WAS IST SILVIA? ENGLÄNDERIN ODER DEUTSCHE? RESTORING
THE ORIGINAL ENGLISH TEXTS TO SONGS SCHUBERT SET IN
TRANSLATION, A LECTURE RECITAL, TOGETHER WITH
THREE RECITALS OF SELECTED WORKS OF H.
PURCELL, G. F. HÄNDEL, W. A. MOZART,
F. SCHUBERT, J. BRAHMS, H. WOLF,
F. POULENC AND OTHERS

DISSERTATION

Presented to the Graduate Council of the
University of North Texas in Partial
Fulfillment of the Requirements

For the Degree of

DOCTOR OF MUSICAL ARTS

By

Colleen R. Bolthouse, B.Mus., M.M.

Denton, Texas

May, 1995
WAS IST SILVIA? ENGLÄNDERIN ODER DEUTSCHE? RESTORING
THE ORIGINAL ENGLISH TEXTS TO SONGS SCHUBERT SET IN
TRANSLATION, A LECTURE RECITAL, TOGETHER WITH
THREE RECITALS OF SELECTED WORKS OF H.
PURCELL, G. F. HÄNDEL, W. A. MOZART,
F. SCHUBERT, J. BRAHMS, H. WOLF,
F. POULENC AND OTHERS

DISSERTATION

Presented to the Graduate Council of the
University of North Texas in Partial
Fulfillment of the Requirements

For the Degree of

DOCTOR OF MUSICAL ARTS

By

Colleen R. Bolthouse, B.Mus., M.M.

Denton, Texas

May, 1995

Franz Schubert, like many German literary and musical figures working at the beginning of the Romantic Period, was influenced by English literature, particularly the dramas of Shakespeare, the prose poems of Ossian, (James Macpherson) and the novels of Sir Walter Scott. Among Schubert’s many Lieder appear two dozen musical settings of English poems in German translation.

In one of Schubert’s few attempts to achieve commercial success, he published seven settings of poems from Sir Walter Scott’s *Lady of the Lake* in 1826. Four of the solo songs were published with vocal lines for both the German translations and Scott’s original poems. Schubert hoped to publish this collection in England where Sir Walter Scott’s popularity would help to promote his songs. Schubert also planned to compose additional songs with English and German vocal lines. Schubert’s failure to do so was probably a consequence of his declining health.

Because of the lack of information concerning the success or failure of Schubert’s bilingual edition and concerning the relationship between the English texts and Schubert’s settings, most performers take the conservative route of performing both the songs from *Lady of the Lake* and the rest of Schubert’s English song
both the songs from *Lady of the Lake* and the rest of Schubert's English song repertoire only with the German translations. Because of the desirability of performing this repertoire in English for English-speaking audiences, this study examines all of the English songs of Schubert to determine whether the original poems can be successfully substituted for the German translations. Editions of the settings that can be effectively performed with the English texts are included in the appendix, in order to make available editions which reflect Schubert's ambition to make his songs easily accessible to non-German-speaking audiences.
Tape recordings of all performances submitted as dissertation requirements are on deposit in the University of North Texas Library.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like to thank my major professor and voice teacher, Miss Virginia Botkin, for her help and support throughout this degree. Her suggestions concerning the choice of repertoire for my dissertation recitals were especially appreciated as was her help in the technical preparation of the recitals. I would also like to thank my minor professor, Dr. Deanna Bush, both for her direction of the seminar which inspired the topic of this study and for her suggestions concerning this study and the proposal which preceded it. Finally, I would like to thank the third member of my committee and my vocal coach, Mr. Harold Heiberg, whose musical instruction significantly improved the quality of my dissertation recitals and whose careful proofreading of this document made preparing the final copy much simpler.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>RECITAL I ................................................................. vi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RECITAL II ................................................................. viii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RECITAL III ................................................................. x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RECITAL IV ................................................................. xi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LIST OF MUSICAL EXAMPLES .............................................. xiii</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## Chapter

### I. SCHUBERT AND ENGLISH LITERARY ROMANTICISM ........ 1

- Ossian ............................................. 2
- Shakespeare ...................................... 7
- Sir Walter Scott ................................... 11
- Schubert .......................................... 14

### II. ANALYSES OF THE TEXTS ............................... 18

- Shakespeare ........................................ 18
- Abraham Cowley’s *The Inconstant* .............. 21
- Alexander Pope and Colley Cibber ............... 25
- Ossian ............................................. 30
- Sir Walter Scott’s *Lady of the Lake* Songs ... 37
- The Other Scott Songs and One by Andrew MacDonald ........ 47
- Conclusions ...................................... 53

### III. ANALYSES OF SCHUBERT’S BILINGUAL SONGS ........ 55

- Schubert’s Editorial Practices .................... 55
- *Ellens Gesang II* .................................... 73
- *Lied des gefangenen Jägers* ..................... 74
- *Ellens Gesang III: Hymne an die Jungfrau* ...... 76
- *Ellens Gesang I* .................................... 81
Conclusions ................................................................. 84

IV. ANALYSES OF SCHUBERT’S OTHER ENGLISH SONGS ........ 85

The Shakespeare Songs ................................................. 85
Der Weiberfreund ......................................................... 87
Verklärung ................................................................. 87
Der blinde Knabe ......................................................... 89
The Ossian Songs ......................................................... 92
Lied der Anne Lyle ....................................................... 95
Gesang der Norna ....................................................... 98
Romanze der Richard Löwenherz .................................. 101

V. GERMAN OR ENGLISH: THE FINAL EVALUATION ............ 104

APPENDIX ................................................................. 107

Preface ............................................................... 108
Ellen’s Song II ............................................................. 115
Ellen’s Song III ........................................................... 122
Lay of the Imprisoned Huntman .................................. 126
The Blind Boy ............................................................ 134
Drinking Song ............................................................ 141
Serenade ................................................................. 144
To Silvia ................................................................. 147
Song of Anne Lyle ...................................................... 150
Norna’s Song ............................................................. 156
Romance of Richard the Lion-Hearted .......................... 163

BIBLIOGRAPHY ........................................................... 177
UNIVERSITY OF NORTH TEXAS
College of Music

presents

Graduate Recital

COLLEEN R. BOLTHOUSE, soprano
Sarah Chick, pianist

Monday, April 2, 1990  8:15 p.m.  CONCERT HALL

We Sing To Him
Come All Ye Songsters
Sound the Trumpet
Sweeter than Roses

Selections from Mörike Lieder

Hugo Wolf

Lied vom Winde
Ein Ständlein wohl vor Tag
An eine Aeolsharfe
Zum neuen Jahr
Rath einer Alten
Er ist's

"A Berenice . . . Sol Nascente" KV 70 (60c) W. A. Mozart
Intermission

Catalogue de Fleurs

Darius Milhaud

I. La Violette
II. Le Begonia
III. Les Fritillaires
IV. Les Jacinthes
V. Les Crocuses
VI. Le Hencychome
VII. L'Eremurus
The White Election

Gordon Getty

(1985)

Part 4: The Pensive Spring

1. I Sing to Use the Waiting
2. There is a Morn by Men Unseen
3. I Had a Guinea Golden
4. If She Had Been the Mistletoe
5. New Feet Within My Garden Go
6. She Bore It
7. I Taste a Liquor

Presented in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of
Doctor of Musical Arts
UNIVERSITY OF NORTH TEXAS
College of Music

presents
Graduate Recital

COLLEEN R. BOLTHOUSE, soprano
SARAH D. CLICK, pianist

Monday, April 8, 1991  8:15 p.m.  Concert Hall

PROGRAM

George Frideric Handel
"Mio caro bene!" (Rodelinda)
"Care selve" (Atalanta)
"Tornami a vagheggiar" (Alcina)
Allison Oppedahl, violin
George Settlemire, viola
David Shaw, violone

Johannes Brahms
Bird Songs
Nachtigall
Auf dem Schiffe
Lerchegesang
Das Mädchen spricht
In Waldeseinsamkeit

Wolfgang Amadeus Mozart
Concert Aria, K. 505
"Ch'io mi scordi di te? . . . Non temer, amato bene"

- Intermission -
Francis Poulenc

La Dame d'André
Dans l'herbe
Il vole
Mon cadavre est doux comme un gant
Violon
Fleurs

Samuel Barber

A Nun Takes the Veil
The Secrets of the Old
Sure on this shining night
Nocturne

Presented in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Musical Arts
UNIVERSITY OF NORTH TEXAS

College of Music

presents

A Graduate Recital

COLLEEN R. BOLTHOUSE, soprano
SARAH CLICK, piano
assisted by
Patricia Pierce, clarinet

Monday, October 21, 1991 8:15 p.m.

Concert Hall

"O, King of Kings . . . Alleluja" ESTHER

Der Hirt auf dem Felsen

Automne
La Fée aux chansons
Aurore
La Fleur qui va sur l'eau
Dans la forêt de septembre
Fleur jetée

- Intermission -

В молчании ночи тайной
Ветер перестиший
Сон
Отрывок из А. Мюссе
Сумерки
К ней
Какое счастье

Presented in partial fulfillment of the
requirements for the degree of
Doctor of Musical Arts
WAS IS SILVIA? ENGLÄNDERIN ODER DEUTSCHEN?

Restoring the Original English Texts to Songs Schubert Set in Translation

Verklärung D. 59
Ellen s Gesang Ii D. 838
Kolma s Klage D. 217
Lied der Anna Lyle D. 830
An Silvia D. 891

Presented in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Musical Arts
# LIST OF MUSICAL EXAMPLES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Example</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Lied des gefangenen Jägers, mm. 9-11</td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Ellens Gesang I, m. 106-107</td>
<td>57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Lied des gefangenen Jägers, m. 44</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Ellens Gesang I, m. 98</td>
<td>59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Ellens Gesang I, m. 81-83</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Ellens Gesang III, m. 6</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Lied des gefangenen Jägers, m. 76</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Ellens Gesang I, m. 48-50</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. Ellens Gesang I, m. 56</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. Ellens Gesang I, m. 96</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11. Ellens Gesang I, mm. 96-101</td>
<td>66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12. Ellens Gesang I, m. 57</td>
<td>67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13. Ellens Gesang II, m. 70-74</td>
<td>69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14. Ellens Gesang III, m. 7-8</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15. Ellens Gesang II, mm. 36-37, 41</td>
<td>71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16. Ellens Gesang II, mm. 47-48</td>
<td>72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17. Lied des gefangenen Jägers, mm. 18-20</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
18. Lied des gefangenen Jägers, mm. 19-21, altered ....................... 75
19. Lied des gefangenen Jägers, mm. 60-61 ................................. 76
20. Ellens Gesang III, mm. 7-8 altered ................................. 77
21. Ellens Gesang III, mm. 10-11 .................................. 79
22. Ellens Gesang I, mm. 98-101 .................................. 83
23. An Silvia, mm. 19-26 .................................. 86
24. Der blinde Knabe, mm. 32, beat 4-36, beat 1 ...................... 92
25. Kolma's Klage, mm. 25-28 .................................. 94
26. Lied der Anne Lyle, mm. 10-12 .................................. 96
27. Lied der Anne Lyle, mm. 22-24 .................................. 97
28. Gesang der Norna, mm. 61-63 .................................. 98
29. Gesang der Norna, mm. 51-57 .................................. 100
30. Romanze des Richard Löwenherz, mm. 6-8 ...................... 102
31. Romanze des Richard Löwenherz, mm. 51-53 ...................... 103
32. Gesang der Norna, mm. 55-57 .................................. 110
33. Romanze des Richard Löwenherz, mm. 12-14 ...................... 111
34. Lied der Anne Lyle, mm. 10-12 .................................. 111
35. Romanze des Richard Löwenherz, mm. 51-53 ...................... 112
36. Der blinde Knabe, mm. 32-33 .................................. 112
37. Gesang der Norna, mm. 51-53 .................................. 113
38. Romanze des Richard Löwenherz, mm. 6-8 ...................... 113
39. Ellens Gesang III, mm. 7-8 .................................. 114
CHAPTER I

SCHUBERT AND ENGLISH LITERARY ROMANTICISM

During the late eighteenth century, many influences began to change the literary, artistic and musical culture of the German-speaking areas of Europe. Long overshadowed by France and French culture in politics, literature and language, and by Italy and Italians in music, German culture and language were considered second rate, and unworthy of attention by serious writers and artists.

As the influence of both the Enlightenment and the Church began to wane, however, important writers and scholars began looking to the past for inspiration. These scholars attempted to reconstruct an ideal past when the Germanic tribes roamed Europe, more or less unified by common language and culture. The collection of German stories and legends was an essential part of this reconstruction, as was a renewed interest in folk culture generally. Rousseau’s writings, upholding the ‘natural genius’ as the ideal man, uncorrupted by culture and civilization, added to the enthusiasm and longing for a simpler time. By themselves, these factors were not sufficient to create a common vision of the past that would inspire the newly awakening national sentiment that was to be found particularly among the members of the growing middle class. Thus, German writers began looking beyond their borders for artistic models which they could imitate in order to capture the growing interest in a specifically German culture and tradition. One place they found inspiring models was
in English literature.

Ossian

Considering the increasing interest in legend and history during this period, it is not surprising that publication of the writings of Ossian took the German-speaking areas of Europe, (as well as much of the rest of the continent), by storm. The poems of Ossian, partially based on Celtic originals and published by James Macpherson as translations from Gaelic and Erse, were supposedly the work of a third-century Celtic bard. From the beginning there was considerable controversy concerning Macpherson’s translations, particularly concerning whether such lengthy poems could have been orally transmitted from the third century without being corrupted, and whether the manuscripts that Macpherson claimed to have worked from existed. Because of this controversy, and because of the cultural prejudice that existed in London at that time against anything associated with Scottish or Celtic traditions, Ossian's poems were never as favorably received in England as they were on the continent. In his biography of James Macpherson, Paul deGategno compares the influence of Macpherson’s "translations" on English and foreign writers:

Scholars generally agree that Ossian’s impact on English writers, for all the provocative evidence, remains (after argument and counterargument) problematic. Ossian’s influence on the European continent, however, in particular Germany, France and Italy, is subject to little or no disagreement. Macpherson’s poems were received in these countries with an excitement bordering on hysteria.¹

The first German translations of some of the poems of Ossian appeared in

Bremen in 1762, only two years after their publication in England. A complete edition of the poems of Ossian was available in German by 1768-69, in a translation by J. N. C. Michael Denis. Denis, however, was forced to base his translation on an Italian version by Melchior Cesarotti, since copies of the English poems were relatively rare in German-speaking areas. It was not until 1773, when the first English reprint of *Works of Ossian, Vol. 1*, was published in Darmstadt,\(^2\) that these poems were widely available to German-speaking readers.

Among the poets Ossian influenced were Klopstock, Herder, Goethe, and Schiller, as well as the poets of the *Göttinger Hain*, of the *Sturm und Drang* movement, and of the Romantic school. Klopstock, in particular, held up Ossian’s poetry as a model for German poetry, and in fact went so far as to suggest that Ossian was German. For Klopstock, the ancient Celtic and Germanic tribes were all related. At a time when German-speaking areas were still divided into numerous individual states and when there were no exceptional German-speaking political leaders (except Frederick the Great), Klopstock could conjure up an ideal, unified Germanic fatherland of the distant past by equating the Celtic and Germanic tribes.

Fiona J. Stafford, in her book *The Sublime Savage*, states that part of the attraction of Ossian came from the new freedoms that poetry in style of Ossian offered to the poet. She states,

‘Sublimity’ was a word constantly associated with *Ossian*. The new taste for storms, mountains and blasted heaths was part of the desire for powerful emotional experience, which could not find an outlet in

\(^2\)The second volume was published in 1775.
contemporary [sic] literature. The Poems of Ossian, with their wild landscape and irregular structure, seemed to promise the imaginative release that was so desperately needed.\(^3\)

This desire for emotional experience was elevated to an aesthetic ideal by the poets of the Sturm und Drang movement, who preferred these new freedoms over what they considered to be the restrictions of the neoclassic poetry of the Enlightenment. Gerald F. Elsa, in his article on the concept of the sublime for the Princeton Encyclopedia of Poetry and Poetics,\(^4\) discusses the importance of the idea of the sublime for English poets. His statements are equally valid for German poets of this period:

As the 18th c. advanced, the sublime was absorbed into the bloodstream of English thinking not only about literature but about art in general and even external nature. Under it were subsumed all the loftier feelings—"admiration," "transport," "enthusiasm," vehemence, even awe and terror—which literature, art and nature were capable of inspiring, but for which neoclassicism had no clearly marked place. More and more frequently the sublime was distinguished from the beautiful—and ranked above it. Thus it played no small part in the drift toward subjectivism, the psychologizing of literature and literary experience, the concept of "original genius" unfettered by rules...and ultimately in the rise of romanticism in poetry and the concurrent establishment of aesthetics as a new, separate branch of philosophy... .\(^5\)

Stafford believes the German yearning for the sublime was related to a growing uncertainty of the existence of God. She states that,

The vogue for Ossian can be seen as part of a subconscious reaction


\(^5\)Ibid., 819.
against the scepticism of David Hume and the French *philosophes*, which seemed to threaten the traditional frameworks of belief. The world of *Ossian* was remote and mysterious, haunted by ghosts and surrounded by mists and darkness. It was the complete antithesis of the Enlightenment.\

One of the most significant events that enabled the spread of enthusiasm for the poems of Ossian was the translation of sections of two Ossian poems, *The Song of Selma* and *Berrathon*, by Goethe. Goethe incorporated these translations into the second half of his novel *Die Leiden des jungen Werthers*. This novel, which was one of the most influential pieces of literature of the century, first appeared in 1774. A widely-read and controversial novel, *Werther* carried Ossian’s poetry with it to a height of popularity it would otherwise not have reached. Not just in Germany, but also in France and the U.S., Ossian’s poetry became well known because of its association with Goethe. (Napoleon was said to have carried a copy of *Werther* and a copy of Ossian’s poetry on campaigns.) Thomas Jefferson spoke for many readers when he wrote to Macpherson stating, "These peices [sic] have been, and will I think during my life continue to be to me, the source of daily and exalted pleasure. The tender, and the sublime emotions of the mind were never before so finely wrought up by human hand."\

The primary reason, however, that Ossian’s poetry was influential on German poets was that it pointed to a new direction for poetic development, while retaining a

---

6Stafford, 174.

grounding in the past. Stafford attributes this to the combination in Ossian of novelty and antiquity:

Despite their newness, The Poems of Ossian also seemed to offer a comforting sense of permanence: it was ancient poetry like the Bible or Homer and therefore seemed safe. Although Macpherson's work anticipated many of the concerns of the Romantic Movement, the words of a third-century poet could hardly seem revolutionary. The melancholy preoccupations of the Celtic bard himself attracted the sympathy of an eighteenth-century audience, but he still retained the stature of an Ancient. The combination of the subjective poet and the sage prophet was perfect for the Romantic Period, where the image of the poet as an isolated genius emerged again and again. As sole survivor of a greater world, Ossian commanded the perennial fascination with the exiled hero and the loss of paradise.⁸

Enthusiasm for Ossian continued until the work of the poets of the Romantic school began to overshadow it late in the century. Macpherson died in 1796, and after his death the only significant interest in Ossian's poems in German areas arose in the years 1800-08 when steps were being taken toward publishing the original Gaelic poems Macpherson had collected. A German translation of them was not published until Ahlwardt's translation of 1811. Rudolf Tombo states:

The excellence of this translation was trumpeted throughout the land long before its appearance, a specimen was published as early as 1807 and widely reviewed, so that when the complete translation finally appeared, little was left to be said. Ahlwardt's translation really marks the beginning of the end.⁹

Ossian continued to influence important Romantic composers, however, including Brahms and Mendelssohn. The latter even toured Scotland and the Hebrides in 1829,

⁸Stafford, 178.

and later composed the *Overture Hebrides* (*Fingal's Cave*) of 1930 and the *Symphony No. 3* (known as the Scottish) of 1842.

**Shakespeare**

Although Shakespeare was considered to be the greatest poet and dramatist in the English language, he was relatively unknown by German playwrights and poets until the middle of the 18th century. The first of his plays to be translated in full into German was *Julius Caesar*, which was published in 1741. This publication led to a dispute between Johann Christoph Gottsched and Johann Elias Schlegel, which brought about the first significant discussion of Shakespeare among German writers.

Gottsched was interested in bringing to life a German dramatic school modeled on the style of French neoclassical drama, and therefore criticized Shakespeare for his lack of adherence to the classical unities. Schlegel, on the other hand, believed that the unities did not serve the purposes of Shakespearian drama, where character, rather than action and moral purpose, was the central element of the drama. Though Gottsched's views were influential during the time that German writers aimed their works at the French-influenced German courts, Schlegel's views began to prevail among the rising middle class. Simon Williams, in his book *Shakespeare on the German Stage*, writes:

Gottsched's influence over German literature declined as the Francophone culture of the courts lost its appeal for German writers, even though this culture continued as a powerful influence in Germany until well into the nineteenth century. Its pre-eminence was challenged by a rising middle class that used models from English and national German literature to give its own literature identity. Shakespeare was a
pivotal figure in this change.10

A complete appreciation of Shakespearean drama did not arise, however, until the 1770s when Shakespeare was taken up as a model by the Sturm und Drang school. These writers believed that by studying and emulating Shakespearean drama they could free themselves from the influence of French neoclassic drama. Their enthusiasm for Shakespeare, writes Williams,

... resulted in a major body of Shakespearean criticism, representing the first phase in an outbreak of Shakespeare-worship in Germany that has rarely if ever been equalled elsewhere. Through the flood of writings that resulted, Shakespeare came to be assimilated as the 'third German classic writer' after Goethe and Schiller,11 whose work has had as great an influence as that of the first two on subsequent German drama.12

Two writers associated with the Sturm und Drang school who were particularly influential in the spread of enthusiasm for Shakespearean drama were Goethe and Herder, both of whom wrote important essays on Shakespeare. Goethe's essay, originally a speech entitled Zum Shakespeares-Tag, was not published until 1854, though it was originally given in 1771. Goethe wrote about two aspects of Shakespearean drama that especially appealed to him. One was the freedom of Shakespeare’s plays from the classical unities and the other was the completeness of

---


12Williams, 14
Shakespeare's characters, who to him were reflections of nature (that is they were real individuals, not characters created for the theater).

Herder's essay, published in 1773, was far more influential than that of Goethe. Herder, who had been familiar with Shakespeare's works since 1764, rebutted in his essay all the criticisms of Shakespeare that had been raised by supporters of neoclassic drama. Since he had already fully developed a new theory of popular art, his arguments were very effective. According to Williams:

He [Herder] granted French drama elegance, beauty and the capacity to enlighten its audience, and appreciated it as a natural expression of a rigorously hierarchical society, but as it was now separated from its roots, its action and characters "lack spirit, life,[and] truth".\(^{13}\) In contrast Shakespeare's drama seemed natural and vigorous. Through writings such as Herder's, neoclassical drama came to be seen as symbolic of an increasingly friable aristocratic culture, while Shakespeare's plays, though of an older date, appeared to embody a democratic spirit and natural energy that was powerfully antagonistic to this culture. Although the neoclassic hold on Germany was never completely loosened, writings such as Herder's Shakespeare essay provided a vital challenge to it.\(^{14}\)

Among the Romantic writers, two in particular, August William Schlegel and Ludwig Tieck, helped to secure a permanent place for Shakespeare on the German stage, as well as to strengthen understanding of his work in general in German-speaking areas. Schlegel both wrote about Shakespeare's works, most significantly in his *Vorlesungen über dramatische Kunst und Literatur* (Lectures on Dramatic Art and Literature), and translated them into German. Between 1791 and 1801, Schlegel


\(^{14}\)Williams, 22.
published translations of sixteen of the plays, and then added one more in 1810.\textsuperscript{15}

When Schlegel lost interest in finishing a complete translation of the plays, the project was given by its publishers to Tieck, who oversaw its completion, though most of the actual translation work was done by Tieck's daughter Dorothea and Wolf von Baudissin. Williams describes the translations and their impact on German language and literature:

> Despite the several hands that completed the Schlegel/Tieck translation, it is remarkably uniform in style, sticking faithfully to Schlegel's original intention, "to reproduce [the text] faithfully and at the same time poetically, following step by step the literal meaning and yet catching at least a part of the innumerable, indescribable beauties which do not lie in the letters but hang about it like a ghostly bloom."\textsuperscript{16} The translations are faithful to the original without being prosaic, demonstrating a resourcefulness and imagination that often finds close German equivalents to Shakespeare's English. ... The German verse was flexible, pleasant to hear and rhythmically light, which made it ideal for the stage, while Shakespeare's ambiguous and multiple meanings were surprisingly well sustained in the German. But the reason why this translation is historically pre-eminent is that it appeared at a time when German literature was at a crucial stage in its development. ... The works of Goethe, Schiller and the Romantics had expanded the scope and flexibility of German as a literary medium. The Schlegel/Tieck translations, by demonstrating that German could achieve a range and expressiveness equal to Shakespeare's English, validated the advancement of German literature to European status. So, while several other complete translations of Shakespeare have since appeared, the Schlegel/Tieck version has always commanded a remarkable loyalty.\textsuperscript{17}

---

\textsuperscript{15}The plays were *Romeo and Juliet*, *A Midsummer Night's Dream*, *Julius Caesar*, *As you like it*, *The Tempest*, *Hamlet*, *The Merchant of Venice*, *Twelfth Night*, *King John*, *Richard II*, *Henry IV Parts 1 and 2*, *Henry V*, *Henry VI Parts 1, 2 and 3*, and *Richard III*.


\textsuperscript{17}Williams, 151.
Sir Walter Scott

While Shakespeare primarily influenced German drama, Sir Walter Scott influenced the German historical novel as no other writer of that time. Goethe himself held Scott in high esteem, calling Scott, "a great genius who does not have an equal."\(^{18}\)

The importance of Scott's influence was also attested to by a German critic, Julian Schmidt who wrote in his *History of German Literature* of 1869 that, "No matter how we measure it, the influence of Walter Scott is enormous. Yes, I do not hesitate to proclaim it, it is the greatest which any of the authors of the nineteenth century wielded."\(^{19}\)

One reason for Scott's popularity among German readers may have been that his own style was influenced by German literature, especially the writings of Goethe. As a young man Scott studied German specifically to enable him to read Goethe in his native language. Indeed, Scott's first publication of any importance was his translation of Goethe's *Goetz von Berlichingen*. According to his friend R. P. Gillies,

> there is every reason to believe that the *Goetz of Berlichingen* had more influence in disposing his mind for the course which he afterwards pursued, than any other production, either foreign or domestic, which fell in his way. . . . Here, at least, was a real and well-known historical hero of the olden time—a man whose character was so far from being fabulous, that he has left his own very curious autobiography—and without the slightest departure from the realities of life, brought out in


\(^{19}\)Schmidt, quoted in Ochojski, 260.
manner, till then, unprecedented in modern art."\(^{20}\)

The admiration that Scott had for Goethe continued throughout his life. E. H. Harvey Wood writes, "It was to be one of the great disappointment of Scott's life that he never managed to talk to Goethe in person, . . . [and] Goethe's interest in Scott seems to have been no less acute than Scott's in him." Though they exchanged letters in 1827, Scott's planned visit to Goethe in 1832 was frustrated by Goethe's death on March 22. Wood mentions, however, that, "By the time he [Scott] reached Germany, he was so ill that it is doubtful whether he could have seen Goethe, had he still been alive."\(^{21}\)

Whatever the reason, Scott's popularity in German-speaking areas is unquestioned. Deutsch mentions in his documentary biography of Schubert that Scott was in vogue in Vienna and German-speaking areas from 1815.\(^{22}\) Although Scott's early novels were published anonymously, by 1817 German critics were well aware that "The Great Unknown" was probably Scott, and his popularity grew rapidly after the publication of *Ivanhoe* in 1820. A writer in *Elegante Welt*, No. 57, (an issue that includes an advertisement for *Ivanhoe*), states that,

---


\(^{21}\)Wood, 248.

The truly romantic writer had become scarce, ... No wonder that the novels of Scott among us found enthusiastic reception. His newest novel *Ivanhoe* surpasses his others. All the persons appearing in this novel are portrayed in a manner betraying the brush of a master, and not seldom reminding one of Shakespeare's great genius.23

The reviews of Scott's novels in German periodicals reveal another reason that Scott's novels may have been so popular. The *Literaturblatt* (No. 55, 1819), edited by Wolfgang Menzel, in holding up one of Scott's novels as an example for German writers, praises its high moral tone, and states that that the popularity of Scott's novels (in contrast to those by German-speaking writers) was proof that German readers were tired of erotic trash.24

Though the height of Scott's popularity was during the years 1820-30, his novels continued to be published throughout the nineteenth century. According to Ochojski, "even as late as the period 1896-1910, when Scott had been overtaken by Dickens, Marryat, and Stevenson in popularity, there were still 51 separate editions of his novels published."25 Scott's writing also continued to inspire writers in German-speaking areas to recreate German history by writing historical novels. Ochojski believes that, "the historical novel in Germany was a strong factor in promoting national unity, and it would be no exaggeration to state that it played a large part in the psychological preparation for the foundation of the German Reich in 1871."26

23Ochojski, 262.
24Reported in Ochojski, 262.
25Ochojski, 270.
26Ochojski, 269-70
Schubert

With so much enthusiasm for English literature among German speakers, it is not surprising that Schubert should be among those who were influenced and inspired by German translations of English poems. As early as 1813, while Schubert was still a student at the Kaiserlich-königliches Stadtkonvikt, he made his first setting of an English poem in translation. It was a setting of Herder's translation of *The Dying Christian to his Soul* by Alexander Pope. This song signaled the beginning of what would be a lifelong interest in English poetry, particularly the poetry of Ossian, Shakespeare and Sir Walter Scott.

Schubert set twenty-three translations of English poems to music. Though these songs appear throughout his compositional career, poems by individual poets tend to be grouped together. For example, the nine settings of translations of Ossian all appear in the years 1815-1817, and the seven Scott translations belong to the years 1825-26.

It is impossible to discover how Schubert was first introduced to English literature in translation because there is no mention of the translations, the original poems or the poets in any of the contemporary documents concerning Schubert before 1823. It is likely, however, that some of Schubert's friends had studied English literature, either in the original language or in translation, and brought it to his attention. The first mention of any of the English poets Schubert set in translation is in a letter from Schubert to Schober dated August 14, 1823. Schubert writes, "Here [he was writing from Steyr] I live very simply in every respect, go for walks regularly,
work much at my opera and read Walter Scott.²⁷

However, contemporary documents reveal that Schubert planned to publish bilingual versions of his songs from Scott’s *Lady of the Lake*. This plan appears to have been formed near the time of the composition of the songs. *The Lay of the Imprisoned Huntsman*, the only one of these songs that Schubert dated, was composed on April 4, 1825. The first document to mention these songs is a letter from Anton Ottenwald to Josef von Spaun dated July 19, 1825. Later that same month, on July 25, Schubert wrote to his father and stepmother concerning his publication plans:

> My new songs from Walter Scott’s ‘Lady of the Lake’ especially had much success. . . . In Steyregg we called on Countess Weisenwolff, who is a great admirer of my littleness, possesses all my things and sings many of them quite nicely. The Walter Scott songs made such an excessively good impression on her that she even let it be guessed that the dedication of them would be anything but disagreeable to her. But I intend to use a very different procedure with the publication of these songs from the usual one, which yields so very little, since they bear the celebrated name of Scott at their head and may in that way arouse greater curiosity, and might also make me better known in England by the addition of the English words.²⁸

By this time, however, Schubert had apparently already contacted a publisher concerning a bilingual edition. Only two days after Schubert wrote to his parents, Franz Hüther, the manager of the publishing firm of Anton Pennauer, wrote Schubert asking how many of the *Lady of the Lake* songs have the same meter as the original English and could be printed with both texts. (The edition was actually published in

---

²⁷Deutsch, 287. Unfortunately, this is also the letter in which Schubert’s illness is first unequivocally mentioned.

²⁸Deutsch, 434-35.
April of 1826 by Matthias Artaria.) Ferdinand Schubert also wrote to his brother that summer to express his enthusiasm for Schubert’s publication plan:

> It would long ago have been a good thing to proceed differently with the publication of your songs; but I particularly like your plan for the Walter Scott songs, i.e. to let them appear with English words as well.--I am already dreaming of your reception in England, where by means of larger works, such as symphonies, oratorios and perhaps operas, you will climb to the same heights among German composers as the Egyptian Joseph did among his brethren.²⁹

Schubert also intended to expand his idea for bilingual publications to additional groups of songs. On October 23, Jakob Nikolaus Craigher, Freiherr von Jachelutta, made the following entry in his diary:

> Schubert has entered into an agreement with me according to which I am to supply him with a number of songs by English, Spanish, French and Italian classics with German translations in the meters of the originals, which he will then set to music and have published with the original text. I myself can only gain thereby, the more so because this may bring about a closer connection between us, which could not fail to be in every respect beneficial to us both. Besides, Schubert is too splendid a person for me not to do my utmost to draw him nearer to us. --He also took a few new songs of mine with him, which he will probably set to music.³⁰

Craigher was an accountant who also wrote poetry, and two of his own poems were set by Schubert (*Die junge Nonne* and *Totengräbers Heimweh*). Though Schubert did set one of Craigher’s translations of an English poem, (*Der blinde Knabe*, a translation of Colley Cibber’s *The Blind Boy*), the song was composed earlier in the year, probably about the same time as the *Lady of the Lake* songs.

²⁹Deutsch, 446.

³⁰Deutsch, 470-1.
Unfortunately, Schubert’s plan to collaborate with Craigher was never carried through. This was probably a result of Schubert’s deteriorating health rather than any loss of interest in the project. He did, however, continue to set translations of English poems to music, his last being a setting of the Middle English ballad *Edward* (*Eine altschottische Ballade*), which he composed in 1827 to a translation by Herder.

Together Schubert’s song composition and the documents concerning his life draw a clear picture of his interest in the literature of other languages, especially English, and of his intent to replace German translations in his songs with the original poems. One can only speculate about what direction his compositional career would have taken had better health lengthened his life or increased his output. However, there is no doubt he would have been pleased if more editions of his songs had appeared with the original poems. The purpose of the following chapters is to discover whether, in those songs Schubert did compose to translations of English poems, it is possible and desirable to replace the German translations with the English poems from which they are derived. Chapter Two will begin by examining the poems and their translations.
CH  AP ITER II

ANALYSES OF THE TEXTS

The English poems that Schubert set in translation are, despite a common language, a quite varied collection. They cover a wide temporal span, beginning possibly as early as the 1580s, when Shakespeare began his work as a playwright, and continuing through Schubert’s lifetime, when Sir Walter Scott was writing his historical novels. Because of this, they also exhibit a great variety of poetic and literary styles and techniques. As underscored in the last chapter, however, all these poems are linked by the influence of English literature on the emerging German style of poetry and literature and therefore were considered appropriate texts to use in the composition of the developing German genre of the Romantic Lied. To better understand how these poems made the transition from English poem to German Lied, it is necessary to examine both the original poem and the German translation.

Shakespeare

The three Shakespeare texts are all taken from Shakespeare’s plays, and therefore are all without an individual title. The poem beginning "Who is Silvia?", which appears in The Two Gentlemen of Verona, is generally believed to be the
earliest, possibly from as early as 1587, and certainly no later than 1598. The translation that Schubert set is by Eduard von Bauernfeld.

Who is Silvia? What is she,  
That all our swains commend her  
Holy, fair and wise is she;  
The heaven such grace did lend  
her  
That she might admired be.  

Was ist Silvia, saget an  
daß sie die weite Flur preist?  
Schön und zart ich sie nahn,  
auf Himmels Gunst und Spur weist,  
daß ihr alles untan.

Is she kind as she is fair?  
For Beauty lives with Kindness.  
Love doth to her eyes repair  
To help him of his blindness,  
And being helped, inhabits there.  

Ist sie schön und gut dazu?  
Reiz labt wie milde Kindheit,  
himmel Aug eilt Amor zu,  
dort heilt er seine Blindheit  
und verweilt in süßer Ruh.

Then to Silvia let us sing  
That Silvia is excelling;  
She excells each mortal thing  
Upon the dull earth dwelling.  
To her let us garlands bring.  

Darum Silvia tôn, o Sang,  
der holden Silvia Ehren,  
jeden Reiz besiegt sie lang,  
den Erde kann gewähren,  
Kränze ihr und Saitenklang.

The poem beginning "Come Thou Monarch of the Vine", from Antony and Cleopatra can be more precisely dated, probably from the latter part of 1606. The translation Schubert set is by Ferdinand von Mayerhofer.

Boy  Come thou monarch of the vine,  
Plumpy Bacchus with pink eyne!  
In thy fats our cares be drowned,  
With thy grapes our hairs be  
crowned,  

Bacchus, feister Fürst des Weins,  
komm mit Augen hellen Scheins,  
unsre Sorg ersäuf dein Faß,  
und dein Laub uns krönen laß,
All  Cup us till the world go round,  füll uns, bis die Welt sich dreht,
    Cup us till the world go round.  füll uns, bis die Welt sich dreht.

The latest poem is *Hark! hark! the lark* from *The Tragedy of Cymbeline*, which was probably premiered in 1610. August Wilhelm von Schlegel made the translation Schubert set.

Hark! hark! the lark at heaven's gate sings,
And Phoebus 'gins arise,
His steeds to water at those springs
On chalic'd flowers that lies;
And winking Mary-buds begin
To ope their golden eyes:
With everything that pretty is,
My lady sweet, arise:
Arise, arise!

Horch, horch, die Lerch im Ätherblau,
und Phōbus, neu erweckt,
tränkt seine Rosse mit dem Tau,
der Blumenkelche deckt,
der Ringelblume Knospe schleußt
die goldenen Auglein auf;
mit allem, was da reizend ist,
du süße Maid, steh auf;
steh auf, steh auf.

All of these poems are sung in their original contexts within the plays.

The translations of these three poems retain the meter of the original poems, the only exception being found in the tenth line of the translation of *Who is Silvia?*, where an unaccented syllable that opens the tenth line in the original is omitted in the German, so that the German line is one syllable shorter. In general, all of the translations are reasonably accurate in communicating the meaning of the original English. Each of the poems, however, suffered some loss in the beauty and specificity of the imagery when they were translated. For example, in *Hark! hark! the lark*, the lark that sings at "heaven’s gate" in the English sings in the "blue ether" in Schlegel’s

---

German. Similarly the "pink eyne" of Bacchus (pink in this context referring not to their color but to their shape--small, narrow or half-closed) become "eyes with bright shine" in Mayerhofer. Because of this loss, and because of acknowledged high quality of Shakespeare's dramatic works, the original Shakespeare poems are clearly superior to the German translations.

Abraham Cowley's *The Inconstant*

After the Shakespeare poems, the next earliest English poem set by Schubert was a translation of *The Inconstant* by Abraham Cowley. The original poem was published in London in 1647, in a volume of Cowley's poems entitled *The Mistresse or Several Copies of Love-Verses*. *The Inconstant* was one of a pair, the title of the other being, appropriately, *The Constant*. The poems of *The Mistresse* were clearly modeled on the collection *Songs and Sonets* by John Donne (1633), *The Inconstant* being an especially close imitation of John Donne's *The Indifferent*.

Despite its obvious derivation, *The Mistresse* was very popular, as was much of Cowley's work during his lifetime (1618-1667). The popularity of his poetry is also evidenced by the fact that many of his poems were set to music, including several that were set by Henry Purcell. Cowley's popularity was short-lived, however, and his work has since that time been overshadowed by that of his predecessors, Ben Jonson.

---


and John Donne. The translation Schubert set was made by Josef von Ratschky. Von Ratschky translated only the first three verses.

*The Inconstant*

1.  
I Never yet could see that face  
   Which had no dart for mee;  
   From fifteeene yeares, to fiftie’s space,  
   They all victorious bee.  
   Love, thou’rt a Devill; if I may call thee one;  
   For sure in Mee thy name is Legion.

2.  
Colour, or Shape, good Limbes, or Face,  
   Goodnesse, or Wit in all I finde:  
   In Motion or in Speech a grace,  
   If all faile, yet ’tis Womankind;  
   And I’me so weake, the Pistoll need not bee  
   Double, or treble charg’d, to murther Mee.

3.  
If Tall, the Name of Proper slay;  
   If faire, shee’s pleasant as the Light;  
   If Low, her Prettiness does please;  
   If Black, what Lover loves not Night?  
   If yellow-hair’d, I Love, lest it should bee  
   Th’e excuse to others for not loving mee.

4.  
The fat, like Plenty, fills my heart;

*Der Weiberfreund*

1.  
Noch fand von Evens Töchterschaaren  
   Ich keine, die mir nicht gefiel;  
   Von fünfzehn bis zu fünfzig Jahren  
   Ist jede meiner Wüsche Ziel.

2.  
Durch Farb’ und Form, durch Witz und Güte,  
   Durch alles fühlt’ ich mich entzücht;  
   Ein Ebenbild der Aphrodite  
   Ist jede, die mein Aug’ erblickt.

3.  
Selbst die mag mein Herz zu angeln,  
   Bei der man jeden Reiz vermisst:  
   Mag immerhin ihr alles mangeln,  
   Wenn’s nur ein weiblich Wesen ist!
The leane, with Love makes me too so.
If streight, her Bodie's Cupid's Dart
To mee; if Crooked, 'tis his Bow.
Nay, Age it selfe does me to rage encline,
And strength to Women gives, as well as Wine.

5.
Just halfe as large as Charitie
My richly-landed Love's become;
And judg'd aright in Constancy,
Though it take up a larger roome.
Him, who loves alwaies one, why should they call
More Constant, then the Man loves Alwaies All?

6.
Thus with unwearied wings I flee
Through all Love's Gardens and his Fields;
And like the wise industrious Bee,
No Weed, but Honey to me yields!
Honey still spent this dil'igence still supplies,
Though I return not home with laden Thighes.

7.
My soul at first indeed did prove
Of prety Strength against a Dart,
'Till I this Habit got of Love;
But my consum'd and wasted Heart,
Once burnt to Tinder with a strong Desire,
Since that by every Spark is set on Fire.
Josef von Ratschky's translation of *The Inconstant*, though clearly based on Cowley's original poem, is significantly different in both form and content. Cowley's poem has seven six-line stanzas in which the first four lines have four iambic feet and the last two have five iambic feet. Von Ratschky's translation, in contrast, has only three stanzas with only four lines each, each with four iambic feet. In effect, von Ratschky's translation cuts the last two lines off of each stanza.

Von Ratschky also changes the specific meaning of the poem, covering in three stanzas only the meaning of the first two of Cowley's stanzas. Von Ratschky's translation also introduces poetic images that are not found in Cowley's poem, such as the comparison of all women to Aphrodite in the second stanza. The focus of the poem is also shifted at times. For example, in the first stanza of Cowley's poem, the focus of the entire stanza is the on women and their power over the poet, while in von Ratschsky's translation the women become the objects of the poets desire, that is, passive recipients rather than active agents. However, despite the liberties that von Ratschky takes with Cowley's specific images, his poem is similar to the original in tone and spirit.

Von Ratschky's translation cannot be replaced in Schubert's setting with Cowley's original primarily because of the differences between the formal structures of the two poems. When von Ratschky decided to shorten Cowley's basic stanza length and to ignore the different line lengths that Cowley used, he made changes that directly affected the form of Schubert's musical setting, which is too short to
accomodate the number of syllables in Cowley's stanzas. Therefore, Schubert's song can only be sung to von Ratschky's translation.

Alexander Pope and Colley Cibber

Two of the English poems set by Schubert were written by poets who were contemporaries, and indeed participants in a literary feud in London during the first half of the eighteenth century. Alexander Pope and Colley Cibber both indulged in satirizing the other, Pope firing the first shot when he based a character in *Three Hours after Marriage* on Cibber.\(^6\) Plotwell was the name Pope gave to his caricature of Cibber. Cibber took the shot in stride, even taking the role of Plotwell himself, since he was also an accomplished actor. However, when Cibber lampooned *Three Hours after Marriage* by inserting lines ridiculing it into a revival of *The Rehearsal* several weeks later, Pope was incensed. He flew into a rage, and in addition to verbally denouncing Cibber backstage, Pope attacked him in print repeatedly over a period of many years. Though Cibber let many of the attacks go unanswered, he did on occasion respond, most importantly in a 1742 pamphlet entitled *A Letter from Mr. Cibber to Mr. Pope*. This led to an all-out literary war that continued up to Pope's death in 1744.\(^7\) Leonard Ashley, in his biography of Cibber, summed up the feud as follows:

\(^6\) *Three Hours after Marriage* was primarily written by John Gay, but both Pope and Dr. Arbuthnot collaborated on it.

These facts are clear. Pope kept it going, Pope enjoyed the advantage of attack, but emotion robbed him of moderation and personal animus deprived him of restraint. Cibber, on the whole, maintained good humor throughout the unfortunate business, and we must respect him more, though it only increased Pope's fury and made him nastier and shriller.

It was a stupid dog fight: Cibber, a large and somewhat less nervous mutt, was more amused than injured by the yapping and snapping of a purebred lapdog.⁸

There is no doubt that Alexander Pope, though less generous in spirit than Cibber, was the greater poet. His poem *The Rape of the Lock* is considered to be the finest neoclassical poem in English literature, and he also excelled in satire and didactic essays and epistles. Cibber, on the other hand, is remembered primarily because of Pope’s ridicule of him in Pope’s poem *The Dunciad*, which is considered to be a great poem despite being flawed by Pope’s need to exact revenge on Cibber.

Though Cibber’s poem *The Blind Boy* was admired by his contemporaries, others of his poems, especially the odes, were not. Ashley believes that Cibber fully realised what the judgement of history on the two poets would be, stating, "He (Cibber) was aware that he would be remembered as the grindstone that sharpened the wit of Pope—Pope, who despised, envied, assailed, insulted, and immortalized Cibber."

Pope’s poem *The dying Christian to his Soul* was first published in 1708 in a collection entitled *Ode on St. Cecilia’s Day, MDCCVIII, and other Pieces for Music*. The translation Schubert set was by Johann Gottfried von Herder.

The dying Christian to his Soul

Der sterbende Christ an seine Seele

ODE

---

Vital spark of heav'nly flame!
Quit, oh quit this mortal frame:
Trembling, hoping, ling'ring, flying,
Oh the pain, the bliss of dying!
Cease, fond Nature, cease thy strife,
And let me languish into life.

Lebensfunke, vom Himmel erglüht,
Der sich loszuwinden müht,
Zitternd-kühn, vor Sehnen leidend,
Gern, und doch mit Schmerz
scheidend --
End', o end' den Kampf, Natur!
Sanft ins Leben
Aufwärts schweben
Sanft hinschwinden lass mich nur.

Hark! they whisper; Angels say,
Sister spirit, come away.
What is this absorbs me quite?
Steals my senses, shuts my sight,
Drowns my spirits, draws my breath?
Tell me, my soul, can this be Death?

Horch! mir lispeln Geister zu:
"Schwester-Seele, komm zur Ruh!"
Ziehet was mich sanft von hinnen?
Was ist's, das mir meine Sinnen,
Mir den Hauch zu rauben droht?

Seele, sprich, ist das der Tod?

The world recedes; it disappears!
Heav'n opens on my eyes! my ears
With sounds seraphic ring:
Lend, lend your wings! I mount! I fly!
O Grave! where is thy Victory?
O Death! where is thy Sting?

Die Welt entweicht! Sie ist nicht mehr!
Harmonieen um mich her!
Ich schwimm' im Morgenrot--
Leiht, o leiht mir eure Schwingen;
Ihr Brüder-Geister! helft mir singen:
"O Grab, wo ist dein Sieg, wo ist dein Pfeil, o Tod?"

Herder's translation, except in a few places, closely approximates the meaning of Pope's poem. However, in attempting to clearly transfer into German the meaning of the original, Herder alters the form of stanzas one and three. Pope's first stanza has six lines, each with four trochaic feet. Herder's first stanza has eight lines, though lines six and seven are both short lines of only two trochaic feet each, and therefore together would equal the length of one of Pope's line. The real difference in length, however, occurs because Herder uses three lines (the two short lines, numbers six and
seven, together with line eight) to clarify the idea that Pope expressed in only one line, line six.

A similar disparity occurs between Pope’s and Herder’s third stanzas. In Pope’s poem, line four, "Lend, lend your wings! I mount! I fly!," is followed immediately by his quote from the Bible, "O Grave! where is thy Victory? O Death, where is thy sting?," in lines five and six. Herder adds an additional line in his translations of these lines, so that the final part of his poem reads as follows:

Leiht, o leiht mir eure
Schwingen;
Ihr Brüder-Geister! helft mir
singen:
"O Grab, wo ist dein Sieg, wo ist
dein Pfeil, o Tod?"

Because of the line Herder inserted before the biblical quote, he had to place the entire quote in a single line for his stanza to be of the same length as Pope’s. Also, because the last two lines are a quotation, they do not have the same metrical structure in German as they have in English, primarily because the English word **victory** has three syllables, while the equivalent German word **Sieg** has only one.

In part because of Herder’s fidelity to the exact meaning of Pope’s poem, his version loses some of the tone and movement of the original, which is to be preferred on that basis. Only a careful examination of Schubert’s setting, however, will reveal whether the formal changes Herder made in translating the poem are significant enough to make substitution of Pope’s original poem for Herder’s translation undesirable.
Colley Cibber’s *The Blind Boy* was first published in 1734 in *The British Musical Miscellany*. The translation Schubert set was made, as was mentioned in chapter one, by Jakob Nikolaus Craigher de Jachelutta.

*The Blind Boy*  
*Der blinde Knabe*

O say! what is that Thing call’d Light,  
Which I can ne’er enjoy;  
What is the blessing of the Sight,  
O tell your poor blind Boy?  

O sagt, ihr Lieben, mir einmal,  
Welch Ding ist’s, Licht genannt?  
Was sind des Sehens Freuden all,  
die niemals ich gekannt.

You talk of wond’rous things you see,  
You say the Sun shines bright,  
I feel him warm, but how can he  
Then make it Day, or Night.  

Die Sonne, die so hell ihr seht,  
Mir Armen scheint sie nie,  
Ihr sagt, sie auf und nieder geht,  
Ich weiß nicht wann, noch wie.

My Day, or Night myself I make,  
Whene’er I wake, or play;  
And cou’d I ever keep awake,  
It wou’d be always Day.  

Ich mach mir so selbst Tag und Nacht,  
dieweil ich schlaf und spiel,  
mein inners Leben schön mir lacht,  
ich hab der Freuden viel.

With heavy sighs, I often hear,  
You mourn my helpless woe;  
But sure with patience I may bear,  
A loss I ne’er can know.  

Zwar kenn ich nicht, was euch erfreut,  
doch drückt mich keine Schuld,  
drum freu ich mich in meinem Leid  
und trag es mit Geduld.

Then let not what I cannot have,  
My cheer of Mind destroy,  
Whilst thus I sing, I am a King,  
Altho’ a poor Blind Boy.  

Ich bin so glücklich, bin so reich  
mit dem, was Gott mir gab,  
bin wie ein König froh, obgleich  
ein armer, blinder Knab.

Though Cibber’s poem was well-received during his lifetime, literary ideals have changed since then, and it now seems presumptuous of Cibber, who was not blind, to put words in the mouth of a blind boy. At the time, however, it was not considered to be in bad taste.

Craigher’s translation is faithful to the metrical structure of Cibber’s poem, although to accomodate such rigorous adherence to the structure, Craigher was forced
to alter the meaning in a few places. For example, in the last two lines of the third stanza, where Cibber is still elaborating on the blind boy’s ability to make any time day or night, Craigher’s poem translates back into English as, “My inner life smiles beautifully to me, I have many joys.” Craigher’s fidelity to the structure of Cibber’s poem, however, may make it possible for Cibber’s original poem to replace Craigher’s translation in Schubert’s song.

Ossian

I have already written extensively about the popularity of Macpherson’s Ossianic poetry in Germany and its influence on German literature in chapter one. Although some aspects of Macpherson’s "translations" are discussed there, a more detailed discussion is necessary in order to evaluate both Macpherson’s poems and their German translations.

Macpherson’s Ossian poems were in fact based on orally transmitted poems, although none of the poems existed in the final form in which Macpherson published them. When Macpherson collected poems in the Scottish Highlands, he was taking down poems that existed as part of an oral tradition in a culture that lacked the sophistication of English culture of the day. Stafford states that Macpherson was at first reluctant to translate the Gaelic verse:

The Gaelic tradition was totally different from the English, so Macpherson was doubtful whether the simple ballads would impress readers used to the elaborate literature of English and classical authors. It was no good translating the poems of the Highlanders if they were to be scorned by English speakers.9

9Stafford, 80.
Macpherson also seemed to believe that the poems he had collected had been corrupted over the centuries as they had been handed down by successive generations of bards (this was indeed the case). Therefore, Macpherson apparently felt no need to translate his poems literally, but rather believed it was his duty to try to restore them to their original purity. Stafford writes,

This idea of a pure original from which there has been a decline is crucial to the understanding of Macpherson's practice. . . .Macpherson's Celtic world was one of noble warriors, not a quaint fairyland of giants and magicians, so the witches and monsters which feature in the popular Highland ballads had to be condemned as interpolations and stripped away. (Ironically, the stories of the Viking invasions, which were obviously a later addition to the third-century Fenian cycle, were perfectly acceptable, since they suited Macpherson's vision of Fingal as a national hero, defending the honor of Scotland). . . .Although Macpherson was to draw on the genuine ballads, then, his Ossianic poems were by no means accurate translations of the poetry which was still being recited in the Highlands. . . .By dismissing his principle sources as corrupt, Macpherson felt free to 'restore' the Gaelic poems to what he thought they ought to have been. The traditional figure of Ossian, familiar throughout the Highlands as the last survivor of the Fiana, was thus to be presented to the English-speaking world with the ideas and preoccupations of James Macpherson.

Because Macpherson believed that the Celtic poems he had collected were neither uncorrupted nor suitable for a sophisticated English audience, his versions of the poems were largely a product of his own imagination. Several aspects of their style can therefore be attributed directly to Macpherson's free approach to the poems.

First, though they were supposedly handed down orally over a period of more than a thousand years by many generations of bards, Macpherson's translations show a remarkable unity of style. For example, the overall atmosphere of the poems is unrelentlessly gloomy. Storms often hover on the horizon, heros too frequently meet
their end and love never wins the day. Writing about Macpherson's *Fragments of Ancient Poetry*, Stafford states, "gradually, it becomes possible to predict the outcome of the story as soon as the principle characters have been introduced. The speakers vary, but each tale involves the frustrated life and ultimate death of all the major characters." In addition, the poetic images are remarkably similar. Stafford writes,

In the longer *Poems of Ossian*, the repetition of the same simple images becomes rather tedious, . . . Macpherson's imitation of an early bard's limited vocabulary led to constant use of certain stock features such as 'rock', 'deer', 'stream', 'mist', 'moon', 'sun', 'oak', 'wind', 'storm', 'grave' or 'cloud'.  

The length of the poems Macpherson published in *The Poems of Ossian* is also a result of Macpherson's attempt to restore Celtic poetry to its supposed earlier glory. In order to create an epic Celtic literature, Macpherson would string together several previously unrelated poems into a single poem of epic length. *Fingal*, for example incorporates as episodes several shorter poems that were originally published separately in *Fragments of Ancient Poetry*. Unfortunately, this practice tended to distract from the central plot that epic poems generally need to unify them. Stafford writes the following concerning a particularly gory episode originally published as *Fragment XV* and later inserted into *Fingal*:

While such an episode did not seem out of place in the *Fragments*, it causes considerable disruption to the narrative flow in the longer poem. . . . On the whole, *Fingal* tends to leave the reader uncertain as to which characters have actually appeared in the main action and which survive only in the memories of the protagonists. . . . The uncertainty is

---

¹⁰Stafford, 105.
increased by the fact that the entire poem is being sung by Ossian, who seems to make little distinction between the living and the dead.\footnote{Stafford, 140-141.}

The character of Ossian as the creator of epic poems is also largely a creation of Macpherson's imagination. Although in genuine Celtic literature there was a third-century bard named Oisin, Macpherson's Ossian belonged as much to the eighteenth century as to the third. According to Stafford, the development of Ossian was perhaps the most important difference between \textit{Fingal} and the \textit{Fragments}. The earlier collection had been attributed to an anonymous body of 'Bards', but when \textit{Fingal} appeared, there was no question about the identity of the author: Ossian, the son of Fingal. An epic poem required an epic poet, so Ossian, who had appeared in the \textit{Fragments} as a character, was now placed firmly in the tradition of Homer and Milton as the blind bard of the Highlands. Macpherson's concentration on the isolated poet owed as much to the literature of the mid-eighteenth century as the classics. Despite its epic pretentions, \textit{Fingal} is a sprawling work, held together not by unified action or theme, but by the presence of the narrator.\footnote{Stafford, 141.}

One final aspect of the Ossianic poems needs to be mentioned. Because they were allegedly translations from Gaelic and Erse, Macpherson decided not to follow poetic conventions found in English poetry. The Ossian poems are prose poems. They have neither regular line lengths, regular metrical structures, or standard stanzic forms. However, because Macpherson was trying to give his work an ancient feeling, his prose is very stylized. He makes use of alliteration and assonance to give his prose a more poetic sound. He also repeats key words to create an echo or refrain effect. Stafford suggests that these repetitions create a musical effect:
The echoes and refrains suggest an arrangement of music, corresponding to the emotions of the speakers. The lyrical chants have a semi-hypnotic effect, drawing the reader into the intangible landscape where the characters are insubstantial voices in the wind.\textsuperscript{13}

These musical qualities added to the ancient feel of the translations, helping to make them appear to be genuine translations of poetry that was originally set to music.

When Schubert began to set Macpherson’s Ossianic poetry to music, he was working from a three volume edition published in Düsseldorf entitled \textit{Die Gedichte Ossian’s eines alten celtischen Helden und Barden}. The translation of the poetry was made by Edmund, Baron von Harold, and was a prose translation. Because the Ossianic poetry is so unified in style and because Schubert used the work of a single translator in making his nine settings of Ossianic poetry, rather than going into a detailed analysis of all the Ossianic poems that Schubert set, I will take an in-depth look at only one, since detailing the study I have done of all the poems would be outside of the scope of this work. In looking at the text of \textit{Kolma’s Klage}, however, I will be examining the possibly most influential of all the Ossianic texts because it was this text, in Goethe’s translation, that was read by Werther to Charlotte at the climactic point of Goethe’s novel \textit{Die leiden des jungen Werthers}.

The text of \textit{Kolma’s Klage} was originally published as Fragment X in Macpherson’s \textit{Fragments of Ancient Poetry}. Macpherson later included it as part of the longer poem \textit{The Songs of Selma} in an altered form (or, as Macpherson would have said, a better translation). For example, Colma’s lover is named Shalgar in Fragment

\textsuperscript{13}Stafford, 109.
X, but is Salgar in *The Songs of Selma*. The text of the poem is also slightly altered throughout. For example, the torrent that "shrieks down the rock" in Fragment X only "pours down the rock" in *The Songs of Selma*. Since Schubert was using Harold’s translation of the *Works of Ossian*, his translation most closely approximates Macpherson’s version in *The Songs of Selma*.

*Colma*. It is night, I am alone, forlorn on the hill of storms. The wind is heard on the mountain. The torrent pours down the rock. No hut receives me from the rain; forlorn on the hill of the winds!

Rise, moon! from behind thy clouds. Stars of the night, arise! Lead me, some light, to the place where my love rests from the chase alone! With thee, I would fly from my father; with thee, from my brother of pride.

Cease a little while, O wind! stream, be thou silent awhile! let my voice be heard around. Let my wanderer hear me! Salgar! It is Colma who calls. Here is the tree, and the rock. Why delayest thou thy coming? Lo! the calm moon comes forth. The flood is bright in the vale. The rocks are gray on the steep, I see him not on the brow. His dogs come not before him, with tidings of his near approach. Here I must sit alone!

Who lie on the heath beside me? Are they my love and my brother? Ah! they are dead! Their swords are red from the fight. O my brother! my brother! why hast thou slain my Salgar? why, O Salgar! hast thou slain my

...
brother? Oh! from the rock on the hill, from the top of the windy steep, speak, ye ghosts of the dead! speak, I will not be afraid! Whither are ye gone to rest? In what cave of the hill shall I find the departed? No feeble voice is on the gale: no answer half-drowned in the storm!

I sit in my grief; I wait for morning in my tears! Rear the tomb, ye friends of the dead. Close it not till Colma come. My life flies away like a dream: why should I stay behind? Here shall I rest with my friends, by the stream of the sounding rock.

Harold's translation of Macpherson is a good translation of the meaning and spirit of the original, though Harold at times takes liberties with the specific content. For example, Harold's phrase "ich irr' allein" translates literally as "I wander aimlessly alone," while Macpherson had only written "I am alone." However, such changes are few, and do not significantly alter the overall sense of the poem.

An issue that will become more significant in determining whether Harold's translation can be replaced effectively with the original, however, is the incongruity between Harold's and Macpherson's line lengths and accent pattern. This mismatch is evident from the first line, where Macpherson begins "It is night, I am alone, forlorn on the hill of storms." This line has fourteen syllables of which seven are accented syllables. Harold's translation, "Rund um mich Nacht, ich irr' allein, verloren am stürmischen Hügel," has seventeen syllables, seven of which are accented. An even greater incongruity in line length can be found at the beginning of fourth paragraph,
where Harold requires thirteen syllables to clarify what Macpherson said in eight. Such
length differences may be difficult to accommodate within Schubert's musical settings.

Sir Walter Scott's *Lady of the Lake* Songs

Sir Walter Scott's *The Lady of the Lake* is considered to be one of the finest, if not the finest, of his poems. First published in 1810, it was also his greatest commercial success as a poet. Over twenty thousand copies were bought in the first few months following publication. John Buchan, one of Scott's biographers, stated that the poem, "brought the Highlands, of which Scott knew next to nothing, inside the comprehension of the Lowlands and of England." Though not a flawless work, according to Edward Wagenknecht, it contains,

a number of fine lyrics, such as "Coronach," "Hail to the Chief," "Soldier rest, thy warfare o’er," "He is gone to the mountain, he is lost in the forest," and the "Ave Maria," which Schubert set to immortal music and which John McCormack, Marian Anderson, and many other great singers have made an important part of the vital aesthetic life-experience even of many who have never read Scott's poem.\(^{15}\)

Schubert selected seven of the lyrics from *The Lady of the Lake* to set to music, including four of those mentioned above, "Coronach," "Soldier rest, thy warfare o’er" (*Ellens Gesang I*), "Ave Maria" (*Ellens Gesang III*) and "Hail to the Chief" (Bootgesang). Schubert also wrote music for "Huntsman rest, thy chase is done"


\(^{15}\)Wagenknecht, 64-5. "Coronach" and "He is gone on the mountain, he is lost to the forest" are actually the same poem, "Coronach" the title and "He is gone on the mountain," the first line.
(Ellens Gesang II), "Lay of the Imprisoned Huntsman" (Lied des gefangenen Jägers), and "The heath this night must be my bed" (Normans Gesang). "Coronach" and "Hail to the Chief" both fall outside the scope of this study because they are both choral works, "Coronach" for female chorus in three parts and "Hail to the Chief" for male chorus in four parts.

Of the remaining five songs, Schubert chose to publish four in bilingual editions and one (Normans Gesang) in German translation only. By examining both the German translations, all of which are by D. Adam Storck, and Scott’s lyrics, the logic behind Schubert’s decision may become clear.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Song</th>
<th>Ellens Gesang I</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>'Soldier, rest! thy warfare o'er,</td>
<td>Raste Krieger, Krieg ist aus,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sleep the sleep that knows not breaking;</td>
<td>schlaf den Schlaf, nichts wird dich wecken,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dream of battled fields no more,</td>
<td>träume nicht von wildem Strauß,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Days of danger, nights of waking,</td>
<td>nicht von Tag und Nacht voll Schrecken.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In our isle's enchanted hall,</td>
<td>In der Insel Zauberhallen</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hands unseen thy couch are strewing,</td>
<td>wird ein weicher Schlafgesang</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fairy strains of music fall,</td>
<td>um das müde Haupt dir wallen zu der Zauberharfe Klang.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Every sense in slumber dewing.</td>
<td>Feen mit unsichtbaren Händen werden auf dein Lager hin</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>holde Schlummerblumen senden, die im Zauberton blühn.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Soldier, rest! thy warfare o'er,</td>
<td>Raste Krieger, Krieg ist aus,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dream of fighting fields no more;</td>
<td>schlaf den Schlaf, nichts wird dich wecken,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sleep the sleep that knows not breaking;</td>
<td>träume nicht von wildem Strauß</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Morn of toil, nor night of</td>
<td>nicht von Tag und Nacht voll</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
waking.

'No rude sound shall reach thine ear,
Armor's clang or war-steed champing.
Trump nor pibroch summon here
Mustering clan or squadron tramping.
Yet the lark's shrill fife may come
At the daybreak from the fallow,
And the bittern sound his drum,
Booming from the sedgy shallow.
Ruder sounds shall none be near,
Guards nor warders challenge here,
Here's no war-steed's neigh and champing.
Shouting clans of squadrons stamping.'

Schrecken.

Nicht der Trommel wildes Rasen,
nicht des Kriegs gebietend Wort,
nicht der Todeshörner Blasen
scheuchen deinen Schlummer fort.

Doch der Lerche Morgensänge
wecken sanft dein schlummernd Ohr,
und des Sumpfgeleders Klänge,
steigend aus Geschilf und Rohr,

Nicht das Stampfen wilder Pferde,
nicht der Schreckensruf der Wacht,
nicht das Bild von Tagsbeschwerde
stören deine stille Nacht.
XXXII

She paused, -- then, blushing, led the lay,
To grace the stranger of the day.
Her mellow notes awhile prolong
The cadence of the flowing song,
Till to her lips in measured frame
The minstrel verse spontaneous came.

Song Continued

'Huntsman, rest! thy chase is done;
While our slumbrous spells assail ye,
Dream not, with the rising sun,
Bugles here shall sound reveillé,
Sleep! the deer is in his den;
Sleep! thy hounds are by thee lying;
Sleep! nor dream in yonder glen
How thy gallant steed lay dying.
Huntsman, rest! thy chase is done;
Think not of the rising sun,
For at dawning to assail ye
Here not bugles sound reveillé.'

Ellens Gesang II

Jäger, ruhe von der Jagd!
Weicher Schlummer soll dich decken,
träume nicht, wenn Sonn’ erwacht,
daß Jagdhörner dich erwecken.
Schlaf, der Hirsch ruht in der Höhle,
bei dir sind die Hunde wach,
schlaf, nich quäl es deine Seele,
daß dein edles Roß erlag.
Jäger, ruhe von der Jagd!
Weicher Schlummer soll dich decken,
wer dein junge Tag erwacht,
wird kein Jägerhorn dich wecken.

As the above parallel translation makes clear, the texts that Schubert set as

Ellens Gesänge I und II follow one after the other with only one intervening paragraph in Scott’s poem. Both are intended to lull Fitz James (actually King James V) to sleep.

As one might infer from the text of the second song, Fitz James has been taken in for the night by Ellen Douglas after he has become separated from his hunting party and his horse has broken a leg.
The translations Storck made for these two songs are faithful to the meaning of Scott’s poems, but in structure they vary from Scott. In *Ellens Gesang II*, the differences in form are minor. For example, in line four the German translation begins with an unaccented syllable while in the English the first syllable is accented, so that the line has a different accent pattern in German than in English despite having the same number of syllables. Similarly line six has four stressed syllables in English and in German, but again the German begins with an unaccented syllable, the English with an accented syllable, and the German line is one syllable longer.

The differences between the original poem and the translation are more significant in *Ellens Gesang I*. Although the opening four lines have identical structure and very similar meaning in the English and German versions, the next four English lines correspond to eight lines of German. This is because Storck elaborates on the meaning of the four English lines, adding images of a "magic harp" and "sweet flowers of sleep that bloom a magic land" to Scott’s poem. Thus, while Storck’s translation is closer to the metrical structure of Scott’s individual lines in *Ellens Gesang I* than in *Ellens Gesang II*, his translation of *Ellens Gesang I* is actually four lines longer than the original poem.

In addition, in the final four lines of the second stanza (lines 21-24 in Scott, 25-28 in Storck) Storck rearranges the meaning somewhat, placing the list of things that might disturb Fitz James’ sleep in the first three lines rather than in the last three. This also occurs in lines 13-16 (17-20 in Storck), lines which are very similar to the
final four. Schubert, however, apparently felt he could accommodate these structural differences in his song and so published both of *Ellens Gesänge* in bilingual editions.

*Hymn to the Virgin*  

*Ave Maria!* maiden mild!  
Listen to a maiden’s prayer!  
Thou canst hear though from the wild,  
Thou canst save amid despair.  
Safe may we sleep beneath thy care,  
Though banished, outcast, and reviled—  
Maiden! hear a maiden’s prayer;  
Mother, hear a supplicant child!  
*Ave Maria!*

*Ave Maria!* undefiled!  
The flinty couch we now must share  
Shall seem with down of eider piled,  
If thy protection hover there.  
The murky cavern’s heavy air  
Shall breathe of balm if thou hast smiled;  
Then, Maiden! hear a maiden’s prayer,  
Mother, list a supplicant child!  
*Ave Maria!*

*Ave Maria!* stainless styled!  
Foul demons of the earth and air,  
From this their wonted haunt exiled,  
Shall flee before thy presence fair.  
We bow us to our lot of care,

*Ellens Gesang III: Hymne an die Jungfrau*  

*Ave Maria!* Jungfrau mild,  
höre einer Jungfrau Flehen,  
aus diesem Felsen, starr und wild,  
soll mein Gebet zu dir hinwehen.  
Wir schafen sicher bis zum Morgen,  
ob Menschen noch so grausam sind.  
O Jungfrau, sieh der Jungfrau Sorgen,  
o Mutter, hör ein bittend Kind!  
*Ave Maria!*

*Ave Maria!* Unbefleckt!  
Wenn wir auf diesen Fels hinsinken zum Schlaf, und uns dein Schutz bedeckt,  
wird weich der harte Fels uns dünken.  
Du lächelst, Rosendüfte wehen in dieser dumpfen Felsenkluft.  
O Mutter, höre Kindes Flehen  
o Jungfrau, eine Jungfrau ruft!  
*Ave Maria!*

*Ave Maria!* Reine Magd!  
Der Erde und der Luft Dämonen,  
von deines Auges Huld verjagt,  
sie können hier nicht bei uns wohnen!  
Wir woll’n uns still dem Schicksal beugen,
Beneath thy guidance
d reconciled:
Hear for a maid a maiden’s
prayer,
And for a father hear a child!
Ave Maria!

da uns dein heil’ger Trost anweht,
der Jungfrau wolle hold dich neigen,
dem Kind, das für den Vater fleht!
Ave Maria!

Storck’s translation of this song is very faithful to both the meaning and the structure of the original poem. The furthest Storck gets from copying the metrical structure of the original is in line four, where he adds an unaccented syllable both at the beginning and at the end of the line, so that while his fourth line has the same number of accented syllables as Scott’s, it is two syllables longer. He also succeeds in closely approximating the meaning of the English in the German, though he again sometimes changes the order of lines. For example, at the end of the second stanza, Storck’s lines seven and eight would more closely match Scott’s meaning if they were reversed. However, Storck is also trying to keep Scott’s ABABBABA rhyme scheme intact as much as is possible in the German translation, so in this case the rhyme scheme wins out. Overall, this is a good translation and probably the best of the three Ellens Gesänge translations at preserving both the meaning and spirit of the original as well as its poetic structure.

**Lay of the Imprisoned Huntsman**

'My hawk is tired of perch
and hood,
My idle greyhound loathes his
food,
My horse is weary of his stall,
And I am sick of captive
thrall.
I wish I were as I have been,

**Lied des gefangenen Jägers**

Mein Roß so müd in dem Stalle steht,
mein Falk ist der Kapp und der
Stange so leid,
mein müßiges Windspiel sein Futter
verschmäht,
und mich kränkt des Turmes
Einsamkeit.
Ach wär ich nur, wo ich zuvor bin
Hunting the hart in forest green,
With bended bow and bloodhound free,
For that's the life is meet for me.

'I hate to learn the ebb of time
From yon dull steeple's drowsy chime,
Or mark it as the sunbeams crawl,
Inch after inch, along the wall.

The lark was wont my matins ring,
The sable rook my vespers sing,
These towers, although a king's they be,
Have not a hall of joy for me.

'No more at dawning morn I rise,
And sun myself in Ellen's eyes,
Drive the fleet deer the forest through,
And homeward wend with evening dew;
A blithesome welcome blithely meet,
And lay my trophies at her feet,
While fled the eve on wing of glee,--
That life is lost to love and me!

gewesen,
die Hirschjagd wäre so recht mein Wesen,
den Bluthund los, gespannt den Bogen,
ja solchem Leben bin ich gewogen.

Ich hasse der Turmuhr schläfrigen Klang,
ich mag nicht sehn, wie die Zeit verstreicht,
 wenn Zoll um Zoll die Mauer entlang der Sonnenstrahl so langsam schleicht.
Sonst pflegte die Lerche den Morgen zu bringen,
die dunkle Dohle zur Ruh mich zu singen;
in dieses Schlosses Königshallen,
da kann kein Ort mir je gefallen.

Früh, wenn der Lerche Lied erschallt,
sonn ich mich nicht in Ellens Blick,
nicht folg ich dem flüchtigen Hirsch durch den Wald,
und kehre, wenn Abend taut, zurück.

Nicht schallt mir ihr frohes Willkommen entgegen,
nicht kann ich das Wild ihr zu Füßen mehr legen,
nicht mehr wird der Abend uns selig entschweben,
dahin, dahin ist Lieben und Leben.

This translation is less successful than the last one (Ellens Gesang III) at retaining the structure of the original poem. Though all the lines of Storeck's translation
have the same number of accented syllables as in Scott’s _Lay_. Storck’s lines frequently have a greater number of syllables because in positions where Scott has only one unaccented syllable Storck has two. For example, Scott’s fifth line has eight syllables, of which four are accented (I wish I were as I have been’), while Storck’s fifth line has twelve syllables, only four of which are accented (Ach, wär ich nur, wo ich züvor bin gëwësëñ). The meaning, however, is close to that of the original poem, though, as he did in _Ellens Gesänge I & III_, Storck sometimes rearranges the order of certain lines to accommodate his rhyme scheme. This is immediately apparent in the first three lines, because Scott mentions the hawk in the first line, the greyhound in the second and the horse in the third, while in Storck the order is horse, hawk, and dog (literally a whippet). I should also point out that the rhyme scheme that Storck uses (ABABCDD), is close, but not identical, to Scott’s (AABBCDDD).

_Normans Gesang_

The heath this night must be my bed,
The bracken curtain for my head,
My lullaby the warder’s tread,
Far, far from love and thee, Mary;
To-morrow eve, more stilly laid,
My couch may be my bloody plaid,
My vesper song thy wail, sweet maid!
It will not waken me, Mary!

Die Nacht bricht bald herein,
dann leg ich mich zur Ruh,
die Heide ist mein Lager,
das Farnkraut deckt mich zu,
Mich lüllt der Wache tritt
wohl in den Schlaf hinein,
ach, muß so weit von dir,
Maria, Holde, sein.

Und wird es morgen Abend,
und kommt die trübe Zeit,
dann ist vielleicht mein Lager
der blutigrote Plaid,
mein Abendlied verstummet,
du schleicht dann trüb und bang,
Maria mich wecken kann nicht dein Totensang.

I may not, dare not, fancy

So muß’ ich von dir scheiden,
now,
The grief that clouds thy
lovely brow,
I dare not think upon thy vow,
And all it promised me, Mary.

No fond regret must Norman
know;
When bursts Clan-Alpine on
the foe,
His heart must be like bended
bow,
His foot like arrow free,
Mary!

A time will come with feeling
fraught,
For, if I fall in battle fought,
Thy hapless lover’s dying
thought
Shall be a thought on thee,
Mary.
And if returned from
conquered foes,
How blithely will the evening
close,
How sweet the linnet sing
repose,
To my young bride and me,
Mary!

In translating *Normans Gesang* Storck adopted an unusual procedure. Storck
translated each line of Scott’s poem into two shorter lines of German text. Thus for
each of Scott’s lines (all of which have four iambic feet) Stock adds at least two feet
(four or five syllables). As a consequence Storck’s translation is forty-eight feet longer
than Scott’s. If those feet were placed into lines of four iambic feet (the scansion of
Scott’s original poem), they would add twelve lines to the poem, which was only
sixteen lines to begin with, thus lengthening it by 75% of its original length. Though in theory such a disparity between total numbers of syllables might be accommodated by judicious use of text repetition when replacing the German translation with the English, in this case, because the individual German lines are actually shorter than the English, it is impossible to replace the German text with the English without dividing the English lines in odd places. Therefore, Schubert decided not to publish this song with the English text because to do so would require rewriting the entire setting.

The Other Scott Songs and One by Andrew MacDonald

The final three English poems that Schubert set in German translations are appropriately grouped together because they can all be found in the prose novels of Sir Walter Scott. Schubert’s *Lied der Anne Lyle* is from Scott’s *The Legend of Montrose*, his *Gesang der Norna* is from *The Pirate* and his *Romanze des Richard Löwenherz* is from *Ivanhoe*. The picture becomes more complicated, however, because the text that Scott inserted in *The Legend of Montrose* for Annot Lyle to sing is actually by Andrew MacDonald. Also, all three of the translations that Schubert set were by different translators. The translation *Lied der Anne Lyle* was made by Sophie May.

*Lied der Anne Lyle*

Wert thou, like me, in life’s
low vale,
With thee how blest, that lot
I’d share,
With thee I’d fly wherever
gale
Could waft, or bounding
galley bear.
But parted by severe decree,

Wärst du bei mir im Lebenstal,
gern wollt’ ich alles mit dir teilen,
mit dir zu fliehn wär leichte Wahl,
bei mildem Wind, bei Sturmes Heulen.
Doch trennt uns harte
Schicksalsmacht,
Far different must our fortunes prove;
May thine be joy—enough for me
To weep and pray for him I love.

The pangs this foolish heart must feel,
When hope shall be for ever flown,
No sullen murmur shall reveal,
No selfish murmurs ever own.
Nor will I through life's weary years,
Like a pale drooping mourner move,
While I can think my secret tears
May wound the heart of him I love.

Schubert's song is truly a translation of a translation. Though it is uncertain who did the first translation, this poem was apparently written by MacDonald in Gaelic\(^{16}\). It was first published as part of an opera entitled *Love and Loyalty*, which was included in a volume called *The Miscellaneous Works of A. M'Donald*, published in London in 1791. Sophie May's translation closely follows the structure of the original poem. Except for a few unaccented syllables in the German that don't appear in the English, the only variants from the scansion of the original poem appear in lines eleven, twelve, and fourteen. Line eleven in the translation has the same number of

\(^{16}\)See Sir Walter Scott, The Legend of Montrose and The Black Dwarf (Edinburgh: Adam and Charles Black, 1886), 370 for more information on MacDonald.
syllables in the German translation as in the English, but the accents fall in different places (Nö sul’lën murmūr shall’ rēveal’ vs. dōch sōll’s nie’ sēinēn Gram’ gēstehn’).

Similar metrical problems appear between the German and the English in lines twelve and fourteen, in addition to which both are a syllable longer in the German translation.

The most significant differences between these two poems, however, are in their meanings. May’s translation waters down MacDonald’s images, causing the emotion Annot Lyle is expressing to seem less sharp than in MacDonald. For example, in lines seven and eight May’s translation literally reads, "My happiness is when joy smiles on you; I weep and pray for my beloved." In MacDonald’s poem happiness for Annot is never mentioned; she will only weep and pray. Similarly, in the second stanza, MacDonald’s image of "a pale, drooping mourner" is not literally translated but becomes a more general statement that Annot will not let life’s burdens oppress her heart or cloud her faint eyes. Because of these alterations in meaning, MacDonald’s original poem is to be preferred over May’s translation.

The translator of Gesang der Norna is Samuel Heinrich Spicker.

Gesang der Norna

"For leagues along the watery way, Through gulf and stream my course has been; The billows know my Runic lay, And smooth their crests to silent green."

"Die Welle kennt den Runensang, und glättet sich zum Spiegel ab.

Mich führt mein Weg wohl meilenlang
durch Golf und Strom und Wassergrab.

Die Welle kennt den Runensang,
der Golf wird glatt, der Strom wird..."
stream is still;  
But human hearts, more wild  
than they,  
Know but the rule of wayward will.

"One hour is mine, in all the year,  
To tell my woes—and one alone;  
When gleams this magic lamp,  
'tis here,—  
When dies the mystic light,  
'tis gone.

"Daughters of northern Magnus, hail!  
The lamp is lit, the flame is clear,—  
To you I come to tell my tale,  
Awake, arise, my tale to hear!"

The scansion and rhyme scheme of Spicker's translation exactly copies that of Scott's poem, except in line thirteen. This is because Spicker's translation stays true to Scott's standard line form (each line having four iambic feet), while Scott made his first foot in that line a trochee. So Spicker is actually more true to the form set by the first three stanzas than Scott. Spicker's translation, however, also loses some of Scott's imagery. Norna of the Fitful-head believes that she has supernatural powers and so refers to her lamp as "magic" and its light as "mystic". German equivalents of those words do not appear in Spicker's translation, so much of the supernatural atmosphere that Scott creates is lost in the translation. Since creating atmospheric images was one of Scott's strengths as a writer, much of what is special about Scott is lost when his images are translated only in a general way.
The Crusader's Return

1. High deeds achieved of knightly fame, from Palestine the champion came; The cross upon his shoulders borne, Battle and blast had dimm’d and torn. Each dint upon his batter’d shield, Was token of a foughten field; And thus, beneath his lady’s bower, He sung, as fell the twilight hour:—

"Joy to the fair!—thy knight behold, Return’d from yonder land of gold; No wealth he brings, nor wealth can need, Save his good arms and battle-steed; His spurs, to dash against a foe, His lance and sword to lay him low; Such all the trophies of his toil, Such and the hope of Tekla’s smile!

2. "Joy to the fair!—thy knight behold, Return’d from yonder land of gold; No wealth he brings, nor wealth can need, Save his good arms and battle-steed; His spurs, to dash against a foe, His lance and sword to lay him low; Such all the trophies of his toil, Such and the hope of Tekla’s smile!

3. "Joy to the fair! whose constant knight Her favor fired to feats of might; "Heil der Schönen! aus der Ferne ist der Ritter heimgekehrt, doch nichts durft’ er mit sich nehmen, als sein treues Roß und Schwert. Seine Lanze, seine Sporen sind allein ihm unverloren, dies ist all sein irdisch Glück, dies und Teklas Liebesblick.

Romanze des Richard Löwenherz

Großer Taten tat der Ritter
fern im heilgen Lande viel,
und das Kreuz auf seiner Schulter
bleicht’ im rauhen Schlachtgewühl,
manche Narb auf seinem Schilde
trug er aus dem Kampfgefilde,
an der Dame Fenster dicht
sang er so im Mondenlicht:

Heil der Schönen! aus der Ferne ist der Ritter heimgekehrt,
doch nichts durft’ er mit sich nehmen,
as sein treues Roß und Schwert.
Seine Lanze, seine Sporen sind allein ihm unverloren,
dies ist all sein irdisch Glück,
dies und Teklas Liebesblick.

"Heil der Schönen! was der Ritter tat,
verdankt er ihrer Gunst,
Unnoted shall she not remain,
Where meet the bright and
noble train;
Minstrel shall sing and herald
tell--
'Mark yonder maid of beauty
well,
'tis she for whose bright eyes
was won
The listed field at Askalon!

4.
"'Note well her smile!--it
edged the blade
Which fifty wives to widows
made,
When, vain his strength and
Mahound's spell,
Iconium's turban'd Soldan
fell.
Seest thou her locks whose
sunny glow
Half shows, half shades, her
neck of snow?
Twines not of them one
golden thread,
But for its sake a
Paynim bled.'

5.
"Joy to the fair!--my name
unknown,
Each deed, and all its praise
thine own:
Then, oh! unbar this churlish
gate,
The night dew falls, the hour
is late.
Inured to Syria's glowing
breath,
I feel the north breeze chill as
death:
Let grateful love quell maiden
shame,

darum soll ihr Lob verkünden stets
des Sängers süße Kunst.
"Seht, da ist sie," wird es heißen,
"wenn sie ihre Schöne preisen,
"'deren Augen Himmelsglanz

gab bei Ascalon den Kranz.

Schaut ihr Lächeln, eh'rne Männer
streckt' es leblos in den Straub,
und Iconium, ob sein Sultan
mutig stritt, ward ihm zum Raub.

Diese Locken, wie sie golden
schwimmen um die Brust der Holden,

legten manchem Muselmann

Fesseln unzerreißbar an.

Heil der Schönen! dir gehört,
Holde, was dein Ritter tat,

darum öffne ihm die Pforte,

Nachtwind streift, die Stunde naht,
dort in Syriens heißen Zonen

muß' er leicht des Nords entwohnen,

Lieb ersticke nun die Scham,
And grant him bliss who 

weil von ihm der Ruhm dir kam. 

brings thee fame."

In translating Scott’s *Romanze*, Müller adopted a different metrical pattern than Scott had used in his poem. Scott’s basic poetic line was made up of four iambic feet (High deeds’ achieved’ of knight’ly fame’), but Müller adopted a basic line of four trochaic feet (Gro’ßer Ta’ten tat’ der Rit’tër). This means that though the English and German lines have the same number of accented syllables, the order of accented and unaccented syllables is consistently opposite.

Müller’s translation, however, is closer in meaning and spirit to the original poem than either *Gesang der Norna* or *Lied der Anne Lyle*, though some of the imagery is not literally translated. For example, in stanza two the Müller’s knight is only returning home from the distance, not from the “land of gold.” In addition, Müller sometimes puts specific images in different lines than those in which they were originally found, a compromise we saw earlier in Storck’s translations. For example, the knight’s sword is not mentioned in Scott’s second stanza until line six, while in Müller it appears in line four. Still, Müller’s translation seems to lose less of Scott’s tone than the other two, though it still is less vivid that Scott’s original poem.

Conclusions

Now that all the poems and translations have been examined, some general conclusions concerning them can be drawn. First, the original poems are generally superior to their translations. This is especially true of the Shakespeare and Scott poems. Two of the poems, *The Inconstant* and *Normans Gesang*, however, were so
radically changed by their translators that it is inadvisable to replace the German texts with the original poems within Schubert's settings. All of the other songs will have to be individually evaluated to see whether the variants in the translations can be accommodated. In order to discover what kinds of alterations to his music Schubert might have sanctioned so that the English texts could be used, an in-depth study of the four songs Schubert himself published in bilingual edition will be the undertaken in the next chapter.
CHAPTER III

ANALYSES OF SCHUBERT'S BILINGUAL SONGS

When Schubert decided to publish four of the *Lady of the Lake* songs in English, he realized that despite the fact that the translations of the three *Ellens Gesänge* and *Lied des gefangenen Jägers* were in the same meter as the original poems, simply replacing the German syllables with the corresponding English syllables would not guarantee a satisfactory result. Schubert knew no English, and so was unqualified to undertake the task of editing his settings to suit the English texts. There is no record of how he got around this difficulty, but it is likely that there were others in his circle of friends who knew some English and could help make the necessary changes. The question still remains, however, whether the adaptions made by Schubert and his unknown collaborator were successful. Before that question can be answered, it is necessary to examine the kinds of adaptions Schubert made.

Schubert’s Editorial Practices

All of the alterations that Schubert made to his settings effect the vocal line only. The piano accompaniment is never changed, so the original harmony and the accompanimental figures remain the same. Also, because in each of these songs the German translation and the English poem have the same meter, most of the alterations involve accommodating either one more or one less unaccented syllable. These alterations generally take place within a single bar.
Schubert used several different strategies to adapt his settings when the English line was one syllable shorter. In cases in which the number of notes in a phrase was greater than the number of English syllables, Schubert kept the music as it was and assigned one syllable to two notes that previously had separate syllables. This can be seen in the second vocal phrase of *Lied des gefangenen Jägers*.

Example 1. *Lied des gefangenen Jägers*, mm. 9-11.

In essence what Schubert has done is to make a short melisma in what had been a syllabic setting. A variation on this idea can be seen in *Ellens Gesang I*. On

---

several occasions in this song, the pitches are the same in the German vocal line as in the English, but an even rhythm is replaced by a dotted one at the same time that a melisma is used to accommodate fewer syllables.


When two syllables on the same pitch are replaced by one syllable, Schubert frequently adds the note-values together. This can be seen in both measures 9 and 10 of example 1. In these bars the notes added together are of equal value, but Schubert also added together notes of unequal length, as can be seen in bar 11.

A more radical alteration that includes adding note values in one place and dividing up a single note in another can be seen in *Lied des gefangenen Jägers.*
Example 3. *Lied des gefangenen Jägers*, m. 44.

In this example, the first two eighth notes are added together with the first half of the quarter note to make a dotted quarter. The second half of the quarter is then assigned its own syllable, and the rest of the bar is as it was in the German version.

There are also a few instances where Schubert added together the values of notes on different pitches to accommodate a shorter English line. The pitch of the second note is deleted and its length is given to the first pitch. This occurs only when the second pitch is either an octave or a third below the first. One example of this can be found in *Ellens Gesang I*. 
Example 4. *Ellens Gesang I*, m. 98.

The same song also shows an interesting variation on this theme. In measure 81, Schubert has set two German syllables to three notes, the first note being a dotted eighth on $f'$, the second a sixteenth on $d''$ and the third a quarter note on $d'''$. The sixteenth note functions as an anticipation of the second $d''$, which also carries the second syllable of the word *wecken*. However, when adapting these notes to the monosyllabic English word *more* Schubert eliminates the anticipation and adds its value to the $f'$ (he also shortens the following $d'''$).
Example 5. *Ellens Gesang I*, m. 81-83.

Schubert makes the same adjustment in reverse two bars later in measure 83 when the English word (*breaking*) is two syllables. Thus, the English vocal line in this measure shows an anticipation not found in the German vocal line.

Schubert would often simply delete a note if the English poem had fewer syllables than the German translation. This happens at the beginning and end of phrases and can be observed in measure 6 of *Ellens Gesang III.*

This example is also significant because it contradicts a statement made by Richard Capell in his book *Schubert’s Songs*:

A peculiarity of Scott’s prosody here is that in the first stanza the lines are mostly trochaic, while in the second and third they have a syllable more, becoming regularly iambic. The German translator made the first stanza conform to the rest and he used double rhymes freely; hence some little discrepancies when the English is sung. Schubert’s ‘anacruses’ must not be interfered with. It is better to supplement Scott’s lines with ‘O,’ ‘for’ and so on.²

Capell does not give a reason why he believes that Schubert’s ‘anacruses’ must not be interfered with, and Schubert apparently did not feel the same way about his anacruses since he replaced them with rests on five different occasions in this song.

A final strategy that Schubert uses to accommodate an English line that is one syllable shorter is found only in *Lied des gefangenen Jägers*. In six places in this song Schubert replaces a three-note figure with a single note equal in value to the three if their note values were added together.

Example 7. *Lied des gefangenen Jägers*, m. 76.

![Example 7](image)

All of the figures that are replaced by a single note have identical pitches and note values to the one shown above.

In addition to the instances where the English text is one syllable shorter than the German translation, there are a few cases where the English is two syllables shorter. In most of these cases Schubert uses the same strategies as described above, that is, he combines two or more note values, inserts rests or makes short melismas. He also may combine two of these strategies in a single phrase when the English is two syllables shorter than the German. In measures 48-50 of *Ellens Gesang I*, for example, in beat four of measure 48, Schubert divides up the quarter note of the
German version to accomodate two English words. Then, in beats one and two of measure 49 he adds a quarter and an eighth together, which sets the word isle's to a dotted quarter. Finally in beats three and four of measure 49 and in beat one of measure 50 he makes short melismas of notes that were set syllabically in the German version. All of these alterations work together to make it possible for Schubert to set both a nine-syllable German line and a seven-syllable English line to the same music.


When the English lines are a syllable longer than the lines in the German translation, Schubert reversed many of the practices above in order to add notes to his vocal line. For example, in *Ellens Gesang I*, Schubert gave two English syllables to a note that with its appoggiatura had previously set only one German syllable.
Similarly, Schubert divided longer notes into two when the English lines were longer, sometimes adding a drop of a third or an octave.

Schubert also replaced rests with notes by adding an upbeat on the same pitch as the first note of a phrase or by adding a final note at the end of phrase, either on the same pitch as the last note or a third or an octave below.

In only one instance in these songs is the English line two syllables longer than German translation. When setting *Ellens Gesang I*, Schubert combined Scott’s line fifteen (Trump nor pibroch summon here) with the first part of line sixteen (Musterling clan) into a single phrase. It is unclear why Schubert made this adjustment since it forced him to add several new notes to accommodate the English text. (He also had to add note values together and create a melisma in the next phrase since it was now two syllables shorter than the German line it replaced.) Schubert added the additional notes in measure 97, where he originally had a half note tied to an eighth. Their melodic shape suggests the trumpet call mentioned in the text.
This melodic material is similar to that of the two previous phrases and with them forms a series of rising sequences before it reverts to the original melodic material of the German setting in beats three and four of measure 97. This is the most significant change that Schubert made in any of these four songs when adapting them for the English texts.
The alterations described above easily account for the majority of the changes Schubert made to his vocal lines. And except for the last one, they are also easily attributed to the necessity of accommodating the vocal line to the English text. However, there are other, less numerous, alterations, some of which are difficult to account for.

The largest number of these additional changes are places where the same number of syllables appear both in the German and in the English, but where Schubert has replaced an even rhythm with a dotted one. One such variation appears in measure 57 of *Ellens Gesang I*, where the even eighths in the first two beats are replaced with dotted eighth notes followed by sixteenth notes.

There are also some instances, though they are fewer in number, where dotted rhythms are replaced by even ones. However, all these changes seem to be unrelated to either the meanings of the texts they set (that is, they do not seem to correspond to places where the meaning of the English is different from that of the German translation), or to different accent patterns of the English vs. the German.

Schubert was sensitive, however, to differences in declamation. For example, in *Ellens Gesang II*, he was apparently aware that the text, "Huntsman, rest!" could stand by itself apart from the rest of the line, "thy chase is done." Although he does not change his music every time this text is sung, he does so several times, using two different methods. In some instances Schubert emphasized the word *rest* by lengthening it from a quarter note to a dotted quarter by stealing an eighth from the quarter note that follows on the word *thy*. In other places he also shortens *thy*, replacing the quarter note's first eighth with a rest. Both of these variants can be seen in measures 70-74.

In other places, however, similar passages were unaltered, both in this song and in *Ellens Gesang I*, though in neither song does leaving the music as it was affect the English version.

Schubert’s attempts to alter his vocal lines to suit the English poems are not all equally successful, however. For example, in measures 7 and 8 of *Ellens Gesang III*, Schubert faces a particularly difficult problem. The German translation Schubert originally set has nine syllables in this line in all three strophes. Scott’s poem has only seven syllables in this line in the first strophe and has eight syllables in the two successive strophes. Schubert attempted to remedy this problem by repeating words in the English strophes and by moving syllables to other notes, but he did not always make the best choices hence the English lines are awkward.
The first verse is the most successful. The placement of the first syllable of the word *despair* is the only problem. It is overemphasized by being sung through almost all of the second beat, and would have been better placed on the last sixteenth note of that beat. The same problem appears in the second verse (that is, the second syllable of
hover would be better placed on the last sixteenth of the second beat), but is also awkward at the beginning of the phrase, where the word if is stressed by the music although it is an unaccented syllable in the poem. The third strophe shares these same flaws. In all of these strophes, Schubert was trying to adapt his setting to fit the English poetry, but did not know English well enough to make the adaptions gracefully.

Although Schubert did his best to alter his settings to fit Scott's poems, he was not above altering the original poem to fit his setting. For example, in *Ellens Gesang II*, Schubert seems to have thought that the English word *dying* had a long vowel, rather than actually being a two syllable word. Thus, the first two times he set the line, "how thy valiant steed lay dying," he set *dying* to a half note. Oddly, he did add a note for the second syllable of the word *lying* two lines before this.

Example 15. *Ellens Gesang II*, mm. 36-37, 41.
However, at the end of the B section, when Schubert wants to bring back the horn call of the introduction as an interlude that returns to the A section, he changes Scott's word *dying*. He replaces it with the word *dead*, which could be set to a quarter note rather than a half note, and which would emphasize the return of the music of the introduction.


![Music notation](image)

Overall, the adjustments that Schubert made to the *Lady of the Lake* songs are the kind of small adjustments that have been used by many composers to adapt successive stanzas of text to strophic musical settings, and which can therefore also be found in Schubert's strophic German Lieder. By examining them in detail, it has become clear that while in the majority of cases Schubert's alterations do successfully accommodate the English text, he did not always make alterations that were
appropriate for the English poems. It should also be pointed out that merely making all the correct alterations to accommodate English declamation will not by itself insure that the English versions of these songs are successful. Each song will have to be considered as a whole before any judgement can be formed concerning whether Schubert's music works together with the English poems to create effective musical compositions.

*Ellens Gesang II*

Although it may seem odd to begin with *Ellens Gesang II*, this is the setting that needs the least alteration for it to be effective in English. With the exception of the half note Schubert places on the word *dying* (see Ex. 15 above), his text setting works perfectly well, and the music suits the English words as well as it does the German. The half note on *dying* is easily divided into two quarter notes, and the rest of the song can be sung as Schubert wrote it.

American speakers of English may find it odd that in Schubert’s setting the second syllable of the word *reveillé* is obviously the accented syllable. It is clear from Scott's rhyme scheme, however, that he intended *reveillé* to rhyme with *assail ye*. Therefore, the proper pronunciation of *reveillé* in this case should be that which is shown in the Oxford English Dictionary³: *rivei•lye*. This pronunciation guide clearly shows that the second syllable is the accented one because it is followed by a dot, the

symbol this dictionary uses to mark the accented syllable. Therefore, American singers should simply make the two lines rhyme.

Not everyone agrees that Schubert’s music is an appropriate setting for this text in either German or English. Capell objects to the horn calls that seem to contradict the fact that this song is a lullaby⁴. I believe, however, that if the singer and the accompanist carefully follow Schubert’s dynamic markings, the horn calls fade into the distance, and need not disturb the quiet mood of the song or Fitz James’ sleep.

*Lied des gefangenen Jägers*

*Lied des gefangenen Jägers* has only one significant declamatory problem. In measures 18-19 Schubert sets the word *hunting* to an eighth note upbeat and a dotted quarter, effectively reversing the natural accent pattern of the word.

⁴Capell, 209.

This passage would need to be altered in order for it to be sung in English.

One possible alteration is shown below.

A similar but less objectionable problem can be seen in measures 60-61. Here the word *the* is accented by being on the first beat of the bar.


This problem can be solved in the same way as the one in example 16, that is by placing the first syllable of the line, *drive*, on the down beat and changing the rhythmic pattern of the first two beats to the same rhythm as in measure 19 of example 17 above.

After making either one or both of the changes suggested above this song can be sung in English as effectively as it can in German.

*Ellens Gesang III: Hymne an die Jungfrau*

Of all the songs in this group, this song is the most famous. Unfortunately, Schubert’s attempt to underlay his setting with the original text has serious problems. As mentioned above, there are declamatory problems in measures seven and eight in
all three strophes (see pp. 71-72). In addition there are problems in measures ten and eleven in the third strophe. There are, however, some possible solutions.

Moving certain syllables to other notes will help solve the declamation problems in measures seven and eight. In all the stanzas, the syllables in the second beat of bar eight should be moved to the last sixteenth note. In the second stanza, the word *if* should be sung to the two sixteenth notes in the second beat of measure seven, the word *thy* to the next dotted eighth, and the second *if* the following sixteenth. Similarly, in stanza three *shall* should be sung to the two sixteenths, *flee* to the dotted eighth, the second *shall* to the sixteenth. After these alterations, these measures would look like this:

Example 20. *Ellens Gesang III*, mm. 7-8 altered.
This is clearly not an ideal solution. The repetition of the words *if thy* in the second strophe is awkward and does not intensify the emotion in the way that the word repetitions in the other two strophes do. Eliminating the word repetition, however, is no better solution because the melismas become even more lengthy, therefore making the meaning of the line more difficult to follow.

The problem in measures ten and eleven is even more difficult to resolve. In the third strophe, the words *hear for* (from the line, "hear for a maid a maiden's prayer") are set to an eighth-note upbeat and a dotted-eighth downbeat in measure 11. Again this reverses the natural accent pattern of the two words.
Unfortunately, unlike the similar phrases in \textit{Lied des gefangenen Jägers}, this phrase does not lend itself to shifting the first word, \textit{hear}, across the bar line and dividing up the note on the downbeat to accommodate the accent pattern. So, although the word \textit{for} is given unnecessary prominence because of the way that Schubert has set it, I am unconvinced that any alteration of these bars would constitute an improvement.

A less significant problem is found in bar eleven, where because of Schubert's unfamiliarity with English, he divided the word \textit{prayer} into two syllables, and gave
each syllable a separate note (with an appoggiatura into the first). This unnecessary division is easily solved by merely combining the note values, an adaption Schubert used on many other occasions.

One other place in Schubert's English version may cause some dismay among performers of this song. In the third line of the third strophe, Schubert reverses the accent pattern of the word *exiled*. That is, the last syllable of *exiled* falls on the downbeat of bar seven, which means it is more prominent than the first syllable. This is, however, the accent pattern in Scott's original stanza, where *exiled* is obviously intended to rhyme both with *stainless styled* in line one, *reconciled* in line six, and *hear a child* in line eight. Schubert should not be faulted for retaining the same accent pattern found in these parallel lines.

Unfortunately, even with the corrections detailed above, some performers may believe that the declamatory flaws in the English text make it undesirable to perform this song in English. I, however, believe that these flaws are not greater than those that can be found in many English strophic songs and hymns and therefore should not preclude this song from being performed in English. In addition, although Storck's translation is a good one, it is not a match for the original Scott poem. Because the original meaning and context of this song are not widely understood, I believe that performing it with the original text would lead to a greater appreciation of the song as a part of the longer poem *Lady of the Lake*, and would only enhance its reputation.
Ellens Gesang I

Ellens Gesang I is the most problematic of Schubert’s bilingual songs. Although it contains only one declamatory error, it is seriously flawed because of liberties that Storck took with his translation.

The first problem is the difference in the lengths of the poems. As noted in Chapter II, the German translation is four lines longer than the English original because Storck added four lines to the first stanza between the original lines eight and nine. This plays havoc with the original twelve-line structure of the two stanzas of this poem, in which the first four lines form an A section, the second four a B and the third four a variation of A. Storck’s extra lines change the structure of the first stanza into an ABB’A’ form. Thus, when Schubert adapted his setting to the English poem, he had to use the same four lines of English text in the second B section as he had in the first B section. In practical terms this means that Schubert has to stretch four lines of text to cover 34 measures (almost two minutes) of music. This makes the English version extremely repetitious and monotonous.

A different problem appears in the second stanza. Storck’s translation of this stanza is the same length as the second stanza of the original poem, but, as mentioned in chapter two, Storck rearranges the order of both the first four and the final four lines. The rearrangement of the first four lines is shown below. The rearrangement of the final four is strikingly similar.
As these parallel translations demonstrate, Scott lists the sounds that might disturb Fitz James’ sleep in lines two, three and four, while Storck lists them in lines one, two and three. The same rearrangement appears in the final four lines of this stanza. (See p. 39) When Schubert set this stanza of the German translation, at the point when he reaches both lines four and twelve, the two lines that in the German translation mention sleep and tranquility, the martial strain that he began this section with changes to music of a gentler character and a slower tempo. Unfortunately this means that when the English lines replace the German ones, the gentler music sets the words "or squadron tramping" and "shouting clans or squadrons stamping."
Richard Capell argues that the fast, martial music is inappropriate for this text in either German or English⁵, (remember that Ellen is singing this song to lull Fitz James to sleep) but putting that question aside, certainly the change in character of the music shown above suits only the German translation, not the English poem.

Because of the contradiction evident between the English words and the character of the music in the second strophe, as well as the monotony that results when the first English stanza replaces the first German stanza, I believe that this song should not be sung to Scott’s English poem, but only to Storck’s translation.

⁵Capell, 209.
Conclusions

After analyzing each of the *Lady of the Lake* songs, I believe that three of them, *Ellens Gesang II*, *Ellens Gesang III* and *Lay of the Imprisoned Hunstman* can be effectively performed in English. Although slight alterations are required to make this possible, they are alterations of the same kind that Schubert himself used to edit his vocal lines for the English poems. I do not agree with Graham Johnson that such adaptation is "cheating" since it is clear that Schubert was willing to alter his settings in the hope of attracting a wider audience for his songs. Only in the case of *Ellens Gesang I*, where there is a clear contradiction between the English words and the character of the music that sets them, do I believe that performing the English version is inappropriate.

---

CHAPTER IV

ANALYSES OF SCHUBERT’S OTHER ENGLISH SONGS

Now that detailed analyses of Schubert’s *Lady of the Lake* songs have been completed, the results can be used to make some decisions concerning the rest of his English songs. Specifically, this chapter will attempt to determine which of Schubert’s other English song settings can be adapted to their original English poems, using the kinds of editorial procedures he himself used to adapt the *Lady of the Lake* songs. These songs will be discussed in the same order that their poems were in Chapter II.

The Shakespeare Songs

The three Shakespeare songs are the songs to which the original poems can be returned most easily. Two of them, *Ständchen* and *Trinklied*, require no alteration in order for the English texts to be sung. The English syllables can simply replace the German ones in a one for one exchange. The same is also true for the first and the third stanzas of *An Silvia*. In the second verse, however, two alterations are required. Changes are required because last line of the second stanza is one syllable longer in Shakespeare’s English than it is in Bauernfeld’s translation and because Schubert repeats the final line of each stanza in his musical setting. Therefore, in measure 19 the two eighth notes should each take one syllable of the word *being*, and in measure 22 an upbeat needs to be added for the word *and*. These adjustments are shown below.

85

When the German translations have been replaced by Shakespeare’s poems, the English versions of these songs are actually better than their German counterparts. As mentioned in Chapter two, none of the translations of these poems approaches the quality of Shakespeare’s poems, particularly in the area of imagery. Shakespeare had the ability to evoke very clear and precise images with a minimum number of words, and none of the translators was able to capture that quality of Shakespeare’s poems. Schubert’s music, however, does capture the spirit of the original poems, so therefore there is no reason that these songs should not be performed in English.
Der Weiberfreund

Abraham Cowley's poem The Inconstant was significantly altered by Josef von Ratschky when he translated it into German. As the analysis in Chapter II shows, von Ratschky's translation only reproduces the meaning of Cowley's poem in a very general sense, and it does not reproduce the structure of Cowley's poem at all. Since von Ratschky's stanzas are considerably shorter than Cowley's original stanzas, Schubert's musical strophes are also too short to accommodate Cowley's stanzas.

Verklärung

Richard Capell, in his book Schubert's Songs, discusses Verklärung on two separate occasions. In his chapter on Schubert's poets he writes: "It [Verklärung] is very early Schubert but still of real interest. Schubert's note-values do not quite fit Pope. It would be worth editing the song in that sense." Later, when examining the songs of 1811-1814, he elaborates:

In the song Verklärung of 1813 Schubert has set Herder's translation of Pope's Vital spark of heavenly flame. Many grown composers might have been proud to acknowledge this song. The recitatives are telling; the short cantabile sections have upward-striving phrases and a serious pulsing accompaniment. Oddly enough, Pope's last words, 'O death, where is thy sting?' fit Schubert's notes better than does the German. Although not like mature Schubert, it is not immature music. The association of Pope and Schubert is curious enough to make the song memorable.²

¹Capell, 25.
²Capell, 82.
Clearly Capell believes that this song can and should be edited to accommodate Pope's poem. Capell also leaves the reader with the impression that such editing would be relatively simple to do. This turns out to be untrue.

Schubert's setting falls roughly into an ABA'B'A" form in which the A sections are recitative and the B sections are arioso passages with related musical material. Unfortunately, these sections do not correspond to the structure of Pope's poem. The first major problem arises at the end of the first A section. Schubert uses his first recitative section to set the first five lines of Herder's translation. (As can be seen on p. 27, Herder's first stanza has eight lines). The remaining three lines of the stanza are set in the first B section. Pope's first stanza, however, is a six-line stanza. Though it is possible that Schubert's recitative could be altered to suit Pope's first five lines, the sixth would still have to be separated from the stanza with which it belongs. This is particularly troublesome because the sixth line is linked to the fifth by its opening word and, and because the two lines form a rhymed couplet:

Cease, fond Nature, cease thy strife,  
and let me languish into life!

Schubert's musical structure is obscures Pope's poetic form and makes it more difficult for the listener to grasp the meaning of the poem.

A similar structural incongruity between Schubert's setting (whose structure is based on that of Herder's translation) and Pope's poem occurs in the second B section. As was noted in chapter two, the final quotation from the Bible, "O grave, where is thy victory, O death where is thy sting," (which makes up the final A section) takes up two lines in Pope's poem, but only one in Herder's translation. This means that
Herder's translation of this stanza is actually a line longer than Pope's stanza.

Schubert's setting is therefore one phrase too long and that extra phrase appears in the last B section. Normally, this problem might be overcome by text repetition, but in text repetition would sound odd in this song because no other text has been repeated, and because the song is structured around the alternation of recitative and arioso sections that closely mirror the structure of Herder's translation.

In my opinion, these two major structural incongruities create serious flaws in this song if it is sung in English. Replacing Herder's translation with Pope's poem undermines the structure of Pope's poem, which causes the meaning of the poem to become unclear. Therefore I believe that this song is best left unaltered.

Der blinde Knabe

Critical opinion of this song is split. Capell writes:

The pages, considered without regard for the text, suggest a graceful and placid brook song. The arpeggio figure is one of the prettiest of its kind in Schubert. All is delicacy and suavity. Unfortunately the subject renders the song intolerable. For the sighted complacently to put smoothe words into the mouth of the blind, and to make a comfortable song of unimagined disaster is a sentimentality and an impertinence. The English text fits Schubert's melody.

E. G. Porter, however, seems undisturbed by the subject of the poem, when he writes that, "Colley Cibber's 'The Blind Boy,' . . . is one of the great songs of this section," (that is, the section of his book that covers the English songs). Graham Johnson takes

---

3Capell, 207.

a middle road between Porter’s unquestioning acceptance and Capell’s condemnation by first mentioning that Schubert’s era was, "more susceptible to pathos, and more moved by melodrama than our own more 'politically correct' century," and then by stating:

Although Capell was right to point out that Cibber’s words . . . were in bad taste, Schubert’s music seems to soften the overt process of tear-jerking to show us the same inner radiance and bravery against the odds which make the celebrated Frühlingsglaube such an overwhelmingly powerful song. . . . This is no more or less than a song encapsulation of the composer’s own refusal to become cynical and bitter in the face of tragedy.5

Whether one agrees with Johnson or Capell concerning the appropriateness of Schubert’s song, Capell was right about one thing. Schubert’s melody can be easily adapted to Cibber’s words. In the first four stanzas, the German syllables can be replaced by the corresponding English ones without altering Schubert’s melody at all, as long as Schubert’s text repetitions are observed. Only in the final stanza is some adjustment necessary. This is because Schubert’s phrase structure mirrors the grammatical sense, not the line form of Craigher’s translation. Craigher’s last two lines read:

Bin wie ein König froh, obgleich
[I am happy as a King, although]

Ein armer blinder Knab.
[A poor blind Boy.]

---

5Graham Johnson, Program notes for Franz Schubert’s Complete Songs, Vol. 15 performed by Margaret Price with Graham Johnson (Hyperion CDJ33015, 1992), 34-35.
Thus, Schubert’s first phrase ends at the comma, and the word *obgleich* is placed in the same phrase as Craigher’s final line. Cibber’s original lines, "Whilst thus I sing, I am a King/Altho’ a poor Blind Boy" cannot be divided in the same way. However, Schubert has written enough notes in the first phrase so that by giving two short melismas syllables on every note, all of Cibber’s word’s can be accommodated. Of course, that means that in the next phrase the German line is two syllables longer than the English line, but this can also be altered by combining note values and making short melismas. Both the original version and an English version are shown below.
Example 24. *Der blinde Knabe*, mm. 32, beat 4-36, beat 1.

With these changes, which must also be made in measures 38-41, Schubert’s song can be sung in English. The only question that remains is whether it is appropriate to sing this song at all.

The Ossian Songs

Porter writes the following concerning Schubert’s Ossian songs:

This song [Shilrik und Vinvela], like most of this group, may be sung to the original English with little alteration as the translation is practically
literal, for although the diction is deeply poetical, there is no regular rhythm and naturally no rhyme. The only difficulty lies in the fact that the translator (Harold) sometimes used German equivalents that had more syllables than the original words.6

What Porter does not mention is that those "difficulties" (that is, German equivalents that have more syllables than the original words) are quite frequent, several of them often occurring within a single sentence. The opening of Ossians Lied nach dem Falle Nathos' is typical. The first lines of Macpherson's original prose poem and Harold's translation are shown below:

"Bend forward from your clouds," I said, "ghosts of my fathers! bend."

Beugt euch aus eurem Wolken nieder, ihr Geister meiner Väter, beuget euch!

Macpherson's line is fourteen syllables long, while Harold's translation is eighteen syllables. In addition, neither follows a regular pattern of accented and unaccented syllables. A similar problem can be seen in the opening of Das Mädchen von Inistore. Here not only is Harold's translation significantly longer than Macpherson's sentence (seventeen and fourteen syllables respectively), but Harold reverses the order of the phrases:

Weep on the rocks of roaring winds, O maid of Inistore!

Mädchen Inistores, wein' auf dem Felsen der stürmischen Winde.

In the following example from Kolma's Klage, the opposite problem appears. Here Macpherson's sentence (sixteen syllables) is significantly longer than Harold's (twelve):

---

6Porter, 112.
Lead me, some light, to the place where my love rests for the chase alone.

Geleitet freundlich mich wo mein Geliebter ruht.

Similar problems appear in all of the Ossian songs and they make replacing Harold's translation with Macpherson's words extremely difficult. Although at times individual lines can be easily accommodated, in each of these songs there are one or more occasions where the alterations must go far beyond any Schubert made when he edited the *Lady of the Lake* songs. As the example below illustrates, in many cases, both because of discrepancies between the lengths of the lines and because of different accent patterns, Schubert's music can not be adapted for the English text.


The first half of this phrase, "Lead me, some light to the place," can be easily edited for the English text. The second half can not, however, because of the greater number
of syllables and because of the natural accent pattern that requires the words love, rests and chase to fall on strong beats. The final word alone can not be incorporated into Schubert’s music.

Because all of the Ossian songs display similar problems to the one shown above, they would require more significant editorial changes than those Schubert made when he edited the Lady of the Lake songs. Therefore, I believe that this entire repertoire is more effectively performed with Harold’s German translation.

Lied der Anne Lyle

Sophie May’s translation of Lied der Anne Lyle is structurally very similar to the English version Sir Walter Scott included in The Legend of Montrose. This makes adaption of the English text to Schubert’s setting relatively simple. Although in various places upbeat notes must be dropped, short melismas must be inserted or divided up, and rests must be replaced with notes, most of the phrases require only minor changes. The phrase shown below is typical of the kind of alteration that is necessary.
There is, however, one place in this song where there is something of a discrepancy between the English words and Schubert’s music. It appears in bar 24, where Schubert has written a six-note melisma for the second syllable of the word *Freude* (joy). When May translated this line she moved this word, which appears earlier in the line in MacDonald, almost to the end. The two lines are given below:

mein Glück ist, wenn dir Freude lacht, (ich wein und bete für den Lieben).

[My happiness is when joy smiles on you]

May thine be joy—enough for me (To weep and pray for him I love.)
Because of this rearrangement of the word order, the relatively unimportant word *for* is sung to Schubert's melisma when the English words replace the German.


Despite the fact that this is a strophic song, the same problem does not appear in the second strophe where the English and the German words sung at this point, *geheimer* and *secret*, have the same meaning. It is interesting to note, however, that in both strophes Schubert's melisma appears on an unaccented syllable. In addition, while in the first strophe the melisma is associated with the word *Freude* (joy), in the second it sets the words *geheimer Schmerz* (secret sorrow). Because of this, I believe that this melisma should be seen as a melodic embellishment, rather than as an example of word painting, so that the fact that it appears with the word *for* when the English text replaces the German should not be considered to be a significant flaw.
This is one of the more beautiful of Schubert's settings of the poems from the novels of Sir Walter Scott, and should be better known than it is. Since Schubert's music can be so easily adapted to the English poem, there is no reason not to perform it in English.

*Gesang der Norna*

As the analysis in Chapter II showed, Spicker's translation exactly copies the stanzaic structure and scansion of Scott's poem except at the beginning of line thirteen, where Scott used one trochaic foot instead of his usual iambic foot. Because of this, except at the beginning of the fourth strophe, substituting the English syllables for the German ones is a relatively simple process. The trochee at the beginning of line thirteen requires one rhythmic alteration in Schubert's setting, that can be seen below.

Example 28. *Gesang der Norna*, mm. 61-63.
One way in which Spicker’s translation does not mirror Scott’s poem is in its phraseology. Within a line, the phrase breaks do not always coincide and while in most cases this is of no consequence, it creates a problem at the climactic point of Schubert’s setting. Scott’s original twelfth line and Spicker’s translation of it divide differently as can be seen below:

When dies the mystic light,’tis gone.

ihr Schein verlischt—sie ist entflohn.

Schubert’s music is strophic except in the third verse where, following the structure of line twelve, Schubert breaks the line into two separate musical phrases. If the German syllables were replaced one for one with the English syllables in Schubert’s setting, the rests between the phrases would fall between the two syllable of the word mystic. This difficulty can be overcome by dividing up the tied note Schubert uses to set the word Schein and by repeating some of the text in the second musical phrase.
Example 29. Gesang der Norna, mm. 51-57.

When Scott's words replace those of Spicker, the haunting quality of this scene becomes even stronger. Schubert's music is an excellent partner for Scott's poem,
since both Schubert and Scott excel at creating the supernatural atmosphere this scene
depends on.

*Romanze des Richard Löwenherz*

Richard Capell has the following to say about the last of Schubert’s setting of
Sir Walter Scott:

Scott’s translator turned iambics into trochees, so that the English text and
Schubert’s music cannot be made to agree. The music, in B minor and
major, is all built on a spirited dotted quaver rhythm. . . . As a song, it
does not, in its seven pages of hammered quavers, altogether avoid
monotony.7

Whether one or not agrees that with Capell that this song becomes monotonous, Capell
has made two important points about this song. First, Müller did change the basic foot
that makes up the poetic lines of this poem when he translated it. Since in a trochaic
foot the strong accent is on the first of the two syllables in the foot, when Schubert set
this poem to music he began all the poetic lines on the beat, and often on the
downbeat of the measure. On the other hand, Scott’s iambic lines would generally be
set to music beginning on an upbeat.

Capell goes on to state, however, that Schubert’s music is based on a dotted
quaver rhythm, that is, a dotted eighth note plus a sixteenth. This figure appears in
nearly every beat (and probably is a major reason Capell considers this song to be
monotonous). Because it does, adapting Scott’s iambic feet to Schubert’s music is
actually not very difficult. It requires adding a up-beat to nearly every vocal phrase,
but since every phrase is preceded by a sixteenth note, incorporating this note into the

7Capell, 212.
following phrase is not difficult. The first phrase is typical of the type of alteration needed.

Example 30. Romanze des Richard Löwenherz, mm. 6-8.

The added upbeat is not required on every phrase because Scott sometimes substituted a trochee for the first iamb in a line. The quotation, "Joy to the fair!", that begins three of Scott's five stanzas is a case in point. It begins with a trochee followed by an iamb, so that two unaccented syllables fall together. In this case modifying Schubert's dotted eighth plus sixteenth note to an eighth plus two sixteenths can overcome this problem of differences in scansion. An example of this type of modification is shown below, though in this case the first words of the line are, "Minstrel shall sing."
This example shows another modification that must be made in a few phrases. Because Müller’s trochaic lines are more likely than Scott’s iambic ones to have feminine endings (that is, to end with unaccented syllables) the final note must be omitted in some phrases, such as the one above.

Because the alterations that Romanze des Richard Löwenherz requires in order to be sung in English are similar to those made by Schubert for the English texts of the Lady of the Lake songs, I see no reason for Capell to forbid the singing of this song in English. And perhaps with Scott’s poetry, which is undoubtedly of better quality than Müller’s translation, performers of this song will be able to avoid the monotony of which Capell complains.
CHAPTER V

GERMAN OR ENGLISH: THE FINAL EVALUATION

Now that all the analyses are complete, some final conclusions can be drawn as to which of the songs that Schubert wrote using German translations can be effectively sung with the original English poems. Of the songs that Schubert himself adapted, those from Sir Walter Scott’s *Lady of the Lake*, three of the four can be successfully performed in English. *Ellens Gesang II*, *Ellens Gesang III* and *Lied des gefangenen Jägers* all require some alterations beyond those made by Schubert, but the changes are not significantly different from the alterations he himself made in other places in these songs. These songs should all be sung in English and enjoyed by English singers and audiences. Only *Ellens Gesang I*, in which there is a serious conflict between Scott’s poetry and Schubert’s music, should be performed exclusively with its German text.

One could argue that the Shakespeare songs should always be sung in English. The quality of Shakespeare’s poetry is so far above that of his translators, even that of Schlegel, that the main justification for singing them in German would be so that German audiences can enjoy them. In any case, these songs should be in every English-speaking singer’s repertoire.

The songs from the novels of Sir Walter Scott can also be sung to their original texts. Although they require some adaptations, *Lied der Anne Lyle*, *Gesang der Norna*,
and Romanze des Richard Löwenherz can all be altered, using the same editorial procedures that Schubert used for the Lady of the Lake songs, so that Scott's original poetry can replace the translations. Since Scott's poetic abilities surpass those of this translators, these songs can benefit from the exchange of texts.

Of the individual songs, only the music of Der blinde Knabe can be joined effectively to the original poetry. The music of Verklärung and Der Weiberfreund too closely follows the structure of the translations to allow the use of the original poems. Schubert himself recognized that when the structure of his music closely imitated that of the German translation, and that structure was different from that of the original English poem, a completely new setting would be required. It is likely that for this reason he decided not to attempt to adapt Normans Gesang to its original text. Verklärung, Der Weiberfreund, and all of the Ossian lieder can not be adapted to the English texts on which they are based and will always have to be sung in translation.

For the sake of clarity, I have listed below all the English songs of Schubert, recommending whether they can can or cannot be sung effectively with the original English text. Those that can be performed in English have also been included in the Appendix, fully edited for performance in English. It is my hope that through use of the English poems, these songs will become more widely known and loved by both English-speaking singers and audiences.
Songs that can be sung in English

Ellens Gesang II, D 838
Ellens Gesang III, D 839
Lied des gefangenen Jägers, D 843
Der blinde Knabe, D 833
Lied der Anne Lyle, D 830
Gesang der Norna, D 831
Trinklied, D 888,
Ständchen, D 889
An Silvia, D 891
Romanze des Richard Löwenherz, D 907

Songs that cannot be sung in English

Ellens Gesang I, D 837
Verklärung, D 59
Lodas Gespenst, D 150
Kolmas Klage, D 217
Der Weiberfreund, D 271
Ossians Lied nach der Falle Nathos', D 278
Das Mädchen von Inistore, D 281
Cromman, D 282
Shirri und Vinvela, D 293
Der Tod Oscars, D 375
Lorma, D 376
Die Nacht, D 534
Normans Gesang, D 846
Before and during Schubert’s lifetime, as German literature and culture were first beginning to emerge from the shadows of French and Italian culture, English literature in German translation was widely available in German-speaking areas and was frequently used as a model for German literature. Therefore, it is not surprising to discover that Schubert set twenty-three translations of English poems to music. The songs included in this volume are intended to be performing editions for English-speaking singers of those Schubert songs which can be effectively performed when the original English poems replace the German translations Schubert set.

The first three songs in the collection, *Ellens Gesang II*, *Ellens Gesang III* and *Lied des gefangenen Jägers*, are based on Schubert’s own English versions. These songs, along with the choral pieces *Coronach* and *Bootgesang* and two other solo songs, *Ellens Gesang I* and *Normans Gesang*, all of which have texts from Sir Walter Scott’s *Lady of the Lake*, were originally published in 1826 in Vienna by Matthias Artaria. The changes Schubert made in the three *Ellens Gesänge* and *Lied des gefangenen Jägers* in order to permit use of the original English poems were carefully studied. They became the standard by which Schubert’s other songs which had been composed to translations of English poems were evaluated in order to determine whether Schubert’s music could be successfully edited to accommodate the English poem. These songs were also evaluated in order to determine whether the English texts could effectively substitute for the German translations in performance. In editing his songs, Schubert only made changes to the vocal lines, never to the accompaniments.
After careful evaluation, it was determined that of the twenty-three English poems whose German translations were set by Schubert, ten can be effectively performed with the music Schubert wrote for the translations.

It should be noted that because Schubert did not know English, there is a high degree of probability that he collaborated with someone (or several others) in his circle of friends to prepare the English versions of the Lady of the Lake songs published by Artaria. It is not known who this collaborator was, but because the collaborators lacked familiarity with English there are some problems in the English text underlay as it was published. However, except in the case of Ellens Gesang I, the problems can be solved by using the same methods Schubert used to correctly adjust for the English text in other places in these songs. These adjustments have been made in this volume. Unfortunately, in Ellens Gesang I there are discrepancies between the meaning of the English text and the character of the music that cannot be resolved, so this song has not been included.

The remaining songs in this volume appear for the first time with the original English poems. Although the amount of editing that was required in order to accommodate the English text varied from song to song, all were edited in accordance with the practices Schubert and his collaborator(s) employed in editing the Lady of the Lake songs. It is my hope that through the use of the English texts, these songs will become more widely known and loved by both English-speaking singers and audiences.

The basic editorial guidelines used in creating this edition are given below.
Specific alterations are not identified within the edition, but can be seen by comparing this edition with either the *Neue Schubert Ausgabe*¹ or the Schubert *Werke*². Additional information concerning Schubert’s editorial practices, on which these editorial guidelines are based, can be found in Chapter III of this document.

I. The accompaniments of the songs are never altered.

II. Whenever possible, the English syllables replace the corresponding German syllables in a one-for-one exchange.

III. Shorter English lines are accommodated in the following ways:

   A. The music is unaltered, but only one syllable is assigned to two or more notes that originally had separate syllables.

Example 32. *Gesang der Norna*, mm. 55-57.

---


B. The values of two notes that originally had separate syllables are added together and sung to a single syllable.

Example 33. Romanze des Richard Löwenherz, mm. 12-14.

C. One or more upbeat notes are deleted.

Example 34. Lied der Anne Lyle, mm. 10-12.

D. The final note of a phrase is deleted. In the following example, the final pitch is deleted, but its length is given to the previous pitch.

IV. Longer English lines are accommodated in the following ways:

A. The music is unaltered, but separate syllable are assigned to two or more note that were originally sung to a single syllable.

Example 36. *Der blinde Knabe*, mm. 32-33.

B. Some long notes were divided into two shorter notes of the same total length so that two syllables could be set to a single note.
C. Rests at the beginning of a phrase were replaced by an additional upbeat note(s) on the same pitch as the first note of the phrase.

Example 38. Romanze des Richard Löwenherz, mm. 6-8.

V. Declamatory problems in the songs Schubert edited himself were corrected in the following ways:
A. Using the methods cited above.

B. Moving syllables to different notes in the phrase. In the example below, Schubert's original text underlay is shown below the corrected version.

Ellen's Song II
(Ellens Gesang II)

Sir Walter Scott

Etwas geschwind

Franz Schubert D 838

Hunts - man, rest! thy chase is done,

Hunts - man, rest! thy chase is done,
while our slumbrous spells assail ye, dream not, with the

rising sun, bugles here shall sound reveille
cresc.

bugles here shall sound reveille. Huntsman
Hunts-man rest! thy chase is done.
sleep! the hounds are by thee lying, sleep! nor dream in

yon - der glen, how thy gal - lant steed lay dy - ing,

cresc.

how thy gal - lant steed lay dy - ing, sleep! nor
dream in yonder glen, how thy gallant steed lay dead.

Hunt - man, rest! thy chase is done,
hunts-man, rest! thy chase is done, while our stumbrous

spells assail ye, dream not, with the rising sun,
Hunts - man rest! thy chase is done, Hunts-man

rest! thy chase is done

dim.
Listen to a maiden's prayer, thou canst hear though from the
flinty couch woe now must she seem with down of elder
demons of the earth and air from this their wonted haunt

Wild, thou canst save midst decreed, if thy, if thy protection howver
bled, shall flee, shall flee before thy presence

Safe may we sleep beneath thy care, though there. The shifty cavern's heavy air
fair. We bow us to our lot of care.
banished, outcast and reviled;
breathe of balm if thou hast smiled;
neath thy guidance concealed;

Maiden! hear a maiden's prayer
for a maid a maiden's prayer
Mother hear a suppliant child!
for a father hear a child!

Ave Maria!
Lay of the Imprisoned Huntsman  
(Lied des gefangenen Jaegers)

Sir Walter Scott  
Franz Schubert D 843

Etwas geschwind

My hawk is tired of perch and hood, my

idle grey-hound loathes his food, my horse is weary of his stall, and
I am sick of captive thrall.

wish I were, as I have been hunting the hart in forest's green, with

bended bow and bloodhound free, for that's the life is meet for me, for

cresc.
that's the life is meet for me.

I hate to learn the
ebb of time, from yon dull steeple's drow-sy chime, or mark it as the
sunbeams crawl, inch after inch, along the wall.

The lark was wont my matins ring, the sable rook my

vespers sing; these towers, although a king's they be, have
not a hall of joy for me, have not a hall of joy for me.

No more at dawning morn I rise, and sun myself in_
Ellen's eyes, drive the fleet deer the forest through, and

home-ward wend with evening dew;

blithe-some welcome blithely meet, and lay my trophies
at her feet, while fled the eve on wing of glee, that

cresc.

life is lost to love and me, that life is lost to love and

me!
The Blind Boy
(Der blinde Knabe)

Colley Cibber

Maessig

O say! what is this thing called Light,

Which I can ne'er enjoy;

What is the Blessing of the Sight,

tell your poor blind Boy.

Franz Schubert D 833
You talk of won-d'rous things you see, You
say the sun shines bright I feel him warm, but how can he Then
make it Day or Night, Then make it Day or Night.
My Day or Night myself I make,
a tempo

When-e'er I wake, or play; And cou'd I ev-er
keep a-wake,

It wou'd be al-ways Day, It
wou'd, it wou'd be al-ways Day.

heav-y sighs, I of-ten hear You mourn my help-less woe; But

sure with pa-tience I may bear, A loss I ne'er can know,
loss I ne'er can know. Then let not what I can not have my

cheer of mind destroy Whilst thus I sing, I am a King.

Al-

tho' a poor Blind Boy! Al-tho' a poor Blind

pp
Boy! Then let not what I can not have, My cheer of mind de-
stroy, Whilst thus I sing, I am a King, Al-tho' a
poor Blind Boy! Al-tho' a poor Blind Boy!
a tempo
Drinking Song
(Trinklied)

William Shakespeare
Maessig

Franz Schubert D 888

Come thou monarch of the vine
Plumpy

Bacchus with pink eyne!
In thy fats our cares be drowned,
With thy grapes our hairs be crowned, Cup us till the world go round.
Cup us till the world go round.
Serenade

(Staendchen)

William Shakespeare

Allegretto

Franz Schubert D 889

Hark! the lark at heaven's gate sings and Phoebus gins a rise.

Fine
steeds to water at those springs. On charlie'd flowers that lies; and winking May-buds begin to ope their golden eyes: With every thing that pretty is. My
lady sweet arise, arise, arise, my lady sweet arise, arise, arise, my lady sweet arise, arise, arise, my lady sweet arise!

Da capo al fine
To Silvia
(An Silvia)

William Shakespeare

Franz Schubert D 891
Heav'n such grace did lend him of his
blindness.
And, being helped in habits there.
And, let us bring.
Anne Lyle's Song
(Lied der Anne Lyle)
Andrew MacDonald (from Walter Scott's The Legend of Montrose)
Maessig

Franz Schubert  D 830

Wert thou like me in life's low
vale with thee how blessed that lot I'd share
fly where-ev-er gale could waft or bounding gal-ley

With thee I'd
bear.

But parted by se-

vere de-cree Far diff-

rent must our for-

tunes prove May
cresc.

thine be joy, e-

ough for me to

weep and

pray for him I

love. May thine be joy, e
To weep and pray for

him I love.

The pangs this foolish heart must feel when...
hope shall be forever flown. No sullen murmurs shall re-

veal. No selfish murmurs ever own.

Nor will I through life's weary years like a

drooping mourner move, While I can think my
secretn tears May tears may wound the heart of him

love. While I can think my secret tears

my tears may wound the heart of him

love.
Norna's Song
(Gesang der Norna)

Sir Walter Scott

Franz Schubert D 831

Nicht zu langsam

For leagues a-long the wa-tery way, Through gulf and stream my course has been;
The billows know my
Ru·nic lay, And smooth their crests to si·lent green.

And smooth their crests to si·lent green.
bills know my Runic lay. The gulf grows smooth, the stream is still;

But human hearts, more wild than they,

Know but the rule of wayward will,

Know
but the rule of way-ward will

One hour is mine, in

all the year. To tell my woes; and one a-lone,
When gleams this magic lamp, 'tis here.

When

dies the mystic light,

'tis gone, 'tis gone.

'tis gone.
Daughters of nor-thern Mag - nus, hail! The lamp is lit, the flame is clear,

To you I come to tell my tale,

A - wake, a - rise, my
tale to hear!  A - wake, a - nse, my tale to

tale to hear!  A - wake, a - nse, my tale to

hear!
Romance of Richard the Lion-Hearted
(Romanze des Richard Loewenherz)

Sir Walter Scott

Maessig, doch feurig

Franz Schubert D 907

High deeds a
chieved of knight-ly fame, From Pa-
les -tine the champion came;
The cross up
- on his shoulder borne, battle and blast had dimmed and torn

Each dint up

- on his battered shield Was taken of a foughten field;

And thus, be

-neath his lady's bower, He sung as fell the twilight's
Joy to the fair! thy knight behold, Return'd from yonder land of gold;
No wealth he brings, nor wealth can need, Save his good arms and battle steed
His spurs to dash against a foe, His lance and
sword to lay him low,
Such all the trophies of his
toil,
Such and the hope of Tekla's smile!

Such all the trophies of his toil,
Such and the
Joy to the world...

Hope of Te-kia's smile!
fair whose constant knight her favor fired to feats of might;
whose bright eyes was won the listed field at Askalon!

'Tis she for whose bright eyes was

won The listed field at Askalon!

decresc.

p

>
"Note well her smile! it edged the blade
Which fifty wives to widows made,
When, vain his strength and Ma-houds spell, I-co-nu'm's tur-ban'd Sol-dan fell

Seest thou her locks whose sun-ny glow Half shows, half shades her neck of snow?

Twines not of them one gold-en thread, But for its
sake a Pay-nim bled.'  Twines not of

them one golden thread.  But for its sake a Pay-nim bled.'
Joy to the fair! my name unknown, each deed, and all its praise thine own:

Then, oh! unbar this churlish gate, the nightdew
falls, the hour is late.

Inured to Syria's glowing

breath I feel the north breeze chill as death

Let grateful

love quell maiden shame, and grant him bliss who brings thee
Then, oh! unbar this churlish
gate, The night dew falls,
Let grateful
love quell maiden shame, and grant him bliss who brings thee
176

Let grateful love quell maiden.

shame, And grant him bliss who brings thee fame.


_____ , tr. The Poems of Ossian, To which are prefixed a preliminary discourse and dissertations on the aera and poems of Ossian. New York: C. Wells, 1773.


Miller, Philip Lieson. The Ring of Words: An Anthology of Song Texts, the original texts selected and translated, with an introduction by Philip L. Miller. Garden City, New York: Doubleday, 1963.


____. The Lady of the Lake, ed. with introduction and notes by Ebenezer Charlton Black. Boston and New York: Ginn and Company, [ca. 1921].


**RECORDINGS**


