

Department : Navy
 Scenario File : C:\Documents and Settings\Home\My Documents\Scenarios 2\BNAS corrected Scenario 2.CBR
 Option Pkg Name: BNAS 138B Correction 2
 Std Fctrs File : C:\Documents and Settings\Home\My Documents\COBRA\BRAC2005.SFF

Starting Year : 2006
 Final Year : 2011
 Payback Year : 2023 (12 Years)

NPV in 2025(\$K): -25,973
 1-Time Cost(\$K): 147,305

Net Costs in 2005 Constant Dollars (\$K)

	2006	2007	2008	2009	2010	2011	Total	Beyond
	----	----	----	----	----	----	----	----
MilCon	9,854	0	45,015	45,459	19,015	0	119,344	0
Person	-120	-647	-1,202	-2,589	-5,263	-15,769	-25,589	-24,864
Overhd	3,724	2,778	2,730	3,266	3,386	2,821	18,705	1,856
Moving	0	0	300	2,189	3,594	2,727	8,810	0
Missio	0	0	0	0	0	5,381	5,381	5,381
Other	0	0	125	1,037	2,110	3,118	6,390	2,518
TOTAL	13,458	2,131	46,969	49,363	22,842	-1,722	133,041	-15,108

	2006	2007	2008	2009	2010	2011	Total
	----	----	----	----	----	----	----

POSITIONS ELIMINATED

Off	2	2	0	1	1	23	29
Enl	0	6	3	7	20	151	187
Civ	0	0	0	5	15	10	30
TOT	2	8	3	13	36	184	246

POSITIONS REALIGNED

Off	0	0	0	107	134	36	277
Enl	0	0	0	705	686	303	1,694
Stu	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Civ	0	0	0	0	0	4	4
TOT	0	0	0	812	820	343	1,975

Summary:

 This alternative scenario is based on DON-138B, which "Realigns Brunswick to only move out the squadrons. Eliminations are based upon NAS Brunswick realigning to become a Naval Air Facility."

In deconstructing scenario DON-138B, Brunswick Task Force analysts discovered five cost-significant errors in the original DON analysis. This alternative scenario incorporates corrections to those errors, as follows:

1. Overstated Personnel Savings: DON based its case on the elimination of 403 personnel largely as the result of consolidating maintenance and support at a single base. However, DON incorrectly included 157 positions that are actually programmed nonBRAC changes due to transition from the maintenance-intensive P-3 to the contractor-maintained P-8 MMA. (See Screen Six for details.)
2. Overstated Facilities Shutdown: According to NASB Scenario Data Call DON-0138B, 126KSF of facilities shutdown is due to closure of AIMD. This should not be counted as a BRAC benefit because AIMD is a programmed shutdown due to the P-8 CLS program. (See Screen Five for details.)
3. Ignored Mission Costs: The COBRA Users Manual requires the user to "capture all known costs/savings incurred with the realignment action." The DON-138B scenario failed to capture the additional costs of meeting NAS Brunswick mission requirements with aircraft based in Florida, approximately 1,000 NM to the southwest.

This analysis corrects Activity Mission Costs by including an allowance for the additional costs of operating aircraft out of NAS Jacksonville due to the additional distances aircraft must fly to reach deployment sites, operational areas and exercise/training areas that are normally served out of NAS Brunswick. The total annual cost is \$5,381K based on a detailed analysis of mission costs including four 5-aircraft detachments annually. (See Screen Five for details.)

4. One-time Moving Costs have been corrected to include the cost of relocating Brunswick aircraft to Florida and an average cost of \$7,876 per flight hour. The total one-time cost of relocating all aircraft is estimated at \$2,569K. The DON analysis assumed these costs would be zero. (See Screen Five for details.)

COBRA REALIGNMENT SUMMARY REPORT (COBRA v6.10) - Page 2/2
 Data As Of 8/20/2005 1:02:12 AM, Report Created 8/20/2005 2:17:16 AM

Department : Navy
 Scenario File : C:\Documents and Settings\Home\My Documents\Scenarios 2\BNAS corrected Scenario 2.CBR
 Option Pkg Name: BNAS 138B Correction 2
 Std Fctrs File : C:\Documents and Settings\Home\My Documents\COBRA\BRAC2005.SFF

Costs in 2005 Constant Dollars (\$K)

	2006	2007	2008	2009	2010	2011	Total	Beyond
	----	----	----	----	----	----	-----	-----
MilCon	9,854	0	45,015	45,459	19,015	0	119,344	0
Person	21	45	12	5,537	11,284	14,048	30,947	12,943
Overhd	3,727	2,797	2,755	4,837	6,562	6,986	27,664	6,021
Moving	0	0	300	3,764	5,252	3,362	12,678	0
Missio	0	0	0	0	0	5,381	5,381	5,381
Other	0	0	125	1,037	2,110	3,118	6,390	2,518
TOTAL	13,602	2,842	48,207	60,635	44,223	32,894	202,404	26,864

Savings in 2005 Constant Dollars (\$K)

	2006	2007	2008	2009	2010	2011	Total	Beyond
	----	----	----	----	----	----	-----	-----
MilCon	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Person	141	692	1,214	8,126	16,547	29,817	56,536	37,807
Overhd	4	19	24	1,571	3,176	4,165	8,959	4,165
Moving	0	0	0	1,575	1,658	635	3,868	0
Missio	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Other	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
TOTAL	144	711	1,238	11,272	21,381	34,616	69,363	41,972