat – F, in m. 19, which is inverted to F – B-flat in m. 21, then the beginning of section B returns with the original fifth as a result of another inversion (Ex. 4.12). The voice exchanges in m. 19 and m. 23 initiate a structurally extended voice exchange in m. 26, which also marks the beginning of the dominant prolongation in mm. 23-40 (see the asterisks in Ex. 4.12). Eventually, the F – B-flat in m. 23 is inverted to the B-flat – F in m. 42, where the B section concludes.

A subordinate voice exchange of the motivic-function variety occur in the A and B parts: voice exchanges of F, F-flat, and A-flat in mm. 11-14 (Ex. 4.4) and of C, C-flat, and E-flat in mm. 32-40 (Ex. 4.12). These two voice exchanges in both the A and B parts, however, do not represent “motivic voice exchange” (in contrast “motivic-function voice exchanges” in the B and B’ sections in the first movement), because these exchanges are never repeated later in the movement. Moreover, in order for a voice exchange to be regarded as “motivic,” it should participate in the prolongation of an element of the more background structure. These two voice exchanges, however, do not contain any such structural notes.

35 The progression, in which the first inversion tonic chord returns to root position, is the first indication we have that the fifth measure is the real structural start of the piece.
In the background graph of the third movement (Ex. 4.13) that voice exchange, which begins with the structural notes in m. 5 is completed in m. 42, where the A' section of the third movement begins. The first inversion of the tonic chord from the beginning of the movement reappears in m. 43. The upper-voice line closes with scale degree \( \hat{1} \) in m. 43 after passing through scale degree \( \hat{2} \) in m. 40. The E-flat in the lower voice (the structural tonic) moves through F in m. 32 to its goal, G-flat in m. 40. This extended voice exchange, built on the structural tones between m. 5 and m. 43, not only prolongs structure and harmony but also has an important motivic function. There are two main arguments for this voice exchange being primarily motivic in function: it connects each structural note and is repeated several times. In the example we see that the A' and B' sections also contain several voice exchanges, which connect the structural notes continuously until the end.

Although some of the voice exchanges are of the motivic variety in each of these movements, they assume different functions based on the pitches involved. In the first movement, the second theme contains a significant motivic voice exchange, C – A-flat and C – G voice exchanges and E-flat – C-flat and E-flat – B-flat voice exchanges. The voice exchange in the third movement articulates, E-flat – G-flat and E-flat – G-natural voice exchanges, both a structural and motivic relationship. Despite having fewer voice exchanges than the first movement, in the third movement the voice exchange itself represents a deeper driving force in the structure.
A FUNDAMENTAL VOICE-LEADING MOTIVE: E-FLAT, F-SHARP, AND G

The Concept of the Fundamental Voice-Leading Motive

A motive in conventional analysis is a minimum cell on which is built a theme and/or an entire piece. Its length is normally short, usually no longer than two measures. John Baur defines a motive as “a short, characteristic melodic idea that is used to construct a larger musical idea.”36 Even though a motive may be transformed into other figures through transposition and variation of its rhythmic or intervallic content, the motive can act as a hidden connection between different sections of a piece; therefore, it can provide unity within or between movements.37

Similarly, the “fundamental motive” is the smallest unit with which to unify a piece. Like a conventional motive, the fundamental motive, though it is small and simple, can become the basis of unity for the entire work. However, the fundamental motive is usually and easily found at the background more than the surface of music because the fundamental motive is related to structural notes on the background level. Likewise, it influences the whole structure rather than only a local phrase or section. A fundamental motive often contains structural notes within the piece as a whole; therefore, its area of influence is larger than a surface motive, which may cover only one or two sections in a


piece, partially affecting only one or two movements of a multi-movement work. Like a conventional motive, the fundamental motive may consist of a group of connected notes within one or two measures, but it can also consist of tones that function in different formal sections on a larger scale. For instance, the first note of the fundamental motive can be the first note of the A section, and the next note might be the first note of the B section.

The concept of the fundamental motive can be found in Rudolph Réti’s book, *The Thematic Process in Music*. Réti describes how a motive can affect the structure and key scheme of a piece and often help to explicate the relationship between movements. Although Réti does not use the term “fundamental motive” in his book, his general concept of motive can be regarded as the foundation of the concept of the fundamental motive as presented here. Réti states that the deeper-level motive cannot be developed or transformed like a conventional motive because it usually affects the overall structure. To create unity, the fundamental motive is often repeated rather than transformed or developed in other sections or movements. However, the fundamental motive can be transposed from the main key of the piece in a section or movement. In this chapter, I will discuss significant characteristics of the fundamental motive as I believe it functions in the Horn Trio with special attention to its use in each of the four movements, and its incorporation as a unifying element in the work as a whole.

38 Réti, 291-230.

39 Ibid., 4-5.
The Fundamental Voice-Leading Motive: E-flat – F-sharp – G

The fundamental voice-leading motive of the Horn Trio is an ascending stepwise third-progression, E-flat – F-sharp – G. This chromatically filled-in third-progression appears in all four movements, connecting them structurally.40 The intervallic content of this fundamental motive consists of an augmented second between E-flat and F-sharp and a minor second between F-sharp and G. In the first and third movements, the F-sharp is substituted for by its enharmonic equivalent, G-flat. The fundamental motive has several significant features: 1) each note of the fundamental motive becomes structurally significant; 2) the intervallic relationship between E-flat and G-flat represents E-flat minor, and E-flat and G, E-flat major, thereby evoking the large-scale key scheme of the work; and 3) furthermore, the fundamental motive is related to the “Gypsy” scale or mode commonly used in Hungarian folk music (Ex. 5.1).

As mentioned above, each note of the fundamental motive is a structurally significant note within the piece. The first note of the fundamental motive, E-flat, is the structural tonic in all four movements. No matter which structural scale degree appears at the beginning of a movement, such as scale degree 3, 5, or 6, it is eventually supported by the tonic, E-flat. In addition, each movement concludes on an E-flat tonic with scale degree 1 in the upper voice and the tonic in the lower voice. Hence, E-flat is the most important structural note in the Horn Trio. All of the Horn Trio’s movements, with the exception of the third movement, are initiated with an ascent to scale degree 3, or G. In the third movement, the fundamental tone, scale degree 3, appears at first to be

G-flat because the movement is in E-flat minor. As shown in Ex. 4.13, however, the true structural fundamental tone or head-note in the third movement is G-natural (m. 62). Thus, G-natural is the goal of the fundamental motive and functions as the primary tone in every movement, even the putatively E-flat minor movement. The middle note of the fundamental motive, F-sharp, may be considered a chromatically altered passing tone connecting E-flat with G-natural by stepwise leading-tone motion. The F-sharp emphasizes the last note, G-natural, since the tension of the augmented second between E-flat and F-sharp is resolved by the resolution to the major third. In the first movement, the structural tonic note in the lower voice, E-flat (m. 29), progresses to G-flat, the enharmonic equivalent F-sharp (m. 41). The tension of the augmented second between E-flat and G-flat is resolved by the major tonic chord in m. 68 (Ex. 5.2), with the G-natural in the bass.

The second feature of the fundamental motive is its reflection of the key scheme for the entire Horn Trio. The overall key is E-flat major; as already discussed in Chapter III, one of the unique features of the work as a whole is the parallel key relationship between E-flat major in the first, second, and fourth movements, and E-flat minor in the third movement (where normally a related key area such as C minor might have been used). The fundamental motive’s two outer notes, E-flat and G-natural, imply the tonic chord, E-flat major. The first and second notes of the fundamental motive, E-flat and F-sharp also present a tonic chord, but in E-flat minor because the F-sharp can be enharmonically equivalent to G-flat. Thus, the fundamental motive implies the two main keys of the Horn Trio, E-flat major and E-flat minor.
The last significant feature of the fundamental motive is its reference to the Gypsy scale commonly found in traditional Hungarian music. While Brahms was writing the Horn Trio around 1865, he was staying in Vienna where Hungarian influences dominated. Even though the Hungarian uprising collapsed in 1860, Hungarian culture was still strongly present in Austria. Brahms’s interest in Hungarian folk tunes and dances is evident in the initial twenty-one ‘Hungarian Dances’ for four-hand piano arrangements published in 1869.41 Although they were published four years after the Horn Trio, Brahms had already performed the Hungarian folk songs with one of his acquaintances, the Hungarian violinist Eduard Hoffmann (1828-1898) who called himself Reményi. The two young artists began a concert tour which included the Hungarian folk songs in 1853.42 Therefore, we can assume that Brahms had been exposed to Hungarian musical influences.

The Gypsy scale or Hungarian scale is C, D, E-flat, F-sharp, G, A-flat, B, C (Ex. 5.1). One of the characteristic features of the scale is the augmented seconds occurring between E-flat and F-sharp, and A-flat and B. If the beginning two notes, C and D, are eliminated, the scale can be divided into two parts, E-flat – F-sharp – G and A-flat – B – C, which are intervallically identical. Comparing the fundamental motive of the Horn Trio with this scale reveals that, the two parts of the scale have the same intervals as the fundamental motive. Thus, the Hungarian scale might have provided an impetus for the fundamental motive.

41 Geiringer, 218.

42 Ibid., 26 and 28-29.
The Fundamental Voice-Leading Motive in the First Movement

The fundamental voice-leading motive can be found several times in each section of the first movement. In the A section, the motive occurs in both the upper and lower voices in mm. 29-77 (see the asterisks in Ex. 5.2). The E-flat in the bass in m. 29 may be understood to move to G-flat (m. 41) and G-natural (m. 68) thus presenting the fundamental motive in enlargement. Simultaneously, the G-flat in the horn (m. 39), supported by the cadence on G-flat major (m. 40), ultimately resolves to the G natural in the horn (m. 73). Notice that the bass presents a further, overlapping statement of the motive as E-flat (m. 29) – G-flat (m. 69) – G-natural (m. 73) in the top voice (see the asterisks in Ex. 5.2). In this way (as indicated by the asterisks in Ex. 5.2), the fundamental motive is worked into the texture on different levels and registers. As E-flat moves to G in m. 73 through the G-flat in mm. 39-45 in the upper voice, the progression of the fundamental voice-leading motive is complete.

While the motive appears often in the A section, the A′ and A″ sections do not contain the fundamental voice-leading motive in its original form. The A′ section is shorter and therefore the complete motive does not appear. In the A″ section the motive is transposed to B-flat – D-flat – D (see the asterisks in mm. 186-200 in Ex. 5.2). In the B section, mm. 76-77, the motive is restated in the upper voice. Here, the E-flat of the motive appears in m. 74, moves to F-sharp in m. 104, and finally reaches G in m. 117 at the close of the B section (see the asterisks in mm. 73-117). Though there is only one appearance of the fundamental voice-leading motive in the B section, in m. 76, there are some voice-leading progressions that represent the fundamental voice-leading motive. For example, at the beginning of the B section, m. 77, the violin plays F-sharp
and G in a triple rhythm. Related with the previous note in m. 76 where the A section is
closed, the three notes ascending similarly to the fundamental voice-leading motive.
This familiar motion also appears in the inner voice in mm. 85-86 (see the asterisks in
mm. 74-88 in Ex. 5.2). However, these are not considered the fundamental voice-
leading motive because the motion is not associated with scale degree notes. The B’
section repeats the B section in B-flat minor (mm. 165-199 in Ex. 5.2). In the B’ section,
the motive it is transposed up a third to G-flat – A – B-flat (mm. 173-186), functioning
similar to the previous B section. Likewise the motive is transposed up a fifth to B-flat –
C-sharp (D-flat) – D between the B’ and A” sections.

As mentioned in the previous chapter, tension is created between the descending
Urlinie and the ascending fundamental voice-leading motive (The Urlinie descends to
reach scale degree 1, while the fundamental voice-leading motive holds on its goal note
or primary tone). At the background level, scale degree 3 is picked up in m. 29, and
descends to tonic in m. 73. The fundamental voice-leading motive moves in contrary
motion to the descending progression as it ascends in the inner voice from E-flat to G in
mm. 39-45 with a passing G-flat. The opposing motion between the two voices create
tension in the A section. The fundamental voice-leading motive in the B section also
creates tension through contrary ascending and descending motion.

The Fundamental Voice-Leading Motive in the Second Movement

The fundamental voice-leading motive also appears in the second movement, only
in the scherzo section, mm. 1-274 (see the asterisks in Ex. 5.3). Here, the fundamental
voice-leading motive mainly occurs in the introduction (mm. 1-13), appearing in both the
upper and lower voices in mm. 1-13 (Ex. 5.3). In order to reach scale degree $\hat{3}$ in the upper voice and its doubled note in the lower voice in m. 13, both voices ascend chromatically. Similarly, in the restatement section, beginning in m. 163, the fundamental voice-leading motive reappears, worked into the outer voices.

The above-mentioned fundamental voice-leading motives in the scherzo can be considered as fundamental voice-leading motives in local level. A larger-scale fundamental voice-leading motive, however, includes the F-sharp in m. 93 as its second note (rather than the F-sharp in m. 12) and resolves to the G in m. 167. In mm. 81-167, we find several significant techniques, including voice-exchange and prolongation of F-sharp or G-flat. Not only is this section difficult to analyze, but it is also remarkable for the way in which it incorporates the fundamental voice-leading motive. This part modulates to B major (mm. 97-152) and moves back to E-flat minor in m. 153. The F-sharp of this large-scale fundamental voice-leading motive in m. 93 is prolonged through the B major section (mm. 97-152). In spite of the modulation to E-flat minor in m. 153, the F-sharp is understood as retained voice in the upper enharmonically respelled as G-flat, but functioning and respelled as F-sharp in m. 163. The prolonged F-sharp functions as scale degree $b\hat{3}$ with the prolongation of tonic chord (Ex. 5.3).

The Fundamental Voice-Leading Motive in the Third Movement

There are two versions of the fundamental voice-leading motive in the third movement: 1) E-flat – F – G-flat and 2) E-flat – F-sharp – G-natural, i.e. the original version. E-flat – F – G-flat appears locally at the beginning of the A section in mm. 1-5 (Ex. 5.4). In this first version, the second and third notes of the original fundamental
motive, F-sharp – G-natural, are changed to F – G-flat, because these pitches conform to E-flat minor, the main key. Thus, the motive progresses E-flat (m. 1) – F (m. 4) – G-flat (m. 5) in the upper voice part. This revision of the fundamental voice-leading motive also appears in the A’ section in mm. 43-47. Both versions of the motive participate in a voice-exchange as shown in the graph.

The first version of the fundamental voice-leading motive participates in the Anstieg which arrives on G-flat in m. 5. This G-flat, enharmonically respelled as F-sharp, can be regarded as the second note of the fundamental motive occurring on a larger-scale from mm. 1-69. The motive is completed as it progresses to G-natural in m. 69, which functions as the true primary tone for the entire movement. The G natural in m. 69 is emphasized by a strong dynamic marking "passionato", unusual rhythmic patterns, the wide range of the piano part, and a change of key from E-flat minor to E-flat major just prior to its appearance, further establishing it as the fundamental scale degree 3. The significance of the G in m. 69 forms a basis for the interpretation of the large-scale fundamental voice-leading motive presented above.

The Fundamental Voice-Leading Motive in the Finale

The Finale is a typical sonata form, consisting of exposition, development, recapitulation, and coda. The fundamental voice-leading motive also appears in this movement, however, differently than in the other movements. In the initial three movements, the statements of the fundamental motive appear near or at the beginning of each movement. In the finale, by contrast, the fundamental voice-leading motive does not appear until the recapitulation. Rather a transposition of the fundamental motive, B-
The original fundamental voice-leading motive is found in mm. 212-259 in the recapitulation, clearly indicated by the asterisks in the upper voice part. The first note of motive is the E-flat in m. 212, the termination of a local *Urlinie*. The second note, F-sharp (enharmonically, G-flat), appears several times before m. 259. In m. 214 following, however, the G-flat and F-sharp in m. 222 are not regarded as the second note of the motive because they function locally as a passing tone to reach scale degree $\text{♭}\text{2}$ locally. The F-sharp – G in m. 259 completes the fundamental motive initiated by E-flat in m. 212. The fundamental voice-leading motive is recalled in mm. 261-275 closing the structure (Ex. 5.5).

**The Fundamental Voice-Leading Motive in the Entire Work**

As discussed in the previous chapter, the fundamental motive unifies all movements, i.e. the motive retains similar structural and voice-leading connotations even though each movement has different musical features, such as tempo, style, and texture. If the piece is regarded as a unified whole, i.e., only superficially divided into four movements, the fundamental voice-leading motive may be projected on a large-scale over the entire piece. The following background graph in Ex. 5.6 shows the *Urlinie* and structural bass line for the work in its entirety. Each of the four measures in the example represents one movement. The initial scale degree $\text{♭}\text{3}$ in the upper part and the structural tonic in the lower part occur at the opening of the first movement in the graph’s first measure. On the largest scale, both scale degree $\text{♭}\text{3}$, G, and the structural tonic, E-flat, are prolonged
until the beginning of the Finale in the fourth measure. Near the end of the second
movement (mm. 81-163), a voice-exchange occurs at the middleground level. The F-
sharp and E-flat in m. 81, a bridge section in the second movement, are exchanged with
the E-flat and F-sharp in m. 163. This voice exchange, however, does not influence the
voice-leading progression at the background level because E-flat and G are prolonged
until the fourth movement. Scale degree \( \hat{2} \), prolonged in the Finale through the second
group in the exposition and the development, descends to scale degree \( \hat{1} \) at the end of
the finale, thereby completing the Ursatz.

From this large-scale perspective, the prolongation of the tonic over the first three
movements is much longer than the prolongation of the dominant in the last movement.
However, when it comes to consideration of the fundamental voice-leading motive and
its initial ascent, the length of the prolongation of tonic and dominant seems more
appropriate. At the background level, the fundamental voice-leading motive spans the
first two movements, regaining the fundamental tone, G-natural, in the third movement.
From this perspective, the initial note of the fundamental voice-leading motive, E-flat, is
located at the beginning of the first movement (m. 29). The second note of the motive,
F-sharp now spelled as G-flat, ultimately resolves to G-natural in the third movement (m.
69). In this sense, the first and second movements recompose the Anstieg to scale
degree \( \hat{3} \) on the largest scale. Furthermore, the third movement functions as the long-
range goal of the piece, strengthening the interpretation of the scale degree \( \hat{3} \), or G-
natural (m. 69), in the third movement as the structural scale degree \( \hat{3} \) of the entire
piece. Moreover, the interpretation of the Finale as a large-scale dominant function is
reinforced by the great length of the dominant prolongation within the movement, which
comprises the second group of the exposition and the development or almost half of the Finale.
CHAPTER VI

CONCLUSION

One of the most fundamental compositional principles is the realization of large-scale unity by using a variety of techniques. In order to attain this, unity is created at both the surface level of a piece and in the background. In addition, compositional unity may result from musical affinity between different sections and movements. Réti states that homogeneity may occur both between and within movements. Réti states that homogeneity may occur both between and within movements. Réti states that homogeneity may occur both between and within movements.43 Cooke also asserts a composer may use same fundamental pitch-pattern of a whole group of intimately-associated works.44 Even though composers did not indicate a relationship between sections, movements, and/or genres, it is inevitable that music has been connected structurally and motivically. Hence, the interpretation of large-scale unity may lead to greater understanding of musical logic and coherence.

This study focuses primarily on the large-scale fundamental unity within this work,--Brahms’s Horn Trio--such as thematic or formal unification between different sections or movements, rather than unity created on the surface of music. Large-scale fundamental unity in the Horn Trio is provided across the overall multi-movement structure by the fundamental voice-leading motive, which functions both locally and globally: thus, the fundamental structural unity in the Horn Trio is created by two structures--the initial ascent and voice exchange, and the fundamental voice-leading motive, namely the progression of E-flat − F-sharp − G. These fundamental elements are remarkable

43 Réti, 5.

44 Cooke, 144.
features of the entire work. Especially, the initial ascent and voice exchange connect the first three movements. In addition, the fundamental voice-leading motive spans the initial three movements, and reaches its conclusion at the end of the third movement. Not only do the fundamental structures unify the entire work but also they emphasize the end of the third movement, which is, perhaps, the most sorrowful slow movement in Brahms’s works. Beyond the analytical interpretation, the piece has a strong historical correlation with the death of Brahms’s mother and his nostalgia at her passing.

In addition, this study illuminates several significant aspects of the work, such as the non-sonata form of the first movement, the incorporation of the natural horn, the use of German folksong, and unusual key schemes: the Horn Trio is the only multi-movement piece in Brahms’s oeuvre, which does not employ sonata form in the first movement; the combination of the timbre of the natural horn and German folksong may also be connected with the death of Brahms’s mother, as may be the use of the parallel minor key for the third movement.

This study of the fundamental unity spanning movements in Brahms’s Horn Trio sheds new light on Brahms’s chamber music: the unity of entire movements in Brahms’s chamber music has not been discussed until now. As Cooke observes, the purpose of the study of unity is, “to open up a path towards elucidating what is generally felt to be the enigmatic character of these works,”\textsuperscript{45} it is hoped that the present study may help us to better understand the special characteristics in Brahms’s chamber music. Therefore, explicating the fundamental unifying features of in the Horn Trio ultimately contributes toward a more comprehensive understanding of the piece. The fundamental structures, 

\textsuperscript{45} Cooke, 145.
initial ascent and voice exchange, and fundamental voice-leading motive, especially, help the listener to hear the multi-movement piece as a whole because the individual characteristics of each movement are the source of the innermost unity. This is significant for an elucidating of the large-scale compositional logic that informs the Horn Trio.
Example 2.1. German folksong, "Dort in den Weiden steht ein Haus."
Example 3.1. the first movement, mm. 1-16.
Example 3.2. the first movement, mm. 29-40.
Example 3.3. the first movement, mm. 130-146.
Example 3.4. the first movement, mm. 197-234.
Example 3.5. the first movement, mm. 76-84.
Example 3.6. the first movement, mm. 166-174.
Example 3.7. the second movement, mm. 1-4.
Example 3.8. the second movement, mm. 13-17.
Example 3.9. the second movement, mm. 160-177.
Example 3.10. the second movement, mm. 227-242.
Trio

Molto meno Allegro

\[ \text{MUSICAL NOTATION} \]

\[ \text{MUSICAL NOTATION} \]

\[ \text{MUSICAL NOTATION} \]

\[ \text{MUSICAL NOTATION} \]
Example 3.11. the second movement, mm. 287-314.
Example 3.12 the first movement, mm. 56-74.
Example 3.13. the second movement, mm. 349-362.
Example 3.14. the third movement, mm. 1-5.
Example 3.15. the third movement, mm. 43-46.
Example 3.16. the third movement, mm. 15-25.
Example 3.17. the third movement, mm. 55-66.
Example 3.18. the third movement, mm. 67-79.
B’ section

(mm.67-68)
Example 3.19. the third movement, mm. 67-68. and mm. 26-33.
Exposition – the first group

Finale

Allegro con brio

Example 3.20. the Finale, mm.1-20.
Exposition – the second group
Example 3.21. the Finale, mm. 44-68.
Exposition – the second group
Example 3.22. the Finale, mm. 57-96.
Example 3.23. the Finale, mm. 99-109.
Development - B section

New theme in the left hand
Example 3.24. the Finale, mm. 107-130.
Example 3.25. the Finale, mm. 131-142.
Example 3.26. the Finale, mm. 156-162.
Example 4.1a and 4.1b.
Example 4.2.
Example 4.3. Analysis of the second movement (mm. 1-18) -- middleground level
Example 4.4. Analysis of the third movement (mm. 1-15) -- middleground level
Example 4.5. Analysis of the third movement (mm. 1-71) -- background level
Example 4.6. Analysis of the finale movement (mm. 1-18) -- middleground level
Example 4.7 Diatonic and Chromatic voice exchanges.
Example 4.8.
Example 4.9a. B section of the first movement (mm. 76-92).
Example 4.9b. Analysis of the first movement (mm. 77-92) -- middleground level.
Example 4.10. Analysis of the first movement (mm. 167-178) -- middleground level.
Example 4.11. Analysis of the first movement (mm. 105-116) -- middleground level.
Example 4.12. Analysis of the third movement (mm. 19-42) -- middleground level.
Example 4.13. Analysis of the third movement -- background level.
Example 5.1. Gypsy Scale
Example 5.2. Analysis of the first movement -- background level.
Example 5.3. Analysis of the second movement -- background level.
Example 5.4. Analysis of the third movement -- background level.
Example 5.5. Analysis of the finale – background level.
Example 5.6. Analysis of the entire work -- background level.
BIBLIOGRAPHY

Books


**Articles**


Parsons, James. “*Pour the Sweet Milk of Concord into Hell*: Theories of Unity and Disunity in Late Beethoven.” *Music Analysis* 18 (March, 1999): 127-142.


Tovey, Donald F. “Brahms.” In *Cobbett’s Cyclopedia Survey of Chamber Music.* (1929): 158-82.

**Dissertations**


Dictionaries


Musical Score