THE ANTHEM IN AMERICA: 1900-1950

DISSERTATION

Presented to the Graduate Council of the North Texas State University in Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements

For the Degree of

DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY

By

Terry Lee Fansler, B.M., M.M.
Denton, Texas
August, 1982
During the first half of this century, a wealth of anthem literature was published and performed in the United States that, as a result of the deluge of new publications since those years, has been either forgotten or is unknown to modern church musicians. The purpose of this study is to make the best of this music known, for much of it is still both suitable and desirable for contemporary worship. The research is grouped into six chapters that are entitled: "The Quartet Anthem," "Anthems in the Anglican Tradition," "Prominent Choral Ensembles and the Dissemination of the Anthem," "Anthems by Prominent Music Educators," "Anthems in the Russian Style," and "The Negro Spiritual."

General discussions include a history of the Quartet Choir; the establishment of the English Choral Tradition in America; the development of collegiate a cappella choirs from Northwestern University, St. Olaf College, and Westminster Choir College; the history of the Mormon Tabernacle Choir and the Collegiate Chorale; the history of choral singing in American high schools and colleges; the history of Russian sacred choral music and the publication of such in America; and the history of the Negro spiritual. Biographical sketches of the major composers and detailed analyses of selected anthems from each comprise the majority of the study. Composers discussed include Dudley Buck, Harry Rowe Shelley,
TABLE OF CONTENTS

| LIST OF MUSICAL EXAMPLES                      | vi  |
| FOREWORD                                     | xiii|
| Chapter                                      |     |
| I. THE QUARTET ANTHEM                       | 1   |
|    Dudley Buck                               |     |
|    Harry Rowe Shelley                        |     |
|    Raymond H. Woodman                       |     |
|    William H. Neidlinger                    |     |
|    William C. Macfarlane                    |     |
| II. ANTHEMS IN THE ANGLICAN TRADITION        | 32  |
|    Horatio Parker                            |     |
|    T. Tertius Noble                         |     |
|    J. Sebastian Matthews and H. Alexander Matthews |   |
|    Seth Bingham                              |     |
|    H. Everett Titcomb                        |     |
|    Joseph W. Clokey                          |     |
|    Philip James                              |     |
|    T. Frederick H. Candlyn                  |     |
|    Leo Sowerby                               |     |
| III. PROMINENT CHORAL ENSEMBLES AND THE DISSEMINATION OF THE ANTHEM | 75  |
|    Professional and Amateur Singing Societies |     |
|    The Musical Arts Society of New York     |     |
|    The Mendelssohn Choir of Toronto          |     |
| Russian Choirs                              |     |
| Collegiate A Cappella Choirs                 |     |
| Northwestern University                      |     |
| St. Olaf College                             |     |
| Westminster Choir College                    |     |
| The Salt Lake Mormon Tabernacle Choir        |     |
| The Collegiate Chorale                       |     |
IV. ANTHEMS BY PROMINENT MUSIC EDUCATORS

Peter Christian Lutkin
F. Melius Christiansen
Second Generation A Cappella Composers
Clarence Dickinson
Van Denman Thompson
Carl F. Mueller
Noble Cain
Robert Shaw

V. ANTHEMS IN THE RUSSIAN STYLE

Alexandr Grechaninov
Pavel Chesnokov
Noble Cain

VI. THE NEGRO SPIRITUAL

Harry T. Burleigh
R. Nathaniel Dett
William L. Dawson
Commercial Advancements of the Spiritual

VII. SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS

216

BIBLIOGRAPHY

220
### List of Musical Examples

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Example</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Dudley Buck. <em>Festival Te Deum</em>, Op. 45, no. 2</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(G. Schirmer, no. 10027), measures 81-86</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dudley Buck. <em>Cantate Domino</em>, Op. 31, no. 4</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(G. Schirmer, pl. 3617c), measures 82-86</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dudley Buck. <em>The Lord of Hosts Is With Us</em></td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(European American Music, EA 380), measures 12-15</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Harry Rowe Shelley. <em>The King of Love My Shepherd Is</em></td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(G. Schirmer, no. 3125), measures 24-28</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Harry Rowe Shelley. <em>Christian, the Morn Breaks Sweetly</em></td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>O'er Thee</em> (G. Schirmer, no. 1141), measures 22-26</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Harry Rowe Shelley. <em>Hark! Hark, My Soul!</em></td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(G. Schirmer, no. 3209), measures 33-36</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Raymond H. Woodman. <em>A Song in the Night</em></td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(G. Schirmer, no. 3884), measures 16-21</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Raymond H. Woodman. <em>O Lord I Will Exalt Thee</em></td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Arthur P. Schmidt, no. 1550), measures 4-5 of the melody</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Raymond H. Woodman. <em>O Lord I Will Exalt Thee</em></td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Arthur P. Schmidt, no. 1550), measures 50-57</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Raymond H. Woodman. <em>A Song in the Night</em></td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(G. Schirmer, no. 3884), measures 22-26</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Raymond H. Woodman. <em>O Lord I Will Exalt Thee</em></td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Arthur P. Schmidt, no. 1550), measures 167-178</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>William H. Neidlinger. <em>The Birthday of a King</em></td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(G. Schirmer, no. 3576), measures 1-10</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
13. William H. Neidlinger. *The Birthday of a King*  
   (G. Schirmer, no. 3576), measures 16-24 .... 23

   (G. Schirmer, no. 5196), measures 27-32 .... 25

15. William C. Macfarlane. *Ho, Everyone That Thirsteth*  
   (G. Schirmer, no. 4808), measures 1-8 .... 28

16. William C. Macfarlane. *Ho, Everyone That Thirsteth*  
   (G. Schirmer, no. 4808), measures 163-165 .... 29

17. William C. Macfarlane. *Ho, Everyone That Thirsteth*  
   (G. Schirmer, no. 4808), measures 43-50 .... 30

   (G. Schirmer, no. 3552), measures 35-40 .... 37

19. Horatio Parker. *Rejoice in the Lord*  
   (Oliver Ditson, no. 11,062), measures 44-48 .... 37

20. T. Tertius Noble. *Fierce Was the Wild Billow*  
   (G. Schirmer, no. 5283), measures 31-39 .... 40

   (G. Schirmer, no. 4837), measures 47-52 .... 42

22. T. Tertius Noble. *Go to Dark Gethsemane*  
   (H. W. Gray, no. 501), measures 33-36 .... 43

23. T. Tertius Noble. *Go to Dark Gethsemane*  
   (H. W. Gray, no. 501), measures 45-50 .... 43

24. H. Alexander Matthews. *This Is the Promise*  
   (G. Schirmer, no. 8673), measures 9-14 .... 46

   (G. Schirmer, no. 9513), measures 1-2 .... 47

   (G. Schirmer, no. 9513), measures 24-25 .... 47

27. Seth Bingham. *The Lord's Prayer*  
   (Carl Fischer, CM 607), measures 1-7 .... 50

28. Seth Bingham. *O Come and Mourn*  
   (Galaxy, no. 1498), measures 101-108 .... 51

29. H. Everett Titcomb. *O Love How Deep*  
   (H. W. Gray, CMR 2226), measures 1-6 .... 55
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Composer</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Publisher</th>
<th>Measures</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>30</td>
<td>Joseph W. Clokey</td>
<td>Treasures in Heaven</td>
<td>Summy-Birchard, B-2010</td>
<td>3-13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31</td>
<td>Joseph W. Clokey</td>
<td>Two Kings</td>
<td>J. Fischer and Bro., no. 7211</td>
<td>1-2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Joseph W. Clokey</td>
<td>Canticle of Peace</td>
<td>Summy-Birchard, B-340</td>
<td>1-2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>32</td>
<td>Joseph W. Clokey</td>
<td>Canticle of Peace</td>
<td>Summy-Birchard, B-340</td>
<td>8-9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>33</td>
<td>Joseph W. Clokey</td>
<td>Canticle of Peace</td>
<td>Summy-Birchard, B-340</td>
<td>26-27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>34</td>
<td>Joseph W. Clokey</td>
<td>Canticle of Peace</td>
<td>Summy-Birchard, B-340</td>
<td>78 and 90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35</td>
<td>Philip James</td>
<td>By the Waters of Babylon</td>
<td>H. W. Gray, no. 636</td>
<td>29-32 and 59-65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36</td>
<td>Philip James</td>
<td>Blessed Are Ye That Hunger</td>
<td>H. W. Gray, CMR 2438</td>
<td>18-28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37</td>
<td>T. Frederick H. Candlyn</td>
<td>Christ, Whose Glory Fills the Skies</td>
<td>Carl Fischer, CM 622</td>
<td>1-13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>38</td>
<td>T. Frederick H. Candlyn</td>
<td>Christ, Whose Glory Fills the Skies</td>
<td>Carl Fischer, CM 622</td>
<td>58-65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>39</td>
<td>Leo Sowerby</td>
<td>Come Ye and Let Us Go Up</td>
<td>H. W. Gray, no. 2242</td>
<td>28-33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40</td>
<td>Leo Sowerby</td>
<td>My Heart Is Fixed, 0 God</td>
<td>H. W. Gray, no. 2414</td>
<td>4-11, melody only</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>41</td>
<td>Leo Sowerby</td>
<td>I Will Lift Up Mine Eyes</td>
<td>Boston Music, no. 6350</td>
<td>3-5, melody only</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>42</td>
<td>Peter C. Lutkin</td>
<td>The Lord Bless You and Keep You</td>
<td>Clayton F. Summy, no. 1089</td>
<td>6-10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>43</td>
<td>Peter C. Lutkin</td>
<td>The Lord Bless You and Keep You</td>
<td>Clayton F. Summy, no. 1089</td>
<td>14-23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>44</td>
<td>F. Melius Christiansen</td>
<td>Lullaby on Christmas Eve</td>
<td>Augsburg, no. 136</td>
<td>1-8</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
45. F. Melius Christiansen. *Lullaby on Christmas Eve*  
(Augsburg, no. 136), measures 31-32  
46. F. Melius Christiansen. *Beautiful Savior*  
(Augsburg, no. 51), measures 31-38  
47. F. Melius Christiansen. *Lamb of God*  
(Augsburg, II-0133), measures 23-28  
48. Morten J. Luvaas. *Sweetly Angel Choirs Are Singing*  
(C. C. Birchard, no. 1283), measures 15-20  
49. Morten J. Luvaas. *O Sing Unto Him*  
(C. C. Birchard, no. 1355), measures 22-26  
50. Morten J. Luvaas. *Christ Has Arisen*  
(Neil A. Kjos, no. 2010), measures 45-54  
51. Leland B. Sateren. *Grieve Not the Holy Spirit*  
(B. F. Wood, no. 670), measures 26-27  
52. Leland B. Sateren. *Grieve Not the Holy Spirit*  
(B. F. Wood, no. 670), measures 46-49  
53. David Hugh Jones. *God Is a Spirit*  
(C. C. Birchard, no. 546), measures 28-32  
54. George Lynn. *Pass Me Not, O Gentle Savior*  
(Mills Music, RH-11), measures 15-23  
55. George Lynn. *Lonesome Valley*  
(Theodore Presser, 312-40062), measures 5-8  
56. Clarence Dickinson. *The Shepherds' Story*  
(H. W. Gray, S.C. 30), measures 1-6  
57. Clarence Dickinson. *The Shepherds' Story*  
(H. W. Gray, S.C. 30), measures 57-61  
58. Clarence Dickinson. *Jesus, Refuge of the Weary*  
(H. W. Gray, no. 240), measures 1-7  
59. Clarence Dickinson. *Jesus, Refuge of the Weary*  
(H. W. Gray, no. 240), measures 20-21  
60. Clarence Dickinson. *Jesus, Refuge of the Weary*  
(H. W. Gray, no. 240), measures 38-41  
61. Van Denman Thompson. *Hymn to the Trinity*  
(Lorenz, no. 9578-20), measures 1-15
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Composer</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Publisher</th>
<th>Measures</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>62.</td>
<td>Van Denman Thompson.</td>
<td>Oh, For a Thousand Tongues to Sing</td>
<td>Lorenz, no. 9705-2</td>
<td>20-21</td>
<td>134</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>63.</td>
<td>Van Denman Thompson.</td>
<td>Oh, For a Thousand Tongues to Sing</td>
<td>Lorenz, no. 9705-2</td>
<td>34-40</td>
<td>135</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>64.</td>
<td>Van Denman Thompson.</td>
<td>Mercy and Truth</td>
<td>G. Schirmer, no. 7665</td>
<td>1-7</td>
<td>136</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>65.</td>
<td>Van Denman Thompson.</td>
<td>Dear Lord, Who Once Upon the Lake</td>
<td>G. Schirmer, no. 7666</td>
<td>32-38</td>
<td>138</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>66.</td>
<td>Carl F. Mueller.</td>
<td>Now Thank We All Our God</td>
<td>G. Schirmer, no. 7745</td>
<td>61-71</td>
<td>141</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>67.</td>
<td>Carl F. Mueller.</td>
<td>Create in Me a Clean Heart, O God</td>
<td>G. Schirmer, no. 8682</td>
<td>29-36</td>
<td>142</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>68.</td>
<td>Carl F. Mueller.</td>
<td>Lead On, O King Eternal</td>
<td>Carl Fischer, C.M. 6271</td>
<td>24-29</td>
<td>144</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>70.</td>
<td>Noble Cain.</td>
<td>The Lord Is My Shepherd</td>
<td>Harold Flammer, no. 84221</td>
<td>21-24</td>
<td>149</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>71.</td>
<td>Noble Cain.</td>
<td>Christ, Whose Glory Fills the Skies</td>
<td>Harold Flammer, no. 84270</td>
<td>24-34</td>
<td>151</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>72.</td>
<td>Robert Shaw.</td>
<td>For All the Saints</td>
<td>G. Schirmer, no. 9908</td>
<td>33-36</td>
<td>154</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>73.</td>
<td>Robert Shaw.</td>
<td>For All the Saints</td>
<td>G. Schirmer, no. 9908</td>
<td>49-52</td>
<td>154</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>74.</td>
<td>Robert Shaw.</td>
<td>All Creatures of Our God and King</td>
<td>G. Schirmer, no. 9909</td>
<td>54-58</td>
<td>155</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>75.</td>
<td>Dmitry Bortnyansky.</td>
<td>Cherubim Song No. 7</td>
<td>Carl Fischer, CM 6315</td>
<td>1-12</td>
<td>163</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>76.</td>
<td>Alexandr Kastal'sky.</td>
<td>O Gladsome Light No. 1</td>
<td>H. W. Gray, no. 9</td>
<td>1-8</td>
<td>165</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
77. Alexandr Grechaninov. *Only Begotten Son*  
(J. Fischer and Bro., no. 4100),  
measures 1-9 .................................. 170

78. Alexandr Grechaninov. *A Song of Joy*  
(J. Fischer and Bro., no. 6690),  
measures 1-9 .................................. 171

79. Alexandr Grechaninov. *The Lord’s Prayer*  
(Raymond H. Hoffman, no. 22),  
measures 1-4 .................................. 172

80. Alexandr Grechaninov. *The Lord’s Prayer*  
(Raymond H. Hoffman, no. 22),  
measures 23-26 ................................ 172

81. Alexandr Grechaninov. *Vouchsafe O Lord*  
(Galaxy, no. 1356), measure 33, melody  
only, and *A Song of Joy* (J. Fischer and Bro.,  
no. 6690), measure 14, melody in inversion ...... 173

82. Pavel Chesnokov. *Salvation Is Created*  
(J. Fischer and Bro., no. 4129),  
measures 1-21 .................................. 175

83. Pavel Chesnokov. *Let Thy Holy Presence*  
(C. C. Birchard, no. 12), measures 11-22 .......... 178

84. Noble Cain. *In the Night, Christ Came Walking*  
(G. Schirmer, no. 7967), measures 7-11 .......... 180

85. Noble Cain. *Holy Lord God* (Harold Flammer,  
no. 84157), measures 1-4 ........................ 181

86. Harry T. Burleigh. *Deep River* (G. Schirmer,  
no. 5815), measures 1-8 ........................ 193

(G. Ricordi, no. 1774), measures 21-28 .......... 194

88. Harry T. Burleigh. *Steal Away* (G. Ricordi,  
no. 422), measures 35-39 ........................ 196

89. R. Nathaniel Dett. *Listen to the Lambs*  
(G. Schirmer, no. 8010), measures 60-74 .......... 198

90. R. Nathaniel Dett. *Listen to the Lambs*  
(G. Schirmer, no. 8010), measures 87-100 .......... 199

91. R. Nathaniel Dett. *Wasn’t That a Mighty Day?*  
(G. Schirmer, no. 7712), measures 1-8 .......... 201
92. R. Nathaniel Dett. Wasn't That a Mighty Day?
   (G. Schirmer, no. 7712), measures 17-24
   ............................................. 202

93. R. Nathaniel Dett. Wasn't That a Mighty Day?
   (G. Schirmer, no. 7712), measures 58-61
   ............................................. 203

94. William L. Dawson. Soon-ah Will be Done
   (Music Press, no. 102-A), measures 1-4
   ............................................. 207

95. William L. Dawson. Ain-a That Good News!
   (Music Press, no. 103-A), measures 1-8
   ............................................. 208

96. William L. Dawson. Soon-ah Will be Done
   (Music Press, no. 102-A), measures 33-40
   ............................................. 209

   (Music Press, no. 103-A), measures 16-20
   ............................................. 210

98. William L. Dawson. Ain-a That Good News!
   (Music Press, no. 103-A), measures 64-73
   ............................................. 210

99. William L. Dawson. There Is a Balm in Gilead
   (Music Press, no. 103), measures 8-10
   ............................................. 211

100. Noble Cain. De Gospel Train (Harold Flammer,
      no. 81086), measures 29-32
      .......................................... 213

101. Noble Cain. I Want to Be Ready (Boosey and
      Hawkes, no. 1604), measures 57-63
      .......................................... 214

102. Robert Shaw. Do-Don't Touch-a My Garment
      (G. Schirmer, no. 9954), measures 17-24
      .......................................... 215
FOREWORD

Partially as a result of the encouragement offered by the burgeoning music publishing industry over the last thirty years, the amount of church music issued annually in America is staggering. Sifting through this flood of new materials to find those pieces worthy of performance in the church has become one of the major challenges facing the modern church musician. In desperation, some musicians have ignored all current publications, and instead perform only the proven classics from previous centuries. Others dupe themselves into believing that the more current the copyright date, the more appropriate the piece. What is lacking is a clear method of assessing the relevance of the current deluge, a situation that can be largely remedied by a better understanding of the antecedents of contemporary church music.

I have observed, after fourteen years of studying this genre, the last eight in the actual practice of the craft, that the amount of historical research given to the development of the anthem in America decreases proportionately as one moves toward the present. Consequently, the compositions of many composers who were writing during the first half of this century remain on the shelves of church choral libraries because

the music director has either forgotten them, or if he is too young, has no knowledge of them.

To bring these works to light, it was clear that the entire period needed to be considered, for outside of the single chapter in Elwyn Wienandt and Robert Young's *The Anthem in England and America*, information was painfully scarce. To research such vast uncharted territory, judgments were necessary in three areas: first, significant composers had to be isolated, and second, a portion of these individual's best works had to be selected for musical analysis. (Such limitations may have overlooked a favorite composer or a favored composition of the reader—although regrettable, this could not be avoided.) Third, because of the breadth of the subject matter, the amount of secondary material relating to the selected individuals varied greatly. For example, sufficient information was available for such notable figures as Dudley Buck, F. Melius Christiansen, and Leo Sowerby, but little was uncovered for the likes of such as William H. Neidlinger, Leland Sateren, and Alexandr Grechaninov. As a result of these lacunae, the research may at times appear uneven.

The problem of sifting through thousands of anthems written by hundreds of composers to find the most important examples was formidable. To gain a sense of direction, I compiled a list of fifty-four prominent composers and sent it to choral music directors in church-related colleges and universities throughout the United States, asking them to rank each composer according to perceived importance. The diversity of these

directors' opinions demonstrated that a simple chronological survey of anthem composers based on, for example, birthdates would be of little use or interest to scholars and church musicians. It quickly became apparent that a broader framework was needed in which to establish the criteria for grouping and evaluating the material. The search for the larger internal and external influences that might explain not only the variance in the style of the compositions of different composers, but also the stylistic evolution of individuals culminated in the delineating of five major factors. These were the development of the quartet anthem, the establishment of the Anglican tradition in American churches, the composition of unaccompanied anthems, which resulted from the practice of a cappella singing by American collegiate and high school choirs, the editions and imitations of church music from Russia, and the arrangements of Negro folksongs.

Once these broader factors were defined, the task of determining who were the significant composers within each category was begun. In the early stages, I relied heavily on the pioneer work done by Wienandt and Young; additions and deletions were made as the research developed. When a composer was selected for inclusion, examples of his anthems were gathered and arranged chronologically according to publication. As a rule, SATB voicing was sought because it is the most common arrangement for both the church and school choirs. From this group of anthems, pieces

3. I am grateful to Dr. Phillip Sims and the music library of Southwestern Baptist Theological Seminary, Ft. Worth, Texas, for their gracious assistance in securing materials.
were extracted that appeared to represent best the composer's development, and these were examined in detail.

The actual analysis of the music consisted of an examination of six areas: the overall sound, that is, an evaluation of the composer's choral style and an identification of particular features; the use of accompaniment; the harmonic structure; the use of melody; the use of rhythm; and the overall formal design.

The scarcity of secondary materials produced the most trying problems with the study. Many books give only an overview of the twentieth century that is too general to be of use. Music encyclopedias such as *The New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians* (1980) or the earlier *Grove's Dictionary of Music and Musicians: American Supplement* (1937) provided excellent material when the composer was listed, but for the most part, the composers could be located only in isolated articles found in periodicals related to organists, such as *The Diapason* or *The American Organist*, or periodicals related to music educators, such as *The Music Teachers' National Association Proceedings* or the *Yearbook of the Music Educators National Conference*. Doctoral dissertations and personal contacts provided invaluable assistance.

Because the anthem is the primary vehicle through which the modern church musician demonstrates his craft, the understanding of this genre is critical to his ultimate success. By fostering a clearer understanding of American church music written and sung during the first half of this century, this document will serve as a valuable reference manual. By gaining a clearer understanding of the music composed during these
fifty years, it is likely that the reader will resurrect or discover pieces in his library that should be heard in both church worship and the concert hall. Finally, by understanding the immediate antecedents of the modern anthem, the church musician will have a more intelligent basis by which to judge new material. This will not only make his job easier, but will, in the process, hopefully upgrade the quality of music which he presents each Sunday to his congregation.
Chapter I

THE QUARTET ANTHEM

During the last half of the nineteenth century, the more fashionable churches in larger American cities began to augment their existing volunteer choirs with a quartet of paid soloists.¹ Professional musicians were brought into the churches to enable the choir to perform musical literature of greater difficulty that was deemed to be of a higher quality. During the two decades following the Civil War, the addition of a paid quartet brought the music of composers like Handel, Haydn, Mendelssohn, and Rossini to many churches in the Eastern states and even to a few in the pioneer West.² The plan, however, faltered, for evidence shows that as the quartets were added, volunteers withdrew from the larger ensembles, so that, in many churches, it was necessary to abandon the volunteer choir altogether and replace it entirely with a hired quartet.³ Just as the quartet replaced the volunteer ensemble, commonly referred to as the "chorus choir," so

---

¹ Although an exact date of origin is difficult to determine, most authors date the first quartet choirs c. 1850. For example, Leonard Ellinwood places that of St. Michael's, Charleston c. 1840. Leonard Ellinwood, The History of American Church Music (New York: Morehouse-Gorham, 1953), 74.


³ Ellinwood, 73.
they in turn passed out of vogue during the early decades of this century, and the volunteer choir returned in force. 4

From c. 1860 to c. 1910, a wealth of church music was produced by American composers that was intended for either solo quartet or for chorus choir with interpolated solo, duet, and quartet sections. 5 Stylistically, these pieces are characterized by a melodic sweetness that results from an abundant use of chromaticism and by the use of thick chordal accompaniments, both of which are characteristics common to the period. Scholars and church musicians in this century have largely rejected this body of music, claiming that these two features were abused. While this is undoubtedly true in many cases, the music of these composers strongly appealed to the audiences for which it was written. For the first time in the history of American church music, the attention of church congregations was directed away from the compositions of the Europeans toward those by American composers; this ultimately created an accepting market for American-composed church music in this century.


5. Determining the ensemble for which a given anthem was intended is not always an easy matter. While the inclusion of passages for solo or duet certainly suggests that the piece was intended for quartet, unmarked choral passages could have been written for solo quartet, chorus choir, or both, and undoubtedly they were performed by whatever means were available. The problem of establishing the choral group intended in those unmarked anthems that contain no solo or duet passages is obviously compounded, for as Dudley Buck states, there are no inherent musical characteristics in the tune to suggest performance guidelines. Dudley Buck, Illustrations in Choir Accompaniment with Hints in Registration (New York, 1892), facsimile edition (New York: AMS Press, 1971), 29.
Dudley Buck

Hailed in 1890 by the *New York Herald* as the leading composer of American church music, Dudley Buck (1839–1909) composed scores of anthems that made an unprecedented impact on American churchgoers. Because it was expected that he would follow the career of his father, who was a wealthy shipping merchant, Buck received no musical training as a child. In 1855, the same year in which he entered Trinity College in his hometown of Hartford, Connecticut, he acquired his first piano. Within a short time, he had become proficient enough to be employed by the St. John's Episcopal Church in Hartford as their organist.

Convincing his parents to assist him financially, Buck left New England for Leipzig, Germany, in 1858, to pursue the necessary training for a career in music—an occupation considered almost scandalous in the mind of his New England friends. After three years of

---


8. Green, 104.
study in theory, composition, orchestration, piano, and organ, he left Leipzig for an additional year in Paris. In 1862, Buck returned to Hartford, where he became organist at the North Congregational Church, and where he taught music privately. While in Hartford, he published his first collection of anthems in which he explained the proper manner of using the organ to accompany choral singing. In addition to augmenting the existing anthem repertory, this collection was a valuable resource for church organists.

In 1869, Buck left Hartford for Chicago, where he accepted the position of organist at the St. James Church and subsequently published a second book of anthems, which contained compositions written for the Chicago choir. Several of his early works and personal effects were destroyed when the great fire swept the city in 1871. Although he was unharmed, Buck decided to move to Boston, where he assumed the organist's position at St. Paul's Church, now known as the Cathedral Church of St. Paul, and the responsibility for playing and maintaining the organ at Music Hall. During his residence there, he also taught at the New England Conservatory of Music. In the summer of 1875, at the invitation of Theodore Thomas, Buck was named assistant conductor of the Thomas Orchestra in New York. At the end of the summer season, he moved his residence a final time to Brooklyn, where he founded the

9. While some sources place Buck at the Park Church upon his return to Hartford, William Gallo, who is to be considered a most reliable source, disagrees, placing him instead at the North Congregational Church. Gallo, "The Life and Church Music," 8, and "Buck," 408.
Apollo Club, a singing organization for men, and where he became organist at the Holy Trinity Church, a position he retained for twenty-five years until he retired from church music in 1903. Among his many honors, he served as Honorary President (1896-1897) of the newly organized American Guild of Organists, of which he was a founder.

Although Buck composed music for a variety of vocal and instrumental genres, his largest group of works were those written for church choirs.\(^{10}\) The majority of these 112 works were written, and more than eighty of them were published between 1864 and 1873, the time during which he served the North Congregational Church in Hartford and the St. James Church in Chicago as organist.\(^{11}\)

Buck composed anthems for both solo quartet and for chorus choir with sections designated for solo quartet. Although he personally preferred volunteer chorus choirs,\(^{12}\) he recognized the primacy of the quartet choir in American churches and accordingly composed music for them. Because Buck's style is basically consistent throughout his anthems, it is possible to make general observations concerning the musical characteristics. The ensemble for which a choral passage is intended is usually indicated in the score with the words "chorus" for the full ensemble and "solo" for the quartet. These choral sections feature four-voice homophonic writing with unison passages and soprano-

---

10. A complete bibliography of Buck's compositions is included in Gallo, "The Life and Church Music," 219-277.


tenor or alto-bass doublings occurring only occasionally. Passages for the solo voices from the quartets abound, with no voice part excluded from solo work.

Choral sections are supported by thick, bombastic organ accompaniments that generally double the vocal score; however, solo sections are commonly accompanied with either block chords or running scale passages that are idiomatic to the harp or piano. This latter style is typically found in sections set in compound meter, as the passage for tenor or alto solo from Buck’s *Festival Te Deum*, Op. 45, no. 2,\(^1\) clearly illustrates (Example 1).


\(^{13}\) G. Schirmer, 1870, no. 10027.
Texts are drawn most frequently from the Canticles for the Morning, Evening, and Communion Services of the Episcopal Church. As Gallo observes, however, various scriptural texts along with other occasional canticles are also set. Metrical texts are generally drawn from religious poetry or from hymns found in the Episcopal Common Praise or Hymns Ancient and Modern. 14

Buck's harmonizations are conservative even for his day. While pieces generally begin and end in the same key, a piece begun in minor normally concludes in the parallel major. Key changes often indicate textual divisions or changes in the character of the text, but sudden temporary shifts away from the key within a section are most commonly used to illustrate a dramatic moment or thought in the text. An example of the latter is found in Cantate Domino, Op. 31, no. 4, 15 in which the harmony accompanying the text "Let the floods clap their hands, and let the hills be joyful together before the Lord" completes the transition from the pensive tonic key of C minor to the bright, relative key of E-flat major on the word "joyful" (Example 2). Triads and dominant seventh chords are plentiful and are often mixed with a variety of altered chords, which include diminished sevenths, augmented sixths, and Neapolitan chords. Gallo points out that augmented sixth chords are used to produce special, overall climactic effects, while Neapolitan chords seem to be reserved for the illustration of specific

15. G. Schirmer, 1868, pl. 3617c.
Example 2. Dudley Buck, *Cantate Domino*, Op. 31, no. 4 (G. Schirmer, pl. 3617c), measures 82-86.

words. Chromatic melodic lines, a trademark of Buck and his pupils, are frequently harmonized by altered chords set over a pedal point in the bass line, as seen in *The Lord of Hosts Is With Us*  

(Example 3).

Form is most often dictated by the text, a reflection of Buck's emphasis on the importance of the latter. Considered to be one of the distinctive trademarks of his music, Buck's textual


approach to musical form produces severe weaknesses in his music. An occasional restatement of the opening theme is often the only unifying device used, and this creates the effect of a series of somewhat unrelated musical sections loosely strung together. Textual divisions are emphasized in the score with a textural change. Unless the text is metrical, such changes of texture normally occur at the conclusion of a complete grammatical thought, which may encompass several verses of text.

In spite of some musical shortcomings, Buck produced a higher calibre of music for the church than was common during his day. His
music was so popular with the American public that each new publication was immediately reviewed in the Atlantic Monthly.\textsuperscript{18} It was his ability to raise musical standards, and at the same time, appeal to the average listener that made Buck unique.

The stylistic features of Buck's anthems were passed on to his students, who continued to write for a vast market of churchgoers anxious to hear more of the same. Of Buck's pupils, the most influential in carrying his musical style into the twentieth century included Harry Rowe Shelley, Raymond H. Woodman, and William H. Neidlinger.

**Harry Rowe Shelley**

Harry Rowe Shelley (1858-1947) achieved substantial popularity during his lifetime and was considered by music critics to be one of the most promising musicians of his day.\textsuperscript{19} Born in New Haven, Connecticut, he attended Yale University and subsequently studied with Buck.

\textsuperscript{18} Ellinwood, 114.

and Dvořák. Although he held the position of organist in a number of churches, both in Connecticut and in Brooklyn, his most notable tenure was at the Plymouth Congregational Church in Brooklyn, where Henry Ward Beecher was pastor. Additionally, he taught in New York at the Metropolitan College of Music and the American Institute of Applied Music.

Like Buck, Shelley composed anthems for both quartet and chorus choirs; however, his intentions are not as carefully notated in the score. For example, in some pieces such as *Christian, the Morn Breaks Sweetly O'er Thee*, choral parts are marked "Quartette or Chorus," while other pieces such as his famous *The King of Love My Shepherd Is, *include some choral sections marked "Chorus" and others marked "Soprano," "Alto," "Tenor," and "Bass," which probably indicates that they were intended for solo quartet. Melodic tunefulness is the most delightful quality of Shelley's anthems. Rupert Sircom rightly states that, with a simple textual exchange, many of these anthems could have doubled as secular love songs. Solo passages are usually found at the beginning of a piece and these

20. G. Schirmer, 1887, no. 1141.


22. Partial bibliographies of Shelley's compositions are included in Pratt and Boyd, "Shelley," *Grove's, New Encyclopedia*, 753; and Slonimsky, 1591. None include a listing of anthems.

together with duet passages often make up the greater portion of an anthem. Not surprisingly, Shelley’s best writing is located in these passages, for his choral passages are rather uninteresting, consisting primarily of simple block chords that merely support a soprano melody. Like Buck, Shelley wrote frequently for unison voices, and when he used four-part writing, he fashioned it much like that of a hymn in which little counterpoint or melodic interest is given to the inner voices.

Avoiding the bombastic, heavy accompaniments of his teacher, Shelley accompanied his more lyrical melodies with a lighter texture. A typical example is the memorable soprano-bass duet from The King of Love My Shepherd Is, in which the rocking eighth-note pattern in the accompaniment provides subtle counterpoint to the duet (Example 4). This constant rhythmical motion supplies the impetus needed to propel the pieces from beginning to end and helps to conceal the lack of musical direction resulting from their static harmonic quality. Although there are numerous examples of altered chords above a pedal bass, an inheritance from Buck, modulations are infrequent, and when they occur they may be unusual.

24. For example, in The King of Love My Shepherd Is, solo-duet sections make up 29 out of 71 measures, or 41%, while in Hark! Hark, My Soul! (G. Schirmer, 1887, no. 3209), they make up 92 out of 162 measures, or 68%. The amount of material given to solo voices leads one to assume that Shelley wrote with quartet in mind whether or not he so indicated his intentions in the text.

For example, in *Christian, the Morn Breaks Sweetly O'er Thee*, an enharmonic modulation is used to shift the key from A-flat major to E major. Although this modulation is perceived aurally as encompassing the distance of a major third (E to G-sharp), the actual notation suggests the relationship of an augmented fifth (Example 5). Most of these pieces are written in the flat keys, producing a warm, relaxed mood. When the brighter, sharp keys are used, their duration is temporary.
The sweetness of the tunes, for which Shelley is famous, is created by chromatic passages and melodic duets consisting of parallel thirds or sixths. Examples of the latter are found not only in passages such as in Example Four, but they are also seen in passages for solo voice. By doubling the solo melody and adding a countermelody in thirds or sixths, a duet is written into the organ accompaniment (Example 6). The predominance of solo material in Shelley's anthems apparently led him to simplify and shorten the formal design, for unlike the lengthy multisectional pieces of Buck, Shelley's pieces are often constructed in a simple two-part form in which each part begins with solo voice and concludes with a chorus.

Raymond H. Woodman

Born in Brooklyn, Raymond H. Woodman (1861-1943) began his musical study under the tutelage of his father, who was organist choirmaster at various churches in New York City and Brooklyn and who taught at the Rutgers and Packer Institutes. In addition to studying with Buck (1881-1885), Woodman was one of the few Americans to study with César Franck. He served churches as organist-choirmaster in

Flushing, New York (1875-1879), Norwich, Connecticut (1879-1880), and Brooklyn (1880-1941). The latter position, his longest tenure, was at the First Presbyterian Church of Brooklyn. Woodman taught music at the Metropolitan College of Music (1889-1898), the Packer Institute (after 1894), and the American Institute of Applied Music (after 1909). From 1894 to 1897, he edited the "church-music department" for the New York Evangelist.

Woodman began his career in church music as the director of a quartet of singers, who sang mostly operatic arrangements with sacred texts. Later, he included the compositions of Buck and various English composers in his repertory and replaced the quartet with a salaried chorus, an innovation in non-liturgical churches of his day. He subsequently gave numerous performances of oratorios with this latter group.26 As a composer, he published some one hundred fifty compositions, among them numerous anthems.27

Like Buck, Woodman wrote anthems to be sung by SATB chorus or quartet; however, unlike other composers of quartet pieces, Woodman identified the ensemble for which he wrote a given anthem more clearly in some of his later publications that were issued after the quartet style had declined in popularity. For example, in his famous *A Song in the Night,*28 the choral sections are unmarked, but the extensive


27. A bibliography of his works was unavailable.

28. G. Schirmer, 1898, no. 3884.
passages given to baritone and soprano soloists suggest the intention for quartet. In 1910, Woodman published *God So Loved the World*, which bears the inscription "Quartet or Chorus;" then twenty years later, he brought out *O Lord I Will Exalt Thee*, in which he clearly differentiated between those choral passages to be sung by "solo" (quartet) and those to be sung by the "chorus." All of Woodman's anthems reflect a degree of musical complexity not evident in those works of his predecessors, for choral sections include occasional a cappella passages, and solo sections more resemble those found in oratorios than they do Shelley's "love songs" (Example 7). Accompaniments are somewhat thick-textured and frequently include chromatically altered scale passages that function as countermelodies to voice parts.

Like Buck, Woodman often chose through-composed formal schemes for his anthems, and he unified them with recurring rhythms, motives, or portions of previously stated themes. An interesting example of a recurring rhythmical pattern is found in the anthem *O Lord I Will Exalt Thee*, in which the rhythm found in the first measure of the vocal line (Example 8) returns throughout the piece in both the voice and the accompaniment (Example 9).

29. G. Schirmer, 1910, no. 5393.


Andante con moto ($=108$)

Let all them that trust in Thee rejoice.

They shall alway be giving of thanks, because Thou defendest them.

Increased complexity is also evident in the harmonic construction of Woodman's anthems. Modulations from section to section and within sections, and frequent use of altered chords, especially diminished chords, over pedal points extending several measures are common (Example 10). Likewise, the harmony of the vocal parts reflects a degree

of sophistication that seems unusual for the period. An example is found in *O Lord I Will Exalt Thee*, in which the harmony of the passage accommodates chromatic motion in the bass voice for twelve measures (Example 11).

William H. Neidlinger

William H. Neidlinger (1863-1924) received his early musical training in New York and London, and by 1890, he was established in Brooklyn as an organist and conductor. In 1896, he traveled to Europe, where he taught in London and Paris for two years. Returning to the United States in 1898, Neidlinger settled in Chicago, where he became known as a specialist in child psychology and a composer of songs for children. Subsequently, he established a school for subnormal children at East Orange, New Jersey. Of his publications, one of the most interesting is a special study entitled "Small Songs for Small Children," which was intended for use by kindergarten children.

One of Neidlinger's most famous anthems is the Christmas piece entitled *The Birthday of a King*, which bears the earmarks of both Buck and Shelley. The anthem is written for baritone soloist and chorus, and the extended passages for solo voice clearly suggest the


32. G. Schirmer, 1890, no. 3576.

33. Partial bibliographies of Neidlinger's compositions are included in Pratt and Boyd, 74; and Slonimsky, 1222. Neither source includes a listing of anthems.
quartet style, even though choral passages are undesignated. The first stanza of the two-part strophic piece begins with a somewhat bombastic introduction in which the opening motive, in the tonic key, is immediately repeated a third lower before sliding chromatically from the dominant back to the tonic. Interestingly, the introduction, which is subsequently used as the interlude between the two stanzas, bears no relation to the vocal music (Example 12).


Little village of Bethlehem
There lay a child one day,
Like Shelley, Neidlinger's best writing appears in the lengthy solo passages, with little innovation given to choral sections. When accompanying the baritone solo, the organ displays both melodic and rhythmic independence, but when accompanying choral sections, the organ merely doubles the vocal parts (Example 13).

Diatonic harmonies predominate; however, they are often colored with altered chords, of which Neidlinger's favorites are diminished seventh chords. In spite of characteristic rising and falling chromatic lines, the pieces, like those of Shelley, suffer from a lack of modulation and become harmonically stagnant. Similarly, Neidlinger's melodies lack variety because of their simple conjunct motion. He does, however, use this latter characteristic effectively in the anthem The Silent Sea, which is based on a mystical poem by John Greenleaf Whittier. In the choral refrain, the impression of a flowing sea is created by a melody consisting of three ascending and two descending conjunct notes (Example 14).

34. G. Schirmer, 1908, no. 5196.

Poco più lento

Beside the sea, the silent sea, beside the sea,
so, beside the sea, I

Beside the sea, the silent sea, beside the sea,
so, beside the sea, I

the silent sea, I wait the oar, the muffled oar.
wait the muffled oar.

the silent sea, I wait the oar, the muffled oar.
wait the muffled oar.
Of Buck's three pupils discussed, undoubtedly Harry Rowe Shelley made the most lasting impression on his public. Through his tuneful melodies and abundant use of chromaticism, he became something of a legend in his own day. By musical standards, the anthems of Woodman were superior to those of Shelley; however, they lacked both the tunefulness and harmonic sweetness that made Shelley's compositions so popular. Neidlinger's melodies approached the tunefulness of Shelley's, but his anthems generally lack the more subtle refinements found in the pieces by both Shelley and Woodman. Although the saccharine quality of all of these pieces may be somewhat cloying to our modern ears, it must be remembered that these anthems enjoyed great favor with churchgoers, and this, after all, was the true measure of a composer's success.

William C. Macfarlane

The influence of the anthem composed for quartet choir extended well into the present century in the works of such composers as William C. Macfarlane (1870-1945). Born in London, he was brought to the

35. Ellinwood, 154.

United States at age four and received his musical education in New York. Macfarlane's father administered his first music lessons, and as a boy he sang in the choir at New York's Christ Church. He studied organ and theory with S. P. Warren and made his concert debut at the organ in 1886.

From 1885, Macfarlane held various positions as organist in New York churches, including posts at All Souls' (1889-1900), Temple Emanu-El (1898-1912), and St. Thomas' (1900-1912). From 1912 to 1919, he served as municipal organist in Portland, Maine, where he performed some forty recitals annually and conducted various other musical events. In 1896, he became one of the founders of the American Guild of Organists; in 1918, he received an honorary doctorate in music from Bates College in Lewiston, Maine; and in 1941, he retired to North Conway, New Hampshire. During his career, he received several composition awards for his skill as an anthem composer.

Macfarlane's anthem Ho, Everyone That Thirsteth represents his early compositional style. Scored for SATB chorus, solo quartet, and either soprano or tenor solo, the anthem is couched in the style of Buck, with all of its attendant Victorian characteristics. The organ introduction, which begins on the chord of the dominant and expands outward through successive triads and dominant seventh chords.

---

37. G. Schirmer, 1906, no. 4808.

38. A partial bibliography of Macfarlane's compositions is included in Slonimsky, 1962. This list does not include his anthems.
for eight measures before settling on the tonic, sets the stage for the entrance of the soloist, who utters the opening exclamation on a sustained high e-natural (Example 15). The operatic quality of the

Example 15. William C. Macfarlane, Ho, Everyone That Thirsteth (G. Schirmer, no. 4808), measures 1-8.

opening solo line continues throughout the work, even to the final note where the soloist concludes the anthem with a dramatic leap from the dominant to the tonic pitch that includes the tonic anticipation so customary in nineteenth-century opera (Example 16). The choral portions are somewhat dull when compared to the solo passages. Despite their dramatic opening with the repeated "Ho! Ho!," they quickly deteriorate into a rather staid chordal format. Macfarlane contrasts the bombastic choral sections with a simple pianissimo quartet, thereby producing an interesting choral contrast.

A feeling of motion is created throughout the piece by frequent harmonic fluctuations. In Example Seventeen, Macfarlane sets up an internal direct modulation from the tonic key of A major to G major, in which he passes through six different key areas (Example 17).

The harmonic motion is no more unusual than the formal structure of the anthem. The first half of the anthem is cast in a typical strophic verse-chorus, with chorus repeating the same material between the verses, but midway (mm. 71ff), the piece is recast in a through-composed structure, in which the chorus repeats material from the preceding verse.

Macfarlane's compositional style evolved rather dramatically. In 1928, he published an a cappella anthem, *Open Our Eyes*, that reflects little of the Victorian style. The entire piece, which is set


Solo slower

\[
\text{Wherefore do ye spend mon\-ey for that which is not bread? and your}
\]

\[
\text{A} \quad \text{vi} \quad \text{vi} \quad \text{V}^7 \quad \text{V}
\]

\[
\text{la\-bor for that which sat-\-is-fi\-eth not?}
\]

\[
\text{V} \quad \text{G} \quad \text{vi} \quad \text{ii} \quad \text{V}^7 \quad \text{I}
\]

in 3/2 meter to accommodate the rather wordy text, is dominated by a homophonic a cappella chorus. No passages for either soloists or quartet are included. Some fourteen years later, he published *O Rest in the Lord*, the text of which is drawn from Psalm 37.\(^{40}\) Throughout the anthem, the harmonic scheme depicts the theme of resting in the Lord by sinking chromatically through a number of unrelated, often vaguely dissonant harmonies and arriving at the tonic only at its conclusion.

\(^{40}\) G. Schirmer, 1942, no. 5925.
The style of the quartet anthem, as can be seen in the works of Macfarlane, was eventually replaced sometime during the first quarter of the century with more reserved harmonies and with the full choir, changes brought about by an increasing influence of the Anglican tradition and by the rise of a cappella singing. Although solo quartets disappeared from most American churches rather early in the century, many of the anthems written for those ensembles continued to be performed in the churches throughout the first half of the century, as passages for solo quartet were either delegated to a quartet drawn from the larger volunteer choir, or they were simply sung by the entire group.

41. For an account of these events, see Chapters Two, Three, and Four.
Chapter II
ANTHEMS IN THE ANGLICAN TRADITION

During the last half of the nineteenth century, when the quartet anthem was in its prime, another body of anthem literature composed by both American and foreign-born musicians who were mostly associated with the Episcopal Church appeared on the scene. This new style of church music apparently resulted from an increased sensitivity of these composers toward providing music deemed more appropriate for liturgical worship, and from the reestablishment of the volunteer choir as the primary musical ensemble in the worship service.

Although some of the composers of quartet anthems discussed in the previous chapter were also organist-choirmasters in Anglican churches and undoubtedly wrote these pieces for their own congregations, they were not steeped in the British liturgical traditions as were men such as T. Tertius Noble and H. Alexander Matthews, both of whom were born and musically trained in England before coming to America. Certainly, these men who had been reared in the tradition of the English full and verse anthem were dismayed the first time they heard a modern American anthem sung by virtuoso soloists and accompanied by highly chromatic harmonies, for rather than follow this current vogue, they produced anthems that clearly avoided the characteristics of the quartet style. In their new anthems, the lengthy solos that often made up the majority of the quartet pieces were either shortened considerably or omitted.
Similarly, dignified, reserved harmonies, in which chromatic alteration is limited, predominated. Careful attention to the proper setting of the text resulted in a formal style that frequently utilized text painting and was often abbreviated in comparison with most quartet pieces.

A shift in the design of these pieces further indicates that they were intended for a different performing ensemble. In the quartet anthem, technically difficult passages frequently fell to professional soloists, with choral passages and organ parts somewhat simplified. In this new body of anthems, however, vocal parts are noticeably simplified, suggesting that they were intended for the non-professional musicians of volunteer choirs, while the more difficult passages were given to the person who could best perform them, the organist.

Horatio Parker

Had a survey been taken among American church musicians around the turn of the twentieth century, undoubtedly Horatio W. Parker (1863-1919) would have been considered the most outstanding American composer of church music. His anthems, which were "couched in the English style,"¹ undoubtedly equalled the finest music being produced in England at that time.

As a child, Parker disliked the study of music and avoided the subject until around the age of fourteen, when he began to study piano.

and organ with his mother. From 1880 to 1882, he was employed as organist by a small Episcopal church in Dedham, Massachusetts, and shortly after, according to George Chadwick, he began to compose anthems and services for the choir. His musical style was largely shaped by his study with Chadwick in America and with Joseph Rheinberger in Germany, where he lived from 1882 to 1885.

Returning to New York in 1885, Parker served churches as organist-choirmaster, including St. Luke's in Brooklyn, from 1885 to 1887, St. Andrew's in Harlem, from 1887 to 1888, and the Church of the Holy Trinity in Manhattan, from 1888 to 1893. During these seven years, he also taught music at the New York cathedral schools of St. Paul and St. Mary, from 1886 to 1890, the General Theological Seminary in 1892, and the National Conservatory of Music from 1892 to 1893. He left New York in 1893 and moved to Boston to accept the organist's post at the Trinity Church. The following year, he received an honorary master's degree from Yale University and took a teaching position there, which he retained until his death. In 1904, ten years after coming to


3. Chadwick, 7.

Yale, he was named dean of the School of Music.\(^5\) Two years prior to his being named dean, Parker had returned to New York from Boston to become organist at the Dutch Reformed collegiate church of St. Nicholas, where he remained until 1910.

Although his responsibilities as a church musician and educator were extensive, Parker managed to compose steadily throughout his career. Of his larger works, one that brought him considerable celebrity was the oratorio *Hora Novissima*. The work, which is based on a twelfth-century poem by the monk Bernard of Cluny, was written in 1892 for the Choral Church Society of New York. The oratorio achieved considerable popularity in America and England, a fact that no doubt drew attention to his smaller works as well, chief among them the anthem.

In this latter group, the most interesting feature is that of formal construction.\(^6\) Parker's skill as a symphonic composer is evident in *Rejoice in the Lord*,\(^7\) which is constructed in a tripartite design, with the outer sections in the tonic key of D major and the middle section in the key of the flat-six scale degree, B-flat major. The outer sections are further divided into three parts, but with different key schemes. The first section includes the tonic, mediant, and tonic

\(^5\) This date of 1904, given by Stevenson, does not agree with Chadwick, who dates Parker's appointment as 1894. Stevenson, 231, and Chadwick, 13.

\(^6\) Bibliographies of Parker's compositions, including a listing of anthems, is found in Semler, 318-330; and Stevenson, 232-234. A partial bibliography is also found in Broder, 807.

\(^7\) Oliver Ditson, 1898, no. 11,062.
keys, but the last section is harmonized entirely in the tonic, creating an overall form that loosely resembles that of the sonata-rondo.

A

B

A

\[ \begin{array}{c}
    a \\
    b \\
    a \\
\end{array} \quad \begin{array}{c}
    a \\
    b \\
    a \\
\end{array} \quad \begin{array}{c}
    I - iii - I \\
    bVI \\
    I - I - I \\
\end{array} \]

Parker harmonizes the predominantly homophonic choral settings with a variety of diatonic and altered chords, which are often supported by a pedal bass line. The altered chords create an harmonic tension that drives, rather than merely ornaments the anthems. For example, in *The Lord Is My Light*, a German sixth is used as a predominant chord to create the musical tension that propels the piece back into the tonic (Example 18). Modulations are generally restricted to keys a third away from the given key, a trait in common with Dudley Buck; however, Parker does not use this technique as frequently as does Buck. When establishing a new key, Parker does so by means of well-designed sequence patterns, rather than the abrupt shifts which are found in so many anthems of this period. An example is *Rejoice in the Lord*, in which a cadence on B-flat is confirmed by means of a musical sequence over a B-flat pedal (Example 19).

Parker's melodies are tuneful because they tend to outline triads and repeat frequently. For example, the opening phrase of *The Lord Is My Light* is heard ten different times throughout the 181-measure anthem. Many pieces include sections for soloists.

---

8. G. Schirmer, 1890, no. 3552.

and all are accompanied by the organ. Texts are commonly drawn either from scripture or hymns, with some poetic settings included.

It is evident from these few examples that Parker brought an element of professional compositional skill to the anthem which was desperately needed. By doing so, he opened the way for those composers who were reared in the Anglican tradition to introduce their new anthems to receptive American congregations.

T. Tertius Noble

T. Tertius Noble (1867-1953) devoted sixty-two of his eighty-five years to the profession of church music. Born and educated in England, Noble held several positions as organist there before coming to the United States in 1912, when he became organist-choirmaster at the St. Thomas Episcopal Church in New York, a position he held until 1947.9

St. Thomas' had been recently rebuilt with the idea of establishing more firmly the Anglican traditions and liturgy. As a result, Noble was brought from England to provide the appropriate music. Accordingly, he supervised the installation of a new organ, introduced

---

the cathedral evensong, revised the style of Psalm chanting to conform more closely to that of the Church of England, and in 1919, established the St. Thomas choir school for boys, an organization that attracted considerable attention throughout the United States. In 1943, he resigned his post at St. Thomas' and was made organist emeritus.  

Although they were composed in England, two of Noble's most famous anthems, *Fierce Was the Wild Billou* and *Souls of the Righteous*, were published in America. Performance instructions for both pieces allow for the use of quartet, even though the earmarks of the Anglican anthem are clearly evident. The instruction "For Quartet or Chorus of Mixed Voices," appears on the cover of *Fierce Was the Wild Billou*, and while *Souls of the Righteous* was designed "For Full Chorus of Mixed Voices," some of its choral sections are to be sung by "chorus" and others by "quartet." Neither piece includes the passages for solo voice so typical of the quartet style, but instead both feature the chorus, which sings a cappella throughout. Homophonic writing predominates in both anthems, yet the pieces are quite different stylistically. In *Fierce Was the Wild Billou*, choral sections feature

10. An obituary in *The American Organist* notes that his retirement pension from St. Thomas was "more attractive" than his actual salary and implies that Noble might have been coerced into retirement by church officials. "Obituary Notices," *The American Organist* XXXVI (April, 1953), 139.


13. A partial bibliography of Noble's compositions is located in Williamson, 1542-1543.
syllabic writing in which recurring triplet patterns are used to highlight the short, rhymed phrases of text. Although the setting almost defies musical treatment, Noble skillfully weaves the short lines into a tripartite construction and emphasizes dramatic portions of text with sudden shifts in dynamic levels and harmonic mode. For example, when the theme of the text changes from a narrative account of Christ's walk on the water to a personal prayer of petition, the harmonic mode correspondingly shifts from minor to major (Example 20). The choral writing found in Souls of the Righteous is somewhat different, for the text, which is translated from the Book of Wisdom, is much longer than that of the previous example and is correspondingly set to longer, more serene musical phrases. Homophonic writing still

prevails, but in this piece, the inner voices display melodic interest as well. Like Fierce Was the Wild Billow, this anthem is characterized by dynamic contrasts that, when produced by the unaccompanied voices, create a most dramatic effect (Example 21).

Go to Dark Gethsemane,\textsuperscript{14} which was composed by Noble after he moved to America, is a dramatic call to personal redemption. Interestingly, the piece was dedicated to another English church musician who also journeyed to America, H. Alexander Matthews, and to Matthew’s choir in Philadelphia. The text is drawn from a hymn by the nineteenth-century English hymnist James Montgomery. Set in the key of e-flat minor, the piece fluctuates ethereally from minor to parallel major, increasing musical and dramatic tension with each phrase. An

\textsuperscript{14} H. W. Gray, 1918, no. 501.
impressive climax begins in the third section of the modified strophic anthem with an ostinato pattern in the bass line that repeats for twelve measures (Example 22). In measure forty-five, the ostinato pattern of the bass is given to the upper voices and the bass assumes a new melody. This new double ostinato is repeated once, then abandoned as the entire ensemble exclaims, "It is finished! Hear Him cry" (Example 23).

Although Noble's anthems appeared in print alongside those intended for quartet choirs and were marked to accommodate that ensemble, they were clearly intended for the chorus in the English style. Besides merely augmenting the existing repertory of American anthems, Noble gave new importance to the full choir by not only featuring them

Very sustained, gradually increasing in force and intensity to a great climax.

The Bass part somewhat emphasized.

\[
\text{Cal - vary's mournful mountain climb;}
\]

\[
\text{Cal - vary's mournful mountain climb;}
\]

\[
\text{Cal - vary's mournful mountain climb;}
\]

\[
\text{Cal - vary's mournful mountain climb;}
\]

\[
\text{Cal - vary's mournful mountain climb;}
\]


\[
\text{God's own sacrifice complete; It is}
\]

\[
\text{God's own sacrifice complete; It is}
\]

\[
\text{God's own sacrifice complete; It is}
\]

\[
\text{God's own sacrifice complete; It is finished!}
\]
in his compositions, but by also incorporating into the choral score the dramatic element that had largely been reserved for the quartet soloists.

J. Sebastian Matthews and H. Alexander Matthews

The brothers John Sebastian Matthews (1870-1934) and Harry Alexander Matthews (1879-1973) distinguished themselves as leaders among those who wrote anthems in the English style, although neither produced anthems that equalled those of Parker or Noble. Born in Cheltenham, England, they were first trained in music by their father, John Alexander, who was a musical conductor. J. Sebastian, the older brother, came to Philadelphia in 1891, where he accepted the position
of organist at St. Martin-in-the-Fields. After leaving that city, he held similar positions at St. Mary's in Burlington, New Jersey, and at St. Stephen's in Boston. In 1901, he became organist at St. Peter's in Morristown, New Jersey, and in 1916, he moved to a similar position at Grace Church in Providence, Rhode Island.

Following in his brother's footsteps, H. Alexander came to Philadelphia in 1899, where he held the position of organist at the Second Presbyterian Church and then at St. Luke's and the Epiphany. He was a member of the music faculty of the University of Pennsylvania, receiving an honorary doctorate from that institution in 1925. Additionally, he was chairman of the theory department of the Philadelphia Musical Academy and conductor of several music clubs before retiring to Madison, Connecticut, in 1954. Both brothers published several successful cantatas and anthems, plus a variety of literature for the organ.


17. Partial bibliographies of their compositions are included in Pratt and Boyd, 288.
Of the two, H. Alexander's anthems were probably heard more often in American churches, and while they are riddled with Victorian musical clichés, they also reflect characteristics of the English anthem. From his cantata *The Life Everlasting*, H. Alexander published the anthem *This Is the Promise* in 1907, which serves as a good illustration of his musical style. Although the piece begins with a somewhat bombastic organ introduction of twenty-four measures that resembles the organ accompaniments of Dudley Buck, contained within the introduction is a rather skillful melodic sequence that points to the merits of the composer (Example 24). Throughout the anthem, stable choral sections are juxtaposed with bombastic organ interludes; however a recurring rhythmic pattern helps to unify the piece.

H. Alexander's concern for musical cohesion is further displayed in a Christmas anthem entitled *Voices of the Sky* which, like the earlier work, was excerpted from one of his cantatas, *The Story of Christmas*. Here, the recurring use of the retardation creates an

18. G. Schirmer, 1907, no. 8673.
19. G. Schirmer, 1913, no. 9513.
atmosphere of sentimental sweetness that probably delighted its listeners (Example 25). As in the previous example, the tasteful use of repetition and sequence point to this composer's knowledge of his craft. Unfortunately, however, simple, direct choral settings are victimized by bombastic, at times even pianistic organ accompaniments (Example 26).


A student of Horatio Parker who was known for composing "practical" anthem literature that was suitable for average or accomplished church choirs was Seth Bingham (1882-1972). In 1906, two years after graduating from Yale University, Bingham traveled to Paris for further


21. Although an article in The Diapason dated July 1, 1951, states that Bingham received his bachelor's degree from Yale in 1901, H. Wiley Hitchcock, who is to be considered a most reliable source, disagrees, stating that the degree from Yale was not received until 1904. "Honor Seth Bingham," The Diapason, 20; and Hitchcock, 724.
musical training. After a year in Paris, he returned to the United States in 1908 and joined the faculty of Yale, where he remained until 1919, when he was appointed chairman of the Music Theory Department at Columbia University. During these and the following years, he served several churches as organist-choirmaster, the most notable of which was the Madison Avenue Presbyterian Church, where in 1951 he retired after thirty-five years of service. In 1952, he received an honorary doctorate from Ohio Wesleyan University, and the following year he was appointed to the faculty of the School of Sacred Music at Union Theological Seminary. He retired from his position at Columbia in 1954, but he continued to lecture at Union Theological Seminary until 1965.

Bingham wrote for the entire Protestant church, that is, he had no particular denomination in mind. His anthems include settings of canticles, hymns, scripture, and sacred poetry. His earliest works are somewhat difficult technically, but, as time goes on, they become shorter in length and simpler in construction.

In 1941, Bingham published a choral setting of The Lord's Prayer that was, no doubt, welcome to many church musicians who were unwilling to present the popular, gaudy settings of this text to their congregations. The overall form and mood of the piece are prescribed by

22. The sources consulted disagree as to Bingham's tenure at the Madison Avenue Presbyterian Church. Again, Hitchcock is believed to be the most reliable source, Hitchcock, 724.


24. A partial bibliography of Bingham's compositions is included in Ibid., and in Hitchcock, 724.

the text. Irregularly barred conjunct vocal lines are chanted by the choir in hushed chords, set in minor mode (Example 27). A mood of awe.

Example 27. Seth Bingham, The Lord's Prayer (Carl Fischer, CM607), measures 1-7.
and reverence is further created by the organ accompaniment, which moves independently of the voices through highly unusual harmonic progressions that include the Neapolitan sixth, flat-six, and minor dominant.

Four years after the Lord's Prayer was issued, Bingham brought out a piece entitled O Come and Mourn in which chromaticism predomi-
nates. As in the Lord's Prayer, the text dictates both the harmonic motion and mood. Chromatic scale passages effectively create a feeling of hopelessness over the death of the Savior, and while the final words proclaim "Our Lord is crucified," the descending lines settle slowly to a final unison pitch (Example 28).

Example 28. Seth Bingham, O Come and Mourn (Galaxy, no. 1498), measures 101-108.

In addition to the use of the scriptures, the use of non-scriptural texts of high quality tastefully complements these more sophisticated, subtle musical settings. As a rule, Bingham gave careful attention to the rhythm of the text, so that it is easily understood. The reserved, sophisticated style of these anthems may have limited their exposure in American churches, for there is no doubt that they were most appreciated by those congregations that valued musical artistry and skill. Unlike many of the composers already discussed, Bingham avoided the clichés of the day, and many modern church musicians would profit from an examination of the works of this somewhat overlooked composer.
No American composer of church music enjoyed greater respect from his colleagues than did the Bostonian organist H. Everett Titcomb (1884-1969). A devout Episcopalian, Titcomb served the church of St. John the Evangelist, Boston, as organist-choirmaster for fifty years from 1910-1960. During this time, both the Boston University College of Music and the New England Conservatory of Music called upon him to instruct students in applied organ, liturgical music, and choral training.  

Titcomb was largely a self-taught musician, a fact that intimidated him considerably. In 1946, for example, officials at Boston University asked Titcomb to assume the responsibilities of the chairman of the Organ Department, who had become ill and was forced to take a leave of absence. The composer was reluctant to serve as a substitute because he believed himself to be ignorant of sufficient organ literature to fill the position adequately. While he may have lacked a knowledge of organ literature, he certainly compensated for that deficiency with his knowledge of the Episcopal liturgy, for he was


considered an authority of the latter. He spent several summers in Europe learning the various methods of plainsong performance, then amid significant opposition from some church members, he gradually introduced it into the liturgy at St. John's. Titcomb realized that a number of church musicians in and around Boston were interested in learning more about the performance of chant, so he invited them to sing the Benediction Service every Sunday evening. Forming these music directors into a choir, which he named the "Schola Cantorum," Titcomb gave them the opportunity to experience first-hand the singing of the chant, and at the same time, created a first-rate ensemble to enhance his own choral program at the church.

Titcomb's anthems were published primarily by two American publishing houses, Carl Fischer and B. F. Wood. Sections for unison voices supported by heavy, pompous organ accompaniments are found in most of the accompanied pieces, making them especially well-suited for the untrained choir. Diatonic harmonies predominate and there is little use of chromaticism. Modulations to relative keys are most common at clearly marked section changes.

In 1934, Titcomb published a set of anthems entitled Eight Short Motets, which call for more than average technical skill from the singers. Scored for unaccompanied choir, the anthems are written to be sung during the communion of the greater festivals of the church.


30. A bibliography of Titcomb's published anthems up to 1953 is included in Smith, 31.
Of the eight selections, *I Will Not Leave You Comfortless*[^31] is a typical example. The piece is constructed in a simple tripartite form, and each section is unified with a recurring rhythmic pattern. The voices are set polyphonically, with some imitation and text painting, and the overall mood is reserved and unobtrusive.

One of Titcomb's best-known accompanied anthems is *O Love How Deep*,[^32] the text of which is translated from a fifteenth-century Latin hymn, suggesting the influence of the Oxford Movement, an effort made to incorporate High Church principles into the Anglican Church during the nineteenth century. Examples of sweeping unison phrases supported by rich, rhythmically constant organ accompaniments are found throughout the anthem (Example 29). Occasional a cappella


[^31]: Carl Fischer, 1934, CM 441.

sections occur, but according to Bernard Smith, these are the exception in Titcomb's accompanied works. Conjunct, flowing, vocal lines, which are set in regular two- or four-measure phrases, suggest that the choral sections might have been written for the organ first, then transcribed for the singers. Phrases often begin on either an upbeat or a weak beat, a technique that may have better facilitated the organist who conducted the choir while playing.

The popularity of Titcomb's anthems resulted from their simple dignity. By means of full organ sonorities, Titcomb was able to please even the most sophisticated Episcopal congregation. On the other hand, by writing a good deal of unison choral sections, he not only caught the eye of the director whose choral forces were lacking, but also the director of the accomplished choir who desired suitable literature that could be learned and performed on short notice.

Joseph W. Clokey

A product of the American educational system, Joseph W. Clokey (1890-1960) received his musical training at Miami University, in Oxford, Ohio, and at the Cincinnati Conservatory of Music. Clokey's

33. Smith, 27.
career included tenures at Miami University, from 1915 to 1926, and
Pomona College, from 1926 to 1939. He was awarded an honorary doc-
torate by Miami University in 1937, where two years later, he was
named dean of the School of Fine Arts, a position he retained until
1947. After retirement from Miami University in 1947, he was awarded
honorary doctorates by Ohio Wesleyan University in 1951 and LaVerne
College in 1956. Prior to his death, he gave periodic guest lectures
at Claremont College, the University of Southern California, and the
University of California at Los Angeles.

Throughout his career, Clokey's church music was among the most
popular and therefore most widely performed of his day. Harold Thompson
notes a tendency toward a more conservative, reserved emotion in Clokey's
anthems dating after 1930 and partially credits this change to a shift
in the composer's theology, which resulted in Clokey's separation from
the Presbyterian church and subsequent affiliation with the Episcopal
church. Many of his anthems were written for the Anglican ser-
vice and reflect Clokey's extraordinary command of the organ as an ac-
companying instrument. A characteristic of many of his later pieces
is a simplified choral format that relies on a full organ accompaniment
for stability. Like Everett Titcomb, Clokey was able to create a dig-
nified choral composition utilizing only modest choral forces, a tech-
nique that attracted many small- to medium-sized church choirs.

35. Although an article in The American Organist dated October, 1966,
states that Clokey remained at Miami University until 1960, most
sources agree on the date 1947. "Joseph Clokey," The American
Organist XLIII, 43.

36. Harold W. Thompson, "Joseph W. Clokey's Compositions Form Subject
for Study," The Diapason XL (May 1, 1949), 10.
The evolution of Clokey's musical style is readily seen in his anthems. In 1936, he published a piece, based on a text from a sixteenth-century manuscript, entitled *Two Kings*. The piece is scored for four to eight voice parts, which are accompanied by trumpet and trombone fanfares. Frequent shifts in tonal centers coupled with a lack of support from the accompaniment makes the piece suitable only for more advanced choirs.

An anthem that reflects Clokey's more reserved emotion is *Treasures in Heaven*, which was published in 1941. In this anthem, the text of which is drawn directly from chapters six and seven of St. Matthew, a modest choral setting is supported by a rich, yet subdued organ texture. Flowing vocal sections are constructed using a variety of chord inversions, notably second inversion triads that result from omitting the root of the chord contained in the pedal point of the organ accompaniment (Example 30). Homophonic choral parts coupled with a free alteration between duple and triple meters indicate Clokey's interest in clear textual articulation. A lack of rhythmic motion, which is caused by the exclusion of any note values smaller than the quarter note, makes this piece difficult to perform stylistically, even though

37. A partial listing of Clokey's compositions is included in Slonimsky, 331.

38. J. Fischer and Bro., 1936, no. 7211.

39. The date of this example obviously does not coordinate with the information from Thompson, 10.

40. Summy-Birchard, 1941, B-2010.

```
Lay not up for yourselves treasures on earth, Where moth and rust

doth corrupt and where thieves break through and steal,
```

its hymn-like characteristics place it within the capacity of choirs with average ability.

Four years after publishing *Treasures in Heaven*, Clokey produced an anthem for unison voices with piano accompaniment entitled *Canticle of Peace*. Based on the second chapter of Isaiah, the text is harmonized by means of a tonal center on "g" and unified by four short motives. At first glance, this anthem appears to be quite unlike

---

Clokey's other pieces; however, there are similarities. The first motive, located initially in the accompaniment and later in both the accompaniment and vocal melody, is reminiscent of the brass fanfares in *Two Kings* (Example 31). The second motive is located only in the

vocal line (Example 32), while the third motive is found only in the
accompaniment (Example 33). The final motive is stated first in the

Example 32. Joseph W. Clokey, *Canticle of Peace* (Summy-Birchard,
B-340), measures 8-9.

Example 33. Joseph W. Clokey, *Canticle of Peace* (Summy-Birchard,
B-340), measures 26-27.

vocal line, then later migrates to the accompaniment (Example 34).

Example 34. Joseph W. Clokey, *Canticle of Peace* (Summy-Birchard,
B-340), measures 78 and 90.
A unison melody is set in recitative style throughout and is accompanied by tonal harmonies containing an abundance of added notes and by non-functional bi-tonal chords. Harmonic progressions that move in parallel motion recall the same feature in Treasures in Heaven.

Like many of his contemporaries, Clokey discovered a method of anthem composition in which musical integrity could be preserved in spite of only modest choral facilities. The difficulties of the choral sections of his pieces written after Treasures in Heaven probably lie midway between the anthems of Bingham and Titcomb; however, the difficulties of accompaniments in pieces such as Canticle of Peace tend to surpass those of his contemporaries.

Philip James

The development of the American anthem would have changed considerably if the composer Philip James (1890-1975) had chosen to invest more of his compositional talent in this medium. He was one of the best-trained musicians to deal significantly with the anthem; however, his production was greatly reduced by his other pursuits.

Receiving his musical education in New York, London, and Paris, James began a career as a church organist around 1905, playing in various churches in and around New York City. 42 While pursuing a

church music career, he played the violin in a theater orchestra, and even directed the music of one theater production. Following the first World War, during which he served as a bandmaster, James conducted a comic opera company for two seasons, and in 1922, founded the New Jersey Orchestra, an organization he conducted for the next seven years. From 1929 to 1936, he conducted the Bamberger Little Symphony Orchestra, which he founded, performing some five hundred concerts with this group. Throughout his career, James frequently performed with major American orchestras as a guest conductor. From 1923 to 1955, he taught at New York University, where in 1933, he was appointed chairman of the Music Department. His numerous works include both vocal and instrumental genres.

The most noticeable characteristic of James' anthems is their tendency toward impressionism. An example is *By the Waters of Babylon*, which abounds with non-functional diatonic chords, major sevenths and ninths, diminished triads and sevenths, chord clusters, and cross-rhythms (Example 35). Coupled with a rather aimless melody, the unusual chord progressions create an overall ethereal mood for the text setting, which is drawn from Psalm 137. Both choral and organ

---

43. The orchestra was under the patronage of Bamberger's Department Store. Joseph A. Mussulman, *Dear People...Robert Shaw* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1979), 45.

44. A partial bibliography of James' compositions is included in Hilton, 472.

45. H. W. Gray, 1921, no. 636.

a.

O Si-on. As for our harps, we

O Si-on. As for our harps, we

O Si-on. As for our harps, we

O Si-on. As for our harps, we

b.

Je-ru-sa-lem! Je-ru-sa-lem!

Je-ru-sa-lem! Je-ru-sa-lem!

Je-ru-sa-lem!

Je-ru-sa-lem!
parts are difficult to perform, thus reserving this work for the better ensembles found in more sophisticated American churches and colleges.

At the close of the first half of this century, James published the anthem Close Thine Eyes, and Sleep Secure. Once again, the text, a poetic setting by King Charles I of England, dictates the overall mystical mood. Unaccompanied choral parts are written for up to eight voices and are set in compound meters that shift rather frequently, recalling the typical characteristics of post-Romantic choral works. Diatonic triads are still utilized in a non-functional fashion, but the use of altered chords is not as apparent as in the previous anthem. After the midpoint of the century, James' anthems become more difficult and, as seen in Blessed Are Ye That Hunger, still retain elements of a compromised impressionistic style (Example 36).

These anthems reflect the compositional skill of a master composer. It is unfortunate, however, that such a fine talent as James continued to write in a musical style that had long passed out of vogue. This aspect of the style probably reduced the size of his American audiences more than did the actual technical difficulties of the works.

46. Galaxy, 1949, no. 1768.

47. H. W. Gray, 1956, CMR 2438.

Blessed ye when men shall hate you, and cast you from their midst.

Your reward is great in heaven; for in like manner...
T. Frederick H. Candlyn

Born and educated in England, T. Frederick H. Candlyn (1892-1964) came to the United States in 1915 to assume the organist’s position at St. Paul’s Episcopal Church in Albany, New York. In 1919, he was named chairman of the Music Department at the State University of New York at Albany, and after twenty-four years there, he succeeded T. Tertius Noble as organist at the St. Thomas Church, New York City, where he remained until 1954. Upon his early resignation, which remains

48. The following biographical information is drawn from "Dr. T. Frederick H. Candlyn," The American Organist XXXVII (May, 1954), 159; "Dr. T. Frederick H. Candlyn," The Diapason XLV (July 1, 1954), 17; and "Obituary," The American Organist XLVIII (February, 1965), 28.
unexplained, he served several other churches as organist until his death in 1964.\textsuperscript{49}

Like the compositions of a number of his contemporaries, Candlyn's anthems contain a considerable amount of writing for unison voices.\textsuperscript{50} In one of his best-known works, *Christ, Whose Glory Fills the Skies*,\textsuperscript{51} forty-nine of sixty-seven measures scored for chorus are written for unison voices. The anthem, which is set to the text of the eighteenth-century hymnist Charles Wesley, begins with a robust organ introduction in D major that then accompanies a unison statement of the first stanza. The second stanza is harmonized in the parallel minor, an appropriate choice for the text, "Dark and cheerless is the morn unaccompanied by Thee..." Only in this solemn passage does Candlyn write for four voice parts, for the final stanza is again given to unison choir. Further evidence of Candlyn's concern with proper textual emphasis and articulation is found at the conclusion of each stanza in which the meter is altered to accommodate proper word accentuation.

The bulk of the musical sonority is given to the organ accompaniment, which although not extremely difficult, provides rhythmic and harmonic motion and contains passages that unify the anthem. An

\textsuperscript{49} An article announcing his resignation from St. Thomas' implied that some problem existed. "Dr. T. Frederick H. Candlyn," *The American Organist* XXXVII (May, 1954), 159.

\textsuperscript{50} A bibliography of Candlyn's compositions was unavailable.

\textsuperscript{51} Carl Fischer, 1942, CM 622.
example of the latter is found in the first four measures of the
organ introduction, which is based on an inversion of the vocal melody
(Example 37). Subsequent organ interludes that occur between stanzas


of the hymn also contain fragments of the melody stated in inversion
and in diminution (Example 38). These same characteristics are also
observed in anthems such as *Alleluia to the Easter King*, which were
written after the mid-century.

52. M. Whitmark, 1951, no. 5-W3437.
Like several of his contemporaries, Candlyn skillfully produced a series of anthems that were suitable for the average choir and that also achieved a degree of musical substance. He was able to utilize unison choral writing to a significant degree, and at the same time, construct an organ accompaniment that could be performed by the less-skilled organist. The production of such pieces made his works a popular choice during the 1940's.

Leo Sowerby

During the third and fourth decades of this century, music critics predicted a bright future and abundant recognition for the
young organist-composer Leo Sowerby (1895-1968). Although he enjoyed a brilliant career, it is doubtful that he gained the national recognition that would have been possible had his anthems not featured an excessive use of dissonance and a preference for virtuoso organ accompaniments. In that he was largely self-taught, his use of such advanced techniques was most unusual.

Prior to the first World War, during which he toured France as a bandmaster, Sowerby held several posts as organist in and around Chicago. Returning there after his military service, he accepted a position as principal organist for a congregational church and the position of assistant organist at the Fourth Presbyterian Church. In 1921, he became the first recipient of the American Prix de Rome, which enabled him to spend the following three years in Italy. In 1925 he was hired to teach at the American Conservatory, where in 1934, he was named chairman of the Department of Composition and Theory. Two years


54. Raymond Jones recounts a story that illustrates Sowerby’s early musical training. Unable to afford the twenty-five cent fee to practice on an organ at a church in Chicago, Sowerby devised his own pedal board by drawing it on butcher paper and placing it on the floor beneath a piano. Jones, 6.
after he began teaching at the American Conservatory, he was named organist at the St. James Episcopal Church in Chicago. He held both of these positions until his retirement in 1962.

With the post at St. James', he began a life-long association with the Episcopal church. During the summer of 1927, Sowerby traveled to England to familiarize himself with the Anglican liturgy, and upon his return, he set about composing choral services for the church. In the late 1930's, Sowerby assisted in the revision of the 1940 Episcopal hymnal, and then in the summer of 1944, he joined the faculty of the Evergreen Conference on Church Music, which was an organization designed to augment the training of Episcopal church musicians.

Sowerby produced several anthems during the early 1920's, when American churches were experiencing a period of musical stagnation that followed the dying Victorian influence on the genre. He was not an innovator, yet was considered a rebel among the composers of American church music. While Sowerby's compositions are rooted in the ideals of nineteenth-century Romanticism and remain within a tonal framework, they are excessively dissonant, a characteristic for which he received considerable criticism throughout his career.\(^55\) Examples of altered chords including ninths and elevenths are found frequently, along with harmonic progressions that are non-tertian (Example 39). Both enharmonic and chromatic modulations are common.

---

\(^55\). A partial bibliography of Sowerby's compositions is listed in Tischler, 947, and a descriptive listing of anthems is included in Jones, 380-412.

Fairly fast, but with dignity ($q = 132-138$)

Sowerby's anthems are quite formidable in length and include melodies that range from rhythmically active, short tunes (Example 40)

Example 40. Leo Sowerby, *My Heart Is Fixed, O God* (H. W. Gray, no. 2414), measures 4-11, melody only.

My heart is fixed, my heart is fixed, O God,

to long, winding musical lines that cease to pique one's interest after the first few measures (Example 41). Like the melodies of

Example 41. Leo Sowerby, *I Will Lift Up Mine Eyes* (Boston Music, no. 6350), measures 3-5, melody only.

I will lift up mine eyes unto the hills, from whence cometh my help.
Titcomb, they often enter on either an upbeat or following a weak beat, more easily facilitating conducting by the organist.

Examples of homophonic writing are found in many choral sections, and a thick choral texture is common. Characteristic choral writing includes voices in unison, voices in unison octaves, or two voices written in counterpoint and doubled at the octave.

Anthems are often accompanied with heavy organ parts calling for three staves. The flowing rhythmic motion of the accompaniment may either double the vocal score or move independently of the voices. In his scores, Sowerby consistently indicated interpretive suggestions and directions in English, and omitted all metronomic indications.

Although Sowerby wrote almost exclusively for the church, the extreme difficulty of his anthems made them unsuitable for the average church choir, and has therefore limited their popularity in American churches. All-Sowerby programs were common among the American Guild of Organists and the various choral directors' associations during the 1930's and 1940's; however, the greatest influence of this composer has been somewhat contained within the Episcopal church.
Chapter III

PROMINENT CHORAL ENSEMBLES AND THE DISSEMINATION OF THE ANTHEM

During the first half of this century, the efforts of a number of amateur and professional choirs singing in this country evoked in the American public an unprecedented awareness of and appreciation for the performance of choral music. The celebrity of the earliest of these ensembles derived largely from their exclusive performance of a cappella literature, most of which was sacred. Among the groups performing earliest in this century are included professional and amateur singing societies, located in the major cities of the United States and Canada, touring choirs from Russia, and American collegiate choirs. The latter ensembles had the greatest impact on the anthem, for they emphasized that particular genre in their concerts. Through the programs presented by the choirs from Northwestern University, St. Olaf College, and Westminster Choir College, the unaccompanied anthem became the focal point in American sacred music during the second quarter of this century. As a result, a wealth of new a cappella anthem literature was written and performed.

At the same time as the collegiate a cappella choirs were sweeping the country with their extraordinary performances, the Salt Lake Mormon Tabernacle Choir, considered by many to be the finest volunteer church choir in America, was providing weekly programs of a variety of foreign and domestic anthems to radio audiences. With additional
concert tours and several professional recordings to its credit, this choir established a new precedent of quality performances from a volunteer church ensemble.

In the same way that the Mormon Tabernacle Choir inspired volunteer church choirs, Robert Shaw, as the director of New York's Collegiate Chorale, inspired American choral directors in the art of choral music-making during the 1940's. Actually, these groups did a great deal more than merely promote certain anthems, for by inspiring local church choirs and directors to improve their weekly performances, they gave increased credibility to the entire genre of the anthem in America.

Professional and Amateur Singing Societies

The Musical Arts Society of New York

The renaissance in choral singing that took place in the 1930's and 1940's actually began around the turn of the century with professional and amateur choirs that specialized in a cappella singing. 1 The first such professional choir in America, the Musical Arts Society of New York, was established by Frank Damrosch during the final decade of the nineteenth century. Organized to educate New York society to the beauties of a cappella music, the group consisted originally of fifty-five professional singers and sang a total of sixty-one concerts in its twenty-five seasons. The repertory of the choir contained sacred and secular pieces dating from the sixteenth to the nineteenth centuries. While it

1. The following material is drawn largely from Richard Irl Kegerreis, "History of the High School A Cappella Choir" (unpublished Ph.D. dissertation, University of Michigan, 1964), 60-70.
included no examples of newly composed American anthem literature, the repertory provided a musical foundation from which many collegiate a cappella choirs drew inspiration some two decades later.

The Mendelssohn Choir of Toronto

Begun in 1894, less than one year after the establishment of the Musical Arts Society of New York, the Mendelssohn Choir of Toronto consisted of amateur singers only. The nucleus of the seventy-five member ensemble was the Jarvis Street Baptist Church Choir, directed by organist-choirmaster A. S. Vogt. The choir specialized in a cappella singing, a result of Vogt's musical training in Leipzig, where he was exposed to the famous St. Thomas Choir.

The first program presented by the Mendelssohn Choir of Toronto included seven selections, of which two were sacred. After three concert seasons, the choir's sacred repertory was expanded to include unaccompanied oratorio selections. American audiences were first introduced to this ensemble in 1907, when the group toured New York, and again in 1908, when it toured the Chicago area. According to Peter C. Lutkin, the founder of the collegiate a cappella choir in the United States, the concert tours of this group are noteworthy because they helped to increase the sensitivity and awareness of the American public to the choral art.

2. The sacred selections were *Sweet and Low* by Mason and *Judge Me O God* by Mendelssohn. The name "Mendelssohn" was chosen for the choir because Vogt intended to include at least one unaccompanied part-song or Psalm by Mendelssohn on each program. *Ibid.*, 69.

American taste for a cappella anthem literature from Russia was indelibly influenced by the performances of Russian choral ensembles in the United States during the third and fourth decades of this century. According to Richard Kegerreis, the first Russian choir to perform in the United States was founded in New York when Charles Crane, a New Yorker who had been living in Russia, convinced Ivan Gorokoff to come to America with him to establish a choir at the Russian Orthodox Cathedral in New York City. Gorokoff, in turn, brought five singers with him: two tenors, two basses, and one "octave bass." The uniqueness of these five singers coupled with Crane's effectiveness in organizing tours for the choir produced large audiences eager to hear the ensemble perform.

Aside from the Cathedral Choir, all of the other Russian ensembles which toured the United States were native organizations. Three of the more prominent groups were the Ukranian Choir, directed by Alexander Koshetz, the Russian Symphonic Choir, directed by Basil Kibalchick, and, probably the most famous, the Don Cossack Chorus, which made its American debut on November 4, 1930. The Ukranian Choir was in the United States from 1922 to 1924, and the Russian Symphonic Choir

4. The following material is drawn primarily from Kegerreis, 71-75.

5. No date for this event was available; however, Crane was active in Russia around 1920. For an account of Russian sacred music and its influence on the anthem in America, see Chapter Five.

6. "Octave-bass" is one of the numerous terms used to describe the type of bass singer who could sing an octave below the normal bass range.
toured in 1923 and 1924. Russian sacred music was not a featured part of the performances of these three groups. However, they undoubtedly drew attention to the numerous editions of Russian liturgical music that were being published in this country at the time.  

Collegiate A Cappella Choirs

None of the ensembles mentioned thus far devoted its repertory exclusively to American sacred music; in fact, except for the Russian Cathedral Choir, most of them performed little sacred music at all. Instead, they established a new medium of performance in the United States—that of the unaccompanied choral ensemble—which was subsequently imitated by three outstanding American collegiate choirs. It was the performances of these ensembles from Northwestern University, St. Olaf College, and Westminster Choir College that shaped the direction of American anthem composition for several decades, for these ensembles featured sacred music, especially anthems, in their repertoires.

Northwestern University

The founder of the collegiate a cappella choir in the United States was Peter Christian Lutkin, who served for many years as dean of the Department of Music at Northwestern University, Evanston, Illinois. According to Lutkin, the formation of the first collegiate

7. See Chapter Five.
8. For a discussion of Lutkin's career, see Chapter Four.
a cappella choir was the result of an ensemble organized to demonstrate Renaissance choral music for a class at the university. Lutkin was so taken with a cappella singing that he became an expert on the subject, often speaking out in its support at such programs as the annual meeting of the Music Teachers' National Association, where he delivered papers in 1909, 1916, 1917, 1923, and 1928. These papers were subsequently reprinted in the organization's journal. In addition to being the first collegiate ensemble to adopt and promote the practice of a cappella singing, the Northwestern University Choir undoubtedly had the distinction of performing Lutkin's anthems as well.

St. Olaf College

In 1903, F. Melius Christiansen came to Northfield, Minnesota, to build the Music Department at St. Olaf College, a small denominational institution supported by the Norwegian Lutheran Church. In addition to musical and administrative duties at the college, Christiansen also directed the choir at Northfield's St. John's Church. Following an unsuccessful attempt to locate suitable church music for the choir, Christiansen made some of his earliest contributions to American anthem


10. For a discussion of Lutkin's anthems, see Chapter Four.

11. The following is drawn from Leola Nelson Bergmann, Music Master of the Middle West: The Story of F. Melius Christiansen and the St. Olaf Choir (Minneapolis: The University of Minnesota Press, 1944); Albert Rykken Johnson, "The Christiansen Choral Tradition: F. Melius Christiansen, Olaf C. Christiansen, and Paul J. Christiansen" (unpublished Ph.D. dissertation, University of Iowa, 1973), 96-129; Kegerreis, 82-110; and Van Camp, 230-236.
literature by rescoring for mixed chorus a number of pieces originally written for men's voices. To this group he added a few new songs and published the collection in 1905 under the title *Sangerfesthefte*, a song festival pamphlet. The texts of most of the selections, as might be inferred from the title, were written in Norwegian.

The year following his first publication, Christiansen took leave from the college and traveled to Leipzig to spend the winter of 1906–1907 studying composition and arranging under the direction of Gustave Schreck, a noted composer and director of the Thomasschule. The result of his study included new arrangements of forty-four chorales and folk hymns for the St. John's Choir. Upon Christiansen's return to St. Olaf in 1907, the St. John's Choir was invited to sing for the annual conference of the Norwegian Lutheran Church in America, which was held on the campus of the college. For this concert, the choir presented eleven of Christiansen's chorale settings in which sermonettes by John Nathan Kildahl, then President of St. Olaf College, were interspersed. Under the title *Sang Gudstjeneste* (song services), these eleven arrangements were published during that same year, with the remaining thirty-three arrangements issued in six successive collections from 1908 to 1916.

In addition to conducting the St. John's Choir, which consisted mostly of students from the college, Christiansen also directed a male

---

12. Leola Bergmann notes the publication of twelve *Korsange* by Christiansen in 1894, which pre-date these pieces. Bergmann, 210.

octet and the Choral Union, a large mixed choir organized to sing extended works at special functions. In 1908, Christiansen divided this large ensemble into separate men's and women's choruses, both of which he directed until 1911. During that year, he combined these groups to present a series of concerts under the name of his church ensemble, the "St. John's Church Choir." In 1912, when this choir was invited to visit several Lutheran churches in Wisconsin, it was renamed the "St. Olaf Lutheran Choir," a title deemed a more appropriate representation of the college.¹⁴

For the 1912 tour, the choir presented a program of eight chorale and folk hymn arrangements by Christiansen, all sung in Norwegian, a selection from Messiah by Handel, three selections with English texts by Soeldermann, and two sermonettes by Kildahl.¹⁵ During the next eight years, from 1912 to 1920, programs contained a decreasing number of pieces sung in Norwegian.¹⁶ A preference for Norwegian pieces was still evident in the program of 1913, with seven of the eleven selections performed in Norwegian. However, by 1918, only two selections were sung in Norwegian. The remaining ten selections were performed

---

¹⁴. Van Camp, 232. The denominational affiliation "Lutheran" was eventually dropped from the choir's appellation.

¹⁵. Copies of concert programs performed by the choir from 1912 to 1944 are included in Bergmann, 218-227.

¹⁶. Albert Johnson notes that the sermonettes were eventually dropped from these programs, and the music was then presented in a concert format. Johnson, 123.
in English. According to Kenneth Jennings, the current conductor of the choir, the majority of students attending St. Olaf College during those early years spoke Norwegian; therefore, it was the easiest and most comfortable language in which to sing. He explains the gradual shift to English texts as part of the conscious efforts being continually made by the college to become "American." 

Although the repertory performed by the St. Olaf Choir from 1912 to 1942, the year Christiansen retired, was always unaccompanied, curiously, it reflected little of the a cappella literature from the sixteenth century. In fact, works by Palestrina and his contemporaries are found only seven times in the choir's programs. Instead, the majority of the repertory, all of which was sacred, consisted of Bach motets, music from the Russian liturgy, and the arrangements and compositions of Christiansen. On the basis of the frequency with which the repertory of this choir was imitated by other choral groups during the first half of this century, it is clear that the impact of the St. Olaf Choir on the development of the American anthem was enormous.

17. Some pieces performed earlier in Norwegian were translated into English for the later programs. For example, the compositions Lover den Herre and Deilig er Jorden were sung in Norwegian for concerts from 1912-1917. For the national tour of the United States in 1920, these pieces were translated into English as Praise to the Lord and Beautiful Savior, respectively. See Chapter Four for a more detailed analysis of Christiansen's anthems.

Westminster Choir College

John Finley Williamson began his musical career as a paid singer in the quartet of the First Lutheran Church in Dayton, Ohio.\(^{19}\) An unskillful tonsillectomy forced him to abandon his singing career and to investigate the opportunities as a director of choral music. As a result, he became convinced that an amateur choir, properly rehearsed and developed, could enhance the spiritual nature of worship more effectively than the quartet had been able to do. In 1920, he was hired by the Westminster Presbyterian Church of Dayton to produce such a group.

Sixty singers were chosen by audition for the first choir, which gave its premiere performance during the morning worship service of the Westminster Presbyterian Church on Sunday, September 19, 1920. For this service the choir sang two anthems by Dudley Buck, entitled *God Is Our Refuge* and *Rock of Ages*.\(^{20}\) Williamson created such a skillful choral ensemble from amateur singers that the fame of the choir spread quickly, and on November 16, 1922, the group embarked on a Northeastern tour whose stated purpose was to promote and inspire the development of similar church choirs.\(^{21}\)

---


20. Schisler, 36.

21. Wehr, 39.
As the fame of the choir spread throughout Protestant churches, so did the demand for church-music directors who could produce similar effects within the local congregation. To satisfy this increasing demand, the Westminster Choir School was established in 1926 as an outgrowth of the music program at Dayton's Westminster Presbyterian Church. One year prior to the founding of the choir school, Williamson outlined a plan he felt would provide musical education for church members, a service to the community, and a program of worship for the church.  

His system, which became known as the "Westminster Plan," called for a department of music to be established in the church under one head. Three choirs would be formed: a junior choir for ages six to twelve, an intermediate choir for ages twelve to eighteen, and an adult choir for ages eighteen and older. A fourth choir for high school students, ages sixteen to twenty-one, could be implemented if the church membership were large enough to support this additional ensemble. The church would have an orchestra, and each member of the adult choir would receive free voice lessons from the director. The music director, whom Williamson called the "minister of music" would receive a full-time salary for his work.  


23. The term "minister of music" was created by Williamson and Dr. Evans, the pastor of the Westminster Presbyterian Church. According to the Westminster Plan, music was to be used as a means to the end of "ministering to the needs of men and women. . . ." Wehr, 71.
The sole function of the school was to train ministers of music to reproduce the Westminster Plan in other churches. This vocational approach resulted in a curriculum similar to that in a conservatory or trade school, with emphasis on performance. No degrees were offered, and no stress was placed on academic training. Only the development of skills in singing, conducting, vocal pedagogy, theory, and organ or piano were taught.

For three years, from 1926 to 1929, the school was located in Dayton. During that time, the most important activities were choir tours. Concerts brought fame to the choir and subsequently the school, but more importantly, they brought more students to the school to learn the Westminster Plan and to acquire musical training. Each year the number of requests for Westminster-trained ministers of music exceeded the availability of graduates.24

National recognition first came to the school in 1929, at the end of its stay in Dayton. Walter Damrosch, then conductor of the New York Symphony, heard the choir and suggested that the group tour Europe. As a result, an eight-week tour, financed by Dayton philanthropist Katharine Talbott, was planned. By the late 1930's, having performed in some 250 cities in the United States, and having completed a second tour to Europe that included Russia, the Westminster Choir had become both nationally and internationally recognized.

During this time of increased celebrity, Williamson moved the school from Dayton to Ithaca, New York, to join with the Ithaca Conservatory.

24. Schisler, 76.
and Affiliated Schools. The move provided two advantages: enlarged facilities, which could not be found in Dayton, and accreditation with the authority to confer bachelor of music degrees under the New York Board of Regents. The curriculum was expanded to four years.

Before the school moved to Ithaca, local churches had been contacted concerning the use of Westminster students. These students arrived on campus one month prior to the beginning of classes and spent the entire month working in their new churches. Once school began, the students left Ithaca on Friday at noon and returned the following Monday morning. A suitable choral library was provided at the school for the use of these student ministers of music.

Three weeks after school began in 1929, the student directors brought their adult choirs together to be led by Williamson and to hear the Westminster College Choir sing. During the years that the college was located in New York, numerous festivals of this nature were held. By 1932, fifty churches in the central New York area were served by Westminster students and graduates.

The repertory performed by the Westminster College Choir on their numerous tours favored compositions by American composers. F. Melius Christiansen and the St. Olaf Choir had such an impact on Williamson that one-fourth of the numbers performed by the Dayton Choir on the 1922 tour were composed by Christiansen.

The 1923-24 program was similar to the 1922 program in that all music was sacred and unaccompanied. Again, the influence of Christiansen is clearly seen, with nearly one-third of the pieces performed credited to him. Anthems composed or arranged by contemporary composers living in America made up more than two-thirds of the concert and were as follows:

- Fierce Was the Wild Billow ........ T. Tertius Noble
- What Christ Said ................. Peter C. Lutkin
- The Shepherds' Story ............. Clarence Dickinson
- Awake, Awake .......................... Nicolai, arr.
- Beautiful Savior ................... 12th century, arr.
- Praise to the Lord .................. Soehren, arr.
- Psalm Fifty .......................... F. Melius Christiansen
- Listen to the Lambs ................ R. Nathaniel Dett
- Ballad of the Trees and the Master Philip James
- O God, Hear My Prayer ............ Alexandr Grechaninov

The 1929 European tour program reflected the best selections from previous years plus the addition of four Negro spirituals arranged by Hall Johnson and Frederick Hall. Williamson's increasing independence from Christiansen is indicated by the performance of only one piece by the latter. A selection arranged by William Arms Fisher entitled Going Home was included from the previous year. This piece, a vocal arrangement of the Largo from the New World Symphony by Dvořák, quickly became a favorite of the audiences and was included in many successive concerts.

27. The tour programs of the Westminster Choir from 1923 to 1934 are reprinted in Ibid., 534-540.

28. Although this particular selection was composed while Grechaninov lived in Russia, he moved to the United States in 1929 and gained citizenship in 1946. See Chapter Five.
The program for the 1934 Russian Tour included secular music for the first time because Williamson's tour manager successfully convinced him that the Russians wanted to hear such pieces. Secular numbers performed on the tour included arrangements of Negro songs such as St. Louis Blues, the cowboy song Whoopee-Ti-Yi-Yo, and the Song for Occupations by Roy Harris.

Programs for tours from 1938 to 1958 are similar to those performed during the 1930's. Additions were mostly arrangements of American folksongs and original works by American composers.

In 1932, Williamson relocated the school for the third time in its present location at Princeton, New Jersey. This location allowed the choir to utilize the new medium of radio broadcasting more effectively. From 1932 to 1940, the group made numerous broadcasts for the Educational Programs of the National Broadcasting Company, located in nearby New York City. These broadcasts reached audiences throughout the United States, South America, Mexico, and Canada. During World War II, the group participated in weekly broadcasts to South America, and during the 1940's and 1950's, made numerous broadcasts originating from Carnegie Hall.

The move to Princeton also provided the choir with a close proximity to two major symphony orchestras, the New York Philharmonic, and

29. For example, the 1949 program included Alleluia by Randall Thompson, Lost in the Night by F. Melius Christiansen, Hosanna by Norman Lockwood, and Tears by Roy Harris. A copy of this program is included in Wehr, 136.

30. Schisler, 183.
the Philadelphia Orchestra, along with a variety of smaller orchestras. Between the years 1934 and 1958, the year Williamson retired, the choir sang over forty different works with these orchestras in some 162 performances.\textsuperscript{31}

Recordings by the Westminster Choir were begun in 1925. Between 1934 and 1941, the group went to New York for eight different recording sessions. Radio broadcasts, concerts with symphony orchestras, and recordings all increased the fame of the school throughout the United States and beyond.

To expose a greater number of music directors to the Westminster Plan and to give them the opportunity to study and learn from Williamson personally, summer classes were begun in 1930.\textsuperscript{32} In the same year the summer schools began, Williamson initiated a two-day festival for the choirs themselves. The first festival, named in honor of Katharine Talbott, included some 3,000 singers representing forty-six churches in New York, Ohio, and Pennsylvania, who were all trained by Westminster students and graduates. The first day was given to the performance of unaccompanied choral works, ranging from Palestrina to Christiansen, and the second day was devoted to the singing of great hymns, arranged and orchestrated by David Hugh Jones, a Westminster faculty member. Two additional Talbott festivals were held in the summers of 1931 and 1932.\textsuperscript{33}

\textsuperscript{31} Wehr, 135.

\textsuperscript{32} Williamson had offered master classes in the summers intermittently from 1917. \textit{Ibid.}, 108.

\textsuperscript{33} Schisler, 117-122.
The Talbott festivals included performances of the *Mass in B Minor* by J. S. Bach, a tradition begun in 1931, plays by the drama class, a concert by "past, present, and future Westminster choirs," and a massed choir program of hymns and anthems conducted by Williamson. In 1938, the Talbott Festival was combined with the Contemporary American Music Festival, and in 1939, it was held at the World's Fair in New York, attracting choirs trained by Westminster graduates nationwide. The festivals were discontinued during the 1940's, but resumed in 1950.

The Contemporary American Festivals were held at Westminster during the years 1936 to 1938, under the direction of Roy Harris. The purpose was to encourage the composition of both choral and instrumental works by American composers. During the course of the three-year existence of the festival, forty-one choral and thirty-two instrumental pieces were performed.


---


Choir College entitled "The Westminster Choir College Library Series," begun in 1949 and edited by faculty member Normand Lockwood (1906– ), was taken over a year later by the Theodore Presser Company, which published seventy-five titles during the next seven years. All but nine of the titles were composed or arranged by alumni, faculty of the Westminster Choir College, or students of the summer schools. A fourth collection entitled "From the Library of John Finley Williamson" was published between 1961 and 1964 by Golden Music Publishers. This collection consisted of sixteen pieces selected by Williamson and edited by George Lynn, alumnus and former faculty member of Westminster Choir College. The sixteen pieces were drawn mostly from the Renaissance and Baroque eras.

During the second quarter of this century, the popularity of a cappella singing among American choral ensembles and the resulting increased composition of unaccompanied choral music was largely due to the performances of the Northwestern, St. Olaf, and Westminster College Choirs. The influence of these three groups continued for many years as the programs of their concerts were studied and imitated by the directors of both church and school choirs throughout the United States.

The Salt Lake Mormon Tabernacle Choir

On August 27, 1847, just twenty-nine days after the first group of Mormon pioneers led by Brigham Young arrived in the Salt Lake Valley,

36. The series, now edited by Westminster faculty member David Stanley York, was resumed by Theodore Presser in 1962. Wehr, 117.

37. The contents of these four series are included in Wehr, 260-265, and all except the series issued by Golden Music Publishers are contained in Schisler, 515-519.
a special conference was held during which a choir sang two hymns.\textsuperscript{38}

Thus began the evolution of one of the most famous and influential choral ensembles ever assembled in the United States—The Salt Lake Mormon Tabernacle Choir. During the first half of the twentieth century, the famed choir, with approximately 375 members, toured throughout the United States, sang weekly on the radio, and made several recordings. Undoubtedly, the performances of this volunteer organization served as a role model for church choirs throughout the country, both as a guide in selecting repertoire and as an example of good choral singing.

Initially organized to sing for worship services and special conferences, the choir has always been under the general direction of the Presidency of the Mormon Church, who also appoints its conductors. Membership in this group has always been voluntary, consisting of church members who work in and around Salt Lake.\textsuperscript{39} Although the ensemble has been partially reorganized from time to time, usually at the request of an incoming conductor, it has never been disbanded, thereby allowing a tradition of quality musical performances to be established.

The choir first performed outside the Salt Lake Tabernacle in 1862, and in the intervening century, has toured many times throughout the United States. One of the outstanding Eastern tours occurred in 1911, when the group traveled to New York for a ten-day engagement at

\textsuperscript{38} The following is drawn primarily from J. Spencer Cornwall, \textit{A Century of Singing: The Salt Lake Mormon Tabernacle Choir} (Salt Lake City, Utah: The Deseret Book Co., 1958), 1-250, and from Charles Jeffrey Caiman, \textit{The Mormon Tabernacle Choir} (New York: Harper and Row, 1979), 3-97.

\textsuperscript{39} Auditions were not required until 1916. Cornwall, 10.
Madison Square Garden. The return trip was highlighted by a concert at the White House for President and Mrs. William H. Taft. Concert tours to the west coast have been enhanced by two appearances at the Hollywood Bowl—in 1926 and 1941. Throughout its history, the choir has sung for non-church-related events, some of the most notable including concerts for the Ford Motor Company's national expositions in 1934 and 1935. One of the most significant tours occurred in 1955 when the entire organization toured Europe as missionaries for the church.

Because of its size, the ensemble has always produced acute technical challenges when recorded. The choir has therefore had the unusual privilege of initiating many new technical devices or processes as these were developed by the American recording industry. The first recording was made on September 1, 1910, by the Columbia Phonograph Company of New York City, a forerunner of Columbia Records, with subsequent recordings throughout the first half of this century. In 1929, Earl J. Glade, founder and manager of Salt Lake's pioneer radio station KSL, suggested to officials of the National Broadcasting Company, with which his station was affiliated, that the choir be featured in a network broadcast. Although some officials of the choir feared that the sound might not be accurately reproducible, the first national broadcast took place on Monday, July 15, 1929, from 3:00 to 3:30 p.m. In 1932, station KSL and the choir's broadcasts were assumed by the Columbia Broadcasting System. Today, the weekly broadcast is the oldest continuous radio program on national network. The weekly broadcast,

40. The thirty-minute program is currently carried by 570 radio and television stations in the United States and is heard in many other parts of the world via tape recordings. Calman, 184.
entitled "Music and the Spoken Word," is divided into three sections with music by the choir assuming approximately one-half of the radio time. Choral music for the program consists entirely of inspirational, but not always sacred music. Most sacred compositions are written by Protestant composers, and each broadcast includes a hymn, which by adding or deleting a verse, serves to control the air time. Only this hymn plus the opening and closing themes are constant from week to week. The selection of music for each program is usually made by either the conductor or the assistant conductor.\textsuperscript{41} Through these weekly radio and later television broadcasts, the Mormon Tabernacle Choir of Salt Lake has not only promoted the singing of American anthems but has also been a key force in preserving the entire choral tradition in American churches during this century.

\textbf{The Collegiate Chorale}

While visiting the campus of Pomona College, Claremont, California, in the spring of 1937, Fred Waring, the famous creator and director of "Fred Waring and the Pennsylvanians," observed a student, Robert Shaw, conduct the campus glee club and was so taken with the young man's ability that he offered him a position with the Pennsylvanians. Shaw was to organize and train a special glee club of twenty young men for a new radio series scheduled to begin the following October.\textsuperscript{42}

\textsuperscript{41. Ibid.}

\textsuperscript{42. The following information is drawn largely from Joseph A. Mussulman, \textit{Dear People... Robert Shaw} (Bloomington, Indiana: Indiana University Press, 1979), 3-112, and from Michael Steinberg, "Shaw, Robert (Lawson)," \textit{The New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians} (London: Macmillan, 1980), XVII, 235.}
Shaw entered college with aspirations of becoming a minister like his father, but instead was attracted to the performance of sacred music. He did not become actively involved in this pursuit until 1941, when Gordon Berger, who had organized a community choir of some sixty young singers at New York's Marble Collegiate Church, asked Shaw to guest conduct one selection at a rehearsal of the new group. Berger easily persuaded Shaw to become the official conductor of the choir, which was named the "Collegiate Chorale," in honor of the church where it met to rehearse. The first official public performance of the Collegiate Chorale took place at the Riverside Congregational Church on Sunday, March 8, 1942. Rehearsing two nights per week—one night on the music to be performed, the other on developing musical skills through classes and lectures—the Chorale performed a wide variety of sacred musical programs with increasing frequency. Specializing in the performance of larger choral works from the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries and an increasing number of major contemporary choral works, the choir often collaborated with major American orchestras.

Although the repertory of the ensemble did not include a significant number of anthems, the influence of Shaw and this ensemble on the performance of American church music was significant. During the decade of the 1940's, the group had achieved national recognition, but the war years demanded the resignation of so many members that new singers

43. In 1938, Shaw conducted Waring's Glee Club in a single concert of sacred music at the Riverside Congregational Church, and in the fall of 1941, he conducted a mixed ensemble of twenty-five singers in a single concert of sacred music at a New York hotel. Musselman, 6, 20.
were constantly sought. An annual turnover of forty to fifty percent of the organization created room for choral musicians from across the country who joined the choir for a season or two, then left to establish their own choirs and reproduce the high calibre of choral singing to which they had been exposed.

In 1948, Shaw assembled thirty singers, who were mostly members of the Collegiate Chorale, and a pianist to produce a nine-week television series. Under the name "The Robert Shaw Chorale," the ensemble sang half-hour programs consisting of madrigals, hymns, Bach chorales, Brahms part-songs, Broadway show tunes, folksongs, and spirituals. Shaw remained as conductor of the Collegiate Chorale until 1954, when the severity of the Robert Shaw Chorale's touring schedule necessitated his resignation.
Chapter IV

ANTHEMS BY PROMINENT MUSIC EDUCATORS

No group of people took a more active role in the development of the anthem in America during the first half of this century than did those composers who taught in the institutions of higher learning. All of those discussed in this chapter either directed or accompanied choral ensembles in their schools, and as a result, were especially abreast of current trends in choral music. They all wrote for their own choirs, but for different reasons. For example, the anthems of F. Melius Christiansen, many of which were composed early in the century, supplied a good part of the basic repertory of the then newly formed St. Olaf Choir. For others, however, such as Carl F. Mueller and Noble Cain, who were writing during the height of the choral renaissance, it may have been as much the desire for recognition as a composer as it was the necessity of providing suitable literature that prompted their voluminous outpourings.

The trend toward the composition of sacred rather than secular choral music was established by such as Christiansen and John Finley Williamson, who worked in church-related colleges where sacred music was emphasized. Even though most of the composers discussed in this chapter also served churches as ministers of music, it is likely that their associations with the educational institutions played a more significant role in both the calibre and the volume of their publications,
for here they probably discovered an acceptance of innovations and a quality of choral ensemble that was often not to be found in their churches.

During the late nineteenth century, the study of music in American high schools consisted largely of developing the ability to sight-read. Though not an end in itself, the acquisition of this skill enabled students to sing music of such substance that, around the turn of the century, performances of both oratorios and secular cantatas by newly formed choral ensembles were possible.\(^1\) In the years before the first World War, the most common musical activity in American high schools consisted of weekly assemblies during which all of the students engaged in choral singing.\(^2\) These gatherings were mainly for the enjoyment and exposure to music, rather than the preparation of music for performance, but by 1920, many of the required assembly choruses had been replaced with elective choruses created to perform oratorios and other major choral works.\(^3\)

In some schools, the larger choruses were supplemented with additional choral organizations, called "glee clubs," that consisted of selected students who were willing to devote time to musical activity outside the school curriculum. Separate boys' and girls' glee

---


3. Ibid., 154.
clubs usually rehearsed one hour per week after school, and they sang for both civic and church functions. In addition to performing a variety of both sacred and secular pieces, the separate glee clubs were combined on occasion to sing lighter operettas, a practice that was to be regretted by many choral directors, for the performances of operettas by the glee clubs began to replace the performances of oratorios by the larger choruses during the early 1920's.

Fortunately, during the third decade, a number of state choral organizations initiated vocal contests after the manner of existing instrumental festivals. As the competition between choirs intensified, many directors prepared for these contests by forming a new mixed glee club of their best singers. To illustrate the ability of these new mixed ensembles, selections that were designed to be sung without accompaniment were included in their repertory. As the skill of the new choirs increased, the number of unaccompanied selections soon outweighed those requiring accompaniment, and some organizations drew attention to this feature by changing the designation "glee club" to "a cappella choir."

During the 1930's, the educational experience of many high school students was shortened by the Depression and later on by the war. Yet, both mixed glee clubs and more importantly a cappella choirs

4. Richard Kegerreis notes that in some midwestern high schools, the glee clubs provided the only choral ensembles. Ibid., 163.

5. Ibid., 160.

6. Davis, 76.
flourished during this time. Beginning about 1925, performances by new a cappella choirs at the national conferences of music educators showed an increasing use of sacred music by these groups—in some cases to the exclusion of all secular music.\(^7\) Their repertory frequently paralleled that of the St. Olaf Choir,\(^8\) consisting largely of the choral works of F. Melius Christiansen, the unaccompanied works of the European masters from the sixteenth through the eighteenth centuries, and examples of anthems in the Russian style.

According to Joseph Mussulman, by the early 1940's, nearly two hundred college-level music departments had been established in the United States, most of them since the turn of the century.\(^9\) Many colleges and universities offered degrees in performance and music education as well as classes in composition. Moreover, a number of music conservatories, based on European methods, had been created by individual benefactors. This growth in college-level music education owed much to the organization of the first collegiate a cappella choirs at Northwestern University, St. Olaf College, and Westminster Choir College during the

---

7. An examination of concert programs presented at the annual conferences of the Music Supervisors National Conference and the Music Teachers' National Association reveals that in some schools with both an a cappella choir and glee clubs, the glee clubs sang only secular music. See, for example, the program of the Wichita High School Choral Organizations presented at the Southwestern Conference of the Music Supervisors National Conference. "Southwestern Music Supervisors Conference," *Journal of the Proceedings of the Music Supervisors National Conference* (1929), 299.

8. For a history of this choir, see Chapter Three.

first three decades and to the corresponding establishment of music departments at each of these three institutions. In addition to popularizing the medium of a cappella singing, from which the high school music directors drew their inspiration, the conductors of the Northwestern University and St. Olaf choirs, Peter Christian Lutkin and F. Melius Christiansen, added new material to the ever-growing body of anthem literature.

Peter Christian Lutkin

Peter Christian Lutkin (1858-1931), the founder and first dean of the Northwestern University School of Music, began his musical career at age ten as an alto soloist for the Episcopal Cathedral in Chicago.

Beginning in 1879, he taught piano for two years at Northwestern University, Evanston, Illinois, and from 1881 to 1884, he studied piano, theory, and organ in Europe. Returning to Chicago, he assumed the duties of organist first at the St. Clement's Church, from 1884 to 1891, and

10. In her master's thesis of 1934, Ruth Steese surveyed 226 American colleges and universities concerning their choral organizations and discovered that forty-eight percent of the choral groups initiated between 1927 and 1932 were a cappella choirs. Ruth Zimmerman Steese, "Choral Music in American Colleges" (unpublished master's thesis, Eastman School of Music, 1934), 9.

then at the St. James Church, from 1891 to 1897. In the same year that he began at St. James', he also accepted a position on the faculty of Northwestern, where he succeeded to the post of dean of the School of Music in 1895. The following year, he was instrumental in founding a chapter of the American Guild of Organists at Northwestern, and his accomplishments were recognized with the awarding of an honorary doctorate in music from Syracuse University in 1900. Lutkin was active in the Music Teachers' National Association, for which he wrote numerous articles and papers and served as president in 1911 and 1920. In 1908, he presented a series of lectures at Western Theological Seminary in Chicago that were compiled and published in 1910 as Music in the Church. In addition to his numerous anthems and services, Lutkin also served as an editor for the Methodist Sunday School Hymnal (1905) and the Episcopal Church Hymnal (1918).

Of his presumed many anthems, probably none is better known than the short choral benediction The Lord Bless You and Keep You. For the most part, the body of this anthem is constructed homophonically and utilizes diatonic chords that include leaps and chromatic writing reminiscent of the compositions of Horatio Parker (Example 42). Above all, the popularity of this piece rests on the concluding sevenfold amen. By skillfully combining melodic imitation, smooth conjunct sequence


13. A bibliography of Lutkin's compositions was unavailable.

patterns, and chordal progressions that abound with major, minor, and diminished sevenths, Lutkin produced an anthem that has survived until this day as the concluding piece at many worship services and choral concerts (Example 43).

F. Melius Christiansen

Perhaps the most significant contribution to the repertory of the American anthem was made by F. Melius Christiansen (1871–1955), who came to the United States from his native land of Norway in 1888.  

15. The following biographical material is condensed from Leola Nelson Bergmann, Music Master of the Middle West: The Story of F. Melius Christiansen and the St. Olaf Choir (Minneapolis: The University of Minnesota Press, 1944), 25-84.
Example 43. Peter C. Lutkin. The Lord Bless You and Keep You
(Clayton F. Summy, no. 1089), measures 14-23.
Christiansen desired to become a concert violinist and, upon arriving in America, attempted to support himself by securing positions as a church organist and as a private teacher of violin. He was unsuccessful in these early attempts, and as a result, held several odd jobs as a laborer during the following two years. In 1890, he moved to Marionette, Wisconsin, where he was hired to conduct a Scandinavian band and subsequently to play the organ and direct the choir at Our Savior's Lutheran Church. Christiansen resigned both positions in 1892 and moved to Minneapolis to attend Augsburg Seminary. The following year, he left the seminary and enrolled at Northwestern Conservatory of Music, also in Minneapolis, from which he graduated in 1894. During the next three years, Christiansen sang with a male quartet from the seminary, directed a choir at the Trinity Lutheran Church in Minneapolis, and taught private lessons in violin. In 1897, after recently marrying, he left Minneapolis with his bride and traveled to Leipzig, Germany, where he studied composition and violin at the Royal Conservatory. Receiving his diploma in 1899, Christiansen and his wife returned to Minneapolis, where he supported his family by teaching private lessons and concertizing. In 1903, Christiansen left Minneapolis a final time and moved to the small community of Northfield to join the faculty of St. Olaf College. 16

Christiansen's compositions and arrangements fall into three major categories: large works, works in several movements, and small

16. For further information concerning Christiansen and the establishment of the St. Olaf Choir, see Chapter Three.
The large works include *The Prodigal Son*, *The Reformation Cantata*, and the *Centennial Cantata*, all of which were written between 1917 and 1925, the middle years of Christiansen's compositional life. The sixteen segments of the oratorio *The Prodigal Son* (1918) are written for SATB chorus; women's chorus; soprano, alto, tenor, and baritone soloists; organ and orchestra. These portions are cast into two parts, which are separated by a sermon, and their text is drawn entirely from the scriptures. *The Reformation Cantata* was composed for the celebration of the 1917 merger of three Lutheran synods into the Norwegian Lutheran Church. It is scored for a large ensemble consisting of male, female, and mixed choruses; solos for soprano, tenor, and baritone; and orchestral accompaniment. The audience is invited to participate in the last of the eleven numbers, and unlike the preceding work, there is no sermon. *The Centennial Cantata* was written for the 1925 commemoration of Norwegians in America. Its ten selections include many of the same features as the previous example, with the addition of a sermon.

The works in several movements were composed at a slightly later time period and include *Psalm 50* (1922), *Celestial Spring* (1930), and *From Grief to Glory* (1936). Scored for unaccompanied divided choirs, these three pieces, which according to Richard Hanson, include some of

17. This particular categorization is adapted from Richard David Hanson, "An Analysis of Selected Choral Works of F. Melius Christiansen" (unpublished Ed.D. dissertation, University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign, 1970), 290.

18. Leola Bergmann disagrees saying that another cantata *Store ting har Herren gjort* (Wondrous Things the Lord Hath Done, 1916) was written by Christiansen for the 1917 event. Bergmann, 182-183.
Christiansen's finest efforts, are more challenging to perform than the larger works. The three movements of Psalm 50 are set to the scriptural text. For both Celestial Spring and From Grief to Glory, Christiansen composed the music before their Norwegian texts, which depict a pantheistic theology, were translated. He then commissioned Oscar R. Overby, a friend and textual collaborator, to supply English versions. Both of these pieces consist of four movements. Those of Celestial Spring are thematically related in the form of a song-cycle, but those of From Grief to Glory bear no musical connection.

The third and largest category consists of small choral works that were composed between 1906 and 1946. Included here are Christiansen's anthems, many of which were either written or arranged for the then newly formed St. Olaf Choir. A number of these pieces were set initially to Norwegian texts and only later translated into English. Among the works of this group are found original compositions, arrangements based on folksongs, and arrangements based on chorale tunes.

One of Christiansen's most beautiful original compositions is a Christmas anthem entitled Lullaby on Christmas Eve. Christiansen first published the melody in 1906 as a violin and vocal solo. It reappeared many years later reshaped as a piece to be sung by the St. Olaf Choir at the college Christmas Festival. For this choral version, Overby supplied

19. Hanson, 295.
21. F. Melius Christiansen, Vuggesang om Julekvelden (Kristiania, 1906), cited in Hanson, 201.
an English translation of a Norwegian poem by Albert J. Lange. Christiansen used only the first and last of its three stanzas in his modified-strophic design.

Written for a cappella choir, the anthem is actually a soprano solo with vocal accompaniment. The effect of a lullaby is created by the recurring rhythmic pattern \( \frac{3}{4} \) \( \frac{3}{4} \), set in a compound meter, and what starts out as a rather dull diatonic harmonic setting over a pedal bass is retrieved through the use of numerous chromatic chords (Example 44). Voice parts are generally conjunct, and there is an occasional use of imitation in the predominantly homophonic setting. Text painting is found in measures thirty-one and thirty-two, in which the choir imitates the ringing of Christmas Eve bells (Example 45).

As was mentioned above, Christiansen's interest in folksongs and chorale tunes dated back to his second sojourn in Leipzig (1906-1907), where he reharmonized forty-four pieces for his choir back home. One of the most famous of those arrangements based on folksongs, is Beautiful Savior. This anthem was one of those originally sung by the choir in Norwegian as a part of the Sang Gudstjeneate and has been performed by the group nearly every year since 1913. First published in 1919, the piece has sold over one million copies and has been recorded extensively. Based on a twelfth-century Silesian folk tune, the strophic anthem is composed for eight-part a cappella choir and alto solo. Voice parts move conjunctly for the most part, with ascending and descending passing tones, neighboring tones, and suspensions adding harmonic interest. No modulations occur, but the listener's interest is retained by the variation in the vocal textures used for each stanza. Christiansen creates a warm, rich texture in the opening stanza by duplicating the four-part chords of the women's voices an octave lower in the men's parts. There is no text here, only the inscription con bocca chiusa. The melody is given to the first altos-baritones and accompanied by a sweeping countermelody scored for the first soprano-first tenor combination. For the second stanza, the

22. See Chapter Three.
23. Augsburg, 1919, no. 76.
24. See Chapter Three.
women's voices are omitted, except for a solo alto who sings the text. The men continue to hum a chordal accompaniment to which a second countermelody is given, this time to the baritones. The hushed mood of the previous stanzas is replaced in the final stanza with a resonant sonority created by assigning the text to all voice parts and the melody to unison women (Example 46). Olaf C. Christiansen, a son of F. Melius, revised

Example 46. F. Melius Christiansen, Beautiful Savior (Augsburg, no. 51), measures 31-38.

the original arrangement in 1955 to incorporate certain changes, specifically a reassignment of the key from D-flat major to D major and a shortening of the coda, which reflected an alteration that the choir had gradually made through its successive performances.
Of Christiansen's arrangements based on chorale tunes, one of the most popular is *Lamb of God*, the melody of which dates from 1540. Except for the final four measures, polyphonic writing is used consistently throughout the piece. The chorale tune is set in the soprano voice, and the other parts are woven into a contrapuntal accompaniment beneath it. The text is abbreviated by the lower parts in the first section, but it is utilized almost entirely by these voices in the second half of the through-composed anthem.

Although imitation is found throughout the piece, it is used most effectively at the beginning of the second half on the text "Our sins by Thee were taken" (Example 47). Overlapping cadences and suspensions created by conjunct motion in all voice parts work together to add interest to the ponderous diatonic harmonization.


26. Augsburg, 1933, no. 11-0133.
Second Generation A Cappella Composers

During the third and fourth decades, the original repertory of the St. Olaf Choir was faithfully continued by many graduates of the school who secured positions as choral directors in high schools, churches, and other Lutheran colleges throughout the country. At the same time, the exposure to Christiansen inspired other graduates to continue the a cappella tradition in their own works. An example of the latter is Morten J. Luvaas (1896-1973), the well-known editor of the Allegheny Choral Series. After graduating from St. Olaf College, Luvaas became interested in choral composition and arranging while teaching high school in Erie, Pennsylvania; failing to find suitable music for his choir, he began to compose. In 1930, he became the director of the Allegheny College Choir in Meadville, Pennsylvania, a position he retained until his retirement in 1965.

Like his teacher, Luvaas added many examples to the repertory of a cappella anthems. His work is characterized by homophonic choral writing, which occasionally includes subtle text or mood painting. An

27. In his examination of selected concert programs of Lutheran colleges from 1921 to 1941, Paul Neve has clearly shown that Christiansen's compositions and arrangements became a staple for Lutheran choral programs during those years. Paul Edmund Neve, "The Contribution of the Lutheran College Choirs to Music in America" (unpublished D.S.M. dissertation, Union Theological Seminary, 1967), 143-203.

28. The series is published by the Neil A. Kjos Company.

29. Neve, 89.
example of such text painting is found in the Christmas anthem *Sweetly Angel Choirs are Singing*, in which a series of major and minor triads and their inversions are repeated, creating the effect of ringing bells (Example 48). Another more subtle example of the same technique is


---

found in *O Sing Unto Him* where, in the opening section, a triplet figure is tossed back and forth between voice parts as they exclaim "O Sing Unto Him, Ye Nations of Earth." Midway through the anthem, the men and altos solemnly intone "If lonely the road, if heavy thy load" to which the sopranos joyfully reply "The Master is ever beside

---

30. C. C. Birchard, 1938, no. 1283.
31. C. C. Birchard, 1940, no. 1355.
thee." Their triplet response, contrasted with the preceding stolid quarter notes, subtly unifies the piece by recalling the optimism of the opening section (Example 49).


As editor of the Allegheny Choral Series, Luvaas arranged a number of sacred folksongs for choir. In these pieces, both diatonic harmonizations and irregular phrasing caused by phrase extensions are common. A more unusual example is *Christ Has Arisen*, which is based on a twelfth-century folksong. Written for a cappella choir, the anthem consists of two complete stanzas. The first stanza is designed for full choir and uses polyphonic writing throughout. The second

stanza is given to unison children's choir, with repetitions and extensions added by the full choir. A short transition based on the opening melody leads to a concluding statement that is constructed of a two-part canon at the fifth and that utilizes both a new melody and a new meter (Example 50).

Leland B. Sateren (1913- ) is an example of the many Lutheran composers who continued the a cappella tradition in other Lutheran colleges.33 In 1935, he received his undergraduate degree from Augsburg College, Minneapolis, Minnesota. Upon graduation, Sateren accepted a position as director of public school music in Moose Lake, Minnesota, where, during his three-year tenure, a fire destroyed the music library. Denied the funds to purchase new music, Sateren began to compose. In 1943, he received a master's degree from the University of Minnesota, and in 1946, he joined the faculty of his alma mater, Augsburg College, where he directed the famous Augsburg College Choir. He was named chairman of the Music Department in 1950, a position he held until his retirement in 1978. Sateren is credited with some three hundred compositions, nearly all of which use religious texts. Additionally, he prepared several introits and graduals for a collection of contemporary service music issued by the Augsburg Publishing House.


Andante $d' \approx 132$

Now and in e-ter-ni-ty, Now and in e-ter-ni-ty, Com-fort and our joy is He. Hal-le-lu-ia! Hal-le-lu-ia!

Com-fort and our joy is He. Hal-le-lu-ia! Hal-le-lu-ia!

Now and in e-ter-ni-ty, Now and in e-ter-ni-ty, Com-fort and our joy is He. Hal-le-lu-ia! Hal-le-lu-ia!

Com-fort and our joy is He. Hal-le-lu-ia! Hal-le-lu-ia! Hal-le-lu-ia!

Com-fort and our joy is He. Hal-le-lu-ia! Hal-le-lu-ia! Hal-le-lu-ia!
Sateren's anthems display some techniques that make them noteworthy. By the frequent use of homophonic passages, which include unison to eight-part writing, he produces a variety of strong choral sonorities. Most of the anthems involve some modulation to the relative key, and they include irregular phrasing created by changing meters. Like Luvaas, he incorporates subtle text painting into his compositions. For example, in *Grieve Not the Holy Spirit*, he strategically introduces the interval of the minor second at various pitch levels to illustrate the text from Ephesians 4:31, "Let all bitterness and wrath and anger and clamor and evil speaking be put away from you, with all malice" (Example 51). The following verse of scripture, "Be ye kind


one to another tenderhearted, forgiving one another... (verse 32),
is then set in consonant harmonies over a soothing, rhythmical pedal
bass (Example 52).

Example 52. Leland B. Sateren, Grieve Not the Holy Spirit (B. F.
Wood, no. 670), measures 46-49.

![Musical notation]

Although John Finley Williamson did not compose anthems him-
selves, he influenced a number of composers who did. One of the best-
known of these is David Hugh Jones, a student of T. Tertius Noble.
Jones was hired to play the organ at the Westminster Presbyterian Church
of Dayton, Ohio, in 1925, one year prior to the opening of the choir
school, where he served on the faculty. In the fall of 1926, when the
Westminster Choir went on tour, Jones remained in Dayton to direct the

35. For a discussion of Williamson's editions, see Chapter Three.
music in the church. During this time, he composed three anthems, one of which was entitled *God Is a Spirit*. Upon his return, Williamson taught the new piece to the choir, and when Katharine Talbott, the choir's primary benefactor, heard the anthem, she was easily persuaded to supply the funds needed to send Jones abroad for further study.

The anthem, constructed in a binary form and written for eight-part a cappella choir, displays Jones' ability to create musical interest through a variety of choral effects. The conjunct melodic line of the first part, sung by the basses, is accompanied by a humming chorus of varying voice combinations, producing an unusual, ethereal effect. In the first two phrases, the bass is doubled at the unison and in thirds by the humming tenors (Example 53). The second part is skillfully constructed in a four-voice fugato that concludes homophonically with a series of eight-part chords. Harmonizations are diatonic and include no modulations.

A graduate of Westminster Choir College during Williamson's administration and one who has also made noteworthy contributions to American anthem literature is George Lynn (1915- ). In addition

36. C. C. Birchard, 1928, no. 546.


to completing a bachelor's degree at Westminster Choir College in 1938, Lynn received a master's degree from Princeton University and an honorary doctorate from Harding College. From 1945 to 1950, having returned to Westminster, he served as associate conductor of the Westminster Choir. During the following years, he taught at the University of Colorado in Boulder, and he served as organist-choirmaster in several churches in Denver, where he also established the Golden Music Publishers. Returning again to Westminster in 1963, he was named professor of conducting and director of the Westminster Symphonic Choir. One year later, he became the conductor of the famed Westminster Choir, a position he held until 1969, when he resigned from the college and
returned to Denver to resume activities in composition and church music. He is currently a faculty member at Loretto Heights College, Denver.  

Lynn provided many examples of choral arrangements and, like his teacher, Williamson, editions of earlier works. In 1945, he published a free paraphrase of the hymn *Pass Me Not, O Gentle Savior* for SATB a cappella choir. By introducing accidentals and non-functional chords throughout the piece, Lynn produces a harmonization that obscures the tonality of the piece at certain points (Example 54). Conjunct motion along with a frequent use of imitation in all voice parts characterizes this most unusual hymn arrangement. The tonal complexities of this anthem limit its use to choral groups consisting of better musicians.

For the 1949-50 concert tour of the Westminster Choir, Lynn, who was then associate conductor, arranged the Negro spiritual *Lonesome Valley*. This arrangement subsequently became one of the initial publications of the "Westminster Choir College Library," a series for which Lynn contributed a number of arrangements and modern editions of earlier works. Written for a cappella choir, the anthem is actually a solo with choral accompaniment. Although the harmony in this piece is strictly conventional, interest is created in the vocal accompaniment, which contains fragments of the text set rhythmically to contrast the flowing solo line (Example 55).


41. Theodore Presser, 1950, no. 312-40062.

While on others Thou art smiling,

Humble, humble cry,

Hear my humble, humble cry,

Hear my humble, humble cry,

While on others Thou art smiling,

Do not —
The anthems and arrangements of Luvaas, Sateren, Jones, and Lynn were not only important contributions to the a cappella repertory of their particular choirs, but they served to spread the a cappella tradition established by their predecessors. For a number of years, through the late 1930's and into the 1940's and beyond, their works were performed repeatedly by many choirs performing in secular as well as sacred institutions throughout the country.

Clarence Dickinson

Hailed as the "dean of American church musicians,"\(^{42}\) Clarence Dickinson (1875-1969) held the position of organist-choirmaster in several churches, while at the same time, he achieved national recognition

\(^{42}\) "Dr. Clarence Dickinson Recovering from Illness," *The Diapason* XLIX (March 1, 1958), 1.
as a music educator. In addition to composing and editing a wealth of church music, he performed as a concert organ recitalist for a time, and at his death, he held the distinction of being the last surviving founder of the American Guild of Organists.

Dickinson began his formal education in music in the United States first at Miami University, Oxford, Ohio, and then at Northwestern University, Evanston, Illinois (1890-1894). Traveling to Europe, he studied piano, organ, and composition in Berlin and Paris. Upon his return to the United States, he was appointed organist at the Patrician Unitarian Church in Chicago and subsequently as organist-choirmaster at the St. James Episcopal Church in that same city. In 1909, he moved to New York City, where he assumed the same post at the Brick Presbyterian Church, a position he held for fifty years.

Three years after arriving in New York, Dickinson was also appointed organist-choirmaster at Union Theological Seminary, where he taught courses in the history of sacred music and in composition. In 1928, he founded the School of Sacred Music there and served as its director until 1945.


44. Specific dates for these occurrences were unavailable.
Dickinson was well-known as a concert organist and maintained this reputation by means of the many recitals he gave throughout the country for nearly seventy years. In addition to composing and arranging numerous single works for organ, he edited the *Historical Recital Series for Organ*, a series that served for many years to educate organists as well as influence their musical taste. With his wife, Helen, whom he met in Europe and married in 1904, he wrote a pedagogical manual for organists that was reissued many times, a music history textbook, a series of complete worship services, and numerous anthems. Dickinson is best remembered for his arrangements of folk hymns and anthems from foreign countries, for which his wife often provided English translations. The Dickersons devoted some forty summers traveling throughout the world in search of undiscovered texts and melodies for their anthems. Many of their arrangements were published either individually or in collections by the H. W. Gray Company.


46. Gotwals, 429.


Of Dickinson's original choral works, one of the most frequently performed is the Christmas anthem *The Shepherds' Story*. Scored for a cappella choir in eight parts, the anthem bears a stylistic resemblance to those pieces in the then current Russian style. The spectacular opening fanfare on the text "Nowell" suggests both the mood and the technical difficulty of this piece (Example 56). Unaccompanied solo passages and solo passages accompanied by a cappella choral parts that consist of intricate melodic and rhythmic passages clearly earmark this anthem for the trained ensemble (Example 57).


51. H. W. Gray, 1913, S.C. 30. Interestingly, the text of this piece is adapted from the traditional English carol *Masters in This Hall.*
Jesus, Refuge of the Weary, a choral arrangement based on an ancient Florentine melody, clearly displays Dickinson's ability to compose accompanying vocal parts in such a manner that the melody is featured constantly. Much of the piece is written for solo voice or unison choir with organ accompaniment. In those passages written for full choir, Dickinson highlights the melody by scoring the accompanying voices in their lower, softer registers (Example 58). Fragments of the


52. H. W. Gray, 1946, no. 240.
melody are set off imitatively in the organ introduction and later inverted in the organ interludes between verses (Examples 58, 59, and 60).


Van Denman Thompson (1890-1969) was a member of the faculty of DePauw University, Greencastle, Indiana, from 1911 to 1956. He was musically educated at Colby Junior College and at the New England Conservatory of Music, where he completed his study and graduated in one year. During his career, he also undertook post-graduate study

---

at Harvard University and at the New England Conservatory. In 1928, he became minister of music at the Gobin Memorial Methodist Church, and from 1937 until his retirement in 1956, he was dean of the School of Music at DePauw. He taught organ at the university, and although he did not tour as a concert artist, he was considered by many of his students to be one of the finest organists in the United States. Thompson's playing for Sunday afternoon vespers at DePauw was once cited in a survey of the student body as the "single feature of campus life that was most religiously inspiring."\textsuperscript{54}

Thompson possessed the ability to write convincingly for audiences with differing levels of musical appreciation. As a result, his anthems were published by a variety of music publishers. At one extreme, he was a regular contributor to the Lorenz magazine and oratorio series,\textsuperscript{55} while at the other, he ventured boldly into more contemporary styles, providing material for such sophisticated publishing houses as the G. Schirmer and H. W. Gray Companies.

\textsuperscript{54} Charles Huddleston Heaton, "In Memoriam," \textit{The Diapason} LX (February 1, 1969), 14.

\textsuperscript{55} Begun in 1894 by its founder Edmund S. Lorenz (1854-1942), the Lorenz publishing company became one of the leading publishing houses to furnish a selection of monthly periodicals containing choral literature that was suitable for a variety of abilities and styles. Since its founding, a total of five magazines, including \textit{The Choir Leader}, \textit{The Choir Herald}, \textit{The Quarterly Anthem Folio}, \textit{The Younger Choir}, and \textit{The Volunteer Choir}, have been published by this company. These magazines contained not only music but also essays and helpful tips on any number of subjects relating to the practice of church music. There is much evidence suggesting that many composers writing for these publications did so by using compositional formulas; nevertheless, these monthly magazines are noteworthy because they provided the entire repertory for many choirs in small churches who were often afflicted with small music budgets or with poorly trained music directors. Elwyn A. Wienandt and Robert H. Young, \textit{The Anthem in England and America} (New York: The Free Press, 1970), 314-326.
Thompson's anthems were among the most popular published by Lorenz and were therefore performed frequently for many years. Many of these pieces contain thick organ parts that are used to supplement the rather simple choral sections. An example, *Hymn to the Trinity*,\(^{56}\) includes certain characteristics which are typical of his Lorenz pieces: unison writing, regular phrases, and homophonic choral settings, all of which are supported by a diatonic harmonic framework (Example 61). This

Example 61. Van Denman Thompson, *Hymn to the Trinity* (Lorenz, no. 9578-20), measures 1-15.

\[\text{With spirit } \frac{d}{d} = 108\]

\[\text{Come, thou almighty King,} \quad \text{Help us thy name to sing,}\]

\[\text{Come, thou almighty King,} \quad \text{Help us thy name to sing,}\]
is not to imply, however, that such predictability indicates a lack of musical value in these anthems. For example, melodic unification is skillfully achieved in *Oh, For a Thousand Tongues to Sing*, in which the organ interlude at measures twenty and twenty-one (Example 62)

Example 62. Van Denman Thompson, *Oh, For a Thousand Tongues to Sing* (Lorenz, no. 9705-2), measures 20-21.

Later becomes a memorable women's descant that is used to bring the piece to a rousing conclusion. Modulations enliven the diatonic framework of this anthem (Example 63), while a cappella choral sections add a spark of enthusiasm to the pervading homophony of the piece.

In 1932, G. Schirmer introduced Thompson’s new anthem entitled *Mercy and Truth*. Adapted from the book of Psalms, the piece is scored for an unaccompanied ensemble of eight voices. Flowing, somewhat aimless conjunct melodic lines suggest that the piece may have been initially conceived for organ, then transcribed for voices. Common characteristics of irregular phrasing and temporary modulations to new keys are seen in the first phrase, in which the key is shifted from the tonic to the submediant major within three measures (Example 64). Pedal points establish an harmonic focus that permits some chordal experimentation including short examples of quartal harmonies.

58. G. Schirmer, 1932, no. 7665.
Example 64. Van Denman Thompson, *Mercy and Truth* (G. Schirmer, no. 7665), measures 1-7.

Rather fast; flexibly

Mercy and truth have met together;

Mercy and truth have met together;

Mercy and truth have met together;

Mercy and truth have met together;

Righteousness and peace have kissed each other.

Righteousness and peace have kissed each other.

Righteousness and peace have kissed each other.

Righteousness and peace have kissed each other.
During the same year, G. Schirmer also published Thompson's *Dear Lord, Who Once Upon the Lake*, which reflects even more experimentation. Diminished chords, ninths, and quartal harmonizations are used to create the mystical musical setting needed to express Theodore Pease's poetic text. Unlike the choral parts in the Lorenz publications, the choral parts in this piece move independently and incorporate a good deal of chromaticism and non-harmonic tones. The organ accompaniment wanders somewhat aimlessly through the interludes between choral sections, which like those in the previous example, appear to have been written first for organ, then transcribed for choir (Example 65).

The significance of Thompson's contribution to the development of the anthem resulted from his ability to provide literature for such widely differing markets. No doubt this versatility was financially profitable for him; however, it seems that those who subscribed to publications of such as the Lorenz Company were the true benefactors. Literature intended for inexperienced ensembles is often shunned by the finer composers and left for those who write by formulas with little creativity or skill. By comparison, Thompson provided some fine music for American church choirs that is still sung today.

**Carl F. Mueller**

With over 300 original compositions and arrangements, many of which were issued in series by the G. Schirmer, Carl Fischer, and Harold Flammer Publishing Companies, Carl F. Mueller (1892— ) was one of the

59. G. Schirmer, 1932, no. 7666.
Example 65. Van Denman Thompson, *Dear Lord, Who Once Upon the Lake* (G. Schirmer, no. 7666), measures 32-38.

Let that calm our bosoms fill.
most prolific contributors to American anthem literature during the first half of this century. In light of his voluminous output, it is interesting to note that he began his career not as a composer, but as an organ recitalist. It was apparently after studying choral directing with John Finley Williamson in 1927 that he became seriously interested in choral composition. Mueller's compositions can be grouped into three periods, two of which coincide with the time frame of this study. From 1926 to 1938, his first compositional period, Mueller attended vocal camps offered by Williamson at the Westminster Choir College, and from 1928 to 1954, he was director of music at Montclair State College, Montclair, New Jersey, where he conducted one of the first a cappella choirs in the eastern United States. It is no surprise that some of his finest compositions for a cappella choir date from this first period.

In the summer of 1933, Mueller arranged a choral setting of the hymn *Now Thank We All Our God*, which was published by G. Schirmer the following year. Of all of Mueller's compositions, this anthem ranked second in number of total sales by 1970. Written for an eight-part a cappella chorus, it utilizes diatonic chords almost exclusively and


61. G. Schirmer, 1934, no. 7745.

62. Grant, 19.
avoids modulations, both of which are characteristics found in most of
his other hymn arrangements. To compensate for the bland harmonic scheme,
Mueller incorporates an interesting assortment of vocal combinations.

The arrangement contains three stanzas from Johann Crüger's
famous hymn. The first stanza is sung by a women's chorus in four parts.
For the first half of stanza two, the entire ensemble is called upon,
with the melody sung in octaves by the men. The second half of this
stanza is given to a four-part men's chorus, which balances the earlier
women's ensemble. Stanza three, not found in Crüger's Praxis Pietatis
Melica (1644), the source commonly cited for this hymn text, begins in
a fugal style and contains new melodic material—yet another character-
istic found in many of Mueller's anthems. Midway through the stanza to
its conclusion, a musical dialogue is created in which the new contra-
puntal material is interrupted by segments of the chorale tune set in
stately chordal harmony (Example 66).

From 1939 to 1952, Mueller's second compositional period and
his most productive years, he produced some two hundred twenty-eight
original compositions and arrangements. Among the anthems in this
group is his most famous piece, Create in Me a Clean Heart, O God, which also serves as a typical example of his style during this period.
Constructed in a tripartite format, the homophonic piece is scored for
mixed chorus accompanied by organ. In the first part, Mueller avoids
four-part writing by alternating sections for unison women and unison

63. Ibid., 32.

64. G. Schirmer, 1941, no. 8682.

To praise Him while we live, and on His will attend,

To praise we—for all He hath created,
men and by concluding with full choir in unison. The first example of four-voice harmonization is found in the middle section, which is written in the parallel major key, another characteristic of Mueller's formal designs (Example 67). The final section, also in four voices,

begins in the key of the relative major and moves to the tonic for a concluding statement of the main theme. Throughout the anthem, choral sections are reinforced with a simple organ accompaniment that merely doubles vocal parts. In this piece, as in many of his anthems from this period, Mueller apparently intended to construct a work that could be performed by a small choir of modest means, and the volume of his publications perhaps testifies to the success of his effort.

Other hymn arrangements from this period reflect a style similar to that of the earlier example *New Thank We All Our God*. In 1946, Mueller published an a cappella arrangement of *Lead On, O King Eternal* in a three-part form that includes three stanzas of the hymn, two of which are set to the familiar "Lancashire" tune. Following an introductory fanfare, the first stanza is sung by the men in unison and concluded by the entire ensemble in a four-part hymn style. For the second stanza, which is set to new melodic material, the choir provides a melismatic accompaniment for either a tenor or soprano soloist (Example 68). A short introductory section, using the first phrase of the familiar tune in an imitative fashion, prepares the final stanza, which is sung by the four-part ensemble in a broad 4/2 meter. The piece concludes with a characteristic cadential expansion to eight parts (Example 69). Undoubtedly, Mueller intended these hymn arrangements to be sung by larger festival choirs; however, many of his anthems were rescored for a variety of vocal combinations, a fact illustrated by the anthem *A Mighty Fortress Is Our God*, of which Mueller produced arrangements for seven different vocal combinations.


The choral arrangements and compositions by the high school choral director Noble Cain (1896-1977) were an addition to the repertories of many high school a cappella choirs not found in those of the major
a cappella collegiate choirs. Many of Cain's original compositions
and arrangements for choirs utilize sacred texts, a notion undoubtedly
prompted by his father, who was both a musician and a minister. 66 With
a degree in music from the American Conservatory of Music in Chicago
and a master's degree in German literature from the University of Chicago,
Cain considered a career as a concert pianist, but instead, he pursued
training in composition, studying with Adolph Weidig and Leo Sowerby.

In 1921, Cain was appointed director of choral activities at
the Nicholas Senn High School in Chicago, where he became an early pro-
ponent of a cappella singing by programming unaccompanied choral music

ed. by Dr. J. T. H. Mize (Chicago: Who Is Who in Music, Inc., LTD,
1951), 98.
as early as 1924.\footnote{67} Cain's skill as a conductor enabled him to create an unusually fine high school a cappella choir that received both local and national recognition. In 1930, he organized the Chicago A Cappella Choir, a professional group containing a nucleus of alumni from the Senn High School Choir, and in 1932, he resigned from Senn High School to assume responsibilities as producer and director for choral activities throughout the central division of the National Broadcasting Company. During the following seven years, he gave over 2,500 radio broadcasts, mostly with the Chicago A Cappella Choir.\footnote{68}

Throughout his career, Cain directly influenced the development of the American anthem. As a composer, he provided numerous original pieces, editions and imitations of Russian choral works, and arrangements of Negro spirituals to the growing repertory of choral music written for collegiate, high school, and church choirs. As a journalist, he voiced opinions on a variety of musical and non-musical issues, thereby influencing the teaching methods, performance practices, and even the theology of many American music educators for several decades.

Cain's regard for a cappella singing was evident by 1932, when he published his only book, \textit{Choral Music and Its Practice}. In this book, he declared a cappella singing to be the highest form of choral education.\footnote{69} These same ideas were foreshadowed in an article by Cain dated

\begin{footnotes}
\item[67] R. I. Kegerreis, 202.
\item[68] Letter from Cain cited in \textit{Ibid.}, 219.
\end{footnotes}
one year earlier. 70 His continued enthusiasm throughout the 1930's is evident in the number of a cappella chorus collections he edited, including *The A Cappella Chorus Book*, upon which he collaborated with F. Melius Christiansen. 71 A bibliography of Cain's publications located in *The National Union Catalog Pre-1956 Imprints* includes a collection dated 1930-1932 and two collections both dated 1934. 72

A change was evident in 1940, however, when he warned against singing only unaccompanied music even though he still regarded a cappella singing as the supreme choral experience. 73 He completed the transformation two years later in his second edition of *Choral Music and Its Practice*, where he noted that it was "sheer nonsense" to consider a cappella singing to be the epitome of the choral art. 74 By the time of this writing, he was earning a living primarily as a free-lance guest conductor, clinician, and festival adjudicator. During the following decade, the numerous articles which he wrote for various music education journals consisted mostly of a collage of unrelated thoughts and always


included a lamentation of the deplorable state of choral music in which the elements of popular music were being utilized.

In the early 1950's, Cain's writings were devoted primarily to spiritual conditions in America. In 1951, he summarized these thoughts by declaring that the church, along with the schools, ought to be leading the way in exposing young people to choral music. Sacred music, he postulated, should never be separated from the music literature of the school, but rather the "schools could stand a little more God!"^75—a situation he spent much of his lifetime attempting to bring about.

In addition to numerous editions and imitations of Russian liturgical music and his concert arrangements of Negro spirituals,^76 Cain produced a group of anthems in his own particular style. An excellent example of his technique is the sensitive setting of the twenty-third Psalm entitled The Lord Is My Shepherd,^77 which was issued during the 1940's. The anthem is written for four unaccompanied voices and is characterized by the avoidance of extreme vocal ranges and high tessituras. The harmonization is enriched with a variety of altered chords including major, minor, and diminished sevenths, and the text is illustrated by a temporary shift in the mode of the piece from minor to the parallel major (Example 70).


76. See Chapters Five and Six.

77. Harold Flammer, 1944, no. 84221.
An example of Cain's skillful hymn arrangements for choir is

*Christ, Whose Glory Fills the Skies.* Based on the hymn text by Charles Wesley, the festive arrangement is intended for either concert or church choir. Formally, the anthem is constructed in a tripartite design that is harmonized in C major, c minor, and A-flat major. The melody of the first section is repeated in the third, but its reharmonization lends an unexpected musical departure from the simple setting.

Effective text painting characterizes the middle section, which begins with the text "dark and cheerless is the morn unaccompanied by Thee." In contrast to the jubilant running eighth-note patterns of the outer sections, this middle part begins on a solemn unison pitch.

78. Harold Flammer, 1947, no. 84270.
in the alto and tenor voices. As the single pitch opens into a major second, a third voice—the soprano—is added to form a cadence in the key of c minor. From here the soprano leaps a diminished fifth to form, with the other three parts, a diminished seventh chord that finally resolves to the subdominant with the proclamation: "joyless is the day's return till Thy mercy's beams I see" (Example 71).

Cain undoubtedly made his greatest contributions to the anthem literature through his arrangements and editions; however, he did create some noteworthy original works. His main market, judging from the concert programs of the time, were the large, proficient high school choirs which helped make his anthems some of the most popular during the decades between the two world wars.

Robert Shaw

In 1946, the Institute of Musical Art was merged with the Julliard Graduate School to form the Julliard School of Music. In the fall of that year, Robert Shaw (1916–) was named director of choral music at the new institution. Most choral directors associate Shaw's name with musical composition only in the context of his collaboration with Alice Parker, a member of Shaw's Collegiate Chorale whom he first met in the summer of 1947 while teaching conducting classes at Tanglewood. To be sure, the Shaw-Parker contributions are significant, for they created together some 216 arrangements, most

79. Interestingly, the formal design closely parallels the setting of the same hymn by T. Frederick H. Candlyn. See Chapter Two.

80. For additional information concerning Shaw and the Collegiate Chorale, see Chapter Three.
Example 71. Noble Cain, Christ, Whose Glory Fills the Skies (Harold Flammer, no. 84270), measures 24-34.

Dark and cheer less is the morn Un-ac-com-pan-ied by Thee; Joy-less

Joy-less is the day's re-turn Till Thy mer-cy's beams I see; Till they

Joy-less is the day's re-turn Till Thy mer-cy's beams I see;
of which were published by either Lawson-Gould or G. Schirmer. For the most part, however, these pieces were prepared after 1950, placing them outside this study. Prior to these publications, Shaw alone composed several arrangements of hymns and spirituals that are noteworthy.

In March of 1949, Shaw recorded his first album of Protestant hymns, entitled *Onward Christian Soldiers*. According to Mussulman, Shaw had become acquainted with some of the great hymns of the Christian faith only since arriving in New York after joining Waring in 1937. These new hymns, some of which he performed with Waring's Glee Club and others of which he learned through association with various church musicians, satisfied his inner desire for a mode of religious expression that lacked the sentimentality of the hymns he had learned as a child. For his recording, Shaw rejected those arrangements he occasionally performed with Waring's Glee Club as too spectacular, and he rejected the original, strophic settings of hymns designed for congregational singing as too dull. Instead, he arranged his own expressive versions of several hymns, in which the mood of each stanza is given its own musical setting.

Two of Shaw's hymn arrangements published in 1950 and later included on a 1958 recording were *For All the Saints*, based on

---


82. Shaw's arrangements of spirituals are discussed in Chapter Six.

83. Mussulman, 171.


85. G. Schirmer, 1950, no. 9908.
the tune *Sine Nomine* by the English hymnist Ralph Vaughan Williams,
and *All Creatures of Our God and King*, a setting of the seventeenth-
century tune *Lasst uns Erfreuen*, from the *Geistliche Kirchengesang*.
The former is scored for unaccompanied SATB chorus and utilizes four
stanzas of the hymn. Shaw skillfully enlivens Vaughan Williams' har-
monizations with a variety of vocal combinations and contrapuntal tech-
niques. The entire first stanza is set forth simply by the full choir
singing in unison, a favorite technique of Shaw. For the second stanza,
contrapuntal writing is skillfully used as three- and four-part ensem-
bles sing alternate phrases of the hymn. Here, the basses and baritones
state the main phrase in unison, which is imitated at the octave first
by unison women and then by the tenors in augmentation. The third stanza
begins with a contrapuntal duet that juxtaposes the men singing the third
phrase of the hymn against the women singing the first phrase (Example
72). These parts are interchanged later in this stanza, and the basic
idea is continued and expanded in the final stanza, in which the bar-
tones sing the third phrase of the hymn against an augmentation in the
bass voice. Then, with the first phrase of the hymn tune reappearing
in the soprano voice, it is imitated successively by tenor and alto
voices (Example 73).

*All Creatures of Our God and King* is scored for SATB chorus
with organ accompaniment and includes four stanzas of the hymn. Once
again, the first stanza is sung in unison, this time by the men only.
Unison singing by all voices is continued throughout the second stanza,

86. G. Schirmer, 1950, no. 9909.
except at cadence points where the harmony expands to four parts.

For this stanza, the voices are accompanied by full organ. The men are given the melody in stanza three, while the women toss the word "alleluia" back and forth in a rhythmical fashion. As in the previous stanza, the voices are joined homophonically at the cadence points.

The concluding phrase of stanza three is telescoped with the beginning phrase of the final stanza, in which a two-voice canon at the unison is
cleverly created. Midway through this stanza, the canon is expanded to three voices (Example 74) and then dissolved as all voices join together for the final statement "O praise Him, Alleluia!"

In 1950, the idea of creating an anthem from a hymn text and tune was not a new concept; however, few examples existed that displayed the technical finesse of pieces such as these. With his arrangements, Shaw not only challenged the work of his contemporaries, but actually set a compositional standard that is seldom duplicated by the writers of hymn-anthems even today.

Example 74. Robert Shaw, _All Creatures of Our God and King_ (G. Schirmer, no. 9909), measures 54-58.
praise the Spirit, Three in One, O

praise the Son, And praise the Spirit, Three in One, O

And praise the Spirit, Three in One,
Chapter V

ANTHEMS IN THE RUSSIAN STYLE

The development of an entire body of unaccompanied choral music in Russia notably affected stylistic trends in the American anthem throughout the first half of this century and beyond. As a result of numerous American editions of Russian choral works and the concerts of Russian touring choirs, American audiences were first introduced to this new music during the early decades of this century, even though the genre had existed in Russia for several hundred years prior to this time. As Russian choral music gained popularity in the United States, its principal features, including a cappella settings, thick voice doublings, and rich harmonizations that border on modality, were included in the original works of some American composers.

During the final decade of the nineteenth century, Russian sacred music was the subject of an occasional article in British and American music journals. In 1891, for example, W. J. Birbeck reported to the Royal Music Association of a recent journey to Russia during which he had attended a liturgical service and heard choral singing of unusually high quality. Contained also in this report was a rather lengthy historical account of Russian liturgical music in general. In

the years that followed, Alfred Swan, an American who was musically trained in Russia, published numerous articles that dealt with this topic in a more scholarly fashion. Although his writings were concerned primarily with the history and development of Russian liturgical chant, a fact no doubt owing to his interest in medieval chant development, Swan's contributions created an awareness of this foreign repertory among American music educators.²

In 1915, N. Lindsay Norden added to the growing body of written material on this subject with his essay "The Music of the Russian Liturgy;"³ however, Norden's primary contribution was that of a musical arranger and editor of Russian choral works. As a trained organist and composer with a degree from Columbia, Norden skillfully adapted over one hundred Russian selections for American choirs by rescoring some existing choral parts and replacing Slavic texts with English approximations.⁴ Of these more than one hundred editions, eighty-one were published by J. Fischer and Brothers under the title Russian Church Music. It is largely through such musical arrangements that this genre was brought to America, for Norden was the first of a group of choral arrangers including Canon Winfred Douglas, A. M. Henderson, Max T. Krone, Peter Tkach, and Noble Cain, to adapt Russian music for American choirs.⁵

---


4. Prior to World War I, Norden founded and directed the Aeolian Choir of Brooklyn, a group which he used to perform his editions. Beckwith, "Choral Traditions," 43.

5. Ibid., 43-44.
Many editions and imitations of Russian music were published during the first four decades of this century that were performed first by the various collegiate and professional choirs specializing in a cappella singing, and subsequently by high school a cappella choirs and larger church choirs that attempted to follow the then current vogue. The style was further promoted by Russian ensembles such as the Ukrainian Choir, the Russian Symphonic Choir, and the Don Cossack Chorus, which toured the United States during the 1920's and 1930's. Although their repertory included mostly secular music, these Russian groups skillfully entertained American audiences with pieces that featured the typical robust, thick, choral sound.  

When Nikon ascended the patriarchal throne in the mid-seventeenth century, he attempted to update the Russian liturgy by revising the service books and by encouraging the Western harmonization of the old monophonic *znamenny* chant, which had been in use in Russia since the middle ages. A type of part singing in two, three, and four voices, with the chant, usually *znamenny*, in the bottom voice, had appeared during the last half of the sixteenth century; however, these early efforts were largely unremembered a century later, when the patriarch authorized the new chant harmonizations. Nikon's musicians were unable to adapt the old chant to Western harmonies; thus, they began the search for a more modern substitute.  

---

6. For further information concerning the Russian Choirs, consult Chapter Three.

7. Charles C. Hirt, "Graeco-Slavonic Chant Traditions Evident in the Part-Writing of the Russian Orthodox Church" (unpublished Ph.D dissertation, University of Southern California, 1946), 185-188.
southern Kievan region were imported to Moscow to staff the patriarchal and Imperial Court Chapel Choirs, two choral ensembles that determined acceptable church music for the Orthodox churches. These singers brought with them examples of Kievan, Greek, and Bulgarian chant harmonized chordally in three and four voices, and these new harmonizations were subsequently adopted by the Imperial Court.8

Attempting to imitate the cultural milieu of the European courts, the Russian monarchs invited Italian musicians to direct the musical activity of the Imperial Court at St. Petersburg during the early years of the eighteenth century. This single act affected the style of Russian sacred music for over a century. While employed by this court, the Italian composers, among them Galuppi, Traetta, Paisiello, Sarti, and Cimarosa, wrote as service music unaccompanied vocal concertos. These concertos consisted of solos, duets, trios, and choruses in the then current Italian style, all set to Slavic texts.9 Because the Russian chant melodies and harmonizations from the seventeenth century lacked the flexibility demanded by Italian ornamentation and the capacity for modern harmonizations, the foreign composers replaced them with new, freely composed melodies. This new style was quickly adopted by some younger Russian composers, but the new music did not please the Imperial Court, and in 1797, Pavel I

8. While this account agrees with most authors, Harry Elzinga disagrees, stating that the chants used by the singers from southern Kiev for their harmonizations also included zamennyy. Harry Elzinga, "The Sacred Choral Compositions of Pavel Grigor'evich Chesnokov (1887-1944)" (unpublished Ph.D. dissertation, Indiana University, 1970), 14.

9. Ibid., 18-19.
issued an edict that forbade the further performance of these vocal concerto in worship services. 10

Although he represented the apex of the Italian influence on Russian composers, Dmitry Bortnyansky 11 (1751-1825) was one of the first Russians to attempt a revival of Slavic chant. He served as a choir boy in the court chapel under the direction of Galuppi and studied privately with the Italian master before traveling to Italy for further training in 1769. Returning to Russia in 1779, he was named chapelmast er of the court to Crown Prince Pavel I, and he b e came the director of vocal music at the court chapel in 1796, a position he held some twenty-nine years until his death. 12

Bortnyansky's influence on Russian composition was paramount, but not for musical reasons. As director of the court chapel, he was appointed in 1816 the official musical censor of all compositions intended for performance in the Church. 13 Because of his position, Bortnyansky's compositions achieved considerable attention in Russia and subsequently were popularized in the United States. Under the title Blessed Be Jehovah, God of Israel, his Cherubic Hymn No. 7 may
have been the first Russian liturgical piece to enter the American choral repertory. Elwyn Wienandt and Robert Young cite its publication in the 1866 collection *The Jubilate* by Luther Orlando Emerson.\(^{14}\)

The piece was later arranged by Chaikovsky, and this arrangement first appeared in the United States in 1915, with subsequent versions appearing in the catalogues of nearly every major American choral publisher.\(^{15}\)

In Chaikovsky's version, the Italian influences are most clearly seen in the regularity of phrases and in the harmonizations which consist of chord progressions typical of eighteenth-century Western music (Example 75).\(^{16}\)

The group of composers who succeeded Bortnyansky comprise what is known as the St. Petersburg School and includes L'vov, Turchaninov, Lomakin, L'vovsky, Vinogradov, Azeyev, and Arkhangel'sky.\(^{17}\)

Using both chant and freely composed melodies as cantus firmi, these

---


16. For this study, a copy of the 1915 arrangement published by the John Church Company was unavailable, except for an excerpt located in Wienandt and Young, 409. A copy of Chaikovsky's arrangement published by Carl Fischer in 1948 was located and is therefore used as Example Seventy-five. Although the texts differ, a comparison of the excerpt located in Wienandt and Young with the Carl Fischer publication, reveals that the musical arrangement of voice parts is identical.

17. Arkhangel'sky was apparently the first to incorporate female voices into the choir in the 1880's. Velimirović, 341.
Example 75. Dmitry Bortnyansky, *Cherubim Song No. 7* (Carl Fischer, CM 6315), measures 1-12.

Adagio ($\approx 72$)

Hear the host of angels singing,

Hear the host of angels singing,

Hear the host of angels singing,

Hear the host of angels singing.

Kneeling at the Father's throne!

Kneeling at the Father's throne!

Kneeling at the Father's throne!

Kneeling at the Father's throne!
composers commonly wrote for four voice parts. In their chant compositions, Kievan and Greek subjects were preferred to those selected from znamenny chant. Of these composers, one of the most influential was Alexy L'vov (1798-1870), who became the first Russian composer to counter successfully the Italian influence on Russian church music. Although Bortnyansky reinstated the use of Slavic chant, he so camouflaged it with Western rhythms and harmonies that the chant was often unrecognizable. L'vov used simpler harmonizations and placed the cantus firmus, which consisted of abridged versions of earlier melodies, in the top voice. He was also instrumental in the edition of the second Obikhod, a volume similar to the Latin Liber Usualis. Published in 1848, this new Obikhod was scored for four voices in strict homophonic style and its use became mandatory for all churches in Russia. During his tenure at the court chapel, L'vov established guidelines for training conductors and composers of church music, permitting only graduates from the school to conduct church choirs, and he controlled the repertory by allowing liturgical choirs to perform only the music approved by the censor.

During the final quarter of the nineteenth century, the center of Russian liturgical composition shifted from St. Petersburg to Moscow.
and the Moscow Synodal School, where the assistant conductor of the Synodal Choir, Alexandr Kastal'sky (1856–1926), became one of the first to gain notice with a new approach to chant composition based on Slavic cantus firmi. In his sacred compositions based on chant melodies, Kastal'sky constructed accompanying voice parts in the same style as the chant, thereby incorporating a greater use of polyphony and modality than did his predecessors (Example 76).


---


22. A bibliography of Kastal'sky's sacred choral works is included in Beckwith, "A. D. Kastal'skii," 462-467.
Deviating from the earlier practices of the St. Petersburg School, in which the chant appeared only in the uppermost voice, Kastal'sky allowed the cantus firmus to migrate freely throughout the piece, avoiding strict four-part harmonizations by injecting sections for smaller vocal combinations.

In 1887, two years after entering the Moscow Conservatory as a student, Kastal'sky was appointed to the Moscow Synodal Academy, where he conducted the choir and taught music classes. In 1891, he was named assistant conductor of the Synodal Choir, and in 1910 he became the conductor, a position he retained until 1923 when the Synodal Academy was renamed and merged with the Moscow Conservatory. Subsequent to this merger, Kastal'sky was appointed to the Conservatory as a professor whose duties included administering the choral music program.

Following the Revolution in 1917 and the subsequent establishment of the Soviet Union, the composition of church music lost its exalted position in Russia. However, during the two decades prior to the Revolution, two composers, Alexandr Grechaninov and Pavel Chesnokov, who were students respectively of the St. Petersburg and Moscow Synodal Schools, produced a number of anthems that found their way across the sea into the concert programs and worship repertory of American choirs.

Alexandr Grechaninov

Alexandr Grechaninov (1864-1956) may be the most innovative composer in the history of Russian sacred music. In the face of severe criticism, he, like Kastal'sky, rejected the current trend of eighteenth-century Italianism in Russian sacred choral composition and chose instead to simulate old Slavonic church singing in a modal framework.

Against his father's wishes, Grechaninov attended the Moscow Conservatory from 1881 to 1890, and for the next three years, he studied with Rimsky-Korsakov at the Conservatory in St. Petersburg. During the remainder of the decade, he enjoyed successful performances of several works and supported himself by teaching piano in St. Petersburg and Moscow. In 1902, he composed a liturgy, using recitation by a soloist for the first time, and in 1917, he composed a choral Psalm-setting which included orchestral accompaniment, thereby departing from the Orthodox practice of unaccompanied singing. He considered his greatest achievement in sacred music to be his Missa Oecumenica, a work utilizing chants from the Orthodox, Gregorian, and Hebrew liturgies and accompanied by organ with full orchestra.

Grechaninov's choral music received considerable notice in the United States during his lifetime. The composer himself credited much of the popularity of Russian choral music in America to the efforts of

two men, Theodore Becker, chorusmaster at the Russian Imperial Opera in St. Petersburg, and Ivan Melnikov, a singer in the opera who had encouraged Russian composers to supply literature for their newly established choral school for amateurs.25

Undoubtedly, the American most responsible for the popularity of Grechaninov's music outside Russia was Charles Crane. As was mentioned earlier,26 Crane personally financed and maintained the choir of the Russian Orthodox Cathedral in New York City, where the works of Grechaninov were performed as part of their repertory. Shortly after the 1917 Revolution, Crane personally sought out Grechaninov in Russia and invited him to establish a new home in America, an offer the composer rejected. Crane did, however, entice Grechaninov and his wife to travel to London and Prague for concert performances at no personal expense in 1922.

Apparently, it was the American's luxurious hospitality during that concert tour that influenced Grechaninov finally to leave Russia, for in 1925 the composer and his wife moved to Paris and then Rome, where they lived for the next four years and where he performed his compositions for a variety of audiences. In 1929, Grechaninov came to America to perform his music, and over the next five years, spent about three months of each year touring the major cities of this country. He finally settled in New York and gained citizenship in 1946.

26. See Chapter Three.
Grechaninov's anthems include elements of both tonal and modal harmonizations. In those anthems published in America during the early years of this century, formal design consists mostly of a series of unrelated sections. Each section centers around a definite key area, which, while often functionally unrelated to neighboring sections, is closely related to the home key or mode of the piece. An example is the anthem *Only Begotten Son*, whose text is loosely based on the Hymn of Justinian. The piece consists of four sections all closely related to the key of C major, with separate areas in g mixolydian, C major-aeolian, F major and d minor. Tonal centers for each section are established with pedal points, around which the chords vacillate back and forth, for the most part, in non-functional progressions (Example 77). In the anthem *A Song of Joy*, a modal flavor is established by avoiding accidentals, often using the minor form of the dominant, and omitting the third of some chords (Example 78). Ventures into bi-tonality (Example 79) and vague suggestions of impressionism (Example 80) are found in a version of *The Lord's Prayer*, which according to its editor-arranger, Noble Cain, was the only edition approved by the composer. Grechaninov's music typically includes thick

---

27. A bibliography of Grechaninov's compositions including a listing of anthems is included in Gretchaninoff, *My Life*, 175-204.

28. J. Fischer and Bro., 1914, no. 4100.

29. J. Fischer and Bro., 1933, no. 6690.

Example 77. Alexandr Grechaninov, *Only Begotten Son* (J. Fischer and Bro., no. 4100), measures 1–9.

Allegro moderato

Glory to Father, Son and Holy Spirit.

Now and ever and to ages of ages, Amen.

**Moderato e molto maestoso**

Oh, be joyful, be joyful in the Lord, all ye lands.

**Moderato e molto maestoso**

Sing, oh sing unto His name.

Play right hand an octave lower

Tenor Solo Comodo \( \text{d} = 66 \)

chordal textures, frequent eight-part voicing, and melodies that are primarily conjunct and constructed in a centonized fashion, as can be seen in Example eighty-one, which illustrates a five-note motive and its inversion found in several anthems (Example 81).

Example 81. Alexandr Grechaninov, Vouchsafe O Lord (Galaxy, no. 1356), measure 33, melody only, and A Song of Joy (J. Fischer and Bro., no. 6690), measure 14, melody in inversion.

Pavel Chesnokov

Pavel Chesnokov (1877-1944) composed choral music almost exclusively, with much of his output intended for the services of the Russian Orthodox Church. He attended the Moscow Synodal School from 1885 to 1895, and upon graduation, remained at the school as a teacher of choral singing until 1920. In 1913, Chesnokov enrolled at the Moscow Conservatory to study composition. He completed his study in 1917, and three years later, he was hired by the Conservatory to teach choral conducting, where he remained some twenty-four years until his death. After

According to Elzinga, the majority of Chesnokov's sacred works, of which there are approximately 325, employ liturgical texts. Of those pieces, the melodies of some one-third are based on *znamenny*, Kievan, Greek, Bulgarian, or other unidentified chants.\(^{32}\) Both chant and free compositions utilize large choral forces of commonly six to eight voices, with as many as four bass parts found at cadences.\(^{33}\) Chesnokov's *Salvation Is Created*,\(^ {34}\) drawn from the Kievan liturgy, is a famous example of his compositions in which the melody is based on chant. This piece, like many other Russian works, was arranged for varying vocal combinations and texts by numerous American editors.\(^ {35}\) Unlike Kastal'sky and Grechaninov, who were often criticized for disguising the cantus firmus beyond recognition, Chesnokov seldom hid the chant melodies.\(^ {36}\) Instead, the chant may be found in any voice including

---

\(^ {32}\) Elzinga, 99 and 124.

\(^ {33}\) For a listing of many of Chesnokov's compositions, consult Elzinga.

\(^ {34}\) J. Fischer and Bro., 1913, no. 4129.

\(^ {35}\) In 1939, for example, the same piece was arranged for SATTBB by Noble Cain using the text *Now Sing We Thy Praise* and published by Belwin. Nineteen years later, Cain's musical arrangement and text were rescored for SATB choir by Richard Carlyle and published by the Plymouth Music Company.

\(^ {36}\) Generalizations concerning Chesnokov's music are drawn from Elzinga, 99-221.
the bass, and it often migrates through different voices, as in the works of Kastal'sky. Chesnokov characteristically doubles the chant at the octave with the soprano-tenor combination found most often (Example 82). The text usually coincides in all voices, even when the

Example 82. Pavel Chesnokov, Salvation Is Created (J. Fischer and Bro., no. 4129), measures 1-21.
voices are rhythmically independent. Although the formal design of this anthem could be considered binary (AA'), throughcomposed formal schemes are most common in his chant compositions, and as seen in Example Eighty-two, asymmetrical phrases are created by omitting meter signs. Chesnokov's chant and free compositions are solidly tonal, utilizing triads and their inversions, major-minor sevenths (which function as both dominant and secondary dominant seventh chords), and minor-minor sevenths. Any harmonic shift away from the tonal center is usually a third away from the tonic, as is found in measure five of Salvation Is Created, where the tonality shifts from b minor to D major using a common chord modulation (Example 82). Although not evident in this example, pedal points and occasional shifts to modality are often seen.

*Let Thy Holy Presence*[^37] is an example of a free composition.

[^37]: C. C. Birchard, 1940, no. 12.
that, like *Salvation Is Created*, has also been arranged by a number of editors for various vocal combinations and texts. This arrangement by editor Noble Cain is scored for SSATTBB, which is the typical voicing of more than half of Chesnokov's entire repertory.

In this composer's free compositions, the melody is usually found in the soprano voice and is often doubled by either the alto or tenor voices. Binary and ternary forms are common, as is evidenced in the ternary formal construction of this anthem. The outer sections of *Let Thy Holy Presence* feature a dialogue between men's and women's sections, a device noted in many Russian works, and the middle section illustrates another feature of Chesnokov's free compositions—that of contrapuntal writing. Examples of both imitation and sequence are also evident in the middle section (Example 83). The harmonic constructions of the free compositions parallel those of the chant compositions, and although meter signatures are included, shifts in meters accommodate irregular phrasing.

*As the popularity of choral music from Russia increased in the United States, the stylistic features of the genre were imitated*

38. In 1948, for example, the same anthem, set to a new text entitled *Come Thou Holy Spirit*, was arranged for eight voices by Peter Tkach and published by Neil A. Kjos. Seven years later, in 1955, the Boosey and Hawkes Publishing House issued a new version arranged for men's chorus by Walter Ehret, which was set to the earlier text, *Let Thy Holy Presence*, and in 1958, the anthem, under the title *May Thy Holy Spirit*, was arranged for SATB chorus by Peter Lindsay and published by Plymouth Music.

by American composers in their original works. Although the anthems of such as Clarence Dickinson, Carl F. Mueller, and Van Denman Thompson occasionally reflect a Russian technique, it is likely that no other composer adopted the Russian features more thoroughly or more frequently than did Noble Cain. In addition to copying the Russian style, Cain also edited numerous Russian pieces and even studied composition with Alexandr Grechaninov in 1930.40

Of Cain's anthems published during the 1930's that reflect Russian features, one of the best-known is *In the Night, Christ Came Walking*,41 the text of which is a narrative account of Christ's walk on the water as found in the fourteenth chapter of St. Matthew. The piece is scored for an eight-part, unaccompanied ensemble and includes choral dialogues between men and women, sudden dynamic contrasts and frequent temporary shifts to the submediant key, all characteristics of the Russian style (Example 84). Apparently Cain was attempting to imitate the modal flavor of the Russian pieces by restricting the number of chords used and by avoiding modulations in this anthem. Unfortunately, he failed to omit such earmarks of tonal structures as the third degree of the triad and the leading tone, thereby making his chord progressions sound solidly tonal, and because of the static motion, rather uninteresting. In 1939, Cain published the anthem *Holy Lord*


41. G. Schirmer, 1936, no. 7967.
Example 84. Noble Cain, *In the Night, Christ Came Walking* (G. Schirmer, no. 7967), measures 7-11.

In the opening measures, this piece features the typical Russian characteristics of multiple unaccompanied voice-parts, choral dialogues between women's and men's sections, the use of triplet figures, and the harmonic progression tonic to submediant (Example 85).

Many of these imitations may be perceived as inferior when compared to the original examples, yet the volume that was written and published throughout the first half of this century undeniably testifies

---

42. Harold Flammer, 1939, no. 84157.

43. See also *Sing Unto the Lord a New Song* (Harold Flammer, 1944, no. 84220), and *Our Father Who Art in Heaven* (Harold Flammer, 1944, no. 84215) for further illustrations of Cain's music from the 1940's.

Both new editions of Russian choral music and new original imitations of the style appear even today, further confirming the impact of this genre on American church music.
Chapter VI

THE NEGRO SPIRITUAL

The Negro spiritual has grown from a simplistic folk idiom into a true art form despite the contempt of slave owners, textual and melodic alterations caused by oral transmission, periodic pressure from Puritan reformers to omit them from Negro worship, and inferior imitations at the hands of some modern choral arrangers.¹ Also known by the names "jubilee," "minstrel," "religious song," "slave song," and "folksong," spirituals cover a wide variety of religious and secular subjects. Some singers, in order to distinguish between them, called the pieces dealing with religious subjects by the name "anthem."² These pieces, often born of the spontaneous fervor of the camp meetings, are inherently both improvisatory and choral. Besides providing a repertory of religious songs, spirituals have served for centuries as a means of documenting both the faith of the Negro and the conditions under which he lived.³

During the final decades of the nineteenth century, touring groups of Negro singers discovered quite by accident that they could

better please their concert audiences by using simple choral versions of the old slave songs instead of the choral art songs that made up their repertories. Mainly through the arrangements of Harry T. Burleigh, these simple folksongs were first introduced to more sophisticated twentieth-century concert audiences as solo songs with piano accompaniment. Then, as interest in the new folk art grew, other Negro composers began to publish new arrangements of the old folksongs for choral ensemble. With the growth of the a cappella movement during the 1930's and 1940's, these new arrangements, with their spirited rhythms and clever imitations of the Negro dialect, were welcomed by choirs and audiences accustomed to the often sombre standard literature. As the demand for new choral arrangements increased, Caucasian composers also joined the parade and produced parodies in which they exaggerated the characteristic features of the spirituals to new extremes. By 1950, the Negro spiritual was commonplace in the repertories of both amateur and professional choral ensembles.

The earliest examples of Negro folksongs in America date to 1619, when the first slaves were imported from Africa. Because they were given little time for recreational activities or music-making, the slaves provided their own recreation by producing music as they worked. Their earliest repertory of songs likely consisted of secular folksongs, for the religious pieces resulted from the introduction of the slaves to Christianity by their white masters and itinerant

4. For a discussion of Harry T. Burleigh and his music, see pages 190-195 in this chapter.
missionaries from the North. By 1750, it was common to see the slaves gathered in the evenings to sing the new Psalms and hymns being taught them as part of their instruction.

The authorities disagree about the origin of this genre. Some believe that the Negro songs are the sole creation of the slaves, noting specifically their similarities to African music. Yet others believe the spirituals to be Africanized versions of English ballads, while still a third group views the slave songs as a Negro imitation of the Southern "white spirituals," a body of hymns used in the more organized religious meetings of the South. These are represented by several early nineteenth-century collections, especially those that used the four-shaped notation.

The origin of this genre may remain uncertain, but we do know that the Biblical stories being relayed to these new Christians by the missionaries provided ideal material for new songs. Because most African people held a concept of a supreme, but remote deity, they more easily communicated with lesser supernatural beings, many of whom were


8. See for example, Tallmadge, 37.

associated with epic histories. As part of their religious rites, the Africans typically recounted the dramatic actions and special powers of these lesser beings. The Bible stories were ideal because they provided new material that could be easily adapted to this sort of dramatic or epic treatment. The slaves preferred biblical stories that focused on specific events and were particularly interested in the rescue of Daniel from the lion's den, the deliverance of the poor, and the humble birth and the resurrection of Jesus Christ. John W. Work believes that if the Bible had been lost, it could have been reconstructed in the mind of the Negro through these accounts that became the texts of the songs.

The language of the spirituals was drawn largely from the Scriptures and from the hymns introduced to the slaves by their doctrinal teachers; however, certain words carried special meaning for the Negro and were therefore used frequently. For example, "King Jesus" specifically referred to Jesus Christ, as did the appellation "God." "Heaven" was the eternal resting place for the faithful, "hell" was the eternal home of the thief and the sinner, and "religion" was a panacea for all evils and all sins. The Negro sang about "sin"

11. Evans, 39.
12. Work, Folk Song, 36.
in one of three contexts: he sang songs rejoicing in his victory over it, songs lamenting his present entrapment by it, or warnings of woe to the "sinner man." References to "heaven," "the gospel train," "gospel shoes," and even "death" all appear to be symbols of spiritual release from the physical body; however, some authors believe that a secondary meaning exists, referring to the physical escapement from slavery. For example, in addition to expressing the longing of the Negro's soul for the eternal resting place, the spiritual Steal Away to Jesus may also have reflected a secret longing to steal away to the North and to freedom. Similarly, the "gospel train," which the Negro believed was a modern version of Elijah's chariot that would take the faithful home to heaven, may also have referred to the "underground railway," just as "Moses" in the song Go Down Moses may have referred to the train's "conductor," Harriet Tubman. One can, of course, become overzealous in a search for these double meanings, but it does seem probable that the theory is often correct.

The melodies of many African folksongs are set in a minor mode based on a pentatonic scale. They lend themselves to harmonizations using mostly chords of the tonic, subdominant, and dominant, each of which may be ornamented with non-harmonic tones. Although each melody has its own particular features, they all fit generally into one of three categories: the call and response, the slow, sustained, long-

14. Ibid., 60.
15. Courlander, 39-42.
phrase melody, or the syncopated, segmented melody. Spirituals such as Swing Low Sweet Chariot or Listen to the Lambs as well as many of the early songs resulting from a soloistic improvisation followed by a congregational response fit into the first and largest category, while such famous examples as Were You There When They Crucified My Lord? and Deep River fit the second category, in which slow, sustained phrases predominate. The third group features melodies characterized chiefly by syncopation and rhythmic complexity and includes such songs as Little David Play on Your Harp and O By and By.

Of all the features associated with spirituals, one of the most important is the use of rhythm. According to Arthur Lee Evans, rhythm is paramount in these pieces because the drum was the primary instrument of the African. The plantation owners did not permit the slaves to use instruments to accompany their songs; therefore, the Africans interpolated the rhythm that would have been produced by the instruments into the song itself by, for example, shifting the main accent of the measure to the off-beat, or by inserting the neutral syllable "a" between the words of the text. Regarding the latter technique, Work notes that many speech elisions, once thought to be the result of illiteracy, were instead purposeful alterations included to create stronger rhythmical patterns, and Evans points out that


17. Evans, 32.

18. Ibid., and Work, Folk Song, 39.

because certain English sounds displeased the Negro, they were either dropped from his vocabulary or replaced with a more pleasing sound.  

Spirituals were introduced into the American choral scene by the collegiate choirs of southern Negro institutions. These choirs presented "authentic" performances utilizing harmonized singing, the Negro dialect, and the display of deeply felt emotion created by swaying the body slightly to mark regular beats, thus emphasizing the rhythm of the piece above other musical characteristics.

Of the numerous Negro choral ensembles that performed spirituals during the last quarter of the nineteenth century, the Fisk Jubilee Singers were among the most famous. Established by the American Missionary Association of the Congregational Church in 1866, the Fisk School in Nashville, Tennessee, was on the brink of bankruptcy barely five years after its founding. In a desperate attempt to raise the funds needed to continue operations, the school treasurer, George L. White, organized a small ensemble of nine Negro students with the intention of concertizing throughout the northern states. The ensemble began their first tour in October, 1871, but the initial reception of the group was so poor that dissolution seemed imminent. Early in their

20. Evans, 55-56.


22. The following material is drawn from Langston Hughes, Famous Negro Music Makers (New York: Dodd, Mead and Co., 1955), 17-26; Maud Cuney-Hare, Negro Musicians and Their Music (Washington, D.C.: Associated Publishers, 1936), 56; Fisher, 190; Locke, 19; and Work, Folk Song, 105-108.
tour, the singers stopped in Oberlin, Ohio, hoping for a chance to sing at a meeting of the National Council of Congregational Churches. They were denied a place on the agenda, but during an unexpected delay in the proceedings, the choir softly intoned the spiritual *Steal Away* from the back of the room, where they had been sitting quietly for some time. Their music quickly caught the attention of the council members, who urged the choir to delay their tour and remain in Oberlin.23

Henry Ward Beecher, pastor of the Plymouth Congregational Church in Brooklyn, was present at the Oberlin meeting and invited the choir to come to his church and present a Sunday evening program. For this concert, the choir assumed the name the "Fisk Jubilee Singers." In the pre-concert publicity, the local newspapers had referred to the nameless organization as the "Nigger Minstrels."24 White, in order to retain the dignity of the group, chose the name "Fisk Jubilee Singers," after the spiritual *The Day of Jubilee*, in which is recounted the story of Moses delivering the Hebrew children from Egypt.25 The concert at the Brooklyn church was enthusiastically received by the audience, and in addition to favorable reviews, a sizeable amount of money was donated to the school. Leaving New York, the group continued their tour through the New England states, which included a concert at the White House. By the time they returned to Tennessee, the Fisk Jubilee Singers had reportedly raised some twenty thousand dollars for the school treasury.26

25. Hughes, 22.
The group was active until 1932, during which time they toured Europe, presenting much of the Western world with its first concert version of the Negro spiritual.\(^{27}\)

Since these first concerts of the Fisk Jubilee Singers, a wealth of new "spirituals" have been performed by numerous Negro and white choral groups. Unfortunately, some of these pieces have been composed by unskilled musicians, and the result, in many instances, is a concert spiritual that often little resembles the original. At the same time, other, more skillful composers have brought the spiritual from a folksong to a veritable art form. Three of the most influential composers during the first half of this century were Harry T. Burleigh, R. Nathaniel Dett, and William L. Dawson.\(^{28}\)

Harry T. Burleigh

Harry T. Burleigh (1866-1949) is universally recognized as the composer most responsible for establishing the Negro folksong as an art form in the United States.\(^{29}\)

Although choral versions of spirituals

---

27. Cuney-Hare, 56.

28. The works of other composers such as John W. Work, Jr., William Henry Smith, Hall Johnson, and Jester Hairston were examined, but were omitted from this study because their compositional styles closely paralleled one or more of the three chosen, or because their greatest influence fell outside the time frame of this study.

had already been introduced by such groups as the Fisk Jubilee Singers, it was Burleigh who first brought this genre to the attention of more sophisticated audiences by arranging simple folksongs for solo voice with piano accompaniment. From these solo arrangements, which were intended for the concert stage, he drew the material for his choral versions.

Born in Erie, Pennsylvania, Burleigh grew up under the influence of his grandfather, a former slave who personally taught his grandson many of the old plantation songs. As a young man, Burleigh worked as a stenographer, all the while singing in the several churches and synagogues of Erie. In 1892, at age twenty-six, he won a scholarship to study at the National Conservatory of Music in New York City, where during his second year, Antonin Dvořák became director and subsequently Burleigh's mentor. According to Eileen Southern, Burleigh sang spirituals for Dvořák on many occasions, and it was these performances that inspired the latter to include examples of Negro folksongs in his American works.

In 1894, Burleigh accepted the position of church soloist at St. George's Episcopal Church in New York City, a position he retained for the next fifty-two years. Six years later, in 1900, he also assumed a similar position at New York's Temple Emanu-El. Following a

30. Lovell, 442.
32. John Lovell states that Burleigh came to St. George's in 1903; however, all other sources examined agree on the date 1894. Lovell, 443.
short term as a voice instructor at the National Conservatory, Burleigh expanded his activities as a soloist and gave numerous concerts before shifting his attention to composition.  

Burleigh's first examples of serious vocal music, a group of art songs for solo voice and piano, were composed during the last years of the nineteenth century. According to Lovell, he transcribed his first spirituals in 1901, arranging them for solo voice, quartet, or chorus. In 1911, the G. Ricordi Publishing Company hired him as a music editor; this subsequently led to the publication of many of his more than 200 compositions.

Of all the pieces examined for this chapter, the choral arrangements by Burleigh are among the most sonorous and lyrical. Mostly written for unaccompanied voices, Burleigh's arrangements consist of homophonic choral settings enriched by the occasional division of the voice parts. Diatonic harmonies prevail, and the rhythm, which dominates the arrangements of most other composers, is here understated. His most famous piece *Deep River* is a typical example. The pentatonic melody is given to the alto voice and accompanied with a four-part men's ensemble. All voices generally sing in their mid to low registers, creating a sense of warmth throughout most of the piece.

---

33. The dates of his retirement from Temple Emanu-El and his retirement from the concert stage are not available.

34. Lovell, 443.

35. A bibliography of Burleigh's compositions was unavailable.

36. G. Schirmer, 1913, no. 5815.
Emphasis is given to the subtle rhythmic off-beat accents of the melody by scoring half-note chords in the accompanying parts, and the occasional use of a secondary dominant chord tastefully enriches the simple, diatonic harmonizations (see Example 86).

Exceptions to this typical style of Burleigh are noteworthy. In 1921, Ricordi published Burleigh's *Didn't My Lord Deliver Daniel?*, which is written for a four-voice ensemble with piano accompaniment. Here, the rhythm is the dominant musical feature. Its choral settings include either homophonic sections, rhythmic solos with humming vocal accompaniments, or rhythmic solos accompanied by voice parts in which both the rhythm and the text are contrapuntally syncopated (Example 87).

Although the harmonies typical of Burleigh's spirituals rarely venture beyond their diatonic framework, a few interesting variants do occur. For example, the anthem *Steal Away*, begins with a simple


37. G. Ricordi, 1921, no. 1774.

38. G. Ricordi, 1924, no. 422.
diatonic harmonization that gradually increases in dramatic intensity by shifting to chromaticism. The harmonies produced by this chromatic motion include a variety of altered chords. Example Eighty-eight illustrates the point. This excerpt, in the key of b minor, contains several diminished triads and sevenths, plus a major submediant, and an augmented sixth chord (Example 88).

R. Nathaniel Dett

A Canadian by birth, R. Nathaniel Dett (1882-1943) received his musical training in the United States. In 1903, he graduated from


The Niagra Falls Collegiate Institute. After a brief attendance at the Halsted Conservatory in Lockport, New York, he matriculated at Oberlin College, where in 1908, he received the first bachelor of music degree in composition granted by that institution to a Negro. He was later lauded with honorary degrees by the Eastman School of Music, by Howard University, and finally by Oberlin in 1926.

Upon leaving Oberlin in 1908, Dett taught for three years at Lane College, Jackson, Tennessee, and then after two years at the Lincoln Institute, Jefferson City, Missouri, he was hired as the director of music at the Hampton Institute, Hampton, Virginia. He held this position from 1913 to 1931. During his tenure at Hampton, Dett

40. Cuney-Hare, 336.

41. In 1929, while at Hampton, Dett traveled to Paris to study composition with the famous Nadia Boulanger.
directed the chorus, an ensemble of 400 voices that received critical acclaim in the United States and abroad. He was also active as a concert pianist, with concerts in various major cities in the United States.

Dett's compositions include three works for chorus and orchestra, which are based on traditional Negro folksongs, five suites for piano, and two collections of choral arrangements of spirituals. His works are unique and often display unpredictable stylistic features. They are, for the most part, composed within a diatonic framework, but occasionally display bolder harmonic statements made up of short, quickly moving, chromatic passages. The Negro dialect and the pentatonic scale, both earmarks of the spiritual style, are used infrequently in these pieces. Moreover, they reflect a dramatic intensity that results from careful indications in the score of the proper tempo and dynamic nuance, and from the use of subtle text painting. Tasteful harmonic sequences and unexpected codas give evidence of Dett's skill as a composer.

A good example of Dett's style is found in *Listen to the Lambs*, a work made famous by the repeated performances of the Westminster Choir. The piece is descriptively subtitled "a religious characteristic in the form of an anthem." Written for a cappella choir, it is constructed in a tripartite form, and while the melody of the outer sections is derived from a traditional spiritual, the melody of the

---

42. A bibliography of Dett's compositions is included in Southern, "Dett," 405, and in Pratt and Boyd, 188.

43. G. Schirmer, 1914, no. 8010.
middle section is original. Interestingly, the basis of the melody derived from the pre-existing folksong is that of a minor scale, while the basis of the original melody is the typical pentatonic variety. Homophonic choral sections are constructed as either dialogues between various combinations of voice parts or as passages for solo voice accompanied by a humming ensemble. At the conclusion of the middle section, a descending harmonic sequence is combined with a choral ostinato on the text "in his bosom" to reassure the listener that the Lord will care for His flock (Example 89). The doleful cry of the lambs is skillfully depicted in the coda before the voices intone a solemn amen in unison (Example 90).

Example 89. R. Nathaniel Dett, *Listen to the Lambs* (G. Schirmer, no. 8010), measures 60-74.

Example 90. R. Nathaniel Dett, *Listen to the Lambs* (G. Schirmer, no. 8010), measures 87-100.
In 1933, Dett published *Wasn't That a Mighty Day?*[^45], an unaccompanied spiritual for five voices. Scored for three-part men's ensemble, the opening chorus illustrates how subtle chromatic alterations create unpredictability in Dett's harmonic progressions (Example 91). The point is further confirmed by the following solo alto section whose accompaniment slips midway into a series of diminished seventh chords (Example 92). Dett's penchant for the unexpected is further displayed at the conclusion of this piece, in which the basses sing a rhapsodic, quasi-recitative that is accompanied by sustained chords in the other voice parts (Example 93). Surprise conclusions characterize many of Dett's spirituals, and they range from the "blues" effect of

[^45]: G. Schirmer, 1933, no. 7712.

\begin{quote}
Andante religioso ed espressivo

\begin{verbatim}
What a mighty, mighty day, a mighty day,

Wasn't that a mighty day - Wasn't that a mighty day,

\end{verbatim}

\begin{verbatim}
Wasn't that a mighty day - When Jesus Christ was born!

\end{verbatim}

\begin{verbatim}
Wasn't that a mighty day - When Jesus Christ was born! (So lowly!)

\end{verbatim}

\begin{verbatim}
Wasn't that a mighty day - When Jesus Christ was born!

\end{verbatim}

\end{quote}

this piece, to the quasi-liturgical effect created by the threefold choral amen at the conclusion of the anthem \textit{I'll Never Turn Back No More}. 46

46. J. Fischer and Bro., 1917, no. 4435.

ALTO
Solo (ad. lib.)

God sent Jesus into this world to come as a little child;

In a manger they laid him low, And his mother was both meek and mild.

In a manger was laid low, And his mother was both meek and mild.

In a manger was laid low, And his mother was both meek and mild (O how low!)

"born?"

"born?"

"born?"

"born of Mary, a virgin; and because there was no room in the inn, she wrapped Him in swaddling clothes and laid Him in a manger!"

"born?"

"born?"

"born?"

"born of Mary, a virgin; and because there was no room in the inn, she wrapped Him in swaddling clothes and laid Him in a manger!"
William L. Dawson

William L. Dawson (1899– ) began his musical training at age thirteen, when he left his Alabama home to enter the Tuskegee Institute. Graduating in 1921, he pursued further training, first at the Washington College, Topeka, Kansas, and then at the Homer Institute of Fine Arts, Kansas City, Missouri, where he received a bachelor's degree in music in 1925. Two years later, in 1927, he received a master's degree in music from the American Conservatory of Music in Chicago.

Dawson performed with the Chicago Civic Orchestra from 1926 to 1930 as the principal trombonist, and he taught music in several colleges before returning to the Tuskegee Institute, where he founded the music school and served for twenty-five years as its first director. There, he directed the choir, an ensemble of 110 voices that toured extensively in the United States, sang for national radio broadcasts, and recorded professionally.

Prominent among his numerous compositions, and one that gave him considerable recognition, was the *Negro Folk Symphony*, which was premiered by the Philadelphia Orchestra under the direction of Leopold

---


Stokowski in 1934. The majority of his compositions, however, are spirituals intended for either solo voice or chorus. Many of these choral versions were written for the Tuskegee Choir and, for the most part, were published by the Neil A. Kjos Music Company.49

The concert programs of the many high school and collegiate choirs who performed for the national meetings of the various music educators' conferences attest to the popularity of Dawson's spirituals. Undoubtedly, this celebrity resulted largely from their emphasis on syncopated rhythms, which is created through a combination of melodic and textual accents. Like those of Burleigh, these anthems are scored mainly for unaccompanied voices within a homophonic framework, but the careful attention to tempo and dynamic contrast is more in the manner of those pieces by Dett. Angular melodies frequently outline triads and move freely throughout the voice parts. In the texts of these pieces, the Negro dialect is exaggerated considerably to create added rhythmical accents. Dawson's choice of chords ventures little beyond those contained in the diatonic framework, and altered chords, if used at all, are generally reserved for cadences.

Two examples of Dawson's highly rhythmical spirituals are Soon-ah Will Be Done50 and Ain-a That Good News!51 Both illustrate this composer's preference for the call and response technique, a choral style

49. A bibliography of Dawson's compositions was unavailable.

50. Music Press, 1934, no. 102-A.

in which a solo voice is accompanied by homophonic chorus. In the first of these, the rhythmic pulsation of the opening choral refrain with its ever present final phrase "goin' home to live with God"—this latter is used at the conclusion of every verse and refrain—provides a sense of musical unification as it recurs throughout the strophic anthem (Example 94). Correspondingly, the element of rhythm is somewhat downplayed in the verses of this piece. On the other hand, the rhythmic abandonment with which the sopranos begin *Ain-a That Good News!* finds little relief throughout the piece (Example 95). The aural effect of weeping and wailing is rather clearly portrayed in *Soon-ah Will Be Done* (Example 96), and the image of a heavenly harp is created in *Ain-a That Good News!* with a subito piano in all voice parts (Example 97). Both pieces, but especially the latter, illustrate Dawson's flair for the theatrical, for they contain examples of altered chords and divided voice parts in which the uppermost vocal ranges are showcased (Example 98).

*There Is a Balm in Gilead* is an example of Dawson's treatment of a slow, flowing folksong melody. Although many features of this style duplicate those of the previous examples, there is a noticeable relaxation of the rhythm and an underscoring of melodic contours through imitation (Example 99). At the conclusion of some phrases, the meter is frequently altered to better facilitate the relaxation of the tempo.


Allegro (Lightly) \( \text{\underline{\text{\textit{\textbf{c = 104}}}}} \)

Soon ah will be don' a-wid de trou-bles ob de worl;

Soon ah will be don' a-wid de trou-bles ob de worl;

Soon ah will be don' a-wid de trou-bles ob de worl;

Soon ah will be don' a-wid de trou-bles ob de worl;

Soon ah will be don' a-wid de trou-bles ob de worl;

trou-bles ob de worl; de trou-bles ob de worl;

trou-bles ob de worl; de trou-bles ob de worl;

trou-bles ob de worl; de trou-bles ob de worl;

trou-bles ob de worl; de trou-bles ob de worl;

trou-bles ob de worl; de trou-bles ob de worl;

Lively (M.M. = 104)

I got a crown up in a the King-dom, Ain'-a that good news!

Lively (M.M. = 104)

I got a crown up in a the King-dom, Ain'-a that good news!

I got a crown up in a the King-dom, Ain'-a that good news!

I got a crown up in a the King-dom, Ain'-a that good news!

```
subito (J = 76)

subito (J = 76) with restrained joy
Ain' a that good news!
I got a harp up in the Kingdom, Ain' a that good news!

subito (J = 76) with restrained joy
Ain' a that good news!
```


```
cresc.

Iungi quickly
good news, good news, good news, good news, my Lawd! Ain' a that
good news, good news, good news, good news, my Lawd! Ain' a that
good news, good news, good news, good news, my Lawd!
good good news, good news, good news, good news, my Lawd! quickly
```


Commercial Advancements of the Spiritual

During the 1930's and 1940's, at the height of the a cappella movement in this country, the catalogues of certain publishing houses reflected an increase in the number of arrangements of spirituals. The prior composition of spirituals had been mostly undertaken by Negro composers; however, several of these new pieces were written by non-ethnic musicians, who tended to emphasize the entertaining aspects of the style through the use of rhythm and dialect in their new arrangements. Although these parodies must have appealed to their largely Caucasian audiences, they were abhorred by the Negro composers, among them John W. Work, who felt that these new pieces distorted and abused the religious intent of the folksongs from which they were derived.\(^53\) Undoubtedly, he was correct in many cases, yet the performances of this group of Caucasian-based spirituals drew the attention of increasing numbers of the American public, and in so doing, undoubtedly helped to establish the genre as part of the American repertory during the following years.

Chief among the non-Negro spiritual composers was Noble Cain, the director of the Senn High School A Cappella Choir. The percussive imitation of almost everything from shuffling gospel shoes to the bell and the whistle of the gospel train, are included in Cain's spirituals, implying that he aimed these pieces for concert performances rather than church use (Example 100). On the other hand, no church youth choir

---

library will likely be without at least some representation of Cain's versions.

These pieces contain most of the characteristics of their models. Cain arranged them primarily for a large, unaccompanied choral ensemble with up to eight voice parts. The choral sections, which are usually homophonic, are often designed either as choral dialogues or as solos accompanied by the full ensemble. The texts, drawn from traditional Negro spirituals, exaggerate the Negro dialect, and the style is further popularized through the use of simple jazz progressions (Example 101).

Around 1950, the Negro spiritual found its way into the repertory of the professional popular singing ensembles such as Fred Waring's
Pennsylvanians. Many of their arrangements were provided by Robert Shaw, who was then musical director of the group. These arrangements are scored for various combinations of men's voices and frequently include passages for solo voice. Homophonic choruses sing texts in an exaggerated dialect just like those of Cain, but Shaw's rhythmic usage, unlike that of Cain, exploits a skillful contrapuntal interaction between the voices (Example 102). By the mid-century, the simple Negro spiritual, which had begun as an improvisatory choral style, had evolved through these arrangements into a form so technically demanding that its performance challenged even the finest ensembles.

54. For a fuller account of Robert Shaw and the Collegiate Chorale, consult Chapter Three.

Refrain

(Let it rock 'n' ride!)

My Lawd, Good Lawd, Good Lawd, To

Yo' God— and my God, Good Lawd, I'm gwine home,

My Lawd, Good Lawd, I'm gwine home,
Chapter VII
SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS

In the initial stages of this study, it was presumed that those anthems written and performed in America during the years of the two World Wars and an intervening economic depression reflected the sociological upheaval of these eras. Interestingly, such was not the case, for no evidence exists to support this hypothesis. Instead, the stylistic evolution of the anthem in America derived from three separate occurrences, not unrelated from one another, but apparently little influenced by the sociological changes of the time. These events included the addition of professional singers to the volunteer choirs of many churches, the establishment of the English choral tradition in American churches, and the practice of a cappella singing by American collegiate and high school choirs. Although they overlapped each other historically, for the most part, these events occurred successively.

During the final years of the nineteenth century, the choirs of many metropolitan churches were augmented with a quartet of professional soloists, who could better negotiate the technical difficulties of the more operatic style of European church music preferred by the congregation. This left little need for the participation of volunteer choral singers and all but abolished any choral tradition that existed in American churches. At the same time, these changes created a need for a type of anthem that could be performed either primarily or entirely by the quartet. The initial compositions of Dudley Buck, with their tuneful
melodies and saccharine harmonies, delighted the congregations of fashionable churches. Three of Buck's pupils: Harry Rowe Shelley, Raymond H. Woodman, and William H. Neidlinger were largely responsible for the continuation of this type of anthem into the twentieth century, and it seems quite likely that the style might have dominated the composition of American anthems throughout the first half of the century, had it not been for the introduction of the English choral tradition into American churches.

During some of the same years that Buck's anthems swept the country, Horatio Parker produced music for full choir that included little material for soloists and utilized a more stable harmonic framework by avoiding "popular" melodies and chromaticism. The efforts of Parker prepared the way for English-born immigrants such as T. Tertius Noble, H. Alexander Matthews, and T. Frederick H. Candlyn to introduce to American congregations a type of anthem composed for full choir in the English manner. Because the musical abilities of many of the newly- or re-formed volunteer ensembles in American churches were somewhat lacking, when compared to the professional quartets, these new anthems featured simply-constructed choral parts, with the more difficult passages reserved for the organ accompaniment. Subsequently, this style of anthem became the trademark of such as Seth Bingham, H. Everett Titcomb, Joseph Clokey, Philip James and Leo Sowerby, who were known in this country not only as composers, but also as competent organists.

Although these two developments resulted from events related directly to the American church, the most influential factor affecting the anthem in America, the practice of a cappella singing, occurred
outside the church. Founded in the performance medium of both American and Russian choral ensembles concertizing in the major cities of the United States during the first three decades of this century, this performance practice captured the attention of American concertgoers largely through the programs of the choirs from two church-related colleges—St. Olaf and Westminster Choir College. Because they concertized to attract students and potential benefactors to their schools, both of these organizations consistently produced outstanding performances of their repertories, which initially featured the original compositions and arrangements for a cappella choir by F. Melius Christiansen, the director of the St. Olaf group. Christiansen's pieces not only augmented the existing anthem repertory, but they also inspired a wealth of similar music by numerous other composers.

As the number of collegiate a cappella choirs increased, the practice was adopted by many high school glee clubs as well. As a result, the number of such choral ensembles associated with American educational institutions surpassed those of the American churches, if not in total number, certainly in size. During the 1930's and 1940's, it appears that many of the more festive original compositions and arrangements of sacred music, characterized by multiple divisions of unaccompanied voice parts, were issued for the larger, more proficient choirs of the high schools and colleges, rather than for the choirs in the churches. Included in this body of music were numerous American editions of Russian choral music, American imitations of the Russian style, as well as both Negro and Caucasian arrangements of spirituals.
In that many of these same pieces were found also in the choral libraries of American churches, it seems that these larger, more difficult anthems came to the church through the influence of the school ensembles. When one considers that many collegiate and high school choral directors also served churches as music directors, this evolution is not at all surprising. Moreover, the choral renaissance that occurred in this country was in part perpetuated by the interrelationship of the school and church choral programs. Today, this relationship is waning, for many church congregations view choral music only as a vehicle for transporting the spoken word, and many schools view it only as an aesthetic experience with no message for the modern man. It appears, then, that the strength of the anthem in America from 1900 to 1950 was built upon the emotional wedding of these two ideas, and though it now seems in abeyance, this union cannot be destroyed if the strong tradition of choral music in America is to continue.
BIBLIOGRAPHY

Books


**Articles**


__________. "This is Not an Article," Educational Music Magazine XXV (March-April, 1946), 27, 72-73.


"Dean of Church Musicians Retires from Brick Church," The Diapason LI (August 1, 1960), 21.

Dickinson, Clarence. "Growth of Seminary School of Music Told by Founder," The Diapason LI (December 1, 1959), 56.

"Director Thompson Leaves Depauw Post," The Diapason XLVII (June 1, 1956), 4.

"Dr. Clarence Dickinson Recovering from Illness," The Diapason XLIX (March 1, 1958), 1.

"Dr. George Lynn," The Diapason LV (May 1, 1964), 2.

"Dr. H. A. Matthews Retires; 54 Years in Philadelphia," The Diapason XLV (June 1, 1954), 1.

"Dr. H. Alex. Matthews Active in America for Half a Century," The Diapason XLI (April 1, 1950), 22.

"Dr. H. Alexander Matthews," The Diapason LXIV (June 1, 1973), 11.

"Dr. T. Frederick H. Candlyn," The American Organist XXXVII (May, 1954), 159.

"Dr. T. Frederick H. Candlyn," The Diapason XLV (July 1, 1954), 17.

"Dr. T. Tertius Noble Dies at the Age of 86," The Diapason XLIV (June 1, 1953), 1.


"Everett Titcomb," The Diapason XLIII (August 1, 1952), 10.
"Everett Titcomb Awarded Doctorate by Seminary," *The Diapason* XLV (September 1, 1954), 4.

"Everett Titcomb Honored at NYC Chapter Service," *The Diapason* LII (April 1, 1961), 12.

"Everett Titcomb Honored on Fortieth Anniversary," *The Diapason* XLII (January 1, 1951), 12.


"George Lynn," *Journal of Church Music* XI (October, 1969), 16.


"Heart Attacks Fell Two Church Music Leaders," *The Diapason* LI (November 1, 1960), 1.


"Honor Seth Bingham, Who Retires After 38 Years at Church," *The Diapason* XLII (July 1, 1951), 20.


"Joseph W. Clokey, Composer, on Tour of Midwest," *The Diapason* XLVI (December 1, 1954), 1.


"Obituary Notices," *The American Organist* XXXVI (April, 1953), 139.


"Philip James Retires from N. Y. University," *The Diapason* XLVI (September 1, 1955), 1.


"Seth Bingham Recovers from Injury, Finishes New Work," *The Diapason* XLIV (September 1, 1953), 16.


Thompson, Harold W. "Joseph W. Clokey's Compositions Form Subject for Study," *The Diapason* XL (May 1, 1949), 10.

"Van Denman Thompson," *The Diapason* LX (February 1, 1969), 1.


Weaver, Paul J. "Choral Music in the College and University," *Yearbook of the Music Educators National Conference* (1938), 116-118.


**Encyclopedia Articles**


---


**Unpublished Typescripts**


Editions of Music


Recordings