HARMONIC AND CONTRAPUNTAL TECHNIQUES
IN THE LATE KEYBOARD WORKS
OF CÉSAR FRANCK

DISSERTATION

Presented to the Graduate Council of the
University of North Texas in Partial
Fulfillment of the Requirements

For the Degree of

DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY

by

Dennis R. Cranford, B.S.E., M.M.
Denton, Texas
May, 1992
HARMONIC AND CONTRAPUNTAL TECHNIQUES
IN THE LATE KEYBOARD WORKS
OF CÉSAR FRANCK

DISSERTATION

Presented to the Graduate Council of the
University of North Texas in Partial
Fulfillment of the Requirements

For the Degree of

DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY

by

Dennis R. Cranford, B.S.E., M.M.
Denton, Texas
May, 1992
Cranford, Dennis R., *Harmonic and Contrapuntal Techniques in the Late Keyboard Works of César Franck.*

Doctor of Philosophy (Music Theory), May 1992, 352 pp., 85 figures, 136 examples, 36 titles.

This study examines the five late keyboard works of César Franck: the Prelude, Chorale, and Fugue and the Prelude, Aria, and Finale for piano, and the three organ chorales. The study focuses on harmonic and contrapuntal techniques and their interrelationships, placing the discussion in the context of an analysis of the whole piece. The primary goal is to identify the salient characteristics of each piece; a secondary goal is to identify common harmonic and contrapuntal aspects of Franck’s style.

The observation of local and structural counterpoint may clarify harmonic succession. Contrapuntally-defined passages may form the basis for structural delineation. Thematic combination is prominent throughout all the works, cyclically uniting the multi-movement piano works and unifying the organ chorales.

Relative to both harmonic and contrapuntal constraints, the use of three related associative techniques (sequence, pair, and sequential pair) is examined. Prominent sequential techniques include nesting, truncating, ascent, overlapping, and coupling. Franck’s use of sequence and
pairing involves a wide variety of harmonic and melodic combinations. Intervallic relationships may be exact and adjusted. The emphasis of a prominent fifth (such as 5, 3, 1) by means of a sequence is especially characteristic. That tonality remains foremost in Franck’s musical conception is verified by examining the large-scale diatonic relationships. Local and intermediate level digressions give the musical surface a highly chromatic form. Harmonic and melodic patterns may diverge, and non-sequential units may display parallelisms.

Reinterpretation of chord function and chord substitution account for many of Franck’s chromatic progressions. The fully-diminished seventh chord and the augmented-sixth chord (both with multiple interpretations) are employed to reach distant tonal regions. Chord qualities may be altered while retaining their tonal function. Accounting for these extensions of harmonic practice, Franck’s music remains well within the conventions of the nineteenth century.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

TABLE OF CONTENTS

| LIST OF FIGURES                  | v  |
| LIST OF EXAMPLES                | ix |
| Chapter                          |    |
| 1. INTRODUCTION                 | 1  |
| 2. DEFINITION OF TERMS          | 15 |
| 3. PRELUDE, CHORALE, AND FUGUE  | 34 |
| 4. PRELUDE, ARIA, AND FINALE    | 132|
| 5. CHORALE NO. 1 IN E MAJOR     | 215|
| 6. CHORALE NO. 2 IN B MINOR     | 258|
| 7. CHORALE NO. 3 IN A MINOR     | 291|
| 8. SUMMARY                      | 329|
|                                 |    |
| Contrapuntal Techniques         |    |
| Sequential and Pairing Techniques |   |
| Other Harmonic Techniques       |    |
| REFERENCE LIST                  | 350|

iv
# LIST OF FIGURES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Figure</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Six position-categories of Jörgen Jersild</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Four relationships between musical ideas</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Summary of interval combinations</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Fundamental harmonies of Gottfried Weber</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. 0 ct and 1 ct relationships summarized</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Structural outline of Prelude</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Prelude, mm. 1-4, chord roots</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Consonance and dissonance of A-theme</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. Harmonic correspondence of A- and B-themes</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. Comparison of A-themes, Prelude, mm. 1-7 and 16-23</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11. Comparison of notation, Prelude, mm. 5-6, 20-21</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12. Large-scale progression, Prelude, mm. 43-47</td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13. Pair of pairs, Prelude, mm. 42-51</td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14. Structural diagram of Chorale</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15. Cadence types of the Chorale</td>
<td>65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16. Sequence, Chorale, mm. 60-61</td>
<td>74</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17. Rhythm of d-, f-, and h-sequences</td>
<td>76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18. Cross-relation of melodic and harmonic accent, Chorale, mm. 72b-73</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19. Correspondence of melodic and harmonic accent, Chorale, mm. 85b-86</td>
<td>79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20. Chord roots, h-phrase, Chorale, mm. 93b-96</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
LIST OF FIGURES, Continued

21. Dissonance shift of Link motive ............ 86
22. Structural diagram of the Fugue ............. 90
23. Downward step sequence, Fugue, mm. 177-178 . . . 102
24. Similar harmonic patterns, Prelude, mm. 1-2
   (a), Fugue, mm. 232-235 (b),
   mm. 256-257 (c) .................. 121
25. Comparison of expected and actual sequential
   goals, Fugue, mm. 255-267 ............ 123
26. Structural diagram of the Prelude (PAF) ... 134
27. Chord roots, Prelude (PAF), mm. 5-9 ........ 137
28. Three-part structure, Prelude (PAF),
   mm. 1-13a ....................... 138
29. Major to half-diminished succession ........ 140
30. Chord roots, Prelude (PAF), mm. 10-12 .... 143
31. Comparison of harmonic goals, Prelude (PAF),
   mm. 43-50 ...................... 150
32. Comparison of Funktionstheorie (a) and
    Stufentheorie (b) symbols .......... 152
33. Constant goal keys ....................... 153
34. Chord roots, Prelude (PAF), mm. 73-74 .... 154
35. Aria (PAF), structural diagram ............ 174
36. Accompanimental rhythm .................. 183
37. Relationship of harmony of Aria coda
to that of the introduction ............ 185
38. Finale (PAF) structural diagram ........... 190
39. Comparisons of the harmonic connections of B . 202
40. Chorale No. 1 in E Major structural diagram . 217
41. Displacement of 4-3 appoggiatura ........... 225
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Figure</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>42</td>
<td>Comparison of patterns</td>
<td>227</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>43</td>
<td>Chord roots, mm. 30b-33</td>
<td>229</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>44</td>
<td>Voice exchange, mm. 65-86</td>
<td>234</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>45</td>
<td>Thematic combination</td>
<td>237</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>46</td>
<td>Chord roots, Chorale No. 1 in E Major, mm. 130-132a</td>
<td>238</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>47</td>
<td>Ambiguity of harmonic roots</td>
<td>241</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>48</td>
<td>Chord roots, mm. 141b-144a</td>
<td>241</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>49</td>
<td>Progression of mediant-related keys</td>
<td>246</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>50</td>
<td>Comparison of dominant-elaboration passages</td>
<td>252</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>51</td>
<td>Comparison of cadence approaches</td>
<td>255</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>52</td>
<td>Chorale No. 2 in B Minor structural diagram</td>
<td>259</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>53</td>
<td>Motion toward beat 3</td>
<td>265</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>54</td>
<td>Chord roots of sequence, mm. 41-44</td>
<td>266</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>55</td>
<td>Sequence (ea) with augmented sonority as connection</td>
<td>269</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>56</td>
<td>Chord roots, b-phrase, mm. 80b-83</td>
<td>269</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>57</td>
<td>Half-step adjustment</td>
<td>272</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>58</td>
<td>Different connection in b-b-c phrase group</td>
<td>273</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>59</td>
<td>Upward third-related harmonies</td>
<td>274</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>60</td>
<td>Adjustment in f-section</td>
<td>280</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>61</td>
<td>Structural diagram of fugato</td>
<td>280</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>62</td>
<td>Harmonic connections, mm. 250-253</td>
<td>287</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>63</td>
<td>Comparison of sequences</td>
<td>288</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>64</td>
<td>German sixth-diminished seventh interchange</td>
<td>289</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
LIST OF FIGURES, Continued

65. Chorale No. 3 in A Minor structural diagram . 292
66. Minor third pivot on diminished sevenths . . . 293
67. Comparison of different a-b phrase groups . . . 306
68. Harmonic roots, m. 63 . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . 315
69. Harmonic roots, m. 104 . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . 316
70. Harmonic roots, mm. 120b-122 . . . . . . . . . . . . 320
71. Harmonic roots, mm. 135-136a . . . . . . . . . . . . 322
72. Harmonic roots, mm. 153-155a . . . . . . . . . . . . 323
73. Diminished/dominant seventh succession,
   mm. 159-161a . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . 324
74. Comparison of chorale phrase structure . . . . . . . 326
75. Summary of passages displaying motivic
   interweaving . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . 331
76. Summary of dominant elaborations . . . . . . . . . . . 332
77. Summary of thematic elaboration . . . . . . . . . . . . 333
78. Summary of fully contrapuntal sections . . . . . . . 334
79. Summary of thematic combination . . . . . . . . . . . . 337
80. Summary of sequence nesting . . . . . . . . . . . . . . 339
81. Summary of sequence truncating . . . . . . . . . . . . 340
82. Summary of ea sequence . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . 341
83. Summary of sequence combined with pedal . . . . . 343
84. Summary of remote sequential relationships . . . . 343
85. Summary of altered downward fifth cadence
   approaches . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . 348
# LIST OF EXAMPLES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Example</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Illustrations of four associative means</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Illustrations of four combinations of external and internal intervals</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Enharmonic resolution of the fully-diminished seventh chord</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Resolutions of the diminished seventh chord</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. The $0\text{ ct}$ resolution of the diminished seventh chord</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. The $2\text{ ct}$ resolution of the diminished seventh chord</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Four pivot possibilities for each resolution of the diminished seventh chord</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Derivations of the augmented-sixth chords</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. Alternate qualities of augmented-sixth chords</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. Prelude, mm. 1-4</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11. C-motive, Prelude, mm. 13-14</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12. Motive from Prelude, mm. 5</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13. Cadence of $f^#$ A-theme, Prelude, mm. 22-23</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14. Sequence of Prelude, mm. 31b-32</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15. Motivic means of modulation, Prelude, mm. 33-34, 35-37</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16. Derivations of C-motive</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17. Thematic relationships, Prelude, mm. 1-3, 42-43</td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18. Harmonic reduction, Prelude, mm. 42-45</td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Example</td>
<td>Page</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19. Harmonic reduction, Prelude, mm. 48-51</td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20. Prelude, mm. 47-51a</td>
<td>57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21. Comparison of Chorale theme (a) and bell motive (b) from <em>Parsifal</em> (Act 1), by Richard Wagner</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22. Chorale, mm. 66-68a</td>
<td>66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23. Chorale, mm. 87-89</td>
<td>69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24. Resolution of half-diminished seventh chord</td>
<td>71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25. Chorale, mm. 58-59</td>
<td>72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26. Chorale, mm. 60-62a</td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27. Voice exchange, Chorale, mm. 86-87 and 112-113</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28. Sequential nesting and ascent, Chorale, mm. 89b-93</td>
<td>82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29. Relationship between motives from Prelude and Chorale</td>
<td>83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30. Motive from Link, mm. 120b-121</td>
<td>86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31. Harmonic reduction, mm. 129-132</td>
<td>87</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>32. Fugue subject, mm. 157b-161</td>
<td>92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>33. Subject harmonization</td>
<td>94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>34. Fugue countersubject, mm. 161b-165</td>
<td>96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35. Reduction, Fugue, mm. 173b-177</td>
<td>96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36. Comparison of countersubject I with earlier material</td>
<td>98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37. Comparison of countersubject II with earlier material</td>
<td>98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>38. Upward minor third pivot, Fugue, mm. 247b-248</td>
<td>99</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
LIST OF EXAMPLES, Continued

39. Motive similarities, Fugue, m. 179 (a) and m. 233 (b) ............... 104
40. Sequence of Fugue, mm. 183-188 ................. 106
41. Sequence of Fugue, mm. 184-188 ................. 106
42. End of sixth subject, sequence, and seventh subject, Fugue, mm. 196b-209 ............... 107
43. Diatonic contrapuntal underlay, Fugue, mm. 199-205 ............... 109
44. Fugue, mm. 199-206, (a) harmonic reduction, (b) chord roots, (c) and (d) functional interpretation ............... 110
45. Pairing, Fugue, mm. 211-214 ................. 115
46. Shift of contrapuntal to harmonic function ............... 117
47. Sequential pair, Fugue, mm. 214-216 ............... 118
48. Fugue, mm. 258b-261 ............... 122
49. Harmonic reduction of sequential ascent, Fugue, mm. 269-271 ............... 126
50. Harmonic reduction of the cadenza, Fugue, mm. 286-309 ............... 128
51. Contrapuntal structure, Prelude (PAF) ............... 139
52. Embellishing harmonies ............... 140
53. Half-diminished seventh as augmented-sixth chord ............... 141
54. Augmented-sixth chords created by surface chromatic movement ............... 145
55. Derivation of the h-phrase motive ............... 149
56. Surface augmented-sixth chord ............... 151
57. Harmonic reduction, Prelude (PAF), mm. 79-82 .... 156
LIST OF EXAMPLES, Continued

58. Subject of o-p phrase group, Prelude (PAF),
    mm. 84b-92a . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . 157
59. Countersubjects of o-p phrase group . . . . . 158
60. Compression of falling second motive . . . . . 159
61. Harmonic reduction, Prelude (PAF),
    mm. 92b-100a . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . 160
62. Dissonance shift of motive . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . 163
63. Comparison of harmonizations, Prelude (PAF) . 165
64. Voice exchange, Prelude (PAF), m. 140 . . . . 166
65. Prelude (PAF), mm. 149-150 . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . 167
66. Half-diminished seventh chord on ♭ . . . . . . . 167
67. Half-step slip, Prelude (PAF), m. 170 . . . . . 169
68. Comparison of Aria (PAF) introduction and
    Chorale (PCF) theme . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . 175
69. Aria (PAF) theme . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . 176
70. Aria (PAF), mm. 230-232a . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . 179
71. Compensation for dissonance created by voice
    inversion . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . 180
72. Aria (PAF) extension, mm. 221-225a (a and b),
    mm. 241-245a (c and d) . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . 182
73. Suspended diminished sevenths . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . 185
74. Aria coda motive . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . 186
75. Incomplete voice exchange, Aria (PAF),
    mm. 290-292 . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . 187
76. Finale, A1-phrase, mm. 301b-305a . . . . . . . 191
77. Finale, A2-phrase, mm. 305b-309a . . . . . . . 192
78. Finale, mm. 317b-325a, and harmonic
    reduction . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . 193
LIST OF EXAMPLES, Continued

79. Alternate progression .......................... 195
80. Alternate harmonic succession, Finale (PAF),
    m. 324 ........................................... 196
81. Finale (PAF), mm. 327-330 ........................ 197
82. Augmented-sixth resolutions ........................ 198
83. Upward step movement ............................ 199
84. B-theme: Type 1a, mm. 335-339a (a); Type 1b,
    mm. 339-343a (b); Type 2a, mm. 347-350a (c);
    Type 2b, mm. 350-353a (d) ...................... 200
85. Prolongation of A minor harmony .................... 204
86. Linear connection, Finale (PAF), m. 364 ... 205
87. Finale (PAF), mm. 385-388 ........................ 206
88. Descending fifth and neighbor note motive from
    Chorale No. 1 in E Major, h-, i-, and
    j-phrases, mm. 46b-55 ............................ 219
89. Chorale No. 1 in E Major, mm. 8b-10a ........... 222
90. Minor-minor seventh form of the augmented-sixth
    chord ............................................. 222
91. Neighbor note motive .............................. 223
92. Disguised descending fifth ........................ 224
93. Alternate augmented-sixth sonorities ............ 224
94. Chorale No. 1 in E Major, mm. 27-30a ........... 226
95. Major second appoggiatura on a diminished
    seventh chord .................................... 229
96. Connection of half-step-related chords ........... 231
97. Thematic elaboration .............................. 233
98. Prominent motives ................................. 235
LIST OF EXAMPLES, Continued

99. Variants of y-motive: m. 96, transposed (a); m. 129 (b); m. 147, transposed (c) .... 238
100. Chorale No. 1 in E Major, mm. 129-130 ...... 239
101. Comparison of e-phrases: mm. 23b-25 (a); mm. 153b-156 (b) ........ 243
102. Pair, Chorale No. 1 in E Major, mm. 164b-166 ...... 244
103. Chorale No. 1 in E Major, mm. 167-170 ...... 245
104. Development of a-phrase motive ........ 248
105. Chorale No. 1 in E Major, mm. 215-218 ...... 249
106. Overlapping sequence and pair structure, Chorale No. 1 in E Major, mm. 215b-229 ...... 250
107. Comparison of i2 dux and comes ........ 253
108. Comparison of j3 dux and comes ........ 254
109. Chorale theme, Chorale No. 2 in B Minor, mm. 1-16 ........ 260
110. Harmonic parallelisms, mm. 21-22 ........ 263
111. Connection of tritone-related chords .......... 271
112. Chorale No. 2 in B Minor, mm. 115-118 ...... 275
113. Chorale No. 2 in B Minor, mm. 127-130 ...... 277
114. Bidirectional gravitation to bVI triad members ........ 278
115. 2 ct resolution of diminished seventh ...... 278
116. Contrapuntal elaboration of dominant approach ........ 279
117. Connection of bvi-related harmonies .......... 282
118. Downward fifth movement, Chorale No. 2 in B Minor, mm. 228-230a ........ 284

xiv
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Example</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>119.</td>
<td>New harmonic goal for downward-fifth succession</td>
<td>284</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>120.</td>
<td>Half-step descent, mm. 1-4</td>
<td>293</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>121.</td>
<td>Incomplete neighbor note, m. 1</td>
<td>294</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>122.</td>
<td>Comparison of b-phrases: b (a); b1 (b); b2 (c); b3 (d)</td>
<td>295</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>123.</td>
<td>Chorale No. 3 in A Minor, mm. 26-28a</td>
<td>298</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>124.</td>
<td>Motive relationship to chorale theme</td>
<td>299</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>125.</td>
<td>&quot;Phrygian&quot; dominant</td>
<td>300</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>126.</td>
<td>Chorale No. 3 in A Minor, d-phrase, mm. 30b-35a</td>
<td>301</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>127.</td>
<td>Chorale No. 3 in A Minor, e-phrase, mm. 35b-40a</td>
<td>302</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>128.</td>
<td>Chorale No. 3 in A Minor, f-phrase, mm. 40b-47</td>
<td>304</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>129.</td>
<td>Chorale No. 3 in A Minor, g-phrase, mm. 61b-66</td>
<td>307</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>130.</td>
<td>Chorale No. 3 in A Minor, h-phrase, mm. 66b-70a</td>
<td>308</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>131.</td>
<td>Chorale No. 3 in A Minor, h1-phrase, mm. 70b-74</td>
<td>309</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>132.</td>
<td>Chorale No. 3 in A Minor, g1-phrase, mm. 74b-79</td>
<td>310</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>133.</td>
<td>Harmonic reduction of g1-phrase, mm. 74b-78</td>
<td>311</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>134.</td>
<td>Descending fully-diminished seventh succession</td>
<td>311</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>135.</td>
<td>Sequence (ea), Chorale No. 3 in A Minor, mm. 106-111</td>
<td>317</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>136.</td>
<td>Reharmonization of i-phrase motive</td>
<td>319</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CHAPTER 1

INTRODUCTION

In the chronology of César Franck's compositions, the piano music comes from the earliest and latest periods. Franck's father recognized his son's musical gifts early and set about to profit from young César's talent. Under strong parental control, Franck wrote many virtuoso show pieces in the period 1835-1846; these he performed at concerts arranged by his father. Included among them were frothy fantasias and dazzling variations on popular opera themes. Alfred Cortot describes Franck's early efforts as a "series of glib effusions written well within the bounds of the consciously declamatory style of the epoch."¹

Not until almost forty years later, at the peak of his musical maturity, did Franck turn again to the piano as the vehicle for his compositions.² Of the four major late


²The only exceptions to this statement are: Les plaintes d'une poupée (which Cortot, ibid., 41, refers to as an "insignificant trifile"), a few piano arrangements of organ works, a few song accompaniments, and the piano part of the piano quintet. The last work, written in 1879, is not a small work, but it is near Franck's complete resumption of piano composition in 1884.
works, two are for piano and orchestra: *Les Pièces* (1884), a tone poem with piano solo, and *Variations symphoniques* (1885), a one-movement concerto-like piece, in which the piano functions as an equal to (and not the superior of) the orchestra. The other two, which will be considered in this study, are for solo piano: the *Prelude, Chorale, and Fugue* (1884) and the *Prelude, Aria, and Finale* (1886-1887).

These two late piano works combine elements of eighteenth-century formal structure and large key relationships with an extended nineteenth-century harmonic vocabulary and pianistic technique. Vincent d'Indy, Franck's first biographer, relates that Franck felt dissatisfied with the condition of the piano repertoire, and consequently set out to write something really original for the piano, adapting the old aesthetic forms to the new technique of the piano.³ In his view, Franck's late piano works represent a conscious effort to replace the virtuoso, but musically banal, variety of fantasia and operatic variation with a more serious kind of music, an absolute music with artistic value apart from any popular appeal. Cortot contradicts the "protest" aspect of d'Indy's assessment of Franck's motivation, believing that Franck's renewed interest in the piano was due

to a desire to see it profit by the
great stirring of musical activity after
the 1870 war . . . . I am sure that in
undertaking the composition of the four
works under discussion Franck was not so
much protesting against the so-called
morbid tendencies of the beginning of
the century (for it is hard to imagine
Franck writing music in protest against
anything), as bent on proving the
expressive worth of an instrument
unjustly neglected or disparaged at the
actual moment.⁴

Laurence Davies, also taking issue with d'Indy's
interpretation, gives yet another possible motivation:

Part of Franck's intention surely
stemmed from his original training as a
virtuoso (now given a fresh and slightly
different opportunity to display itself)
and partly from the connection of the
piano with chamber ensemble for which he
had written in 1879 . . . . The writing
of [the Quintet] must have put the
composer in mind of keyboard figuration
again.⁵

Whatever the motivation, Franck's late piano works, though
not alone as d'Indy claims, certainly stand with only a few
other works as masterpieces of nineteenth-century French
piano literature.⁶

⁴Cortot, op. cit., 57.
⁵Laurence Davies, César Franck (London: Dent, 1973),
35.
⁶d'Indy, op. cit., 161-163. Cortot, op. cit., 58,
lists other masterpieces which predate Franck's two
triptychs, including d'Indy's own Poème des Montagnes
As an organ composer, Franck had ample opportunity for creative work. From 1858 until his death in 1890, he held the position of organist at Ste. Clotilde, for which he composed service music. Much of this music was extemporized, and, as d'Indy attests, his music often attracted many students and other admirers to Ste. Clotilde on Sunday. 7 Franck's larger organ works are in three groups: the Six Pièces (1860-1862), the Trois Pièces (1878), and the three organ chorales (1890), from the last year of his life.

The three late organ works, the chorales in E major, B minor, and A minor, represent the culmination of Franck's harmonic style. In these works, as in the two piano works, he combines traditional and innovative elements on harmonic and structural levels. None of the three is based on a pre-existing chorale melody, but on a chorale composed uniquely for its setting. Although Bach's organ chorales were in Franck's mind, 8 the organization of the three chorales goes beyond the simpler chorale prelude structure of Bach to a much larger structure, approaching that of (1881), Alexi di Castillon's Concerto (1872), Fauré's Ballade (1880), and other works by Saint-Saëns, Lalo, Chabrier, and Alkan.

7d'Indy, op. cit., 42-44.

chorale variation and chorale fantasia. Franck himself used the term "fantasia" in describing the first of the three works: "a chorale it is indeed, but with plenty of fantasy."

My study, then, will analyze the following five keyboard works: (1) Prelude, Chorale, and Fugue for piano (denoted PCF), (2) Prelude, Aria, and Finale for piano (denoted PAF), (3) Chorale No. 1 in B Major for organ, (4) Chorale No. 2 in B Minor for organ, and (5) Chorale No. 3 in A Minor for organ. The grouping of these five works as a body is justified on the following grounds: (1) The dates of their composition fall into a relatively narrow span (1884-1890) of Franck's late period. (2) They are all large-scale pieces from these two related mediums.

As significant as these keyboard works are, no detailed study has been done that focuses on the works themselves. Many general studies of Franck have been done, emphasizing historical and biographical aspects of his life and works. Without exception, the analyses in these studies are necessarily limited to citing themes and key areas, identifying compositional techniques (such as cyclicism and sequence), and giving general "mood descriptions" of particular passages or movements.

\[\text{9}\text{ cited in Vallas, op. cit., 230.}\]
More detailed studies have been relatively few, considering Franck's stature as a composer. Some have focused on Franck's style in general (Wegener, Jersild), identifying and classifying certain personal characteristics of Franck's harmonic language. Other studies have examined certain works or genres, emphasizing their individual characteristics (B. Jones, Dommel-Diény, James) or tracing their influence or relationship to works of other composers (Grover, C. Jones, Sanger). A brief summary of some of the major studies (both biographical and analytical) is as follows:

Laurence Davies' book on Franck is one of the more recent studies.\textsuperscript{10} It presents a general overview of the composer's life and works. In the discussion of the works themselves, the analysis is confined to the identification of key areas, primary themes, and, occasionally, a particular compositional device.

Wilhelm Mohr's study is the German counterpart to Davies' study.\textsuperscript{11} It, too, is concerned with a general discussion of Franck's life and works. Mohr also provides a complete thematic catalog of the composer's published music. His index (M.) is occasionally used to identify Franck's

\textsuperscript{10}Davies, \textit{op. cit.}

\textsuperscript{11}Wilhelm Mohr, \textit{Caesar Franck}, 2nd ed. (Tutzing: Schneider, 1969).
works, but, on the whole, it has not gained widespread usage.\footnote{An obvious reason is that an index is almost superfluous because of the limited number of major works.}

Earlier studies have taken a similar general approach. The first large-scale study was Vincent d'Indy's biography.\footnote{d'Indy, \textit{op. cit.}} Though somewhat marred by an intentionally "worshipful" perspective, d'Indy's biography is useful for first-hand accounts of many aspects of Franck's life. The study of Léon Vallas focuses on the historical aspects of the musical works, examining such things as circumstances of composition and public reaction.\footnote{Vallas, \textit{op. cit.}} The study of Norman Demuth emphasizes the works themselves, rather than biography.\footnote{Norman Demuth, \textit{César Franck} (New York: Philosophical Library, 1949).} The analytical approach is, like Davies, descriptive, but more thematic detail is given. Key areas, compositional devices (texture, counterpoint, etc.), and thematic development are the main topics.

Among the more detailed studies, that of Dommel-Diény\footnote{Amy Dommel-Diény, \textit{L'analyse harmonique en exemples de J.S. Bach à Debussy: César Franck} (Paris: author, 1973).} concentrates mostly on thematic aspects...
(development, cyclicism, etc.) of the Prelude, Chorale and Fugue and the three organ chorales.

Bernd Wegener, drawing examples from all genres of Franck's music, identifies the following characteristics of Franck's harmonic language: (1) choice of tonality, (2) modal influence (meaning "church modes"), (3) major-minor shift, and (4) deceptive cadence. Musical excerpts are labelled with a combination of Stufentheorie Roman numerals and Funktionstheorie Riemannian symbols. He also discusses the influence of Wagner on Franck's late harmonic style.

Wegener compares and contrasts four elements: (1) cadence treatment, (2) dissonance treatment, (3) chromaticism, and (4) tonality-consciousness. The final large section of this study is devoted to explaining the various ways that Franck's melodies are influenced by the harmonic vocabulary.

The study of Jörgen Jersild, also broadly considering all works, examines and classifies harmonic function. Based on Riemann's Funktionstheorie and using Riemannian symbols, Jersild's study groups the various diatonic and chromatic chords based on the number of "steps" required to...
reach tonic. These groups are given the title "position-categories." For example, the secondary dominant chain is a clear example of the six position-categories, as shown in Figure 1. To this is added the subdominant function chords and the tritone equivalent of every chord. As an example of the tritone equivalency (notated with the suffix "alt"), both the dominant seventh and the augmented-sixth chord built on $b^2$ ($G^7$ and $D^b7$ in the key of C) are placed in position-category 2.

Figure 1. Six position-categories of Jørgen Jersild.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>position-category</th>
<th>6</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>1</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Jersild, after Riemann</td>
<td>$\text{V}$</td>
<td>$\text{V}$</td>
<td>$\text{V}$</td>
<td>$\text{V}$</td>
<td>$\text{V}$</td>
<td>$\text{T}$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>functional Roman numeral, after Weber</td>
<td>V/iii</td>
<td>V/vi</td>
<td>V/ii</td>
<td>V/V</td>
<td>V</td>
<td>I</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>generalized Roman numeral, after Schoenberg</td>
<td>VII</td>
<td>III</td>
<td>VI</td>
<td>II</td>
<td>V</td>
<td>I</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Having so grouped the harmonic vocabulary, Jersild proceeds to explain many of Franck's chromatic progressions as the various successions of mutually unrelated but positionally adjacent harmonies. In illustrating the various position-categories, Jersild is able to comment on the relative frequency of certain types (i.e., position) of chords.

With more of a specific-work focus, the recent studies of B. Jones and James have examined Franck's works for
piano and orchestra (*Les Djinns* and *Variations symphoniques*).  

The study of Sanger is an attempt to calculate the amount of chromaticism used in different works from various periods of Franck's life. He then does the same for Fauré, making comparisons and contrasts. A peculiar aspect of this study is Sanger's insistence that every measure of every piece must be identified with a particular key. Even if the tonal areas were discrete, the criteria for establishing a tonal area is certainly not absolute. In addition, the study is also marred by inaccuracies and inconsistencies in identifying tonal areas. For instance, according to a key area graph of the *Prelude, Chorale, and Fugue*, the final secondary key area of the Prelude is d minor, rather than g	extsuperscript{#}. If the key areas shown in the graphs are indeed the ones used in the calculation of the

---


21Sanger, *ibid.*, 94. See also my discussion of this passage in Chapter 3.
statistical measure of chromaticism, then the results may also be questioned.

In addition to these large studies, single passages have been analyzed in Piston (showing irregular harmonic resolutions), Benward (stressing harmonic and melodic aspects), Lester (explaining nonfunctional simultaneities from a voice-leading basis), and Salzer (showing how a sequence identifies a significant harmonic/contrapuntal goal). 22

I will maintain that it is of prime importance to consider a musical work as a whole. Techniques of construction, important melodic and harmonic figures, and formal processes can then be placed within the context of the complete work. A direct consequence of this orientation is that a profile of each individual piece will be revealed as its individual elements and their interrelationships are discovered.

My goal, then, will be to examine each piece singly, identifying its salient features in detail, and to create a "composite image" of the piece as a musical entity. A

---

secondary goal will be to compare the features and
techniques of the works as a corpus, noting similarities and
differences. As this proceeds, a higher-level profile of
Franck’s compositional style will result. Necessarily
narrower in scope than Wegener (who illustrates his points
from all genres of Franck’s oeuvre), my summary will be more
detailed, concentrating on underlying techniques as well as
surface phenomena.

It will be instructive to consider the various ways in
which the musical materials are put together. Since the
technique of sequence is so pervasive in the late keyboard
works of Franck, we will find it instructive to examine the
various types of sequences and the various roles they serve.
In addition, other related techniques of associating
harmonic and melodic materials will be considered. Some of
these subsequent techniques will concern the ways in which
the pattern is modified, broken, or contrasted with a
different pattern. A detailed examination of these
techniques has not been undertaken in the studies described
above.

As I have stated above, the emphases in the above
studies have been harmony and, secondarily, melody. With
the possible exception of the last two references (Salzer
and Lester), the role of counterpoint in explaining tonal
logic has, it seems, been underplayed. The counterpoint of
Franck, it is true, has been noted in the following ways: (1) identification of themes in canon, (2) recognition of fugues and fugal passages, and, (3) in a general way, the description of the relationship between various musical lines. What has not been addressed is the following: (1) How can the observation of local contrapuntal relationships clarify and explain local harmonic succession? (2) How can observation of larger structural units (whether harmonic or contrapuntal) clarify and explain local harmonic succession? (3) What kind of contrapuntal techniques does Franck employ, and which techniques recur the most frequently? (4) What is the role of contrapuntal devices in defining (or frustrating) harmonic relationships (local, intermediate, key areas), formal outlines (from local to large-scale), and expectation?

My aim, then, will be to answer these questions, and, in so doing, give more substantive definition to the role of counterpoint and its relationship to harmony in Franck's works.

The organization of the study will be as follows: (1) definition of terms and symbols used in the analysis, (2) a separate analytical chapter for each of the five late keyboard works (Prelude, Chorale, and Fugue and Prelude).

\[\text{(ibid.) do propose answers for these questions for the single passage each analyzes.}\]
Aria, and Finale for piano; Chorale No. 1 in E Major, Chorale No. 2 in B Minor, and Chorale No. 3 in A Minor, for organ), and (3) a summary detailing Franck's characteristic harmonic and contrapuntal techniques.
CHAPTER 2

DEFINITION OF TERMS

Before we begin to examine the specific works, it will be necessary to define some terms and concepts. This will not only provide a justification for the following analytical discussion, but also allow it to be more concise.

Let us consider first the various relationships that may exist between successive musical ideas, relationships which are very specific and circumscribed. At the most trivial level, this amounts to a simple repetition, as in Figure 2a ("x" represents the material; "a" represents the pitch level).

![Figure 2. Four relationships between musical ideas.](image)

- a. \_\_x\_\_ a\_x\_\_ Repetition
- b. \_\_x\_\_ b\_x\_\_ Sequence
- c. \_x\_\_ a\_x'\_\_ Pair
- d. \_x\_\_ b\_x'\_\_ Sequential pair

The second type (Fig. 2b) features the repetition of the same material at a different pitch level. This corresponds to our notion of sequence. The relationship of "a" to "b" can be exact or diatonic, and many different combinations of melody and harmony may be sequenced. The interrelationships of these aspects will be addressed presently.
The third type, which we will identify as "pairing," is the immediate repetition of the material at the same pitch level--yet one element of the material is varied (Fig. 2c). The recurrence of varied material at some distance may be described with the terms "association" and "development," but, strictly speaking, it is not pairing.

The variation of the second unit may be as small (and nonsubstantial) as the change of diminution or the revoicing of an arpeggio. On the other hand, it may be as large (and substantial) as the change of harmonic direction of the phrase or of successive phrases. The new element becomes the musical focus of the pair, with the listener's attention drawn inevitably to it.

John Trevitt mentions this term, but with a slightly different meaning.¹⁴ For him, the origin is the "chord pair," meaning two adjacent chords that are associated together and thus form a pair. He goes on to say that the pair may be repeated with variation to the second chord, thus creating a focus (his term is "implied sforzando"). He goes on to say that Franck applies the concept to melodic materials and to entire phrases. My use of the term "pair" differs in that the individual unit of the pair is not a

single chord, but the entire melodic material that is repeated with variation.

The fourth type of adjacent association (Fig. 2d), combining sequential and variation aspects, will be known as the "sequential pair." Technically this category contains all types of sequences that are not exact or that do not involve all musical parameters. For instance, a sequence that involves harmony only can be said to be a sequential pair with the melody and/or voicing varied. Even a diatonic sequence involving all parameters is, by this criteria, a sequential pair, because the patterns within the first leg are adjusted qualitatively (and consequently, "varied") in the second leg in order to remain in the local tonality. And it may be debated whether the breaking point of the sequence is outside the sequence or is a "varied" element within the sequence. For these reasons, the line between sequence and sequential pair is not always easily distinguished. The four types of adjacent association (of Fig. 2) are illustrated in Ex. 1.

Let us return to the concept of sequence. We may classify sequences according to the following two criteria: (1) musical parameters involved in the sequence, and (2) relationships between the units.²⁵

²⁵In this discussion, the term "unit" will be synonymous with "leg."
Example 1. Illustrations of four associative means.

a. Repetition

b. Sequence

c. Pair

d. Sequential pair

With regard to musical parameters, I will distinguish between the sequences in which only the melody is sequenced (designated m), those in which only the harmony is sequenced (h), and those in which both melody and harmony are sequenced (mh). We will find the mh and m types to be the most common.

Before I define the relationships between the units of a sequence, I need to identify two further criteria by which these relationships will be defined. The first is the pattern of intervals within each unit ("internal intervals"). This pattern may be exact (all corresponding intervals identical), or modally adjusted (that is, all intervals adjusted to be "in" the local key area). The term "diatonic" is often used to characterize this type of modal
adjustment. The term "tonal" corresponds only insofar as the adjustments are of interval quality only. The eighteenth-century tonal adjustment of changing a fourth to a fifth is not included in my definition of "adjusted" as it refers to internal intervals. Example 2c illustrates the modally adjusted internal relationship. Note that the pattern of the first unit, G - F - E\textsubscript{b}, is reflected by E\textsubscript{b} - D - C in unit 2. This melodic pattern is not exact, but it is modally adjusted and, thereby, diatonically equivalent. Example 2a illustrates exact internal relationships. Note that G - F - E\textsubscript{b} is imitated by E\textsubscript{b} - D\textsubscript{b} - C\textsubscript{b}. The second criterion is the interval between the units (the interval of sequence or "external interval"). This interval may also be either exact or adjusted. Example 2a illustrates an exact external interval. Note that the units begin successively on G, E\textsubscript{b}, and B, each an enharmonic major third apart. Example 2b, which has exact internal intervals (verify G - F - E\textsubscript{b}, E\textsubscript{b} - D\textsubscript{b} - C\textsubscript{b}, C - B\textsubscript{b} - A\textsubscript{b}), has an adjusted interval of sequence. Note that the units begin successively, on G, E\textsubscript{b}, and C. One interval of sequence is a major third; the other is a minor third. Notice also that this type of sequence requires at least three legs, since it must have two external intervals. By definition, the term

\textsuperscript{26}By "external" I mean external to the individual units, but not external to the sequence.
"adjusted," when referring to external intervals, may denote qualitative (e.g., major third to minor third) and quantitative (e.g., third to second) adjustments.

Example 2. Illustrations of four combinations of external and internal intervals.

a. ee

b. ea

c. aa

d. ae

The various combinations, then, are as follows: exact internal intervals with exact external intervals (ee), as in Example 2a, exact internal intervals with adjusted external intervals (ea), as in Example 2b, and adjusted internal intervals with adjusted external intervals (aa), as in Example 2c.

A fourth combination, adjusted internal intervals with exact external intervals (ae) is illustrated in Example 2d. In actual practice, this type occurs as a special case of the aa type, that is, when the exact external intervals of
the diatonic sequence lay within the diatonic scale. A summary of these relationships is given in Figure 3.

Figure 3. Summary of interval combinations.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>internal intervals</th>
<th>external intervals</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>exact</td>
<td>exact</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>exact</td>
<td>adjusted</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>adjusted</td>
<td>adjusted</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

exact exact = ee
exact adjusted = ea
adjusted adjusted = aa

If a sequence has only two units and has no possible initial note of a third unit, I will replace the external interval indicator with a hyphen, as follows: a-, e-.

When discussing tonal music, it is frequently helpful to refer to harmonic structures in terms of their relationships to the tonal center. To do this, I will use the system of Roman numerals developed by Gottfried Weber (1779-1839). First delineated in his theoretical treatise Versuch einer geordneten Theorie der Tonsetzkunst of 1821, the Roman numeral system has gained a wide acceptance in music pedagogy and analysis.28

If we replace the more general concept of "adjusted" with the more specific "diatonic," then the fourth combination (ae) practically does not exist, for the concept of diatonic internal intervals ceases to exist when the external interval is exact. As an example, envision the third unit of Ex. 2c as starting on C♭. What is the diatonic series that follows C♭? C♭ itself is not diatonic.

27If we replace the more general concept of "adjusted" with the more specific "diatonic," then the fourth combination (ae) practically does not exist, for the concept of diatonic internal intervals ceases to exist when the external interval is exact. As an example, envision the third unit of Ex. 2c as starting on C♭. What is the diatonic series that follows C♭? C♭ itself is not diatonic.

Three aspects are inherent in the Roman numeral labels: (1) the identification of the chord root, (2) the identification of the relationship of that root to a given tonic, and (3) the identification of the quality of the triad or seventh chord. Weber's "fundamental harmonies" (both triads and seventh chords) for major and minor are given in Figure 4.29

Figure 4. Fundamental harmonies of Gottfried Weber.

Major:  
I  ii  iii  IV  V  vi  vii°  
I°  ii°  iii°  IV°  V°  vi°  vii°

Minor:  
i  ii  iv  V  VI  vii°  
ii°  iv°  V°  VI°

It is interesting to note Weber's exclusive use of the harmonic minor scale for the formation of minor key diatonic qualities. This results in an augmented quality for the mediant, which he rejected as a fundamental harmony.30 The major qualities III and VII are regarded as "not appropriate to the scale, but [as] modulations."31 In addition, he rejected the fully-diminished seventh chord as a fundamental chord, preferring rather to view it as an incomplete

Wilkins, Carter, 1846).

29ibid., I, 289.

30ibid., I, 287.

31ibid., I, 287.
dominant ninth. The minor key qualities of III, VII, v, as well as the all-upper case symbols have come as theorists extended and modified Weber's system.

Occasionally it will be helpful to identify chords in a more general sense than Weber's Roman numerals allow. To do this, I will use the all-capital version of the Roman numeral to denote the scale step. This will be particularly helpful in gaining a background perspective on a progression. As we will see in the specific analyses, chord function may be independent of chord quality. Said another way, each scale step (chord function) may, in actual practice, have several possible triad- and seventh-chord-qualities. The use of Roman numerals, whether of Weber or of the generalized variety, depends on the recognition of a 'tonal center. Occasionally in Franck's late works, as well as in much of the music of the late nineteenth-century, the perception of key is so ambiguous that it renders the Roman numeral system meaningless. In these cases, as well as in more well-defined cases, I will simply label chord roots.

A figured bass symbol will be appended to certain Roman numerals to indicate the inversion of the chord.

Since the system of Roman numerals expresses relationships, it is helpful to extend it to express key

\[ \text{iibid.}, \ I, 200-201. \]
relationships, as well. Keys will be indicated by the use of brackets. They may reflect absolute pitch levels, as in "[b]", or key relationships, as in "[V]".

To denote scale degrees (relative to local tonic) I will use the carret, as such: 5 to mean "scale degree 5."

Corresponding to Weber's use of upper- and lower-case Roman numerals to distinguish between qualities, I will use lower case letters to denote minor chords or keys and upper case letters to denote major chords or keys. By extension, diminished chords will be lower case, and both dominant seventh and major-major seventh qualities will be upper case.

The diminished seventh chord, pervasive in nineteenth-century music, is, because of its equidistant character, a likely chord for quick modulations to and tonicizations of remote key areas. So that I may refer quickly to its enharmonic qualities, let us examine a few illustrations at this point.

Because any note of the diminished seventh chord may be the root, any single diminished seventh chord may have four possible primary resolutions, as shown in Example 3." If a chord whose tonal context is vii°/D resolves to F, then I will refer to that as an "upward minor third

33 The term "primary" means the resolution as a vii° to its tonic.
pivot." Similarly, if a vii⁰⁷/D resolves to B, it is a “downward minor third pivot,” and if to A♭, then, "tritone pivot."

Example 3. Enharmonic resolution of the fully-diminished seventh chord.

The diminished seventh chord bears a close resemblance to the dominant seventh chord whose root is a major third lower than that of the diminished seventh chord (Ex. 4a). Indeed, they share three common tones and may function as V⁷ and vii⁰⁷ of the same key. Because of this great similarity, the diminished seventh chord may be said to represent or to be equivalent to the dominant seventh with which it shares three common tones. In the following analyses that list generalized chord roots, I will denote the root of the diminished seventh as the root of its equivalent dominant seventh. A resolution such as in Ex. 4b will be noted as a 3⁰ resolution. Note that, in the general sense, there is no harmonic movement since they share the same general root. Again, there are four possibilities of a 3⁰ resolution for each diminished seventh chord.
Example 4. Resolutions of the diminished seventh chord.

A diminished seventh chord may resolve with a single common tone to either a major chord or dominant seventh, as illustrated in Example 4c. This resolution may be described in three different ways: (1) as a chromatic elaboration (neighbor notes) of the tonic or dominant seventh (sometimes referred to as a "nondominant resolution"), (2) as a deceptive resolution (vii°7 to VI°6), or (3) as an omission of the dominant function (vii°7/V - omitted V - I). In any case, this resolution, whether of diminished seventh to dominant seventh or vice versa, will be noted as a 1 ct resolution. When the resolution is of dominant seventh to diminished seventh by 1 ct, the equivalent root movement is by downward fifth (Ex. 4d). As always, though, the context will dictate the meaning of the diminished seventh. A 1 ct resolution whose equivalence is an upward major second is shown in Example 4e. When the order is reversed, namely from diminished seventh to dominant seventh by 1 ct, the underlying root movement is the opposite, that of upward
fifth (Ex. 4f). Again, context determines the actual root (see Ex. 4g).

The resolution of a diminished seventh as a vii\(^{0}\) contains no common tones (Ex. 5a), as does its resolution to another diminished seventh (Ex. 5b and c). The upward 0 ct resolution (Ex. 5b) is equivalent to going up by fifth (and three other pivot possibilities) and the downward 0 ct resolution (Ex. 5c) is equivalent to going down by fifth (again, with three other pivot possibilities).

Example 5. The 0 ct resolution of the diminished seventh chord.

![Example 5](image)

A summary of these relationships is given in Figure 5. For the sake of completeness, we should note the 2 ct resolution of the diminished seventh chord. This does not constitute a new category, but it represents a subset of the others. The first case is when the diminished seventh resolves to a minor triad (Ex. 6a), or vice versa. With the diminished seventh first, the equivalent movement is up by fifth (as in the lower right corner of Fig. 5), expressed
most frequently as a downward second (as in Ex. 6a). With the minor chord first, the equivalent movement is down by fifth (as in the lower left corner of Fig. 5).

Figure 5. 0 ct and 1 ct relationships summarized.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>↓P5</th>
<th>↑P5</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>0 ct</td>
<td>1 ct</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M/m</td>
<td>M/m</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>o7 → Dom7</td>
<td>o7 → Dom7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>↓o7</td>
<td>↓o7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 ct</td>
<td>0 ct</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dom7</td>
<td>Dom7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M → o7</td>
<td>o7 → M</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The second case is when a diminished seventh is paired with a major triad (Ex. 6b). This resolution is similar to the 3 ct resolution in which there is no change of root.

Example 6. The 2 ct resolution of the diminished seventh chord.

and it would be a 3 ct resolution is the triad were a dominant seventh.

A summary of these enharmonic relationships is given in Example 7. There each diminished seventh is identified by the root of its equivalent dominant seventh. Notice that

---

34If the f5 of Ex. 6a is delaying a C sonority, then the real harmonic movement is a primary one (0 ct), down by fifth.
the 0 ct relationship is equivalent to a downward fifth, that
the 1 ct relationship is equivalent to a downward second
(also apparent in the "omitted dominant" explanation,
vii\textsuperscript{3}/V - I or, more generally, II - I), and that the 3 ct
relationship is no movement at all. Each relationship may,
of course, be subjected to three pivot possibilities.

Example 7. Four pivot possibilities for each resolution of
the diminished seventh chord.

The augmented-sixth chord, also prevalent in
nineteenth-century music, can quite logically be derived
from the chromatic alteration of one note of several
different pre-dominant chords (Ex. 8). But once a sonority,
especially a linearly-established one, becomes a part of the
vocabulary, it is free to be treated as an independent
entity. Kraft makes this point when he says,

The chromatic chords that became part of
the vocabulary of tonal music grew out
of triads. Their linear origin shows in
the way they resolve to consonant
chords. Once a dissonant chromatic
chord is absorbed into the language of
music, two things happen: First, each of those chords may be further elaborated into more dissonant chords, adding to the vocabulary again. Second, the dissonant chords may be used with less connection to their original function.\textsuperscript{35}

On the other hand, if we are to interpret this chord harmonically, we first must find the root. A literal scale-step interpretation of the three chords of Ex. 8 yields two different roots, with one of them an altered scale degree ($\sharp 4$). Though this interpretation has had its adherents, it obscures the similarity and common function of the various augmented-sixth chords.

A more logical explanation can be found in the writings of Simon Sechter, a mid-nineteenth-century theorist. For him, the primary augmented sixth varieties all have the second scale degree as their root.\textsuperscript{36} Thus, each of the chords in Example 8 have D as the root; for two (Ex. 8a and b) the root is implied; each has a major third and diminished fifth (forming the interval of the augmented sixth, when $b6$ is below $\sharp 4$; one (Ex. 8b) has a minor ninth.


The result is that the label (II) is consistent with their harmonic function.\textsuperscript{37}

Example 8. Derivations of the augmented-sixth chords.

\begin{figure}[h]
\centering
\includegraphics[width=\textwidth]{example8.png}
\caption{Derivations of the augmented-sixth chords.}
\end{figure}

Before Sechter, this perception of the augmented-sixth chord was found in the eighteenth-century theorists, Johann Philipp Kirnberger, Georg Andreas Sorge, and Friedrich Wilhelm Marpurg.\textsuperscript{38} After Sechter, this perception of the

\textsuperscript{37}Though Weber would never have recognized such a quality as a fundamental harmony (he even denied that right to the fully-diminished seventh chord), he did recognize its occurrence: "... the four-fold chord with small fifth on the second degree, as e.g. $b^7$ in a-minor (this harmony--the four-fold chord on the second degree of the minor scale, is the one that is peculiarized by the elevation of its third)." Weber, \textit{op. cit.}, I, 286.

\textsuperscript{38}Johann Philipp Kirnberger, \textit{Die wahren Grundsätze} (Berlin, 1773), repr. (Hildesheim: Olms, 1970), 28-30. In this source, Kirnberger illustrates the Italian and French types and discusses the German type. In \textit{Die Kunst des reiner Satzes in der Musik}, Kirnberger illustrates (but does not discuss) only the French augmented-sixth chord, and not the functionally similar German and Italian types. Johann Philipp Kirnberger, \textit{Die Kunst des reiner Satzes in der Musik} (Berlin, 1771-79), trans. David Beach and Jurgen Thym as \textit{The Art of Strict Musical Composition} (New Haven, Conn.: Yale University Press, 1982), 49. Georg Andreas Sorge, \textit{Vorgemach der musikalischen Composition} (Lobenstein: author,
augmented sixth was adopted by Arnold Schoenberg. A generalization of this principle allows both writers to place an augmented-sixth type chord on any degree of the scale.

The three commonly found varieties are listed in Example 8, as well: Italian (a), German (b), and French (c). One will quickly note the enharmonic equivalence of the augmented sixth sonorities of Italian and German varieties to that of the dominant seventh built on $b_6$.

Other varieties of augmented-sixth chords may be described in terms of their enharmonic equivalents: (1) minor-minor seventh (Ex. 9a), and (2) half-diminished seventh (Ex. 9b).

Example 9. Alternate qualities of augmented-sixth chords.

\[ \text{Aug}^6(\text{min}) \quad \text{Aug}^6(\text{G7}) \]

Having thus defined the terms and symbols relating to sequence (and other associative devices), to chord sequences...
designation, and to diminished seventh succession, I will proceed to the analytic discussions of the five late keyboard works.
PRELUDE, CHORALE, AND FUGUE

Prelude

The character of the Prelude is fantasia-like and rhapsodic; its themes are characterized by extended arpeggiation figures and a rubato-like quality. It is marked by two distinct themes (denoted "A" and "B"). These themes alternate, with the first A-B pair stated in the tonic and the second A-B pair stated in the dominant minor (Fig. 6). A third idea (C) is briefly stated between the pairs (mm. 13b-15), and it later forms the basis for a developmental section which is primarily sequential (mm. 29b-40). The return to tonic is coupled with a return to the A-theme texture. The A-theme itself is modified. Two significant harmonic diversions form the chief interest of the final modified A-section.

Figure 6. Structural outline of Prelude.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>key</th>
<th>measure</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>i i</td>
<td>1- 8- 13b- 16- 24- 29b- 41-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(C) y v- -- i--i</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The opening (A) theme uses a Lisztian thumb melody combined with bravura-style arpeggiations. It flows in
long-breathed lines without change of texture or pace until its cadence (m. 7). The opening measure of the A-theme is an elaboration of $\frac{5}{4}$ ($F^\#$) as follows: $\frac{5}{4} - \frac{4}{5} - \frac{5}{4} - \frac{5}{4}$. The falling second, stated twice in the opening bar is a significant "germ" motive from which many ideas of the three-movement work are based. Dommel-Diény notes the "expressive cell," but is quite insistent that the material of the opening measures does not constitute a "theme" because of its instability and open-endedness.\footnote{Amy Dommel-Diény, L'analyse harmonique en examples de J.S. Bach à Debussy: César Franck (Paris: author, 1973), 20-21.}


The A-theme demonstrates how Franck constructs thematic materials by the use of sequence. Not only are the opening germ motives sequential (Ex. 10), but the first two measures form the first unit of an a-/m antecedent sequence that extends through measure 4. Additionally, mm. 5-6 form
a separate \( e-/mh \) consequent sequence, as well.\(^{42} \) These first two measures of the A-theme are also significant in these respects: (1) They suggest \( VI^6 \) as an early and important goal. (2) To reach that goal, an upward minor third pivot on the diminished seventh chord is employed. The \( d^\#_7 \) chord that is prolonged through measure 2 resolves not to \( e \), but rather, as an \( f^\#_7 \), to \( G \). The pedal on \( VI^6 \) gives us an early illustration of Franck's tendency to use pedals which are the implied third rather than the implied root of the underlying sonority.

The chord roots are given in Figure 7. Already in m. 3 we see an interesting cross-relationship between harmonic and melodic patterns. The large \( a- \) melodic sequence (with units of two measures) has an external interval of an upward second. The corresponding \( e- \) harmonic sequence moves down by major third, as the \( i - \text{vii}^9 - i \) pattern is stated on the level of \( VI \). The difference is caused by the fact that the soprano (m. 3) contains a different triad member (chord root, rather than chord fifth, as in m. 1). Had the \( G \) of m. 3 been the fifth of a \( C \) chord, or had the soprano note been a \( D \) (fifth of \( G \)), then the external intervals would have

\(^{42}\)This coupled relationship is justified on the following grounds: (1) The two sequences are adjacent. (2) While the intersection of the two sequences (an \( e^\#_7 \) chord) is not a foreign harmony or tonality, it is less conclusive than the goal of the second (\( F^\# \) dominant seventh, which resolves to tonic).

The G was made necessary, however, by the smaller aa melodic sequence, 5 - 4, 6 - 5, 7 - 6).

Note also that the same diminished seventh chord that forms the pivot to VI (m. 2) also tonicizes VI (m. 3). This pivot can be seen in Figure 7 by comparing the equivalent
Figure 7. Prelude, mm. 1-4, chord roots.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>m. 1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>b</td>
<td>dº7</td>
<td>G (fº7)</td>
<td>G</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B</td>
<td>(Fº)</td>
<td>B = D</td>
<td>G (D)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>i</td>
<td>(viiº7)</td>
<td>viiº7/iv</td>
<td>viiº7/V</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

dº7 and fº7, or, in the generalized chord roots, the presence of D in both measures. The notation, in this instance, confirms the function of the diminished seventh in the context of the previous key (as opposed to the goal key). In m. 2, the chord is spelled dº - fº - a - c (relating to [b]), and in m. 3, fº - a - c - eº (relating to [G]). This is not the case in m. 4, where the eº7 (general root of Cº) relates to the goal key of b. Had the notation corresponded to that of m. 2, the diminished seventh chord would have been spelled as a bº7.⁴³

Following the key-establishing cadence on b (mm. 6-7), the second theme (B), marked a capriccio, arrives. It consists of short-breathed motives marked by distinct pauses. It is also characterized by sequence, pairing, and melodic coupling in octaves, thirds and sixths. The falling second of the A-theme is discernible, yet here we have one

---

⁴³Maybe the principle is that the notation should relate to the primary key as closely as possible, unless a secondary key is clearly established, being determined by the following harmony.
important change: Whereas in the soprano voice of the A-theme (mm. 1-4), the upper note is consonant (Fig. 8), in the B-theme, it is usually dissonant, in the manner of a suspension or appoggiatura. This significant change portends the opening of the fugue subject—indeed, the actual pitches of the head of the fugue subject are stated in mm. 11b-12a.

Figure 8. Consonance and dissonance of A-theme.

\[ \begin{array}{cccccc}
\hat{7} & \hat{4} & \hat{6} & \hat{5} & \hat{7} & \text{or} & \hat{5} & \hat{4} & \hat{6} & \hat{5} & \hat{7} \\
[b]: i & vii^67 & i & vii^7/iv & i & i & vii^7/iv
\end{array} \]

* The second interpretation reflects the vii^7 (beats 2 and 3, scale degrees 4 and 6) as dissonant with respect to the b pedal.

Though the surfaces of the A- and B-themes are quite different, their harmonic features bear a close resemblance (Fig. 9).

One significant difference is the approach to VI^5 (mm. 2-3 and 9). In the A-theme, the approach is by a pivot on (or reinterpretation of) a diminished seventh, which then resolves as a vii^67 - I (0 ct) on the level of VI. In the B-theme, the approach is by deceptive resolution of a diminished seventh (1 ct), or vii^67 - VI^6.

---

44This appoggiatura figure first appears in the left hand in mm. 5-6.
Figure 9. Harmonic correspondence of A- and B-themes.

A: | B (F*) B | D -- | G (D) G | C* -- | C* (F*) C* | F (B) F* | B

B: | F* | B F* | G | E C C* | F* | B

The B-theme dissipates into a half-cadence in mm. 12-13, and is followed by a third distinct texture. Though the one moving line is doubled in octaves, the impression is that of a more contrapuntal texture, especially compared with the previous arpeggiated A-theme and a capriccio B-theme.\(^{45}\) This phrase (mm. 13b-15) performs the following two functions: (1) It develops the falling second (Ex. 11) by placing three ascending sixteenth-note anacruses before it (denoted C-motive), and (2) it provides a rather abrupt modulation to the dominant minor.

Example 11. C-motive, Prelude, mm. 13-14.

This motive undergoes two modifications to bring about this modulation: (1) The final appoggiatura is changed from \(\hat{\hat{6}} - \hat{6}\) to \(\hat{7} - \hat{6}\). Accompanying the shift is a g\(^{\#7}\) (G\(^\#\) - B - D

---

\(^{45}\)When this texture returns (mm. 29b, ff.), the texture is definitely contrapuntal, and the three successive sequences use the motive of this phrase as a basis for the melodic material.
- F) and the appoggiatura creates the characteristic succession of half-diminished seventh to fully-diminished seventh. A further modification is made as the g\textsuperscript{#7} (E) is reinterpreted and renotated as a C\textsuperscript{#7}.

The A-theme returns (m. 16) in the key of the dominant. Though the goal of the phrase remains the same, that of local tonic, the path to the goal is characterized by several harmonic adjustments.\textsuperscript{46} Both phrases contain an antecedent and consequent sequence. The first sequence (mm. 1-4) features the upward minor third pivot on the diminished seventh chord ([b]: vii\textsuperscript{#7}/iv - VI\textsuperscript{6}). The restatement of the first sequence (mm. 16-19) is identical with transposition, with this one exception. The addition of a new bass note D transforms the expected b\textsuperscript{#67} into a D\textsuperscript{9}. (The spelling of the arpeggiation accommodates the new bass: f\textsuperscript{#} - a - c - e\textsuperscript{b}, rather than the expected b\textsuperscript{#} - d\textsuperscript{#} - f\textsuperscript{#} - a.) Note that D is 6 in f\textsuperscript{#}, and is yet another reference to this degree.

The restatement of the second sequence (mm. 5-6 and 20-21) is altered substantially, but only in the intervals of connection. The material is identical. Each leg is made up of two motives (Ex. 12). The first (denoted "a") is an

\textsuperscript{46}These two occurrences of the A-theme do not form a pair in the strictest sense of the definition since they are separated by the intervening B-theme. They do, however, offer an opportunity to compare two phrases that begin and end alike, but whose internal structure is different.
embellished V', and the second (denoted "b") consists of a three-note chromatically ascending bass line, harmonized

Example 12. Motive from Prelude, mm. 5.

\[ \text{Example 12} \]

in this fashion: major, diminished seventh, and diminished seventh. I have already discussed the first change of connection, the b\(^{##7}\) into a D\(^9\) or its equivalent, f\(^##7\). This first change results in a tritone difference (refer to the "difference" and "cumulative difference" rows in Fig. 10). At this interval of transposition the sequences begin. The connection between 'a' and 'b' is altered by a half-step. This alteration can be seen by comparing the perfect fourth of m. 5 with the augmented fourth of m. 21. The third adjustment occurs between the units of the sequence. Between m. 5 and 6, there is a vii\(^{##7}\) to I (0 ct) resolution (e\(^{##7}\) to F\(^7\), or generally, C\(^7\) to F\(^7\)). In the corresponding place (between m. 20 and 21), there is a vii\(^{##7}\) to V\(^7\) (3 ct) resolution (a\(^{##7}\) to A\(^7\), or generally, A to A). By the end of the second unit, we have returned to the original interval of transposition (upward perfect fifth). Indeed, the
Figure 10. Comparison of A-themes, Prelude, mm. 1-7 and 16-23.
downbeat of m. 22 could have been f', and the phrases would have ended similarly. Instead, a measure is added which provides a more final, more dramatic arrival on f' (m. 23). The expected f' of m. 22 is replaced by D6. This D6 is VI6 in the key of f#, and its arrival is by 1 ct, corresponding to the B-theme treatment of VI (mm. 9 and 25, see also Figure 9).

In comparing mm. 5-6 and 20-21, we raise several questions regarding enharmonic notation and its interpretation. Although the 'b' fragment is harmonized with the same succession enharmonically, it is written differently in m. 20 (Fig. 11a). Had the series been literally transposed (accounting for the half-step adjustment), it would have been as in Fig. 11b, with F# - F#7 - E7 imitated by Ab - A7 - G7. Again, close relationships to the primary key seem to be the determining factor. The Ab chord of m. 20 is spelled G - E - C. The notation of the pitch Ab as a G also saved an accidental on the following A. Similarly, a G7 is equivalent to the more readily recognizable A7.

Of greater significance is the question of interpretation of the functional chord roots. In m. 5, the F7 may have D# as its general root. However, since the root of the following chord is C (connecting it with the first chord of the measure) and since the previous chord is
F#, the context dictates that F# is the simplest interpretation. (Note a similar boundary shape as in m. 1:)

Figure 11. Comparison of notation, Prelude, mm. 5-6, 20-21.

- a. mm. 5-6: C7 F# f7 e7 | F7
  C F D C | F
  C F D C

- b. mm. 20-21: D7 A7 f7 a7 | A7
  D A7 D F | A
  D A7 F E | A
  A

- c. mm. 20-21: D7 A7 f7 a7 | A7
  D -------- A -----

the same harmony before and after a different one.) Against this interpretation, though, is the suggestion of ii - vii7/V (general root D#), which is aided by the incomplete lower neighbor D# (Fig. 11a, third line). A similar case exists in m. 20, but, because of the perfect fifth adjustment between m. 20 and 21, the context is different. Merely copying the relationships from m. 5 to m. 20, we have the series in Fig. 11b. Merely interpreting the chord roots directly from the notation of m. 20, we have the series of Figure 11a. The context, that is, the occurrence of an A sonority on the downbeat of m. 21, lends the simpler interpretation of m. 20 beat 4 as neither Eb, nor F#, but A (Fig. 11c).
As an aside, we must note that the surface relationships of this connection contradict this explanation of the $a^7$. The double neighbor notes (m. 21) $B^b$ (−$A$) and $F^*$ (−$G$) temporarily create the sound of an $F^*_5$, so perhaps the notation of m. 20 beat 4 as an $a^7$ relates to that. This neighbor note, as in the first occurrence in m. 5, creates the sound of a $III^6_F - V^7$, a linear succession with an outward resolving minor sixth.

Following the $VI^6$ of m. 22, a contrapuntally-determined succession (Ex. 13) of harmonies leads to the goal of tonic. As a result, the goals are relatively the same, and the parallel tonics (m. 7 and m. 23) are treated to the same arpeggiation and figuration. It is interesting to note that the larger arrival is on [v] and not [i], and that the arrival is linear (rather than harmonic), using an enharmonic $g^7$ as an augmented-sixth-type chord. (The generalized chord roots show a quite conventional progression: VI − IV − V − I.) Wegener misses the fact

Example 13. Cadence of $f^*$ A-theme, Prelude, mm. 22–23.
that the E* carries over to the fourth beat. Consequently, he reads the chord on the fourth beat as a c♯7 on which is superimposed the leading tone E* in the soprano.47

Finally, this passage illustrates two important aspects of Franck's technique: (1) It is often the connection between elements that affords the opportunity for adjustment. (2) The goal, often diatonic, is important as a controlling factor in determining the logic of the progression. With so many variables, almost any key would have been possible. Yet, through the maze of adjustments, Franck chose to maintain the original diatonic goal. Said another way, a chromatic surface may elaborate closely-related large-scale relationships.

Just as before, the B-theme follows immediately. Instead of a half cadence on C♯ (V in f♯), the parallel to m. 13, an abrupt downward step adjustment occurs at the fermata in m. 28. Had the B-theme been copied exactly (from m. 11-13), the half-cadence would have been on C♯ (V in f♯). Because of the adjustment, the key and all the harmonic relationships are shifted down by step, forming a half-cadence on B (V in e).

Parallel to m. 13b, the C-motive returns, now in e minor (m. 29b). At this point, Franck uses a common

47 Bernd Wegener, César Franck's Harmonik (Ph.D. dissertation, University of Köln, 1976; Regensberg: Bosse, 1976), 46.
eighteenth-century harmonic device, that of using the same material that initially modulates from tonic to dominant to modulate from subdominant to tonic later on (I to V equivalent to IV to I). Such is the case here, with $F^\#$ ([b]: $V^7$) arriving on beat 3 of m. 31. B as tonic is only weakly confirmed (mm. 31b-32), however, since the $F^\#$ dominant resolves to B through the mediant, D. An extension (compared to the corresponding place in m. 15) is formed by sequencing the 9-8 appoggiatura on $F^\#$, D, and B. Further, when B arrives, it is B dominant seventh, directing the tonality past b minor. Developing the C-motive, the contrapuntal texture becomes denser as the sequences elaborate dominant sevenths on E and G and six-four sonorities on Bb and $F^\#$. The final arrival is b minor tonic (mm. 40-41).

Let us now examine the sequential aspects of this section more closely. The return of the C-motive (m. 29, ff.) begins as a parallel to the earlier occurrence. From the outset, however, an imitative statement is added in the tenor voice. It is this contrapuntal element that becomes the motivating factor in the following three sequences. In

---

48One example may be cited: In the F major (8th) Invention of Bach, mm. 4-12 move from F to C and provide the cadence in the dominant. The same material is used at the end (mm. 26-34) to provide the return to tonic (Bb to F) and the final cadence.
fact, from this point (m. 30) to the end of this section (m. 40), the texture is quite contrapuntal, in contrast to the remainder of the Prelude. The first of the three sequences (mm. 31b-32, Ex. 14) is the first occurrence of an ea/mh type. (Note the initial soprano notes of each unit: G to F♯, E♭ to D, and C to B.) One reason for the adjusted external interval is the prominence of the tonic triad, 5 – 3 – 1 (F♯ – D – B) in the soprano. Another closely related reason is the importance of the origin (V) and goal (i). This interval cannot be divided into two intervals of the same size. A few modifications deserve note: (1) The bass line does not descend 6 – 3 – 1, but remains on 5 for the first two units (6 – 5 – 1). This modification avoids parallel octaves between the outer voices, and it creates a passing reference to the prominent D sonority we saw earlier.
and to the upward minor third pivot of the opening phrase.\(^49\) (2) The soprano line is also altered in one note (C\(^\#\) of m. 32) to allow a better connection.

Still based on the C-motive, the second sequence (mm. 33-34), an ee/mh type, exhibits an elaborated V\(^7\). The elaboration is an alternation of the V\(^7\) and the German sixth of the respective key (i.e., a dominant seventh a half-step higher). We will find this technique to be quite common in Franck's late works. Wegener discusses this passage,\(^50\) as well as the more general concept of Trugschluss (deceptive cadence).\(^51\) This generalized notion includes all chords where the bass note is a half-step above \(^\#\). (See also my discussion of the Prelude of the Prelude, Aria, and Finale.)

Combined with the C-phrase motive in the soprano, the bass contrapuntal elaboration becomes the means by which the modulation is effected (Ex. 15a). The half-step alternation (m. 33, beats 1 to 3) becomes a half-step line (mm. 33, beat 4), arriving on G, the bass of the second unit. This sequence (mm. 33-34) is also coupled with the following

\(^49\)The D sonorities occur as VI\(^6\) (m. 22), replacing the expected f\(^\#\) tonic, and as D\(^\#\) (m. 19), replacing the expected D\(^6\). The upward minor third pivot of the first measure results when d\(^#\) resolves to G\(^\#\); the pivot of mm. 31-32 results when F\(^\#\) dominant seventh resolves to bIII\(^6\). In both cases the actual goal is a minor third higher than expected.

\(^50\)Wegener, op. cit., 49.

\(^51\)Wegener, op. cit., 151, ff.
(i.e., the third) sequence (mm. 35-39a). The coupling of these two sequences is identified by the diatonic origin and goal and by the foreign intersection.

Example 15. Motivic means of modulation, Prelude, mm. 33-34, 35-37.

The third sequence (mm. 35-38, also an ee/mh type) expands the bass elaboration of the dominant pitch (1) by replacing the half-step goal (E - F) with a step goal (B - C), (2) by further elaborating the step goal with an intermediate half-step (B - B - C), and (3) by adding a lower step goal (B - A - A).\(^5\) Again the contrapuntal motion of the bass provides the means of modulation (Ex. 15b). The lower neighbor (A\(^b\), m. 36) becomes part of a descending line (A\(^b\) - G - F\(^#\)), whose goal is the bass note of the following unit (B in second inversion). Whereas the second sequence rises by two minor thirds, the third sequence descends by two major thirds, thus effecting a

\(^5\text{A less plausible explanation of the bass line is given by Sievers, who relates it to the B - A - C - H motive. Sievers, op. cit., 210.}\)
cumulative downward step motion (E of m. 33 to D of m. 39).

It is interesting to note that the falling second (derived from the opening A-theme), and specifically the $b_6 - \frac{5}{4}$ form of it, is present in two important ways. (1) First, as I have already noted, it develops from a single falling second (as in the end of the B-theme, mm. 27-28), to the elaborated version with the three-sixteenth-note anacrusis (mm. 29b-30). Throughout the section, this motive often places the falling second on $b_6 - \frac{5}{4}$ (e.g., m. 30, m. 31 beat 3, m. 36 beat 4, m. 38 beat 4). Franck uses many permutations of this motive (Ex. 16a) to form the melodic basis of the entire section (mm. 29b-40). Modifications include the elaboration of the falling second (Ex. 16b, e, h), the alteration of the connection between the second and its anacrusis (Ex. 16c, d, e, g, h, i, j), and the replacing

Example 16. Derivations of C-motive.
of the second (Ex. 16f). (2) The second and third sequences consist of an elaboration of the dominant pitch in the bass. In the second, the elaboration takes the form of \( \hat{5} - b_6 - \hat{5} \) (mm. 33-34) with the harmonic support of dominant seventh and German sixth. In the third, the elaboration is extended \( \hat{5} - \hat{6} - \hat{5} - \hat{7} - \hat{5} \), with chromatic passing tones, and the harmonic support is tonic six-four.

At the cadence point, the arpeggiated texture of the A-theme returns. The "thumb melody" (m. 42, ff.) is not the A-theme, but is derived from it (Ex. 17).53 This final section displays a marked absence of sequence; yet another associative device, that of pairing, takes its place as a significant melodic and harmonic determinant. Opening with a G\(^6\) ([b]: VI\(^6\)) rather than a b minor tonic, the A-related motive concludes its first unit with an f\(^\flat\) in the soprano.

---

53 Note that the earlier occurrence (Ex. 10) features a movement away from \( \hat{5} \) (to \( \hat{7} \) or \( \hat{6} \)), and this occurrence reverses this motion, \( \hat{5} \) to \( \hat{6} \).
harmonized by a b minor tonic chord (m. 43). The second unit of the pair concludes with the f\# enharmonically written as a G\#b, and accompanied by an e\# minor chord in second inversion (Ex. 18). This new harmonic element is the musical focus of the pair. The logic of this progression can be explained on several grounds, each of which illustrates a facet of Franck’s harmonic style: (1) **Melodic basis.** Regardless of the harmonic succession, the two chords are connected by the same melodic pattern with a reharmonization of the final note. (2) **Voice leading basis.** Again, regardless of successive root relationships, all voices move smoothly and logically—by half-step. (3) **Root relationship basis.** This progression is equivalent to I – bvi, a harmonic device used by Franck with particular effectiveness. Mason comments generally on Franck’s avoidance of the expected: "His pages are studded with departures and evasions; he delights in going some other way than we expect or in writing chords that do not give us even any basis of expectation."\(^{54}\)

The return to b is both harmonically and melodically motivated. The e\# minor chord leads to c, which, in turn, is subjected to the following quality changes (m. 46): half-diminished, dominant with minor ninth, major. This

last quality is then treated as the Neapolitan sixth, resolving to tonic six-four. In addition, the melody of the Example 18. Harmonic reduction, Prelude, mm. 42-45.

previous pair is used to direct the melodic line back to b. Observing the chord roots (Fig. 12), we can see a conventional harmonic progression, with a half-step alteration of IV ($E_b$ rather than $E$) and of II (C rather than $C^\#$).

Figure 12. Large-scale progression, Prelude, mm. 43-47.

The cadence is avoided at mm. 47-48 because the dominant (m. 47) does not resolve to tonic but to the 1 ct-related diminished seventh chord (m. 48). This chord, $e^{b7}$, resolves as an appoggiatura chord to B major tonic in m. 48.

Following this avoided cadence, a second pair begins. Using the same $\flat$ to $\sharp$ motion (as in m. 42), this pair shifts
the mode to B major. Thus, the initial melodic note is not G (as in m. 42) but G♯, and the harmony is not G♭ but e♭⁷.

As before, the units are two measures in length (mm. 48-49 and 50-51), and the corresponding first measures are identical except for arpeggiation and spelling changes that reflect the new goal. Also as before, it is the final chord that is varied: B (m. 49), with F♯ in the soprano, becomes D♯₃ (m. 51), with F♮ in the soprano (Ex. 19). On the

Example 19. Harmonic reduction, Prelude, mm. 48-51.

large level the two pairs form a pair with some sort of D♯/E♭ sonority as the variable element (Fig. 13).

Figure 13. Pair of pairs, Prelude, mm. 42-51.

The avoided cadence (mm. 47-48) offers us an opportunity to consider how a contrapuntal element becomes
harmonic in a different context. The diminished seventh chord in m. 48 (Ex. 20) is clearly an embellishing one (1st resolution to B tonic). When the chord reappears in m. 50, it is spelled as a $c^{\#7}$ (general root of $A^\#$), and it

Example 20. Prelude, mm. 47-51a.
functions in a harmonic manner, that of downward fifth to the following dominant, D#. This last D# dominant seventh temporarily establishes g minor as the tonic. The melodic idea (mm. 52-53) emphasizes two aspects seen earlier: (1) the falling half-step motive (D# - E - D#), a prominent aspect of the A-theme, the B-theme, and the repeated C-motive, and (2) the scale degrees 5 and b6. This g# minor region, though distantly related to the original tonic, is the dynamic climax of the movement. The tonality of b returns abruptly through the modal change of the E chord of m. 54: E major ([g#]: VI) becomes e minor ([b]: iv), which functions as the subdominant of the returning key of b minor. The brevity of the subdominant chord (only an eighth-note value) and the relatively forceful and extended emphasis of g# both contribute to the sense of abruptness with which the Prelude ends. This sudden ending coupled with the B dominant seventh that immediately follows the b tonic necessitates the following movement.

The principle of conventional progression with chromatic alteration is present in this concluding phrase, as well. The basic progression is I - VI - IV - I. The

---

55Interestingly enough, this occurrence of the falling step motive features the actual pitches of the head of the fugue subject, but in a different key!
submediant is modified (1) by borrowing the major mode submediant (g\textsuperscript{*})\textsuperscript{56} and (2) by extending it as a local tonality.

The large key relationships reflect closely-related keys, that of tonic and dominant. Remote relationships exist as transitory tonics in the sequential section of m. 33-39 and as the prominent g\textsuperscript{*} area of m. 51-54a. It is interesting to note how Franck "smooths" the path to these remote regions. I have already noted how, in the sequential section, the bass line adds a linear connection between the major- and minor-third related key areas. The g\textsuperscript{*} minor phrase exhibits a referentially remote relationship (b to g\textsuperscript{*}). But if the relationships are measured successively, they are all close, even diatonic, since b minor becomes B major (mm. 48-49) before moving to g\textsuperscript{*} minor. This relationship is, then, the diatonic vi (B to g\textsuperscript{*}). The return, as noted before, also makes use of a modal shift, though of shorter duration.

Finally, it is important to recall the emphases of the Prelude. (1) We have seen the descending second, its transformation of dissonance placement, and its use in the A-theme, the B-theme, the C-motive, and the final b and g\textsuperscript{*}

\textsuperscript{56}This alteration is similar to that given the subdominant in the previous phrase, except there the half-step adjustment was downward (E to E\textsuperscript{b} versus G to G\textsuperscript{*}).
areas. Dommel-Dièny notes that this motive attracts more and more attention to itself as the Prelude progresses.\(^{57}\)

(2) The submediant in first inversion is brought to our attention early (m. 3) as the first change of expectation. It continues in this role in both prominent (mm. 19, 22a, 42, 44) and less prominent places (mm. 9, 10, 12, 25, 26, 28). (3) A third emphasis regards the focus on D\(^{b}\) or its equivalent E\(^{b}\). It occurs as pivot (m. 2), as the fugue subject precursor (mm. 11b-12), and as the foreign midpoint of a coupled sequence (m. 35). In addition, the emphasis intensifies as the Prelude nears the close, with occurrences as the two focus points of the two paired phrases (mm. 42-45 and 48-51) and as the prominent melodic pitch of the g\(^{#}\) area. Also, the final cadence chord (containing D) is quickly replaced by a B dominant seventh chord (containing D\(^{b}\)). All of these significant statements point forward to the key of the Chorale, E\(^{b}\).

**Chorale**

The Chorale exhibits many features suggested by its title: (1) a prevailing harmonic rhythm of one beat, (2) a prominent melody in the upper voice, and (3) a regular phrase structure with periodic melodic and harmonic cadence.

\(^{57}\)Dommel-Dièny, *op. cit.*, 26.
points (Fig. 14). The melody of the opening a-phrase, marked cantabile, is quite singable, and it moves mostly conjunctly and sequentially to reach its harmonic goal of $V$ (m. 62).

The chorale theme itself does not appear until the third phrase (c), in which it is stated twice, and it appears three times throughout the chorale, in c minor, f minor, and e♭ minor. The three statements are separated by other material, some of which reoccurs. The b-phrase performs a modulation to c minor and prepares for the first chorale statement. Following the c minor chorale statement,
a fourth phrase (d) provides a harmonic arrival on c. A fifth phrase (e) modulates to F and prepares for the f minor chorale statement. A different subsequent phrase (f) performs a similar structural function as the d-phrase, that of providing a harmonic arrival. The successive phrases g, h and i/b are transitional, modulating to E♭. The i/b phrase prepares for the final chorale statement in e♭ minor. Following this statement, both previously stated subsequent phrases (d and f) are used to provide the harmonic climax.

The first two phrases (a and b) are structurally introductory in function, if not in character. The fact that the main Chorale theme does not enter until the third phrase led Mohr, in his thematic catalog, to incorrectly cite this phrase (mm. 68b-70) as the incipit of the second movement, and, correspondingly, to give the length of the Prelude as 68 measures. Demuth describes this alternation as a "theme and interlude" structure. The Chorale theme (c-phrase) bears a close resemblance to the bell theme of Parsifal (Ex. 21), as both d'Indy and Vallas

---


have noted. The melody of descending fourths (♯-♭-♯-♯) is coupled with a descending octave in the bass. The extreme compass of this theme—the left hand not only plays the bass in octaves but also reaches over to play a doubling of the melody note—contributes to its forcefulness. In all three occurrences of the c-phrase, the "left-hand over" texture continues into the following phrase to add strength to the cadence. Following the first two occurrences of the c-phrase, a different consequent phrase is used (d and f, respectively) to bring about a cadence, with the second (f) being the stronger. Following the third and final statement of c (mm. 103b-107), both d and f follow in order to make the final cadence the climax.

Example 21. Comparison of Chorale theme (a) and bell motive (b) from Parsifal (Act 1), by Richard Wagner.

---

Sievers notes that the combination of the chorale theme (c) with its consequent (d or f) creates a Bar form (AAB) with two Stollen and an Abgesang.61 Thematically this is correct, since the c-phrase is comprised of two identical halves. On the other hand, the structural weight (in terms of length) of the Abgesang is equal to the combined statement of the Stollen (four measures each), thus forming a two-part structure (AB). Sievers is incorrect to call the final f-phrase an "epilog," apparently failing to see the utilization of two different (but previously stated) Abgesânge at the close of the Chorale.62

Several salient features of the Chorale deserve specific attention: (1) the cadence types, (2) the role of the diminished seventh, and (3) the extensive use of sequence.

First, let us consider the cadence types. In this aspect, the Chorale diverges significantly from the outer movements. There is a relative scarcity of the dominant-tonic (V - i) cadences that abound in the other movements. It is that the type of cadence is different. That does not necessarily mean "weakened," for many of these cadences have a strength and forcefulness comparable to any V - i cadence of the other movements.

61Sievers, op. cit., 211.
62Sievers, op. cit., 211.
The thirteen phrases and their corresponding cadence types are listed in Figure 15. Note first of all that there are no V-I cadences in the primary key of E♭. Two V-I cadences occur in secondary key areas (a and e, mm. 61-62 and 80-81). The key areas of both are arrived at abruptly and only one (that of the e-phrase) continues past the cadence.

![Figure 15. Cadence types of the Chorale.](image)

The d-phrase employs the evaded cadence, proceeding from V⁷ (with a flattened fifth) to iv⁶ (a consequence of the sequence). The melodic close (to ̂1) coincides with the iv⁶ (mm. 72b-76).

A linear close is employed to conclude the c-phrase (main Chorale theme). The bass descends by step from tonic to tonic. The final ̂3 - ̂2 - ̂1 in the bass coupled with the ̂5 - ̂1 in the soprano comprises this linear cadence (see Ex. 21a).
Of particular interest is the inverted leading tone cadence ($\text{vii}^6_7 - i$). It is significant because of its numerous occurrences (five) and because of its diverse placement (first, second, and third inversions) in the context of three different phrases.

1. The $\text{vii}^6_5 - i$ cadence occurs only in the g-phrase, and is a result of the sequence (mm. 90-93).

2. The $\text{vii}^6_4 - i$ cadence uses a dominant function sonority that has several characteristics of a subdominant. Three of its pitches ($\hat{2}$, $\hat{4}$, and $\hat{6}$) are common in subdominant type chords and $\hat{4}$ is the bass note. If we look at the end of a b-phrase (Ex. 22, m. 67), we can see that

Example 22. Chorale, mm. 66-68a.

\begin{figure}
\centering
\includegraphics{chorale}\caption{Example 22. Chorale, mm. 66-68a.}
\end{figure}

the subdominant harmony is prolonged through beats 2, 3, and 4. On beat 4, however, the $\hat{1}$ becomes $\hat{7}$, thus turning the iv into a $\text{vii}^6_7$. It is this prolongation combined with the half-step alteration that prompts Benward to rewrite the B
as a C♭ and to classify beat 4 as a iv♭Ⅶ. Dommel-Diény arrives at the same conclusion, but on different grounds. For her, the C, as a dissonant fourth of the c♯, is prolonged throughout m. 67 and is embellished by (but does not resolve to) the B♭ on beat 4. The C then resolves directly into the tonic chord of m. 68.

. . . the C, the fourth, adopted like a real chord-tone by the accompaniment of the S.D. [subdominant], escapes the obligation of its resolution; it integrates itself into the pedal, do; the B♭ is only an embellishing ornament without relationship to the dominant function which does not exist here.63

As an aside, it is interesting to note that the various editions of this piece differ in this measure. In the original published edition (Enoch, 1885), the C on beats 2 and 3 (shown in Ex. 22) is a C♭. As a result, the quality of the beat-2 iv♭Ⅶ is half-diminished seventh. Even so, the chord may be viewed as a b♭7 with a prolonged half-step.

63Bruce Benward, Music in Theory and Practice, rev. ed., 2 vols. (Dubuque, Iowa: W.C. Brown, 1982), 217. The question as to whether E♭ or F is the chord tone on beat 4 also bears upon this. While I do not agree with his analysis, I can see his point, that the aural impression is that of a further flattened subdominant.

64Dommel-Diény, op. cit., 29-30. She also labels the iv♭Ⅵ as a VI. (It must be said that Dommel-Diény's use of the Roman numerals, though not extensive, seems to denote bass notes, rather than chord roots. With regard to this, see the analyses on pp. 31, 69, 71, and 88.)
implied appoggiatura (E\textsuperscript{b} - D). The c\textsuperscript{6}, upon which Dommel-Dièny places so much importance, is even more a passing chord, C\textsuperscript{b} - E\textsuperscript{b} - G. The C\textsuperscript{b} in measure 67 is more consistent, because the parallel b-phrase (in e\textsuperscript{b} minor) contains B\textsuperscript{bb} in the corresponding place (m. 102).

(3) The vii\textsuperscript{6} - i cadence which concludes the f-phrase follows a German sixth (mm. 88-89, Ex. 23). It is this German sixth that is the climax of the phrase and the goal of the preceding sequence.\textsuperscript{65} The German sixth, equivalent to a dominant seventh sonority built on b\textsuperscript{6}, then resolves with 1 ct to a diminished seventh chord. The common tone is the b\textsuperscript{6} in the bass, and the resultant diminished chord is vii\textsuperscript{6}. Note that the generalized Roman numerals reveal a conventional progression (II - V - I). The effect of this progression is to make the German sixth the focal point, and to give it the strongest sense of arrival, and in so doing, to de-emphasize the dominant function and to lessen the strength of the tonic arrival. The dynamic markings of both m. 88 and m. 114 confirm this. Franck gives this cadence type, with its pitch and sonority emphases, further importance by using it for the final cadence of the Chorale.

\textsuperscript{65}The German sixth is extended by a Neapolitan six-four, and, for voice leading considerations, is spelled as a dominant seventh built on b\textsuperscript{6}. (b\textsuperscript{5} resolves to 1 in both the Neapolitan six-four and in the vii\textsuperscript{6}.)}
It is interesting to note that this cadence, with the German sixth and tonic in close proximity, recalls the opening German sixth to tonic (mm. 57-58).\(^{66}\) In particular, the final German sixth, as a C\(^b\) dominant seventh chord, is a prominent reference to B, the key of the Prelude and of the Fugue.

Example 23. Chorale, mm. 87-89.

\[\text{\copyright 1922 Oliver Ditson Company Used by Permission}\]

The diminished seventh chord occupies a prominent place in the harmonic features of the Chorale. We have already seen the inverted leading tone cadences. In addition, the diminished seventh often serves as a pivot, thereby allowing a sequence (especially an ee/mh type) to remain in the key. Such is the case in the d-phrase (m. 74, beat 4) where the d\(^{7}\) chord (relating to the local tonality

\(^{66}\)Wegener notes the mediant relationship of the B dominant seventh with the opening E\(^b\), but apparently misses the fact that B\(^7\) is equivalent to the German sixth of E\(^b\). (He does, however, note that the seventh of the B\(^7\) acts as a leading tone.) Wegener, \textit{op. cit.}, 45.
of B♭), is resolved as a b⁷ into m. 75 (or generally, B♭ = G), returning the tonality to c minor. A similar downward minor third pivot performs the modulation from E♭ to c in m. 63. An upward minor third pivot occurs in the f-phrase (mm. 86-89), in which b♭ ([f]: iv) is followed by an a⁷. This a⁷ has as its resolution, D♭⁷, which means the a⁷ was resolved as a c⁷ (or generally, F = A♭ - D♭). Note that Franck uses both the upward and downward minor third pivot but not tritone pivot.

I have already mentioned the 1 ct and the 3 ct relationships of the diminished seventh chord to the dominant seventh. Prominent occurrences of this pair include the following: (1) The a-phrase sequence (m. 60) resolves the diminished seventh to a dominant seventh with 1 ct (see Ex. 26). There the underlying harmonic motion is that of upward minor second, V - bVI (B♭ - C♭ and D♭ - E♭♭).

(2) The f-phrase resolves a dominant seventh to a diminished seventh (the German sixth to vii§) with 1 ct (m. 114). Note that both occurrences use the same two chords, with the opening phrase moving away from tonic (to C♭) and with the closing phrase moving toward tonic (to d⁷). Correspondingly, the harmonic underlay is reversed, bVI - V (C♭ - B♭). The double meaning of the German sixth, however,

---

67Other occurrences of this progression can be found in m. 88 (in f minor) and in the i-phrase of mm. 96-97.
lends another equally functional interpretation, that of II - V (F - Bb).\footnote{\textsuperscript{68}}

The a-phrase (m. 60) also illustrates one other context in which the diminished seventh chord is often placed. There, the root is delayed by a suspension. This suspension causes a certain ambiguity in perception. Is the sonority (in m. 60, beat 2) an $f^7$ or a $d^7$? If the seventh of the articulated half-diminished chord resolves down by a half-step (Ex. 24a), a diminished seventh chord is formed; if it resolves down by whole step, a dominant seventh chord is formed (Ex. 24b). The former occurs in mm. 60 and 63; the latter, in m. 59.

Example 24. Resolution of half-diminished seventh chord.

\begin{center}
\begin{tikzpicture}
\end{tikzpicture}
\end{center}

The sequences of the Chorale perform the following important functions: (1) They are the means by which thematic ideas are constructed. (2) They perform connections and modulations. (3) They give linear and harmonic direction to important goals. In fact, the whole

\footnote{We recall that eighteenth-century theorists, Sechter for instance, perceived the German sixth chord as having a double function. See Chapter 2, especially Ex. 8 and footnote 36.}
character of the Chorale depends on this device, since every phrase contains at least one.

The opening a-phrase (mm. 58-62) contains two sequences, the first of which is an ee/m type (Ex. 25). Since only the melody is sequenced, the harmony is made to stay in E♭. As in the opening of the Prelude, there is a divergence of melodic and harmonic patterns. A literal imitation of harmonic roots would place the series C♭ - A♭ - E♭ - G♭ in m. 59. An imitation of the quality-specific

Example 25. Chorale, mm. 58-59.

b. m. 58

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>E♭</th>
<th>C</th>
<th>G</th>
<th>d♭7</th>
<th>C♭</th>
<th>B♭</th>
<th>E♭</th>
<th>B♭</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I</td>
<td>vi</td>
<td>iii</td>
<td>vii♭7</td>
<td>bVI</td>
<td>Aug♭</td>
<td>I♭</td>
<td>V♭</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I</td>
<td>VI</td>
<td>III</td>
<td>V</td>
<td>bVI = II (I)</td>
<td>V</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Chords would be the series C♭ - a♭ - e♭ - b♭7. Note how the 3 - 2 - 1 melodic succession of m. 58 becomes, not 3 - 2 - 1

---

99Sievers incorrectly reads beat 2 of m. 59 as an f♭7 (his notation: B♭ø). Sievers, op. cit., 211.
of a local key area of Cb, but 1 - b7 - h6 in the primary key of Eb.

Significantly, the two legs are connected by a 1 ct resolution of a diminished seventh to a major triad (d°7 to Cb). As I have noted already, both of these sonorities are prominent throughout the Chorale.

The following sequence (mm. 60-61a) may be classified as a consequent only because of its adjacent position—there is no foreign intersection. (It is, in fact, Eb tonic.) This second sequence (Ex. 26) heightens the emphasis on the 1 ct resolution (this time to a dominant seventh), since each of the two units is comprised solely of this progression.


a.

b. m. 60

\[
\begin{array}{cccccccc}
\text{Eb} & \text{d}^\text{b}_7 & \text{C}^\text{b}_7 & \text{f}^\text{b}_7 & | & \text{D}^7 & \text{G}^7 & \text{B}^\text{b}_7 & \text{F}^7 & | & \text{Eb} \\
\text{I} & \text{vii}^\text{b}_7 & \text{V} & \text{vii}^\text{b}_7 & | & [\text{V}]: & \text{Aug}^6 & \text{V} & --- & | & \text{I} \\
\text{I} & \text{V} & \text{bVI} & | & [\text{V}]: & \text{III} & \text{II} & \text{V} & --- & | & \text{I} \\
\text{Eb} & \text{B}^\text{b} & \text{C} & \text{B}^\text{b} & & & & & & & & \\
\text{D}^\text{b} & | & \text{D} & \text{C} & \text{F} & --- & | & \text{Eb} \\
\end{array}
\]
In addition, the interval of sequence is a minor third (motivated by the leap from the third to the fifth of the dominant seventh), so each diminished seventh chord is enharmonically the same one. The dominant sevenths in each unit are C^b and E^bb, respectively. Interestingly enough, this E^bb dominant seventh is notated as an augmented sixth (E^bb - G^b - B^bb - C rather than E^bb - G^b - B^b - D^bb). This notation causes Sievers to regard the root of this chord as A^b (his notation: A^{bb^5}) , and to ignore the parallelism to the first unit of the sequence.\(^70\)

Note also that at the point where the sequence breaks, Franck places another dominant seventh (G^b) which is reinterpreted as a German sixth of B^b. This dominant seventh is one half-step higher than the expected one would have been had the pattern continued (C^b - E^bb/D - F, Fig. 16).

Figure 16. Sequence, Chorale, mm. 60-61.

\[
\begin{array}{ccc}
\text{d}^g7 & = & \text{f}^g7 \\
B^o & C^b & D \\
\text{continuation} & \left[ \begin{array}{c}
\text{a}^g7 \\
F^b & F \\
\text{G}^b = C & F & B^b \\
\text{actual} &
\end{array} \right]
\end{array}
\]

This asymmetry can be related to the ea sequence type with adjusted external intervals (particularly thirds).

\(^70\text{Ibid.}, 211.\)
Also this asymmetry, necessary to achieve the local goal of B♭, illustrates that the goal is of higher importance than the exactness of the pattern. This sequence also illustrates the principle that foreign harmonies or tonalities may serve as intermediaries to a relatively closely-related goal. This sort of technique creates the effect of foreground surprise and "freshness" while maintaining the large-scale diatonic continuity.

In contrast to the ee/m and e-/mh sequences of the first two phrases stands the aa/mh sequence of the Chorale theme (c-phrase, mm. 68b-72). The former types, because of the exactness of their external intervals, almost always contain chromaticism with respect to the local tonic. (Sequences that are of the ea and aa/m types may often be chromatic as well.) On the other hand, when both melody and harmony are involved, and when the intervals are adjusted diatonically, then an absence of chromaticism occurs. Such is the case when the c-phrase enters, with its melodic descending fourths and its bass octave descent.

Several sequences of the Chorale have certain elements in common. Belonging to the d-, f-, and h-phrases, these sequences all employ the melodic rhythm shown in Figure 17.

---

71 Not all aa/mh types fit this description, only those whose intervals are adjusted diatonically, i.e., for the purpose of remaining in the key.
They all employ the downward major second as their external interval. The d- and f-phrases follow each occurrence of the Chorale theme (first singly, then both together--refer to Fig. 14), and they are important in setting up points of arrival.

Figure 17. Rhythm of d-, f-, and h-sequences.

\[ \begin{aligned}
    &\quad \\
    &\quad \\
\end{aligned} \]

The d-phrase presents an interesting cross-relation of melodic accent and harmonic support. Due, in part, to the preceding c-phrase, which was metrically offset, the leap of a third (mm. 72b-73a) is perceived as connecting strong to weak beats, leaving the repeated beat (beat 2) as a second strong beat. On the other hand, the harmonic motion is prolonging a d\(^7\) (from beats 1 to 3) with a passing six-four on beat 2. As a result, the melody emphasizes 4 and 2 as strong beats while the harmony emphasizes 4 and 1 (Fig. 18a). An alternate interpretation of the harmonic support (and one that would correlate to rather than contradict the melodic accent) would be to view the six-four sonority as the primary one (Fig. 18b) with the half-diminished seventh
as embellishing (through upper and lower neighbor notes in the bass). This interpretation is also reinforced by the e\textsuperscript{7} chord on beat 4 of m. 73. Viewing the underlying harmony as an e\textsuperscript{7} to an elaborated b\textsubscript{b}\textsuperscript{4} makes the functional progression to be: \([b^b]: \text{vii}^0/\text{V} - i_4\]. (Whether the six-four is considered to be a tonic or a double suspension on the dominant, in any case, the V\textsubscript{3}--F A C--is not present.)

Figure 18. Cross-relation of melodic and harmonic accent, Chorale, mm. 72b-73.

\begin{center}
\begin{tabular}{ll}
\textbf{a. melody} & \textbf{b. melody} \\
\textbf{harmony} & \\
\end{tabular}
\end{center}

The six-four sonorities (beginning in m. 73) are c minor, and b\textsuperscript{b} minor, and a third leg (m. 75) would have been an embellished a\textsuperscript{b} minor triad (six-four on beat 2, b\textsuperscript{b}\textsuperscript{4} on beat 1). However, an upward minor third pivot allows the goal to be c\textsuperscript{6} rather than a\textsuperscript{b}, thus maintaining the tonality of c minor. To do this, the d\textsuperscript{7} is resolved as a b\textsuperscript{b}\textsuperscript{7}. (Note that both C\textsuperscript{b}--indicating the chord's preparation--and
B--indicating its resolution--are present in the chord.) To conclude the d-phrase, another sequence (aa/mh) follows, which leads directly to the avoided cadence.

The sequence of the f-phrase (mm. 85b-89 and 111b-115) is a aa/m type with modification. The large-scale harmonic pattern is not repeated, but both melody and bass are diatonically sequenced in contrary motion. The linear progression of the bass gives a very directed motion to the German sixth (spelled as bVIb7) which is the goal and breaking point of the sequence (m. 88, beat 1). At the point where the sequence breaks, there is an upward minor third pivot on the diminished seventh chord. The a9 (m. 87) is followed, not by bb, but by Db7.72 Ascending by step each measure, the soprano breaks the pattern at the F (m. 88). Also sequenced by step, the bass proceeds linearly on the local level, as well. The large-scale stepwise line (F - Eb - Db) provides the framework for a third diminution in each measure. Consequently, the goal of Db is approached linearly on the local level, as well.

Notice that this sequence also makes use of a passing chord, in a manner similar to the d-phrase. Here, it is not a six-four but rather a five-three that connects two beats of the same chord. Unlike the d-phrase, the passing chord

72Note also a rather prominent occurrence of the 97 to 07 succession (m. 87).
is on beat 3. As a result, it appears, at first glance, that the harmonic progression reinforces the displaced metric pattern which was set up by the previous Chorale theme (Fig. 19a) with emphasis on beats 4 and 2. There is actually another displacement that occurs here. Because the downbeat note is dissonant with respect to the rest of the chord, it takes on the character of an appoggiatura. The harmony, then, of beats 2, 3, and 4 (with the passing chord on beat 3) actually begins on beat 1 (Fig. 19b).

Figure 19. Correspondence of melodic and harmonic accent, Chorale, mm. 85b-86.

When this sequence is repeated as the concluding phrase of the movement (mm. 111b-115), an interesting voice exchange takes place. The alto-tenor of mm. 86-87 (extracted in Ex. 27) becomes the bass of mm. 112-113; and the bass of mm. 86-87 becomes the alto-tenor of mm. 112-113. As a direct consequence of this exchange, the goal bass note
(which is the climax of the phrase and of the movement) is approached by a leap of a downward perfect fourth, thus giving it an even greater sense of arrival than the linear approach of m. 87.\textsuperscript{73} This descending fourth is related to the general subdominant to tonic progression found in the cadences of this movement.

Example 27. Voice exchange, Chorale, mm. 86-87 and 112-113.

Similarly to the f-phrase, the h-phrase (mm. 93b-97) also arrives on a German sixth from a diminished seventh (Fig. 20). Its arrival (m. 96), however, is less dramatic because the resolution of the diminished seventh is by 3 ct (the same general root) rather than by 0 ct (down by fifth). The harmony following the German sixth is, like before, vii\textsuperscript{67} (a 1 ct, or II - V approach). It is this h-phrase sequence that re-establishes the tonality of E\textsuperscript{b} for the first time since the opening phrase. This sequence also

\textsuperscript{73}There is still a slight degree of linearity in the approach. Considering the lowest note of the diminution and not the note being prolonged, we find the succession of E\textsuperscript{b} - D\textsuperscript{b} - C\textsuperscript{b}. 
makes use of the 1 ct (or V - bVI) resolution of the diminished seventh. In the first leg (mm. 93b-94), the diminished seventh resolves not to f, but to D♭ in first inversion. In fact, with the appoggiatura on beat 1, a 2 ct resolution occurs on the surface. The appoggiatura creates the expectation that the diminished seventh will resolve to its tonic (0 ct, or V - I). But only one of the voices resolves, thereby creating the 1 ct (V - bVI) relationship. (Notice also another interesting harmonic pattern: Whereas the first two diminished sevenths resolve to a bVI, the third one resolves as a bVI.)

Figure 20. Chord roots, h-phrase, Chorale, mm. 93b-96.

Two quite different sequential techniques can be observed in the g-phrase (Ex. 28, mm. 89b, ff.). The first technique is that of "sequential ascent." As well as providing a linear balance to the descent of the Chorale theme (c-phrase) and of all the other prominent sequences,

---

74The two common tones are present only if the full diminished seventh is assumed. The note of the appoggiatura is missing from the preceding diminished seventh.
this sequence provides a harmonic connection from f minor to c minor, with an intermediate goal of g minor. That this passage is derived from the chromatically ascending bass line can be verified by examining the juxtaposition of g with G\textsuperscript{b6} (m. 91). The logic of this connection is based primarily on the single common tone B, and, to a lesser extent, on the perfect fourth relationship with the first leg. Sequential ascents often make use of the diminished seventh chord (as this one does). This sequence also exhibits one feature that is characteristic of Franck's longer sequences, and that is sequence nesting. Notice that within each leg, there is a smaller ee/mh sequence of a half-note duration. Also, it is common to have one or more non-sequential elements placed before or after (as here) the

Example 28. Sequential nesting and ascent, Chorale, mm. 89b-93.

© 1922 Oliver Ditson Company
Used by Permission

smaller sequence to complete the leg of the larger sequence. Often these elements provide some degree of
tonal arrival. Notice another occurrence of the pedal on \( \frac{3}{4} \) (mm. 91 and 93).

There is little recurrence of motivic ideas from the Prelude. An articulated suspension (mm. 58 and 59) gives a hint of the falling second that forms the basis of the basis of the fugue subject. The Prelude C-motive also appears singly (mm. 62-63), and its relationship to other motives is discernible (Ex. 29).

Example 29. Relationship between motives from Prelude and Chorale.

![Example 29](image)

Within the Chorale itself, there is little development of material. This stands in contrast to the construction of the Prelude, in which we observed the following: (1) the growth of the falling second motive, (2) the use of pairing to vary one element of a repeated idea, and (3) the internal reworking of a subsequent thematic statement. Practically the only change in material of the Chorale is that of key area, and even then, the connections are performed by different phrases (thus offering little opportunity for comparing any similar material).

The key relationships are all close when measured successively. Though the final e\(^b\) minor is remotely related...
to c minor and f minor, the path to it leads through E\textsuperscript{b} major (mm. 98-100), a closely related key, followed by a modal shift (mm. 101-102). The perception of successive key relationships is often complicated by an intervening passage of tonal instability. Such is the case here between f minor and e\textsuperscript{b} minor. Following the f minor cadence of m. 89, a sequential ascent (Ex. 28) completely obscures f minor, and weakly tonicizes g minor and c minor. In m. 96 the tonality of E\textsuperscript{b} arrives, but even there the 1\text{st} relationship between C\textsuperscript{b}\textsuperscript{7} and d\textsuperscript{57} could imply many keys. Only in m. 98 is E\textsuperscript{b} major heard (in six-four position), and by that point the closeness to f minor may be considered only a large-scale and not a surface relationship.

To summarize the features of the Chorale, we find a regular phrase structure with clearly defined cadences, though often not the V-I variety. The use of sequence in all the many forms creates a sense of harmonic and linear direction to most phrases. The diminished seventh chord is used in cadential formulas, in conjunction with minor third pivots, and with 3\text{rd} and 1\text{st} resolutions and preparations.

**Link**

The cyclic nature of this work is strengthened further by the "link," a 41-measure segment that connects the Chorale to the Fugue. Considerably more extensive than the
single chord connecting the Prelude to the Chorale, the link performs several functions that weld the Chorale and Fugue together: (1) It performs a change of tempo and texture; (2) it provides an area of harmonic and tonal instability; (3) it performs a modulation from e\textsuperscript{b} to b; and (4) it provides a harmonic goal of a dominant pedal. Each aspect of the link will be discussed in turn.

(1) The link begins with a statement of the fugue subject with a harmonic accompaniment characteristic of the Chorale. Upon completion of this first subject, a motive appears (Ex. 30) that is used subsequently as the texture becomes more active and as the harmonic direction begins to point to the dominant pedal. Following the second fugue subject statement, an accompanimental rhythm of eighth-note triplets enters (m. 129). When the composite rhythm changes to eighth notes (m. 143), the tempo indication is molto vivo. The resultant effect is of a further quickening of the pace (i.e., the eighth notes of m. 143 are equal to sixteenths, or less, in the tempo of m. 129).

(2) Tonal instability is caused by rapidly changing key areas. Harmonic instability is caused by the extended use of nonchord tones. The motive shown in Example 30 undergoes a dissonance placement shift as shown in Figure 21. The initial dissonant lower neighbor (Fig. 21b) is often accompanied by a "nonchord chord" (i.e., an appoggiatura
Example 30. Motive from Link, mm. 120b-121.

chord), and the resolutions of the three upper voices do not coincide (e.g., m. 136b-137).

Figure 21. Dissonance shift of Link motive.

a.  \[ \begin{array}{cccccc}
C & C & C & D & C \\
5 & 6 & 8 & 7 & 6 \\
\end{array} \]

b.  \[ \begin{array}{cccccc}
D & C & C & D & C \\
\text{or} & D & C & D & D & C \\
\end{array} \]

(3) The connection of e\(^b\) to b is achieved in this manner: The opening fugue subject (mm. 115b-119) is harmonized in the key of e\(^b\). An extension to the subject provides a cadence (mm. 120-121); an extension to the cadence introduces the motive of Example 30. The following statement (mm. 112b-126) is in the relative major, G\(^b\)/F\(^\#\). Its extension concludes with a deceptive cadence, C\(^\#\) to D (mm. 127-128), which resolves down by third to B\(^7\). At this point (m. 129) the texture changes to a slower harmonic rhythm yet a faster accompanimental rhythm. A series of voice leading motions begins (using the motive of Ex. 30) that transforms the B\(^7\) (mm. 129-133a) into an F\(^4\)^\(^7\) (mm. 137).
A reduction of this passage is given in Example 31. At the deepest level, the progression is as follows: I (V\(^7/\)IV) – V/V – V. At the intermediate level, we see the connection of B\(^7\) to C\(^\#\)\(^7\) filled in with chromatic passing tones. We also observe the C\(^\#\) dominant seventh prolonged by the diminished seventh connected to it by a 1 ct resolution (spelled as a f\(^xo7\) in m. 134 and as an a\(^xo7\) in m. 135). Note also that the final statement of the C\(^\#\) dominant seventh is actually its diminished seventh equivalent, e\(^xo7\) (m. 136). And finally, at the surface, the progression is further obscured by chromatic passing tones and neighbor tones. One type, the incomplete lower neighbor, as seen in the bass in mm. 134-135, is a particularly important figurative device of the dominant pedal (e.g., mm. 144-151). We recall it from the arpeggiated portions of the Prelude (e.g., mm. 5, 7, 20-23, 52-55), and we will see it again in the episodes of the Fugue (e.g., mm. 179-180).

Example 31. Harmonic reduction, mm. 129-132.
Two different forms of the half-diminished seventh chord act as an embellishment to the dominant seventh. The first one, an enharmonic $b^7$, is spelled and resolved as an augmented-sixth type chord (mm. 136, 137), with the $B - G^x$ interval resolving outward to the octave on $A^*$. The second one, an $f^7$, arises from a double lower neighbor note on the $F^x$ dominant seventh (mm. 155, 156).

(4) The dominant pedal (mm. 137-157) is not literally a long-held note, but is actually the repetition of the $F^x$ dominant seventh and its equivalent, $a^7$, combined with neighbor notes and chords. The motive of Example 30 appears imitatively (at the interval of a tritone) in mm. 140b-142.

The subject of the fugue appears twice in the link (mm. 115b-119 and 122b-126). The subject itself is on $B^b$ and $C^x/D^b$, but the key is $e^b$ and $f^7/g^b$. That this is the pitch level of the subject can be verified by examining any subject in the fugue itself (e.g., m. 157b, ff.). There the subject begins $4 - 4 - 3$ and concludes $3 - 4 - 3$ (harmonized $V - I$). In the link, however, the subject is harmonized in the key of the dominant, so the scale degree patterns become $8 - 8 - 7$ for the head and $2 - 1 - 7$ for the conclusion. Of all the occurrences of the subject (in both the Link and the entire Fugue), these two statements are the only ones in a different key.
Fugue

My analytical discussion of the fugue will be arranged as follows: (1) structural overview and key scheme, (2) subject usage, (3) episodic materials (including sequence), (4) other harmonic aspects, (5) cyclic aspects.

Structural overview and key scheme

Consistent with the previous two movements, Franck blends both eighteenth-century and nineteenth-century characteristics in this large masterful work. The first two expositions proceed according to a common eighteenth-century pattern: tonic (b) and relative major (D) with alternate statements in the dominant of each. (Refer to Fig. 22 throughout the following discussion of structure.) The first exposition has no close but is linked inseparably to the D major exposition. After an appropriate extension the D major exposition comes to a close with a large perfect authentic cadence. It should be noted that the fugue does not want for authentic (V - i) cadences, since the close of the subject (stated completely 13 of 15 times) is consistently V - i(I). Metric position, voicing (i.e. inversion), and short duration, however all lessen their finality.

A short bridge, using the subject in inversion, connects the D major cadence to the large middle section,
Figure 22. Structural diagram of the Fugue.

S  denotes Fugue subject
CS denotes Fugue countersubject
harm t denotes harmonization type
.  denotes perfect cadence
,  denotes transient cadence
opening with an equally large cadence in $f^*$ minor (mm. 231-232). This large middle section changes character in two respects: (1) The underlying rhythm changes from eighth-notes to eighth-note triplets; and (2) the eighteenth-century progression of fifth-related key areas is replaced by a progression more characteristic of the nineteenth century, that of symmetric thirds, as in the succession of $f^*$ to $d$ to $b$.

Following the $f^*$ exposition, a large passage constructed by sequence spins out the triplet-based material and leads to the large dominant pedal. Before the final exposition, a huge cadenza unifies the whole work by introducing into the fugue the arpeggiation rhythm of the Prelude and the melodic theme of the Chorale.

The final exposition contains not only the only subdominant statement of the subject but also the Chorale theme combined with the subject. The final extension shifts the mode to B Major and both the extension and cadence are parallel to the end of the D Major exposition. Upon the final cadence, the Chorale theme returns in major as a prolongation of the tonic. Demuth cites this passage as the one "blot." In another place he speaks more generally of Franck's codas: "... the weakest moment in each of

---

75 Demuth, César Franck, op. cit., 149.
Franck's large and (shall we say) noisy movements comes in the final coda, which is invariably vulgar; but it is only fair to say that this was the usual way to terminate a work in those days.\textsuperscript{76}

Subject usage

The subject of the fugue (Ex. 32) comprises a descending scalar line from $\frac{4}{3}$ to $\frac{5}{4}$. The motive of the head is directly derived from the falling second motive of the Prelude. Franck treats this motive to an $ea$ sequence, with $\frac{4}{3} - *\frac{5}{4}, \frac{5}{4} - \frac{3}{2}$ and $\frac{3}{2} - \frac{7}{6}$ suspensions. (Sievers has noted a resemblance to the fugue subject of the Toccata of the e-minor Partita by J. S. Bach.)\textsuperscript{77} Even with all the chromatic movements present in the subject ($\frac{5}{4}$ and $\frac{7}{6}, \frac{7}{6}$ and $\frac{5}{4}$), a firm sense of the tonality is maintained in two ways: (1) The harmonization of the last measure is

\textsuperscript{76}Norman Demuth, \textit{French Piano Music} (London: Museum Press, 1959), 47.

\textsuperscript{77}Sievers, \textit{op. cit.}, 212.
consistently V - i. The subject is kept intact with respect to its internal intervals; they are never shrunk or widened for the purpose of leading the tonality to remote regions.

Because the subject is linear, as opposed to "triadic," many possibilities of harmonizations exist. This inherent aspect is wonderfully exploited (Ex. 33). The first downbeat is consistently I or V/IV (B or B relatively), and the last two harmonies are consistently dominant to tonic (f to B/b relatively); but between those boundaries no fewer than five different harmonic successions occur. Note the second downbeat (D - C suspension, relatively) is harmonized by an A (type 1 and 1a), C (type 2), or a F (type 3 and 3a).

Note the succession of parallel dominant four-two's in type 1. The last one, a G, is resolved as a German sixth in b. Note also that all types (except 3a) have a movement to the subdominant in the third measure. This late subdominant movement is used as a prominent aspect of the sequence of mm. 201-205 (discussed later). In addition, it contributes to the tonal ambiguity of the subject by making IV sound like I and the final V - I sound like V - I in the key of the dominant. This interpretation of the key of subject, then, would have the subject commencing 8 - 8 - * (as it does in the link). The only type 3 subject that is
Example 33. Subject harmonization.

stated in its entirety (mm. 206-209) confirms this subdominant tendency in two ways: (1) The subject is on A, yet it is used as the final statement in a D Major exposition; and (2) it places an A dominant seventh (B dominant seventh in Ex. 33) on the downbeat of the fourth measure (m. 209).
As we examine the placement of the various types in the structural scheme of the Fugue (Fig. 22), we find that all subjects that are a part of the same exposition are of the same type, with one exception. The concluding statement of the D Major and final b minor expositions are not of the same type (2 and 3a, respectively) with respect to their exposition, but are the same with respect to each other (type 3). This fact is important, since the following extending and cadential material is the same, as well. This parallel use of material further unites these two points as the two largest points of arrival of the fugue.

The subject is also modally ambiguous. Note that the mode is not established until the third measure. (Specifically, it is the eleventh note that is either $b^6$ or $^6$.) This modal ambiguity allows the successive subject statements in $f^\flat$ minor, d minor, and $b^\flat$ minor to sound diatonic. Each successive downward major third is perceived as the diatonic $^6$VI of the previous key area.

Let us now examine the subjects in their contexts. The opening exposition is a very strict four voice exposition with voice entries in this order: tenor, alto, soprano, bass. There is a countersubject (Example 34), which is derived from the third measure of the subject. It follows the subject only in this first exposition (and in one reappearance of the type 1 harmonization, m. 278b, ff.).
Example 34. Fugue countersubject, mm. 161b-165.

Beyond this it only identifies general shapes for subject-accompanying voices (e.g., type 2, mm. 193-199). The fourth statement introduces the head of the subject in diminution. In so doing the texture becomes very linearly oriented, with the combination of passing tones and neighbor tones on various levels obscuring the harmonic underlay (Ex. 35).

The second exposition continues the free voicing of the above, and it introduces the "chopstick" rhythm pattern into

Example 35. Reduction, Fugue, mm. 173b-177.
the fugue. This pattern creates a homophonic effect, that is, melody (subject) with accompaniment. Even when the first dynamic climax is reached (m. 206) and the subject is stated again without the offbeat accompaniment, the homophonic effect continues since the melody (subject) and bass are doubled in octaves.

Immediately following the close of the D Major exposition, the subject appears in inversion, as a bass line. This point is perhaps the weakest moment of the fugue, not because of the inverted subject, but because of the extensive parallel movement of similar (major and dominant seventh) sonorities.

The f♯ minor exposition is written in strict three-voice triple invertible counterpoint. The subject and two counter-subjects each take their turn as highest, middle, and lowest voice. The six-four sonorities that are inevitable in such a strict arrangement are minimized by several factors: (1) the slight number of triads (most are seventh chords or diminished seventh chords); (2) the displacement of the six-four through suspensions (m. 246, beat 2); (3) short duration due to a moving bass; (m. 252, beat 2; m. 254, beat 4); (4) the omission of the fifth (m. 245, beat 4); (5) the addition of a free bass voice (m. 255, beats 1 and 2).

The first countersubject grows directly out of the triplet theme (m. 232); their respective first measures are
identical (Ex. 36). The second countersubject, doubled in octaves in two of the three statements, is more of a bass line (though it takes its turn as the middle and highest voice), vaguely resembling the original countersubject (Ex. 37).

The harmonic connection between the successive subjects is the same movement as the opening of the Prelude: an upward minor third pivot on vii\(^{07}\)/iv (Ex. 38). This particular movement is also used extensively in the extended
sequential passage that follows this exposition (mm.255b-265).

Example 38. Upward minor third pivot, Fugue, mm. 247b-248.

During the huge dominant pedal that prepares for the cadenza, the subject is stated once, over the dominant pedal. The harmonization type (type 1) is that of the opening (b) exposition. This point, along with the coda, are the only points in the fugue to receive a fortississimo (fff) marking.

The final exposition grows out of the cadenza, keeping the arpeggiated pattern until the final statement (m. 353) then resuming at the coda. The first two subject statements, in b and e, are overshadowed by the Chorale theme which is superimposed as the highest voice of the texture. The right hand continues the arpeggiated texture and the left hand states the subjects in a middle voice, with a lower bass sometimes present (i.e., when there are "hands" to spare, as in the rhythmic "holes" in the fugue subject).

The contrapuntal aspects of this passage (namely, the combination of the subject and the two statements of the
Chorale in stretto) determine its harmonization. Note that (Fig. 22 and Ex. 33) Franck derived a new harmonization (type 3a) just for these two statements.

The final subject statement, in \textit{f} no less, uses the same approach, harmonization, extension, and cadence as the final statement of the D Major exposition. Only a few modifications are present: (1) abbreviated sequence as approach (mm. 353-355), and (2) an internal extension of the tail (by means of an \underline{ea/mh} sequence, mm. 358-361).

Episodic materials

In typical fugal construction the episodic sections "spin out" the subject and subject-related ideas, often through the use of harmonic and/or melodic sequences. They also introduce new elements and provide linear or harmonic drive to some important goal. All of these aspects of the episodes, as we will see, are especially prominent in Franck's working-out of the fugal construction. It is important to emphasize that though the harmonic vocabulary is distinctly nineteenth-century, the techniques are clearly derived from the earlier contrapuntal practice.

Five times throughout the fugue Franck begins an episode with a sequence that grows out of the previous
sequence statement. This happens twice in the initial exposition (mm. 165b-169 and mm. 177b-178). Coming after the first two statements of the subject, a sequence (mm. 165b-169) grows out of the subject and its counterpoint of m. 165. It provides two successive downward fifth movements to connect the harmony of f° to that of E (m. 167). E is the pitch necessary to begin the next subject entry ([b]: ♭, m. 169b). A second sequence (mm. 167-169) extends E and provides a linear connection to the voicing of the subject entry.

Immediately following the initial exposition, another episode begins similarly (m. 177b, ff.) The sequence that grows out of the tail of the subject lessens the effect of the f° cadence (m. 177b). The harmonic movement is propelled past the cadence in a downward step sequence. This sequence features two successive half-steps, b² - i - 7.

Three other items deserve particular notice: (1) The iv progression is approached abruptly with the local minor subdominant providing an element of surface surprise. (2) The six occurrences are as follows: (1) m. 165b, ff., (2) m. 177b, ff., (3) m. 200b, ff., (4) m. 209b, ff. (paired repetition, rather than sequence), (5) m. 282b, ff. (development of tail, rather than strictly sequence), (6) m. 343b., ff.

The cadence is not very strong to begin with. The order of subject entries is TASB. Thus, the bass subject ends with ♭ - 4 - 3 and the resulting cadence is V-i°.
The iv\(^6\) is further elaborated by a half-step neighbor note which gives the effect of a Neapolitan six-four. This local \(b^2\) provides the scale degree pivot. It is approached as the leading tone of the previous key, but it resolves as the \(b^2\) of the following key. (3) The effect of a downward step sequence is that of successive downward fifths. In a rather characteristic eighteenth-century fashion, this harmonic sequence might have been accomplished as shown in Figure 23a. Note that the actual succession (Fig. 23b) keeps the dominant and tonic function, but replaces the subdominant with a chord with greater chromatic contrast (both in its preparation and resolution).

Figure 23. Downward step sequence, Fugue, mm. 177-178.

a.  f\(^*\)  f\(^*\)\(^7\)  B  e
b.  f\(^*\)  F  B  e
(a)

The harmonic goal of the downward step sequence is A\(^7\) (m. 179), at which point a second sequence commences. This sequence surprises the listener with its sudden change in character. All at once, the style becomes more rhapsodic with two-measure-long harmonies, extensive use of diminished sevenths, enharmonic resolutions, and arpeggiation. Also,
the four-voice polyphonic texture becomes homophonic. Even in this, however, a vestige of the older contrapuntal fugal practice is retained in that there is a voice exchange with units of two measures.

This episode foreshadows the later f section (m. 232, ff.) in several important ways: (1) Initially, the shift in texture and "style" is present at the appearance of both. (2) Specific harmonic movements (not present in the expository material) are prominent in both, particularly the 1 ct resolution of the diminished seventh chord. (3) Melodic patterns are similar. In contrast to the linear subject, both make considerable use of an arpeggiated melodic pattern. This reduces the thematic nature of the line and makes it more harmonic in character. Certain linear elements, however, remain, one of which is the half-step lower neighbor. (We recall this as an important figurative element in the Prelude.) Notice the relationship between the earlier (Ex. 39a) and later (Ex. 39b) patterns.

While providing a textural contrast to the strict four voice b minor exposition, this sequence (along with the one

---

80 The four-voice polyphonic text never returns. Even with the subject and subject-derived materials that follow, the texture is mostly homophonic, or more accurately, anphonic. A counterpoint of soprano and bass with harmonic "fill" best describes the texture for the remainder of the fugue. This anphonic texture is relieved by one passage of triple invertible counterpoint.
immediately following) also extends the harmony with which it begins, an A dominant seventh. This does not mean that an A pedal literally exists; it does mean that the beginning and ending of these coupled sequences are the same harmony. Note that the opening is A\(^7\) (m. 179) and its equivalent c\(^\#o7\), and that the end (m. 188) could have been A. At the point where A\(^7\) is expected to return, the g\(^\#o7\) chord immediately previous is resolved deceptively (1 ct) to an F\(^6\) (with A in the bass). In any case the A\(^7\) that we expected in m. 188 arrives harmonically in m. 190 and as a literal A pedal in mm. 191-193.

Example 39. Motive similarities, Fugue, m. 179 (a) and m. 233 (b).

Even after the resumption and prolongation of the A\(^7\), the listener is not given the expected tonic (D), for the first statement of the D major exposition is in A major, and the opening A\(^7\) ([A]: V\(^7\)/IV, see Ex. 33, type 2) resolves to B\(^7\) (m. 194).

This sequence also reminds us of several resolutions of the diminished seventh chord. Two successive downward 0 ct resolutions imply not two downward fifths, but, because of their spellings, a downward fifth and an upward second, a
motion equivalent to a tonicization of A (c°7 - f°7 - g°7, or their equivalent dominants, A - D - E). The second and third of these diminished seventh chords have the characteristic °7 - °7 appoggiatura (7 - 6) which, with preparation, is the falling second that forms the head of the subject (mm. 180b-181, 182-183).

An overlap occurs between the two sequences, with the final measure of the g°7 chord serving as the first half of the initial leg of the second sequence (Ex. 40). A series of 1 ct resolutions provides the basis for the second sequence (Ex. 41). As I mentioned earlier, the resolution of the final g°7 (m. 187b) is by 1 ct to F. This changes the pattern of the sequence, however, by resolving the connecting diminished seventh (rather than first moving up a half-step as in mm. 185-186) and by pivoting by tritone.

The next episode occurs within the D major exposition, linking the second subject (D) with the third (A). Several important aspects of the relationship between harmony and

---

61 Note the foreign midpoint of this coupled sequence: g°7 - A♭, a tritone distant from D.

62 It is not the B that is held as a common tone, but the F. This tritone pivot is an unusual resolution for this work, but it must be said that in this context, with the diminished seventh more linear than harmonic, the pivot is less aurally apparent.
counterpoint are revealed there. For this reason we will examine this in great detail.

Example 41. Sequence of Fugue, mm. 184-188.

The episodic material is derived from the last two measures of the subject (mm. 199-200, Ex. 42). This two-measure fragment is then treated to an aa/mh sequence that becomes ea/mh before it is finished.

The second unit is transposed up a diatonic third, to f# minor (mm. 201-202). The third unit (m. 203) is up
another diatonic third, to A, and is incomplete. At this point, the sequence becomes an \textit{ea} type, since the internal intervals are imitated exactly for the third, fourth, and fifth units. The fourth unit (m. 204) is up another second, to B, and the fifth unit (m. 205) is up another third, to D. Both are incomplete, and both have an elided initial note (beginning on beat one, rather than on the previous beat 4).

Example 42. End of sixth subject, sequence, and seventh subject, Fugue, mm. 196b-209.
Example 43 illustrates the diatonic underlay of the passage. Notice that the basic relationship between soprano and bass is one of descending sixths. This contrapuntal structure determines the course of the music by identifying linear goals, shown by the arrows. This diagram demonstrates both of the omissions mentioned previously. First of all, the fourth and fifth units have an elided initial note. If they had begun on the previous beat four, the initial notes could have been those in parenthesis. Second, the third and fourth units are incomplete; this is shown by the wavy line that interrupts the linear goal of each of these legs. Note that the bass note of the final unit does resolve to its linear goal, the pitch A (m. 206). This pitch is also the bass note of the opening of the next subject. In fact, one important contrapuntal function of this passage is the preparation of and connection to this A.

The counterpoint of the passage is found essentially between the outer voices; the inner voices have a more

---

83Either a whole step or half step may open the soprano descent (see the second unit, mm. 200-1, and the third unit, mm. 202-3). The determining factor is the mode of the prior cadence. The cadence on D in measure 200 ensures that the opening bass note of the second unit will be F♯, thus transposing by upward major third. Consequently, the first soprano note of measure 201 must be C♯. (Note that the interval of a fifth with respect to the bass, and the interval of a major second with respect to the next soprano note are constant. Now compare the similar cadence in measure 202).
harmonic and textural role since their motion is dependent upon that of the outer lines. On the surface level, one other contrapuntal device is present. Beginning in the third unit and continuing in the fourth and fifth units, the soprano voice contains the head of the subject in diminution. The syncopated pattern of the right hand, beginning in the previous subject, makes this device possible. This contrapuntal aspect heightens the rhythmic activity, and thus intensifies the musical line.

Example 43. Diatonic contrapuntal underlay, Fugue, mm. 199-205.

Let us consider now the vertical relationships and determine what logic and significance is given by the harmonic succession. The harmonic roots of the sonorities are easily discernible (Ex. 44a and b). As I have mentioned before, I have labelled the augmented sixth as a chord whose root is the second scale degree of the local tonality.
Example 44. Fugue, mm. 199-206, (a) harmonic reduction, (b) chord roots, (c) and (d) functional interpretation.
A possible functional Roman numeral interpretation is given in Example 44c. Since the passage is sequential, the same functions reappear on the various tonal levels. The movement (Ex. 44c) is basically submediant to a tonicized subdominant to dominant to tonic. Since the third through fifth units are incomplete, their function must be derived by comparing them to the corresponding place in the complete leg. It might be argued that, in the third unit, there is not much to establish A as the local tonic. Considered alone, it might seem that D is tonic. It is only by comparison with the complete units that we arrive at this functional assessment. An important analytical point is thereby derived: Harmonic function is often only implied, not confirmed, and function is often deduced by comparison and contrast.

In speaking of function, it is necessary to distinguish between various **levels** of functional relationships. With respect to this passage, we may identify the following levels (which are not necessarily discrete): (1) immediate chord succession, (2) larger harmonic movement within a local key area, (3) key area succession, and (4) connection of beginning to goal. I will discuss each of these levels in turn.

(1) Many immediate chord successions possess functional logic, for example, $V_4^1$ to $I^6$, and the augmented sixth (with
Other harmonic successions are not as easily explained—at least on the "immediate" level. The half-diminished seventh chord that occurs on the downbeat of measures 203, 204, and 205 is not the usual quality for a submediant. We see the origin of this chord in the $f^\text{#}$ minor triad at the beginning of the third unit. A "generalized" Roman numeral analysis (Ex. 44d) identifies these chords as submediant, whether minor or half-diminished. From this we derive another principle: Quality may or may not identify function. In any case, the chord is passing to the augmented sixth.

Since this passing chord is a product of the voice leading connections between the submediant and the augmented sixth, it has its origins in counterpoint. In addition, notice how, with the elision of the initial notes of the fourth and fifth units, the contrapuntal chord of the third unit becomes harmonic!

---

84 This latter progression is, in effect, two parallel $V^4_2$'s, and can be related to the very first harmonization of the subject, in which a series of four parallel $V^4_2$'s was used for the head of the subject. It is also interesting to note that in the first occurrence (m. 171) the last $V^4_2$ resolves as an augmented sixth chord (m. 171, beat 4). In the later occurrence (mm. 199, 201, 203-204), the last one resolves as a dominant.

85 The progression of minor to half-diminished is common enough, especially in the downward fifth progression as follows: $i = ii\, ii^7\, V^7\, I$ (see Fig. 23).
One final note on the "immediate" level: We cannot expect any functional relationships to exist across the interruptions. Though they may exist, their occurrence, if not coincidental, is certainly subordinate to the contrapuntal and larger harmonic relationships.

(2) The larger harmonic movement within each local key area is submediant to subdominant, and, in the complete units, on to dominant and tonic. Here we find one reason for the interruptions: Note that the third and fourth units have only the progression VI to IV. Omission of the dominant function heightens considerably the sense of arrival in measure 206, since the final unit progresses on to V as it elides with the next subject.

(3) The succession of key areas, D, F♯, A, B, and D, shows Franck's tendency to use ee sequences to emphasize prominent degrees of the larger tonality. Especially important to such an arrangement is the use of major and minor thirds as external intervals of sequence. In this particular succession, the first, third, and fifth degrees of D major (as well as the sixth, which is the original tonic) are emphasized.86

(4) Finally, on the largest level, the passage is viewed as a single entity, connecting the beginning to the

---

86Franck does use symmetric thirds in ee sequences, as in the succession of keys, f♯ - d - b♭ (m. 244, ff.).
goal. We noticed previously that the succession of keys begins and ends with D. Thus, one function on the largest level is to effect a harmonic circle. In so doing, a register transfer is also achieved (compare measure 200, beat 4 with measure 205, beat 4). In addition, preparation is made in an effective (and even dramatic) way for the most significant subject entry up to that point. This subject (m. 206, ff.) is registrally the highest, lowest, and widest thus far; it is also the first to be doubled in octaves; and it is the first to receive a fortissimo dynamic marking.

Following the fortissimo A Major statement of mm. 205b-209, an extension insures that tonality is D (the key of the previous subject notwithstanding) and provides the first large authentic cadence, also on D. Again the material is spun out of the tail of the subject. Unlike before, the material is not treated sequentially, but rather as a series of paired motives. The first pair (elaborating in the soprano 6-5-4-3) varies only the diminution of the soprano line. The second pair (elaborating in the soprano 4-3) takes the final two beats of the first pair and varies the register of the accompanying parts (Ex. 45). A third unit (m. 213) introduces a more significant variation, the pitch C⁷ (m. 213), which turns the tonic into
a vii\(7\)/IV.\(^{87}\) This \(f\) is then treated to an upward minor third pivot and resolves to a \(VI^6\). This progression is identical to the opening harmonic gesture of the Prelude (mm. 1-3).

Example 45. Pairing, Fugue, mm. 211-214.

\[\text{Example 45. Pairing, Fugue, mm. 211-214.}\]

© 1922 Oliver Ditson Company
Used by Permission

This measure (m. 213), in turn, becomes the first unit of a sequential pair, that is, a sequence with some variation. Note that the upper two voices (m. 214) exhibit sequential characteristics on the respective beats 1 and 2 (down by perfect fourth). The lower two voices remain the same throughout the measure, and the harmony is the same for beats 3 and 4 (B\(^b\)). This passage illustrates the dual nature of the sequential pair. With respect to the constant lower parts and goal harmony, the beat 1 and 2 material of the upper parts is varied, as in a pair. But it is varied.

\(^{87}\)It might seem contradictory to have a third unit to a "pair." The term "pair" refers to the association of successive motives, thus a third unit may exist as the result of two successive, but overlapping, pairs.
in a sequential manner, so perhaps the sequential material is "constant" and the lower parts constitute the varied element. Aurally, it seems that the former interpretation (a pair with a varied element, and, thus, a focus, on beat 1 and 2 of m. 214) is more apparent.

The harmonic progression of the second unit is, of course, different with an augmented sixth (instead of \( v ii^6 / IV \)) resolving to \( B_b \). (Notice also that the interval of the augmented sixth resolves out to the octave on the third of the chord, as did the \( 9^7 \)--an enharmonic augmented sixth--of m. 136.)

An interesting shift of contrapuntal function to harmonic function occurs here. Note that the bass line contains the motion from \( E \) to \( D \) (m. 211 and m. 212). Here the \( E \) is an appoggiatura, or accented passing tone (Ex. 46a), which delays the consonant \( D \). In the first unit of the sequential pair (m. 213), the \( E - D \) motion has been expanded to span three beats and to include the chromatic passing tone \( E_b \). With the \( C^4 \) in the alto, new harmonies are formed (\( f^9 \) and \( f^9 \)). The \( E - E_b \) motion, however, still delays the consonant \( D \); and the vertical sonorities formed clearly represent a \( D \) dominant seventh (Ex. 46b). In the second unit the \( E \) and \( E_b \) are non-replaceable. They have become chord tones (members of an \( A \) sonority) in their own right (Ex. 46c). This shift of function from counterpoint to
Harmony is exactly the same shift we saw in the sequential passage of mm. 200-205 (discussed previously).

Example 46. Shift of contrapuntal to harmonic function.

Following this is another sequential pair (m. 215), one that provides the approach to the dominant for the large D major cadence (mm. 216-217). Interesting aspects of this pair (Ex. 47) include the following: (1) The bass line proceeds by downward perfect fifths, arriving not on 5 (A) but on ℵ (G_sharp!)! These bass notes are all sevenths of diminished seventh chords (moving down by half-step) except for the last chord, which is not a b^7 (with A_sharp as bass) but a Bb^7 (resolving as a German sixth). (2) The initial chord is spelled as an incomplete g^7, without a B_sharp. Therefore, because the previous harmony was Bb, this sonority is clearly perceived as a Bb7. (3) The second chord contains the 7-7 appoggiatura we have seen before. This sound, especially when the half-diminished seventh is in six-five position, is such a part of Franck's style that we might
expect the chord on beat four (German sixth with appoggiatura) to be the same. The adjustment B♭ to B is made for additional gravitation to the dominant (m.216) and for the resumption of the B♭ emphasis set up mm. 213-215a.

Example 47. Sequential pair, Fugue, mm. 214-216.

Unlike the former sequential pair (mm. 213-214), this one gives greater weight to the sequential effect rather than the pairing effect. The reasons for this are two: (1) Whereas the former example has a greater part of non-sequential material, the non-sequential material of the latter amounts to a single note. (2) Whereas, in the former, the non-sequential elements are the same in terms of absolute pitch, the non-sequential elements of the latter have little relationship to the previous material.

Although the length of this passage is eight measures, the internal structure is not 4 + 4, but rather is 2 + 1 + 2 + 1 + 2. This asymmetric structure is caused by overlapping in the various associative devices.
The D major cadence can be noted for two significant aspects: (1) the use of non-essential (embellishing) chromaticisms (chromatic passing tones over the dominant pedal of m. 216), and (2) the appoggiatura on the cadence chord itself.

Beginning at the large f minor cadence (mm. 231-232), the sequence assumes an even greater role than before. The opening material (mm. 232-240) consists of sequence not subject; the expositional material (mm. 244-255), at least in its key relationships, is sequential; and the lengthy "spinning out" section (mm. 256-275) consists totally of sequences of various types. In fact it is the final sequence of this "spinning out" section that leads to the harmonic goal of the entire section, the dominant pedal (mm. 275-276).  

The character of the fugue changes markedly in this section. The previous accompanimental rhythm of eighth-notes becomes eighth-note triplets, and characteristic nineteenth-century harmonies and relationships, hinted at earlier (mm. 179-187), predominate for a greater span. The opening eight measures may be regarded as a sequential pair, or as a sequence over a

---

88 The subject does return over the dominant pedal (mm. 279-282), and it does intensify the drive to the climax (m. 256), but it is the sequence of mm. 268-275 that brings the first arrival of F#.
pedal. Consisting of two four-measure units, the sequence establishes $f^\#$ more by implication than by cadence. Beneath the entire sequence is an $f^\#$ pedal (the varied element in the second unit) and the interval of sequence is an upward perfect fourth. With the large dominant that follows (mm. 240-243), a large I - iv - V progression is formed, with each harmony lasting four measures. This large V prepares for the $f^\#$ entry of the subject (m. 243b).

Within each unit of the sequence, however, there is a significant movement toward $^6\text{VI}$. In each case this submediant is in first inversion ($^6\text{VI}$) (excluding the $f^\#$ pedal in the second unit), and of the three statements of the $^6\text{VI}$ in each unit, two (the first and the last) are prepared by 1ct resolution of a diminished seventh and the other by 0ct ($vii^7$) resolution of the diminished seventh. Though not identical with opening progression of the Prelude, the origin and goal are the same (Fig. 24a and b).

Following the b minor unit, the dominant arrives (mm. 240-241) extended in typical Franck style by a harmonically supported upper neighbor note in the bass. This dominant seventh is turned into its equivalent diminished seventh in order to prepare for the opening $f^\#$ subject statement. This

---

39Parallel tenths occur between the outer voices. The moving inner part prevents any further labeling (whether iv$^6$, $^6\text{VI}$, or Italian sixth).
diminished seventh (vii\(^{o7}\) of the local key) is necessary as the harmonization of the initial note of fugue subject (4) since it provides the means of modulation to the successive \(^{b}VI\)-related statements.

Figure 24. Similar harmonic patterns, Prelude, mm. 1-2 (a), Fugue, mm. 232-235 (b), mm. 256-257 (c).

a. Prelude [b]: i (vii\(^{o7}\)) i vii\(^{o7}/iv \ ^{b}VI^6\)
b. Fugue [f\(^{#}\)]: i vii\(^{o7}\) \(^{b}VI^6\)
c. Fugue [b\(^{b}\)]: i vii\(^{o7}\) i vii\(^{o7}\) vii\(^{o7}/iv \ ^{b}VI^6\)

Following the cadence on b\(^{b}\) (m. 255), a large sequential section ensues. The sequence continues the triplet rhythm but the texture becomes homophonic (melody and chordal accompaniment). This large sequential section also makes prominent use of the i - \(^{b}VI^6\) motion that has become an important feature of this work (Fig. 24c). We also see here the same upward minor third pivot (on vii\(^{o7}/iv\)) that formed the opening progression of the Prelude no fewer than four times, two in each unit. The first two move the tonality (from b\(^{b}\)) to G\(^{b}\), then to D (using the same pattern--thus a nested sequence). Following the movement to D, Franck uses a pair (Ex. 48) built on the head of the subject to reverse the downward motion and bring back F\(^{#}\), though as a dominant seventh (m. 260). In the progression D\(^{6}\) - c\(^{7/6}\) - f\(^{7/6}\), the goal harmony (m. 259a and m. 260a) of
the second unit is changed to an F* dominant seventh. As in any pair, it is the juxtaposition of the same element (here the melodic motive) with the varied element (change of goal

Example 48. Fugue, mm. 258b-261.

harmony) that explains the musical logic of the succession. In particular, the connection between the units (F*° to D6) is not to be understood on the chord to chord, or surface, level.90

The goal of this first unit (m. 260) is also one of the internal goals (Gb6 of m. 257). Yet the movement progresses past that point and returns. As a result, the arrival is given a sense of newness. This device is related to the

90As an aside, we might want to examine a similar progression, one in which the diminished seventh chord clearly resolves to the major triad it represents. It occurs in the Prelude of the Prelude, Aria, and Finale, mm. 52b-54a, 58a-60b. This resolution is similar to the 3rd resolution of the diminished seventh, except that the chord of resolution is major, rather than dominant seventh.
principle of successively remote yet referentially diatonic key and chord relationships.

One peculiarity of this sequence is its asymmetrical phrase structure of 5 1/2 measure units. Asymmetry is not Franck's norm, since his tendency, even in a work of contrapuntal design, is to make all phrases, sequences included, composed of two- and four-measure units. The first unit opens with an half-measure elision with the previous subject statement (m. 255b). Since neither the middle nor the end of the sequence is elided, a 2-4 measure (m. 265) is needed to complete the pattern.

Because the interval of sequence is a tritone, the second unit, if completed exactly, would prepare for the same tonal level with which the sequence began (b\(^b\)). By changing the final harmony of the second unit, b\(^b\) tonic is not established (Fig. 25). At the very moment we expect b\(^b\) minor, we do hear B\(^b\), not as tonic, but as dominant seventh.

The following short sequence (mm. 266-268a) grows out of the preceding one (Fig. 25). The large scale linear motion of the bass is obvious, providing downward steps, C -

Figure 25. Comparison of expected and actual sequential goals, Fugue, mm. 255-267.

F\(^7\) b\(^b\) e (unit 1) ... F\(^7\) B\(^7\) e
B\(^7\) e (unit 2) ... C\(^7\) F\(^7\) b\(^b\) -- copy of unit 1
... C\(^7\), a\(^b\) B\(^b\) -- actual new sequence
Bb - G*. The succession of C7 - a♭ and B♭7 - f♯ can be explained in three ways. (1) By grouping them with their "corresponding" adjacent harmony as such: C7 | a♭ - B♭7 | f♯ - G*, we can see the local iv - V7 controlled by the larger downward step motion. (2) This succession may also be explained contrapuntally with all of the voices resolving by step or half-step.91 (This relationship (V7 - b♭iii) is similar to the I - b♭vi seen elsewhere.) (3) The melodic element of the first two units forms a part of the subject, apparently on, but not in A♭. This is possible since the first two elements of the subject have the same rhythm and internal interval and since the external interval between them is a downward step. While the actual tonality of A♭ is never confirmed the linear connection is sufficient to recall the subject.92

The arrival on G♯7 (m. 268) is a step above the eventual goal (m. 275). To arrive at F♯, a sequential ascent is employed, with the first unit moving from G♯7 to C♯7 and the second unit from C♯7 to F♯7. The characteristics of the sequential ascent are all present

91 In the actual texture only E and C resolve to E♭ and C♭, respectively; the other resolutions are implied.
92 Even the third unit (mm. 267b-268a) of the sequence proceeds in the rhythm and shape of the corresponding part of the subject. An exact transposition of the subject would have been A♭ - A♭ - G rather than A - A - G♯.
here: (1) upward chromatic bass line; \(^9\) (2) nesting (a) with the small sequential units consisting of the harmonization of two adjacent notes of the chromatic scale, and (b) with the large sequential units spanning the interval of an upward perfect fourth; (3) the use of the diminished seventh chord. Also typical of nested sequences is a tonicization element either before or after the smaller sequence. Here the \(G^\#7\) and \(D^\#7\) harmonies are twice embellished by \(iv^6 - Fr^6\). The units of the small sequence contain \(V^7 - vii^6_{\text{ct}}(3_{\text{ct}})\); and, connecting them, the \(vii^6_{\text{ct}}\) resolves by \(0_{\text{ct}}\) (with a downward minor third pivot) to the next \(V^7\), resulting in an upward step for the external interval of the small sequence (Ex. 49a). The third diminished seventh, however, does not resolve similarly (by \(0_{\text{ct}}\)); otherwise, the large external interval would be a tritone. Rather, the final diminished sevenths (m. 271, beat 2 and m. 274, beat 4) resolve by \(1_{\text{ct}}\) (Ex. 49b), resulting in a large external interval of an upward perfect fourth. The phrase structure returns to the four-measure variety, yet the two units are overlapped by two beats so that the goal harmony \(F^*\) may enter on the downbeat (m. 275) rather than on beat 3.

\(^9\)This characteristic distinguishes the sequential ascent from those sequences whose external interval is merely upward.
Many similarities can be observed between this sequential ascent and that of the Chorale (mm. 89b-93a, Ex. 28): the nesting, the large external intervals, and the use of the diminished seventh chord. Some slight differences are noteworthy: In the Chorale the stressed beat is not a dominant seventh but a major-major seventh sonority; also, the additional half-step necessary to make a perfect fourth is added at the beginning of the large unit (e.g., m. 89, beat 4 to m. 90, beat 1), rather than, as here, at the end.

Following the great "summing up" passage of mm. 331-343, in which several themes are combined, an episode spins out the tail of the subject in sequence (mm. 344-346). This sequence also features the head of the subject in the right hand. The goal of this sequence is the e°7 of m. 347. Not unlike the earlier sudden shift of m. 179, the subject-related material stops (homophonic as it is), and a rather Romantic sounding arpeggiated figure prolongs e°7 for one measure and C°7 and F°7 for two measures each. The sudden return of a quicker harmonic rhythm (namely, the
sequence of m. 353, ff.) is perhaps another weak spot of the Fugue. The corresponding earlier passage (mm. 179-205), while it does change texture and style suddenly (m. 179), builds to the climax (of m. 206) much more gradually and subtly.

Other harmonic aspects

With one exception, Franck employs the technique of pairing only slightly throughout the fugue. This fact is partially due to the contrapuntal basis of the construction. The pairing that does occur is found in the episodes and extensions (e.g., the pairing of mm. 210-214, discussed earlier). The similar (and simpler) associative device of repetition is used in the fugue more than in the other movements; it, however, often functions as a preserver of the regular phrase structure (e.g., mm. 240-241, 268-269, 360-361).

The notable exception to the scant use of this technique is the cadenza (mm. 286b-311a) and its outgrowth, the return of the Chorale theme (mm. 311b-334a). Significantly, the cadenza returns the arpeggiation texture of the Prelude, and it is only fitting that a prominent associative device of the Prelude should return as well. The cadenza uses the head of subject (the falling minor second, and inverted once to be a rising minor second) with
the initial note articulated four or two times to connect an a⁷ (equivalent to the V of the previous large half cadence, m. 286a) or an e⁷ (enharmonically the same) to various dominant sevenths. A reduction is given in Example 50. While there are various ways of dividing this passage into sequence, pair, and sequential pair, the important harmonic aspects are that of the pairing principle: (1) a common initial element (the same diminished seventh chord) and (2) a variable second element which provides a focus. In this sense the F⁷ of m. 292b, ff., is the first focus, differing from the C⁷ of the first unit. In a larger sense the B♭⁷ and B⁷ sonorities (mm. 300, 304, 307, ff.) are also a focus because they require a different resolution (1 ct and 0 ct, respectively) of the diminished seventh chord. The final resolution to F⁷ (by 3 ct resolution) is, then, a return not only to the original harmony but also to the original gesture of the cadenza.

The return of the Chorale theme (m. 310, ff.) offers another prominent occurrence of pairing. Based on the double statement in the Chorale itself, the paired statement

Example 50. Harmonic reduction of the cadenza, Fugue, mm. 286-309.
in the fugue offers not a change of diminution (as in the Chorale, mm. 81b-85) but a change of bass line (and resultant harmony). This new element, a linear motion from F* to D (mm. 318-319) provides the means of modulation to the minor flat submediant (bvi). The linear element is present in the corresponding place of the second (but not the third) key area of the complete circle (b - g - e♭ - b).

Whereas the third key area (e♭) only uses a fragment of the Chorale theme, the fourth (b) again contains a double statement of the Chorale theme. To the first is added another statement of the Chorale theme in stretto; to the second is added the returning fugue subject.

Cyclic aspects

In true Franck cyclic style, the final movement and in particular, the climax of the final movement sums up the triptych by recalling the earlier movements. I have already noted the thematic development aspect, present in the treatment of the falling second motive of the Prelude. Other aspects of harmonic device (pairing) and of harmonic gesture (e.g. i - bVI6) recur in prominent ways.

The most obvious association comes through the literal statement of previously heard themes, especially the Chorale theme. Growing out of the cadenza (on the dominant, F*), the Chorale theme is stated, not in block harmonic texture as in
the Chorale itself, but rather clothed in the arpeggiated texture of the Prelude. A harmonic circle is formed as the Chorale theme is stated in successive downward major third-related keys. This passage perhaps represents the summing up of the bVI references. The third key area (e\textsuperscript{b}) is not complete—only the first four notes are stated (E\textsuperscript{b} - B\textsuperscript{b} - C\textsuperscript{b} - G\textsuperscript{b}). Under the C\textsuperscript{b} and G\textsuperscript{b} an accented descending fourth (E\textsuperscript{b} - B\textsuperscript{b}) appears (mm. 328b-329a), portending the following stretto of the Chorale theme. When the tonality of b minor returns (m. 331a), the first Chorale statement is given a complete imitative statement in stretto. The second melodic statement (m. 335, ff.) is combined with the return of the fugue subject. These two combinations (Chorale with Chorale in stretto and Chorale with Fugue subject) take the place of the subject itself being treated in stretto. They certainly intensify the sense of drive as a subject stretto would. This moment is regarded as the "superb peroration" by the laudatory d'Indy.\textsuperscript{94} Indeed, this passage is cited by many who discuss this work. Demuth credits Franck with a "masterful combination" and with "avoiding the obvious."\textsuperscript{95}

To summarize then, the Fugue is designed structurally according to an eighteenth-century model: (1) expositions

\textsuperscript{94}d'Indy, \textit{op. cit.}, 165.

\textsuperscript{95}Demuth, \textit{César Franck, op. cit.}, 148.
in tonic and relative major, (2) a following section of greater instability concluded by a dominant "pedal," (3) a final tonic exposition. With the large arrival on D given an emphasis parallel to final B arrival and with the unstable developmental-like middle section, one can almost perceive a sonata structure. Within this structure, the style and harmonic vocabulary are expanded to accommodate nineteenth-century features.

The subject grows out of a sequential treatment of the embryonic falling second, so prominent in the Prelude. Its linearity permits many harmonizations and its treatment ranges from the strictly contrapuntal to the broadly homophonic.

The episodes provide harmonic connection, thematic (subject) extension, and stylistic contrast. Sequence is a prominent device in expositional, episodic, and extensional sections. Sequence is used with a wide variety of types (parameters involved and interval structure) and construction techniques (nesting, overlapping, ascent).

The return of previous themes is also accompanied by the return of associated devices (pairing) and harmonic material (I - bVI). Aspects from all movements are combined simultaneously at the climax (texture of the Prelude, Chorale theme, fugue subject).
CHAPTER 4

PRELUDE, ARIA, AND FINALE

At once we are confronted with a very different work. Both the character and the construction of the respective movements diverge considerably from the Prelude, Chorale, and Fugue. Strangely enough, the Prelude, Aria, and Finale is every bit as contrapuntal as the Prelude, Chorale, and Fugue, the former's title notwithstanding. The earlier rhapsodic Prelude is replaced by a Prelude with a sturdy opening theme and a consistent use of counterpoint, not only in the voice leading of "unusual" harmonic connections, but also in the construction of thematic materials. The homophonic Chorale is replaced by a tender Aria, abounding in contrapuntal devices yet restricted in its key scheme. The Fugue is replaced by a "Finale," which is every bit as pianistic and showy as the nineteenth-century connotation of the word implies. Not without its contrapuntal elaborations and chromatic harmonies, the Finale recalls the themes of the earlier movements in a combination quite different from that of the Fugue.

Prelude

Opening with a sturdy, singable melody, the Prelude's opening measures call to mind the Chorale of the former
triptych, with its homophonic, chordal style and its regular phrase structure. The first large section ends (Fig. 26) with a conclusive authentic cadence on E (m. 42). This strong internal cadence, along with its approaching phrases, is used later as the final cadence. (Recall that both the Chorale and Fugue (PCF) displayed a similar balanced structure.)

This section exhibits the customary tonic-dominant key relationships; the opening phrases are stated in the dominant in m. 24, ff.

The opening a-phrase (mm. 1-2) consists of an e-/mh sequence that identifies two important harmonic features of the Prelude. The first is a movement to the mediant and the more general relationship of third-related chords. Note that the first measure moves from tonic to mediant and the second, from submediant to tonic (equal to tonic to mediant in the key of the relative minor). The second feature is the upward fifth movement implied, if not explicitly stated, in the "tonicizing" chord. Notice that each degree (iii and I) is tonicized by the local ii(∅)\textsuperscript{b}. Though the progression is not exactly iv - i, the bass does exhibit the 4 - 1 motion.

In true Franck style, the b-phrase (mm. 3-4) is constructed as a pair to the first, with the e (m. 3, beat

\textsuperscript{96}The designation "PCF" refers to the Prelude, Chorale, and Fugue, and the designation "PAF" refers to the Prelude, Aria, and Finale.
Figure 26. Structural diagram of the Prelude (PAF).

1 3 5 7 9 13 15 17 21 24 26 28 30 32 36
a b c c c/d a b1 e f a1 b2 c1 c1 g gl/d1

[1 3 5 7 9 13 15 17 21 24 26 28 30 32 36]
[a b c c c/d a b1 e f a1 b2 c1 c1 g gl/d1]

42b 44b 46b 48b 50b 52b 54b 56b 58b 60b 62b 64b 66b 69 71 73 75 76
h i h1 i1 j k l/h l1/h k h2 i2/m h3 i/n a2 b3 c2 c3 g2/d2

[42b 44b 46b 48b 50b 52b 54b 56b 58b 60b 62b 64b 66b 69 71 73 75 76]
[h i h1 i1 j k l/h l1/h k h2 i2/m h3 i/n a2 b3 c2 c3 g2/d2]

84b 88b 92b 96b 100b 104b 108b 112b 116b 120b 124b 128b 130b 134b 136b 140b
o p o1 p1 o2 p2 o3 p3 o4 p4 q q1 (h) q q1 (h) q2 q2 (h)

[84b 88b 92b 96b 100b 104b 108b 112b 116b 120b 124b 128b 130b 134b 136b 140b]
[o p o1 p1 o2 p2 o3 p3 o4 p4 q q1 (h) q q1 (h) q2 q2 (h)]

147 149 151 153 155
a3 b4 a4 b5 (a)

[e^b] [a^b] [c#] [E]

. denotes perfect authentic cadence
; denotes transient cadence
3) as the melodic divergence. The harmonic divergence arrives later (m. 4, beat 1), with the B\textsuperscript{7} as the first really new harmony. It must be noted, however, that V replaces I as the initial chord of the phrase and the tonicizing ii\textsuperscript{6} has been replaced by a V\textsuperscript{4}. Nevertheless, the mediant goal (beat 3 of mm. 1 and 3) is sufficient to associate the two as common at that point and to make the harmonic point of divergence seem to be after the mediant (m. 4, beat 1). This b-phrase also displays a linear bass, another voice-leading characteristic of this movement.

The sequential c-phrase (m. 5, ff.) exhibits two of the characteristics previously mentioned: (1) The opening B\textsuperscript{7} (m. 5) is treated to two successive upward fifth motions. (2) The combination of two upward fifths is, of course, an upward second, and the large motion of the bass is linearly upward. The effect of this sequence is that of dominant sevenths moving up by step (or half-step), a device not unlike Franck's use of the bVI or German sixth chords to elaborate and extend a dominant. The second half of each two-measure unit is a dominant seventh elaborated (on beats two and three) by an augmented-sixth chord. The bass of this augmented-sixth chord (German, then French) is first (the local) b\#5, then 'i. This upper and lower neighbor motion (and specifically the pitches D - B\textsuperscript{4} - C\textsuperscript{4} of m. 6) forms a prominent part of the o-phrase of the third large
section (m. 85, ff., specifically, mm. 88-89). Another contrapuntal aspect of m. 6, and one that will be seen throughout this piece, is the "mis-resolution" of the seventh on beat 1. The voice leading of the tenor (or third highest) voice is clearly B (seventh of C\(^7\)) - B\(^\#\) - D - C\(^\#\).

The harmonic effect of this line is to keep the same harmony (C\(^\#\)) while removing its seventh. A linear function of this motion is to prepare for the next upward dominant seventh (m. 7) by downward motion, thus relieving, even if slightly, the sense of parallel movement.

The small motion of C\(^\#\)\(^7\) to D\(^7\) (within m. 6) is related to the large motion of upward dominant sevenths (measure to measure). The relatively long appoggiatura on the German sixth (mm. 6 and 8, beat 2) creates the momentary effect of an alternate augmented-sixth type, that of the dominant thirteenth.

An examination of the chord roots of this passage (Fig. 27) shows clearly the upward fifth movement. Note that the embellishing augmented sixth (of mm. 6 and 8) is an additional upward fifth. Note also that the connection from m. 6 to m. 7 is another expression of the upward fifth (C\(^\#\) - G\(^\#\)), but the goal is reinterpreted as a D chord for the opening of the second unit.

The sequence is an ea/mh type with two complete units and a third incomplete unit. Note that the external
interval is first an upward minor third (B to D), then an upward major third (D to F'). Said another way, the connection (between the successive dominant sevenths) is first a minor second (m. 6 to m. 7), and then a major second (m. 8 to m. 9). This adjustment is significant in several ways. First, it expresses a linear upward perfect fifth B to F*. Secondly, it allows not only the goal note but also the goal harmony to be "in the key" (or "close" to the key).

Figure 27. Chord roots, Prelude (PAF), mm. 5-9.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>6</th>
<th>7</th>
<th>8</th>
<th>9</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>B⁷</td>
<td>F⁷</td>
<td>C⁷</td>
<td>Aug⁶</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B</td>
<td>F⁷</td>
<td>C⁷</td>
<td>G⁶</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Andriessen notes a three-part structure to this passage, corresponding to the three units of the sequence. He gives this passage as support for this melodic trait of Franck: "... the building-up of a theme in three parts: the opening, the repetition of this opening with an amplification of the exposition by means of alterations in the intervals or changes in the harmony, and finally the completion of the design." ⁹⁷ He goes on to identify the

⁹⁷Hendrik Andriessen, César Franck, trans. W.A.G. Doyle-Davidson (Stockholm: Continental Book, 194-?), 27. He quotes three excerpts to illustrate this point, each of which is clearer than the Prelude example: (1) the opening phrase of the first movement of the Symphony, (2) the main theme of Variations symphoniques, and (3) the opening of the third movement of the violin sonata.
"opening" as mm. 5-6, the "amplification" as mm. 7-8, and the "completion" as mm. 9-13a. While this is plausible, it does not reflect the relationship between this passage and the first four measures. The whole passage cited by Andriessen (mm. 5-13a) actually represents the "completion" of the first four measures (Fig. 28). Clearer examples of this three-part structure may be seen in the Fugue subject (Ex. 22), the Prelude (PCF) B-theme (mm. 8-11a), the Prelude (PCF) pairing (mm. 42-47 and 48-55), and the Prelude (PAF) h-i phrases (mm. 42b-46).

The large scale linear goal, as Salzer has noted, is achieved in m. 10, when the F\textsuperscript{7} resolves to E\textsuperscript{6}. A sequence by contrary motion now follows, and it leads to the half cadence in m. 12. This sequence (mm. 10-11) offers many harmonic and contrapuntal insights.

(1) The soprano has both diatonic (and hence, adjusted) external and internal intervals (aa), and, as is

---

often the case when the external intervals are adjusted, the two successive thirds form a perfect fifth \( (B - G^\# - E) \). On the other hand, the bass has exact intervals \( (ee) \), as it proceeds \( G^* - A^* - C^\sharp \).

(2) As a direct result of the chromatic passing tones in the soprano and of the different external intervals, a structure is formed (Ex. 51a) in which the two voices seem to move at different rates. This is true, however, only when the surface half-step motions of the soprano are contrasted with the structural half-step progression of the Example 51. Contrapuntal structure, Prelude (PAF).

![Musical notation](image)

bass. Deeper structures (Ex. 51b and c) reveal the same structural rhythm in both parts. As is the case when more
of the voice parts acquire a linear, contrapuntal function, the resultant succession of harmonic or vertical structures may be less of a controlling factor.\(^9^9\)

(3) The harmonic succession must necessarily take into account the linear elements of both voice parts, namely the neighbor notes by contrary motion (beat 2 of each unit). The first embellishing sonority is an enharmonic c\(^g\). Common enough in the harmonically functional progression of Figure 29, this neighbor chord prolongs the first inversion tonic on beat 1. It is also different by one half-step from the diminished seventh associated to the E chord by 1 ct resolution (Ex. 52).

Example 52. Embellishing harmonies.

![Example 52](image)

In the second unit the a\(^g\) is prolonged by an a minor triad (m. 11, beat 2), which is the chord that the linear

\(^{9^9}\)An interesting case in point is mm. 133-136 of the first movement of the Symphony (second theme, second phrase).
progression just came through (m. 10, beat 4). Note that the a minor chord of m. 11 is neighboring (thus embellishing), whereas that of m. 10 is harmonic! Though the connection from beats 1 to 2 of m. 11 is clearly linearly motivated, the harmonic perception of the succession is that of a half-diminished augmented sixth to a minor tonic (Ex. 53a), a resolution used elsewhere with definite harmonic function (e.g., the former Prelude, mm. 22-23). As an augmented-sixth chord, its implied root is E (Ex. 53b), and its resolution is down by fifth (E to A). Note also the aural similarity of this resolution to the i - bvi resolution (Ex. 53c).

Demuth finds this movement the "least satisfactory of the three . . . because of its cloying chromaticism." Perhaps he had this passage in mind.

Example 53. Half-diminished seventh as augmented-sixth chord.

\[ \text{Ex. 53a} \]

\[ \text{Ex. 53b} \]

\[ \text{Ex. 53c} \]

---


The goal of this sequence is $b^\text{VI}$ (m. 12), which is extended by its dominant and then resolves (as a German sixth) to B dominant seventh. The $^4\hat{7}$ of the German sixth is spelled as a $b^5$ because of its resolution to $^4$, the seventh of $V^7$.102 (On the whole, Franck seems to write $^4\hat{7}$ as much as $b^5$, when the German sixth resolves to $V^7$.)103

Examining the chord roots for this passage (Fig. 30), we find many conventional root movements. The $a^\sharp^7$ chord of m. 11, beat 1 is approached by a downward third (A to F$^\#$) as a general IV–II progression. The motion on to the $a$ minor chord (m. 11, beat 2) is harmonically justified; it is down by fifth, E to A (as shown in Ex. 53b). Note how the $a^\#7$ has two different roots in this passage, depending on the musical context: (1) $F^\#$, if resolving to B, or (2) E, if resolving as an augmented sixth to A.104 Notice also that

---

102 The resolution is downward only because of an elision of two motions: $^4\hat{7}$ to $^5$ and $^5$ to $^4$. Wegener seems to miss this fact when he describes the resolution of $^4\hat{7} - ^4$ (harmonized $\text{Gr}^6 - V^7$) as a "tendency tone . . . obtaining another direction." Bernd Wegener, César Franck's Harmonik (Ph.D. dissertation, University of Köln, 1976; Regensburg: Bosse, 1976), 145.

103 Prominent examples of $^4\hat{7} - ^4$ include: Prelude (PCF) mm. 33-34 and Fugue mm. 199, 201, 203-205. Prominent examples of $b^5 - ^4$ include: Chorale mm. 88, 96-97, and Prelude (PAF) m. 12. The dominant seventh notation (as opposed to the German sixth notation) is usually employed for passages with more successive dominant sevenths, as in the Finale mm. 328-330.

104 The $a^\sharp^7$ chord may also have $A^\#$ as its root, as in the progression $a^\sharp^7 - D^\#^7 - G^\#$ (II–V–I).
the returning upward fifth motion of Figure 27 (m. 6) is present here (Fig. 30) in m. 12. This similar movement would be obscured if the augmented sixth of m. 6 were not labelled as G♯.

The following a- and b-phrases are identical to the opening except for the arrival on the dominant of iii in m. 16. This change serves three purposes: (1) the melodic preparation of the pitch D♯, which is the initial note of the following phrase (m. 17, ff., compare m. 4); (2) the emphasis of the third relationship, thrown into relief by the juxtaposition of D♯ and B chords (mm. 16-17a); and (3) the harmonic preparation of the key of B by replacing the dominant function of B (mm. 4-5) with a tonic on B (m. 17). Another example of changing functions from contrapuntal to harmonic occurs here. Note that the C♯ of m. 4 (beat 2) is accorded a passing (and therefore, contrapuntal) harmony.

In the corresponding place of m. 16, the C♯ is given a functional sonority, that of iv♯, which prepares for V/iii.

The e-phrase (mm. 17-20) displays a considerably modified sequence. The soprano is constructed in two
measure units, beginning on D' (m. 17) and G' (m. 19).

Because of the different harmonization the internal
intervals are not exact (compare D' - E - F" with G" - A' -
B), yet the external intervals are both a perfect fourth (D'
to G" and G' to C"). The bass is not without its sequential
aspects. Even though there is no corresponding voicing or
melodic similarity between the lower parts of the
two-measure units, the harmonies are B to C#7 (mm. 17, 19).
This upward step movement is exactly what happens in the
corresponding place in mm. 5-6 (but at a distance of one
measure).105 In the second unit of the soprano sequence
another smaller sequence is nested in the lower parts. The
C#7 of m. 19 is embellished by neighbor and passing chords,
with the latter resolving to an A#7 (m. 20). Similar
devices transform the A#7 into an F#7 (m. 21). The motion of
the bass is a significant gesture, for two units of it
(minor and major third) express the linear fifth. When
descending, this gesture allows the opening V7 to connect to
its tonic through the mediant. It also emphasizes the third
relationship between chords (as in C#7, A#7, F#7). We recall
the mediated fifth of the sequence of mm. 5-9 (bass: B - D -
F"), which does not use the connecting motive, and we recall

105 The corresponding motion is complete with an upward
fifth F" - A - C" in the bass (in m. 5 as a part of an f"
chord and in m. 18 as a part of a b#7).
the mediated fifth of mm. 10-12 (soprano: B - G" - E) which does use it, though elaborated (Ex. 51b).

The following f-phrase (mm. 21-23) is built on a complete circle of downward diatonic fifths, beginning and ending at F\textsuperscript{7}. Both the e- and f-phrases exhibit subtle nuances of chromatic alteration, that is, chromatic passing tones connect many chord tones in a linear sense. Some examples are as follows: (1) A passing ii\textsuperscript{7} (m. 18) is turned into an augmented sixth by the raising of its root (Ex. 54a); the diminished third interval (C\# to E) resolves in to the octave on 3. (2) A V\textsuperscript{7}/vi (m. 23) is turned into an augmented sixth by the lowering of its fifth (Ex. 54b).

Example 54. Augmented-sixth chords created by surface chromatic movement.

![Example 54](image)

The cadence at mm. 23-24 is elided with the return of the opening theme in the dominant. The left hand takes the melody while the right hand weaves a counterpoint above it that is based on the tenor line (highest left hand voice) of the original statement (mm. 1-4). The c-phrases follow (mm. 145).
28-31) with the right hand returning to the melody and
texture it had before (mm. 5-8). The left-hand fills in the
rhythmic holes of the bass line with a treble counterpoint,
though this treble line is divided between the hands. One
harmonic change occurs when one of the embellishing
augmented-sixth chords (m. 29 and m. 31) is replaced with a
V/V (an alteration of one pitch). Instead of proceeding
with a third leg (as before, m. 9), the sequence is broken
after two units. Thus the successive dominant sevenths
conclude on B, just the harmony necessary for a return to
tonic. This connection (mm. 31-32) will receive a prominent,
third shift (D to B) in the final thematic exposition (mm.
178-179).

The climactic character of the g-phrases (mm. 32-38a)
is heightened by several factors: (1) the return to tonic,
(2) the fortissimo dynamic marking, (3) the triadic nature
of the melodic line, first outlining dominant (mm. 32-33)
and then tonic (mm. 34-35), and (4) the doubling of both of
the outer parts in octaves. Notice also that the
descending third motive forms the whole of the bass line,
connecting F - D - B - G - E. The additional B below the
beat 1 bass notes of mm. 23-33 and 35 indicates that B is
the implied pedal throughout and that the tonic harmony,
though expressed in six-four position in mm. 34-35, does
not arrive until m. 36. Even then, E major is replaced by
E dominant seventh (mm. 36-37), which features the same triadic melody.

The goal of this section is the IV\(^6\) of m. 38 (beat 1). This point corresponds to the I\(^6\) of m. 10, because what follows is a statement of the d-phrase sequence in the key of the subdominant (mm. 38-40a). Accounting for transposition the statements are identical except for the initial neighboring chord (m. 38, beat 2). The half-diminished seventh chord of the former (from m. 10, beat 2) is replaced by a fully-diminished seventh chord in the latter (illustrated with respect to E in Ex. 52).

A curious succession of dominant sevenths occurs in m. 40. Based on the upward fifth of m. 12 (beats 1 and 2), the pattern is sequenced down by half-step. Although the connection between the units is more incidental than functional (the melodic sequence being the controlling factor), the relationship between C\(^7\) and E\(^7\) is an upward third. Note also that the sevenths of the first three dominant seventh chords have no downward resolution (indicating either frustration of voice leading tendency or use of dominant seventh in more of a coloristic manner).\(^{106}\)

\(^{106}\)It must be noted that the IV\(^b\) - I succession may be viewed as an augmented-sixth type resolution, with the minor seventh (F to E\(^b\) in m. 40, beat 1) resolving out to the octave on the chord third (E). Only one of these voice leading tendencies, E\(^b\)(=D\(^\#\)) - E, is realized in the musical context.
The second large section (m. 42b, ff., see Fig. 26) provides an immediate contrast to the first. Each phrase begins with a one-beat anacrusis. In fact, the h-phrase (mm. 42b-44) uses a motive that ties the second eighth note across to the downbeat (mm. 42b-43a). James has identified the unstressed downbeat as an important feature of Franck's melodic style. He goes on to state that "this could possibly denote an inherent hesitancy." Without criticizing Franck's melodic compositional skill, it is certainly true that this device gives the music itself a sense of hesitancy. Closely related to this is the shift of accent from beat 1 to beat 4. Davies cites this tendency in his discussion of the Symphony. These related characteristics are not a prominent part of the two large piano works. (A few occasional occurrences may be mentioned: (1) the Aria theme (Ex. 74b), (2) the neighboring chords of the link to the Fugue, mm. 130-142, (3) the accent shift (but not tying over) that occurs in the Chorale theme, mm. 68b, ff., and perhaps (4) the articulated suspension figure (i.e., falling

---


109 By including this in the list, we must also add every melodic suspension!
second) of the Prelude, Chorale, and Fugue, though this figure is neither tied over nor shifted accentually.

In any case, the motive of the h-phrase is related to the third diminution so prominent in the opening section (Ex. 55) and so recently heard (mm. 38-39). The similarity between the motive of the i-phrase (mm. 44b-46) and the four-note chromatic line of mm. 38-39 may be noted. More accurately, however, this motive is derived from the filling of a melodic third, G♯ to B and B to D♯.

Example 55. Derivation of the h-phrase motive.

\[
\begin{array}{c}
\text{Example 55. Derivation of the h-phrase motive.}
\end{array}
\]

Beneath the surface disparities of texture and accentual patterns lies a harmonic continuity, that of mediant emphasis. The cadence of the h-phrase is I - V and that of the i-phrase is a V - i tonicization of iii, which is a prominent secondary key area of the first section. A modal shift to e minor occurs at m. 47 which makes the move (m. 48) to G major (another mediant relationship) seem diatonic. The melodic material is repeated identically with one melodic adjustment (m. 47, beat 4). As before, this phrase moves to its mediant, b minor. A summary of the cadence structure of this passage is given in Figure 31.
The following j-phrase (mm. 50b-52) exhibits an e-/mh sequence with an external interval of a downward major second. The B of the previous cadence is taken as a pedal in the first unit (with six-four and dominant ninth harmonies above). The connection to the A-pedal (mm. 51b-52) is by 1 ct resolution of the d°7. Though this harmonic connection exists, the sequence is of stronger associative effect.

Figure 31. Comparison of harmonic goals, Prelude (PAF), mm. 43-50.

\[\begin{align*}
\text{[E]}: & \quad B, \quad B^7, \quad g^\flat. \\
\text{[G]}: & \quad D^\flat, \quad b. \\
\text{[e]}: & \quad B, \quad j
\end{align*}\]

The k-phrase (mm. 52b-54) consists of a curious sequence that brings an authentic cadence, quite unexpectedly, on A. Each unit of the ee/mh sequence connects a diminished seventh chord to its triad equivalent, a succession that usually goes the other way (e.g., I - vii°7/IV). The succession is elaborated by a chromatic passing tone, using the ascending minor second motive, and this passing tone temporarily turns the diminished seventh into an augmented-sixth chord of the half-diminished seventh variety (Ex. 56). This variety of augmented sixth is stronger when it resolves to a minor triad (as in the former Prelude (PCF), mm. 22-23, Ex. 13) because three of the four
voices move. Here two common tones are held into the chord of resolution. The upward step motion (A - B - C*) arrives on C^[6] (m. 54, beat 1), which is resolved, in characteristic mediant fashion, to E dominant seventh (or III^[6] - V').

There is a sense of harmonic hesitancy, created by the reversal of expected functional relationships, that correlates to the melodic hesitancy.

Example 56. Surface augmented-sixth chord.

This C^[7] - E^7 exhibits the same downward half-step movement of the bass as does the Gr^[6] - V progression. The prominence of this voice leading motion leads Wegener, in his *Funktionstheorie* approach, to label these and other chords (V^[i]/vi, vii^[7]/vi, Gr^[6], bVI, ii^[6]*) as "Tr" from Trugschluss (deceptive cadence).\(^{110}\) The origin of this term, as Wegener shows, is the V' - bVI resolution in minor and the V - vi resolution in major.\(^{111}\) The concept has been expanded to include many chords with b6 or 65 as the lowest note, even when they occur before the dominant. Wegener does distinguish somewhat between the variants of

\(^{110}\)Wegener, *op. cit.*, 162-165.

\(^{111}\)Wegener, *op. cit.*, 151.
Trugschluss-chords, as shown in Figure 32a. On the other hand, the Stufentheorie approach distinguishes between these functions as shown in Figure 32b. This specific type of resolution (III\textsuperscript{6} - V\textsuperscript{7}), although a part of Franck's style, is not a prominent part of these two piano works.\footnote{One occurrence that may be cited is more embellishing than functional: Prelude (PCF), mm. 5 and 6, beat 1. See Wegener (op. cit., 164-165) for occurrences in other works.}

Figure 32. Comparison of Funktionstheorie (a) and Stufentheorie (b) symbols.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>a.</th>
<th>b.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>bVI</td>
<td>Tr</td>
<td>bVI</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gr\textsuperscript{6}</td>
<td>Tr\textsuperscript{7}</td>
<td>II (or bVI)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III\textsuperscript{6}</td>
<td>Tr(v)</td>
<td>III (or V)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>vii\textsuperscript{67}/vi</td>
<td>Tr(v)</td>
<td>III (or V)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ii\textsuperscript{34}</td>
<td></td>
<td>II</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The mediant key relationship continues with parallel phrases establishing A (mm. 54b-56) and C\textsuperscript{#} (mm. 56b-58). The second phrase is then followed by another statement of the k-phrase (mm. 58b-60) positioned so that it cadences in C\textsuperscript{#} major (m. 60).

Following is a variation on the opening h-i structure (m. 60b, ff., see Fig. 26). The melody is divided between the two thumbs, and elaboration occurs above (emphasizing g\textsuperscript{*}) and below (arpeggiated accompaniment). An adjustment occurs in the i-phrase (m. 64, beat 2) which allows the goal to be V (G\textsuperscript{#}) rather than iii (e\textsuperscript{*}). The result is that g\textsuperscript{*}
(the mediant of the original key of E) is a constant, as shown in Figure 33.

Figure 33. Constant goal keys.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>m. 42b</th>
<th>E</th>
<th>g*</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>m. 60b</td>
<td>C*</td>
<td>g*</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The adjustment is of no long-term consequence, however, since both cadences continue with tonic (m. 46b and m. 64b). The following parallel phrase (m. 64b, ff.) contains the same melodic adjustment necessary to modulate to the relative major (the upward fourth of beat 4 of m. 47 and m. 65). The latter statement is used to tonicize f* ([c*]: iv), and an alternation of tonic and subdominant chords (mm. 67-68) prepare for the relatively short dominant (m. 68, beat 4) and for the return of the a-phrase at m. 69.

The return of the opening material is short-lived, however, and the purpose of thematic recall is subsumed under the larger goal of preparing for the large half-cadence of m. 84, which marks the end of the second large section of the Prelude. The statement is the first in the minor mode; this necessitates some changes in harmonization (compare m. 3 and m. 71), although the melody is unchanged (except for modal inflection). The original c-phrase (consisting of successive elaborated dominants) does not fit in minor, so Franck had to completely
reconstitute it harmonically. Using the c-phrase motive (while changing the suspension to a chromatic passing tone), Franck uses a customary, though elaborated, means to tonicize the key of the Neapolitan, namely, the German sixth of C (A) becomes the dominant seventh of the Neapolitan (D). Interestingly enough, however, the first sonority following the A (m. 73, beat 2) is not D, but the French sixth of D. As the chord roots of Figure 34 show, the A of m. 73, beat 2 is approached as a D chord and resolved as an A chord. The E-rooted Fr (beat 3) forms an upper fifth in a similar manner to the first c-phrase (Fig. 28). Thus we note the dominant elaborated by an augmented sixth (two sonorities of similar quality separated by half-step), with the b6 - 5 motion so characteristic of Franck's dominants.

**Figure 34. Chord roots, Prelude (PAF), mm. 73-74.**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>73</th>
<th>74</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>C6</td>
<td>A7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fr6</td>
<td>A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D6</td>
<td>D</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A</td>
<td>E</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A</td>
<td>D</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The return (m. 75) is not made in the customary way, namely the reverse of the above ([D]: V = [C]: G6).

---

To change the mode of the c-phrase, the f minor chord of m. 5, beat 3, in particular, poses the first problem. Is it to be diminished? What about the 9 - 8 suspension?
Instead the D tonic is turned into a dominant seventh, which, with elaboration, resolves directly to G\(^\#\) dominant seventh. This resolution can be viewed as Neapolitan to dominant (if the C\(^\#\) of beat 3 is considered a chord tone) or as a tritone pivot (D\(^7\) to G\(^\#7\)). Note that the dominant is again elaborated by the b6 - 5 motion in the bass. Notice also that this device was prepared for by a new elaboration on V (m. 72, beats 3-4), which features not only the b6 - 5 connection, but also the augmented sixth - V\(^7\) succession.

It is the triumphant g2-phrase (mm. 77-78) and the chromatic d2-phrase (mm. 79-81) that provide the drive to the climax (mm. 82-83). The d2-phrase takes the harmonization of the former dl-phrase (m. 38) rather than the former d-phrase (m. 10). The material is sequenced by parallel motion, rather than by contrary motion, as before. As a result of this, the neighbor tone in the bass (beat 2 of each unit), formerly a contrapuntal device, takes more of a harmonic function, as the first beat (and first harmony) of each unit (Ex. 57). It still resolves, however, as an embellishing harmony (diminished seventh to major triad by 1 ct). Even though the half-diminished seventh (beat 1) does not resolve by continuation of the line (which is broken for the sake of the sequence), there is a functional connection between the units, that of
downward fifth ($\text{vii}^7/V - \text{vii}^9$ with equivalent roots of D - G and B$^b$ - D$^b$).

Even though the soprano continues linearly, connecting successive downward thirds, it contains adjustments

Example 57. Harmonic reduction, Prelude (PAF), mm. 79-82.

that are necessary to make the external interval a major third. (Recall that the model (m. 38) connected a minor third.) To do this, the upper neighbor tone is approached by half-step and resolved by whole-step (see Example 57, unit 1). The effect of continuation (as before) is felt by the treble voices, but the expected f minor triad (m. 80, beat 2) is reharmonized as a b$^9$ to be parallel to the previous unit.\textsuperscript{114} The sequence effects a complete circle, arriving on a$^9$ in m. 82, which resolves to an A

\textsuperscript{114}Interesting voice leading aspects of this sequence include: (1) the common tone held through each four-chord unit, and (2) the four consecutive parallel minor tenths (shown as minor thirds in Ex. 57).
major-major seventh, which is followed by a G♯ dominant seventh.

The third large section (m. 84, ff.), as did the second, provides a contrast of texture and construction. The melodic idea is built in two phrases (o and p, Ex. 58), with the first closing on ♯ (implying tonic) and the second closing on ♯ (implying V). The open-ended feature allows the subject (the o-p phrases) to be stated five times in succession. It is treated contrapuntally, with two discernible countersubjects (Ex. 59), although the first countersubject is a varied form of the last segment of the second countersubject. The subject alternates as either the highest or lowest voice, and the texture varies between three and four parts, except for the opening statement which begins alone and adds first a second then a third voice.

The important melodic features of the subject include:

1) successive fifths related by third (B - E and D♯ - G♯),

Example 58. Subject of o-p phrase group, Prelude (PAF), mm. 84b-92a.
though expressed registrally as a downward sixth, (2) the diminished third D – B⁴, half-step tendency tones to c⁴,¹¹⁵ and (3) the descending chromatic line from b⁶ to b⁷.

Example 59. Countersubjects of o-p phrase group.

The subject has basically the same harmonization for each of its five statements. Slight differences do occur and they arise from the different countersubjects. The o4-phrase (mm. 116b-120a) also has a different harmonization due to a contrapuntally-based reason: In that phrase the theme of the Finale is stated in the bass; thus, the harmonies of the subject are adjusted to conform to it. The character of the Finale theme is prepared for by introducing related motives in the counterpoint to the subject. One motive, that of two successive suspensions related by downward step (Ex. 60a), first occurs in m. 112. (Because of the prevailing half-note harmonic rhythm, the second falling second is often a passing tone, with the second note dissonant.) This motive and its

¹¹⁵This pattern is more common with respect to 5 rather than ʃ.
variants form the second half (A2) of the Finale theme, which is the primary counterpoint to the subject for p3 (mm. 112b-116a). A compression of this pattern (by making all the step half-steps, Ex. 60b), combined with an upward third (ea/m) sequence, forms the first half (A1) of the Finale theme, which is counterpointed with the subsequent subject (o4, mm. 116b-120a). Throughout the five statements of the subject, it is the contrapuntal element that provides most of the variety.

Example 60. Compression of falling second motive.

\[\text{Example 60. Compression of falling second motive.}\]

Returning to the harmonization of the subject (reduction given in Ex. 61), we find that the mediant-related fifths are given a harmonization that emphasizes this relationship. Each of the four pitches is the root of a dominant seventh, so the effect is that of an upward third sequence. This is especially apparent aurally in mm. 109-110. The connection between the two fifths is that of German sixth to dominant seventh, or in other words, two dominant sevenths separated by a half-step. Note that

\[\text{See the Finale theme, in this same key at m. 301b, ff.}\]
Example 61. Harmonic reduction, Prelude (PAF), mm. 92b-100a.
the succession of chord roots shows the reinterpretation of the E dominant seventh as an A\提高. This particular progression is emphasized in the second half with the succession, F\提高7 - F\提高 - E\提高. The last two of these chords are treated to a 1 ct resolution to a diminished seventh chord. This turns the German sixth into a vii\提高0. The first vii\提高0 (g\提高07) resolves to the local V\提高 (E) for a repetition of the pattern; the second resolves to its tonic, V (G\提高). Note that the progression of chord roots shows a conventional succession of downward fifths, with each one (F\提高, E, B, A\提高) being resolved as the tritone-related chord (C, B, A\提高).

We will recall this succession of Gr\提高6 - vii\提高02 - I as the same cadence that concludes the Chorale (PCF, mm. 114-115). We also recall the dominant seventh and its unexpected resolution as a prominent aspect of the first section (especially c-, a-, and e-based phrases). The first alternate harmonization occurs only in conjunction with the first countersubject; the second occurs in the o4-phrase.

Now let us examine some of the contrapuntal intricacies of this passage. Stressed dissonance is certainly a prominent feature. For example, the °7 - °7 succession occurs no fewer than five times during one statement (mm. 92b-100a). Another related technique is that of resolving a dissonance after the underlying harmony has changed. A case in point is the D\提高7 of m. 94. In fact, the F\提高 is never
heard; rather the 4 - 2 replaces the 3. The harmony changes to G\(^7\) on beat 3, and, when the 4 - 2 elaboration resolves, the pitch is F\(^\#\), necessary as the seventh of the G\(^\#\) dominant seventh. Another statement (m. 111) confirms the D\(^7\) as the correct reading. (Based on the model of m. 94, we might wonder if the A of m. 93 is dissonant, thus making the underlying sonority G\(^6\) rather than B\(^7\).)

Another aspect is the use of the same metric pattern with a shift of consonance. In particular, the pattern of mm. 97-98 (Ex. 62) is first consonance followed by dissonance. In the next measure, the dissonant note is first in the manner of an appoggiatura. This phrase also exhibits the "centrist" tendency of some of Franck's melodies, that is, the melody returns to the same note or set of notes. This characteristic has been cited as typical, but it is less prominent in these two piano works.\(^{117}\)

The fifth statement provides a dynamic and textural climax, with the o4-phrase featuring the running-eighth-note Finale theme in the bass (based on the pattern of Ex. 60b), and with the p4-phrase featuring right-hand arpeggiations. It must be noted that there is no harmonic resolution of climax, since the subject, in unfailing adherence to the

Example 62. Dissonance shift of motive.

original harmonic outline, concludes with the open-ended dominant (m. 124). The q-phrase (m. 124b, ff.) then is constructed in downward thirds with either an appoggiatura (m. 126) or retardation (m. 128) embellishing the final note. The harmonic effect of this passage is to negate the previous tonal area of C* by changing the dominant G# into a minor chord and to establish g minor as the tonality, though with important reference to its mediant, B major. The linear bass, from g° to c° (m. 124b-127), is a significant aspect of this phrase, as it provides direction to and from the mediant (though the harmonic succession of itself is functional). An upward minor third pivot allows the mediant tonicization (f° = a° = vii°2 to I°), and a vii°3 leads back to g° minor tonic. Underneath the consequent q-motive (m. 127), a completely conjunct inner voice begins as a countermelody; it smooths the connection between the relatively separated q- and h-motives.

The h-motive returns (mm. 128b-130), now in minor. The second one (mm. 129b-130) underscores the harmonic move to B. This move uses the same diminished seventh chord as
before \( f^7 = a^7 \), but the goal is not \( B^6 \), but \( F^\# \) dominant. We might compare m. 130 with m. 124, since they are somewhat parallel (\( G^\# \) and \( F^\# \) as dominants). Instead of a downward step sequence, Franck resolves the \( F^\# \) to its tonic, \( b \), to begin the second unit. The result is an external interval of an upward minor third, and the second unit (mm. 130b-136) is in \( b \) minor, concluding on A dominant seventh.

The following phrase (m. 136b-138) opens as a sequential pair with respect to the preceding sequence. The q-motive is sequenced up by minor third (expressed registrally as a downward major sixth), but the harmonization is changed in the following ways: (1) The mode is major, rather than minor. (2) The opening dominant (\( A^7 \)) is shifted up by major third (\( V^7/vi - vi \)), with the melody note not the octave but an unresolved sixth \( (6 - 5) \). (3) The same diminished seventh chord is used, but with respect to the shifted tonic of \( f^\# \). As a result, the upward third pivot (which is constant) returns D, rather than proceeding on to F. A summary of these three changes can be found in Example 63.

This two-measure segment (q2) is then treated to a downward major third sequence (mm. 138-140), and the expected goal of \( B^6_b \) is replaced by a \( b^7 \) (m. 140, beat 1). This change is harmonically significant for it represents a shift of function from tonic (as the corresponding \( D^6 \) was in
m. 138) to dominant. The b7, or rather its equivalents, d7 and Bb7 dominant seventh, become the important sonorities throughout the implied dominant pedal (mm. 140-146), preparing for the return of the opening theme in eb.

Example 63. Comparison of harmonizations, Prelude (PAF).

The four-chord succession of m. 140 illustrates one means of elaborating the 3ct resolution of diminished seventh to dominant seventh. The six-four intends to effect a voice exchange between the B and D. Upon the bass resolution to cb, however, the D is replaced by Eb, thus giving the Cb (now a part of a half-diminished four-three) further drive to Bb (Ex. 64). (The succession six-four, four-three, and dominant makes quite logical sense as ii6 -
Because the succession has a diminished seventh chord as its first sonority, a minor third pivot is easily possible, and this happens in measure 143. In effect, a different note of the diminished seventh is lowered (D to Dₜ), and a different dominant seventh (Dₜ⁷) results.

Example 64. Voice exchange, Prelude (PAF), m. 140.

Beginning at m. 147, the original theme returns as a "thumb-melody" in the key of eₜ minor. The texture is at once more active, for the accompaniment of eighth-note triplets has been replaced by sixteenth-notes. We recall that the earlier minor mode statement caused considerable adjustment in the c-phrase (mm. 73-76). For this reason, and due to the fact that we are not yet in the tonic key, Franck aborts the statement after completing the a- and b-phrases. A melodic adjustment allows the b-phrase to end on ⅞ and a harmonic adjustment directs a movement to the subdominant (Ex. 65). The apparent Dₜ half-diminished seventh (m. 150, beat 2) is not an altered subdominant of aₜ
(Ex. 66a), but rather an appoggiatura (without resolution) on a vii\(^{6}\) (Ex. 66b). That this is the harmonic function is made clear (1) by the context (B\(^{b}\) before, a\(^{b}\) following), and (2) by the spelling of the chord with a G\(^{b}\). In fact, the C\(^{b}\) was made necessary because of the melodic line.

Example 65. Prelude (PAF), mm. 149-150.

![Musical notation](image)

A second truncated statement follows (mm. 151-154) in a\(^{b}/g^{b}\), also moving to its subdominant (c\(^{b}\)) after an enharmonic shift at m. 153. Following this, a four-fold statement of the opening motive prepares for the "real" arrival (in m. 159). Both of the two harmonizations used are different from the vi - ii\(^{6}\) - i harmonization we have
seen earlier (mm. 1-2). The first (m. 155), coming off of a deceptive resolution (G*7 - A), uses the Neapolitan in place of the supertonic; the second, up by third from the first, uses a minor subdominant, as such: vi - iv - I (mm. 157-158). This vi - iv relationship has the same aural quality as does the i - bvi succession that we have seen earlier. Each of the two parallel segments concludes with an embellishing scalar line, rising from 1 to 5.

This repetitive statement of the a-phrase head and, to a lesser extent, the truncated a-b statements just prior make the full return at m. 159 even more satisfying. It is significant that the return was not by fifth down (through the dominant), but, after a series of downward fifths (e♭ - a♭ - c♯), by upward third (c♯ - E). This is directly related to the prominent mediant emphasis of this movement. It is also significant that the return of the tonic chord and key area precede the thematic return by two measures. Rather, it is the sequential effect (by diatonic thirds, of course) of the melodic line (E - F♯ - G', G' - A - B, B - C' - D'), and the resultant striving for, but falling short of, the melodic goal that really gives the downbeat of m. 159 its sense of arrival.

The return of the opening material begins the fourth large section, which is a shortened version of the first. Missing are the dominant statements (a1, b2, c1) and the
attendant modulations (e, f—see Fig. 26). The style is martial and triumphant, with the same offbeat accompaniment pattern that first appeared (but did not persist) with the c\(^b\) statement (a2, m. 69, ff.). The original harmonization remains intact until an upward half-step slip on beat 4 of m. 169 (Ex. 67). The previous B dominant seventh becomes a b\(^b\) diminished seventh. When it resolves to its major tonic (G\(_2\)ct), the result (C\(^b\) = D\(^b\)) is one-half step higher than the earlier V\(^7\) to V\(^6\) resolution (B\(^7\) = C). The subsequent half-cadence is identical, accounting for the transposition.

Example 67. Half-step slip, Prelude (PAF), m. 170.

![Example 67](image)

Although the a-phrase returns (m. 171) as before, the character is completely contrasting. The mood is calm and serene, with the melody in canon in the tenor following behind at a distance of one eighth-note. This canonic feature was foreshadowed by the accompaniment pattern in the earlier e\(^b\) statement (mm. 151-152). The b-phrase turns to f
minor, and takes its harmonization from the truncated a-b statements of mm. 147-154. This means that the goal harmony is not V, but V\(^7\)/IV. When the subdominant arrives (m. 175), it is turned into a dominant seventh, which is the opening harmony of a c-phrase. The earlier c-phrase (m. 5) began with a dominant seventh on \( \hat{5} \), so the cumulative effect (1) of the upward half-step (key of the Neapolitan) adjustment and (2) of the downward step adjustment (dominant seventh on \( \hat{4} \) rather than \( \hat{5} \)) is that of downward half-step. Two statements of a c-type phrase bring the series of dominant sevenths up a perfect fourth, to D\(^\#\). Unlike c/d (m. 8 to m. 9), which kept going up, and unlike c1/g (m. 31 to m. 32), which simply carried over the same dominant seventh (B\(^7\)), this connection (c5/g, m. 178 to m. 179) features a prominent mediant shift, that of D\(^\#7\) to B\(^7\). This is significant as the final reference of the Prelude to this important harmonic characteristic.

To summarize the features of the Prelude, we find a large four-part structure (Fig. 26) identified by marked thematic contrast and prominent cadences. The opening theme group recurs with all four sections, but provides the primary material for the first and last sections. The cadences of these two large sections are balanced. The large key relationships are conventional, exhibiting a large submediant movement (E to c\(^4\)) and a smaller dominant movement (E to B).
The opening phrase delineates two gestures that are of primary importance to the entire movement: (1) the emphasis of the mediant, and (2) the use of the upward fifth. Mediant relationships are expressed (1) in the relationship between tonal areas, (2) in third-related chords (particularly dominant sevenths), either in immediate succession or in widely separated, but corresponding, passages, and (3) in the melodic use of the third, expressed literally or in diminution. The upward fifth (or corresponding downward fourth) is expressed in cadence patterns and in sequential chord successions more than in melodic patterns. Davies cites the "descending fourth as a characteristic of the composition taken as a whole,"\(^{118}\) though its appearance is certainly more pronounced in the subsequent movements.

The sequence continues to play a prominent role, assuming both thematic and developmental functions. The use of external intervals of both minor and major thirds within the same sequence is perhaps dictated by the perfect fifth that their combination forms. Indeed, this specific technique allows Franck to create a chromatic surface (by means of exact internal intervals) and yet achieve his pre-determined diatonic goal.

\(^{118}\)Davies, op. cit., 71.
Counterpoint is an insistent part of the Prelude. Stepwise bass lines, as well as linear movement in several parts, create unusual harmonic successions which may have both functional and coloristic significance. An interchange of roles takes place, as contrapuntal elements become harmonic and vice versa. Its effects can also be felt (1) in the minute voice-leading connections between chords, (2) in melody combination, and (3) as the structural process for an entire large section.

The dominant seventh is a prominent sonority, with alternate resolutions (as German sixth, in sequence, to $b\text{VI}$ and VI) common. The diminished seventh chord is not nearly as prominent as in any movement of the former work. It appears with the most frequency in the c$\text{}$ contrapuntal section and in areas of thematic development and tonal instability.

Successive similar sonorities (particularly the dominant seventh) provide both coloristic and functional significance. Expected contrapuntal functions, such as the resolution of the chord seventh, are modified or eliminated entirely. The upward minor third pivot is again present, especially in sequential passages. Although tonal closure is very definite at certain points, tonal ambiguity is achieved through open-ended themes and symmetric third-related sequences.
Aria

The Aria is a movement of profound feeling. Characterized by an unostentatious expression, the movement is melodic and song-like, as the title suggests. Its simple lines and regular structure belie its complexity as contrapuntal elaboration and melodic diminution continuously vary the musical fabric. The Aria is constructed in two large sections framed by an introduction (which is more of a link) and a coda. Each section is almost identical in structure (Fig. 35). Completely in the key of A♭, the whole Aria is based on just four phrases. Each melodic phrase is stated immediately following in the bass as a type of voice exchange. Within each section an extension makes an internal division into halves. The second large section varies the diminution of the accompanying lines in counterpoint to the melody. The extreme restrictions of material, structure, and tonality in no way inhibit Franck from creating a movement of great musicality and one not without variety, motion, and climax.

The introduction commences with a G♯ dominant seventh, a sound immediately perceived as a mediant relationship to the key of the previous movement (E). Another third related chord follows (E dominant seventh),
Figure 35. Aria (PAF), structural diagram.

- denotes perfect authentic cadence
- denotes transient cadence
which resolves to D\textsuperscript{7}, the dominant of the goal key of A\textsubscript{b}. The association with the first movement is apparent: (1) the third related chords, (2) the dominant seventh sonority (and in particular, two dominant sevenths related by half-step), and (3) the large scale upward fifth (G\textsuperscript{#} - D\textsuperscript{#}). The melodic element features descending fourths in a quite remarkable similarity to the Chorale (PCF) theme (Ex. 68). Not only are all the notes present, but, as is the Chorale theme, the pattern is stated twice. The harmonic goal of each pattern (D\textsuperscript{7}/E\textsubscript{b7}) is considerably extended through arpeggiations and, in typical Franck style, an interweaving

Example 68. Comparison of Aria (PAF) introduction and Chorale (PCF) theme.

![Example 68. Comparison of Aria (PAF) introduction and Chorale (PCF) theme.](image)

of a motive derived from the head of the Aria theme proper (from the \textit{a}-phrase, mm. 205b-206). Spanning the interval of a fifth, this motive first connects the chord fifth to the root (mm. 194-196), then connects the chord seventh to the third (mm. 201-203).

Because of the limited material, the harmonic and melodic character of the movement is almost completely
defined by three primary phrases, denoted a, b and c (Ex. 69). A fourth phrase, bl, rounds out the period; it is similar to b, especially in its second half. (Note the repeat of the cadence and cadence approach—a similar principle as in the Prelude (PAF), but on a smaller scale.) The important melodic and harmonic characteristics of these phrases, then, are heard with every iteration, and thus become easily recognizable features of the movement.

Example 69. Aria (PAF) theme.

As we might expect, Franck uses sequence as a means of constructing melodic and harmonic patterns. Although the a-phrase (Ex. 69) is not strictly sequential, it is composed of two two-measure units that are similar. The melody of the b-phrase, also formed in two parts, is composed of sequence, and the harmonies are partially sequential. Note that vi - iii exhibits the same relationship (that of upward fifth) as does iv - i. The
midpoint of the sequence exhibits the vi – iv connection, which is the same as i – bvi. This succession, as I have noted before, can be explained on several grounds: (1) as logical voice leading (especially the F – F\textsubscript{b} – E\textsubscript{b} line), (2) as a functional progression (down by third) with a chromatic alteration, and (3) as a melodic/harmonic sequence, the intersection of whose units may or may not have any functional connection. Though this last reason may be the primary associative criterion, this fact does not diminish the importance of examining the surface relationships.

This vi – iv movement is heard in each b-phrase (four occurrences) and in each c-phrase (four occurrences). The c-phrase occurrence (Ex. 69) is also a part of a sequence, but, unlike b, the vi – iv movement is the point of departure rather than the point of repetition. There, the vi – iv\textsuperscript{6}, mitigated by an anticipation, is sequenced down by step, V – bIII\textsuperscript{6}.\textsuperscript{119} Note the alterations present in the second unit: (1) the suspension on V, and (2) the quality is major, rather than minor. This last alteration allows two common tones (E\textsubscript{b} and G\textsubscript{b}) to be held into the following diminished seventh chord.

\textsuperscript{119}Note that, while this succession does not involve a diminished seventh chord, it does exhibit an upward minor third pivot, i.e., the expected goal of A\textsubscript{b} is replaced by C\textsubscript{b}. 
The harmonization of the conclusion of the c-phrase uses a conventional progression, that of vii°/V - V - I in the key of the dominant (e.g., m. 228). The A⁷ is treated to a 1-ct resolution and becomes an A⁷, however, before resolving to Bb. Though this A⁷ is merely passing it does create the impression of successive dominant sevenths related by upward half-step.

The next prominent stylistic feature is that of modal shift. Both the b- and the bl-phrases (eight occurrences) turn to the parallel minor in the second half of the phrase (with iv playing an important role as the first "borrowed" harmony). At the cadence the parallel major returns with what is perceived as a tierce de Picardie. While an occasional modal shift is found in the remainder of these two piano works, this particular type of modal shift is more characteristic of the organ works.

The "new" part of the bl-phrase displays a harmonic (but not melodic) sequence (Ex. 70). Note that the root of the iv⁶ is delayed by a retardation. Note also the embellishment of the diminished seventh (m. 231). Though the underlying progression is that of g°⁷ to A⁷ (A⁷: vii°⁷ - V⁷/IV), an equivalent downward fifth, the diminished seventh is given extra color by the premature resolution of one of its members, but not the one that would result in its equivalent dominant seventh (F⁷=E⁷ to F⁷, creating E⁷⁷⁷).
Instead, the D\textsuperscript{b} resolves to C, thus temporarily forming a C dominant seventh. That this sonority was in Franck's mind is verified by the spelling of the diminished seventh (as an e\textsuperscript{7} rather than as a g\textsuperscript{7}).

Example 70. Aria (PAF), mm. 230-232a.

![Music notation](image)

The "equal time" given to the bass statement of all the material is in no way less musically effective. Franck creates an additional melody line for the upper part out of the previously stated harmonies. Particularly effective is the countermelody to the first bass c-phrase (mm. 233b-237).

This invertible arrangement inevitably leads to dissonant sonorities, which, by virtue of the melodic character of the bass line, are certainly acceptable. Nevertheless, Franck, in a manner similar to the invertible portions of the fugue, minimizes the effect of the dissonances in several ways: (1) by the use of seventh chords and, to a lesser extent, diminished seventh chords (m. 221, beat 1), (2) by the relegation of the six-four to a
weak beat (m. 218, beat 2; m. 220, beat 2), (3) by the change in harmonization (Ex. 71a), and (4) by delaying through suspensions (Ex. 71b and c). In Example 71a, a root position ii° is prevented by changing the harmony into a V. In Example 71b and c, the five-three sonority would invert to a six-four, but the six is delayed by an accented

Example 71. Compensation for dissonance created by voice inversion.

dissonant seven. (Note, in Ex. 71b, a new alteration to the "i - bvi" succession, that of major "tonic." Now, all three voices move by half-step.) The a-phrase is the only one that makes prominent use of (harmonically unsupported)
melodic appoggiaturas. The transfer of this line to the bass (mm. 209b-213) makes for a wonderful series of accented bass dissonances.

Following each of the internal halves (a-b and c-b1), a four-measure extension is added (mm. 221b-225 and mm. 241b-245). Over a tonic pedal, the two upper voices proceed linearly and imitatively, using a motive that is vaguely reminiscent of the opening idea and of the b and b1 phrases with its descending fourths. These two lines express a three- to four-voice texture that is basically that of descending six-three, then seven-five-three sonorities (Ex. 72b). Note that the movement is diatonic with one degree for each quarter note for two measures. Then it becomes chromatic, with one degree for each half-note. The effect of the first chromatic note, G\textsuperscript{b}, is to direct the motion downward to the subdominant. The lowering effect is continued as the accompanying C proceeds C - C\textsuperscript{b} - B\textsuperscript{b} - B\textsuperscript{bb}, and, bypassing A\textsuperscript{b}, to G, which, as a leading tone, resolves to A\textsuperscript{b}. Note the hint of the B\textsuperscript{bb} major sonority, the tritone substitute (and augmented-sixth substitute) for the dominant B\textsuperscript{b}!

When this extension occurs at the end of the c-b1 section (mm. 214b-245), the A\textsuperscript{b} tonic pedal is still present, but the imitative passage of the right hand is transposed up by perfect fourth (Ex. 72c), a sort of V - I relationship.
Example 72. Aria (PAF) extension, mm. 221-225a (a and b), mm. 241-245a (c and d).
The chromatic alterations come earlier, hastening the arrival of the subdominant. (Both the $B_{bb}$ and $G_b$ are related to the key of $D_b$.) Two individual notes are altered from the transposition (indicated by the asterisks in Ex. 72c), and the end is altered to allow a linear arrival on $A_b$ rather than $D_b$. Comparing the respective last measures, note the very different function of $B_{bb}$ ($2\sharp$, going to $7$) and $D\sharp$ ($4\sharp$, going to $4$), even though they are exactly transposed.

In the second large section the melodic voice exchange is between the tenor and the bass. This gives Franck eight successive phrases for which to create a new melodic line in counterpoint with the lower parts. One phrase (c, mm. 273b-277) uses the same countermelody as before (mm. 233b-237) with additional arpeggiation. Most, however, are new melodies. The accompanimental rhythm quickens (Fig. 36), hastening the sense of climax.

Figure 36. Accompanimental rhythm.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>T:</th>
<th>a</th>
<th>b</th>
<th>ext</th>
<th>c</th>
<th>b1</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>B:</td>
<td>a</td>
<td>b</td>
<td>c</td>
<td>c</td>
<td>b1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

rhythm: \[ \begin{array}{cccccccc}
\cdot & \cdot & \cdot & \cdot & \cdot & \cdot & \cdot & \cdot \\
\cdot & \cdot & \cdot & \cdot & \cdot & \cdot & \cdot & \cdot \\
\cdot & \cdot & \cdot & \cdot & \cdot & \cdot & \cdot & \cdot \\
\cdot & \cdot & \cdot & \cdot & \cdot & \cdot & \cdot & \cdot \\
\cdot & \cdot & \cdot & \cdot & \cdot & \cdot & \cdot & \cdot \\
\cdot & \cdot & \cdot & \cdot & \cdot & \cdot & \cdot & \cdot \\
\cdot & \cdot & \cdot & \cdot & \cdot & \cdot & \cdot & \cdot \\
\cdot & \cdot & \cdot & \cdot & \cdot & \cdot & \cdot & \cdot \\
\end{array} \]

Franck rarely misses an opportunity to construct sequential countermelodies, even when neither the underlying melody nor the harmony is sequential. Parallel sonorities
furnish an opportunity to use parallel melodic ideas (e.g., mm. 258, 271, 272).

The second extension is missing from the second large section. Instead, a coda follows (m. 282, ff.), which does make use of the falling fourth motive. Its treatment is more harmonic, rather than linear. In fact, the thematic connection relates directly to the opening. The placement within the scale and the harmonization are completely different. At the opening, the melody began on \( \hat{1} \) harmonized by a \( V^7/IV \). Here, the melody begins on \( \hat{3} \) harmonized by a diminished seventh chord (Ex. 73a). Note that the melody note itself (C) is a non-chord tone, being derived from the implied \( B^b \) (Ex. 73b). The underlying harmony is that of \( vii^07 \) over a tonic pedal (Ex. 73c), and it resolves to an \( A^b7 \) dominant seventh in the next measure (m. 283). The spelling of the chord with an \( E^b \), rather than an \( F^b \), is significant, for it creates a reference to the equivalent C dominant seventh, strengthened, of course, by the presence by the "non-chord tone" C. This succession of two dominant sevenths related by downward major third is the very same progression as the opening (\( A^b7 - E^7 \)) transposed up by major third. The listener has also been reminded of this progression in the meantime during each c-phrase (Ex. 70).

The following harmony (m. 284), also a diminished seventh, we expect to be an embellishing harmony, that of
Example 73. Suspended diminished sevenths.

the 1st resolution (d⁷) to A⁰. Rather than resolving to its tonic, it resolves as a vii⁰⁷/V, to E⁷. This diminished seventh is also accorded a non-chord tone (G). The implied dominant seventh (G⁷) completes the reference to the opening progression (Fig. 37). The function of the progression is largely I to V (as indicated by the A⁳ pedal); on the surface, the succession of diminished sevenths down by half-step implies a downward fifth motion, V - I - V/V - V.

Figure 37. Relationship of harmony of Aria coda to that of the introduction.

m. 197  A⁵⁷ (=I)  F⁵⁷  E⁵⁷ (=V)
m. 282  (C7)  A⁷ (=I)  (G7)  E⁵⁷ (=V)

The following phrase (mm. 286-289) displays an e-/m sequence, although the harmonization forces the melody to remain related to the key. The motive used for the sequence (Ex. 74a) is not directly stated in the Aria, but it is related to the structural shapes of several phrases (Ex. 74b). The C⁴ of m. 287 is certainly a reference to the "suspended" dominant sevenths of the previous phrase. The
deceptive resolution of $D^b_4$ allows a tonicization of the subdominant before closing on V (m. 289).

Example 74. Aria coda motive.

The final phrase employs a resolution heard previously, that of $V'/IV$ to $vii^7/V$, an equivalent of downward half-step-related diminished sevenths, or upward-step-related dominant sevenths ($I - V/V$).\(^{120}\) From this diminished seventh, a voice exchange takes place (Ex. 75). This, along with the two common tones, explains the reason for the minor six-four in m. 291. At the resolution of the voice exchange, the $D^b_4$ does not reappear, nor does the $C^b$ continue. Both are altered to form a subdominant major.

\(^{120}\)The occurrences are as follows: mm. 223-224, and mm. 283-284.
seventh, which leads to the final authentic cadence. The element of surprise comes at the point of the IV\(^7\) when the two-measure-long C\(^b\) is replaced by C\(^\#\). This marks the end of the chromatic inflection of the coda, and the return to the simple diatonic vocabulary that marked the opening phrase of the Aria. The reason for this sudden shift and for the seemingly unrelated sequence of the previous phrase will be made apparent in the final movement.

Example 75. Incomplete voice exchange, Aria (PAF), mm. 290-292.

To summarize the harmonic and contrapuntal principles of the Aria, we see first of all a binary structure framed by an introduction and coda. The second is a repetition of the first with countermelodies and various accompanimental patterns added. The binary principle permeates all levels of formal organization. Each large section is divided into two halves, each extended by a tonic pedal. Within the small sections a voice exchange takes place, either phrase by phrase, or two phrases at a time. All of these techniques are related to the concept of pairing, that of juxtaposing the same material with an element varied.
Correspondingly, all the sequences of this movement consist of only two units.

The emphasis on the mediant, present throughout the whole work, continues in this movement in the form of third-related dominant sevenths. Successive diminished sevenths tend to take on a more coloristic function, though their use and their resolution is strictly under the control of the larger harmonic plan. Another distinguishing harmonic resolution is that of vi - iv (equivalent to i - bvi), a movement which has sequential, voice leading, coloristic, and harmonically functional aspects.

Counterpoint plays an integral role in the Aria, not only in the imitative "interweaving" technique (used to prolong a harmony), but also in the construction of several melodies based on the same harmonic background. Local counterpoint (that is, counterpoint which is confined to the succession of one or two chords) is used to create ambiguity in the harmonic progression, resulting in "alternate sonorities" and "alternate progressions" which may have functional or coloristic significance.

While the harmonic movement is restricted in this movement, the principle of using a chromatic surface to achieve a diatonic goal is seen in the c-phrase. More indirectly, this principle is related to the minor mode
shift (through iv) of the b- and b1-phrases and the subsequent return of major at the cadence.

Finale

Having been lulled into tranquility by the close of the Aria, the listener is jolted suddenly by the opening of the Finale, with its dramatic introduction and its listless theme, marked Allegro molto ed agitato. Even within the movement itself, we find extremes and contrasts, from the very chromatic, tempestuous A-theme, to the buoyant, diatonic C-theme, to the placid recall of the Aria theme.

Cast in a large rondo-like structure (Fig. 38), the Finale features large-scale alternation between themes. The key scheme is progressive, since the opening key is not that of the end. Beginning in C#, the movement progresses through D (C-theme), A♭ (C-theme), g♯ (A-theme), D♭ (return of Aria theme), to e (A-theme). This e minor then becomes E major for the final A-theme and cyclic recall. E is, of course, the key of the Prelude. As seen in the Prelude, the recapitulation (return of the opening material) is abbreviated, at least in the return of Finale themes. Several themes from the previous movements return, singly and in combination with each other. The primary theme of the Finale does not combine well with the others except to furnish an ominous interjection in between phrases or to suggest an
. denotes perfect authentic cadence
, denotes transient cadence
x denotes avoided cadence
accompanimental pattern. The listener has, however, already heard it—in the Prelude—combined with that movement's c♯ theme (o-p phrases, mm. 112b-120). A tranquil passage combining Prelude and Aria themes leads to a quiet close.

The opening A1-theme (Ex. 76) is constructed from a chromatically descending four-note motive, elaborated by appoggiatura or suspension. This pattern is then treated to an ea sequence, with external intervals of major, then minor thirds. As an unaccompanied melody, the A1-theme offers little to establish the tonality, except for the leap of G♯ to D♯ (implying V) and of B♯ to F♯ (implying V⁷ or vii°), until the final measure when a vii°⁷ - i progression is outlined. The consequent, A2, is also sequential (Ex. 77). This pair of phrases is open-ended harmonically, that is, the middle cadence is tonic, and the final is dominant, thus allowing an immediate repetition in the same key. This harmonic structure is the same as the c♯ minor theme of the Prelude.

The Finale opens with two false starts, with the first using the first measure of A1 and the second using the
second measure. Accordingly, the half-note chords that stop the line agree with the implied harmonies of each fragment (V\(^7\) then vii\(^{67}\)). The theme then is stated fully (m. 301b, ff.) in broken octaves without harmonization. A second complete statement is then heard (mm. 309b-317a) with an added pedal in the right hand. The pitch G\(^\flat\) is changed to F\(^x\) only as vii\(^{67}\) is heard.

Example 77. Finale A2-phrase, mm. 305b-309a.

The third complete statement (mm. 317b-325a, Ex. 78a) shifts the melodic line to the soprano and gives it a full four-voice harmonization. The harmonic underlay is concealed not only by the chromatic theme but also by the presence of non-chord tones in other voices. Further, the falling second is sometimes dissonant-consonant and sometimes consonant-dissonant. In this first layer of harmonic reduction (Ex. 78b), I have omitted the chromatic passing note in the middle of a four-eighth-note figure (mm. 317b, 318b), except where the pair of notes is the consonance (m. 319b). In the second layer I have omitted the deeper non-chord tones, thus revealing the underlying harmonic progression. Several aspects may be noted: (1)
Example 78. Finale, mm. 317b-325a, and harmonic reduction.
The linear bass line connects 1 with 6. (2) The progression of iv⁰ - V⁷ is observable on both structural (m. 320) and embellishing (m. 321) levels. This progression emphasizes the half-step descent by coupling two voices in a parallel movement. (3) The progression of N - vii⁰ - i is sequenced down by major second (in the key of c⁹, then b). (4) The cadence of the A2 phrase is vii⁰⁴ - V, with a prominent 4 to 1 bass motion. (5) The succession of chord roots reveals a conventional progression.

Returning to the surface, we find many implications made by the various contrapuntal movements:

(1) With the falling second as such a prominent gesture, we can expect to see the °7 - °7 succession. Indeed, four of the six diminished seventh chords are embellished in this way (one in "six-five" position, the other three in "seven" position).

(2) The surface contrapuntal motions in mm. 319b-320a cause an interesting interplay of harmonic relationships. The underlying progression, as we have already seen, is vii⁰⁷/iv - iv (Ex. 79a). This requires making the soprano F consonant and respelling it as an E⁹. An alternate view of the progression, and one substantiated by certain surface motions, is that of E⁹ to A³ (Ex. 79b). This view keeps the same dissonance pattern for the four-eighth-note group as the previous measures (mm. 317b, 318b), namely, a quarter
note suspension, filled in with a chromatic passing tone. (The notation of this pitch as an $E^\natural$ supports its function as a local passing tone.) Thus only the last eighth-note of the four (E) is consonant. The resolution is, indeed, an $A^\natural$ on the surface. The $E^\flat$ passing tone temporarily creates the sound of a d minor six-four, before resolving to $F^\natural$. This motion creates a passing reference to the key of the Neapolitan (significant as the key of the next main theme), and to the $i - ^bvi$ relationship (in reverse order, here).

Example 79. Alternate progression.

![Example 79. Alternate progression.](image)

(3) In the sequential measures of A2 (mm. 322-323), the initial note of the four-eighth-note group is given consonant support, thus making only the middle pair dissonant. A local Neapolitan six-four is formed in each measure.

(4) The succession of harmonies in m. 324 is elaborated by the same falling second. The underlying progression is that of $I^\flat - V/V$, similar to the $iv^\flat - V$ noted above, with its double half-step descent. Since the opening chord is major, however, the bass must go through two half-steps to reach its goal of $D^\flat$. The chord on beat 2 is clearly $vii^\flat/V$. 


(Ex. 80a), but the contrapuntal context (namely, the suspension figure) makes the listener want to hear the B as consonant (Ex. 80b). As a result, a definite pre-dominant function ($b\text{vi}^7$), heightened by the half-step bass movement, is given to the chord.

Example 80. Alternate harmonic succession, Finale (PAF), m. 324.

Following this harmonized statement of the A-theme, a nine-measure extension (mm. 325b-334) provides a large arrival on V (m. 334). Opening as a repeat of A1 over a dominant pedal, this phrase diverges after two measures. The $b\text{lo}^7$ of m. 327 does not resolve to an $e\text{lo}^7$ ($\text{vii}^6^7 - \text{vii}^6^7/\text{iv}$) but to an $A^7$ (German sixth). This 1st resolution of $\text{vii}^6^7$ to $G^6$ is the reverse of the prominent Chorale cadence (Ex. 23). A succession of downward dominant sevenths, related by half-step, follows in a sequential pattern (Ex. 81). This series is, in effect, successive $G^6$ - $V^7$ progressions, with the latter being reinterpreted as the $G^6$ of the next key down. This illustrates the principle that successive similar sonorities need not be functional, though they may be. The controlling factor may be melodic or coloristic in nature. Mason notes Franck's
tendency to move sonorities by half-step: "His entire
tone-mass has a trick of sliding bodily up or down, which
disconcerts, even while it fascinates, one who is accustomed
to harmonic stability."\textsuperscript{121}

Example 81. Finale (PAF), mm. 327-330.

Similar to the opening, a 1 ct resolution to a
diminished seventh is employed to end the series (mm.
329b-330). This succession (F\textsuperscript{7} - g\textsuperscript{107}) provides just the
diminished seventh chord that was expected when the phrase
diverged (g\textsuperscript{107}, see m. 319b). The g\textsuperscript{107} resolves to its tonic
(A), which becomes VI in the key of c\textsuperscript{*} minor. Both the

\textsuperscript{121}Daniel Gregory Mason, From Grieg to Brahms (New York:
supertonic and the dominant chords have a lowered fifth, thus making them into augmented-sixth types. The resolution to tonic is avoided, with $\text{VI}_6$ replacing the tonic. With this deceptive resolution, the interval of the augmented sixth resolves outward to the octave on the third of the chord (Ex. 82a), a resolution aurally similar to the "iv$^b_7$" augmented sixth that is a part of the major mode (Ex. 82b). Interestingly enough, the sonority of Example 82a is a rare occurrence of the "triad" form of the augmented sixth, that is, with major third and diminished fifth. Almost always the seventh ($F^\#$ in this key) is present in order to mitigate the harsh sound.

Example 82. Augmented-sixth resolutions.

The transitional B-theme (m. 335, ff.) opens up the texture, thus preparing for the ebullient C-theme (m. 343, ff.). Preparation is made in a more subtle way, as well. The primary motion of the C-theme is that of an upward

---

122The six-three sonority is elaborated by a six-four ($f^\#$) sonority. This is an interesting reversal from m. 320 of surface relationships. There, the surface A sonority turned out to be an $f^\#$ chord (Ex. 79); here, the surface $f^\#$ turns out to be an A chord.
second (from 5), followed by a returning motion. This upward second can be seen in the downward sevenths (mm. 335-336, 339-340, Ex. 83a), in the upward step-related diminished sevenths (mm. 337, 341, Ex. 83b), and in the harmonic implications of the melodic line (mm. 335-336, 339-340, Ex. 83c). Even though the A-theme exhibits a structural rising second (Ex. 78c, m. 317b), the overwhelming predominance of falling seconds (structural, and especially surface) makes the C-theme even more of a contrast.

Example 83. Upward step movement.

The B-theme, in all three of its appearances, introduces the C-theme and modulates to its key (Fig. 38). Type 1a (Ex. 84a) consists of a four-measure unit, and connects a given tonic to a new tonic up by perfect fourth. The first two measures alternate between i and V. The third and fourth measures feature three successive diminished seventh chords, related by upward major second. Since two diminished sevenths separated by an upward major second are equivalent to those a downward minor second apart, the functional progression is that of downward fifth (viiº⁰/V -
Example 84. B-theme: Type 1a, mm. 335-339a (a); Type 1b, mm. 339-343a (b); Type 2a, mm. 347-350a (c); Type 2b, mm. 350-353a (d).
vii\textsuperscript{07} - vii\textsuperscript{07}/iv, or more generally, II - V - I). As before, the successive similar sonorities are both functional and coloristic. Type 1b uses the same material but adds an upward minor third pivot to the final diminished seventh (Ex. 84b). The resultant connection is that of upward minor sixth. Type 2a (Ex. 84c) consists of a three-measure unit, using the first two measures of Type 1. The third measure takes a new initial diminished seventh (equivalent rather than 1\textsuperscript{ct}), resolves to a different dominant seventh (downward minor third pivot), and extends that dominant seventh with a ii\textsuperscript{64} - V\textsuperscript{7} progression (m. 349). The resultant connection is an upward major second. Type 2b moves up by major second, but then replaces the extension with a sequence of the vii\textsuperscript{64} - V\textsuperscript{7} progression up by second, making the connection that of an upward major third (Ex. 84d). A summary of these types and the key connections they achieve is given in Figure 39.

All of the resultant key goals are significant structurally (Fig. 38). The first represents the key of the Neapolitan, important as the first diversion from tonic and as a large-scale expression of the half-step relationship. The second goal (Fig. 39), A\textsuperscript{b}, represents the enharmonic key of the dominant (g\textsuperscript{b} minor), which is the key of the second large A-theme statement. The third goal (Fig. 39), E, is no modulation at all, though the effect of
modulation is still present. This "reconnection" to the tonic is a further characteristic that identifies a "recapitulation" section (although the tonic is not the same as the exposition, but rather is the deepest referential tonic, that of the work as a whole).

Figure 39. Comparisons of the harmonic connections of B.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>mm. 335-342</th>
<th>mm. 347-352</th>
<th>mm. 445-451</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a</td>
<td>c' 1a f' 1b (b) D</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b</td>
<td>D 2a E 2b (f') A</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c</td>
<td>e 1b (a) C 2b (D) E</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The C-theme (m. 343, ff.) is quite a surprising phrase, because of several factors: (1) the sudden shift to major, (2) the contrast with the listless, chromatic A-theme, (3) its prolonged harmonic rhythm (fourteen beats for the first tonic chord), and (4) the added sixths and added sevenths on the D chord.\textsuperscript{123} The character of it is "popular," in a manner similar to the g-phrase of the Prelude (PAF, mm. 32-37) and to the bravura coda of the Fugue (PCF, mm. 369-379). Demuth describes this subject as "vulgar and commonplace." He goes on to say that "while it has considerable verve and triumph there is no gainsaying its earthiness."\textsuperscript{124}

\textsuperscript{123}The cadence introducing the C-theme, that of vii\textsuperscript{7} - I, complete with 7 - 5 motion on the diminished seventh, is the very same (and in the same key) as the final cadence of the first movement of the Symphony.

\textsuperscript{124}Demuth, \textit{César Franck, op. cit.}, 154.
Consisting of only four measures, the phrase makes use of the raised fourth scale degree, as it prolongs the tonic harmony and leads to the dominant goal. The use of the raised fourth scale degree does not, as Wegener asserts, arise from the Lydian scale, but rather from the harmonic implications of the embellishing (1 ct-related) $d^7$ ([Ab]: vii$^7$/V, or generally II).

Immediately following one four-measure phrase, another B-section (see Fig. 39) prepares for a second statement (of C) in A$^b$ (mm. 353, ff.). Following this, the tenor now takes the melody in the next phrase in a voice exchange typical of the Aria. Several harmonic adjustments occur: (1) The tonic chord with the added sixth is turned into a 1 ct-related diminished seventh, still embellishing. (2) The melody is stripped of its eighth-note arpeggiated embellishments (mm. 357b, 358b) due to the accompanying triplet countermelody. (3) The tonic of m. 359 is turned into a dominant seventh. This adjustment serves two purposes: (1) It gives a temporary feeling of functional progression to the 1 ct-elaborated dominant seventh that follows (Ex. 85), since the A$^b$ dominant seventh is equivalent (related by 3 ct) to the diminished seventh that follows. (2) It prepares for a movement to the subdominant.

\[125\] Wegener, op. cit., 133.
that occurs in the corresponding place of the next phrase (mm. 363-364). (Note also at the point where the phrases diverge—beat 1 of m. 360 and m. 364—the same melody note occurs, A/B♭, but with a completely different function: V⁷ and IV.).

Example 85. Prolongation of A♭ harmony.

Two contrapuntal procedures concern us in m. 364. First, with the double embellishment, the surface sound is that of V7 to V⁷VI (A♭ to A♯). Second, the connection to the next phrase (and the next key) is more the result of voice leading than of harmonic succession. As the harmonic reduction (Ex. 86) shows, the upper two voices move up by chromatic half-step. As they reach their linear goal (C/B and A♭/G♯), the harmony and key are changed to fit. The result is a succession of downward major third-related keys (A♭ to E) that sounds as an upward minor third (D♭ to E).

This second phrase (connecting A♭ to E) is employed again (mm. 365-368) to move the tonal level to C. Upon reaching C, only the last measure of the sequence is stated (m. 369), and E♭, as dominant, arrives. We have seen this
technique before, that a long sequence may use shortened forms of the units for its final statement(s), thereby heightening the sense of motion toward a goal. The E♭ dominant is extended, and it leads to the dominant minor (g♯) statement of the A-theme.

Example 86. Linear connection, Finale (PAF), m. 364.

The A-theme (m. 376, ff.) is stated in g♯ without change of harmonization until m. 387 (in the extension). The controlling factor of the earlier passage (mm. 327b-329), that of dominant sevenths related by downward half-step, is changed to upward dominant sevenths related by both half- and whole-step. A huge ee/mh sequence (with units of four measures) is created with an external interval of an upward minor third (compare m. 384 with m. 388). The elaborated movement of V⁷ to Gr⁶ is still present, but rather than resolving the Gr⁶ successively downward to V⁷, it resolves as a V⁷ in this manner: V⁷ – vιi⁴⁹/νi – VI. This "VI" then becomes V⁷ for the opening of the next unit (Ex. 87). The point at which the two phrases diverge is concealed by overlapping in some voices. In other words, the expected V⁷ is replaced by a vιi⁴⁹ (3
ct-related), which resolves back to Gr in a ct embellishing fashion.

Example 87. Finale (PAF), mm. 385-388.

The third unit begins on an A dominant seventh (m. 392), but breaks before it goes anywhere. The downward movement (present in the earlier passage) occurs only once here, as the A resolves as a Gr to G. Note that the large-scale relationship is a diatonic one, that of downward fifth (D, m. 384, to G, m. 395b). Again, we see illustrated the principle that a referentially diatonic goal is given a sense of remoteness by the chromatic surface relationships.

The minor mode is softened by two successive minor-to-major chromatic alterations. First, on the A (D: Gr)
an F - E appoggiatura is replaced by an F' - E (m. 395). This does not relate to the coming key of D\(\text{b}\) (indeed, F is the diatonic 3), but rather to the subsequent chromatic shift. Second, a parallel movement changes an E - D\(\text{#}\) appoggiatura into an E' - D' (m. 396a). This does relate enharmonically to the coming key of D\(\text{b}\), as 3\(\text{b}\) - 4\(\text{b}\).

The Aria theme (mm. 396b-413) concludes the first exposition-like section. The accompaniment is in arpeggiated sixteenths and the mood is calm except for the ominous punctuation of the A-theme pattern (using the head of the Aria as a motive) in the left hand (mm. 403-405). The foreboding statement fulfills its prediction as the final cadence (mm. 412-413) is rather dramatically avoided (tonic being replaced by G\(\text{#}\)6 in four-two position), and the A-theme texture and mood return. The placement of the Aria in this particular position fulfills several important roles: (1) Structurally, it is a balance (Fig. 38) to the thematic recall that happens at the end of the second large section. (2) Harmonically, it reminds the listener (for the last time) of the tonal level (but not the mode) of the opening.

As explained above, the second half of the Finale forms sort of an abbreviated recapitulation. Many structural parallels exist, both large- and small-scale. The opening sequence of the A2 phrase in linear form (mm. 413b-427a)
corresponds to the linear opening of the movement. Here, as before, a pedal is articulated in the right hand on 5. One additional movement of the pedal, besides 4 over vii$^{o7}/V$, is present here (compare with mm. 313b-317b), and that is $\text{b}_7$ (mm. 416, 420, 424). The A2 phrase is sequenced up by minor second, and, since the units are primarily linear, there is no real "harmonic" connection between the keys of d, e$^b$, and e. The last A2 unit is extended to allow a greater arrival on its half cadence (mm. 426-427).

The return of the A material (m. 427, ff.) in harmonized form marks the beginning of a large-scale copy, with transposition from c$^d$ to e. The A1-, A2- and A-extension-phrases and most of the B1-phrase are restated without harmonic change. The melody itself is doubled in octaves, unlike before, through the first two phrases.

The following B1- and B2-phrases (mm. 445-451), as mentioned earlier, connect the A and C material, and perform modulations which return to the same key (E) for the "recapitulation" statement of C (Fig. 39).

At this point (m. 452), another large-scale copy (from the exposition) begins. This includes the following phrases: C1 (triumphant, chordal), C2 (triplet accompaniment), C3 (moving to the subdominant), and C-extension. In perfect balance, the arpeggiated dominant seventh that previously led to the return of A (m. 376b) now
leads to a return of the A melodic pattern, used as an accompanimental figure to the Prelude theme (m. 476, ff.). The running eighth-note octaves of the left hand only suggest the A pattern, for none of the motives actually appears. In fact, the accented dissonance, a hallmark of the A-theme, is present only twice in the entire Prelude statement.

The Prelude is stated completely for five phrases (a, b, c, c, c/d), concluding with its first large half cadence (m. 499). At the V/V (m. 492), the A-related accompaniment figure drops out and the mood becomes more tranquil as the cadence approaches.

After the cadence, the Prelude theme is stated again in the soprano, this time combined with the Aria coda theme in the left hand. Demuth describes the left hand part as a "quaint reference to the Chorale," as I did in Example 68.126 He then accuses most commentators of failing to notice this resemblance, but he himself misses the closer and more complete association to the Aria coda theme. By this revelation, we can explain many of the curiosities of that theme, as derived from the harmonization of the Prelude theme. This technique, that of deriving two different melodies from the same harmonic background so that they may

126Demuth, César Franck, op. cit., 155.
be combined subsequently in a one-to-one correspondence, is also used with prominence in the b-minor organ chorale.

We thus find the origin of the motive of Example 74a. As Example 74b shows, many of the Aria melodic shapes express the motive. It seems logical to believe that the entire Aria theme may have grown out of the Prelude harmonization. Though the order of ideas cannot be proven, the relationship cannot be denied. The sequencing of the Prelude c-phrase (first external interval of minor third) explains the Aria sequence of mm. 286-289, which, apart from its Prelude harmonization, required unusual harmonization to make it fit in the context of the Aria. Even then, that particular sequence (mm. 286-289) is the most foreign-sounding point in the tonally-restricted movement. Finally, the diminished seventh chord (vii\(^7\)/V) of m. 290 is necessitated by the V/V in the third c-phrase (m. 517), and the unusual resolution of minor tonic six-four to a major subdominant with a major seventh (mm. 291-292) is explained by the half-diminished seventh of the Prelude c/d phrase (m. 520, especially). Note also that in m. 518, we find the reason for the use of a vi\(^7\) rather than a I\(_{ct}\) diminished seventh for an embellishing sonority (Ex. 52).

At the point of the bVI in the fifth Prelude phrase (c/d), a minor tonic is heard (m. 522). The motive of the
fourth appears as the harmonies alternate between tonic and subdominant. Though this extension is not necessarily a weak point, it does seem, the fourth notwithstanding, to be less consistent with the remainder of the movement.

The Aria bl-phrase (mm. 528-535) is used to provide the final cadence. The first two measures have a new harmonization, V$^\flat$/bVI - bVI rather than vii$^\flat$/IV - iv. The rest of the bl-phrase characteristics (embellishing diminished seventh, shift to the minor mode) are present here as well. Following the cadence (mm. 534-535), the Aria extension (the second type, beginning on 1) is used to prolong the tonic (mm. 536-545). And finally, an interlocking web using a motive based on the head of the Aria A-phrase (similar to the Aria introduction, mm. 193-194) leads to the final tonic chord.

Except for the Prelude-Aria coda combination, the thematic recall is generally successive in the Finale, as opposed to simultaneous, as in the Fugue. It is perhaps this aspect, along with the concomitant lack of chromatic contrast afforded by the latter, that leads Buenzod to assert that, in the Prelude, Chorale and Fugue, the "cyclic-based architecture . . . appears better laid out and its realization is more satisfying."\textsuperscript{127}

To summarize the features and techniques of the Finale,
we find a large two-part structure identified more by
thematic correspondence than by balanced cadence structure
(as in the Chorale and Fugue of the former work, and in the
Prelude of this work). The thematic correspondence extends
to the cyclic recall as well as to smaller structural
details. The somewhat abbreviated second section copies
(with transposition) large passages from the first, and is
all in the tonic key, in the manner of a recapitulation.
The key scheme emphasizes large dominant, Neapolitan, and
mediant relationships.

The themes of the movement, and, indeed, of the whole
work, offer a great degree of contrast, contrast of mood and
character, and of harmonic and textural determinants. This
contrast heightens the sectional perception of this piece.
Even the cyclic recall of Aria and Prelude themes is
perceived as successive with separate statements before any
combination.

The primary subject is made by the joining together of
several falling half-steps, then sequencing the unit by
major, then minor, thirds. As a melody, the theme is
tonally ambiguous, identifying a tonality only as the
cadence approaches. This progression of the ambiguous to
the clearly defined can be related both to the prevalent
dissonant-to-consonant suspension figure, and to the
The ambiguous nature of the subject is emphasized by unharmonized statements (both modulating and not). When the subject is harmonized, the harmony is obscured by the contrapuntal movements of the subject and inner voices. As in previous movements, this leads to "alternate sonorities" and "alternate progressions," not without their coloristic and functional significance. The cadence structure of the subject is open-ended, thus allowing immediate repetition and extension without providing any conclusive arrival.

Several harmonic/contrapuntal gestures are related to the falling half-step: the iv⁶ - V succession and the °7 - °7 succession. The melodic half-step also can be related to larger half-step relationships, particularly the half-step related keys, the successive dominant sevenths related by upward and downward half-steps, and the Neapolitan emphasis within the subject.

Harmonic techniques include the use of functional sonorities (especially the dominant seventh and diminished seventh) in a coloristic manner, particularly in succession. Related to this is the interplay of functional and embellishing relationships, e.g. approaching a sonority (or succession) in one manner and resolving it in the other manner. The upward minor third, as a pivot on a diminished
seventh chord and as an external interval of sequence, continues to play a prominent role.
CHAPTER 5

CHORALE NO. 1 IN E MAJOR

As Franck’s last creative effort, the three organ chorales represent his mature harmonic style. As in the piano works, he combines traditional and innovative elements on both large-scale and surface levels. Although each chorale has an individual character, there are certain general traits in common: (1) Each has a distinct chorale theme (composed uniquely for this setting), (2) each has a large sectional structure, (3) each employs an improvisatory element for sectional demarcation and dramatic effect, and (4) each employs characteristic chorale development techniques, including sectional thematic and harmonic combination. Beyond these, many common aspects of harmonic vocabulary and thematic construction will become evident in the course of the discussion.

The chorale theme of the E major chorale is not stated at the beginning, but rather grows out of the melodic and harmonic shapes that are stated initially. Not until measure 46b does the chorale itself appear. Franck himself gave the indication of this compositional strategy when he said, “You will see, the real chorale, it
is not the chorale; it is made in the course of the piece."\textsuperscript{128}

Figure 40 shows the structural placement of the chorale theme. The preceding material is related to the chorale theme in several ways: (1) The texture is the same for both: a homophonic texture with a prominent melodic line in the upper voice. The lower four or five parts support the melodic line and occasionally attain their own linear interest. (2) The cadence structure for both is regular and well defined. (3) Certain melodic shapes are common to both. As we have seen before, the issue of "what determines what" cannot be settled conclusively (without knowing the compositional strategy). Here, one may argue that the opening material determines the chorale, by virtue of its earlier point in time. Franck himself seems to favor this view. On the other hand, since the chorale theme is such a concise, self-sufficient unit, one may regard it as the determinant. In any case, substantial relationships exist between the two.

I will discuss the characteristics of the chorale theme itself and then return to compare these characteristics with the opening material. Two prominent shapes can be found in the chorale melody: (1) an upper neighbor motion and (2) a

\textsuperscript{128}Laurence Davies, César Franck (London: Dent, 1973), 79.
Figure 40. Chorale No. 1 in B Major. Structural diagram.

--- Chorale combination ---

\[
\begin{array}{cccccccccccccccc}
h1+n & il+o & j2+p & h1+n & il+o & j2+p & h1+n & h1 & (a) & (a) & (a) & h2 & i2 & j3 & k1 & k2 & j4 & ext \\
\end{array}
\]

\[
\begin{array}{cccccccccccccccc}
& i & i & i & i & i & i & i & i & i & i & i & i & i & i & i \\
\end{array}
\]

\[
\begin{array}{cccccccccccccccc}
\end{array}
\]

. denotes perfect authentic cadence

, denotes transient cadence
descending fifth filled in completely, or nearly so, with steps. Both figures are present in the opening phrase of the Chorale (h, Ex. 88). The second phrase (i, also Ex. 88), in typical Franck style, is a sequential pair. It opens as an upward step sequence, but expands one upward second (mm. 47-48) to an upward fourth (m.m. 50-51). The third phrase (j, Ex. 88) truncates the upper neighbor and sequences this two-beat pattern down by step. The upper neighbor becomes harmonically supported, and effects the downward fifth succession of sonorities E - A - D - G* - C#. Interestingly enough, the appoggiatura on beat 3 of m. 53 gives the momentary effect of a paired relationship (B - C#, A - C#), rather than a sequenced relationship (B - C#, A - B). This appoggiatura, with its harmonic support, also creates a particularly prominent sonority of this Chorale, that of a 4-3 suspension simultaneous with the 3 resolution. Notice also that the two-beat harmonic pattern creates a hemiola effect.

This downward fifth series is not all perfect fifths—the diminished fifth occurs between D and G#. In the minor mode, the diminished fifth occurs diatonically between 6 and 7. In this instance, three successive harmonies are diatonic in the key of f#: D - g#7 - C#7 = (VI - ii°7 - V7). The diminished fifth D - G# also turns the tonal direction back from the "flat-side" of E major (A7 and D).
Example 88. Descending fifth and neighbor-note motive from Chorale No. 1 in E Major, h-, i-, and j-phrases, mm. 46b-55.

© 1987 Dover Publications
Used by Permission

This downward fifth succession also delineates an important harmonic gesture, that of the major subdominant with lowered seventh (or, a dominant seventh on 4). The first occurrence of this gesture opens the succession as e proceeds to A7. The dominant seventh on A, of course, functions as a dominant in order to initiate the downward fifth succession. The harmonic sequence is broken as C7 (dominant seventh) resolves to C7 followed by D7 ([g♯]: IV7 – vii7/V – V7 – i). This phrase modulates to the
mediant (g") and closes with a suspended cadence (mm. 54-55).

The following two phrases (k) sequence the descending fifth motive, with the harmony of each moving up with two perfect fifths (I - V - II: G' - D' - A' and E - B - F').

The final phrase of the chorale (j1) is a restatement of the mediant-cadencing phrase of mm. 53-55. A few modifications (qualities: m. 61, beat 3 and m. 62, beat 3; insertion of vii° before V' in m. 63, beat 3) do not change the harmonic or melodic context. Note that the use of this phrase at the close of the chorale theme makes it a balanced binary structure (seen before in Aria and, on the larger level, in the Chorale (PCF) and Fugue). In addition, each half of the chorale theme is divided into three phrases and each phrase is three measures long.

Now let us return to the opening material. The opening a-phrase (mm. 1-4) exhibits an elaborated neighbor motion, G - A - G', similar to the opening of h (Ex. 88).

The A is harmonically supported with a passing harmony. The following rise of a third (G' - B) is closer to the continuation present in the i-phrase of the chorale. This phrase concludes with a suspended cadence. All the phrases

---

129 The designation "PCF" refers to the Prelude, Chorale, and Fugue, and the designation "PAF" refers to the Prelude, Aria, and Finale.
of the first large section are either suspended or weak-beat cadences. (The lone exception is m. 36, but even there the melodic line continues past beat 1 to resolve on beat 2.) The harmonic support of the cadence and the approach is by downward fifths diatonic in the key of E: vi – ii – V – I.

The second phrase (b, mm. 4b-8) features an aa/mh sequence whose external intervals are adjusted quantitatively: The external interval is first an upward second, then an upward third. Each unit displays an upward fifth: E – b, f' – c#, A – e. Each intermediate goal is a minor sonority. The b minor sonority is explained by its relationship to the successive units. A different position is taken by Wegener, who cites this passage as an evidence of a mixolydian element.130

The third phrase (c, mm. 8b-15) opens with a downward step sequence of the descending fifth line (Ex. 89), connecting B – E and A – D. The harmonic pattern that is present in each unit is typical of Franck in two ways: (1) The opening progression B – G⁶ ([E]: V – bIII⁶) is an example of the upward minor third pivot (so prominent in the Prelude, Chorale, and Fugue). (2) The opening harmony, B as

---

130Bernd Wegener, César Franck's Harmonik (Ph.D. dissertation, University of Köln, 1976; Regensberg: Bosse, 1976), 130.
dominant, progresses to its tonic via the mediant (B – G – E).

Example 89. Chorale No. 1 in E Major, mm. 8b-10a.

The return to E is accomplished as a D sonority (the goal of the previous sequence) becomes a B (m. 12). The B sonority is present in two forms: a $d^7$ and an enharmonic $f^7$. The latter sonority is a minor-minor seventh version of the augmented-sixth chord, with the augmented sixth $F - D^\#$ expanding out to the octave on E (Ex. 90).

Example 90. Minor-minor seventh form of the augmented-sixth chord.

The cadence approach uses the descending fifth motive again. The suspended cadence is the first of many vii$^6_1$ - i cadences. The tonality of e minor is conclusively
established with this c-phrase cadence. The first appearance of e is through the cadence approach of the b-phrase (mm. 7-8). This shift of mode allows the tonality to progress to G major, which is a successively close relationship (e to G, relative major) but a referentially more remote relationship (E to G).

The opening phrase (a) now recurs (m. 16-19) in G major. A different consequent (d) follows (mm. 19b-23). This phrase moves harmonically through successive VI-related keys: G-E\(^b\)-B-G. Motivically, the 4-3 appoggiatura with simultaneous 3 is prominent. The entire melodic unit of sequence is derived from the upper neighbor motion combined with a falling third. The relationship between this figure and the chorale h-phrase is shown in Example 91. Of particular note is that the falling third

Example 91. Neighbor note motive.

is specifically the chord fifth and third of each harmony in the sequence. Before the falling third can descend to fill out the fifth-motive, it is sequenced down by major
third. Even though the major third-related motives and harmonies provide the primary means of association, a subsidiary descending fifth (B♭ - D♯=E♭) is formed (Ex. 92). Incidentally, the cadence approach makes use of an

Example 92. Disguised descending fifth.

![Disguised Descending Fifth](image)

augmented-sixth chord of the "augmented" variety (Ex. 93a). The generalized perception of the augmented sixth allows this chord to remain an A (or II) chord (Ex. 93b).

Example 93. Alternate augmented-sixth sonorities.

![Alternate Augmented-Sixth Sonorities](image)

The following e-phrase (mm. 23b-30) is very closely associated with the preceding material. Harmonically another 6VI-related circle occurs, but the measure-long harmonies (derived from the d-phrase, mm. 19-21) are lengthened to two measures with tonicization element in each unit. The connection between the units is not from
tonic to bVI, but from dominant seventh to bVI<sup>6</sup>. This upward minor third pivot is exactly the same gesture that opens the units of sequence of the c-phrase (mm. 8b-11). The arrival of bVI<sup>6</sup> is associated with a 4-3 appoggiatura. 131 Although the aural effect of this appoggiatura is the same as the preceding phrase, the metric placement is different. In the former phrase, the 4-3 motion elaborates the originating harmony of each sequence; in the latter, it elaborates the goal harmony (Fig. 41).

Figure 41. Displacement of 4-3 appoggiatura.

\[
\begin{align*}
4-3 & \\
\text{d-phrase: } & I^3 \rightarrow bVI \\
\text{e-phrase: } & I \rightarrow bVI^3 \rightarrow (V^7/IV)
\end{align*}
\]

The descending fifth motive is present, although the melodic presence of the chord fifth is more an elaboration of the chord third (mm. 24 and 26, beat 3). The structural motion is that of third to root. We must also note the use of the VI<sup>6</sup> sonority and the allied principle of using the chord third (rather that the root) as a pedal point. Harvey

131 To be completely accurate, it is the third of the chord that is simultaneous with the suspension and resolution of the third. However, since the VI is in first inversion, the figured bass symbols are 6<sup>9</sup>-8. 
Grace notes this tendency of Franck and labels the technique as a "mediant pedal." ¹³²

The conclusion to the e-phrase features a sequence whose harmonic and melodic patterns diverge. The opening unit (mm. 27b-28, Ex. 94) uses an upward minor third pivot to complete the major third circle (G to G) initiated by the first sequence. With respect to the previous sequence, two additional harmonies are added (II and V), and the dominant seventh is changed into the equivalent diminished seventh (Fig. 42a).

As Figure 42b shows, the relationship to the previous level of B is just as apparent as the relationship to the returning level of G. Notice how the ⁷ - ⁹ succession can

be either two chords in B (C:\# - F:\#, or II - V) or one chord in G (A:\# - \#9, or II).

Figure 42. Comparison of patterns.

a. mm. 23b-24 transposed to B: B7 G6
   mm. 27b-28 c\#5 c\#7 (=a\#7) f\#7 (=d\#7) G6
b. chord roots in B: C\# F\# B G
    II V I bVI
chord roots in G: A --------------- D G
    II V I

The melodic/harmonic divergence occurs as another three-beat unit follows (mm. 28b-29). It appears to have an upward minor third as its interval of sequence. (Compare B of m. 27b with D of m. 28b.) At the point where the new tonic, Bb6, would have arrived (m. 29, beat 2), only the Bb melodic pitch appears—a result of the prolonged f\#7 through the whole measure. The notation reflects the harmonic goal of remaining in the key of g minor, with the chromatic degrees related to g minor rather than to a minor-third transposition of the first unit: Bb in m. 27 is C\# (not D\#) in m. 28; Eb in m. 28 is F\# (not G\#) in m. 29. This change of a harmonic goal (G6 of m. 28) into a contrapuntal passing tone (Bb of m. 29) is significant in keeping the key level (G) constant. It is also important to realize that this
passage is another example of Franck’s dichotomy between surface chromaticism (the apparent upward minor third sequence) and longer range continuity.

The cadence is an inverted leading tone cadence, exactly like that of the c-phrase. This and other harmonic characteristics mentioned above associate these two phrases together. They are also structurally similar in that they follow an a-type phrase: a/b (mm. 1-8) and a/d (mm. 16-23).

The following f-phrase (mm. 30b-36) opens with a quick turn to the minor submediant (g - e\textsuperscript{b}). This relationship is, however, not the basis for the ensuing sequence. Rather it is the upward minor third that is the external interval. This is the very same external interval that was suggested, but not realized, in the sequence of the preceding phrase (mm. 27b-29). The melodic line is a lengthened form of the upper neighbor motion. The structural neighbor note (C), which has a further neighbor note embellishment, is dissonant with respect to both origin and goal harmonies (Ex. 95a). The major second appoggiatura on the diminished seventh chord (mm. 33, 35) resembles the major second appoggiatura of the previous e-phrase (mm. 25 and 27). Also this harmonic structure is similar to a sequential goal within the chorale itself (mm. 58 and 61). Both contain a major second appoggiatura on a diminished seventh; the difference is that in the chorale, the note that forms the
major seventh (dissonance) with respect to the appoggiatura is not present until the resolution (Ex. 95b) but in the f-phrase the dissonance is present from the beginning of the harmony.

Example 95. Major second appoggiatura on a diminished seventh chord.

The connection between the units is by 1 cr (e⁰⁷ to Dᵇ⁷). The linear movement of the bass is a significant aspect that connects the two units. As the generalized chord roots show (Fig. 43), the pivot may be interpreted in many ways, although the notation suggests the deceptive (C - Dᵇ) resolution.

Figure 43. Chord roots, mm. 30b-33.

At the end of the second unit (m. 34), the diminished seventh resolves down by fifth to another diminished seventh. At this point the notation reflects an enharmonic shift, for the g⁰⁷ resolves as an a⁷ to a d⁷. The d⁷
resolves deceptively (1 ct) to VI\(^6\) as the tonality of e returns for the first time since m. 15.

The g-phrase (mm. 36b-46), also sequential, is based on the melodic descending fifth. Each unit also ends with the major second appoggiatura (mm. 38 and 40). The harmonic underlay is a tonic prolongation (V - I - vii\(^7\) - I). The tonic is connected to the diminished seventh with a passing tone on \(b7\). This effects a descending line, in an inner voice, of \(\hat{5} - b7 - b6 - \hat{5}\), which is a prominent characteristic of the chorale melody (m. 51). The \(b7\), of course, turns the tonic into a dominant seventh. The linear resolution is present in \(b6\), but the harmonic implication of the dominant seventh is not realized, or at least, is elided, as such: I - V\(^7\)/IV - (IV) - vii\(^7\).

This harmonic pattern is stated on the level of E, then C\(^\#\), and a third unit is begun on the level of B\(^b\). Only the V - I succession is repeated, as the sequence is truncated, and the successive units have the upward minor second as their external interval. The connection of keys is achieved in a fairly common nineteenth-century manner: The tonic is made into an augmented triad, which is reinterpreted as the augmented dominant of the key one half-step higher (Ex. 96a). Even though the external interval is different than the first part of the phrase (upward minor second versus a downward minor third), Franck maintains a momentary
similarity at the two points of connection. Between the first and second units (m. 38), there is an upward major third (E - C#7). Between the shorter units the structural harmony is that of downward major third (B - Bb+=F#), but a lower neighbor in the bass creates a surface succession of an upward major third: B - D between the third and fourth units, B - D# between the fourth and fifth units (Ex. 96b). This is another example of the correlation of divergent patterns.

Example 96. Connection of half-step-related chords.

The arrival of the sequence is C (m. 43), which is bVI with respect to the goal harmony of E. A deceptive resolution of B in mm. 44-45 sets up an interesting harmonic succession. The resolution of V is not to the usual submediant (vi or bVI), but to the dominant seventh on 6 (V7/ii). Two successive dominant sevenths follow, built on b8 and ♯, although the dominant seventh on b8 is notated as a German sixth. Even though the sound is that of successive sonorities (dominant sevenths) related by half-step, the functional interpretation is of downward
fifths (VI - II - V - I). The setting up of a cadence by a downward fifth progression is typical not only of the chorale proper (mm. 52b-54 and 61b-63) but also of Franck's style in general.

Following the chorale proper, the first variation begins. As the structural diagram (Fig. 40) shows, the variation contains only certain phrases of the original first section (a, b, a, d, f, chorale proper). Other phrases (c, e, g) are omitted, and no new structural elements are added. The elaboration present in this section is of three distinct types: (1) elaborating the melody line by changing the diminution (Ex. 97a), (2) creating a new melodic line with the same harmonic background (bl-phrase, Ex. 97b), and (3) creating a new countermelody juxtaposed with the original melody (d and f, Ex. 97c).

One favorite melodic device of Franck, the articulated suspension, especially in downward stepwise succession, surfaces in m. 67. We have seen this device already in the B-theme of the Prelude (PCF), the Fugue subject, and the Finale A-theme.

Although certain phrases are omitted, the sense of tonal progression and tonality succession is not any less clear. The gap between m. 72 and m. 73 is more remote successively, since the half-cadence on B goes directly to the G major a-phrase (but with tonicizing chords mediating).
Previously, the intervening c-phrase led to e minor, thus smoothing the shift to G. On the other hand, the succession of B - G is exactly what the listener expects at m. 73, because the opening of the c-phrase (mm. 8b-9) began with B7 - G6.
The five phrases of this variation are set off in pairs not only by cadences and recurring melodic and harmonic shapes, but also by the voice-exchange feature of the melodic line (Fig. 44).

Figure 44. Voice exchange, mm. 65-86.

a1 b1 a2 d1 f1

melody in . . . RH RH LH LH RH

The chorale proper is stated in its entirety. The differences are related to the contrapuntal elements that were a new feature of this variation. In the first three intersections between phrases of the chorale (mm. 89, 92, and 95b-96), a motive is inserted. The first two points (mm. 89 and 92) use the same motive (denoted 'x'), which is from the opening diminution of m. 65. The third point (mm. 95b-96) employs a different motive (denoted 'y'), which consists of a descending fifth and a rising i6 - i7 line (Ex. 98). The head of the y-motive is simply the descending fifth line of the chorale melody (mm. 48-49, Ex. 88). It is also used as a contrapuntal motive in this variation (e.g., m. 71). At this intersection, the y-motive is treated imitatively in an interweaving technique not unlike the Aria. (This imitative treatment also extends the phrase by

133There is one harmonic difference: The G7 (V7/vi) of m. 48 is replaced by a g7 (vii7/IV) in m. 88.
one measure, an adjustment of dramatic significance in the final chorale statement.)

Example 98. Prominent motives.

The following improvisatory-like section (mm. 106-125) consists of two elements: (1) A sequence is constructed of a two-chord succession with a dominant seventh resolving up by fifth to a minor chord, in effect, a IV♭7 - i. This type of subdominant we have seen in the balanced cadence approach of the chorale theme. The successive upward fifths occur earlier in the b-phrase (mm. 4b-8) and the 4 - 1 movement is reminiscent of the inverted leading tone cadences. The external interval is an upward major third, although the successive connection is by downward minor third. The expected minor chord of the third unit is replaced by a dominant seventh in preparation for the second element. (2) A dominant pedal is prolonged, first on E♭, then later on B. Above it a significant motive (denoted 'z', Ex. 98) is introduced and treated to imitation at the upward sixth. This z-motive forms the basis of the following section, and, when the chorale returns, it forms the primary counterpoint to the chorale melody.
These two elements alternate twice: sequence - pedal - sequence - pedal. The connection into the second sequence is down by fifth (E₇ - A₆) as is the connection of the second pedal into the following material (B' - e). The second pedal is the same as the first with an additional extension of the dominant by means of a repeated ii₆ - V.

Contrary to both Demuth and Davies, this section is not a second variation, but rather a dramatic contrasting interlude that gives prominent emphasis to a subsequently important motive.¹³⁴

The harmonic outline of this bravura-style interlude is a large-scale circle, for the preceding and subsequent sections are both in E/e. The first sequence (mm. 106-111) moves from C₇ to E₇ and the second (mm. 115-120) from A₇ to B'₇.

The following large section (m. 126, ff.), in e minor, makes prominent use of the z-motive and the ascending part of the y-motive. In customary Franck style, this section is an exposition of material that is to be subsequently combined with a previously-stated theme (in this piece, the chorale theme). The melodic counterpoint, the structure, and the harmonization of the subsequent chorale statements

(m. 171, ff.) are present here in the first three phrases (mm. 126-137). This opening phrase group is, in fact, a statement of the chorale without the chorale melody. (A summary of separate statements and their combination is given in Fig. 45.) This preview of the texture and harmonization that is subsequently combined with the chorale theme is related to the more thematically-oriented combinations that are found in the piano works.

Figure 45. Thematic combination.

The z-motive and its derivatives form the basis of a new contrapuntal melodic line. The second measure (m. 127) compresses the fourth into a third, and further compression results in the sequential motive of m. 127 and m. 128. Harmonically, the first phrase is all over a tonic pedal. The second phrase, correspondingly, opens with a subdominant pedal and resolves to tonic. As an aside, the harmonies above the pedal must be noted (Fig. 46). The IVb⁷ is present here, and its effect extends beyond the chord itself because it functions as a dominant of bVII.
(D). The root of the $\text{VII}$ is then raised to form the dominant function $\text{vii}^7$.

Figure 46. Chord roots, Chorale No. 1 in E Major, mm. 130-132a.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>130</th>
<th>131</th>
<th>132</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>chord</td>
<td>a</td>
<td>B♭</td>
<td>g°7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>root</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>B♭</td>
<td>E</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>bass</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>C</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The y-motive also is used to connect the phrases (m. 129 and m. 133). Originally the upper tetrachord of a melodic minor scale (Ex. 99a), it is varied in two other ways (Ex. 99b and c). This ascending motive displays an interesting shift of metric accent, because the arrival of $i$ occurs not on beat 1 but on the preceding beat 3. A harmonic consequence of this is to allow a tonicization not by a dominant function sonority, but by a subdominant. As shown in Example 100, the melodic arrival in A is on beat 3 (m. 129), but the harmonic arrival on A is not until beat 1 (m. 130). The local dominant occurs on the second half of beat 2 (m. 129), and beat 3 is aurally an augmented-sixth chord (with B as root). (An alternate interpretation would
be to view beat 3 as $F$ to $d^\#$; in any case, $B$ is the pre-tonic sonority.) The basis for this metric shift is found in the original context of the y-motive (m. 96).

Example 100. Chorale No. 1 in E Major, mm. 129-130.

There the resumption of the chorale melody ($\hat{i}$) on beat 3 was coupled with the arrival on $i$ of the y-motive. The convergence of these two points was not necessitated by the y-motive itself ($F^\#$ could have accompanied the $D^\#$), but rather by the tonic ($G^\#$) harmony (present on beat 3 here and in the first statement of the chorale, m. 55). As we look ahead to the use of this material combined with the chorale theme, we find the second phrase beginning with an anacrusis on $\hat{6}$ (e.g., m. 174). The tonicized harmony, as in the model (mm. 129-130) is subdominant; consequently the subdominant pitch must appear on beat 3 to accommodate the anacrusis ($i$-phrase).

Following the second phrase, an abrupt $i - vi^\#$ succession occurs (mm. 133-134). It is mediated slightly by
the tonicizing dominant (and also by the continuation of the 
z-based motive sequence). The new melody of this third 
phrase uses the z-based appoggiatura (e.g., m. 134, beat 2). 
The harmonic pattern corresponds to the hemiola that is a 
part of the j-phrase, previous and subsequent (e.g., mm. 
52b-54, Ex. 88). As in the earlier j-phrase, the modulation 
is to the mediant; since the mode is minor, the goal key is 
G, rather than g♯. This 1-♭III relationship will be used 
successively when the chorale theme returns.

The strict correspondence with the future chorale ends 
with m. 137. Following this a large free section (mm. 138- 
151) develops the z-motive (mm. 138-140), and combines the 
descending fifth motive with the y-motive (mm. 146-150). 
The first of these two passages illustrates a common 
harmonic device of Franck, that of alternating between 
dominant seventh and German sixth harmonies, and, further, 
that of using this succession in sequence. The two-beat 
metric grouping is present here, and the successive 
connection between units of sequence is an upward fifth, C7 
- G7. Interestingly enough, the cadence, to e minor (mm. 
140-141), is by diminished seventh with a bass motion of b♭ 
- i (as in mm. 130-131). The harmonic pivot is clearly on 
the diminished seventh chord (Fig. 47). The perception 
possibilities are indicated by the lines.
Figure 47. Ambiguity of harmonic roots.

\[
\begin{align*}
&[e]: \quad V^7 \quad G^6 \quad \text{vii}^{o7} \quad i \\
&\text{C} \\
&\text{G} \quad \text{A}^b \quad \text{D} \quad \text{E} \\
&\text{F} \\
&\text{D} \quad \text{A}^b
\end{align*}
\]

The two motivically-derived passages are separated by a harmonically-referenced passage (mm. 141-145) that employs a new motive. The measure-long successions represent successive developments of a tonicization progression (Fig. 48). The N - vii\(^{o7}\) succession is reminiscent of m. 130; the IV\(^{b7}\) - Gr\(^b\) - i reminds the listener of m. 131. This latter harmony and the corresponding melody anticipate the motive combination of m. 146, ff. The connecting measure (m. 145) illustrates Franck's use of the chromatic line combined with unstressed beats.

Figure 48. Chord roots, mm. 141b-144a.

\[
\begin{align*}
&\text{142} \quad \text{143} \quad \text{144} \\
a \quad d^{o7} \quad e \quad F \\
A \quad B \quad E \quad F \quad B \\
e: \quad IV \quad V \quad I \quad b\text{II} \quad V \quad I \quad IV \quad \text{II} \quad I
\end{align*}
\]

Beginning at m. 146, the descending fifth motive is combined with the \(^{\#}7\) - \(^{\#}7\) - \(^{\#}\) portion of the \(y\)-motive. The melodic aspects undergo register and voice transfers. After the initial measure, an E pedal persists until m. 151. An interesting divergence of arrival points occurs here. The
same motive combination and harmonic progression occur in m. 149 in the subdominant for the first time. But the bass arrival (on A) is not present at m. 150 (where the first melodic arrival is), but is delayed until m. 151.

Incidentally, the first arrival of the subdominant harmony is not following the first subdominant motive (mm. 149-150a), but as a deceptive resolution following a tonic statement (mm. 148-149a). This pattern, that of deceptive resolution followed by a non-coinciding arrival on iv, is the same as we saw earlier (m. 129).

Now follows a recall of part of the e-phrase, with its tonicization of successive bVI-related chords, but now with an arpeggiated elaboration in the left hand. The second unit of sequence realizes an expectation that has been present in this sequence but not realized up to this point.

Notice that a tonicizing diminished seventh chord occurs over the 3 pedal (Ex. 101a). If we view the pedal as consonant with respect to the rest of the chord, we have a G9 (relating to the opening of the unit), which expects, but does not receive a resolution to C. The same unit occurs later (Ex. 101b), but the tonicizing diminished seventh (m. 155, beat 1), or dominant ninth (F), is restated and resolved (to b9). Note also that the diminished seventh is notated, not as a chord with respect to D9 (C - Eb - Gb - Bbb) as is the case earlier (with
respect to D\textsuperscript{b} in Ex. 101a), but as a chord with respect to
D\textsuperscript{b} (A - C - E\textsuperscript{b} - G\textsuperscript{b}).

Example 101. Comparison of e-phrases: mm. 23b-25 (a); mm. 153b-156 (b).

A restatement of mm. 147-151 occurs in mm. 156-160 to
move the tonality to e\textsuperscript{b}, the subdominant of b\textsuperscript{b}. The
motive-combination and divergent arrivals of the former
passage are present here, as well. The e-phrase follows,
but without the cadence (mm. 164-165) corresponding to the earlier occurrence (mm. 155-156).^{135}

A repetition of the last measure of the sequential unit sets up a pair (Ex. 102). A shift to the minor mode initiates the second unit and the tonicizing diminished seventh (spelled with respect to G) resolves deceptively to E♭.

Example 102. Pair, Chorale No. 1 in E Major, mm. 164b-166.

The following phrase (mm. 167-170) provides a cadence on g, while using the a-phrase melodic line. The line is on G, but the harmonization is completely different (Ex. 103).

Two successive chords exhibit an upward fifth relationship: c⁷ - b⁷ (= A - G or A - E) and b⁷ - A♭ (= G - A♭ or D♭ - A♭). The b⁷ has an ambiguous function in and relationship to the key. With respect to the preceding c⁷ (A), it can

^{135} The notation of the diminished seventh corresponds to the occurrence in m. 155, as if the pedal would become the dominant.
be an upward fifth (A - E). With respect to the following $A^b$, it can be another upward fifth $D^b - A^b$. And finally, with respect to the prevailing tonality (g) it can be a G.

Example 103. Chorale No. 1 in E Major, mm. 167-170.

One may question whether or not this large section (mm. 126-170) may be termed a variation (as Demuth and Davies both maintain).\(^{136}\) The strict correspondence of three phrases (mm. 126-137) to the subsequent chorale harmonization and the use (though slight) of earlier material (non-chorale e-phrase) argue for it; the large amount of free material argues against it.

Beginning at m. 171 the chorale melody, now in minor, returns combined with the harmonization featured earlier in the exposition of the $z$-motive (mm. 126-137). The third of the three phrases modulates to the mediant ($b$III), and at

\(^{136}\)Demuth, Davies, see footnote 134.
that point another statement begins. The newly-established
major (mediant) becomes minor and the second unit begins
(Fig. 49). The procedure, like a large-scale sequence,
continues for two complete units (g and b\textsuperscript{b}) and two
truncated units (c\textsuperscript{#} and f\textsuperscript{*}). A voice exchange corresponds
to the large-scale sequence, with the chorale first in the
left hand, then the right hand, then the pedal.

**Figure 49. Progression of mediant-related keys.**

```
g ----- B\textsuperscript{b} -- b\textsuperscript{b} ----- D\textsuperscript{b} -- c\textsuperscript{*}
```

The third and fourth units are related by fifth. This
relationship is a direct consequence of the truncation of the
sequence. In the chorale harmonization the relationship
between the beginning and ending of the first phrase is that
of fifth down (E to A, compare mm. 47 and 49). Since the
chorale statement is broken at this point, the key relation-
ships reflect the local movement from tonic to subdominant.
(This principle applies to the first two units: Three
phrases are used and the successive key relationships corres-
pond to the tonal movement to that point.) The downward
fifth motion sets up a series of fifth-related key areas,
preparing for the final chorale statement (c\textsuperscript{#} - f\textsuperscript{*} - b - E).

Following the arrival on b (mm. 204-205) a restatement
of the g minor cadence phrase (mm. 167-170) occurs,
confirming b. The following phrase (m. 209, ff.) is also based on the a-phrase, using the complete rhythm and certain shapes from it. The head of the melody is treated to a sequential pair (Ex. 104b); the original shape is a simple pair (Ex. 104a). Harmonically, this phrase is related to the former by the recurrence of certain harmonic successions, e.g., $d^\#_7 - C$, or generally $B - C$. This succession is of a more embellishing nature in the latter phrase, since there the $C$ progresses on to $C^\#$ with the parallel motion of two inner parts (mm. 209b-210a). In the former, the $C$ replaces the $C^\#$ in the bass-supported progression of $N - V - i$ (mm. 207b-208). Another reference to this progression occurs in m. 211 where, in the succession of $d^\#_7$ to $a^\#_7$ ($B - F^\#$), the $C^\#$ of the $a^\#_7$ is delayed by the $C^\#$ belonging to the previous chord. As a result, a temporary $C^7$ is formed on beat 2 ($C - E - G - A^\#$).

This phrase also possesses the very important structural function of changing $B$ from tonic to dominant. The tonic aspect is emphasized in the former phrase, with the cadence of mm. 208-209. In the latter, however, the introduction of the pitch $A^b$ \(^{137}\), the pedal throughout, and the arrival on $B$ major (m. 212) all give a greater sense of $B$ as dominant.

\(^{137}\text{There is one } A^b \text{ in the former phrase (m. 207, beat 3). In the latter, the } A^b \text{ appears from the beginning of the phrase.}\)
The following phrase (mm. 212-215a) continues the emphases of the previous phrase. The melody is the same, up an octave. A canon at the distance of a quarter note begins the phrase. The comes contains both a lower octave and lower third replication of the dux.

The dominant function of B quickly evaporates as the pedal slips by two downward half-steps. This motion is sequenced through three complete units. The means of connection is by an upward minor third pivot on a fully diminished seventh chord (Ex. 105). The chord of arrival is a six-four, and the sound of downward step-related six-four's is remarkably similar to the second phrase of the opening movement of the Symphony.¹³⁸

The harmonic motion achieves a goal that is a tritone distant from the origin, B to F. At this point another

sequence commences and it reverses the motion. The harmonic movement within each unit is six-four on the dominant to vi, which becomes the dominant seventh of the tonal level that is up a step. In characteristic fashion, the third leg is truncated (m. 224), with only the final three beats (2, 3, and 1) corresponding to the previous units.

Example 105. Chorale No. 1 in E Major, mm. 215-218.

The melody of this passage illustrates Franck's technique of constructing melodies by the overlapping of structural processes (Ex. 106). It begins with a two-measure sequence (mm. 215b-218), the goal of which is the opening of the next sequence; second, the next sequence uses two three-measure units (mm. 218-220 and 221-223); third, the sequence is truncated (m. 224); fourth, that three-beat pattern becomes the basis for a three-unit pair.
Example 106. Overlapping sequence and pair structure,
Chorale No. 1 in E Major, mm. 215b-229.
(mm. 224-226); and fifth, the resolution of the final unit of the pair (m. 227, beat 1) becomes the initiating element for a new sequence (mm. 227-229).

This passage seems to be structural filler, however necessary for adequately preparing the arrival of the tonic. Even in such a passage, Franck cannot be content to let the rhythmic activity provide the chief interest, but he must use harmonic/sequential means to achieve even this sort of connective and preparatory function. Related to this is the observation of Mason:

He is, in the first place, noticeably lacking in that vigor of pulse, that strong accentuation, which is the delight of active temperaments. He sings constantly, almost never dances. . . . But Franck never relieves himself and his hearer by passages of brisk motion in which the interest is entirely active; he is, so to speak, a very sedentary composer. And so the rare beauties that stud the page lose something by being set so thickly.¹³⁹

The final preparatory phrase features, in characteristic fashion, an alternation of the six-four on the dominant and the German sixth. Harmonically this can be seen as V - II. The half-step fluctuation of the bass calls to mind an earlier passage (mm. 138-140). Here, however, the harmonic

pattern corresponds to the metric pattern (Fig. 50). Note also that the last measure (m. 232) keeps the 2:1 rhythmic ratio of II to V, but reverses the order, so that the one-beat dominant may introduce the final chorale statement.

Figure 50. Comparison of dominant-elaboration passages.

m. 138 V II V | II
m. 227 V II II | V II II | ... | II II V

The final chorale is constructed by means of two common techniques of Franck: (1) The first half features a modified canon between the chorale melody in the manuals (with harmonization) and the pedal. (2) The second half of the chorale uses the technique of sequence to create a harmonically-motivated point of arrival.

Initially, the canon of the chorale melody occurs at the metric unit of two measures. There is, however, a one measure overlap at the end of the comes. As a result, the phrases, originally three measures long, become four measures long. The chorale melody is modified primarily to allow the overlap. Specifically, the h2-phrases (mm. 232b-237a) are identical. The i2-phrases (mm. 236b-241a) are compared in Example 107. The dux features the chorale melody intact, except that the final descending fourth is $\hat{7} - \hat{6} - \hat{5} - \hat{4}$, rather than $\hat{7} - b\hat{7} - b\hat{6} - \hat{5}$. The bass comes follows with the shape of the dux (upward third
Example 107. Comparison of *i*2 dux and comes.

Compared with an upward second in the first full measure) and, from the third note onward, follows a downward fifth transposition of the dux. This allows the descending fourth to be *i* - 3 - 2 - 1. When we compare the j3-phrases (mm. 240b-244), we find an adjustment in the chorale melody of the dux caused by the harmonic constraints of the comes (Ex. 108). Entering two measures behind, the first two notes of the comes underlie the last two of the dux. For the third phrase, this is V - i in the mediant key.

Therefore, to allow the comes to support that progression with 5 - i, the opening of the dux is modified to ascend a fourth (mm. 240b-241). The adjustment up by third is corrected after beat 2 of m. 242, and the harmonic goal (tonicization of the mediant) remains the same. The j3 comes arrives on the same melodic goal, relatively, as the dux (modified or not), but is modified internally (Ex. 108) to allow a downward fifth succession, $G^\flat - C^\# - C^\# - F^\# - B$, which connects to the second half of the chorale statement.
A few additional harmonic observations on this section:

(1) The opening descending fifth finds its third different harmonization. Whereas previous harmonizations tonicized or resolved deceptively to IV, this one resolves to tonic: vii\(^{o7}/V \rightarrow V^7 \rightarrow I\). This is, incidentally, the harmonization used for the 3-2-1 of the final cadence (mm. 254-255). In m. 235, however, it is less final because of the bass entry of the comes on 5.

(2) The new harmonization of i2 (m. 238) is, of course, necessitated by the new melody. The succession of G\(^7\) to A\(^7\) can be related to the V\(^7\) - G\(^6\) fluctuation of the previous phrase just prior (mm. 277-232). And the A\(^7\) is yet another appearance of the dominant seventh on 4, here resolving directly to tonic, as a type of augmented-sixth chord.

The second half of the chorale theme uses the original device by which it was constructed--sequence--but in a different way. In the earlier occurrence (mm. 55b-64) both sequences had downward external intervals (major third, diatonic step). In the corresponding places of the final
statement, both sequences have an external interval of an upward step. The k-based phrase spans the descending fifth F\# - B, then G\# - C\#; earlier it was D\# - G\# and B - E. One significant harmonic difference is that of goal harmony. Earlier, the large-scale progression was of two successive upward fifths, I - V - II. Here the II is replaced by a dominant seventh on i, I - V - I.

The final sequence, which provides the final cadence approach, begins as the earlier one does, as a downward fifth progression (Fig. 51a). An upward third (mediant) shift lengthens the unit to three beats, so a hemiola is avoided. A functional roman numeral interpretation is given in Figure 51b. Note the II - V - I is present on successively upward steps, beginning in B, then C\# and D\#.

Without an enharmonic change, this results in extremes of sharp-key notation.

The final sequential V (A\#\#) resolves not to its tonic (D\#), but deceptively to the German sixth (B\#), which becomes the dominant in the primary key. A prominent

Figure 51. Comparison of cadence approaches.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>62</th>
<th>63</th>
<th>64</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a. C#</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>E</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>A#</td>
<td>a#7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>B#</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>251</td>
<td>252</td>
<td>253</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>C#</td>
<td>F#</td>
<td>B#</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. II</td>
<td>V</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>II=II</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
occurrence of the IV\textsuperscript{b7} (A\textsuperscript{7}) coincides with the arrival of the tonic note in the melodic line in m. 253. It resolves as an augmented sixth to I\textsuperscript{6} to set up the final II (v\textsubscript{ii}\textsuperscript{7}/V) - V - I cadence.

The final cadence is one of the few strong-beat, nonsuspended V - I cadences of the entire chorale.\textsuperscript{140} The coda is but a single tonic harmony, employing the x-motive in canonic imitation.

To summarize, then, we find that the chorale seems to grow out of the opening material, which foreshadows certain melodic and harmonic shapes of the chorale. Particularly important shapes are (1) the descending melodic fifth (especially 5 - 3 - 2 - 1), (2) mediant modulation, and (3) the upward minor third pivot, as seen in the progression V\textsuperscript{7} - b\textsuperscript{III}\textsuperscript{6} (equivalent to I\textsuperscript{b7} (V\textsuperscript{7}/IV) - bVI\textsuperscript{6}).\textsuperscript{141}

Although much of the work, including non-chorale theme sections, is regular in its phrase and cadence structure, there is an avoidance of strong V - I cadences. Instead, leading tone cadences or suspended cadences are used to weaken the metric and harmonic points of arrival.

\textsuperscript{140}One other cadence deserves note: mm. 169-170 (reused mm. 208-209). Most of the others are associated with the motivic combinations of mm. 146-160 and mm. 198-205. Even there, avoided and deceptive resolutions alternate with V - I successions.

\textsuperscript{141}We recall this shape as an important one of the Prelude, Chorale, and Fugue.
Structural features bear similarities with the other chorales: (1) An improvisatory element punctuates the chorale-based texture, adding a dramatic element and providing very directed harmonic goals. (2) Themes and textures are masterfully combined to form the structural basis of entire sections. The themes and textures are stated so completely that the listener is unaware that any further combination is possible. (3) Binary balance can be seen on the small level, within the chorale theme itself, as the two halves end similarly.
CHAPTER 6

CHORALE NO. 2 IN B MINOR

Franck’s second organ chorale is cast in the structure of a large-scale chaconne. The theme does not grow out of anything, and, in contrast to the treatment in the first chorale, it is not varied melodically. Rather, the chief interest lies in the harmonic, textural, and contrapuntal variety that surrounds the theme. The harmonic interest is found (1) on a local level, as the harmonizations vary from statement to statement, (2) on a larger key-area level, and (3) in theme-less passages, the relationship of which to the rest of the chorale is more harmonic. The large-scale structure of the chorale is a balanced two-part form (Fig. 52). Each of the two parts concludes with the same entire section (E), providing the balance. Within each part there is correspondence of certain elements as the chorale progresses from chorale statement to chorale development and harmonic development.

The theme is stated initially in the pedals with the accompaniment in the manuals entering on beat 2 of each measure (Ex. 109). This accompaniment is first a rearticulated F pedal and then later a full chord. This “window” texture, that of a silent accompaniment on beat 1, is a
Figure 52. Chorale No. 2 in B Minor structural diagram.

1 9 17 25 33 41 49 57 65 73 80b 83b 86b 90 98 105b 108b 111 115
B-Cho S-Cho B/S-Cho B/S-Cho A b b c D D1 b b c E

[b]____ [e]___ = [b]___= F^4 A D __ F^4 B F^4 [B]___

127 136 148 156 163 170b 180 188 195 203 211 219 227 246 258 266 274 285
F F1 Fugato canon A+Cho A+Cho G D2 Chorale E ext

D____ [g]_________ [E^b]______ [e^b]______ [f^*]______ [b]_ _________ [B]__

. denotes perfect authentic cadence
, denotes transient cadence
pervading characteristic of this work. The theme itself is rather plain, with many repeated notes. This characteristic is significant for the development of the work, since it will allow more variety in harmonization, with harmonic successions not being as specifically determined by the melodic shape. At certain points (mm. 6-8, 9-12) it resembles a bass line with skips of fourths and fifths relating to the local

Example 109. Chorale theme, *Chorale No. 2 in B Minor*, mm. 1-16.
tonality. The theme, like the piece as a whole, has a two-part structure. Both phrases end on  and a tonicization of \( V \) is implied in both cases (\( B - C^\# - F^\# \) in mm. 8-9 and \( A - G^\# - F^\# \) in mm. 15-16). The open-ended nature of this theme allows an immediate repetition on the same tonal level. (Recall that Franck uses this same harmonic structure in other chaconne passages: the \( c^\# \) minor section (o-p) of the Prelude (PAF), and in the Finale primary theme.)

Two harmonic gestures are given early adumbration in this phrase: (1) In m. 7, the leap of A to \( E^\# \) over the \( C^\# \) pedal implies an augmented sonority. This sonority will be significant in embellishing and more structural contexts later in the piece. (2) The second phrase exhibits several prominent German sixth to tonic successions. We are accustomed to the sound of this progression with the tonic in six-four position, thus making the underlying harmonic function II - V. In this phrase, as well as in many throughout the chorale, the tonic is in positions other than six-four, thus a distinct aural sense of II - I or (equivalently) \( bVI - I \).

It is also interesting to note that the divergent sequence is present in the second phrase (mm. 9-12). The

---

142 See p. 157, ff. and p. 191, ff. The designation "PCF" refers to the Prelude, Chorale, and Fugue, and the designation "PAF" refers to the Prelude, Aria, and Finale.
melodic pattern in the bass is sequenced up by major third
(D - A and F\# - C\#). The harmonic pattern, however, is not
sequenced, but is a simple repetition of the Gr\^6 - i
progression.

The second statement (mm. 17-32) transfers the theme to
the soprano. The "window" texture persists and the harmonic
motion of the first phrase is more active than the first
statement. The augmented sixth to tonic succession is
present again (mm. 18-19 and 27-28), as is the augmented
sonority (m. 24). The latter occurs in a different place
from that of the first statement. There it is on the V/V
(seventh measure, m. 7), here, on the V (eighth measure, m.
24). In both cases, the augmented sonority is strictly
embellishing, either stating or implying V\^6-5.

Three sequences of this statement deserve note: (1)
For the first, Franck gives the impression of a sequence
without really repeating the entire pattern (Ex. 110a). The
melody, belonging to the theme, is not sequential. The
harmony is not strictly sequential, but the effect of
sequence is given by the parallel usage of six-four
sonorities on beat 3 of the respective units. This
parallelism is aided by the outward resolution (in the left
hand) of A\# - C\# and G - A\#. On the surface, the units show
a common element (F\#) followed by a different element.
(Note also in unit 1 the occurrence of V - bIII, an upward
minor third pivot.) An alternate view associates the common elements in a different way: By viewing the A* as a B♭, we can see the intervallic similarity; by viewing the F* as a replacement for an E (Ex. 110b), we can see the harmonic similarity. Obviously, the F* must be present because it is part of the theme.

Example 110. Harmonic parallelisms, mm. 21-22.

(2) The divergent sequence of the first statement (mm. 9-12) becomes convergent (a-/mh) in the second phrase (mm. 25-28). A large-scale upward third can be seen here, with the first unit tonicizing D ([f]: VI), and the second tonicizing f* ([f#]: i). Even though the respective
tonicizing chords are relatively different (e\#o7—an enharmonic vii\(\#7\)/V/D—\text{and} Fr\(\#7\)/f\(\#\)), their harmonic function is the same (II). They also both have the same 1\text{ct} relationship to their respective tonics.

(3) The technique of the third sequence (mm. 29-30) is similar to that of the first, that is, a sequential harmonic pattern is fitted to a non-sequential melodic shape. The succession of downward fifths D\text{\#7} - G\text{\#7} is imitated by C\text{\#9} - f\text{\#}. It shows (1) a new use of the D dominant seventh, that of dominant of the Neapolitan, and (2) that the lowered seventh of bII (F\text{\#}) is the enharmonic equivalent of the leading tone, and its presence emphasizes the close association of two chords (particularly dominant sevenths) whose roots are a tritone apart. This harmonic relationship is subsequently given great emphasis (in the d-phrase groups).

The third statement (mm. 33-48) increases the rhythmic activity further, with a prevailing accompaniment of eighth-notes. The "window" texture persists with an eighth rest in the accompaniment on beat 1 and occasionally on beat 3 (mm. 37-38). The chorale theme is passed from pedals to the right hand at the midpoint.

The harmonization is completely new. For an example, compare two corresponding first measures, m. 17 and m. 33. The former shows a movement to the subdominant; the latter,
a tonicization of B (over a B pedal). Similarly, the melodic arrival on 5 in the respective fourth measures is first i, then bIII.

Sequential-like parallelisms occur in mm. 37-38 with the 5-6 motion over F#, then E. The large sequence of mm. 41-44 is given its third different harmonization in as many statements, although the upward-third-related goals remain the same (D and f"). Although the accompaniment is eighth-notes (with even the pedal joining the arpeggiation at the midpoint), the harmonic rhythm is consistent (Fig. 53) with a motion toward beat 3, which is emphasized by a change of harmony. In fact, the motion toward beat 3 is even more prominent in mm. 41-44 because of the chord succession. In the earlier statement (m. 25), the change on beat 3 is to a chord that gravitates to the subsequent beat 1. In the latter case, however, the beat 3 chord is more of a harmonic arrival, with a diminished seventh chord resolving by 1ct resolution (2ct to a minor chord in m. 43). Even though
this is relatively the same progression, the notation of the diminished seventh is with respect to the larger key area of f# minor and not the local key area of D (e\(^{b7}\) rather than the equivalent g\(^{b7}\)). This accounts for the apparent different root relationships in Figure 54. The final phrase segment, which provides the cadence on f\(^*\), becomes more contrapuntal as more voice parts are involved in linear movement.

Figure 54. Chord roots of sequence, mm. 41-44.

```
41  e^{b7}  D  |  A\(^7\)  D  |  42  b^{b7}  f\(^*\)  |  43  C\(^{b7}\)  f\(^*\)  \\
   C\(^*\)    D  |  A    D  |  44  G\(^*\)  F\(^*\)  |  C\(^*\)  F\(^*\)  \\
[f\(^*\)]:  V     VI    II    I
```

The fourth statement (mm. 49-64) begins on the subdominant. The structural effect of this shift is to allow the dominant-modulating theme to move to the tonic without needing any tonal adjustment. We observed this effect in the Prelude (PCF), also in b minor. The local connection of f\(^*\) to e is done in a conventional manner, down by fifth: f\(^*\) - B - e. Like the previous statement, the chorale theme is shifted from the pedals to the right hand at the midway point. The accompanimental rhythmic activity increases as eighth-notes are replaced by eighth-note triplets. The "window" effect is present for most downbeats and for some third beats.
The harmonic underlay is somewhat different. The first four-measure segment (mm. 49-52) has an entirely new harmonization, now arriving on V.\textsuperscript{143} The remainder of the first phrase (mm. 53-56) is similar to the third statement (mm. 37-40). The second phrase (mm. 57-64) copies the harmonization of the first statement (mm. 9-16), with its prominent Gr\textsuperscript{6} - i successions. The effect of the final cadence is lessened by the connective bass line in the pedals (m. 64).

The next section (mmm. 65-80) is suspiciously cast into the same harmonic structure: two phrases of eight measures each, with a modulation to [v] at the end. This new harmonization, as we shall see, will be combined with the chorale theme later in the piece. We thus have another occurrence of a typical technique of Franck, that of the separate statement of harmonic and melodic materials that are subsequently combined. The new harmonization is no mere succession of chords, but it possesses melodic and harmonic character that is (1) uniquely its own and (2) contrasting to the previous settings of the chorale theme.

The first phrase (mm. 68-72) contains a large descent in the bass, spanning an octave and a fourth. Included are harmonically supported notes as well as unsupported passing notes.

\textsuperscript{143}Note that the melodic arrival on 5 has now been harmonized with i, III, and V.
tones. A brief tonicization of D occurs in m. 70 before the large half cadence on F# in mm. 71-72. The second phrase supports the sequential aspect of the theme (that is yet to be juxtaposed), with two two-measure units (mm. 73-76). Unlike any of the four previous corresponding chorale segments, the units indirectly tonicize D and F with the following succession: IV - V/V - V (with a 4-3 motion on the dominant). The sequence is an ea type; that the external intervals are adjusted can be seen from the initial downbeat in each unit: G, B, D.\textsuperscript{144} The local connection between the units is achieved by means of an augmented triad. Although the function is clearly linear (anticipation of, or passing to, the subsequent tenor note), the sound of the vertical sonority is unmistakable. A linear interpretation is given in Figure 55a. An alternate interpretation views the equidistant augmented sonority as functioning as V with respect to both previous and subsequent harmonies (Fig. 55b). It must be said that this only works for the half-step-related successions (F' - G with V as F' - A' - C' or D - F' - A' and C' - D with V as C' - E' - G' or A - C' - F'). The step-related chords A' and B must be regarded as a deceptive motion. These

\textsuperscript{144}There are only two units. The second unit, however, connects to a chord as if a third unit were beginning (m. 77).
augmented sonorities along with (1) the F* half cadence (m.72), and (2) the opening melody give this section its distinctive plaintive quality.

The following b-phrase (mm. 80b-83) is a large connection from tonic to dominant. It is constructed of sequence, and the whole phrase itself is sequenced. A harmonic reduction is given in Figure 56. The units of the small sequence are two beats in length, and thus create a beat grouping different from the 3-beat meter. A prominent melodic aspect is the descent of the bass from 5 to 5, a similar shape as the previous a-phrase group.

Several harmonic aspects also have been seen before. First, the phrase goal is V, which has been the only goal up
to this point (tonicized by half-cadence or secondary authentic cadence, and in the tonal areas of b and e).

Second, the C\# - D - A - D succession of mm. 81-82, with its opening 1ct resolution and its emphasis of D, is remarkably similar to the first unit of the chorale sequence, as harmonized in mm. 41-42. Although the surface of the b-phrase is different, these melodic and harmonic similarities offer an underlying continuity which at least partially justifies their presence.

The b-phrase is sequenced up by minor third (mm. 83b-86) and the resultant goal is E ([A]: V) in m. 86. The following short c-phrase (mm. 86b-89) continues the 3-to-4-voice contrapuntal texture of the b-phrases. It is comprised of a sequence of two-beat units, with downward-fifth-related harmonies. Thus the E of the previous phrase leads (via E - A - D - G) to G, the subdominant of D. The cadence approach is also constructed in a sequence-like fashion (m. 88), and the C\# - B appoggiatura on the g\(\text{b}^7\)/E\(7\) of beat 2 reminds the listener of a similar earlier gesture (m. 66). This phrase provides a conclusive cadence on D, the first one that is neither locally nor more largely a V.

\footnote{The sequential melodic figure in the right hand (m. 81, beat 1) is an e\(\text{b}^7\). There is, however, a C\# pedal through the whole measure. This changes the e\(\text{b}^7\) into a C\#.}
The following d-phrase group (mm. 90-105) is constructed similarly to the b-phrase group. A small sequence opens the phrase, and the whole phrase is used as the first unit of a sequence. The prominent aspect of the units of the small sequence is the juxtaposition of tritone-equivalent dominant sevenths (F♯7 - C7 and G♯7 - D7). The alto and bass of the first chord of each unit undergo a voice exchange, with the augmented V♯ as the mediating sonority. As if to blur the distinction between the two chords, Franck uses a Tristanesque 4 - 5 retardation on the goal V7, creating the succession shown in Example 111.

Example 111. Connection of tritone-related chords.

The external interval of an upward step is present in two ways: (1) It occurs as in the obvious comparison of corresponding places, e.g., F♯7 to G♯7 (mm. 90-92). (2) The local succession of C7 - G♯7 is the sound of tonic to Gr6, regarded as II - I. In any case, the arrival of the sequence is D7 (m. 93). As the phrase continues, the D7 resolves as a German sixth to f♯6, another example of this
prominent gesture. This $f^*_{5}$ is but a temporary goal, and the following $B^7$ ($[f'_{4}]$: IV$^7$) becomes VI in the key of D, which is the goal. The tritone equivalence is present in the latter part of the phrase as $B^7$ (Gr$^6$) substitutes for $E^7$ in the downward fifth progression, $B^7 - B^b^7$ (=E$^7$) - A$^7$ - D (=VI - II - V - I). The consequent phrase begins (m. 98) up a minor third with respect to the first phrase (A compared with F$^4$). If followed through completely, this upward minor third transposition would have resulted in a goal of F major (up a minor third from D--m. 97 to m. 105). To keep the goal within the diatonic regions of b, Franck adjusts by half-step in mm. 101-102 in order to allow the goal to be F$^*$ (Fig. 57).

Figure 57. Half-step adjustment.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>90</th>
<th>98</th>
<th>105</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

Following the F$^*$ cadence (mm. 104-105), another b-b-c-phrase group brings an authentic cadence on B (as it did on D, mm. 80b-89). A new connection (denoted * in Fig. 58) is needed between the b-phrases to allow the final goal to be B. Otherwise the goal would be G, or would need to start in d$^*$. The next two-phrase period (E, mm. 115-126) concludes both halves of the entire work, thus giving the piece a
large-scale two-part structure. This chorale-style section, in B major, does not contain the chorale theme, nor is it even able to be combined with it. Davies characterizes this phrase as one of several variations which preserve the shape of the theme without actually presenting it.\textsuperscript{146} He goes on to note the similarity to the Christ motif of "Les Béatitudes."\textsuperscript{147}

While it is true that certain melodic resemblences can be observed, more important is the recurrence of certain harmonic successions and relationships. Initially, the bass line is constructed on a descending scale passage, and as such resembles the bass pattern of the a-phrase group (mm. 65-80). Second, the $G^6 - i$ progression is present twice, both times tonicizing $g^\#$ minor (mm. 116-117 and 121-122). In both cases the goal harmony is in root position, thus giving the aural sense of an upward third ($^{\text{ii}_2}^{\text{VI}} - I$). An upward third precedes the $E$ harmony, thus forming a

\begin{align*}
\text{mm. 80b-89} & \quad b \quad \text{f*} \quad \text{b} \quad \text{A} \quad \text{D} \\
\text{mm. 105b-114} & \quad \text{B} \quad \text{F*} \quad \text{F} \quad \text{B}
\end{align*}

\textsuperscript{146} Laurence Davies, \textit{César Franck} (London: Dent, 1973), 81.

\textsuperscript{147} The similarity extends only to the first three melodic pitches $5 - 6 - 2$ harmonized as follows: $I - vi^6 - \text{ii}_2^5 - V_5^\text{ii}$. 
succession C - E - G	extsuperscript{#}. This succession (Fig. 59) performs
the harmonic function of connecting the widely distant
tonalities G major and g	extsuperscript{#} minor.

The C minor-major sonority of m. 120 arises from a
downward resolution of the bass, 6 - 4 - 4 (with respect to
G), harmonically supported by a succession that, in
reverse, usually gravitates toward V, rather than away from it: I	extsuperscript{4} - vii	extsuperscript{7}/V - iv	extsuperscript{m7}.

The augmented triad is present
in both dominant (m. 120, Fig. 59) and passing (mm. 123-124)
forms.

Figure 59. Upward third-related harmonies.

\[
\begin{array}{ccc}
120 & 121 & 122 \\
C\textsuperscript{m7} & E' & (E\textsuperscript{7}) & g\textsuperscript{#} \\
iv & V\textsuperscript{7} & I=\textsuperscript{m7}VI (=II) & i \\
G & E & & g\textsuperscript{#} \\
\end{array}
\]

An interesting sequence occurs in the opening measures
(mm. 115-118, Ex. 112). The melodic pattern is diatonically
repeated down by third. The harmonic pattern is also
repeated through two chords, with the Gr\textsuperscript{6} (E\textsuperscript{7}, bVI or II)
corresponding diatonically to the VI\textsuperscript{7} (G\textsuperscript{47}) of the first
unit. The harmonic pattern breaks here, because the

\[\textsuperscript{148}\text{The unusual major seventh is purely melodically-}
\text{based. Indeed, B is a central tone of the melody and is}
\text{part of each of the chords and keys shown in Fig. 59.}\]

\[\textsuperscript{149}\text{This is a common harmonic shape of the Violin sonata.}
\text{See, for example, the first movement, m. 97 and m. 109.}\]
following harmony is not the local II (A*\(^7\)), but the local V (D*\(^7\)). Both however, accommodate an A* melodic note, so the melodic pattern continues. The 4-3 suspension on the replacement D* chord of m. 118 further increases the similarity of the expected (A*, corresponding to m. 116) and actual (D*, m. 118) sounds. One reason that D*, rather than A*, was chosen is that in minor, the diatonic fifth between \(^b\)VI and II is a tritone (unlike VI - II in the major mode). Because of the lowered seventh on the VI (thus creating an augmented sixth), the supertonic function of the same chord is heightened considerably. As a result, the progression on to A* would not sound like a downward fifth succession, but more like a tritone shift (as in mm. 90-101).

A final characteristic of Franck is seen in the approach to the cadence. The tonic major becomes minor (m. 117).

Example 112. Chorale No. 2 in B Minor, mm. 115-118.
124), and the cadential succession employs a sonority agreeing with the 33 melodic note (vii67/V). The major tonic then returns at the tonic arrival with what is perceived locally as a tierce de Picardie.

With this the first large section now comes to a rather final close in the tonic major. This entire E-phrase group is used as the final section of the entire piece as well, thus identifying the balanced two-part structure.

The opening of the second large section (m. 127) is just as much a factor in the distinction between the two parts. Beginning with an improvisatory-type section, the f- and fl-groups establish a new point of beginning by the use of contrasting materials. Harmonically, it provides, on the largest level, a connection from the previous B cadence to the half cadence on D (m. 147), which leads to the next chorale variation in g minor. A large half cadence on A (m. 135) mediates the section, separating similar (but not identical) phrases.

Texturally, the "window" effect focuses attention on certain important melodic notes (e.g., mm. 127 and 129) that fall on metric strong beats. Related to this is the downbeat whose accompaniment voices are not resting, but are tied over, and thus not articulated (e.g., mm. 132 and 133).

Several previously-stated harmonic gestures find new forms in this section. To begin with, the I - bVI shift is
thrown into relief at the opening of the respective phrases. (Ex. 113 shows the first phrase.) A closely-related sonority, the German sixth, is present in harmonic and melodic forms. Its harmonic succession to tonic (vi or ii

Example 113. Chorale No. 2 in B Minor, mm. 127-130.

Largamente con fantasia

© 1987 Dover Publications
Used by Permission

to I), seen before in the chorale harmonization, is found here in several places (mm. 129 and 134). The two notes forming the augmented sixth gravitate out to the octave. When inverted the interval becomes a diminished third. In this passage the diminished third is used as a melodic interval to give a bidirectional resolution to a specific
note. This bidirectional effect is accorded each note of a G major triad in mm. 128 (Ex. 114). This melodic device is used throughout this passage; in mm. 129-130 it resolves into a chord tone of a diminished seventh (E♭) and in mm. 138-139 it even resolves into a non-chord tone (F).

Example 114. Bidirectional gravitation to ⅖ triad members.

Another related event is the 2 ct resolution of the diminished seventh to a minor triad in mm. 132. This resolution (Ex. 115a) is but one half-step different from the G♭₃ - i succession (Ex. 115b). Indeed, both have been used prominently and both may be viewed as a general II - I progression.¹⁵⁰

Example 115. 2 ct resolution of diminished seventh.

¹⁵⁰The diminished seventh has previously resolved to a major triad by 1 ct. Recall (chapter 2) that the 2 ct resolution is a special type of the 1 ct resolution in which the chord of resolution is a minor chord.
Another curious succession (Ex. 116) leads to both of the half cadences of this section. The large-scale movement is from $I^6$ to $V$. A combination of passing and neighboring tones, however, interpose the $E_b$ and $B_b$ of a Neapolitan chord (in D). Since the $F^*$ is retained from the $I^6$, the aural impression is that of $e^b$ minor in first inversion. As a result, the arrival of $A^7$ is given a degree of remoteness. (At the corresponding place in the second phrase group (m. 146), a $5$ pedal is added beneath the $I^6$ and $b_{ii}^6$, thus emphasizing its contrapuntal rather than harmonic nature.)

Example 116. Contrapuntal elaboration of dominant approach.

The second phrase group (fl, mm. 136-147) begins and ends as the former phrase (mm. 127-135) does but must be adjusted in the middle to account for the harmonic goal (Fig. 60). The point of divergence is on beat 2 of m. 138. Melodically, the correspondence resumes in m. 143; the harmonic correspondence, in m. 144, beat 3. (Different bass notes result in some new positions.)
The chorale returns, initially in g minor, to form the basis of a fugato (m. 148, ff.). The first phrase of the chorale theme (8 measures), with its arrival on the dominant is used as the subject. As is characteristic of dominant-modulating subjects, the answer is tonal, with a downward step adjustment at some point (e.g., m. 157, beat 3) that allows the pattern that would modulate to V/V to go to tonic. A structural diagram of the fugato is given in Figure 61.

The opening tenor melody is not a countersubject in the strictest sense, because it does not reappear in the fugato section. It does recur, however, as the bass line to the opening of the final chorale statement (mm. 258-265). One motive in particular that is defined by the countersubject is the ascending fourth followed by a descending second or third. It is found with metric stress on the first note.
(mm. 150-151) and on the second note (mm. 148-149). The third shapes of mm. 152-153 are also related.

At m. 163 the non-subject voices become more harmonic, and a distinct melodic shape, that of successive appoggiaturas related by downward step, appears. This device (a primary characteristic of the Prelude, Chorale, and Fugue and the Finale) comes to prominence in the E\textsuperscript{b} subject-answer pair.

A canon at the octave (mm. 170-179a) separates the g minor statements from those in E\textsuperscript{b}. A third free voice is added below (Fig. 61) to give support to the harmony and to give it a particular direction. The harmonic movement is by successive downward fifths with the first three and the last receiving tonicization: g (mm. 172-173a), c (mm. 175-176), f (m. 177), Bb (mm. 178-179), E\textsuperscript{b} (mm. 179, ff.).

The subsequent E\textsuperscript{b} statement (mm. 180, ff.) is the climax of the fugato, and both the "window" texture and the harmonic progression have been heard before (e.g., mm. 33-40). The II - I that was formerly in major, e\textsuperscript{b7} - D (mm. 35-36), is now in minor with a different variety of II, G\textsuperscript{b} - I (mm. 182-183).

Elided with the E\textsuperscript{b} cadence of the E\textsuperscript{b} answer is the opening of the next section (m. 195), a combination of the A-theme in the manuals with the chorale melody in the pedals. We have already noted the correspondences between the structure and harmonic outline of the two.
This entire section (mm. 195-210) is sequenced up by augmented second (e♭ to f♯). Because of the dominant minor ending (m. 210), the successive relationship is perceived as a i - bvi shift (b♭ - f♯). A particular voice leading motion of the bass, B♭ - A♭ - G - F♯ (Ex. 117a), aids the rather abrupt tonal shift, and an implied augmented sixth (half-diminished variety) is formed (Ex. 117b). The f♯ statement (mm. 211-226) is harmonically the same, with some melodic elaboration.

Example 117. Connection of bvi-related harmonies.

Upon arriving in c♯ minor (m. 226), Franck develops motives from the fugato countersubject in an extended section with large downward fifth relationships. An initial sequence comprises two four-measure units (mm. 226-230a, 230-234a), each moving down by fifth, c♯ to f♯ and f♯ to b. Structurally this large section (mm. 226-257) prepares for the final entrance of the chorale theme. Harmonically, we might expect the clearly-stated downward fifths to be an indication of tonal return. Before tonal
return is accomplished and confirmed, however, two significant sequentially-determined harmonic shifts occur: (1) A sequence of the previous material results in a goal of G (m. 238), which becomes the German sixth of b. (2) A second sequence is spun out of the d-phrase material (mm. 251-253 and 254-257). The goal of this second sequential passage is also G (m. 257), and it also resolves as an augmented sixth. Now let us examine these two shifts in greater detail.

When the previous sequence arrives at its goal of B (m. 234), the B is not tonic, but dominant seventh (compare the first beats of mm. 230 and 234). This adjustment, however, is of no tonal significance. What is significant is the new use of the downward succession of three half-step-related diminished sevenths. This succession was present in the former sequence in which it generated the downward fifth movement (Ex. 118).¹⁵¹

In the latter sequence (mm. 234-238a), a similar succession of diminished sevenths generates an upward minor third movement (Ex. 119). To do this, the relationship of the diminished seventh is changed. Before, the initial diminished seventh contained the bass (f⁷ containing C⁷, before the end of its metric duration, the third diminished seventh is transformed into its equivalent dominant seventh (e.g., the C⁷ of Ex. 118).
Example 118. Downward fifth movement, \textit{Chorale No. 2 in B Minor}, mm. 228-230a.

\begin{center}
\begin{tabular}{c}
\textbf{a.} \\
\includegraphics[width=0.8\textwidth]{example118a.png}
\end{tabular}
\end{center}

\textit{© 1987 Dover Publications Used by Permission}

\begin{center}
\begin{tabular}{c}
\textbf{b.} \\
\text{f}^\#_7 \text{b}^\#_7 \text{C}^7 \text{f}^\# \\
\text{(D}^b) \text{(G}^b) \text{C}^\# \text{F}^\#
\end{tabular}
\end{center}

\textit{pedal C}^\# \text{----------------- F}^\#

\text{as in Ex. 118). Since the bass was tonic, the downward diminished sevenths resulted in a II - V - I motion.}

Example 119. New harmonic goal for downward-fifth succession.

\begin{center}
\begin{tabular}{c}
\textbf{a.} \\
\includegraphics[width=0.8\textwidth]{example119a.png}
\end{tabular}
\end{center}

\textit{© 1987 Dover Publications Used by Permission}

\begin{center}
\begin{tabular}{c}
\textbf{b.} \\
\text{(a}^\#_7) \text{b}^6_7 \text{G}^5_7 \\
\text{B F}^\# \text{G}^\#
\end{tabular}
\end{center}

\text{B E A}
Here, not only is bass 5, but the diminished seventh (of the upper parts) does not contain the bass (a\(^\text{#o7}\) not containing F\(^\#\), as in Ex. 119). Rather the bass is the equivalent root of the diminished seventh. Thus the downward fifth progresses F\(^*\) - B - E - A, or V - I - [A]: V - I. The G\(^f\) as root of the second diminished seventh in Example 119 is only given because of the notation of the chord as a b\(^\text{#o7}\) ([b]: VI). The fact that the latter movement begins relatively a fifth lower (V rather than II) allows the relationship of the successive key areas to be correspondingly a fifth beyond (B to A, down two fifths, rather than C\(^\#\) to F\(^\#\), down one fifth).

An interesting foreshadowing of this modulatory device is the succession of m. 234-235a. Although the harmonies are not diminished sevenths, they do have the parallel minor thirds descending by half-step. All four are dominant sevenths, with the third one notated as a Gr\(^5\). The underlying harmonic function, then, is V - I - II - V.\(^{152}\) Note also the imitative motives of the soprano and bass.

The second unit of the sequence moves another downward step, A to G. While this G\(^7\) is ultimately Gr\(^6\) of the

\(^{152}\) When speaking of the diminished seventh, the I - II (upward step) relationship is equivalent to a downward fifth. Even though the II is not a diminished seventh but a German sixth, the similarity to the descending diminished seventh succession should be apparent.
returning key of b, locally it resolves as a dominant (to C). Two associations are thereby made: (1) The G - C relationship reminds the listener of the downward fifth movements (large- and small-scale) of the previous material. (2) The C dominant seventh resolves to an F♯7, and thereby reminds the listener of the d-phrase group (both previous and subsequent), with its prominent tritone-related dominant sevenths.

When the F♯ dominant is finally reached in m. 246, another statement of the d-phrase group ensues. This time, however, a pedal is added to insure a stronger tonal association with the key of b. The first two units proceed as before: F♯7 - C7, G♯7 - D7 (mm. 246-249). The subsequent two measures (mm. 250-251) are also as before, with the addition of the F♯ pedal. Because of the pedal, the goal of the Gr6 - i succession sounds like a tonic, rather than a dominant, which is the case if the resolution is to tonic six-four (as in the earlier occurrence, m. 95).

This harmonic/melodic motion (mm. 250-251) is sequenced up by minor third (mm. 252-253) and the Gr6 (♭VI or II) is replaced by vii°7/V (still a II, however). The choice of d°7 rather than F7 for m. 252 is probably to smooth the connection from f♯. These relationships are shown in Figure 62. Note that the d°7 of m. 252 has a double meaning: vii°7/V (=b°7 or II) in the previous key of
f* and vii°/V (d°7 or II) in the subsequent key of a.
Although the succession of f* to F7 (Fig. 62b) would have
been logical on the grounds of the associative effect of
the sequence (and Franck relies on this association
elsewhere), the adjustment of m. 252 lessens the immediate
abruptness.

Figure 62. Harmonic connections, mm. 250-253.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>250</th>
<th>251</th>
<th>252</th>
<th>253</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a. actual</td>
<td>D7</td>
<td>f°</td>
<td>(b°7 =) d°7</td>
<td>a</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. exact</td>
<td>D7</td>
<td>f°</td>
<td>F7</td>
<td>a</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

At the point where the third unit would begin (with
either a German sixth or a diminished seventh), a new
sequence begins, also with a dominant seventh, but a
different one than expected. A continuation would have
placed A°7 (or a°7) in m. 254. The C is present in the bass,
as if the pattern were continuing. The dominant seventh is,
however, C7. This sequence (mm. 254-257) is constructed
harmonically identical to the last one (Fig. 63), including
the changing of the German sixth to the equivalent
diminished seventh in the corresponding place of the second
unit. The melodic element of both soprano and bass are
different from the first sequence. As if to emphasize the
Gr6 - i relationship and its importance to the piece, the G
harmony of m. 257 is turned into an augmented-sixth chord
(beat 3), and it is **this** chord, and **not** the dominant, that
precedes the return of tonic and the final chorale theme of m. 258.

The final chorale theme is stated in octaves, the first half in the soprano (mm. 258-265) and the second half in the bass (mm. 266-273). This is an opposite arrangement from the earlier divided statements (mm. 33, ff., and 49, ff.). A tonal shift is made between the two halves of the theme. The F♯ dominant of m. 265 quickly becomes B7, allowing the following phrase to be transposed down by fifth. This, in turn, allows the dominant modulation to lead to the tonic.

Figure 63. Comparison of sequences.

mm. 250, ff.: D7 f# d♯7 a
mm. 254, ff.: C7 e a♭7 (=c♯7) G

The first half of the chorale theme is accompanied by the fugato countersubject. The "window" texture is also present, with the inner accompaniment voices supporting the harmony on the melodically-unarticulated beats. The second half emphasizes the G♭ - b and the b♭7 - b progressions.

Quite prominent is the common tone B, which is doubled in octaves and is the highest pitch. This succession is similar, though not identical, to the sequences of the preceding passage. There (Fig. 63), as here, the G♭ of the first unit is replaced by a diminished seventh in the second unit. Unlike the former, however, this passage does not
link the units by sequence, even though the chorale melody maintains its sequential nature. A comparison of the relationships is given in Figure 64.

The second half of this final phrase becomes quieter as the cadence approaches. With the dynamic and thematic climaxes already achieved, Franck opts for a quiet close, using the e-phrase group to end the piece as a whole. This section is also the concluding portion of the first large section. As a final element, this section summarizes several of the salient harmonic features of the chorale: (1) divergent sequences, (2) augmented triads, and (3) G6-i successions.

Figure 64. German sixth-diminished seventh interchange.

mm. 254  C7  e  a4#7(=c4#7)  G
mm. 266  G7  b  b57(=e5#7)  b
(chorale melody) mm. 266  G  D  B  F#

To summarize, then, we find a large two-part structure identified by balanced closure. In addition, the improvisatory nature of the opening of the second half further identifies a point of beginning. The chorale theme is cast in two large segments, the first concluding with an arrival on V, and the second concluding with a tonicization of the minor dominant. The open-ended feature allows immediate repetition in the same tonality. The theme itself
is characteristic of a bass line. It is not varied in any way (except for the tonal adjustment in the fugato subject/answer version); rather, the melody, harmony, and accompaniment texture continually change around it. Throughout the work, the chorale theme itself is thrown into relief by the "window" texture of the accompaniment. This is true, despite the composite rhythm of the accompaniment. The separate statement of subsequently combined materials, a favorite device of Franck, continues to be prominent in this work.

Sequence is an important constructive device. The chorale theme partially dictates one sequence (though it is not always harmonically realized); and harmonic sequences are employed even with non-sequential melodic units.

Certain harmonic successions recur in thematic and nontematic sections. Among the more prominent are the Gm6 - i succession and the closely-related vii_VI/V - i succession. The harmonic function of both is II - I, yet the dominant seventh on b6 can be equally viewed as bVI. As if to emphasize this tritone equivalency, one sequential section juxtaposes dominant sevenths related by tritone.
Possessing a character all its own, the third chorale displays some of Franck’s most adventurous harmonic relationships. Certain aspects of structure (such as the specific means of thematic combination) are also unique among the chorales. A large three-part structure can be observed (Fig. 65), with the sections demarcated by contrasting thematic materials. The three primary thematic elements are quite disparate: the chorale theme itself, the bravura arpeggiation of the a-b phrase pair, and the long-breathed lines of the dolce expressivo Adagio theme.

The work opens with an improvisatory-like passage, characterized by arpeggiation, pedal points, abrupt pauses, and linear harmonies. The opening phrase (a, mm. 1-5) is generally descending, and a line proceeding mostly by half-steps from A down to B can be observed in the first seven measures (Ex. 120). The harmony moves in a corresponding fashion with parallel sonorities and local successions being determined more by linear resolution than by root progression. The bass remains on A as a pedal in m. 1 and 2, but accompanies the descent with its own descent in m. 3. Because the bass moves in m. 3, a sequence involving all
Figure 65. Chorale No. 3 in A Minor structural diagram.
voices is formed.\textsuperscript{153} This shift is significant, for it emphasizes the six-four that occurs on beat 1 by sequencing Example 120. Half-step descent, mm. 1-4.

\begin{center}
\begin{figure}[h]
\centering
\includegraphics[width=0.7\textwidth]{example120.png}
\end{figure}
\end{center}

it down by step on beat 3. As we will presently see, the six-four is a particularly often used sonority in this piece. Pivoting on the diminished seventh chords accomplishes this sequence, as shown in Figure 66.

\begin{center}
\textbf{Figure 66. Minor third pivot on diminished sevenths.}
\end{center}

\begin{center}
\begin{figure}[h]
\centering
\includegraphics[width=0.7\textwidth]{figure66.png}
\end{figure}
\end{center}

Although the arpeggiated texture is primarily harmonic in structure, one important melodic element is delineated in the first measure. This motive consists of an incomplete neighbor note, and is stated twice in the first measure (Ex. 121). The neighbor note implies a harmonic change, since the third below occurs on the following sixteenth-note.

\begin{center}
\begin{figure}[h]
\centering
\includegraphics[width=0.7\textwidth]{example121.png}
\end{figure}
\end{center}

\textsuperscript{153}In m. 2 the upper voices are sequential above the bass pedal.
A contrasting gesture, consisting of two chords, follows the abrupt ending of the a-phrase. Marked \textit{Largamente}, this gesture (b, mm. 6-7) is set off from the surrounding material by significant pauses and is thereby given greater dramatic effect. It begins on an upward arpeggiated dominant four-three and resolves to a different dominant seventh with an elaboration. This harmonic pair is used with four different relationships between the two chords. Because of the common elements, I will discuss each of these at this point.

Example 121. Incomplete neighbor note, m. 1.

The first one (b) resolves down by half-step and employs a 4-3 suspension on the dominant seventh chord of resolution (Ex. 122a). This is the G\textsuperscript{6} - V\textsuperscript{7}, or more generally, the II - V, relationship. Because of the suspension and the presence of the minor ninth on the dominant resolution, a degree of common tone connection (two common tones on the surface) is achieved between these otherwise discrete sonorities.

The second pair (bl) employs a tritone relationship with a 7 - 8 - b9 - 7 elaboration on the dominant chord of
resolution (Ex. 122b). Again, two common tones are held, but this time it is because they are actually present in the two tritone-related dominant sevenths.

Example 122. Comparison of b-phrases: b (a); b1 (b); b2 (c); b3 (d).

The third pair (b2) employs an upward minor third relationship and $b^7 - 6$ suspension on the dominant six-five (Ex. 122c). Because of both of these aspects, this illustrates the pivot on the diminished seventh rather clearly, with the $B^b$ dominant seventh (of Ex. 122c) changed into $d^9$ which returns to the dominant equivalent of an $f^9$ ($D^b7$).

The fourth pair (b3) employs an upward fifth relationship and a 6 - 7 elaboration (retardation) as shown in Example 122d.

We must note that the dramatic use of the dominant four-three sonority in the b-type phrases can be related to the prominent use of the six-four sonority in the chorale theme. It is true, however, that although they are both second inversion chords, the six-four and the dominant four-three sonorities differ with respect to their tendencies. Whereas the six-four sonority occurs in this work primarily
as a passing chord, the dominant four-three, although it is dissonant, can almost stand alone. In this respect, it is similar to the diminished seventh, almost taking on a consonant status. Certainly the use of inverted dominant sevenths with foreign resolutions and with no resolution at all lends support to this view.

Structurally, the b-phrases function as a dramatic contrast to the a-phrase arpeggiation and linear harmonies. Because of the variable relationship between the two chords, and between successive statements of this gesture, the b-phrase is an ideal connecting phrase, with just about any harmonic connection possible. In three different instances, the a-b group serves as an introduction to a primary theme of the work (see Fig. 65): (1) before the first chorale statement, in the tonic (mm. 1-20), (2) before the second chorale statement, in the dominant (mm. 48-56), and (3) before the contrasting Adagio theme (mm. 80-96).

Returning to the opening measures, the first phrase pair (a-b, mm. 1-7) sets up a move to the subdominant by concluding on an A dominant seventh. A tritone equivalence is present in this first pair, as the arpeggiated $g^{7}$ (E) proceeds to $B_{b}^{9}$ (E) before arriving on the A dominant ninth (m. 7).

A second a-phrase (al, m. 8) begins in d minor. It continues identically for three measures and two beats. The
point of divergence (C on beat 3 of m. 11), along with its chord of preparation, becomes a unit of sequence, moving down by step. The phrase concludes with a parallel treatment of an $f^{\#7}$ (mm. 13-14).

Following this is a sequence (mm. 15-20a), each unit of which is one statement of the bl-phrase (see Ex. 122b). The tritone equivalences in the respective units are B - F, $D^\flat$ - G, and $E^\flat$ - A. As in other passages in which sequence forms the primary means of association, the successive connections between the units are more remote. Here the successive connection is that of two dominant sevenths moving down by major third ($F^7$ - $D^b7$, $G^7$ - $E^b7$).

At the arrival of the third unit (m. 20), Franck replaces the expected A dominant seventh with its equivalent diminished seventh ($c^{\#7}$). A textural change accompanies the harmonic change: The 7 - 8 - $b9$ - 7 elaboration is now in sixteenth-notes, but the half rest is gone, replaced by arpeggiation figures reminiscent of the a-phrase. This passage connects $c^{\#7}$ to E dominant seventh, an equivalent upward fifth (A to E).

In a reversal of the pattern of the b-phrase arpeggiation, a following c-phrase employs descending arpeggiated chords as it prepares for the mood and texture of the chorale theme. Significantly, the cadence on a minor (m. 26) is approached through two measures of F followed by
one measure of E. The effect of the dominant E is also delayed and lessened by various aspects of the bass: (1) a non-chord tone (C), (2) an alteration (B♭), and (3) the four-three position.

Franck smooths the seams between the opening fantasia and the chorale theme by using a favorite device, that of motivic imitation. The first imitation (mm. 26-27) recalls the downward arpeggiation of mm. 23-25. Here, however, the descending third is passed through successively lower voices, while a harmonic palindrome prolongs the tonic. As shown in Example 123, the root succession moves thus, A - B - E - B - A. This return to A is significant for both its melodic and harmonic aspects. Harmonically, it omits the dominant as it progresses from II to I. This cadence is used again as the first cadence (d-phrase) of the chorale theme. Melodically, it emphasizes the D - D♯ - E motion, or
more generally, 4 - 5 - 6, with 5 being supported by the
tonic harmony. The second imitation (mm. 28-30) overlaps
the various statements of its motive, which is a variant of
the head of the chorale theme. It replaces the opening
upward fourth with an upward third (Ex. 124).

Example 124. Motive relationship to chorale theme.

The chorale theme itself contains some of the most
foreign relationships in all of Franck's late keyboard
works. Key relationships include a movement to 6iii (mm.
38-40), and other successive chord relationships (such as
6vi - V) surprise the listener.

Structurally, the chorale theme is comprised of two
sets of phrases (mm. 30b-47 and 56b-79) separated by an a-b
interlude (mm. 48-56a). The first set consists of three
phrases (d, e, f), cadencing on i, 6iii, and v,
respectively. Both of the first two phrases are five
measures in length. An extension prolonging the cadence
chord creates the five-measure unit from what would
otherwise be a four-measure phrase. Every phrase of the
chorale theme (except for h and h1) has this extension. The
second set consists of five phrases (d, g, h, h1, g1) and
cadences on v, V/v, I, and i, respectively. The fourth phrase (h1), although it emphasizes the tonic through a Phrygian-like progression, has no real cadence point (mm. 73-74), but rather connects to the following phrase.

Sequence is a primary associative device in the construction of the chorale melody. The ee/mh sequence, with its attendant tonal shifts, is conspicuously missing. Rather, most sequences involve only the melody (ee/m), and tonal shifts and abrupt successions occur not as a consequence of the sequence, but rather in spite of it. Phrases d, f, and h/h1 are constructed in this manner.

The Phrygian element is present here as $b_2$ substitutes for $\hat{2}$ in linear passages or in more harmonically-oriented dominant function chords. A particularly characteristic sound is the half-diminished seventh chord built on the dominant E (Ex. 125).

Example 125. "Phrygian" dominant.

Now let us examine the chorale theme phrase by phrase: The d-phrase (mm. 30b-35a) sequences its opening motive up by fourth (Ex. 126). This gives a subdominant direction to the phrase, before its cadence on the tonic. In fact, the
The e-phrase (Ex. 127), though not sequential, demonstrates the technique of making nonsequential units appear sequential. The opening melody first drops a third, E - C, and then drops a fourth, D - A. In the accompanying harmony Franck creates the sound of a sequence by placing parallel sonorities as the goal of each unit, $C^\flat_4$ and $a^\flat_4$, respectively. The opening augmented sonority (Ex. 127, m.
35) is a common connector from any minor tonic to the six-four position of its relative major. The notation of the bass note as an A♭, rather than as a G♯, clearly identifies its passing character to the goal, G. This same bass note could have been accompanied with a diminished seventh, had the melody note (E) not disallowed it. This hypothetical diminished seventh (g♭7 = b♭7) is the same succession that was used earlier (mm. 3, 10).

Example 127. Chorale No. 3 in A Minor, e-phrase, mm. 35b-40a.

A reading of the harmonic roots is given in Example 127. Note that the succession of B♭ to a♯ creates the Phrygian sound. The succession of three six-four sonorities (mm. 36-37a) is unusual, except for their linear function. Note that they form a part of a bass descent from A to D: A - A♭ - G - F - E - E♭ - D. An alternate view would take into account the near-sequential units of mm. 35b-36a and 36b-37a and would see the C♯ and a♯ as intermediate tonal
goals, and thus, structurally more important. Consequently, the B♭ is passing from one to the other and is of less structural importance. Following the a, the tritone equivalence is demonstrated by the succession of a German sixth to a V/V.\textsuperscript{154} Though two voices move, the harmonic function remains D (II in the goal key of C). The cadence is on c minor in m. 40; the degree of remoteness (a minor to c minor) is caused only by a modal shift at the cadence point. Without the shift, the modulation would have been simply to the relative major.

The f-phrase (mm. 40b-47, Ex. 128) effects a harmonic connection from c minor to e minor. In so doing, several distant relationships are employed. Melodically, two sequences form the basis of the connection. The harmonic roots are given in Example 128. The E♭ augmented sonority (m. 41) is passing, connecting two augmented sixths. It also has a harmonic function, for it represents the G dominant (with E♭ substituting for D). The supertonic function persists into m. 42 as the augmented sixth resolves (as it did earlier, mm. 37-38, Ex. 127) to V/V. The dominant four-three here is a definite reference to the b-phrase (m. 15-18). As the second unit of sequence begins, the succession of D♭ to f surprises the listener. The

\textsuperscript{154}This sound reminds the listener of the previous b-phrases (mm. 15-18).
succession of harmonic roots is just as unclear: Is it D to F, or D to B? The following succession, that of b°7 to e6 is just as surprising. Although the implied roots may be E for both, the pair resembles the Phrygian-like progression of Example 125, and indeed, the b°7 is one half-step removed from the e6 dominant shown there. The close (but not adjacent) association of f6 (m. 43) and e6 (m. 44) also adds a Phrygian element to the phrase. That e minor is now the tonic is established by the B dominant seventh of m. 44. It resolves deceptively, to VI6 (C), in m. 45. The end of this
phrase illustrates divergent points of arrival. The bass (and, by extension, the harmonic) arrival is on the downbeat of m. 45 when E is stated for the first time. Confirming this is the B dominant seventh immediately prior to it. The melodic arrival, however, is not until the downbeat of m. 46 when it reaches E. The linear motion that accompanies the melodic completion (m. 45) introduces an F major sonority, thus giving the effect of a Phrygian cadence. Although the Phrygian sound is unmistakable in the melody and linear harmony, the harmonic arrival is not by Phrygian cadence by authentic cadence one measure earlier.

The extension that prolongs the cadence harmony (mm. 46-47) is lengthened by two beats. Comparing mm. 34-35 with mm. 46-47, we see first six beats, then eight beats of tonic. The reason for the two extra beats is that the final phrase does not have the anacrusis of a subsequent phrase taken out of the end.

At this point, the first half of the chorale theme is concluded. Between the two halves, an a-b phrase group is inserted. The a-phrase (mm. 48-52) is identical to the opening phrase transposed to the minor dominant. Between the a- and b-phrases an abrupt shift of an upward minor third is effected (Fig. 67). This is easily done, since the chord before the shift is a diminished seventh. The connection is then a different interpretation of the diminished seventh.
The pair of chords in the b-phrase is, like the opening, down by half-step. A second b-phrase (mm. 55-56a) connects $C^\flat$ to $B$. As a result, the original tonality (e minor, from m. 48) is returned, but not without surface digression. At this point, the chorale theme resumes in the key of e minor. Parallel to the first half, a d-phrase opens the second half. A completely new phrase (g) follows (Ex. 129). It is the only one to make use of pairing. Note that the opening descending fourth is expanded to a fifth. This descending fourth (a prominent aspect of the f-phrase, mm. 44-45) is also used later in the phrase (m. 64). The harmonic goal of the phrase is the local dominant $B$. It occurs initially in m. 63. To extend $B$, and to allow the melodic element its completion, a submediant (c) is employed (m. 64). This submediant is notable because it is minor. Although the $b^\text{vi} - V$ succession is considerably remote, it does have a degree of continuity in the common tone $E^b/D^b$. The dominant is deprived of some of its freshness by the statement of the enharmonic leading tone one measure early. Indeed, with the passing tone $A$ on beat
4 of m. 64, an a\textsuperscript{7} is formed, which is but one half-step different from the B equivalent, d\textsuperscript{7}.

Example 129. Chorale No. 3 in A Minor, g-phrase, mm. 61b-66.

Following the arrival on B as dominant, the next phrase (h, mm. 66b-70) opens by negating the leading tone (Ex. 130). B dominant becomes b minor before proceeding down by fifth, to E, then to A. The chorale-opening motive (d, mm. 30b-32a) is present in its upward-third form (Ex. 124) and the harmony is the same: minor tonic (b) prolonged with a Phrygian-like linear chord (C). In the h-phrase the tonic pedal is not in the lowest voice, but in the tenor. A
significant consequence of this is the occurrence of second inversion chords in succession (C⁴ and b⁴). The b minor chord undergoes a further alteration as it becomes half-diminished before resolving to E as dominant of A. The cadence on A is well-defined, yet the bass propels the motion beyond A into the next phrase.

Example 130. Chorale No. 3 in A Minor, h-phrase, mm. 66b-70a.

The next phrase (hi, Ex. 131) begins as a downward step sequence to the previous phrase. The same major-minor shift occurs in mm. 70-71a. The B⁶ and a⁵ occur as before, although two new bass interpolations (♯⁹, G⁴, and ♯⁶, F⁴) occur in mm. 70 and 71, respectively.

Unlike before, the a⁵ is a temporary point of arrival. It is prolonged as both the bass and the tenor take up the motive of Example 124. The bass statement (E - G - F - E) changes nothing harmonically because it is in shorter rhythmic values receiving no harmonic support. The tenor
statement (A - C - Bb - A) includes the e⁶ chord, with its characteristic Phrygian sound, in m. 73.

Example 131. Chorale No. 3 in A Minor, hl-phrase, mm. 70b-74.

The motivic motion of the bass in mm. 72-73 continues in the following phrase (g1, Ex. 132). This phrase is similar to the original g-phrase (Ex. 129) with its paired descending fourth and fifth. An interesting harmonic succession accompanies the melodic material. It is quite common for Franck to prepare a significant cadence with a downward fifth succession that is either not the customary quality or not on the expected degree.¹⁵⁵ Such is the case here. Beginning on F dominant seventh ([a]: G⁶), the succession proceeds as

¹⁵⁵An example of a downward fifth succession that is both the customary quality and customary degree is iii - vi - ii - V, or all dominant sevenths, V/vi - V/ii - V/V - V.
shown in Example 133. The downward fifth series can be seen by examining the implied chord roots. One reason that

Example 132. Chorale No. 3 in A Minor, g1-phrase, mm. 74b-79.

the first chord is F dominant seventh and that the third chord is g7 is that the pitch F can kept as a common tone through the first three chords. An equivalent succession of all diminished sevenths would be as in Example 134. Notice that at the place where the diminished seventh pivot occurs

Other significant examples of this technique include the E major organ chorale, mm. 52-54 and 61-63, and the Fugue (PCF), mm. 215 and 367.
Example 133. Harmonic reduction of gl-phrase, mm. 74b-78.

(third chord), one diminished seventh accounts for two chord (g⁷ and C⁷) of the surface. The effect of this "foreign" downward fifth succession is to give the following arrival on tonic a sense of newness. Note also the characteristic dominant voicing V⁷, with a 5-4 anticipation in the soprano.

Example 134. Descending fully-diminished seventh succession.

At this point the chorale exposition is concluded. Each of the two halves of the chorale theme has been set in its own section complete with a-b introduction. The next large section of the piece (m. 80, ff.) begins similarly, with an a-b introduction. Although the arpeggiated texture and motivic outlines (e.g., the incomplete upper neighbor of Ex. 121) are similar to the previous a-phrases, the harmonic connections are different, and certain melodic elements are
new. A rising eighth-note line in the left-hand is new; also, the descending progression of m. 3 has been replaced by an upward moving succession that tonicizes the subdominant. The subdominant emphasis is common to earlier and later a-phrases. In the earlier occurrence, however, a b-phrase separates the two statements, and the entire a-phrase begins anew in the subdominant (m. 8, ff.). In this occurrence, only the first two measures of the a-phrase are repeated immediately in the subdominant (m. 83, ff.) as a sequence over an A pedal.

The final two beats of m. 84 are used as the first unit of a separate sequence (mm. 84b-85). The harmonic connection is that of diminished sevenths moving down by half-steps (c#o7, d#o7, E7, equivalent to diminished sevenths on c, c, and b), although the specific voicing moves upward. A g#o7 (dominant of A) is prolonged with arpeggations throughout mm. 86-87 and tonic arrives in m. 88. The tonic is prolonged (mm. 88-89) with a tonicizing progression that is equivalent to the sequence of mm. 84b-85: c#o7 - d#o7 - g#o7 or A - D=B - E. Beneath this progression a tonic pedal is prolonged. This tonic confirmation is new to the a-phrase, which has previously ended with an unstable diminished seventh chord.

Just as before, a b-phrase follows, this time, however, connected by downward fifth (A - D) rather than by a pivot.
on the diminished seventh. Two new relationships are employed in the internal connection of the three successive b-phrases: an upward minor third (D - F), and an upward fifth (F - C and A - E). (See Ex. 122c and d.) It is important that the final resolution be one whose upper note is the seventh of the dominant seventh (Ex. 122b or d). The seventh (-progressions (particularly of the b-phrases) give a sense of newness to the original tonic.

The Adagio section (m. 96b, ff.) provides an extreme contrast to all that has come before. A single melodic line, set off by the use of the oboe and trumpet stops, dominates the texture, accompanied softly in the left hand and pedal. This passage has been referred to as Franck's "infinite melody." The texture is not without obvious seams, however. The first two phrases (mm. 97-99 and 100-102) come to an obvious harmonic and melodic close. Beyond that, the phrases that have a more continuous melodic line still have harmonic punctuation (e.g., mm. 106 and 112).

In characteristic fashion, Franck creates this melody by the persistent use of sequence. Another melodic device common to his lyrical melodies is that of the unstressed downbeat. The continual suspending of melodic tones into the next metric unit adds another degree of instability.\textsuperscript{158} A related technique is that of making the first sixteenth dissonant, even though it is not suspended from the previous chord. Such is the case in m. 101.

Harmonically, both of the first two phrases (i and ii, mm. 97-99 and 100-102) cadence on $f^\#$. The first one (mm. 98-99) is a conventional authentic cadence. The second one has a Phrygian sound, although it has different harmonic and melodic points of arrival, similar to an earlier cadence (f, m. 45-46, Ex. 128). Here the large harmonic movement is from D to $F^\#$ (mm. 100 to 101). Over the $F^\#$ pedal, however, the melody continues to outline a progression tonicizing $f^\#$: $a^\#_7 - b - e^\#_7 - f^\# - D - G - f^\#$. The expected final dominant (or diminished seventh) is not present, and in its place is a G major chord. The succession of G to $F^\#$ gives the Phrygian quality. The fact that the $F^\#$ chord is major (and quickly becomes dominant seventh) almost changes the impression of G - $F^\#$ to that of $^3_{VI} - V$.

\textsuperscript{158}Not all notes that are tied over create dissonance (e.g., m. 97, beat 3, and m. 98, beat 1).
The intersections between the phrases are filled with elaborating lines in the accompaniment. In m. 102, the harmonic shift (to F as dominant) is performed by these inner lines. The previous measure of intersection (m. 99) recalled the 4 - 6 - 6 motive (from mm. 27-28).

A sequence forms the basis of m. 103. The sequence involves only the melody, although certain parts of the harmonic progression are parallel. The chords and chord roots are given in Figure 68. The movement is basically I - bII - V - I in D (which itself is a secondary key area of A). The E and the D are parallel points, and the "boundary shape"--D is the origin and goal of the sequence--offers a second point of association. The B that occurs on the second eighth-note of beat 3 is clearly passing although it offers a momentary reference (1) to the augmented sixth - tonic (II - I) cadence of the chorale theme (mm. 34-35, Ex. 126) and (2) to the "palindrome" shape seen earlier (mm. 26-28).

Figure 68. Harmonic roots, m. 63.

\[
\begin{array}{cccc}
D^\flat & E^b & \text{C}^\#_6 & B^b_5 D^6 \\
D & E^b & A & (E) D \\
\end{array}
\]

The next measure (m. 104) is also a sequence of two-beat units. Its basic harmonic direction is that of
dominant sevenths moving down by half-step. As such, they function as successive II - V progressions: a German sixth resolving to V\(^7\), which then is reinterpreted as a German sixth (Fig. 69). The last dominant seventh is replaced by its equivalent diminished seventh to allow the return of A as tonic. The phrase concludes with a half-cadence on E.
This phrase is unique among all the material of the piece in that it occurs only once.

Figure 69. Harmonic roots, m. 104.

\[
\begin{align*}
\text{E}^b & \quad \text{A}^7 & \quad \text{A}^b & \quad (G^7) & \quad g^\text{b}\text{7} \\
\text{E} & \quad \text{A}\text{b} & \quad \text{D} & \quad \text{G} \\
\text{E}^b & \quad \text{A}^b & \quad \text{E} & \quad \text{E}\text{b} \\
\text{II} & \quad \text{V} & \quad \text{II} & \quad \text{V} & \quad \text{V} & \quad \text{V} \\
\text{D} & \quad \text{Db} & \quad \text{C} & \quad \text{a}
\end{align*}
\]

The following phrase (k, mm. 106-111) illustrates Franck's extended use of the ea/mh sequence. The units are six beats in length (Ex. 135). Melodically, each opens with an outline of a (local) tonic triad, followed by an elaborated repetition. The harmonic underlay for this four beats is I - V - I - V. Then, for two beats, a descending chromatic line is accompanied by descending tritones (implying dominant or diminished sevenths). This connects to the local $\sharp$ which is reinterpreted as the fifth of the triad for the next unit. An A pedal persists through the
three units of the sequence. This A is the root of the local tonic (A) in the first unit, the third of the local tonic (F#) in the second unit, and the fifth of the local tonic (D) in the third unit. An exact external relationship would have been A - F# - Eb. Because of the adjustment, the goal of the sequence (D) is close to the key, even though the surface seems to digress. The adjustment is made on the second eighth-note of the third beat of m. 108 (Ex. 135). Note that the leap from C# up to F# is not followed by F# - C# (as it is relatively in m. 107), but F# - C#. Beneath, an additional descending
tritone is added to fill the larger external interval of a major third.

The end of the k-phrase is filled with another smaller sequence (m. 110). Significantly, its two units refer to the vii°₃ - I₆ relationship seen in the opening a-phrase. The two six-four’s are f⁶ and A, respectively, but the six-four on A becomes a four-three, dominant of D. The measure of D (m. 111) provides a subdominant connection to the return of A, while the melody continues unabated directly into the return (i-phrase, m. 112).

The final member of this section is an i-phrase (mm. 112-115), a repeat of the opening Adagio melody. To it is added an extension, which arrives at tonic through the subdominant. (Note the pedal notes D and A, mm. 115-116.) A fleeting g₇ is present on the final beat of m. 115, for a reference to the dominant. In a reversal of Franck’s usual modal shifts, the A major becomes a minor at the cadence, and the extension returns the major mode.

A new section of chorale development begins at measure 117. This section features the chorale theme and the Adagio theme juxtaposed in alternate overlapping phrases. One might imagine that the combination of such disparate themes would result in a disjointed effect. On the contrary, Franck is able to make it musically cohesive. Says Davies of this section, "[it is] both fragmentary and
unified, one of the most subtle, if simple, that Franck ever wrote.¹⁵⁹

The chorale, in its first three phrases (d, e, f) is in major and this necessarily calls for new harmonization. The first phrase is quite striking and very different in character. The third note now is a G♯, and as a leading tone, is harmonized with V. Gone is the II – I cadence of the first phrase. The D is accompanied by a B♭⁷ in the succession B⁷ – B♭⁷ – E. Though this succession may be surprising, both of its salient characteristics (the half-step downward dominant sevenths and the tritone-equivalent dominant sevenths) have been heard before.

The Adagio theme begins on the E dominant with its seventh (D) suspended into the next measure. Melodically, it is identical to the previous i-phrases. Harmonically, the second measure is altered to allow a tonicization of A, rather than f♯ (Ex. 136).

Example 136. Reharmonization of i-phrase motive.

---

The second phrase of the chorale theme (e) begins in m. 120b. Its mediant modulation is adjusted according to the mode, so that A major goes to C minor. As such, the relationship is closer than the original: a minor to C minor. The harmonic basis of this phrase is given in Figure 70. B flat is again prominent in this new harmonization, this time following F\#7 (equivalent to G\#6 - I). As before, A follows. The pivot to the mediant is achieved by changing the quality of the d\#7 (=II in A) to a dominant seventh (II in C\#) via the 1ct resolution.

Figure 70. Harmonic roots, mm. 120b-122.

\[
\begin{array}{lcc}
121 & 1 & 122 \\
A & F^7 & B^b & A & d\#7 & E & A & B & D^7 & G^7 & C^\# \\
A & F^\# & E & A & B & D^\# & G^\# & C^\# \\
\end{array}
\]

\[
(II - I) \\
\]

\[
\begin{array}{cccc}
I & VI & V & I \\
\hline
A & II & V & I \\
& & C^\# & I \\
\end{array}
\]

In exactly the same position as the d-phrase, namely the second eighth-note of the V (m. 118, beat 4), the interpolated Adagio theme enters (m. 122, beat 2). As before, the seventh of the V (F\#, 4) is suspended into the following beat. This is the first phrase of the Adagio again (i-phrase), and it confirms C\# (mm. 123-124).

The third and final chorale phrase (f, mm. 124b-126) begins a third higher than expected. Previously the first note was the same as the cadence note of the preceding
phrase (mm. 40, C). Here, C♯ of m. 122 becomes E♯ of m. 124 after the interpolated Adagio theme. As a result, the goal is a third higher (G♯, not E). A downward fifth succession (G♯ - C♯ - F♯ - B) returns the tonality from the mediant. The Phrygian cadence is kept intact, although the harmonic arrival has come earlier. Note that, in m. 126, G♯ as the bass is present from the first descending-fourth motive. In the earlier occurrence (mm. 44-45, Ex. 128), the bass note E does not arrive until the second descending fourth.

At this point, the k-phrase (mm. 127-130), with its ea sequence, takes the tonality through g♯, f (with an enharmonic shift), and D♭. Following this, the i-phrase motive, in both its forms (beginning on 4 and on 5), is used imitatively on the levels of D♭ (m. 131) and f (m. 132). A C♯ emerges at m. 133 and a long k-based sequence ensues. This kl-phrase begins in the third position of the previous sequence (e.g., mm. 106-109), that is, with the bass note as fifth of the implied tonic (here, C). As if to take this process one further step, a further downward third is effected in m. 134 as C progresses to A. Rather than using the head of the kl-phrase, only the second measure is used. Now the bass G, which is consonant throughout, is the seventh of the melodic sonority.

The final measure of the unit (m. 135) uses a bass ascent in characteristic dominant-diminished seventh
alternation with two-beat units of sequence (Fig. 71). Upon arriving on the D\textsubscript{i} of m. 136, the entire k1-phrase is repeated up a step from m. 133. It, too, effects an upward step, and its conclusion reaches on E\textsubscript{i} in m. 139.

Figure 71. Harmonic roots, mm. 135-136a.

\begin{align*}
\text{bass:} & \quad \text{135} & \quad \text{136} \\
& \quad \text{G} \quad \text{A}\text{b} \quad \text{A} \quad \text{E}\text{b} \quad \text{A} \\
& \quad \text{G}\text{b}\text{7} \quad \text{A}\text{b}\text{7} \quad \text{A}\text{7} \quad \text{B}\text{b}\text{7} \quad \text{D}\text{i} \\
& \quad \text{E}\text{b} \quad \text{A}\text{b} \quad \text{A} \quad \text{E} \quad \text{A/D} \\
& \quad \text{F} \quad \text{B}\text{b}
\end{align*}

Over the E\textsubscript{i} the chorale theme returns, foreshadowing the chorale-recapitulation section that is to follow (m. 147, ff.). One statement of the chorale-opening d-phrase in the soprano (mm. 140-142) is followed by another in the bass (mm. 142-144). The second statement replaces the Gr\textsuperscript{6} - i cadence with a 1\textsuperscript{ct} vii\textsuperscript{6} - VI\textsuperscript{6} deceptive cadence. At this point, C is prolonged (and even tonicized by a b\textsuperscript{7}) over a pedal on E. Quite common for Franck, the pedal on the third of the chord persists into the following section.

After a registral ascent climaxing on the C\textsuperscript{6} of m. 146, the arpeggiated a-phrase returns, still extending C\textsuperscript{6}. The incomplete neighbor note is given full harmonic support with a tonicizing b\textsuperscript{7}. The whole texture moves up by half-step to D\textsuperscript{b6} by the use of a 1\textsuperscript{ct} resolution of e\textsuperscript{7} (mm. 148-149).
A similar connection performs a second shift, to D♭ (m. 151).

Three factors identify this point as the beginning of the final chorale-recapitulation section: (1) the climax of the preceding material (m. 145-146), (2) the complete sectional break (with fermata) in m. 146, and (3) the return of the introductory a-phrase material. While it is true that some chorale development is yet to come (e.g., the sequential passage of mm. 157-168), this material leads directly to the final statement beginning in m. 173.

The sequence of mm. 153-154 resembles the downward diminished/dominant sevenths of the k-phrase (mm. 106-109). Its external intervals are not adjusted, because at the outset the pedal is on the third of the triad. Thus, to make it successively the fifth and (minor) seventh, the two thirds are of the same quality: minor. The harmonic roots are given in Figure 72. One non-parallel element may be

Figure 72. Harmonic roots, mm. 153-155a.

\[
\begin{align*}
D^6 & \quad e_{57} & a_{47} & | B^4 & \quad c_{57} & A^7 & | G^4 \\
D & \quad E & \quad A & | A' & \quad D' & \quad G^2 \\
C^4 & \quad F^4 & \quad B & \quad C^4
\end{align*}
\]

noted: The third chord of the first unit is a_{57}, V (A) in D and V (F') in B. In the corresponding place in the second unit, a dominant seventh is used. The parallel
harmony would have been $f^{\#07}$. In any case, $D^\#$ is the root of both.

Over the $G^\#$, the chorale opening (d) appears in the right hand. Because $G^\#$ is V and not i, the Phrygian-like $f^\#$ minor chord becomes iv, and the $A - G^\#$ relationship is not $b^2 - 1$, but rather $b^6 - 5$. The downward moving tritones (related to the previous diminished/dominant seventh succession) find their way into the harmonization here, as shown in Figure 73. The dominant four-two sonority never resolves; rather it functions as a half-consonant chord, similar to another inverted dominant seventh, the four-three of the b-phrase.

Figure 73. Diminished/dominant seventh succession, mm. 159-161a.

\[
\begin{array}{cccccc}
159 & | & G^\# & g^\#7 & | & C^\# & a^\#7 & d^\#7 & | & G^\# \\
160 & | & G^\# & G^\# & | & C' & F^\# & B=D & | & G^\#
\end{array}
\]

[c]: $\text{V} = \text{II} \quad \text{V} \quad \text{I} \quad \text{IV} = \text{II} \quad \text{V}$

The slip of $G^\#$ to $G^\#$ for a second statement is performed by a pivot on a diminished seventh: $G^\#7$ resolves to $b^\#7$ (=C$^\#$ - C$^\#$, down by fifth). This $b^\#7$, showing its resolution from its notation, resolves to its equivalent dominant seventh, G, and a second unit (on $G^\#$) is begun. This second unit proceeds exactly as the first until m. 169.
Although neither the G$^{7}_1$ nor the G$^{2}_2$ resolves as expected (to a tonic-function harmony), the primary tendency tone of both (the chord seventh) does resolve. Note that the F$^{b}$ of m. 161 resolves downward by half-step to F (enharmonically equivalent to E$^{#}$) as the G$^{#}_2$ resolves to b$^{7}$. Also, the seventh of G (F) resolves down to E (m. 169) as G resolves to c$^{97}$.

The longer range resolution at this point is G to E, which is the dominant for the final return of the chorale theme in m. 173. Although an E pedal is present from m. 169, the actual E dominant is elaborated in two different ways: (1) In mm. 169-170, another diminished seventh, c$^{770}$ = a$^{770}$, alternates with the dominant, g$^{b7}$. This relationship is the upward half-step or upward fifth (A-E) relationship. Alternately, this can be viewed as the 1st-related diminished seventh to the dominant E. The upper note of the right hand arpeggiation contains an important melodic motive, the chromatically ascending G - C$^{7}$ - (A) - A$^1$ - B, which is echoed later over the tonic (m. 173) C - C$^{1}$ - D - D$^{b}$ - E. We recall this motive from m. 26-28 in a form using both descent from and ascent to the fifth of the chord (E). (2) In mm. 171-172, an upward half-step progression moves the bass pedal, E, up to B to connect it linearly to A (m. 173). The linear progression is accompanied by a parallel voice in major, then minor, thirds.
At m. 173 the chorale returns for its final statement. The chorale melody proceeds in broad chords in the right hand. In a combination typical of Franck, the shape of the improvisatory a-phrase becomes the left hand accompaniment. An important adjustment is made in the accompanimental pattern: Before, the upper neighbor was followed by a lower third (see Ex. 121), which implied a harmonic change. Here, the upper neighbor is followed by a lower second. This change reduces the structural importance of the neighbor from a chord to a single note. This shows that the improvisatory element is completely subsumed under the chorale melody.

The phrase structure of the final chorale is abbreviated (Fig. 74). The chorale harmonization is the same through the entire statement. Between the e- and f-phrases there is a downward fifth shift (m. 183). This allows the Phrygian-sounding cadence on the dominant in the first f-phrase to cadence on the tonic in the latter occurrence.

Figure 74. Comparison of chorale phrase structure.

m. 30, ff.  
\[d\ e\ f\ (a/b)\ d\ g\ h\ h_1\ g_1\]

m. 173, ff.  
\[d\ e\ f\ g_1\]

The connection is made following the e-phrase cadence on $b_3iii$, between the tonic and the augmented sixth of this secondary key area. Instead of an augmented sixth on $b_3^6$.\]
the augmented sixth is built on $b^2$ ($=V$, m. 183). Finally, Franck could not let the sense of tonality be obscured by the ambiguity of the modal-sounding cadences, so he chose the gl-phrase (mm. 190b-194), with its downward fifth (or half-step) diminished sevenths (see Ex. 133) and its sudden return to a suspended dominant, as the conclusion and final cadence (mm. 193-194).

Following the final cadence, the descending arpeggiation texture of the c-phrase returns. The harmony emphasizes the subdominant function (F and d), and a plagal extension with tierce de Picardie ends the work.

To summarize, then, we find a large sectional structure with three discrete themes: the a-b improvisatory element, the chorale theme itself, and the Adagio theme. The themes are combined in a way that is unlike the other chorales: that of interpolated phrases of different themes. Another theme combination technique, that of using one theme to define an accompaniment figuration for another theme, is common to the chorales.

Both the chorale theme and the Adagio theme possess modal elements, yet Franck maintains the sense of tonality by clearly defined tonal arrivals. (A parallel exists here, with Franck’s use of highly chromatic and sequential elements: they usually support large-scale diatonic relationships.) The Phrygian element exists chiefly in
linear chords which embellish tonal arrivals. The chorale theme also contains other foreign tonal associations, such as b\textsuperscript{iii} and b\textsuperscript{vi}.

The six-four chord is used extensively both as a connecting chord and as an intermediate goal. The opening sonority of the dramatic b-phrase, the dominant four-three, is also used as a harmonic connector, achieving several different harmonic connections.

Franck continues his use of the ea sequence (particularly with major and minor thirds and overall perfect fifth), again reflecting large-scale tonal directions. The downward fifth progression finds consistent use, yet with tritone substitution, alteration, and diminished seventh substitution (and pivot). The principle of association, found chiefly in sequence in this chorale, is extended to the juxtaposition of nonsequential units that are made to be parallel melodically or harmonically.
The harmonic and contrapuntal techniques of Franck's late keyboard works may be summarized under these headings: (1) contrapuntal techniques, (2) sequential and pairing techniques, and (3) other harmonic techniques.

**Contrapuntal Techniques**

We can recognize the role of counterpoint in these five works in six different, but not necessarily discrete, ways: (1) **Surface counterpoint** concerns the local linear movement of otherwise non-melodic inner voices. By the addition of passing tones and neighbor tones, the harmony may be enriched, but essentially remains the same. (2) **Structural counterpoint** concerns the simultaneous elaboration of two linear progressions, usually the soprano and bass. New, but nevertheless embellishing, harmonies are thus created. (3) **Thematic elaboration** concerns the change of diminution of a certain pattern or passage. Though this is not the simultaneous combination of two linear elements (and thus, in the strictest sense, is not counterpoint), it is the successive statement of linear elements based on the same model. (4) **Fully contrapuntal** passages occur when all
voices move in a primarily linear fashion. (5) **Thematic combination** occurs when two melodies, each important as an independent entity, are stated simultaneously. Each of these five types of counterpoint will be discussed in turn.

**Surface Counterpoint**

Primarily an elaborative device, surface counterpoint embellishes a functional harmonic progression. The motion is necessarily local, and, while there is a sense of linear movement, the contrapuntal element is motivic and short-lived (Exx. 54 and 56). This type of surface phenomenon occurs typically in a chorale-style texture in which a strict number of voice parts is maintained. Throughout the homophonic sections of these five works (and especially in the organ chorales), Franck uses this technique extensively.

Another technique associated with surface elaboration is the overlapping statements of the same motive in imitative fashion. This "interweaving" technique may be seen in the passages listed in Figure 75.\(^{160}\)

In all of these occurrences, the contrapuntal element provides most, if not all, of the forward motion, since its basis is a single prolonged harmony.

---

\(^{160}\) The designation "PCF" refers to the *Prelude, Chorale, and Fugue*, and the designation "PAF" refers to the *Prelude, Aria, and Finale*. 
Figure 75. Summary of passages displaying motivic interweaving.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Device</th>
<th>mm.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>PCF Link</td>
<td>121-122</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>140-142</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PAF Aria</td>
<td>194-195</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>201-202</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Finale</td>
<td>547-553</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chorale no. 1</td>
<td>95-96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>255-259</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chorale no. 3</td>
<td>28-30</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Structural counterpoint

Again primarily an elaborative device, structural counterpoint simultaneously elaborates two linear progressions. In so doing, a new vertical structure is formed. While the elaborative function of such a chord may be clear in one context, it may be less clear in another context. Further, the aural quality of the new harmonic succession must be considered at least for the purpose of description and comparison.

A particularly often employed device is the half-step elaboration of the dominant pitch in the bass. It is frequently combined with other linear movements that result in an alternate sonority such as an augmented sixth or a $V_6^5/vi$. Franck often makes the elaborative sonority into a harmonic sonority by using it to make a connection to a dominant seventh on a different tonal level. Prominent passages of dominant elaboration are listed in Figure 76.
Simultaneous linear movements may be extended over an entire passage (as in the Link, PCF, Ex. 31). The linearly-motivated vertical sonorities may take on harmonic significance in new contexts (Exx. 43, 44, and 46); they may also make reference to other gestures that are prominent in the work (Exx. 51, 52, 53, and 70). The presence of dissonance in two simultaneous voices may create sonorities or progressions that have more than one harmonic interpretation (Exx. 79, 80, and 116).

Related to the technique of structural counterpoint is that of the linear bass. This aspect of Franck’s counterpoint is frequently part of his contrapuntal and harmonic practice. A linear bass may be used in a surface manner (Ex. 117, also PCF, Fugue, mm. 315-321). When the passing

---

**Figure 76. Summary of dominant elaborations.**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Movement</th>
<th>kk.</th>
<th>mm.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>PCF Prelude</td>
<td>5-6</td>
<td>20-21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chorale</td>
<td>98-99</td>
<td>137-157</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Link</td>
<td>137-157</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PAF Prelude</td>
<td>5-9</td>
<td>28-31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Finale</td>
<td>327-330</td>
<td>437-441</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chorale no. 1</td>
<td>138-140</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chorale no. 2</td>
<td>238-241</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chorale no. 3</td>
<td>133-142</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---
tones and neighbor tones of a linear bass take on consonant support, the resultant progression, because it is linearly motivated, may not always be functional in terms of the succession of harmonic roots (Exx. 13, 78, and 105; see also PCF, Prelude, mm. 19-21).

Thematic elaboration

This aspect is associated with the contrapuntal techniques because it is a linear device. The change of melodic diminution is quite a common technique throughout the eighteenth century, finding its way into works as diverse as chorale preludes and variation sets. Prominent passages of this technique are listed in Figure 77.

Figure 77. Summary of thematic elaboration.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>model</th>
<th>elaboration</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>PAF Aria</td>
<td>mm. 225b-229</td>
<td>265b-269</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chorale no. 1</td>
<td>mm. 1-4</td>
<td>65-68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>mm. 16-19</td>
<td>73-76</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Fully contrapuntal sections

When all voices are linearly motivated, the texture is fully contrapuntal. The passage may be of varying length, and it may be fugal, canonic, or imitative in a less strict manner. A listing of the prominent fully contrapuntal passages of these five works is given in Figure 78.
**Figure 78. Summary of fully contrapuntal sections.**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Movement</th>
<th>Sections</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>PCF Prelude</td>
<td>mm. 29b-40</td>
<td>motivic, no subject, sequential</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fugue</td>
<td>mm. 158-178</td>
<td>Fugue subject with countersubject, first fugal exposition, 4 vc. entries: i - v - i - v</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fugue</td>
<td>mm. 218-225</td>
<td>inverted fugue subject</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fugue</td>
<td>mm. 244-255</td>
<td>Fugue subject with 2 countersubjects, third fugal exposition, 3-vc. triple invertible, entries by successive downward major thirds</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PAF Prelude</td>
<td>mm. 84-124</td>
<td>o-p phrase, theme-repetitions with contrapuntal treatment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chorale no. 2</td>
<td>mm. 148-194</td>
<td>fugato, with tonal answer, entries: i - v - bVI - bIII</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Many of these sections also illustrate one or more of the other contrapuntal techniques. For example, the Prelude (PCF) passage cited above, with its strong harmonic underpinnings, is an example of structural counterpoint. The Prelude (PAF) passage features both thematic elaboration (but not of the primary theme) and thematic combination.

Considering the different nature of the movements in which major contrapuntal sections occur (listed in Fig. 78), it is not hard to see that the sections, as a whole, perform different structural roles, or functions. In the Fugue (PCF), the fully contrapuntal sections are a point of departure; they are the initial element of the first and third structural units. In the Prelude (PAF), however, the fully contrapuntal section is a point of extreme contrast.
(mood and composite rhythm, in addition to texture) to the prevailing homophonic Prelude. The fugato of the second organ chorale is also a point of contrast, marking the opening of the second large section.

Except for the b minor chorale passage, none of the contrapuntal sections provides any sort of closure. The Prelude (PAF) section could not because of its unfailing adherence to the open-ended o-p theme (with phrase goals of i and V, respectively). The two Fugue sections provide a weak V - i progression, but in both cases the motion is propelled past the cadence. Common to all of the fully contrapuntal sections is the immediate return of a homophonic texture which provides additional development and subsequent tonal arrival.

Thematic combination

This device occurs most frequently in settings that are more harmonic than the fully contrapuntal sections. Its use may be further divided among the following sub-types: (1) the nonsimultaneous yet overlapping combination of linear elements (the "interweaving" technique extended to different melodic ideas, supported by the harmonic progression of an

---

161 On a smaller level, the o-p section does initiate a structural unit (see Fig. 26). This smaller point of departure is not to be confused with the larger role of contrast versus, in the Fugue, a return to the prevailing (or expected) texture.
entire phrase), (2) combination of a theme with itself in
canon and other smaller points of imitation,\textsuperscript{162} (3) combin-
ation of a theme with a new countermelody, and (4) combin-
ation of two primary themes. A summary of the important
occurrences of this device is given in Figure 79.\textsuperscript{163}

The combination of two primary themes (type 4 in Fig.
79) is an important cyclic aspect of both of the piano
works. In a similar manner, thematic combination is an
important aspect of development and unity in the single
movement organ chorales. In the Fugue (PCF), the Chorale
theme is combined with the Fugue subject in two successive
entries (i and iv). With the addition of the Prelude
arpeggiation texture, the triptych is effectively summed up
by the simultaneous occurrence of elements of all three
movements. Indeed, this point is the dramatic climax not
only of the movement (as the return of tonic in the final
exposition), but also of the work as a whole.

\textsuperscript{162}It is important to note that the line between the
type 2 imitative passages listed in Fig. 79 and the fully
contrapuntal passages listed in Fig. 78 is not necessarily
discrete. The general criteria for distinguishing the two
is the length of the passage, with the less structurally
substantive sections listed in Fig. 79.

\textsuperscript{163}Neither the chart in Fig. 79, nor the subset of type
4 thematic combination may be taken as a complete summary of
the cyclic aspects of these works. Although it presents the
simultaneous combination of two primary themes, it does not
deal with the recall of motives, textures, and singly-stated
themes from previous movements.
Figure 79. Summary of thematic combination.

Legend:  
- type 1 - interweaving  
- type 2 - canon  
- type 3 - new countermelody  
- type 4 - two primary themes

| Type | Fugue mm. | Prelude mm. | Prelude mm. | Prelude mm. | Prelude mm. | Prelude mm. | Prelude mm. | Prelude mm. | Aria mm. | Aria mm. | Aria mm. | Aria mm. | Aria mm. | Aria mm. | Finale mm. | Finale mm. | Finale mm. | Chorale no. 1 mm. | Chorale no. 1 mm. | Chorale no. 1 mm. | Chorale no. 1 mm. | Chorale no. 2 mm. | Chorale no. 2 mm. | Chorale no. 2 mm. | Chorale no. 3 mm. | Chorale no. 3 mm. | Chorale no. 3 mm. |
|------|-----------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|----------|----------|----------|----------|----------|----------|-------------|-------------|-------------|------------------|------------------|------------------|------------------|------------------|------------------|------------------|------------------|------------------|
| PCF  | mm. 329b-335 | mm. 24-31 | mm. 112b-120 | mm. 124-136 | mm. 151-152 | mm. 171-174 | mm. 209b-213 | mm. 221b-225 | mm. 233b-241 | mm. 241b-245 | mm. 245b-261 | mm. 261b-265 | mm. 270-281 | mm. 357-373 | mm. 456-471 | mm. 500-522 | mm. 536-545 | mm. 76b-80 | mm. 112-114 | mm. 121-123 | mm. 170b-197 | mm. 212-214 | mm. 232b-245 | mm. 170-179 | mm. 195-226 | mm. 234, 236 | mm. 117-127 | mm. 130b-132 |
| PAF  | mm. 334b-343 | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |

The final combination of themes in the Finale (PAF) serves the same unifying purpose, but with a much different effect. The combination is of Prelude and Aria coda themes. Noticeably absent is any reference to the theme or mood of the Finale. An obvious reason is that the effect of a quiet
close (the theme combination is marked dolcissimo) would have been destroyed by anything resembling the molto agitato Finale theme. In addition, I have already noted the before-the-fact combination with the o-p Prelude theme (in the Prelude itself), which accomplishes the Prelude-Finale thematic unity.

In the organ chorales, a separate theme or passage is typically presented prior to its combination with the chorale theme. This is a significant structural and developmental device of the first two chorales. The thematic combination of the third chorale is not simultaneous. There, the phrases of the separate themes are stated successively with a small degree of overlapping at the connection points.

Thematic combination, then, is an important structural feature of these works. As such it is a harmonic and melodic determinant as well, with specific harmonies implied by the two-voice counterpoint, and, conversely, with specific boundaries for linear shapes implied by the harmonic background.

**Sequential and Pairing Techniques**

Franck’s treatment of sequential and pairing techniques may be described under five general headings: (1) construction techniques, (2) intervallic relationships, (3)
harmonic-melodic relationships, (4) successive relationships, and (5) pairing techniques.

Construction Techniques

The first technique is that of sequence nesting, that is, the grouping together of several small sequential units to form one unit of a larger sequence. Typically non-sequential elements are added to each unit, often to provide some degree of tonal stasis. Prominent occurrences of this technique are listed in Figure 80.

Figure 80. Summary of sequence nesting.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>mm.</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>PCF Prelude</td>
<td>1-4</td>
<td>Ex. 10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chorale</td>
<td>89b-93</td>
<td>Ex. 28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fugue</td>
<td>256-266</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fugue</td>
<td>270-275</td>
<td>Ex. 49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chorale no. 2</td>
<td>90-105</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chorale no. 3</td>
<td>133-139</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The second technique is that of sequential ascent. This involves the movement of a bass line upward by chromatic half-step, usually connecting a perfect fourth. This technique typically uses the diminished seventh chord; it also is often a nested sequence (Exx. 28 and 49).

The third technique is sequence truncating. This does not mean the incomplete statement of a final unit, rather it means the successive shortening of the sequential units by omitting part of the original unit. This technique has the effect of accelerating the harmonic and linear motion.
Prominent occurrences of this technique include those listed in Figure 81.

Figure 81. Summary of sequence truncating.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Technique</th>
<th>mm.</th>
<th>Ex.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>PCF Fugue</td>
<td>199-205</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fugue</td>
<td>311-331</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chorale no. 1</td>
<td>36b-43</td>
<td>106</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>218-225</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The fourth technique is that of sequence overlapping. This consists of creating a new sequence by taking a portion of a unit and combining it with a new element which becomes the unit of the new sequence (Ex. 40, also PCF, Fugue, mm. 265-266 and 267-268). This technique welds the two sequences together tightly as one structural entity.

The fifth technique is that of sequence coupling. This consists of the successive statement of two different sequences whose point of intersection is relatively remote from the tonal origin and goal. An example of this technique is found in the Prelude (PCF), mm. 33-39.

Intervallic relationships

The ea sequence (exact internal intervals and adjusted external intervals) is of particular significance in Franck's technique. It typically uses a minor third and then a major third (or vice versa) as external intervals. This serves the purpose of maintaining an overall diatonic background, because the goal is a perfect
fifth removed from the origin. The emphasis of prominent
degrees of the scale (such as ♯, ♭, and ♭) is a customary
feature of the ea sequence. This feature can also be
related to the general principle of a chromatic surface
contrasted with a diatonic background. The mediating unit
will always sound tonally foreign to the first unit, but
the third unit, because of the perfect fifth relationship
with the first, will always be closely related. Prominent
occurrences of the ea sequence include those listed in
Figure 82.

Figure 82. Summary of ea sequence.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Sequence</th>
<th>Ex.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>PCF Prelude</td>
<td>mm. 31b-32</td>
<td>Ex. 14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fugue</td>
<td>mm. 199-205</td>
<td>Ex. 44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PAF Prelude</td>
<td>mm. 5-9</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>mm. 19-20</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chorale no. 1</td>
<td>mm. 4b-7</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chorale no. 2</td>
<td>mm. 73-77</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chorale no. 3</td>
<td>mm. 106-109</td>
<td>Ex. 135</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>mm. 127-130</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Harmonic-melodic relationships

We can expect to find a wide variety of harmonic and
melodic relationships. The first common type is that of
melody-only sequence. Franck typically constructs his
melodies by sequence and pairing. Especially when the
internal intervals are exact and when the harmony is not a
part of the sequence, the harmony acts as a restrainer of
the tonality, accompanying the exact internal intervals of
the melody with chromatic chords related to the original key (Ex. 25).

Most of Franck’s larger sequences involve both harmonic and melodic parameters. The correlation of melodic and harmonic patterns occurs often; the reader is referred to numerous examples that have been previously cited (Exx. 26, 28, 40, 57, 105, and 106).

Of particular interest is the divergence of melodic and harmonic patterns. This divergence may take three forms: (1) a melodic pattern with no harmonic pattern (i.e., an $ee/m$ sequence), (2) a melodic pattern combined with a different pattern (Ex. 10, also PCF, Chorale, mm. 86-87 and PAF, Prelude, mm. 17-21a), and (3) non-sequential units that are made to appear sequential by the use of corresponding parallel sonorities (Exx. 110 and 127).

Occasionally Franck places a pedal beneath a sequence. A pedal retained from a previous unit of sequence always prolongs a reference to its original function as well as creating new dissonance/consonance relationships. Prominent occurrences of this technique are listed in Figure 83.

Successive relationships

The sequence is such a unifying device because of the repetition of a certain pattern. It is this pattern that forms the primary means of association between the units.
Figure 83. Summary of sequence combined with pedal.

| PCF Chorale | mm. 66-67a | Ex. 22 |
| Fugue       | mm. 232-239 |
| Chorale no. 2 | mm. 246-249 |
| Chorale no. 3 | mm. 2, 9 |
|             | mm. 106-109 | Ex. 135 |
|             | mm. 127-130 |
|             | mm. 133-137 |
|             | mm. 153-155 |

The connection made at the intersection of two units may be of less functional significance and can, therefore, be quite remote. Often large-scale diatonic relationships or goals mitigate the remote surface connections. Examples of remote successive relationships are listed in Figure 84.

Figure 84. Summary of remote sequential relationships.

| PCF Chorale | mm. 89b-93 | Ex. 28 |
| Fugue       | mm. 266-268 |
|             | mm. 311-331 |
| PAF Prelude | mm. 40 |
| Aria        | mm. 213b-217 |
|             | mm. 217b-221 |
|             | mm. 253b-257 |
|             | mm. 257b-261 |
| Chorale no. 1 | mm. 36b-43 |
|             | mm. 106-111 |
|             | mm. 115-120 |
| Chorale no. 2 | mm. 195-226 | Ex. 117 |
| Chorale no. 3 | mm. 15-20 |

Pairing

Related to the associative technique of sequence is that of pairing. Franck employs this technique on both surface and deeper levels, involving both melodic and
harmonic parameters. The new element of the second (or succeeding) unit, whether an enlarged melodic interval or a new harmonic goal, provides a musical focus, inevitably drawing the listener's attention to that point (Exx. 18 and 19). Franck's melodies are typically constructed by extensive use of the pairing and sequential techniques.

Other Harmonic Techniques

Certain other characteristics of Franck's harmonic style are frequent enough to warrant consideration of them individually. The following discussion will be organized as follows: (1) the diminished seventh chord, (2) cadence types, (3) cadence approaches, (4) major-minor shift, and (5) modal effects.

Diminished seventh chord

True to the harmonic practice of the nineteenth century, Franck uses the diminished seventh chord quite frequently as a means of making immediate connections with remote tonal regions. A particularly common reinterpretation in his music is the upward minor third pivot, resulting in a correspondingly related goal (such as a goal of IV replaced by bVI, or a goal of I replaced by bIII). It is this pivot that forms the prominent move to VI° that is such an integral part of the Prelude, Chorale, and Fugue.
This particular change of expectation is also prominent in several passages of the first organ chorale.

The diminished seventh often replaces its equivalent dominant seventh to add a further degree of instability. In addition, Franck often changes the function of a diminished seventh from embellishing to harmonic and vice versa. To be specific, a diminished seventh may be approached as a 1\text{ct} embellishing sonority (or be given this function in a previous parallel phrase) and resolved as a 0\text{ct} (down by fifth) harmonic sonority. The change of function also occurs in the reverse direction.

The diminished seventh chord is a specific example of the more general concept of harmonic ambiguity. As we have seen, the reading of chord roots may be given multiple interpretations. Useful criteria for determining the harmonic underlay of a passage include: (1) the actual notation, (2) the enharmonic sound, (3) the harmonic musical context, including preparation and resolution, (4) the contrapuntal musical context (i.e., the linear movement of particular voices), and (5) the comparison of a passage with parallel passages.

Cadence types

In keeping with Franck's adherence to tonality, the cadences of these works are quite conventional. In fact it
is quite often the V - I authentic cadence that provides the only element of tonal identification to a highly chromatic passage.

One significant alteration to the authentic cadence is the substitution of vii7 (in inversion) for V. This is the primary cadence type of the Chorale (PCF). In that movement, the V - I authentic cadence is minimized (occurring only twice on secondary tonal levels), and the leading tone cadence rises to prominence (Fig. 15). The most climactic cadence features the progression Gr6 - vii64 - i, which is a chromatic variation of the conventional II - V - I. Other important aspects of this cadence are: (1) the 1:ct relationship between the German sixth and the vii7 and (2) the bass movement of b5 - b6 - i. The subdominant emphasis is found in other cadences: (1) vii64 - i, with bass motion of i - i, (2) V7 - iv6, a subdominant replacement for tonic, and (3) i - ii65 - i, a subdominant extension. The inverted leading tone cadence is also a prominent aspect of the first organ chorale.

The augmented-sixth-to-tonic progression, that is, the omission of the dominant function (II - I) as a cadence type is used rarely. The third organ chorale provides one prominent example (Ex. 126). Another even more prominent example is the final cadence of the second movement of the Quintet.
progression extensively for non-cadential successions in the second organ chorale (e.g., Ex. 109).

Cadential points may be blurred by noncoinciding harmonic and melodic arrivals.

Cadence approaches

Certain of Franck's cadences are approached by a series of downward fifth-related chords. This technique is a quite common gesture in tonal music. Although Franck uses this device in a conventional way, he frequently alters it in two substantial ways: (1) by substituting diminished sevenths or tritone-related dominant sevenths (augmented-sixth type chords) for the diatonic or secondary dominant chord and (2) by placing this succession on a different level, thereby requiring a movement other than a fifth to bring about the V - I or the II - V - I. Prominent examples are listed in Figure 85.

Major-minor shift

Franck mixes the major and minor modes freely in his highly chromatic style. Modal interchange may bring about a change of tonal level, or it may provide additional gravitation within the tonal level. A common gesture is the turning of a phrase to minor as the cadence approaches and then returning to major at the point of tonic arrival (Exx. 129 and 130).
Figure 85. Summary of altered downward fifth cadence approaches.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>m.</th>
<th>mm.</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>PCF Fugue</td>
<td>215</td>
<td>98-100</td>
<td>Ex. 47</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>367</td>
<td>106-108</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PAF Prelude</td>
<td>367</td>
<td>13-15</td>
<td>Ex. 61</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>100</td>
<td>44-46</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>106</td>
<td>52-54</td>
<td>Ex. 88</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chorale no. 1</td>
<td></td>
<td>61-63</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>98-100</td>
<td>92-94</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>106-108</td>
<td>102-104</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>250-254</td>
<td>Fig. 51</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chorale no. 2</td>
<td></td>
<td>78-79</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>95-97</td>
<td>88-89</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>103-105</td>
<td>74-77</td>
<td>Exx. 132, 133</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chorale no. 3</td>
<td></td>
<td>190-193</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Modal effects

Franck's use of modality (other than the major-minor interchange) must be considered as an accessory to his chromatic style. Throughout he maintains a sense of tonality. The use of modes may be viewed as explaining certain altered qualities (such as IV in minor and v in major). The use of melodic modal patterns is most prominent in the third organ chorale. Even there, however, the Phrygian-like cadences are primarily extensions of weak authentic cadences.

The harmonic-based approach of this study owes much to the German harmonic theory of the nineteenth century (citing Weber and Sechter, specifically). While Franck's early music was certainly influenced by the French school of
thought, his later compositions show a marked influence of the nineteenth-century German practice. This is particularly evident in his chromaticism (from Wagner) and his consistent use of counterpoint. Because of Franck's adaptation of German harmonic and contrapuntal techniques, it is appropriate to use German theoretical systems to explain his music.

All of these harmonic and contrapuntal techniques contribute to Franck's individual style. Always aware of the individual voice lines, Franck uses counterpoint masterfully as both an elaboration of the harmony and a determinant for the harmony. The fact that Franck's music represents a continuity of nineteenth-century harmonic practice must be emphasized. Reinterpretation and substitution account for variation on conventional tonal progressions, resulting in a complex chromatic surface. From the analysis of the late keyboard works of Franck, we have seen the unique characteristics of the individual pieces and have observed the techniques of late nineteenth-century music in general and of Franck's personal style in particular.


