NATIVE AMERICAN ELEMENTS IN PIANO REPERTOIRE BY THE INDIANIST
AND PRESENT-DAY NATIVE AMERICAN COMPOSERS

Lisa Cheryl Thomas, B.M.E., M.M.

Dissertation Prepared for the Degree of

DOCTOR OF MUSICAL ARTS

UNIVERSITY OF NORTH TEXAS

May 2010

APPROVED:

Adam Wodnicki, Major Professor
Steven Friedson, Minor Professor
Joseph Banowetz, Committee Member
Jesse Eschbach, Chair of the Division of Keyboard Studies
Graham Phipps, Director of Graduate Studies in the College of Music
James C. Scott, Dean of the College of Music
Michael Monticino, Dean of the Robert B. Toulouse School of Graduate Studies

My paper defines and analyzes the use of Native American elements in classical piano repertoire that has been composed based on Native American tribal melodies, rhythms, and motifs. First, a historical background and survey of scholarly transcriptions of many tribal melodies, in chapter 1, explains the interest generated in American indigenous music by music scholars and composers. Chapter 2 defines and illustrates prominent Native American musical elements. Chapter 3 outlines the timing of seven factors that led to the beginning of a truly American concert idiom, music based on its own indigenous folk material. Chapter 4 analyzes examples of Native American inspired piano repertoire by the “Indianist” composers between 1890-1920 and other composers known primarily as “mainstream” composers. Chapter 5 proves that the interest in Native American elements as compositional material did not die out with the end of the “Indianist” movement around 1920, but has enjoyed a new creative activity in the area called “Classical Native” by current day Native American composers.

The findings are that the creative interest and source of inspiration for the earlier “Indianist” compositions was thought to have waned in the face of so many other American musical interests after 1920, but the tradition has recently taken a new direction with the success of many new Native American composers who have an intrinsic commitment to see it succeed as a category of classical repertoire. Native American musical elements have been misunderstood for many years due to differences in systems of notation and cultural barriers. The ethnographers and Indianist composers, though criticized for creating a paradox, in reality
are the ones who saved the original tribal melodies and created the perpetual interest in Native American music as a thematic resource for classical music repertoire, in particular piano repertoire.
Copyright 2009

by

Lisa Cheryl Thomas
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>LIST OF MUSICAL EXAMPLES</td>
<td>iv</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LIST OF ILLUSTRATIONS</td>
<td>vi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Chapters</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. INTRODUCTION</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. NATIVE AMERICAN MUSICAL ELEMENTS</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. SEVEN FACTORS LEADING TO AN AMERICAN CONCERT IDiom</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. THE “INDIANIST” MOVEMENT</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. CURRENT DAY NATIVE AMERICAN COMPOSERS</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. CONCLUSION</td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Appendices</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. &quot;INDIANIST&quot; COMPOSERS AND SELECTED REPERTOIRE WITH PIANO</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. MAINSTREAM EUROPEAN AND AMERICAN COMPOSERS COMPOSING WORKS IN THE</td>
<td>67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. NATIVE AMERICAN COMPOSERS AND PIANO REPERTOIRE</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BIBLIOGRAPHY</td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>List of Musical Examples</td>
<td>Page</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Rameau, <em>Les Sauvages</em></td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Burton, rhythmic phenomena</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Boas, Eskimo melodies</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Farwell, <em>Dawn</em></td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. “The Old Man’s Love Song”</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Otoe melody</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Farwell, <em>Pawnee Horses</em></td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. Pawnee melody</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. Skilton, <em>Sioux Flute Serenade</em></td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11. Cadman, <em>Return of the Braves</em></td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12. Cadman, <em>Return of the Braves</em></td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13. Omaha melodies</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15. MacDowell, <em>From an Indian Lodge</em></td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16. Walla-walla melodies</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17. Hopi Katzina Rain Dance</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18. Busoni, <em>Indianisches Tagebuch Nr. 1</em></td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20. Davids, <em>Fishing the Milky Way</em></td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21. Deganvdogv, <em>Deganogista Talutsa</em></td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22. Ballard, “Ombaska”</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
23. Ballard, “Tabideh” ........................................................................................................................................ 51
24. Ballard, “Nikatoheh” .................................................................................................................................. 52
25. Ballard, “To’Kah’Ni” .................................................................................................................................. 54
## LIST OF ILLUSTRATIONS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Page</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Russell, <em>Her Heart is on the Ground</em> .................................................. 29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Catlin, <em>Wild Horses at Play</em> ........................................................................ 30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>Remington, <em>Love Call</em> .................................................................................... 32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>Katzinas ........................................................................................................... 38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td>Cherokee baskets ............................................................................................. 47</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CHAPTER 1

INTRODUCTION

Voyages of exploration in the 15th century brought inquisitive travelers to the New World. One of the remarkable discoveries, along with corn, beautiful waves of grain, buffalos, and red skinned natives, was an intriguing music that was like no other they had ever heard. Immigrants to America were seductively drawn to learn more about the Native Americans, the uninhibited “savages,” because they saw people who practiced what “refined” people of the Western world shunned as taboo behaviors, such as wearing animal skins and feathers (strangely not equated with civilized people wearing leather shoes, and wearing mink and fox coats), painting their bodies, singing with “nonsense” vocables (syllables without meaning) in a loud, harsh, strained timbre, with “uncivilized” animalistic whoops and yells, and conducting unheard-of ceremonies involving trances and communication with spirits of animals and ancestors. But “intriguing” is where the fascination with this music remained for about four hundred years, for several reasons. Number one, for reasons both real and imagined, the newcomers were terribly afraid of the natives, so approachability was a major barrier to cultural discovery. Number two, Western systems of notation did not readily serve to notate this “uncultured” music, with new rhythmic and metric phenomena, pitches that did not fit

---

2 Native American was the term most frequently used in reference to the indigenous people of the New World and during the historical framework of this paper. It was also the term used by the included composers, writers, and scholars referenced, in addition to just the term, “Indian.” However, most recently, since the late 1980s, the more accepted name for these people is American Indian, so for the first part of this paper, “Native American” is used in context and the latter part, “American Indian” is used in context, or vice versa, where deemed appropriate by this author.
3 The word “savage” was used frequently in reference to the indigenous people of the New World and will be used as a poignant adjective where deemed appropriate throughout this paper. It incites in Native Americans probably the same emotional reaction that African Americans experience when the “n” word was or is used, and I believe that avoiding the use of this now politically incorrect word would “cover up” the true picture of the historical framework of this paper.
Western systems of notation, played on different instruments. Three, even regarding the rare occasion of accessible indigenous culture, Indians did not share what they considered sacred with outsiders who broke treaties with them time after time. Four, they had an inexpressible contempt for white people and most of the time called them *hottuk ookproose* (the accursed people, in the Cherokee language). The most favorable name they had for white people was *Nothings*.\(^4\) Number five, the timing just wasn’t right – perhaps the new settlers were more preoccupied with gaining independence from England and Spain, and with building their own new lives, also involving the art of survival in an unsettled land. After the Revolutionary War and independence from governmental ties with Europe, came the growing pains of becoming a united country, and so after the Civil War had been over by a generation, creativity began to flourish along with the realization of the need for an identity all their own, a uniquely American identity.

This progression of history caused the dilution of a natural resource of that American identity and the diffusion of an indigenous culture. Hundreds of thousands of white people coming to America (prophesied in ancient Indian lore, Hopi in particular\(^5\)) would ultimately lead to cultural mixing. Removing the Indians from their homelands and corralling them into controlled reservation areas, forbidding them to use their own language, sing their songs or practice the ways of their people, their dances, and religion, forcing them to instead adopt Christian ways, sing Christian hymns, and speak English (yet at the same time denying them American citizenship) would lead to the realization that this centuries old cultural treasure was


in danger of not only no longer being pure, but also of being lost forever. Accordingly, there was a fervor, a shibboleth\(^6\) rush, to collect and record such treasure from the 1880s to 1920s. Even though the collections were done by Westerners in the Western system of notation, these are the closest printed representations that we have to the original indigenous music. The wax cylinder recordings are the most accurate renditions of the original tribal melodies, but these were not as available to the public as the printed transcriptions.

It should be pointed out that many other interested people had already been gathering melodies they had heard in various places, but this was rather haphazard and some were recorded from popular side show attractions that were a concoction of what the white man expected to see from “wild” Indians; songs and dances taken out of context, of the sort that would bring the most money at a sideshow. Even Dvořák and Farwell were discovered to have found some of their material at some of these less authentic medicine sideshows.\(^7\) One of the earliest Native American based compositions \textit{Les Sauvages} (The Savages; see Musical Example 1) by Rameau (1683-1764) recalls at the harpsichord “the dance of two Indians from Louisiana which Rameau had seen at the Italian theater in Paris,”\(^8\) but there is no quotation of Native American melodies, nor any replica of their rhythms. From the description in the preface notes of the Kalmus edition, \textit{The Graded Rameau}, there was no singing, or drumming along with it and so it was totally out of the context of native dancing, leaving the impression that these two

\(^6\)Term meaning “watch cry” of the time, from a story in the Bible, Judges 12:5-6. I have used this term intentionally here, because much has been written about the undeniable indicators and artifacts that point to the likelihood that the Cherokees are descendants of the lost tribes of Israel – see especially the book by James Adair.


Native Americans were kidnapped and taken back to Europe to put on display without the rest of the “performance group” or benefit of the real scenario.


But there were others who endeavored a systematic method for the collection of Native American melodies. Notable ethnographers and scholars who devoted their life’s work to the preservation of authentic tribal melodies and cultural facts and stories during this time include Theodor Baker (1851-1934), Alice Cunningham Fletcher (1838-1923), Frances Densmore (1867-1957), Natalie Curtis (1875-1921), Franz Boas (1858-1942), E. von Hornbostel (1877-1935),

---

9 Professor of Anthropology at Columbia University, who established fieldwork as a prerequisite of American anthropology and transcribed many Eskimo melodies.

10 He taught an interdisciplinary mix in the study of pre-contact cultures.
George Herzog (1901-1984), 11 Frederick Burton (1861-1909), 12 and Thurlow Lieurance (1878-1963). 13 Some of these deserve further attention, as it pertains to this paper.

Theodor Baker (born in New York, 1851, died in Dresden, Germany, 1934) was the first to scholarly and systematically record some of the Native American music and make it available for use by composers with his transcriptions. In the summer of 1880, Baker travelled back to his homeland in America to research and record music from various Indian tribes for his doctoral thesis at the University of Leipzig entitled Über die Musik der nordamerikanischen Wilden (On the Music of the North American Savages), published in 1882. 14 He collected melodies primarily from the Seneca tribe singers in the western New York area, but also some from the Iroquois, Cheyenne, Comanche, Dakota, Iowa, Kiowa, and Ponca tribes. 15 His collections then became the source for compositions in Western Europe, for such composers as Dvořák, and MacDowell, an American who completed his studies in Europe. 16

Alice Fletcher (1838-1923) was a pioneer because of her wax cylinder recordings, which made it possible to hear the native nuance of the music as well as see it in print. She was able to do an in depth study of the Omaha Indians in Nebraska by spending three decades with one tribe, who came to trust her with their tribal songs, but she also recorded music and cultural

11 A student of Hornbostel, he established a consistent methodology for comparative musicology and archival work.
12 He was a composer who transcribed many of the Ojibway melodies.
13 Another composer who spent many years collecting Indian melodies.
15 Due to limited funds, most of Baker’s work was limited to transcribing music of one tribe, the Seneca, However, because of a meeting of tribal chiefs arranged by the Indian Office of the Federal Government, he also transcribed many melodies from these additional tribes. Accessed online 10/05/2009 www.newworldrecords.org/linernotes/80542.pdf
information of the Pawnee, Winnebago, Sioux, Nez Pierce and other tribes. As an ethnologist, her work went a step beyond Baker’s by providing the cultural background of the songs she transcribed, so that composers could know about the story or ceremony that gave rise to the song, and “in developing the theme, all the movements might be consonant with the circumstances that had inspired the motive.”

Frances Densmore (1867-1957) identified the unique elements in Native American music that seemed to be true in every tribe, especially the ability to play two music lines in two separate meters and perform it the same every time. Her cultural research and transcription work spanned 46 years (1910-1956) and filled 14 volumes, including over 1500 songs from the Chippewa, Teton Sioux, Northern Ute, Mandan, Hidatsa, Pawnee, Cocopa, and Menominee tribes.

Natalie Curtis (1875-1921) wrote down the accompanying stories and legends to many songs from the Wabanaki, Dakota, Pawnee, Arapaho, Cheyenne, Navajo, Kiowa, Winnebago, Zuni, Kwakiutl, Pima, Mojave-Apache, Yuma, San Juan, Acoma, Laguna, and Hopi tribes, and she was instrumental, because of her friendship with President Roosevelt, in preserving Native American artifacts. “She was one of the few pioneers to defy an intolerant bureaucracy and she helped to pave the way for scholarly efforts at study and preservation of the culture of the Native Americans ....”

---

18 Alice Fletcher. *Indian Story and Song from North America.* (Boston: Small, Maynard & Co., 1900) vii.
CHAPTER 2

NATIVE AMERICAN MUSICAL ELEMENTS

Transcribing the tribal songs proved to be a difficult task. What actually existed, pre-European invasion, was a music system unlike any other, one very complicated, and sophisticated, indeed, one with phenomena “so bewildering that scholars otherwise sane have been led to declare not only that the primitive red man has developed rhythm to a plane higher than that attained by civilization, but that he has a conception of rhythm wholly at variance with ours,”\(^\text{20}\) one whose rhythmic phenomena should not be overlooked as an influence toward, or contributor of elements in American jazz,\(^\text{21}\) one that was nothing like the “dumbed-down” version which became ubiquitous throughout the western cultures. Frances Densmore writes of rhythmic perplexities and of the unique change or “catch” in the rhythm soon after the middle of most songs, and that many songs cannot be divided into rhythmic phrases.

Musical Example 2, from Burton’s Ojibway melodies, illustrates the simultaneous use of two different meters and tempi, yet each time they were performed, they were the same. Franz Boas, in transcribing the rhythms of Eskimos, used Western notation, but sometimes omitted the bar lines, only using accents for the stronger beats (see Musical Example 3). It is my belief that there is no meter as we know it, but a constant beat of one, just as is the heartbeat of all creation that they portray with their drumming, or if you prefer, in our system, the meter is always 1/4.


\(^{21}\)The author’s long held belief is further supported in:

Musical Example 2: Frederick Burton, Ojibway transcriptions of two simultaneous tempi and meters between the voice and drum parts. Notice that the two parts do not align except for one beat at (d).  

Musical Example 3: Franz Boas’ transcriptions of Eskimo melodies showing omission of bar lines, marking the strong beats with accents, and using no, or sparse, meter indications.  

---

In addition to unique rhythmic elements, Densmore writes in detail of the nature of this music that goes outside of the notational capabilities of Western systems, with progressions of sound smaller than a semitone, wandering melodies without a keynote in the Western sense of that term, and “reasonably correct use of the simplest upper partials or overtones of a fundamental, and uncertainty in singing semitones.”

The interval of an octave and a perfect fifth, as well as a major third were consistently reported as exact and clear, but the fourth, seventh, and second intervals were difficult to transcribe in Western notation because of varying intonations. Alice Fletcher writes, “this music possesses a charm of spontaneity that cannot fail to please those who would come near to nature and enjoy the expression of emotion untrammeled by the intellectual control of schools. These songs are like the wild flowers that have not yet come under the transforming hand of the gardener.”

Densmore concluded that Indian music should be studied “as an expression apart and different from our own music, and that its structure be compared with that of our music as little as possible.”

Hundreds of years ago, there were some distinct regional differences in Native American music; hundreds of different tribes, grouped into ten North American geographic and cultural areas: Northwest Coast, California, Plateau, Great Basin, Southwest, Great Plains, Northeast, Southeast, Arctic, Subarctic. For example, a Zuni (Southwest region) lullaby was soft in tone, and was limited to two pitches, and peyote cult songs (a religion involving the use

---

25Alice Fletcher. American Story and Song (Boston: Small, Maynard & Company, 1900), viii-ix.
26Densmore, The American Indians, 139.
28If one included Central America in the whole of North America, there would be an eleventh area including the MesoAmerican civilizations of the Mayan, Aztec, Olmec, and Toltec Indians.
of the peyote cactus, first spread by the Comanche and Kiowa to Indians of the plains, Southwest, prairies, and Great Lakes, to now half of the Indian population of the United States\(^\text{30}\) were sung with a softer vocal quality. Over time, and since European contact, most native music has settled into the “Plains Indian style,” due to a large part on inter-tribal pow-wows held all across the United States. Similarities in the North American regional musical style and the newer widely practiced Plains Indian style include a general downward cascading trend of the melody line, a pulsating vocal technique on sustained notes, irregular metric patterns, juxtaposition of unpredictable duple and triple rhythms,\(^\text{31}\) and harsh and strained vocal technique. In most areas, the melody spanned the range of a fifth to a twelfth, (the twelfth being an octave and a fifth above the “tonic”) and were often what we refer to as pentatonic. Chains of major and minor thirds were also prevalent.\(^\text{32}\) Other commonalities include trailing off of the pitch at the ends of phrases, and a repeated final pitch at the end of phrases, or several repeated final pitches at the end of the song, usually with a big crescendo.

The subject matter of Native American music in all tribes was most often of a functional nature: for ceremonies, festivals and games, in preparation for war or hunting, and used for wooing, healing and lullabies. Occasionally, music was for personal enjoyment, such as during the playing of games. It also reveals a very different aesthetic in that the music was not intended for performance for an audience, but rather as a medium of communication with other spirits that would for example, enable someone to supplement his powers through the

\(^{30}\)Waldman. Encyclopedia of Native American Tribes, 77, 78.


spirits of other living creatures in order to obtain more than human power. Another interesting fact is that even though Native Americans sometimes sang work songs that gave them a working rhythm for a task and passed the time of the work task, they never sang laborers’ songs, or blues songs like the African Americans, about their own pain and misery. Most tribal songs were simple, short statements, with words such as “Behold the dawn,” or words in praise of someone else (for which usually gifts were given), and other songs expressing an emotion, would only use vocables, or “nonsense” syllables. One contrasting exception to the length of songs is the Navajo (the largest tribe in America, with over 200,000 members) ceremonial chants, of which there are 50, with up to 500 songs per chant. Some of the ceremonial chants are entitled Nightway, Enemyway, and Mountainway. The ceremonies accompany ritual procedures and can last a few hours or up to nine nights, depending on the severity of whatever needs restoring to beauty, blessedness and harmony. Even though the Navajo have many types of music, this is their “classical” music, music that is a tradition many generations old, and memorized music that contains lines of poetry thousands of lines long, similar in complexity to a Wagnerian opera. Although the text in other songs within the chant may be rather short, it is repeated and musically varied depending on the occasion. Among all tribes, love songs were seldom, if ever, sung, rather played on a flute. They thought that the white man talked too much and thus, Native American songs were very short and to the point, seldom with an introduction. “The Indian knew how to leave a great deal unsaid, and he trusted

---

33 Densmore, The American Indians, 63.
34 Laubin, Indian Dances, 92.
The rhythm was seldom, if ever, the stereotyped four beat pattern with every first beat accented. On the contrary, rhythms were irregular and complex, with unpredictable accents, and were often in an intricate rhythmical polyphony (especially among Northwest Coast tribes), with a different tempo to each part, in the same sense that polyphony is two independent lines occurring at the same time, and in the same sense that Busoni’s writing style in *Indianisches Jahrbuch* (the second book of the Red Indian Diary, which is a composition for chamber orchestra), the piece, *Gesang vom Reigen der Geister* (Song of the Spirit Dance) is described as having a harmonic polyphony and web of counter point, which he defended as being “found on the structure and content of the piece itself.”

The melodic texture was monophonic, but when combined with the other elements, there was polyphony between the melody and the rhythm of the drum, rattles, dance steps, and sounds of nature. Some melodies were of the “call and response” type that overlapped endings and beginnings of phrases, and there are some accounts of melodies with a drone type of bass (particularly among Eastern tribes). Indeed, the Indians described their own music as consisting of many sounds together: “We sang songs that carried in their melodies all the sounds of nature – the running of waters, the sighing of winds, and the calls of the animals.” [emphasis added] I must assert that they performed *with* the sounds of nature all

---

40 Driver. *Indians of North America*, 204.
41 William Marder, Paul Tice, ed., *Indians in North America: The Untold Story* (San Diego: Book Tree, 2005), 106. (from a memorial presentation for the letter to the Mayor of Chicago at a Grand Council Fire of Indians held on December 1, 1927.)
around them and with an awareness of a very real spirit world, and did not sing in a vacuum, a type of precursor to John Cage (1912-1992), who brought exterior sounds to center stage in 4’33”,42 and Luigi Nono (1924-1990), who included whispered sounds in his music. So for Native American music to be effectively reproduced in concert, it must be more than the mere transcribed melody from an ethnographer’s collection. Alice Fletcher talks of the difficulty of separating the melody from all the surrounding “noises” that were customary to the performance of a song: the drum, the ever-restless wind, and the out of door setting.43 I don’t think it was meant to be separated, rather included.

No one who has ever heard Indian songs in their own environment, under broad skies amid the sweep of wind and grasses, can fail to feel that they are there a note in a nature symphony. Take the Indian from nature, or nature from the Indian, and the Indian’s art, if it survives, must undergo the change of supplying from within that which was unconsciously received from without. It must embody the lost nature-world.44

This is why the Indian Removal Act caused a deeper travesty than if you or I were moved from one city to another. I believe that moving them out of their ancestral homelands stripped them and their songs, songs which were sung for every event in the Indian’s life from the cradle to the grave,45 from their accompanying symphony, and when the ethnologists transcribed their tribal melodies, collected on the reservations, they were only hearing the stripped down version of original Native American songs. The Indian Territory (later, Oklahoma) reservations’ windy plains would be an entirely different accompaniment than the Eastern Woodlands’ euphony and cacophony of sound that the Cherokees sang with for thousands of years.

42The 4’33” of staged silence in reality draws attention to surrounding sounds, thus, bringing them to the spotlight as the musical elements of a piece which would be different each time it is performed.
43Alice Fletcher. Indian Story and Song. 117.
44Natalie Curtis. The Indians’ Book, xxxii.
45Fletcher. Indian Story and Song,” 115.
CHAPTER 3

SEVEN FACTORS LEADING TO AN AMERICAN CONCERT IDIOM

The events of history and the vast amount of new compositional material transcribed, printed, and recorded by ethnographers, as discussed in Chapter 1, were leading to an opportunistic timing for the beginning of a truly identifiable American music school, which seemed to finally be ripe around 1880 when at least seven factors came together.

The first was the new availability of a large amount of compositional thematic material published by ethnographers, as explained in Chapter 1.

Secondly, ethnomusicology became a separate educational discipline. There has been a Western interest in the music of non Western people since the voyages of discovery, but an even more dramatic flurry of activity, and melting pot of ideas from different disciplines occurred from about the 1880s to the 1920s, because of the rush to preserve pre-contact ancient civilizations, also known as “salvage ethnology.”

There were many debates about approaches, and the idea that music should be studied in the context of its culture evolved into the separate discipline of ethnomusicology. Even the term ethnomusicology did not come about until 1950, used as a subtitle in a book by Dutch ethnomusicologist, Jaap Kunst (1891-1960), having first evolved through the term “comparative musicology” (studying from a book, from a comfortable arm chair’s distance), to a discipline that relied heavily on field work and participant observation so that the insider’s view was possible. Several scholars made

---

contributions to this area. Alan Merriam (1923-1980) authored “the anthropology of music.” Branislaw Malinowski (1884-1942; associated with the terms “functional anthropology,” 1926, and “the ethnographic present”) held that culture is the instrument by which the seven basic needs of individuals are satisfied. Clifford Geertz (b. 1926) expands Max Weber’s statement, “man is an animal suspended in webs of significance he himself has spun,” and Geertz takes culture to be those webs of significance. James Clifford espouses participant observation - the *emic* or meaningful, familiar approach, as opposed to the *etic* or unattached, onlooker’s approach. More recently, Bruno Nettl (b. 1930) additionally proposed analyzing the structures of significance by sorting out each culture’s core values. Because of technology and the Internet, “being there” and participant observation now has a new meaning, so that ethnomusicology has continued to evolve and the question now is whether it is a science and if so, what kind should it be? But the discipline remains unique in one constant principle: music should be studied as inseparable from the culture of its people. So, it is important to realize that at the turn of the century, the time of the nationalism movement, and the time of salvage ethnology, there were many followers of this new discipline who studied music as culture, and much was being recorded and written especially about the music and culture of pre-European contact civilizations.

Third, the frightening savages had been moved to controlled reservation areas. The Cherokee Trail of Tears is the story of the removal of the Cherokees from their homelands in

---

48 Allan Merriam (1923-1980) author of *The Anthropology of Music*, promotes the study of music from an anthropological perspective, centered around the study of “music in culture,” and later amended to “music as culture.”

49 nutrition, reproduction, bodily comforts, safety, relaxation, movement and growth

50 The “Da Sein” theory, coined by Martin Heidegger, German philosopher (1889-1973) and his student Hans Georg Gadamer.
the southern part of the mountains and valleys of the Appalachian chain (what later became North Carolina, western Virginia, West Virginia, eastern Tennessee, and Georgia) to Indian Territory (later Oklahoma) in 1838. The Apache Wars lasted for 25 years, and removing the Apaches to reservations took several bloody battles with famous Apache leaders, Victorio and Geronimo. Geronimo, who had become a legend among non-Indians as well as his own people, was captured and escaped many times, until his final capture at the end of the last sustained Indian uprising in the United States, 1881-1886. He was never allowed to return to his homeland and was kept a prisoner of war until his death in 1909. The Sioux also gave in slowly to removal to reservations, with the last surrender coming after the massacre at the infamous battle of Wounded Knee in 1890. Indian containment in reservation areas made it easier and safer to study their music and way of life, or so it seemed at first, because the collateral cultural damage by removing them from their tribal lands was invisible for a long time to outsiders. However, accessibility takes on a new meaning when we read that Natalie Curtis traveled several days by train and two more days on horseback through difficult country to reach the Pueblo Indians and record their ancient lore. The reservations were often in remote areas, requiring serious dedication to the task of cultural research. The task of traveling to gather some of these tribal melodies was not as easy as we might first imagine today, and (even at that point) the ethnographers still had to convince the natives to let them record these songs. There was one additional obstacle. The United States government had forbidden any singing of Indian songs, or practicing of ceremonies and ways of their people. So ethnographers, and natives singing for the transcriptions, were breaking the law until President Theodore Roosevelt

sanctioned Indian songs in 1906, after being most impressed by Natalie Curtis’ collected melodies and stories.\(^{52}\) He autographed her book with, “These songs cast a wholly new light on the depth and dignity of Indian thought, the simple beauty and strange charm – the charm of a vanished elder world – of Indian poetry.”\(^{53}\)

Fourth, Thomas Edison’s collaborative invention of wax cylinder recordings (1887-1894), which replaced Edison’s more fragile tinfoil recordings as the first method of recording sound,\(^{54}\) made transcriptions somewhat easier and possible to hear as well as “see” in print. Ethnologist, J. Walter Fewkes was the first to use the phonograph for recording the music and speech of the Passamquoddy Indians of Maine (winter of 1889-90). Alice Fletcher spent about twenty years recording the music of the Omaha Indians, and Frances Densmore recorded the largest collection ever published from one tribe, 340 Chippewa songs,\(^{55}\) with over 2,000 total wax cylinder recordings of Native American music.\(^{56}\) American Indian music is a reflection of things that are intangible and spiritual and there are qualities that cannot be notated effectively in print that can be heard in a recording. Isn’t it poignant that this invention was available to preserve the qualities of these songs, qualities evasive to black ink?

The presence of Antonín Dvořák on the American musical scene was a fifth factor. He proclaimed that America needed its own music school based on its own music, an indigenous

\(^{54}\)accessed online 9/5/09 http://cylinders.library.ucsb.edu/history-wax.php
American concert idiom.\textsuperscript{57} But America needed someone to inspire this new beginning, and Dvořák obviously felt compelled to provide this inspiration. He was probably not aware that this would be such a difficult task because the sense of national identity crucial to the development of a national school of composition had some key factors weighing it down: the country’s size, regional differences, multi-ethnic population,\textsuperscript{58} and the contemporary American experience of Boston’s (Boston was the first U.S. city to have a full time symphony orchestra and set the standard for Chicago, Cincinnati, Pittsburgh, Philadelphia, Minneapolis, St. Louis, and New York\textsuperscript{59}) turn-of-the-century concert life,\textsuperscript{60} whose patrons, critics and composers shared an elitist reaction of disdain to the use of so-called “lower” genres,\textsuperscript{61} considering African Americans and Native Americans as “barbaric outsiders.”\textsuperscript{62} Indeed, Dvořák’s idea that composers should use Native American, African American, and Creole melodies and rhythms as the basis for a truly American music school was a horrible thought to MacDowell who subscribed to Lewis Henry Morgan’s cultural evolutionary scale that listed blacks as even lower than Indians.\textsuperscript{63} There were debates about the use of African American and Creole music sharing the basis for an American music school, because even though their music developed after having been brought to this land, they were not indigenous people. Dvořák, later amended his idea to only include indigenous peoples’ melodies and rhythms, the Native Americans. Dvořák

\textsuperscript{58}Adrienne Fried Block, “Amy Beach’s Music on Native American Themes,” \textit{American Music} 8, no2 (Summer, 1990), 141.
\textsuperscript{59}Horowitz, “Reclaiming,” 22.
\textsuperscript{60}Boston was the first U.S. city to have a full time symphony orchestra and set the standard for Chicago, Cincinnati, Pittsburgh, Philadelphia, Minneapolis, St. Louis, and New York. See Horowitz, “Reclaiming,” 22.
\textsuperscript{61}Levy, “The Search,” 78.
\textsuperscript{62}Horowitz, “Reclaiming,” 22, 24.
\textsuperscript{63}Browner, “Breathing,” 272.
was already composing works with American flavor, and in spite of the fact that MacDowell was incensed at the idea of a Bohemian composer telling American composers how to compose American music, Dvořák’s success and notoriety in the United States as an eminent composer, made him the ideal leader for this vision. He defined the limits of the debate and experiments with creating the truly American music genre for several decades. This new musical challenge of his had two important outcomes. One, it encouraged the collection of Native American music (as well as African American music), and two, it stimulated composers to use such material.

One monumental event in particular was the sixth factor in developing interest in Native American music: the 1893 World’s Fair in Chicago, celebrating the 400th anniversary of Christopher Columbus’s arrival in the New World. (The Exposition was also to show the world that Chicago had rebuilt from the devastation of the 1871 Great Chicago Fire.) It featured among many topics, hundreds of new buildings of classical architecture, and people and cultures from around the world, in which the midway was designed with exhibits of civilizations from around the world, set up in Darwinian social order of the white race in the center of the midway, with the other races arranged in order of lessening degrees of “intelligence.” The furthest from the central white position was the very popular exhibit of “savage Indians,” followed by the blacks. As of 1890, ethnographer Alice Fletcher had her first publication and wax cylinder recordings of the Omaha Indians ready for this world exposition. Many composers

---

65 This fair, entitled “The World’s Columbian Exposition,” was the last and greatest of the 19th century World’s Fairs, and marked a grand celebration of the 400th anniversary of Columbus’ voyages and “discovery of America”, thus becoming a celebration of American culture and society. Reported attendance was 27 million. Duration - 6 months.
and future composers attended the fair, including Dvořák, (whose Ninth Symphony, *From the New World*, using American sounding pentatonic themes with Romantic harmonies, was composed in 1893, the same year as the World’s Fair), MacDowell, Arthur Farwell, Amy Beach, Henry F. Gilbert (who actually had an extra job at the fair as a pie cutter\(^67\)), Harvey Worthington Loomis, and possibly Busoni (who had moved to New York in 1891 and toured the Great Lakes region in the spring of 1893\(^68\)). The fair lasted for 6 months, hosting reportedly 27 million visitors, and 46 participating nations, so the influence and educational impact were quite phenomenal, resulting in a lasting affect on architecture and the arts.\(^69\)

The native musical elements of rhythm, meter, timbre, and melodic intervals, as well as the popular nationalism movement of the 19\(^{th}\) century\(^70\), seventh in this list of contributing factors, had composers eager to craft compositions with this new material. However, some of these native elements were both toned down to a level acceptable for the civilized, who mistook the loud, “harsh” singing quality for frightening savagery, rather than the actual energetic respect for the Great Spirit,\(^71\) and simplified - reduced to an easier rendition which has become an erroneous stereotype of Native American music for others who believed what they were told, readily intoned with the mere mention of “American Indian music”: a simple

---


\(^{70}\) European nationalism was a distinct genre of music that rose out of a sense of patriotism and a composer’s desire to use the folk material of their homeland as compositional material.

four beat pattern with every first beat accented, along with a simplified mockery of vocables, something like - HU yu yu yu / HU yu yu yu.\textsuperscript{72}

This paper deals with the use of the Native American music as compositional material by twentieth and twenty-first century composers; “Indianists,” mainstream composers, and more recently, Native American composers. The music is analyzed according to the manner in which the Native American music elements are utilized, with important correlations to cultural practices and meanings.

\textsuperscript{72} Try it sometime. Ask people to sing what Native American music sounds like, and this will prove to be the most common response.
CHAPTER 4

THE INDIANIST MOVEMENT

The “Indianist” movement was a result of the pursuit of a truly indigenous American music. The composers were primarily from America, and devoted most of their compositional output to this area of endeavor. Composers who used Native American melodies, motifs, and rhythms on a consistent basis in their compositions between the years 1890 and 1920, were referred to as “Indianists.”

The major Indianist composers were Charles Wakefield Cadman, Arthur Farwell, Arthur Nevin, Charles Sanford Skilton, Edgar Stillman Kelley, Harvey Worthington Loomis, Carlos Troyer, Carl Busch, Preston Ware Orem, and Thurlow Lieurance. Sometimes, the following composers are also grouped under the Indianist label: Amy Beach, Blair Fairchild, Victor Herbert, Henry F. Gilbert, and Albert Bimbino (see Appendix A). This paper will focus on selected works by Indianists Loomis, Farwell, Skilton, and Cadman.

Arthur Farwell (1872-1952) probably did the most for the cause of American music and the Indianist movement with his Wa-Wan Press, established in 1901, named after a ceremony of the Omaha Indians. The Press had two goals: “first to explore and bring to light those treasures of musical material that exist in native folk-song...; second the necessity for American music to cast off the debilitating influence of European tradition, in so far as it is hamperingly pedantic, if it is to arrive at any emancipated individuality of expression.” The main purpose of Farwell’s Wa-Wan Press was to publish the works of younger American composers including

---

73 Tara Browner, “Breathing the Indian Spirit,” 266.
himself, in whom the established publishers showed little or no interest. Volumes were issued periodically until 1911, including works of Arthur Farwell, Carlos Troyer and Harvey Worthington Loomis.\textsuperscript{75}

The first example of Indianist repertoire is by Harvey Worthington Loomis (1865-1930). Loomis was a student of Dvořák in New York, and his piano piece \textit{The Thunder God and the Rainbow} quotes at the beginning of the score the original tribal melody from Alice Fletcher’s Omaha collected melodies (see Musical Example 4). During the piece Loomis quotes the melody in its entirety several times. He uses the same pitches in the composition and opens with an introductory imitation of a thunder rumble in the first three measures with a pickup beat (Indians seldom use pickup beats\textsuperscript{76}), then states the melody in its entirety, and again through the a, b phrases, without the second statements of b. This completes the entire larger first A section all in 2/4 meter with a b minor key signature. The lyrical and transparent B section is undoubtedly the “rainbow” theme, written in the dominant F# Major, in changing meters of 5/4, 3/4 and 4/4 for one measure each, with three statements of the “rainbow” melody, each time varied a little at the end of the phrase and with different accompaniment figures. (The “rainbow” melody is not part of the quoted melody at the beginning of this score.) This unpredictable, changing meter is a typical Native American rhythm element,\textsuperscript{77} and also provides the Native American element of a “catch” or change in the flow of the rhythm about half way through the song of which Frances Densmore spoke. Loomis derives the harmonic support from prevalent intervals in the melody. The octave “drum beats” throughout...


\textsuperscript{76}(observation of the author) When a pickup is used, it almost always is only one quick note, of an an eighth or sixteenth note value.

\textsuperscript{77}Densmore. \textit{The American Indians and Their Music}, 133.
emphasize the tonic, dominant and flat supertonic (m. 10-11,16-17) and the dissonant seconds in the thirty-second note “thunder rumblings” (pickup to m. 1, 2, 20, 32…) as well as the chromatic inner voice leadings (m. 17,18,19) create the ominous storm effect.

Musical Example 4: Harvey Worthington Loomis, The Thunder God and the Rainbow, 1904. Notice Loomis uses the original pitches in the melody, traditional Romantic harmony, (see “B”) and changes meter often in “B.”
The strong accents perhaps represent lightning flashes or strikes, but these accents are predictable and the Native American music typically features unpredictable accents. In the Native American culture, the song Leader puts black on his face with charred elder wood which they say is a black cloud, because the black cloud is worn by Thunder when it comes near to man. The song, originally entitled *Putting on the Insignia of the Thunder God*, is sung while the Leader is putting on the “black cloud” and tells that the Leader is impatiently awaiting the commands of the approaching god of war. Loomis quotes the original melody and uses intervals from the melody in the harmonic support, but overall presents a Western approach to form and Romantic Era harmony.

Arthur Farwell’s *Dawn* is based on two melodies, an Otoe melody and “The Old Man’s Love Song,” an Omaha melody, (see Musical Examples 5, 6, and 7) first composed under this latter title in Farwell’s *American Indian Melodies* for piano solo (1901). In the explanatory notes by the composer in the score, Farwell writes,

"The Old Man’s Love Song" gives expression to a mellowed love of life, born of years of benign and ennobling existence, voiced at dawn in the presence of peaceful nature. It is a tribute, in song, to the spirit of Love and Beauty in the world. The dreamy and idyllic prelude is but a floating breath. This song, with its phrases like the notes of birds, and its pastoral musings, is singularly self-explanatory. It wafts like the breath of a zephyr over the grasses of gentle hilltops, and is not inferior, in its idyllic quality to the music which Wagner conceived for the "Flower-maidens in Parsifal."

It is evident from this passage that Farwell understood the inseparable bond that Native Americans have with nature and that he made it a priority to incorporate this cultural core value into his composition. The score of the “Old Man’s Love Song” includes this quotation, which is a translation of the original words of the Indian song, “With the dawn, I seek thee.”

---

78 Fletcher, *Indian Story and Song*, 5.  
Musical Example 5: *Dawn* (a) quoting the Omaha melody “The Old Man’s Love Song” and (b) after the fermata, from an Otoe melody (see Musical Examples 6 and 7).

The solo version of *Dawn* was transcribed for piano and orchestra in 1904. Alice Fletcher explains that the meaning of “The Old Man’s Love Song” is a mystery. He was a very handsome, prosperous, skillful warrior, with threads of silver in his black hair. He was the same devoted
husband and father, yet every dawn he stood on a hill by his lodge, and “while the morning star hung like a jewel in the east, he sang the melody carrying the words, With the dawn I seek thee!” The Indian music elements incorporated by Farwell in this piece, are the original intervals of seconds, thirds and the cascading melody lines.

Musical Example 6: The Omaha melody, “The Old Man’s Love Song” from Alice Fletcher’s transcriptions, used in Dawn by Arthur Farwell (see Musical Example 5a). Her collected melodies were harmonized by J.C. Fillmore, as here, and Edwin Tracy because she found that the Native Americans could recognize the tunes better on a piano if they had simple harmonizations, otherwise they were distracted by the mechanical sounds in tone production by a percussive instrument.

Musical Example 7: The Otoe melody above used as compositional material for Dawn by Arthur Farwell (see Musical Example 5b).

---

80 Fletcher, Indian Story, 77, 78, 118-119.
*Pawnee Horses* (1923) by Farwell (see Musical Example 8) is based on an Omaha melody, sung by Francis La Flesche (see Musical Example 9). He was the son of an Omaha chief and was adopted as an adult by Alice Fletcher. (Though strange to us, she was probably practicing this custom that was common among the Indians, to increase one’s family.) An Indian’s horse was like his “right hand” and a soul mate, so much so that it was the custom in some tribes that when a male warrior died, to also kill his horse, so that both of their souls could go to the “happy hunting ground” together.

![Musical Example 8](image)

Musical Example 8: Measures 7-9 of *Pawnee Horses* by Arthur Farwell, 1923. Notice the meter change and the unpredictable accents.

![Musical Example 9](image)

Musical Example 9: Pawnee melody from Alice Fletcher’s transcribed melodies, harmonized by Edwin S. Tracy, and used as compositional material for *Pawnee Horses* by Arthur Farwell (see Musical Example 8).  

---

82 From *A Study of Omaha Indian Music*, 116, No. 49.
There is a famous painting in the Tulsa Gilcrease Museum entitled, *Her Heart is on the Ground*, by Charles Marion Russell (1864-1926; see Figure 1), painted during the same time frame as the Indianist movement, depicting a squaw who has just killed her brave’s horse because her warrior has just been killed in a battle and she must “send” his horse with him to the after life.

![Her Heart is on the Ground](https://www.moneymaker.com/gallery/rullelle/herheart.gif)

Figure 1: *Her Heart is on the Ground* (1917) by Charles Marion Russell (1864-1926). Accessed 17 September 2009 at [www.moneymaker.com/gallery/rullelle/herheart.gif](https://www.moneymaker.com/gallery/rullelle/herheart.gif)

Horses came into America when the Spanish Conquistadors came there in the 1500s, and though they had not been a part of the Indian’s culture, they were believed to be a sacred gift from the Great Spirit, one that radically changed the Indian way of life in facilitating travel, hunting, and warfare (see Figure 2, *Wild Horses at Play* (1837) by George Catlin (1796-1872)). They painted their horses and adorned them with colorful symbols to endow them with magical powers.\(^{83}\)

---

You can hear the quick feet of horses and their energetic bursts of power in this piece. The original Omaha melody highlights the following Indian musical elements: cascading melody line, irregular rhythms and metric groupings, unpredictable accents, intervals of thirds and fifths. Farwell quotes the original melody line in a typical consistently unpredictable syncopated pattern throughout, and places the accents in an alternating 9/8 and 6/8 Western metric notation, with accompanying drum like bass pattern of open fifths, derived from the fifth in the melody line. Farwell has captured the spirit of the strong, powerful, changing rhythmical pounding hooves of wild horses.

The *Sioux Flute Serenade* (1919) by Charles Sanford Skilton (1868-1941; see Musical Example 10) includes this description in the score’s explanatory notes:

> Among most Indian tribes it is a custom of courtship that the lover, concealing himself at twilight near the tepee of the object of his affections, shall serenade her by playing on his flute airs of his own composition, or those traditional in his tribe. The maiden, if responsive to his suit, shows herself before the tepee and he is encouraged to make further advances...  

---

Musical Example 10: The A section theme and B transition theme back to A of *Sioux Flute Serenade* (1919) by Charles Sanford Skilton (1868-1941)

This piece is an example of Indian-ness and one that was composed in its originally intended context – it is composed as a “love call,” just as the purpose of the original melody. The accompanying artwork, entitled *Love Call*, by Frederic Remington (1861-1909; see Figure 3) depicts what this piece is about, and was painted in 1909, about the same time that this piece was composed. Skilton’s composition quotes the entire melody consisting of typical thirds, fifths, and seconds (no semitones) several times, using Romantic traditional harmonies, Western ¾ meter, and a formal structure of: A B (transition), A B (transition), A A B (transition), codetta. The Indian element of cascading melody is reflected in the transitional passage work at measures 17, 18, 19 and 36, 37, 38. The composer incorporates a hemiola effect at measure 21, possibly to include the Indian element of combining groups of two and three, and the effect
of different tempi running simultaneously by using an eight against three in the next to last measure. (Frances Densmore notes for example, that in many Chippewa songs, the vocal line moves with the quarter note $= 112$, while the drum beats occur with the quarter note $= 100$.\footnote{Densmore, The American Indians and Their Music, 103.})

Charles Wakefield Cadman (1881-1946), a self proclaimed expert on American music, was voted the most popular American composer by the National Federation of Music Clubs in 1930, and was prominent in the group of composers (Cadman, Farwell, Gilbert, Skilton, Nevin) who idealized the music of American Indians by setting it in a conservative 19\textsuperscript{th} century harmonic idiom.\footnote{accessed 10/05/2009 \url{www.libraries.psu.edu/speccolls/FindingAids/cadman.frame.html}} His piano solo, “The Return of the Braves, Marche Fantastique” (1912; see Musical Examples 11 and 12) is “founded” on two Omaha Indian War Songs (see Musical

---

Figure 3: \textit{Love Call} (1909) by Frederic Remington (1861-1909). Photograph of a print on canvas from the author's collection.
Example 13) as it states in the score. The melody is stated in octaves in the treble, with bass accompaniment of repetitive, open fifths and “Hollywood” romantic style harmonies with augmented sixth chords, seventh chords, and chromatic passages.

Musical Example 11: “The Return of the Braves Marche Fantastique” (1912) by Charles Wakefield Cadman (1881-1946), founded on two Omaha melodies, (a) Theme 1 and (b) Theme 2.

Notice the outer voices of the bass chords on beats two and four in measure 1 through beat two of measure 2, descend chromatically. The second theme begins at measure 21, and is very close to the original. The filler accompaniment material he uses to transition to each new section - an octatonic scale at m. 36, the romantic bravura passage at m. 49 and 75, the
chromatic scale at m. 66, and octave arpeggios at m. 81, has no relation to Native American musical elements.

Musical Example 12: From Cadman, *Return of the Braves*, m. 49-50, is not a Native American musical element.

![Musical Example 12](image)

Musical Example 13: Two Omaha melodies used as compositional material for the two themes in Cadman’s *Return of the Braves* (Musical Example 11). Notice in the heading of (a), the subject matter is the same as Cadman’s composition.87

![Musical Example 13](image)

Other composers, known more as mainstream composers, who composed works in the Indianist style include Dvořák, MacDowell, and Busoni (see Appendix B). Following are representative music examples by these composers.

*Indian Lament* by Antonín Dvořák (1841-1904) (see Musical Example 14) is the slow movement, *Larghetto*, from Sonatina for Violin and Piano in G Major, B. 183 (Op. 100) which

---

87 From Alice Fletcher’s *A Study of Omaha Indian Music*, 88 No.14, and No.69 respectively.
came to be nicknamed “Indian Lament” by the publisher because of the musical references to Native American modal inflections, light syncopation, and pentatonic passages.

Musical Example 14: Antonín Dvořák, *Larghetto* [nicknamed *Indian Lament* by the publisher] from Sonatina in G Major, Op. 100 for violin and piano (1893). (a) Theme 1; (b) Theme 2.

It is believed to have been composed in 1893, the same year as his famous *New World Symphony*, also using Native American elements. This movement was transcribed by Fritz Kreisler (1875-1962), Austrian violinist and composer, as a stand-alone piece for violin and piano. Dvořák used Theodor Baker’s collected melodies of the Seneca Indians for thematic ideas, but the finished composition used more of a Native American modal flavoring than a direct quote of the melodies. The repeated notes on beat two of the first two measures of Theme 1, and the rhythmical sequence of the first theme are characteristically Native American, especially with the longer emphasis on beat one. It is interesting to note that
Kreisler’s transcription reverses the parts of the second theme, with the violin having the melody which he marks *dolce* (at the *poco più mosso*) and the piano having the soft, undulating accompaniment.

Edward MacDowell (1860-1908) was the first American composer to receive any international recognition, was known especially for his piano pieces in smaller forms, and studied in Paris. He was more interested in just using the tribal melodic material and did not necessarily pay attention to the cultural context of the piece. MacDowell’s piece, *From an Indian Lodge*, No. 5 from *Woodland Sketches*, Op. 51 (see Musical Example 15) is based on two melodies from Theodor Baker’s collection (see Musical Example 16).

Musical Example 15: (a) 1st theme, m. 4-7 and (b) 2nd theme, m. 10-13 of Edward MacDowell’s, *From an Indian Lodge*, Op. 51 (1896).
In m. 4 at the sign, “+,” the note in the tribal melody is a half step from the previous one, so here, it should be an e natural instead of an e flat, but the other pitches are like the tribal melody, just transposed to a different “key” (as is the second theme) and the chord progression link or transition in m. 6 to the “drum sounding” tremolo in m. 7, is not present in the original.

Musical Example 16: Melodies of the Walla-walla Indians from Theodor Baker's transcriptions (1882), used as compositional material for Edward MacDowell’s *From an Indian Lodge*.

The first tribal melody includes the caption which translates, “song of the Walla-walla Indians, sung by an old woman in medicine magic ceremonies,” but MacDowell titled this piece after the purification sweat lodges, giving this piece a different subject matter than the original.

Arguably perhaps the most interesting compositions included in the Indianist genre, Ferruccio Busoni’s two books of *Indianisches Tagebuch* (Indian diary) are some of the most difficult and complex pieces composed using Native American motifs. He was so impressed by the collection of melodies transcribed by his harmony student, Natalie Curtis, that he worked painstakingly and diligently, as evidenced in his personal writings, to capture the *orenda* (Iroquois word, meaning indwelling spirit) of the Katzina Rain Dance song in *Allegretto affettuoso, un poco agitato* (Nr. 1), and that this was the element he found so difficult to notate.

---

88 Indians believe in *orenda*, a universal indwelling spirit in all living creatures and in nature, to the extent that nothing was “supernatural” to them.
and get across. He wrote “To seize on paper the spirit of Hopi music is a task as impossible as to put on canvas the shimmer and glare of the desert.”\textsuperscript{89} Katzinas held an important place in Native American culture (see Figure 4).

Figure 4: Katzinas, accessed online 10 November 2009 at http://newsgrist.typepad.com/robertgoldwaterlibrary/images/2008/04/03/kachinas_2.jpg

In ancient times, these deities were believed to live among the natives, but in present times they are no longer to be found. The Natives adorn themselves as Katzinas with meaningful masks and decorative sashes that represent bountiful harvests and rain clouds, then sing and dance to hopefully achieve the same intermediary power of Katzinas, who carried the prayers of the people to the gods to ask for rain for their crops.\textsuperscript{90} Musical Example 17 is a transcription of the original Hopi Katzina Rain Dance Song from the Natalie Curtis collection.

\textsuperscript{89}Beaumont. Busoni the Composer, 195.
\textsuperscript{90}Curtis. American Indian Story and Song, 482-483.
Musical Example 17: Hopi Katzina Rain Dance Song from the Natalie Curtis transcriptions. (a) The first melodic excerpt (from the 5th page of the transcription) is the opening melody of Busoni’s *Indianisches Tagebuch* (1915) Nr.1 *Allegretto affettuoso, un poco agitato*. (b) The second melodic excerpt (from the second and third page of the Natalie Curtis transcription) is the second theme in Busoni’s composition.

Busoni was careful to subtitle his compositions, “...on motives of the Redskin savages,” and you can see that he does not quote the entire original melody, but motives from this song, and not in any particular order (see Musical Example 18). The opening motive is from the fourth page of the transcribed tribal melody. Even though Native American music is not chromatic and seldom uses semitones, Busoni captures the spiritual quality of the Katzina deities with his chromatic, ethereal passage work, while at the same time preserving original intervals in the figurations, as well as the melody line.
Musical Example 18: (a) Busoni *Indianisches Tagebuch* (1915) Nr. 1, Theme 1 (m. 1-5) and (b) Theme 2 (m. 21-26).

Some of these ethereal passages can be found in measures 21-25, where the filler material, in groups of threes, contains typical intervals of fourths, and major and minor thirds, and each small group of three begins a second, third, or fourth away from the previous group. For example, in measure 22, the first group of three consists of a major third and perfect fourth (a broken f# minor first inversion triad). The next group of three begins a minor third from the first group and consists of a major third and minor third (a broken c major triad). The third group of three begins a fifth (an octave away) from the second group and consists of a minor third and a tritone or augmented fourth (a broken e diminished first inversion triad). Also in measures 33-38, the chromatic sounding passage work contains minor thirds (augmented seconds), major thirds, seconds, and the smaller groups of four are fifths or tritones apart. The interlocking major thirds in measures 16-20 (see Musical Example 19) in an ascending chromatic pattern further illustrate his efforts to “seize on paper” the spirit of this music. For it was the Indians’ mysticism and other-worldliness that appealed most strongly to Busoni.\(^91\)

---


It becomes obvious from analyzing their works that the Indianist composers and mainstream composers who composed some works in the Indianist mode appropriated the tribal melodies and Native American musical elements in a Western Romantic style. Some endeavored to maintain an original cultural context of the music and others chose to use the raw material or rhythmical and intervallic “flavorings” of the material without regard to any intrinsic meanings. Regardless of whether either approach was “right” or “wrong,” one critical fact remains, they are the reason Native American music is remembered today. “Indian music first hand as well as from recordings did not come about until [...] the paradoxical discourse inherent within Indianist music...”\(^92\) (The paradox being that making the melodies accessible to the concert public by composing them in a Western framework, somewhat “undid” the meticulous efforts to preserve the original native melodies.) The ethnographers and composers (many of whom also transcribed tribal melodies) who composed with the salvaged melodies in fact saved the cultural musical treasures and made it possible for the perpetuation of artistic gems that would have undoubtedly been lost with out their efforts.

The Wa-Wan Press that published many of the Indianist compositions began losing subscribers in 1908, and folded in 1912 after being acquired and abandoned by G. Schirmer. The growing influence of jazz and popular music, and the end of Romanticism, spelled the end of the formal Indianist movement in music.\(^93\)

The movement reportedly died out. In spite of many attempts to create an American art music, the American public kept turning to imported music. Perhaps because the material was so profuse, if one considered not only Native American melodies, but also New England hymnody, African American folk spirituals, minstrelsy (Stephen Foster 1820-1894), it came to no avail, as there was no continuity to American music nationalism – there was so much going on that there was no focus, and when ragtime and jazz hit the concert public, there was yet another diffusion of musical interest. So for the moment, in the late 1920s, American musical nationalism seemed to be undefined and the emphasis on Native American as the true indigenous source for purely “American” compositional material seemed to fade away, but in reality, lay dormant for several decades.

CHAPTER 5
CURRENT DAY NATIVE AMERICAN COMPOSERS

This source of inspiration from Native American traditions is still alive – the perpetual heartbeat heard in American Indian drumming, the heartbeat of Mother Earth, the pulsating heartbeat of all creation, beats on undaunted and the Indian Movement is alive and well in America (since 1968), perhaps because of pledges and promises made to avoid the ways of the white people during the Ghost Dance Movement. Many years passed between what seemed like the end of the Indianist movement and the appearance of American Indian composers on the American music scene. American Indians were finally granted American citizenship in 1924, and over the course of time, many graduated through the ranks of American universities and music schools. A new group of composers has surfaced since the 1970s and continues to grow and prosper in the area called “Classical Native” – classical music composed by American Indians (see Appendix C). Just as Dvořák was Czech, composing with the folk melodies of his people, and Bartok was Hungarian, composing with the folk melodies of his people, these recent American Indian composers have a natural insight into the music of

94 Many respectful references in Native American culture are made to Mother Earth and Father Sky.
95 Not to be confused with the Indianist Movement dealing with music compositions, the Indian Movement is a current day movement to restore, rebuild, and preserve American Indian languages, culture, ceremonial practices and ways of their people. I have personally attended such a gathering that is held every Thanksgiving at Alcatraz Island off the coast of California. (This island once belonged to the Indians, is a sacred burial ground, and they are working to get it back.)
96 accessed September 25, 2009 www.mnhs.org/library/tips/history (History Topics: AIM)
97 The Ghost Dance religion began in 1888 by Wovoka, a Northern Paiute, who preached the end of the world, at which time the Indians would inherit a new earth, including the Indians already dead. It involved rituals of meditation, prayers, chanting and especially dancing. During the hours and hours of dancing and chanting, the participants could catch a vision of a new world with lush green grasses and large herds of buffalo. These loud and very long dances lasting into all hours of the night frightened the white people, who banned the Ghost Dance. From 150-300 Indians were massacred at Wounded Knee for refusing to stop dancing. This was the end of the Indian wars.
98 Driver. Indians of North America, 483.
their people. None of the composers of Indianist music were American Indian, and even though they devoted their life’s work to developing a classical music that was distinctly American, and some endeavored to capture the Native elements in the music, the differences between the two camps of composers are quite obvious. The Indianists used the Native American melodies and musical elements in a Romantic Western tradition of composition, and with functional Western harmony, and the American Indian composers, albeit composing in the new contemporary style, have been able to naturally capture the inherent musical elements that are unique to American Indian music.

In defense of the Indianist composers, the challenge from Dvořák was not to “copy” the Native music (the ethnographers very painstakingly already did this in the best way they knew how), but to create an identifiably American music.

It should be taken into account that no sane musician,... would advocate building up an art that should prove to be but a refinement of, or elaboration of the primitive stock. The composer who has once accepted a theme, be it a mere motive of one or two measures, or an entire tune, makes it his own and does with it thereafter what he pleases.99

The Indianist composers appropriated the Native American musical material in the same way they would use any other inspirational material with which to create their own compositions, and, as stated earlier, “idealized” the music of American Indians by setting it in a 19th century harmonic framework.

However, if a composer is trying to capture the true essence of the Native element in the composition, then some shifts need to happen within the confines of Western musical systems and qualities inherent to this music should not be toned down or “adjusted” to appeal

to a “civilized” audience. “There are two distinguishable modes of decadence in art, one corresponding to a diminished sensuality, the other reflecting an [...] over-refinement,” which is what happens when this music is adjusted to please “civilized” people. Natives used something invisible (the voice) to communicate with the invisible spirit world and maybe the difficulties of transcribing this invisible, oral tradition into notation are some of the reasons why the movement seemed to wane after 1930. Indeed, the spiritual element is inseparable from the bare notes and rhythm in Native music.

The following are representative works from American Indian composers who have come to be recognized for their “Classical Native” compositions since about the 1970s, and who have stirred the dormant orenda (indwelling spirit) of compositions based on Native American melodies, rhythms, and motifs.

One of the best examples I have found of the element of American Indian rhythm is heard in the piece Fishing the Milky Way (2008) by Brent Michael Davids, nationally acclaimed, living Mohican composer, probably best known as the composer of the score to the movie, The Last of the Mohicans. In Fishing the Milky Way (see Musical Example 20), the meter indicated is 2+3+2+3/8, which is typical of original tribal music discussed in the Burton, Curtis, Fletcher and Densmore collections – groups of two, then three, or five, against groups of a different number. Just as in the transcription of rhythmic phenomena in Musical Example 2, the lower drum part is constant and steady, so the lower “drum” part here in the bass is constant and steady, while the melody or song part consists of irregular accents and rhythmic groupings. The melodic

---

phrases typically descend from a higher pitch of f# or e, as in this piece, to the lower pitch a fifth or fourth below, b. The intervals used are 2nds, 3rds, 4ths, and tritones.


_Deganogista Talutsa_ (2009) by Cherokee woman composer, Delisgidv Unegv

_Deganvdogv_ (b.1955), is representative of the artistry and craftwork that is one of the cultural core values of all tribes. The Cherokee are particularly skilled in basket weaving _101_ (see Figure 5), and the title of this piece, a three voice fugue, translates as “woven music.” Even though in generations past, there was no polyphony as regards the melodic aspect, there was definitely polyphony between the rhythmic and melodic parts of their music, and polyphony between all the surrounding forces of nature of which they were so keenly aware.

---

101 Before the Cherokee were removed from their homeland in the Eastern Woodlands (the Carolinas, Georgia, Virginia and Tennessee) to Indian Territory (which later became Oklahoma), baskets were an integral part of the women’s role in the tribe. Rivercane and braided sweet grasses were the materials typically used. The weaving of Cherokee basket twill patterns honors _ka no he lv hi_ (the old ways). Accessed 11/05/2009 [http://cherokeebaskets.com](http://cherokeebaskets.com)
Figure 5: Cherokee baskets. The basket at left is a blow gun dart quiver. Before the Cherokee were removed from their homeland in the Eastern Woodlands (the Carolinas, Georgia, Virginia, and Tennessee) to Indian Territory (which later became Oklahoma), baskets were an integral part of the women’s role in the tribe. These are rivercane double woven baskets. Weaving Cherokee basket twill patterns honors *ka no he lv hi* (the old ways). Accessed 5 November 2009 online at http://cherokeebaskets.com/images/quiveroakredblack.jpg

“...[T]he life and art of the Indian are so linked with nature that it is to be questioned whether the sounds of the nature-world do not supply to these singers of the open a certain unconscious sense of harmonic background.”

Although this three voice fugue (see Musical Example 21) is in typical Baroque form with fugue statements in the tenor, soprano and bass voices, followed by episodes (four expositions, and three episodes), it also includes typical American Indian “bird call” motives (m. 29, 30, 31, 41) and typical American Indian rhythmic motives (m. 10, 17, beat 3, alto voice, and m. 15, 34, beat 1, alto voice). Notice that the “bird call” motives are not aligned with the melody, nor are they on the beat, another typical Indian element. The episodic voice material employs the element of unpredictable rhythms by changing the pattern of sequences with syncopations (m. 11-13 in the bass, m. 18, 31 – beats 1 and 4, soprano voice).

Musical Example 21: Three excerpts from *Deganogista Talutsa* (2009) by Delisgidv Unegv Deganvdogv, (a) m. 1-8, (b) m. 17-19 and (c) m. 25-33. Used by permission.
Like the other “Classical Native” musical examples, this piece is a metaphor of what it is – the parts are artistically woven together.

The first Native American to receive national recognition as a composer was Louis Wayne Ballard (1931-2007), who was awarded an honorary doctorate degree in composition from the University of New Mexico, won many prestigious awards for his compositions, and studied with Darius Milhaud\(^{103}\) (see Appendix C). *Four American Indian Piano Preludes* is perhaps Ballard’s most famous piano collection (see Musical Example 22). Ballard’s “Ombaska”\(^{104}\) is an example of a close representation of Native American rhythm. Just in listening, without looking at the score, there is a feeling of loss of bar lines on the first page, or ambiguity of meter, which fits another description of Native American elements regarding ethnographer Franz Boas’ collection of Eskimo songs, transcribed “in ordinary musical notation, but in some instances he indicated the rhythm by accents, omitting the bars.”\(^{105}\) Ballard’s harmonic support comes primarily from stacked fourths, derived from the opening intervals of the melody, which uses 4ths, 2nds, 3rds, and tritones. Note the irregular accents in measures 14 and 15 and the change from duple meter, 4/4, to compound triple meter, 9/8 for the B section which begins at measure 9 (fitting Densmore’s description of Indian songs characterized by accents which are not equally spaced\(^{106}\), and the prevalence of rhythms in twos and threes, as well as two against three.\(^{107}\) The B section still uses a melody derived from the intervals of 2nds, 3rds, 4ths, and tritones, and the accompaniment is a single independent line also made up of these same intervals but in the order of almost a twelve tone row, the first phrase having

\(^{103}\) E-mail correspondence and telephone conversations with the composer’s son, Louis A. Ballard, 2009.

\(^{104}\) Daylight


all but one of twelve pitches, and then again in the second phrase – all but two of the twelve pitches are presented.


At this point, the bass becomes the melody in octaves with accompaniment in the treble of tritones and fourths clusters, and chords built out of the same intervals used throughout, 2nds, 3rds, 4ths, and tritones. The technical effect at the end of the piece, of silently depressing
selected notes that produce overtone effects when the damper pedal of the previous fortissimo passage is released, creates the apropos impression of the radiance of daylight.

Ballard’s second piano prelude, “Tabideh”\(^{108}\) (see Musical Example 23) is percussive throughout, employs meters of 4/16, 7/16, 5/16 with many tempo changes, dissonant clusters and unpredictable rhythmic patterns. It is atonal, using many intervals of 7ths, 9ths, and 5ths combined with tritones (m. 7, 19, 21, 23, 29, 30, 32, 35, 36), and ending with a widely spaced, dissonant 2\(^{nd}\), many octaves apart.


The consecutive accents in the bass from m. 29-30 represent a Native American element, often played thus on the drum at the end of a dance number, concluding a crescendo of five or seven

\(^{108}\)“The Hunt”
drum beats. The nature of the piece does not lend itself to a melody, so there is no tribal
sounding melody, but the meter, rhythm and dynamics are characteristically Native American,
and create the illusion of a light-footed hunter pursuing perhaps a quick rabbit, with bow and
arrow in hand.

“Nikatoheh” (see Musical Example 24), the third prelude, is a polyphonic
“conversation” between a bass and treble voice, an allusion to the sound of two flutes.

Verbalized love songs in American Indian culture were all but non existent, but courtship songs
were played on flutes, often at dusk. As a rule, these flutes, the only type of lyric instrument
possessed by the Indians, were constructed by the local medicine-man, who conferred upon
them magic powers of seduction.\footnote{Dario Mueller, “The American Indianists,” CD liner notes, \textit{American Indianists, Vol. 1} (Canada: Marco Polo, 8.223715, 1993), 2.}
The Indian elements incorporated are small groups of
three (quarter note triplets, m.3.6.12, and others), larger groups of three (half measure triplets,
m. 3, 4, 12, and others) along with duple sets (m.8, 9), and duple sets on the off beat (m. 10).

\footnote{“Love song” (loose translation as verbalized love songs are non-existent).}
The treble melody is a typical “pentatonic” flute sounding melody using the notes g, a, b, d, e through m. 13. This is intertwined with another flute sounding melody, this time as if meant for a six hole flute, in the bass: f, g, a, b or b flat, c, d, to m. 10, with an opening a flat (m. 1). From m. 10 in the bass, the composer transposes to other six-note scales, and in the treble, transposes to other five-note scales beginning in m. 14. The meter remains in 4/4 for the entire piece, except for one measure, m. 16 in 5/4, the climax. Another Native American element is the general downward trend of the melodic phrases. With occasional lifts, the overall motion is descending in both parts. The repeated last note in each part is also typical feature of many Native American melody endings.

Most American Indian tribes had societies – fraternities, clubs, clans. The Warrior societies were greatly involved in tribal life and welfare and were also dancing societies. Figure 6 is a warrior painting by Karl Bodmer (1809-1893), Swiss artist of the American west, which represents a warrior dancer of the Hidatsa Dog Society.

Figure 6: Painting of a Warrior Dancer of the Hidatsa Dog (Warrior) Society (1834), by Karl Bodmer. Accessed online 27 October 2009 at www.britannica.com/EBcheckedtopic-art/71055/92452/Dancer-of-the-Hidatsa-Do...
The last prelude, “To’Kah’Ni”\textsuperscript{111}, fast, furious, and highly energetic like a warrior dance, seems to portray an actual war between atonal and tonal.


Even though it has sections that tend to pull it in a tonal direction, like m. 3, 4 with the bass movement from f to b flat, and f to c, this is quickly undone by the descending whole tone octaves in the bass and ascending stacked fourths in m.5, or again by the bass tonal Alberti patterns in m. 11-16 and m. 18-22 which are contradicted by the upper somewhat chromatic quartal harmony (m. 12,13), spanning minor 7ths and Major 7ths (m. 18), and “helter skelter”

\textsuperscript{111} “Warrior Dance”
4ths and 5ths from m. 19-22. There seems to be a metaphorical (warrior) battle between tonal and non-tonal. Even the final forearm cluster resolving the no tonal center argument is met with an open fifth tonal standoff in the bass. The Native American elements present are irregular accents, and rhythmic patterns, repeated notes (m. 26-31), imitations of percussive warrior shouts, such as m. 1, and 8, all included in an actual war of musical elements.
CHAPTER 6

CONCLUSION

I have surveyed the presence of Native American music elements in piano compositions by American composers of the Indianist era (1890-1920), mainstream composers from Europe and America during a similar time frame, and contemporary Native American composers. The prominent Indian elements including rhythmic uncertainties; combinations of triplet and duple division of the beat, irregular accents and phrase lengths, and beats that do not align between simultaneous parts, such as the voice and the drum; intervals of octaves, perfect fifths, chains of major and minor thirds, and varying intonations of the intervals of seconds, fourths, and sevenths; pulsated, sustained notes; and general downward cascading melodic contours, have been analyzed in each compositional style. The main difference between the styles is that the Indianist and mainstream composers “idealized” the tribal melodies in a Western harmonic traditional Romantic framework - Busoni being a notable exception - and the Native American composers composing in their own language, spoke in a more contemporary setting and with as few adjustments to a Western system as possible.

Fletcher, Densmore, and Curtis, commented that this Indian music was not suited to the piano. One of their main reasons in saying this was the difference between the Indian’s prevalent style of singing a pulsated, sustained, unison vocal note, and manner of passing from one tone to another versus the percussive quality of the keyed notes with abrupt, disconnected tones played on the pianos to which they were accustomed.112 113 At that time, the best rendering would be on a violin if not by the human voice. I believe, with today’s piano, and

---

112 Densmore. The American Indians, 127, and Fletcher, Indian Story, 118.
113 Natalie Curtis. The Indians’ Book, xxxiii.
advanced pedaling mechanisms and technique, that it can in fact be effectively rendered. One person at the piano can render the polyphonic effects of the drums, rattles, singing, elements of nature, and implied harmonies from the overtone pitches used – something I don’t think one singer, or one violinist cannot do. And the piano as we know it, grew to maturity in the latter part of the 19th century, became equipped with softer felt hammers, instead of the deer skin hammers, and the new sostenuto pedal. This, together with the change from the older performance practice of “rhythmic pedaling” throughout the 19th century to “legato pedaling” that is practiced today, would result in a much closer rendition today of the original Indian melodies. These ethnographers’ comments were made about the same time that the new changes were happening to the piano and I believe it is logical to assume that their experience regarding the piano’s capabilities would not take into account the instrument’s development, and the new pedaling performance practice, especially since, at that time, they lived on reservations conducting thirty, forty and fifty years of their life’s work, and would have had no contact with new instruments.

If we follow Bruno Nettl’s teaching and sort out Native American culture’s core values, we find spiritual (including the affinity with nature), social, artistic, and hunting for food as the core values. The very titles of Ballard’s Piano Preludes agree with this, and several of the European and American composers who contributed works in the Indianist movement, endeavored to incorporate these values by keeping the music in its cultural context.

If we step back and take a look at other non Western cultures, it is enlightening to see that the Native American culture is not the only one that includes other cultural aspects in the

---

totality of their thing called music. If we apply a similar terminology and insight that Steven Friedson used in describing Tumbuka music of Malawi, it would state, there is a phenomenal reality to Native American music that many in clinical studies don’t experience and hear. This reality requires the interaction of observer and observed as experienced and accounted by those who lived among the Indians (discussed in chapters one, two, and three), a reality missed, overlooked, or ignored by many others who must think of music in a distorted sense as only theoretical notes. “For music is not an object to be encountered but is itself an interaction, a fusion of horizons that dwells in the possibilities of having been.”

America’s heritage of music should be performed and should stand alongside European composers rather than being lumped together in a separate “minority” category of “all American” programs, the very thing that caused MacDowell to withdraw his music from such a concert.

More works will come. It is up to the few dedicated scholar-performers to insure its place in music history and as standard repertoire by making it available to everyone. Once the knowledge is “out there,” the orenda (indwelling spirit) will captivate our attention and this music will remain. “When the music of any people can be transferred from its place of origin to any other place in the world and there stir the emotions of strangers without the adventitious aid of preconceived romantic interest, then that music is of permanent value; and the measure of its value can be taken only after a lapse of many years from the time of its transplanting.”

117 Burton, American Primitive Music, 18.
Frederick Burton wrote this over one hundred years ago. Isn’t it amazing that now, after this “lapse,” the value is indeed becoming apparent to the world?

Ye say that all have passed away –
the noble race and brave,
That their light canoes have vanished
from off the crested wave;
That ’mid the forests where they roamed
there rings no hunter’s shout;
But their name is on your waters –
ye may not wash it out….
Ye say their cone-like cabins
that cluster o’re the vale
Have disappeared as withered leaves
before the autumn gale:
But their memory
liveth in your hills....

---

118 Author unknown. It is believed to be the translation of an ancient Indian poem, according to artist, Jack Unruh, in a telephone interview by the author, 1994. This was used with a set of pen and ink drawings by Dallas artist, Jack Unruh, 1994.
APPENDIX A

INDIANIST COMPOSERS AND SELECTED REPERTOIRE WITH PIANO
The repertoire listed is the result of many months of research and is not meant to be a complete list of every Indianist composition.

Amy Marcy Cheney Beach (1867-1944)

An American woman composer and pianist, her works were revived by feminist historians and performers in the 1980s.

On Eskimo Themes, Op. 64 in four movements for piano solo:
Arctic Night, Returning Hunter, Exiles, With Dog-teams

From Blackbird Hills, Op. 83 (1922), for piano solo, based on a melody from Alice Fletcher’s collection.

Charles Wakefield Cadman (1881-1946)

An American composer, he studied advanced theory and conducting with Luigi von Kunitz and Emil Pauer, the conductor of the Pittsburgh Symphony Orchestra. He was most famous for his opera, Shanewis of the Robin Woman performed with great success in 1918 at the Metropolitan Opera.

4 American Indian Songs, “Four Idealized Indian Themes,” Op. 54 (1912), piano solo
No.1 The Pleasant Moon of Strawberries, dedicated to Arthur Farwell
No.2, From the Land of Sky-Blue Water, dedicated to Alice Fletcher
No.3, The Sadness of the Lodge – refers to an Omaha supplication which Alice Fletcher catalogued under the title, “Appeal for Clear Sky” included in her book, Indian Story and Song.
No. 4, The Return of the Braves, Marche Fantastique

Thunderbird Suite (originally for orchestra - 1914, arr. for piano) Before the Sunrise, Wolf Song (War Dance)

Pianoforte Sonata in A (1915)

Pianoforte Trio in D (1914)

He also composed operettas, songs, and choral music including many sacred anthems.
Blair Fairchild (1877-1933)

An American composer, he studied music at Harvard University under John Knowles Paine and Albert Spalding, followed by studies in Florence, Italy under Buonamici. First, he went into business and the diplomatic service of the U.S.A. in 1901-1903, settled in Paris and pursued musical studies again under Widor and others. He stayed in Paris the rest of his life, but visited New York often.

Solo piano works

Some Indian Songs and Dances (12) piano solo (1926)

This suite of twelve pieces is dedicated to Nadia Boulanger. Instead of accepting a possible key location that would narrow these melodies to our traditional system, he has preferred to suggest an atonality... 119

He also composed ballets, choral works, and orchestral works after Persian legends.

Arthur Farwell (1872-1952)

His first professional degree was as an electrical engineer, but in 1893 he turned to music and studied composition in Germany with Hans Pfitzner and Paris with Alexandre Guilmant. He founded the Wa-Wan Press in Massachusetts in 1901 for the publication of American music, particularly music that used American folk material, driven by the fact that

---

119 Gerald Reynolds. Some Indian Songs and Dances for Piano (Paris: B. Schott’s, 1926), preface notes.
during his studies there, he discovered European cultural centers’ hostility to the idea of an American actually being a serious composer. ¹²⁰

**Solo piano works and chamber works**

Dawn, Op.12 for solo piano (1902), which was revised for piano and small orchestra (1904).

From Mesa and Plain, Op. 20, piano solo

Navajo War Dance, Pawnee Horses

Impressions of the Wa-Wan Ceremony, Op. 21 (8), piano solo

Receiving the Messenger, Nearing the Village, Song of Approach, Laying Down the Pipes, Raising the Pipes, Invocation, Song of Peace, Choral

American Indian Melodies (10), piano solo

Approach of the Thunder God, The Old Man’s Love Song, Song of the Deathless Voice, Ichibuzhi (famed mythical warrior), The Mother’s Vow, Inketunga’s Thunder Song, Song of the Ghost Dance, Song to the Spirit, Song of the Leader, Choral

Navajo War Dance No. 2 for Piano, Op. 29 (1908)

Owasco Memories, Op.8 (5) Piano Solo, also as a Piano Trio (1901)

Spring Moods, By Moonlight, By Quiet Waters, Waltz, Autumn Comes

Piano Quintet in e minor, Op.103 (1937)

The Gods of the Mountain, suite for violin, cello and piano (1927)

Sonata for Violin and Piano (1927)

He also composed many stage works including *Four Choruses on Indian Themes for 8-Part Unaccompanied Chorus* (1937), orchestral works including *Symbolist Study No.6 – Mountain Vision* and *Piano Concerto in One Movement with String Orchestra and Second Piano* (1931), choral works, violin music, and songs.

---

Henry Franklin Belknap Gilbert (1868-1928)

Gilbert studied at the New England Conservatory and with Edward MacDowell.

Indian Scenes, piano solo
- By the Arrow, In the Kutenal Country, The Night Scout, Signal Fire to the Mountain God,
- On the Jocko

He also composed orchestral works:
- Comedy Overture on Negro Themes (1906)
- The Dance in Place Congo (1908)

Harvey Worthington Loomis (1865-1930)

He studied with Dvořák at the National Conservatory in New York, used Fletcher’s transcriptions, and aimed at artistic “framing” rather than authenticity. He composed over 500 works and is most famous for his stage music. The Library of Congress houses most of his manuscripts.

Lyrics of the Red Man, Op. 76 (1903-04), piano solo

Preston Ware Orem (1865-1938)

A native of Philadelphia, and active as a teacher, organist, composer, and editor for the music publisher Theodore Presser, he composed with American Indian music because it was fashionable, and his interest, like that of MacDowell’s, was more superficial.  

---

American Indian Rhapsody (piano solo)

This work is one of the more formally developed compositions in the Indian vein. It cites, in its long virtuosic passages, ten thematic allusions to chants of the Cheyenne, Kiowa, Sioux and other tribes.\(^\text{123}\)

*Charles Sanford Skilton (1868-1941)*

He was a New Englander, educated at Yale, musically trained in Berlin, and became Professor of Music at the University of Kansas in 1903, where he heard Indian students at the nearby Haskell Institute sing tribal melodies, and became inspired to compose in this genre.\(^\text{124}\)

**Solo piano works**

Three Indian Sketches for Piano (1919)
- Kickapoo Social Dance, Sioux Flute Serenade, Winnebago Revel

Two Indian Dances (1921), transcribed for piano from the orchestral score by Carl A. Preyer
- Cheyenne War Dance, Shawnee Indian Hunting Dance

He also composed Two Indian Dances (1915) for String Quartet, Orchestral piece *Suite Primeval* (1920), Operas *Kalopin* (1927) and *The Sun Bride* (1930), and Oratorio *The Guardian Angel* (1925). Also an author, he wrote “Modern Symphonic Forms,” vol. XIV of *Fundamentals of Musical Art*, 1926.

*Lily Strickland (1884-1958)*

An American woman composer, she lived in India from 1920-1929, and became fascinated with non-Western music.

Two Shawnee Indian Dances (1919), piano solo

---


Sun Dance

She also composed many songs, a sacred cantata, and operettas.

George Templeton Strong (1856-1948)

Strong had a lasting friendship with MacDowell, who helped him acquire a position as theory professor at New England Conservatory. He composed and published most of his compositions in Europe: symphonies, symphonic poems, choral works, chamber music, piano pieces and songs.

Au Pays Des Peaux-Rouges

Une Jeune Indienne, piano solo. He composed this piece during his extended Swiss sojourn on the shores of Lake Geneva.125

Carlos Troyer (1837-1920)

He worked mainly among the tribes of the Southwest, and aimed to be as “authentic” as possible to the native tribal melodies in his compositions.

Kiowa-Apache War Dance (piano solo)

Traditional Zuni Songs (piano solo): Lover’s wooing (or Blanket Song), Zunian Lullaby - Incantation upon a sleeping infant - Invocation to the Sun-God

APPENDIX B

MAINSTREAM EUROPEAN AND AMERICAN COMPOSERS

COMPOSING WORKS IN THE INDIANIST ERA
The repertoire listed is not meant to be a complete list in this category.

Ferruccio Busoni (1866-1924)

A famous Italian virtuoso pianist, however he concentrated on composition after 1898, first in the Classic-Romantic style, then from about 1907, in a very progressive and impressionistic style.

Red Indian Fantasy Op.44 for piano and orchestra (1913-1914)

Indianisches Tagebuch, Erstes Buch (Red Indian Diary, first book)
Vier Klavierstudien über Motive der Rothaute Amerikas (Four piano studies on moves of the redskinned Americans) (piano solo 1915)
Allegro affettuoso un poco agitato, Vivace, Andante, Maestoso ma andando

Fantasia, Canzone, Finale

He also composed operas, orchestral works, chamber works, solo works, many songs, and many famous transcriptions of works by Bach, Beethoven, Chopin, Liszt, Mozart, Schubert.

Antonín Dvořák (1841-1904)

Dvořák was an internationally famous Czech composer, who challenged American composers to compose music based on their own folk material. Although he is most famous for his nine symphonies in the German Romantic tradition, his cello concerto, his chamber music, and his string quartets, his most familiar symphony, From the New World, No.9, uses themes suggested by Native American melodies and Negro spirituals, composed in 1893 during his three year sojourn in the United States. His influence in the Indianist movement, was mainly in
the challenge he delivered to American composers to stop imitating European models and turn to their own native sources.\textsuperscript{126}

The Sonatina in G for violin and piano, Op. 100 (1893), nicknamed the “Indian Lament Sonatina” by publishers, so named after the slow movement of this sonatina, \textit{Larghetto} – also transcribed for violin and piano as a separate piece (1914), “Indian Lament,” by Fritz Kreisler.

\textit{Allegro risoluto, Larghetto, Molto vivace – Scherzo, Allegro - Finale}

\textit{Edward MacDowell (1861-1908)}

He was by no means a dedicated Indianist saying that the definition of “American” national identity was a problem. He used Indian themes superficially, and did not work to use them in the context in which they originated.

\textbf{Solo piano works}

\begin{itemize}
\item Indian Suite, Op.48: Dirge
\item New England Idylls, Op.62: Indian Idyll
\item Woodland Sketches, Op.51: From an Indian Lodge
\end{itemize}

\textbf{Orchestral works}

Second (Indian) Suite, Op.48 (1894) \hspace{1em} This is one of his most frequently performed works, with themes taken from Theodor Baker’s dissertation.\textsuperscript{127}


APPENDIX C

NATIVE AMERICAN COMPOSERS AND PIANO REPERTOIRE
The repertoire listed is not meant to be a complete list of compositions by Native American composers.

*Louis Wayne Ballard (1931-2007, Quapaw-Cherokee)*

Ballard was the first Native American composer to receive national recognition, with premieres of his works at such places as Lincoln Center, Kennedy Center, Smithsonian Institution, and others. He studied composition with Darius Milhaud, and was awarded an honorary doctorate degree from the University of Santa Fe. His works for chamber orchestra, woodwind quintet, narrator and symphony orchestra, choral cantatas, Native American instruments and standard percussion, cello and piano, and piano solo are his most frequently performed works. He was the first American composer to receive an entire program dedicated to his works in the new Beethoven House Chamber Music Hall, in Bonn, Germany.\(^{128}\)

The City of Silver (1987), Concert Impromptu for Pianoforte

The City of Fire (1984), Concert Fantasy for Pianoforte

The City of Light (1981), Concert Fantasy for Pianoforte

*Four American Indian Piano Preludes (1993)*

  - *Ombaska* (Daylight), *Tabideh* (The Hunt), *Nikatoheh* (Love Song), *To’Kah’Ni* (Warrior Dance)

*Indiana Concerto* for Piano and Orchestra begun by L.W. Ballard and completed by Brent Michael Davids (2008)

  I  A Spirited Farewell
  II  Music Box Manitou
  III  Stomp Dance for Louis

*From “The Four Moons,”* ballet pas d’quatre (1967), for piano solo

  The Choctaw Variation, The Osage Variation, The Shawnee Variation, and The Cherokee Variation

\(^{128}\) Telephone interviews by the author with the composer’s son, Louis A. Ballard, 2009, as well as score preface notes in the composer’s piano compositions.
Brent Michael Davids (b. 1959, Mohican living composer)

Davids career spans over thirty years writing compositions for the Joffrey Ballet, Kronos Quartet, Bush Foundation, and airing features on ABC, NBC, CBS, NPR, PBS, but he is probably best known as the composer of the new music for the 1920 movie, The Last of the Mohicans.


Raven Chacon (b. 1977, Navajo living composer)

Nilchi Shada’ji Nalaghali, avant-garde piece, for piano solo and electronic sounds

Delisgidv Unega Deganvdogv (b. 1955, Cherokee living woman composer)

Deganogista Talutsa (Woven Music) (2009), three voice fugue, for piano solo
Ehena Adageyudi (Love Call, 1994)
Alihelisdi diniyotli (Happy Children, 1994)
Doduv nanah ama ale gadusi (The Name on Your Waters, 1997)

George Quincy (est. late 1940s, Choctaw living composer)

The Release of the Choctaw Fire Bird (2008), piano solo

Jerod Impichchaachaaha Tate (b. 1968, living Chickasaw composer)

No piano compositions yet, but a prolific composer of orchestral works, chamber works, percussion and string chamber works, operettas, ballet scores, flute and Native American flute chamber works.
BIBLIOGRAPHY

Books and Articles


“American Jazz Music, Folk and Traditional Styles.” Accessed online 12 October 2009 http://spotlightonmusic.macmillanmh.com/music/teachers/articles/folk-and-traditional- sty...


Fletcher, Alice C. *Indian Story and Song from North America.* Boston: Small, Maynard & Company, 1900.


Interviews


Musical Scores


**Discography**

The American Indianists 1994 HNH International Ltd. MARCO POLO D121624, US. 8.223715. Dario Müller, piano.


Amy Marcy Beach, Arthur Foote, Arthur Farwell, Preston Ware Orem, 1977, copyright 1998 Recorded Anthology of American Music, Inc. NEW WORLD RECORDS NW213 (tracks 1-5) and
NW268 (tracks 6-13), New York. Peter Basquin, and Gilbert Kalish, piano, Joseph Silverstein, violin, John Miner, conducting.