

COSÌ FAN TUTTE? A STUDY OF CHARACTER DEVELOPMENT THROUGH KEY
CHARACTERISTICS IN THE PRIMA DONNA AND SOUBRETTE ROLES
FROM FOUR OF W.A. MOZART'S LATE ITALIAN OPERAS

Meng-Jung Tsai, B.M., M.M.

Dissertation Prepared for the Degree of

DOCTOR OF MUSICAL ARTS

UNIVERSITY OF NORTH TEXAS

August 2020

APPROVED:

Stephen Morscheck, Major Professor
Stephen Dubberly, Committee Member
William Joyner, Committee Member
Hendrik Schulze, Committee Member
Molly Fillmore, Chair of the Division of Vocal
Studies
Felix Olschofka, Director of Graduate Studies
in the College of Music
John Richmond, Dean of the College of Music
Victor Prybutok, Dean of the Toulouse
Graduate School

Tsai, Meng-Jung. *Così Fan Tutte? A Study of Character Development through Key Characteristics in the Prima Donna and Soubrette Roles from Four of W.A. Mozart's Late Italian Operas*. Doctor of Musical Arts (Performance), August 2020, 196 pp., 18 tables, 1 appendix, bibliography, 81 titles.

This dissertation investigates how W. A. Mozart applies the concept of key characteristics—the affective properties of each tonality—as discussed by three of his contemporaries, Johann Mattheson, C.F.D. Schubart and G.J. Vogler, to four soubrette and four prima donna characters from four of his late Italian operas: La Contessa and Susanna in *Le nozze di Figaro*; Donna Anna and Zerlina in *Don Giovanni*; Fiordiligi and Despina in *Così fan tutte*; Vitellia and Servilia in *La clemenza di Tito*. The analytical method of this dissertation provides a hermeneutical tool to search for meanings in Mozart's music. The application compares the libretto text and its corresponding tonal center with the description of key characteristics on a micro level, to reveal significant dramatic and practical implications from Mozart's key usage in his operas.

Copyright 2020

By

Meng-Jung Tsai

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
LIST OF TABLES.....	v
CHAPTER 1. INTRODUCTION.....	1
1.1 Key Characteristics.....	3
1.2 Review of Literature: Primary Sources.....	10
1.3 Review of Literature: Secondary Sources.....	12
CHAPTER 2. METHODS.....	19
2.1 Character Background and Situational Synopsis.....	23
2.2 Textual and Tonal Analysis.....	24
2.3 Application.....	24
CHAPTER 3. THREE SELECTED KEY CHARACTERISTICS THEORISTS.....	28
3.1 Johann Mattheson.....	28
3.2 Mattheson’s <i>Das neu-eröffnete Orchestre</i>	30
3.3 Christian Friedrich Daniel Schubart.....	37
3.4 Schubart’s <i>Ideen zu einer Ästhetik der Tonkunst</i>	40
3.5 Georg Joseph Vogler.....	45
3.6 The Influence of G.J. Vogler, His Treatises and His Key Characteristics.....	50
CHAPTER 4. LA CONTESSA AND SUSANNA IN <i>LE NOZZE DI FIGARO</i>	58
4.1 La Contessa.....	58
4.1.1 Character Background.....	58
4.1.2 Dove sono i bei momenti.....	59
4.2 Susanna.....	71
4.2.1 Character Background.....	71
4.2.2 Deh vieni non tardar.....	73
CHAPTER 5. DONNA ANNA AND ZERLINA IN <i>DON GIOVANNI</i>	82
5.1 Donna Anna.....	83
5.1.1 Character Background.....	83
5.1.2 Non mi dir, bell’idol mio.....	85
5.2 Zerlina.....	99
5.2.1 Character Background.....	99
5.2.2 Batti, batti, o bel Masetto.....	100
CHAPTER 6. FIORDILIGI AND DESPINA IN <i>COSÌ FAN TUTTE</i>	109

6.1	Fiordiligi.....	110
6.1.1	Character Background	110
6.1.2	Come scoglio immoto resta	112
6.2	Despina	124
6.2.1	Character Background	124
6.2.2	In uomini! In soldati	126
CHAPTER 7. VITELLIA AND SERVILIA IN <i>LA CLEMENZA DI TITO</i>		135
7.1	Vitellia	136
7.1.1	Character Background	136
7.1.2	Non più di fiori vaghe catene.....	138
7.2	Servilia.....	153
7.2.1	Character Background	153
7.2.2	S’altro che lacrime	154
CHAPTER 8. INTEGRATION AND CONCLUSION.....		166
8.1	Integrations.....	167
8.1.1	Integration of the Arias and Their Keys	167
8.1.2	Examined Arias in F Major	169
8.1.3	Contrast of Three Selected Theorists	171
8.2	Conclusions	174
8.2.1	Key Characteristics in Mozart’s Operas	174
8.2.2	Practical Applications.....	177
8.2.3	The Scope of Application and Possibilities for Future Scholarship.....	179
APPENDIX: LIST OF KEY CHARACTERISTICS		182
BIBLIOGRAPHY		190

LIST OF TABLES

	Page
Table 2-1: Selected Operas and Roles	21
Table 2-2: Selected Roles and Arias	21
Table 2-3: Sample Textual and Tonal Analysis, Da Ponte and Mozart, <i>Le nozze di Figaro</i> , No. 28	25
Table 3-1: Johann Mattheson’s Key Characteristics List, 1713.....	34
Table 3-2: C.F.D. Schubart’s Key Characteristics List, 1806	43
Table 3-3: G.J. Vogler’s Key Characteristics List, 1779 & 1812’	54
Table 4-1: “E Susanna non vien! ... Dove sono i bei momenti” —Textual and Tonal Analysis, <i>Le Nozze di Figaro</i> , No. 20 Recitativo istrumentato ed Aria	61
Table 4-2: “Giunse alfin il momento... Deh vieni non tardar” —Textual and Tonal Analysis, <i>Le nozze di Figaro</i> , No. 28 Recitativo istrumentato ed Aria	75
Table 5-1: “Crudel? Ah no, mio bene! ... Non mi dir, bell’idol mio” —Textual and Tonal Analysis, <i>Don Giovanni</i> , No. 23 Recitativo accompagnato e Rondo.....	87
Table 5-2: “Ma se colpa io non ho! ... Batti, batti, o bel Masetto” —Textual and Tonal Analysis, <i>Don Giovanni</i> , No. 12. Aria.....	102
Table 6-1: “Temerari, ... Come scoglio immoto resta” —Textual and Tonal Analysis, <i>Così fan tutte</i> , No. 14 Aria.....	114
Table 6-2: “Via via, passerò i tempi ... In uomini! In soldati” —Textual and Tonal Analysis, <i>Così fan tutte</i> , No. 12 Aria	128
Table 7-1: “Ecco il punto, o Vitellia ... Non più di fiori vaghe catene” —Textual and Tonal Analysis, <i>La clemenza di Tito</i> , No. 22 Recitativo accompagnato & No. 23 Rondo	140
Table 7-2: “Andiam. Quell’infelice t’amò... S’altro che lacrime” —Textual and Tonal Analysis, <i>La clemenza di Tito</i> , No. 21 Aria	156
Table 8-1: Selected Arias from Repertoire of the Examined Characters and Their Keys	167
Table 8-2: Comparison—Arias in F Major with Their Key Characteristics	170
Table 8-3: F Major Arias Comparison—Context/Subtext/Onstage Listeners.....	170
Table 8-4: Contrast of the Selected Arias, Theorists and Their Key Descriptions	173

CHAPTER 1
INTRODUCTION

On the surface it seems as though Mozart and his librettists are poking fun at their female protagonists. The gender musicologist, Marcia Citron, argues that the title of Mozart's and Da Ponte's opera, *Così fan tutte*, or literally "All women do that," should be titled *Così fan TUTTI* ("Everybody does that").¹ It might be argued that examples of "misogynistic treatment"² can also be found in other operas of Mozart. In *Don Giovanni*, a bride is tempted on her wedding day. In *Le nozze di Figaro*, the Count intends to secretly reinstate the *droit du seigneur* with his wife's maid. However, the female protagonists in Mozart's operas are in fact strong characters that dominate the direction of the plot. If Mozart and Da Ponte were really misogynists, they would not leave a clear clue within Marcellina's text—"ogni donna è portata alla difesa del suo povero sesso, da questi uomini ingrati a torto oppresso."³ ("every woman will march to the defense of her own poor sex against ungrateful men who only seek wrongly to oppress it.")⁴ From another perspective, Mozart and Da Ponte establish their female characters with some strengths. As Cairns described, "The women, as so often in Mozart, are so much wiser and shrewder and more civilized than the men, and Susanna, who takes part in every ensemble, is of all of them the pearl."⁵ It is Susanna who wittingly schemes with the Countess

¹ Marcia J. Citron, *Gender and the Music Canon* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1993), 71.

² *Ibid.*

³ Lorenzo Da Ponte, Libretto of *Le nozze di Figaro: opera buffa in quattro atti = Die Hochzeit des Figaro: Opera buffa in vier Akten, KV 492* (Kassel: Bärenreiter-Verlag, 2012), 422.

⁴ Libretto and English Translation, "*Le nozze di Figaro: Libretto Translation (Italian-English)*," *DM's Opera Site*, handout received in meeting of Mozart Academy in class MUMH 6510: Temperament and Key Characteristics, Denton, March 23, 2016. http://www.murashev.com/opera/Le_nozze_di_Figaro_libretto_English.

⁵ David Cairns, *Mozart and His Operas* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2006), 123.

to save both of their marriages in *Le nozze di Figaro*. In *Don Giovanni* Donna Anna forcefully urges her fiancé to catch the dissolute criminal, and Zerlina, the simple peasant girl bride referenced above, understands how to make up for her indiscretion in a feminine but somehow very sophisticated way. In *Così fan tutte*, Fiordiligi remains faithful the longest, and Despina, who seems well versed in how to manipulate men, keeps the plot moving forward. In *La clemenza di Tito*, Princess Vitellia, whose rage brings the imperial capitol to turmoil, has the self-awareness to admit her mistake, while Servilia, who with beauty, virtue, and great courage reveals the truth of her love, and refuses the empress' throne.

Women in Mozart's operas do have a significant contribution to the dramatic flow. Luke Howard describes how Mozart and Da Ponte worked together to portray women:

In looking at Mozart's entire operatic oeuvre, it's clear that he didn't shy away from presenting strong female characters who are spirited, smart, morally grounded, and daring. From Konstanze (Abduction) to Susanna and the Countess (Figaro) and Pamina (Magic Flute), Mozart provides plenty of operatic evidence of the increasingly influential role strong women were playing in 18th-century society.⁶

A great variety of studies of Mozart's operas are available to performers and scholars. Studies analyzing musical forms, tonalities, drama and characters, society and historical views are common. This study, however, applies the usage of key characteristics in the Eighteenth Century as a doorway to discovering deeper realizations of the characters in Mozart's late Italian operas than the traditional methods described above alone provide. According to Robert Bott's "The Affect Effect: Key Characteristics in *Così fan tutte*," his research results demonstrate:

⁶ Luke Howard, "Così fan tutte lesson 2: Misogyny in Così," Utah Opera, 2015, accessed Oct 10, 2017, <http://www.utahopera.org/backstage/2015/02/cosi-fan-tutte-lesson-2-misogyny-in-cosi/>.

...that Mozart was consciously utilizing key characteristics throughout *Così fan tutte*.... For vocalists, familiarity with a key's purported affect provides insight into the dramatic meaning of scenes and individual numbers, and could be used to inform decisions related to a character's emotional portrayal.⁷

To do so, this research identifies the textual and tonal structure of the case studies and parallels them with the key descriptions line by line so that the affective flow in the aria by Mozart can be comprehensively understood. Opera singers and directors can interpret Mozart with more emotional connections. It also can benefit the singing instructor and the beginner with a practical knowledge of how to learn Mozart. A detailed application of the method is discussed in Chapter 2.

In this study, I examine one aria each, from eight of Mozart's leading roles, the Countess and Susanna in *Le nozze di Figaro*, Donna Anna and Zerlina in *Don Giovanni*, Fiordiligi and Despina in *Così fan tutte*, and Vitellia and Servilia in *La clemenza di Tito*. The analysis of these arias reveals how Mozart utilizes key characteristics, to provide in-depth character development and strength through his choices. Through this study contemporary singers will be provided with an additional stage director, so to speak, as they prepare a role or aria: Mozart himself.

1.1 Key Characteristics

The concept of key characteristics is based on the proposition that each of the tonalities is "able to provide particular moods to music,"⁸ with the belief that its usage can be traced back

⁷ Robert Bott, "The Affect Effect: Key Characteristics in *Così fan tutte*," *Harmonia* 14 (2015-2016): 38-39, accessed April 02, 2018, <http://mhete.music.unt.edu/sites/default/files/Harmonia%20Final%202015-16.pdf>.

⁸ Maho A. Ishiguro, "The Affective Properties of Keys in Instrumental Music from the Late Nineteenth and Early Twentieth Centuries" (master's thesis, University of Massachusetts Amherst, 2014), 1.

to the ancient Greek doctrine of ethos.⁹ With the development of the tempered scale, people may no longer pay as close attention to key qualities, as did the theorists and musicians in the eighteenth century. Rudolf Rasch states in his *Tuning and Temperament*:

Tuning and temperament theory was especially developed by eighteenth-century German authors. They used a variety of methods to describe a great number of tuning systems, both equal and unequal...¹⁰

During the eighteenth century, many music theorists advocated that an unequal temperament indeed underscored the difference between each key's characteristics. James Young also considers unequal tuning to be a major source of the affective properties of keys.¹¹ Young continues to point out that musicians who wish to reveal the thoughts from early composers must apply historical tunings.¹²

Besides temperament, there are still other factors that cause the differences of key characteristics. One of the major factors in the idea of key properties is the number of sharp and flat keys. Rita Steblin states, "This was the psychological association of ever-increasing strength and brightness (or, conversely, weakness and somberness) with the number of sharps and flats..."¹³ Such thought had already outspread in the early 18th century.¹⁴ In Mattheson's *Das neu-eröffnete Orchestre* (1713), he disapproved of "those people who believe that a piece

⁹ Rita Steblin, *A History of Key Characteristics in the Eighteen and Early Nineteenth Centuries* (Ann Arbor: UMI Research Press, 1983), 13.

¹⁰ Rudolf Rasch, "Tuning and Temperament," in: *The Cambridge History of Western Music Theory*, Edited by Thomas Christensen (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2002), 193-222.

¹¹ James O. Young, "Key, Temperament and Musical Expression," *The Journal of Aesthetics and Art Criticism* 49, no. 3 (1991): 235-42, accessed November 11, 2019. doi:10.2307/431477.

¹² Ibid.

¹³ Steblin, *A History of Key Characteristics in the Eighteenth and Early Nineteenth Centuries* (Rochester, NY: University of Rochester Press, 2002), 96.

¹⁴ Ibid.

in flats absolutely must sound soft and tender, while a piece in sharps must be hard, lively, and joyful.”¹⁵ Mattheson personally proclaimed that, by unequal temperament, “the pitch level (higher or lower)” and “a slight difference in the size of intervals” were the cause of the affective character of keys.¹⁶ As for the sharp-flat theory, in Steblin’s explanation, the belief in fact was associated with the idea of the early church modes’ transpositions—“the sharp with the major mode and the flat with the minor mode.”¹⁷ Kirnberger (1721-1783), Schubart and later Vogler (*Vergleichsplan*, 1812) were the advocates of the sharp-flat principle.¹⁸ Some theorists held the view for the variety of keys based on the acoustic properties of orchestral instruments,¹⁹ e.g., Vogler in 1779, who held the open-stopped string theory which affects the key expression.²⁰ He expressed in the *Deutsche Encyclopädie* (1779) that the open string (like D) has more vibrating sound, in which the sound effect is “brighter, fierier, more piercing and more impressive.”²¹

The development of the sharp-flat principle is based on the theory that C major is the purest key.²² Béthizy (1709-81), Rameau’s disciple, expounded that “The key of C major, which

¹⁵ Johann Mattheson, *Das neu-eröffnete Orchestre: oder, universelle und gründliche Anleitung, wie ein galant Homme einen vollkommenen Begriff von der Hoheit und Würde der edlen Music erlangen, seinen Gout darnach formieren, die Terminos technicos verstehen und geschicklich [sic] von dieser vortrefflichen Wissensehatt raisonniren Möge* (Hamburg: Bei B. Schillers Wittwe, 1713), 232-33, quoted in Steblin, 2002, 96.

¹⁶ Ishiguro, 24.

¹⁷ Steblin, 2002, 96.

¹⁸ Ishiguro, 29 & 32.

¹⁹ Ishiguro, 30.

²⁰ *Ibid.*, 31.

²¹ Georg Joseph Vogler, “Ausdruck, (musikalisch)” in *Deutsche Encyclopädie, oder Allgemeines Real-Wörterbuch aller Künste und Wissenschaften*, vol. 2 (Frankfurt-am-Main, 1779), 386, quoted in Steblin, 1983, 137.

²² Steblin, 2002, 98.

has neither sharps nor flats, is easy to perform.”²³ This theory has to be based on Kirnberger’s classification of keys.²⁴ Psychological distinctions then unfold from C major, as more sharps and flats are employed. Rameau described the concept of key qualities as follows:

Let us not forget that the expression of a sentiment and above all of a passion produces no effect without an alteration of the meter and a change of key. The moment of expression requires a new key; the grand art depends not only on the feelings of the composer, but also on the choice he must make between the sharp side or the flat side, relative to the degree of joy or sadness which is to be expressed.²⁵

Rameau’s sharp-flat philosophy, Steblin states, “became the overruling principle of nineteenth-century key associations.”²⁶

So, the sharp-flat principle, for example, anchoring from C major without any key signature, once shifted to one sharp—G major, carries a bright property. When twice shifted to two sharps (following the circle of fifths)—D major, the brightness intensifies. Conversely, shifting the key to one flat—F major, bears a calm quality; then to two flats—B-flat major adds on sad and somber feelings.²⁷ As more sharps or flats are added, the more intense the emotions grow, as explained in Vogler’s essay “Ausdruck” in the *Deutsche Encyclopädie* (1779).²⁸

According to Steblin, Werner Lüthy’s thesis (1931) investigated how the keys related to

²³ Jean Laurent de Béthizy, *Exposition de la théorie et de la pratique de la musique* (Paris: Michel Lambert, 1754), 22, quoted in Steblin, 2002, 98.

²⁴ Ishiguro, 29. Kirnberger’s key classes: The keys nearest to C major in the circle of fifths (e.g. C, G, D, F) are set in the purest class, and the furthest (B^b, C[#], D[#], G[#]) are assorted into the hardest. So that there will be three groups in either the major or the minor keys.

²⁵ Rameau, *Code de musique pratique* (Paris: Imprimerie royale, 1760), 170, quoted in Steblin, (Rochester, 2002), 97.

²⁶ Steblin, 2002, 97.

²⁷ Ishiguro, 28.

²⁸ Floyd K. Grave and Margaret G. Grave, *In Praise of Harmony: The Teachings of Abbé Georg Joseph Vogler* (Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1988), 42.

Mozart's music. He concluded that "The result of this undertaking speaks unambiguously for a characteristic use of keys in Mozart's music."²⁹ Steblin continues with Lüthy's summary:

E major belongs to elevated, other-worldly events, to scenes of high expectations, to the hazy shimmering of lightly rippling sea waves. We know A major as the key of joyful people, of heightened feeling to life, as the expression of beauty and brilliance, while D major includes in its domain festive pomp, military sharpness, revenge scenes, and grotesque and shallow Buffo-arias. The neutral keys of G, C and F are used predominantly by simple characters. C major, as the key of reality, frequently serves for testimonies of thanks and honour, for the dry collection of evidence, for zealous teachers and counsellors. Heart-felt feelings are made known in gentle B^b major and in touching E^b major; the latter is not only the key of profound love, but also of tormenting love-pangs. In A^b major there are nothing but gloomy scenes.³⁰

Lüthy considers using Mozart's vocal works (e.g., arias and lieder) to examine the composer's key choices. He describes how "Mozart almost always adheres closely to the text, which is clearly demonstrated by the many musical illustrations, and we can always infer the character of the music from the text."³¹ Lüthy goes on to say that his evaluation includes all of Mozart's arias and lieder, "if they are fully preserved, and are listed in their keys."³²

Lüthy compares or contrasts Mozart's vocal works with the key descriptions of C.F.D. Schubart in each key. In Lüthy's A major observation, he states that Mozart hardly shares the same view as Schubart to A major,³³ because for Mozart, Lüthy holds, the key depicts the increased attitude to life,³⁴ whereas for Schubart, A major is the declaration of innocent love,

²⁹ Werner Lüthy, *Mozart und Tonartencharakteristik* 3rd ed. (Baden-Baden, Germany: Verlag Valentin Koerner, 1974), 2, see also, 88, trans. Steblin, (Ann Arbor, 1983), 1.

³⁰ *Ibid.*, 1-2.

³¹ *Ibid.*, 41: "Mozart hält sich fast immer eng an den Text, was die vielen musikalischen Illustrationen unzweideutig beweisen, und stets können wir schon an Hand des Textes auf den Charakter der Musik schliessen."

³² *Ibid.*, 42: "In der folgenden Betrachtung sind sämtliche Arien und Lieder Mozarts – sofern sie vollkommen erhalten sind – nach ihrer Tonart aufgeführt."

³³ *Ibid.*, 45: "Diese Ansicht teilt Mozart kaum."

³⁴ *Ibid.*

satisfaction with one's state of affairs and so on.³⁵ Regarding D major, Lüthy states that the young composer and the poet are much in line.³⁶ In his annotation, Lüthy records that Mozart was probably aware of Mattheson's writings, and he notes that "the theoretical view of Mozart's comes closest to Mattheson's (Mattlinger, *Mozart Bekenntnisse und Lehren*)."³⁷

Not only did writers discuss the concept of key associations in the 18th and 19th-century, composers also regarded the key descriptions as a convention. Evidence can be found in Rita Steblin's study *A History of Key Characteristics in the Eighteenth and Early Nineteenth Centuries* and Paul Ellison's *The Key to Beethoven: Connecting Tonality and Meaning in His Music*.³⁸ Both treatises indicate that Bach and Beethoven did consider the meaning of keys when they composed.³⁹ According to Steblin, Bach's key implications match Johann Mattheson's 1713 list as stated in an article by Rudolf Wustmann in the *Bach-Jahrbuch* 1911.⁴⁰ In the opinion of Mattheson's 1713 description, "E major expresses very well a desperate or entirely deadly sadness; best used for extremely enamored, helplessness and hopelessness, and has in certain circumstances such a cutting, separating, suffering, and penetrating quality or characteristic that it can be compared with nothing but a fatal separation between body and soul."⁴¹

³⁵ Steblin, 2002, 118.

³⁶ Ibid., 48: "Diese Anschauung deckt sich ziemlich mit der Mozarts."

³⁷ Ibid., 40 n.2: "Mozart kannte wahrscheinlich Matthesons Schriften. Mattlinger sagt (*Mozart Bekenntnisse und Lehren*, S. 7), dass die theoretische Auffassung Mozarts der Matthesons am nächsten komme."

³⁸ Paul M. Ellison, *The Key to Beethoven: Connecting Tonality and Meaning in His Music* (Hillsdale: Pendragon Press, 2014).

³⁹ Steblin, 1983, 2-9.

⁴⁰ Steblin, 1983, 3.

⁴¹ Johann Mattheson, *Das neu-eröffnete Orchestre*, 1713, (handouts trans. Hendrick Schulze, unpublished, presented in class MUMH 6510: Performance Practice – Tuning Systems and Key Characteristics, University of North Texas, Denton, March 07, 2016).

Wustmann proves Bach uses E major in the Cantata “Liebster Gott, wann werd ich sterben?,” BWV 8, to ask “Dearest God, when will I die? ...”

Beethoven, likewise, was keen on discussing the use of tonal coloring with his contemporary musicians, as described by Anton F. Schindler,⁴² Beethoven’s literary secretary. Schindler mentions a few times how Beethoven, or Mozart, employed “various keys according to their specific psychological qualities.”⁴³ Schindler particularly relates that in Beethoven’s “limited personal library”⁴⁴ he had the book, *Ideen zu einer Ästhetik der Tonkunst*, written by Schubart, of which Beethoven “recommended its careful study to those already far advanced in their musical training.”⁴⁵ Beethoven strongly opposed transposing a piece, the musical setting the composer chose, for this may destroy the original key meaning of the piece. Rita Steblin states, “the cause of key characteristics happened from the unequal tuning systems of keyboard instruments in most of the understandings from 18th-century.”⁴⁶ Therefore, a soprano who wishes to lower the key of the Queen of Night or Constanze arias may cause a completely different meaning than the composer intended. In the early nineteenth century, during Beethoven’s period, sensitive musicians and composers with a belief in key qualities would have fought against the practice of transposition. Among them, the most intense attack against key transposing came from Beethoven,⁴⁷ which Schindler also stated in his *Biographie*:

⁴² Anton Schindler, *Beethoven As I Knew Him: A Biography*, ed. Donald W. MacArdle (Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 1966), 367.

⁴³ Schindler, 367.

⁴⁴ Schindler, 366.

⁴⁵ Schindler, 367.

⁴⁶ Steblin, 1983, 135.

⁴⁷ *Ibid.*, 145.

If anyone had dared to play even a little song of his in another key in his presence, the malefactor would soon have regretted his mistake. [Beethoven] was incensed when he heard this or that number from a Mozart opera performed in a key other than its original one.⁴⁸

Thus, understanding the aesthetic ideas about key characterizations from contemporaries, including Mattheson, Schubart, Vogler, etc. is the essential for understanding the meaning lying underneath the compositions by Bach, Beethoven, and Mozart.

1.2 Review of Literature: Primary Sources

These ideas about key descriptions can be traced back to ancient Greek philosophy.⁴⁹ The Greeks link the name of music modes, e.g. Dorian or Phrygian, to their ethical character. After the tonal major-minor system developed from modal harmony, the first treatise discussing key characteristics in France was Jean Rousseau's *Méthode claire* in 1691.⁵⁰ In Germany, *Das neu-eröffnete Orchestre* (1713) by Johann Mattheson is "the earliest, as well as most extensive discussion of key characteristics."⁵¹ Since then, debates and treatises of key characteristics became popular throughout European countries in the 18th century till the early 19th century.⁵² Steblin's research on these essays, previously mentioned above, offers the important resource of key descriptions to this dissertation. It provides detailed explanations of the history of key characteristics, but it does not discuss Mozart's key choices, or account for its relevance to role development design in Mozart's operas.

⁴⁸ Schindler, 369.

⁴⁹ Steblin, 1983, 19.

⁵⁰ Ibid., 31.

⁵¹ Ibid., 43.

⁵² Ibid., 3-4.

In order to realize the affective development in Mozart's operas, this study adopts the key quality lists from three German theorists: the 1713 treatise *Das neu-eröffnete Orchestre* by Johann Mattheson;⁵³ G.J. Vogler's "Ausdruck" from the *Deutsche Encyclopädie* (1779);⁵⁴ *Ideen zu einer Ästhetik der Tonkunst* (1784) by C.F.D. Schubart;⁵⁵ and also G.J. Vogler's "Vergleichsplan der Neumünsterorgel" (1812).⁵⁶ This evidence presents the direct view about the affective properties of keys from Mozart's time. These ideas offer key associations with different emotions, which is the primary literature group of this research. More information on Vogler's key descriptions are found in Grave and Grave's Chapter Five: Music and Drama from *In Praise of Harmony: The Teachings of Abbé Georg Joseph Vogler*.⁵⁷ The evidence provides slightly more of Vogler's key explanations when the theorist/composer introduced his key usage. These statements are integrated and included in Vogler's chart in this research. A detailed introduction of the three German theorists and their opinions of keys is provided in Chapter 3.

The last group of primary sources are the operas themselves. The music and its libretti serve as a major part of the main resource, and can be acquired from libraries, music stores, and online. This dissertation focuses on and employs the music edition, *Neue Mozart-Ausgabe*,

⁵³ Johann Mattheson, *Das neu-eröffnete Orchestre*, trans. Hendrick Schulze (Hamburg: Schiller, 1713), 236-51.

⁵⁴ Georg Joseph Vogler, "Ausdruck, (musikalisch)" in *Deutsche Encyclopädie, oder Allgemeines Real-Wörterbuch aller Künste und Wissenschaften*, vol. 2 (Frankfurt-am-Main: Varrentrapp und Wenner, 1779), 386, quoted in Steblin, 121-22.

⁵⁵ Christian Friedrich Daniel Schubart, *Ideen zu einer Ästhetik der Tonkunst*, ed. Ludwig Schubart (Vienna: Degen, 1806), ed. P.A. Merbach (Leipzig: Wolkenwanderer-Verlag, 1924), 261-65, quoted in Steblin, 115-19.

⁵⁶ Georg Joseph Vogler, "Vergleichsplan der umgeschaffenen Neumünsterorgel in Würzburg," 1812, The quoted in Steblin, 1983, 122-23, and David James Britton, "Abbé Georg Joseph Vogler: His Life, and His Theories on Organ Design" (D.M.A. thesis, University of Rochester, Eastman, 1973), 95-96.

⁵⁷ Grave and Grave, 178-226.

published by Bärenreiter Urtext.⁵⁸ Wolfgang Rehm, one of the chief editors, writes that “The NMA (*Neue Mozart Ausgabe*) aims to be a historical-critical edition and to offer as such the latest state of philological-musicological procedure as well as practical knowledge (particularly with regard to performance) of Mozart's creative production.”⁵⁹ The Italian libretti respectively are three *opere buffe* by Lorenzo da Ponte, and one opera seria by Caterino Mazzolà, after Pietro Metastasio. The English translations used in the case studies are by Dmitry Murashev from *DM's opera site*,⁶⁰ and also from the website *Opera Folio*.⁶¹ In addition, some opera scores provide practical libretti translations. For example, *Tito's* libretto, published by International Music Company, has a translation in English by Humphrey Procter-Gregg⁶² offering helpful language interpretation. The texts play a significant role in this dissertation, because the words reveal the expression and thoughts of a character. Textual analysis of hermeneutics is employed as the method in this dissertation.

1.3 Review of Literature: Secondary Sources

Mozart must have been aware of these treatises regarding key affects, whether from

⁵⁸ W. A. Mozart, and Lorenzo Da Ponte, *Le nozze di Figaro*, ed., Ludwig Finscher (2001; 15th repr., Kassel: Bärenreiter-Verlag, 2012); *Il dissoluto punito, ossia il Don Giovanni*, eds., Wolfgang Plath and Wolfgang Rehm (2005; 3rd repr., Kassel: Bärenreiter-Verlag, 2010); *Così fan tutte, ossia La scuola degli amanti*, eds., Faye Ferguson and Wolfgang Rehm (2006; 5th repr., Kassel: Bärenreiter-Verlag, 2016); Mozart, and Caterino Mazzolà, after Pietro Metastasio, *La clemenza di Tito*, ed., Franz Giegling (2001; 6th repr., Kassel: Bärenreiter-Verlag, 2017).

⁵⁹ Wolfgang Rehm, "Collected Editions," in H. C. Robbins Landon, ed., *The Mozart Compendium: A Guide to Mozart's Life and Music*. NY: Schirmer Books, 1990, 427.

⁶⁰ Dmitry Murashev, libretti translation (Italian-English): “Le nozze di Figaro,” “Don Giovanni,” “Così fan tutte, ossia La scuola degli amanti,” “La clemenza di Tito,” *DM's opera site – libretti & information*, accessed March 9, 2016, http://www.murashev.com/opera/Wolfgang_Amadeus_Mozart.

⁶¹ “Opera Folio Wolfgang Amadeus Mozart,” *Opera Folio*, accessed February 10, 2019, http://www.operafolio.com/composer.asp?n=Wolfgang_Amadeus_Mozart.

⁶² W. A. Mozart, Caterino Mazzolà, and Pietro Metastasio, *Titus = La clemenza di Tito*, libretto trans. Humphrey Procter-Gregg, piano reduc. Julius Rietz (New York City: International Music, 1982), VI-XXVI.

French Baroque theorists or German scholars of his generation. Nonetheless, sources that directly embody how his compositions relate to key affects and emotions are rare. Scattered evidence can only be obtained from biographies and some specialized research about Mozart and Beethoven. These sources include Hermann Abert's *W.A. Mozart* (1923-4),⁶³ Werner Lüthy's *Mozart und die Tonartencharakteristik* (1931),⁶⁴ Alfred Einstein's *Mozart: His Character, His Work* (1945), Anton Schindler's *Beethoven As I Knew Him: A Biographie* (1860),⁶⁵ and Paul Ellison's *The Key to Beethoven: Connecting Tonality and Meaning in His Music* (2014).⁶⁶ The information from this group provides the views of Mozart, Mozart's father, Leopold Mozart, and Beethoven regarding those key aesthetics theorists such as Mattheson, Schubart, and Vogler, and vice versa, as well as Beethoven's opinions about Mozart's compositions and his key arrangements. In Schindler's *Biographie*, he demonstrated Beethoven's great admiration of Mozart's choice of keys in *Die Zauberflöte*.⁶⁷ It shows that Mozart clearly understood key associations, and comprehensively applied key meanings into his compositions. However, Schindler's *Biographie* mainly examines musical intentions of Beethoven and his ideas about keys, but it does not discuss those of Mozart.

From the list above, Werner Lüthy's *Mozart und die Tonartencharakteristik* (1931) needs to be discussed. Although Lüthy examines all of Mozart's vocal works with their key affects, there are still some issues within his evaluation. Steblin's opinions on earlier sources of key

⁶³ Hermann Abert, Stewart Spencer, and Cliff Eisen, *W.A. Mozart* (New Haven [Conn.]: Yale University Press, 2007).

⁶⁴ Werner Lüthy.

⁶⁵ Schindler.

⁶⁶ Paul M. Ellison, *The Key to Beethoven: Connecting Tonality and Meaning in His Music* (Hillsdale: Pendragon Press, 2014).

⁶⁷ Schindler, 367.

characteristics reflect:

The history of key characteristics has not yet been dealt with in any detail. Valuable references to earlier source materials appear in the studies by Stephani, Lüthy, and Isler, but the discussion is brief and serves only as introductory background.⁶⁸

She mentions that Lüthy, in his remarks about Johann J. W. Heinse (1746-1803), concurred with his contemporary, C.F.D. Schubart, about the opinions of key characters. Nonetheless, Lüthy does not include any of Heinse's key descriptions in his thesis.⁶⁹ Lüthy also considers that Mozart's choice of key is not related to psychological connection. He states, "In many cases Mozart's key was certainly not determined by psychological association, but it was the convention that gave him the choice of this or that key."⁷⁰ The convention that Lüthy means here, is Mattheson's descriptions of key properties. Regarding Mozart's key usage, a detailed analysis is discussed later in Chapters 4, 5, 6, and 7).

A few other documents discuss the subject related to Mozart and key concepts. As previously mentioned, Bott's "The Affect Effect: Key Characteristics in *Così fan tutte*" is the only relevant one that can be found in which the analysis demonstrates that "Mozart was consciously utilizing key characteristics throughout *Così fan tutte*."⁷¹ In Bott's research, he offers verification of Mozart's choice of keys, and indicates the reason why he included descriptions of key explanations of five German-speaking theorists. Bott states:

In order to determine if Mozart was intentionally choosing these keys based on their purported affect, I created a rubric that incorporated descriptions of key characteristics

⁶⁸ Steblin, 1983, 9.

⁶⁹ Ibid.

⁷⁰ Lüthy, 40: "In vielen Fällen wurde bei Mozart die Tonart sicherlich nicht durch psychologische Assoziation bestimmt, sondern es war die Konvention, die ihn diese oder jene Tonart zu wählen gebot."

⁷¹ Bott, 38.

as put forth by five German-speaking theorists. Four of these theorists were contemporaries of Mozart, and their dates of publication situate their work within the same artistic *milieu*: G.J. Vogler, J.J. Ribock, C.F.D. Schubart, and G.C. Kellner. For a perspective on older traditions, I opted to include key characteristics from the 1713 treatise *Das neu-eröffnete Orchestre* by Johann Mattheson, an influential theorist who was “especially interested in the way modern key affects related to modal affects.”⁷²

In Bott’s research, he provides evidence that Mozart likely utilized key meanings with such lists in mind. However, Bott’s research only discusses the key choices of Mozart’s *Così fan tutte*, and not of other Mozart’s operas or developments of any characters in his operas.

Some other documents discuss the topic of Mozart’s tonality structure within his operatic compositions, e.g. John Sibbons’ “Tonality Structure and Key Changes in Idamante’s 3rd Act Aria in Mozart’s Opera ‘*Idomeneo*’ K. 366,”⁷³ in which the author only considers key changes and tonality within the aria. John Platoff is one music historian in particular who concentrates on this subject, and his research indeed provides significant direction for this dissertation. Platoff’s two essays “Tonal Organization in the Opera Buffa of Mozart’s Time”⁷⁴ and “Myths and Realities about Tonal Planning in Mozart’s Operas”⁷⁵ examine the assumption of whether or not Mozart’s operas are framed in a “progression in tonic keys” between successive numbers.⁷⁶ According to Platoff’s “Myths and Realities,” 20th-century scholars hypothesize that Mozart’s operas are “highly tonal planned” compositions—“that is, a network

⁷² Bott, 28-29.

⁷³ John Sibbons, “Tonality Structure and Key Changes in Idamante’s 3rd Act Aria in Mozart’s Opera ‘*Idomeneo*’ K. 366,” *Mozart-Jahrbuch ... des Zentralinstitutes für Mozartforschung der Internationalen Stiftung Mozarteum Salzburg*, Vol.1980/83: 399-408, accessed March 20, 2016, <http://digibib.mozarteum.at/ismretroverbund/periodical/titleinfo/1274932>.

⁷⁴ John Platoff, “Tonal Organization in the *Opera Buffa* of Mozart’s Time,” in: *Mozart Studies 2*, edited by Cliff Eisen (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1997), 139-173.

⁷⁵ John Platoff, “Myths and Realities about Tonal Planning in Mozart’s Operas,” *Cambridge Opera Journal 8*, no. 1 (March 1996): 3, accessed February 18, 2016, <http://www.jstor.org/stable/823699>.

⁷⁶ Platoff, “Tonal Organization,” 1997, 139.

of relationships among the tonic keys of separate numbers of an opera—contributing significantly to structure and meaning.”⁷⁷ At the end of the article “Myths and Realities,” Platoff challenges the assumption of “high-level tonal planning” in Mozart’s operas as “... a dead issue.”⁷⁸ For example, in footnote no. 33 he explains the tonality of the beginning five numbers of *Così fan tutte* which stimulated this dissertation. Platoff describes:

Conversely the first five numbers of *Così fan tutte* are related by descending thirds (G-E-C-A-f), though the first three are a discrete scene for the men, the fourth is a duet for the sisters alone following a change of location, and the fifth marks the beginning of the intrigue with Don Alfonso’s false report that the men have been called away to the army.⁷⁹

Whether it is tonal planning, or not, using Schubart’s descriptions relative to the descending thirds (G-E-C-A-f) in fact confirms the meaning of *Così*’s texts and the dramatic flow. These five numbers match five of Schubart’s key descriptions, and match three of Vogler’s. Taking Schubart’s key meanings⁸⁰ as examples, G major’s ‘satisfied passion’ describes the two lovers considering the beauty and the faith of their ladies; E major’s ‘laughing pleasure and not yet complete’ corresponds to Don Alfonso’s suspicion of women; C major describes ‘pure, innocent, children’s talk’ for Ferrando and Guglielmo’s love for their girls; A major has meanings of ‘satisfaction with one’s state of affairs, hope in seeing one’s beloved again when parting’ portraying the sisters’ desire for their handsome beloved; F minor’s ‘deep depression, funereal lament, groans of misery’ presents Don Alfonso’s false play. Mozart’s choice of keys corresponds well with the plot and the idea of his contemporary aesthetics.

⁷⁷ Platoff, “Myths and Realities,” 3.

⁷⁸ Platoff, “Myths and Realities,” 14.

⁷⁹ Platoff, “Myths and Realities,” 14, n. 33.

⁸⁰ Steblin, 2002, 121-124.

In spite of the main argument from Platoff regarding the topic of tonal planning, he does provide some evidence of Mozart's consideration of key choices with each number "on its own term: the key appropriate to its character and affect..."⁸¹ In the essay "Tonal Organization in Opera Buffa," Platoff describes how Viennese opera composers of Mozart's time regarded key associations as the basic convention to create specific figures, affects, and dramatic settings. He cites from "Constructing *Le nozze di Figaro*"⁸² where Daniel Hertz writes that Antonio Salieri once expressed that, "I [he] decided first on the key appropriate to the character of each lyric number."⁸³ He also briefly explains the distinctions of some keys. For instance, D major is brighter, because it is the key of the trumpet and the drum, so that composers utilize the feature for noble and martial character, especially for male characters, like the Count and Bartolo in *Figaro*, as well as Giovanni and Leporello in *Don Giovanni*.⁸⁴ As for noble or regal female characters, e.g., the Countess in *Figaro*, and Fiordiligi in *Così*, arias in B^b major provide more serious and dignified sentiments in a formal style.⁸⁵ The examples from Platoff's essay provide sufficient proof for how Mozart designs his opera characters with tonic key meanings. Since he focuses on the progression of tonic keys, rather than requiring understanding of the affects of keys, this dissertation provides a thorough and comprehensive understanding of key descriptions of Mozart's time and how that understanding influences the composer in his tonal choices at the macro as well as the micro level.

⁸¹ Platoff, "Tonal Organization," 1997, 169.

⁸² Daniel Hertz, "Constructing *Le nozze di Figaro*," *Journal of the Royal Association*, 112 (1987), 77-98; repr. in id., *Mozart's Operas*, 133-155.

⁸³ Platoff, "Tonal Organization," 1997, 149.

⁸⁴ Ibid., 153.

⁸⁵ Ibid., 153-154.

Most recently, in 2018, Emily Hagen published a dissertation in which she discusses connections between textual and musical meanings of emotions. Hagen refers to evidence of Aristotelian philosophy found in *Seicento*⁸⁶ sources which contain discussions about emotions in Venetian society during this period. She describes “...writings that would have been available to opera creators and performers that could have influenced their ideas about affect, including how emotions work, how people express emotions externally, or how to successfully depict emotions in art (visual, textual, musical, or dramatic).”⁸⁷ Her study mainly focuses on Venetian operas in the 17th-century, and although she does not discuss Mozart’s operas, or character development, Hagen’s examination offers a detailed approach, and her methodology of the textual analysis is adopted in this particular study. By following Hagen’s methodology of understanding affect, this study can disclose “more nuanced”⁸⁸ information of the development of emotions in Mozart’s arias or in characters in Mozart’s operas.

While numerous papers and books offer guidance for singers preparing a role in an opera, and treatises and dissertations discuss key characteristics, none of the research analyzing key characteristics relates to the characters in Mozart’s operas. Through the adjusted methodology for realizing both key and affect, performers and directors will be able to perceive subtle details which Mozart suggests.

⁸⁶ The “Seicento” means Italian culture and history happening in the 17th century. Literally the word *seicento* is “six hundred”; *sei* is six, and *cento* is hundred. It is shortened from *milleseicento*, 1600.

⁸⁷ Emily Hagen, “Depicting Affect through Text, Music, and Gesture in Venetian Opera, C. 1640-1658” (PhD diss., University of North Texas, 2018), 8, accessed April 10, 2018, <https://digital.library.unt.edu/ark:/67531/metadc1157551/>.

⁸⁸ *Ibid.*, 7.

CHAPTER 2

METHODS

In order to comprehend how Mozart depicts characters with key selection, this study first furnishes a background of each protagonist and a synopsis of the situation preceding the music selection to be discussed. Then this study adopts Hagen's four-phased analytical method.⁸⁹ In my dissertation, the method is modified into five phases: 1) selection of case studies; 2) selecting key characteristics theorists; 3) textual analysis; 4) tonal analysis; 5) key characteristics comparison between the theorists' descriptions to render conclusions.

As Brigid Brophy claims, the female voice, especially the soprano, "exerts the most vivid pressure on our imagination."⁹⁰ She explains that opera is an innovation "not exclusively for, but round the soprano."⁹¹ Brophy demonstrates:

Our attention goes as naturally and immediately to the part sung by the soprano as it does to the first violins when we listen to an orchestra or look at an orchestral score; if the composer wants us to pay more heed to some other part, he must pick it out and force it on our notice. And then the soprano, having captured our ear in the first place, has the best qualifications for holding it, either because the soprano really is the most flexible voice or because our ear is more sensitive to subtlety and variety couched in its register.⁹²

Because our ears naturally receive the register of the soprano, Brophy writes, "Dramatic attention was focused where the ear naturally leads it, namely on the register which among adults, if nature is left untampered-with, belongs exclusively to women."⁹³ The dramatic

⁸⁹ Hagen's method comprises four phrases: 1) selection of case studies; 2) textual analysis; 3) musical analysis; and 4) subsequent comparison with other case studies. Hagen, "Depicting Affect through Text,"

⁹⁰ Brigid Brophy, *Mozart the Dramatist* (London: Faber and Faber, 1964), 35.

⁹¹ *Ibid.*

⁹² *Ibid.*

⁹³ *Ibid.*, 36.

attention she mentions above about the soprano, as previously mentioned in Chapter 1 regarding the women characters, shows the female protagonists in Mozart's operas act as a strong force that affects the plot's flow, e.g., Susanna in *Le nozze di Figaro*, or Despina in *Così fan tutte*. Brophy also interprets how Mozart musically discriminates between the characters of a soprano and a tenor, or a mezzo-soprano. According to Brophy:

Even the great tenors have none of the soprano's power, which Mozart so tenderly exploits, to move us by the gravity and density of what are, for her, low notes. In *Così Fan Tutte*, Mozart musically distinguishes Fiordiligi's character from her sister's largely by virtue of the astonishing low notes which play so heroic a part in her big arias – particularly, of course, in 'Come scoglio'; and this despite the fact that it is Dorabella who is technically the mezzo-soprano. Fiordiligi, in fact, has the greater compass: in music as in personality.⁹⁴

Due to the reasons above, this research targets two specific soprano types found in Mozart's operas, the prima donna and soubrette. I selected the two soprano roles from the last four Italian operas by Mozart in the first phase of analysis (see Table 2-1). Mozart wrote the last four Italian operas during the last six years of his life, 1786-1791. These four Italian operas prove Mozart's maturity in both opera seria and buffa with "the richness of his innovation,"⁹⁵ and from *Le nozze di Figaro* onwards Mozart successfully presents himself as a music dramatist.⁹⁶ I have chosen the soprano protagonists from these operas to be the case studies for the following reasons: each opera has a distinguished prima donna and a vividly characterized soubrette; each soprano has two remarkable arias (only Servilia has one aria); each aria is in the primary repertoire of sopranos.

⁹⁴ Brophy, 37.

⁹⁵ Nicholas Kenyon, *The Pegasus Pocket Guide to Mozart* (New York: Pegasus Book, 2006), 283-285, accessed October 8, 2019, <https://archive.org/details/pegasuspocketgui0000keny>

⁹⁶ Abert, 717, 735, 1230.

Table 2-1: Selected Operas and Roles

Title	Year Composed	Librettist	Genre	Prima Donna	Soubrette
<i>Le nozze di Figaro</i>	1786	Lorenzo Da Ponte	Opera buffa	La Contessa di Almaviva	Susanna
<i>Don Giovanni</i>	1787	Lorenzo Da Ponte	Opera buffa	Donna Anna	Zerlina
<i>Così fan tutte</i>	1790	Lorenzo Da Ponte	Opera buffa	Fiordiligi	Despina
<i>La clemenza di Tito</i>	1791	Caterino Mazzolà after Pietro Metastasio	Opera seria	Vitellia	Servilia

From the eight protagonists, there are fifteen arias in total, and only five arias have their own *recitativo instrumentato* or *recitativo accompagnato*. I selected one aria from each protagonist which in my view contains more sincerity, and it is closer to the character's true personality and her genuine intensions. To prevent a hasty conclusion merely from arias, I then considered including the preceding recitative section of the selected arias as a part of the case study (see Table 2-2).

Table 2-2: Selected Roles and Arias

Opera	Role	Preceding Recitative	Aria
<i>Le nozze di Figaro</i>	La Contessa	E Susanna non vien!	Dove sono i bel momenti
	Susanna	Giunse alfin il momento	Deh vieni non tardar
<i>Don Giovanni</i>	Donna Anna	Crudel! –Ah no, mio bene!	Non mi dir, bell'idol mio
	Zerlina	Ma se colpa io non ho!	Batti, batti, o bel Masetto
<i>Così fan tutte</i>	Fiordiligi	Temerari...	Come scoglio immoto resta
	Despina	Via via, passaro i tempi...	In uomini! In soldati
<i>La clemenza di Tito</i>	Vitellia	Ecco il punto, oh Vitellia	Non più di fiori vaghe catene
	Servilia	Andiam. Quell'infelice...	S'altro che lacrime

Next, I selected three German-speaking theorists and adopted their descriptions of key characteristics for analysis. Two of the theorists, C.F.D. Schubart and G.J. Vogler, were from the period of Mozart's time, and "their dates of publication situate their work within the same

artistic *milieu*.”⁹⁷ Those works are: “Ausdruck” in *Deutsche Encyclopädie* (1779)⁹⁸ by G.J. Vogler, and *Ideen zu einer Ästhetik der Tonkunst* (1784)⁹⁹ by C.F.D. Schubart. G.J. Vogler later commented on key affects again in his “Vergleichsplan der Neumünsterorgel” (1812),¹⁰⁰ which I included for analysis as well. As for a possibility of German convention, I included the descriptions of key characteristics from Johann Mattheson’s treatise *Das neu-eröffnete Orchestre* (1713),¹⁰¹ since his theory was “already current in the early eighteenth century”¹⁰² and has been “regarded with special interest up to the present day.”¹⁰³ Mattheson had quite an influence on the way “modern key affects related to modal affects.”¹⁰⁴ A thorough introduction and discussion of the selected theorists and descriptions of key meanings for each is presented in Chapter 3.

After choosing the case studies and suitable theorists, the textual and tonal analysis proceeds. Hermeneutic textual analysis has to be employed. In her Methods Chapter, Hagen states:

To respect the fluidity of affect and its potential to shift on a line-by-line level within sections of recitative and aria style in this repertoire, traditional hermeneutic and musical analysis had to be applied so as to account for affective expression not at the

⁹⁷ Bott, 28.

⁹⁸ Georg Joseph Vogler, “Ausdruck, (musikalisch)” in *Deutsche Encyclopädie, oder Allgemeines Real-Wörterbuch aller Künste und Wissenschaften*, vol. 2 (Frankfurt-am-Main: Varrentrapp und Wenner, 1779), 386, quoted in Steblin, 1983, 121-22.

⁹⁹ Christian Friedrich Daniel Schubart, *Ideen zu einer Ästhetik der Tonkunst*, ed. Ludwig Schubart (Vienna: Degan, 1806), ed. P.A. Merbach (Leipzig: Wolkenwanderer-Verlag, 1924) 261-65, quoted in Steblin, 115-119.

¹⁰⁰ Georg Joseph Vogler, “Vergleichsplan der Neumünsterorgel” of 1812, quoted in Steblin, 1983, 122-24.

¹⁰¹ Mattheson, *Das neu-eröffnete Orchestre*, 1713, (handouts trans. Hendrick Schulze, presented in class MUMH 6510: Performance Practice).

¹⁰² Steblin, 2002, 96.

¹⁰³ Steblin, 1983, 56.

¹⁰⁴ *Ibid.*, 43.

level of the large semantic unit of the recitative section or aria, but rather the smaller, local units of action and emotion that change quickly within section.¹⁰⁵

With a detailed line-by-line analysis, accuracy of subtle emotion shifts can be carefully evaluated. This study uses the original text and its literal and poetic translations, which describes the actions of the character and their state of mind. Then, I compare the affective expressions of the same tonal units to the key descriptions between each chosen theorist, so that the contrast of the meaning will emerge. Finally, the key characteristics prescribed by Mattheson, Schubart, and Vogler, all contemporaries of Mozart, provide a perspective on character development for these leading heroines that is deeper than what is usually found in current sources.

To serve as an example of the detailed analytical steps used in the method, a partial demonstration of a case study, Susanna's Recitative and Aria No. 28, "Giunse alfin il momento... Deh, vieni non tardar" is provided here. The result makes this scene an excellent example. In this scene, the key descriptions from three theorists are all applicable because Susanna is dressing up as the Countess. The example below is a shorter demonstration of a portion of the recitative and aria of No. 28. A preceding character introduction and the contextual synopsis are presented as well.

2.1 Character Background and Situational Synopsis

Joachim Kaiser, in his book *Who's Who in Mozart's Operas*, describes Susanna as clever, supple, and loving.¹⁰⁶ At this point in the drama, the final act, she arrives with the Countess to

¹⁰⁵ Hagen, 25.

¹⁰⁶ Joachim Kaiser, *Who's Who in Mozart's Operas-From Alfonso to Zerlina*, Tr. Charles Kessler (New York: Schirmer Books, 1987), 170.

the garden of the castle. It is evening and chilly. They have exchanged an article of clothing or two, perhaps a hooded cloak, in order to disguise themselves as each other. They are met by Marcellina who informs them that Figaro is nearby, that he has learned of the note Susanna sent to the Count, and that he is filled with jealousy. Marcellina and the Countess leave the scene and Susanna whispers under her breath, speaking of Figaro, “The rascal is eavesdropping. We’ll have some fun too, and pay him back for his suspicions.”¹⁰⁷

2.2 Textual and Tonal Analysis

Being aware of Figaro nearby, Susanna reacts in a solo recitativo strumentato followed by an aria that carries multiple complex thoughts, actions, and emotions. Mozart explicitly divided these actions, or shifting thoughts, by complete modulation or just tonal color shifts. Having discovered these changes of tonal centers and actions/thoughts, I projected the character’s affects and compared them with the key descriptions (see Table 2-3).

2.3 Application

Susanna calls her lover to come, “... where love calls you to enjoyment..., to the pleasures of love ..., to crown his forehead with roses.” Figaro, due to his having misunderstood the note Susanna sent to the Count, thinks this love serenade is directed toward the Count. In fact, Susanna takes advantage of the moment, teasing Figaro with her sensuous words, intending to make him even more jealous.

¹⁰⁷ Lorenzo Da Ponte, “*Le nozze di Figaro*: Libretto Translation (Italian-English),” *DM’s Opera Site*, handout received in meeting of Mozart Academy in class MUMH 6510: Temperament and Key Characteristics, Denton, March 23, 2016. http://www.murashev.com/opera/Le_nozze_di_Figaro_libretto_English.

Table 2-3: Sample Textual and Tonal Analysis, Da Ponte and Mozart, *Le nozze di Figaro*, No.28¹⁰⁸

Text	Translation	Action	Affect	Tonal Color	Key Descriptions ¹⁰⁹
Giunse alfin il momento che godrò senz'affanno in braccio all'idol mio.	At last arrived at the moment that I will without reservation in the arms of lover mine (be).	declaring intention	excited, relieved	C Major	Matt: ... a character of rude and insolent... where else one lets one's joy come forth without inhibition... something charming and sometimes tender moments.
					Schu: ...completely pure, innocence, simplicity, naivety, children's talk.
					Vog: ... the key fit for a painting, for pure water arias, pure subjects... A majestic key, full of gravity... charm, splendid.
Timide cure, uscite dal mio petto, a turbar non venite il mio diletto!	Timid care, be banished from my heart, and come not to disturb my joy.	telling herself not to worry	calm, soothed	A Minor	Matt: ... plaintive, honorable, and at ease, meaning it invites to sleep... "Kircher: ... a magnificent and serious affect which however can be used for flattery...."
					Schu: Pious womanliness and tenderness of character.
Oh come par che all'amoroso foco l'amenità del loco, la terra e il ciel risponda, ...	Oh how it seems the amorous fire the beauties of this place, the earth and the sky respond.	enjoying and observing	content	F Major	Matt: ... the most beautiful sentiments of the world, magnanimity, steadfastness, love, or... top list of virtues, and all this in such natural and incompatible ease that no coercion involved...
					Schu: Complaisance and calm.
					Vog: ... good for dead calm... with a quiet joy in happy shades of Elysium.

¹⁰⁸Libretto and English Translation, "Deh! Vieni non tardar", Opera-Arias, accessed May 10, 2016, <http://www.opera-arias.com/mozart/le-nozze-di-figaro/deh-vieni-non-tardar/>. English translations modified by Meng-Jung Tsai.

¹⁰⁹ Abbreviations for the three authors, Mattheson as "Matt," Schubart as "Schu," and Vogler as "Vog."The characteristic agreeing with the texts are highlighted in red.

Text	Translation	Action	Affect	Tonal Color	Key Descriptions ¹⁰⁹
Deh, vieni, non tardar, oh gioia bella, vieni ove amore per goder t'appella, finché non splende in ciel notturna face,	Ah, come, do not delay, O beautiful joy, come where love for comforts that calls you, until no more shines in the sky the night's torch,	asking love to come and enjoying the moment	tender, loving	F Major	Matt: ... the most beautiful sentiments of the world, magnanimity, steadfastness, love, or... top list of virtues, and all this in such natural and incompatible ease that no coercion involved...
					Schu: Complaisance and calm.
					Vog: ... good for dead calm... with a quiet joy in happy shades of Elysium.
finché l'aria è ancor bruna e il mondo tace. Qui mormora il ruscel, qui scherza l'aura, che col dolce sussurro il cor ristaura,	Until the air is still dark and the world is silent. Here murmurs the brook, here plays the breeze, that with sweet whisper the heart restores,	appreciating the beauty (help) of nature	Appreciative, serene	C Major	Matt: ... a character of rude and insolent... where else one lets one's joy come forth without inhibition... something charming and sometimes tender moments.
					Schu: ... completely pure, innocence, simplicity, naivety, children's talk.
					Vog: ... the key fit for a painting, for pure water arias, pure subjects... A majestic key, full of gravity... charm, splendid.

From the comparison of textual meanings with key descriptions, Mattheson's characterization reflects the literal text, while Schubart and Vogler's descriptions are not as straightforward as Mattheson's. However, when considering the plot at the moment, Schubart's key depiction "*complaisance and calm*" and Volger's "*with a quiet joy in happy shades of Elysium*" completely agree with Susanna's state of mind at that moment. When one applies descriptions from all three authors (in italics) "*Susanna ... lets her joy (over her wedding day) come forth without inhibition (sure of her) pureness and innocence. She is at ease, tender, with a quiet joy, as if almost in paradise. She is hopeful for a better tomorrow.*" These key descriptions provide for the singer precise emotions and attitudes to convey the aria successfully.

From applying the methods to the eight selected soprano roles, conclusions that I am expecting emerge from the questions below: What is the key descriptions for the prima donna and the soubrette categories? What is the ratio of Mozart's key usages in the two categories? If Mozart composes the same key for both categories, what is the explanation? What are the results from the opera buffa versus the opera seria? Are the descriptions strong matching, partial matching, non-matching, or can it be ironic within two different sopranos and two opera categories?

CHAPTER 3

THREE SELECTED KEY CHARACTERISTICS THEORISTS

The debate of key characteristics attained its highest level in the eighteenth century, especially in Germany and France. Steblin states “key characteristics were a matter of considerable interest to 18th and early 19th-century writers on musical subjects....”¹¹⁰ The discussion of key affects was a fairly common study among composers and theorists.¹¹¹ It was somehow also quite controversial due to changes of “the expressive behavior associated with a particular emotion”¹¹² from time to time. According to James Young, any hypothesis about the key affects may be changed from one author to another.¹¹³ In order to explore sufficiently the practices and discussions of key properties in the late eighteenth century, this study selected three German-speaking theorists and applied their key lists to verify Mozart’s choices of key. The opted theorists are Johann Mattheson, C.F.D. Schubart, and G.J. Vogler. Two of them, C.F.D. Schubart and G.J. Vogler, were contemporaries of Mozart. Johann Mattheson provided the approach and the viewpoint of German traditions to the key characteristics. The three theorists are introduced in chronological order by birth year followed by a short biography, a brief discussion of their works, their influence and their impact upon eighteenth-century music.

3.1 Johann Mattheson

Johann Mattheson (1681-1764), a German composer, singer, writer, music theorist,

¹¹⁰ Steblin, 1983, 187.

¹¹¹ Ishiguro, 2.

¹¹² Young, 241.

¹¹³ Ibid.

diplomat, and philosopher, was born in Hamburg, of ordinary parents according to his autobiography.¹¹⁴ Though his parents were neither prominent, from his notes penned during his sixtieth year, young Mattheson still had a very good early education.¹¹⁵ At age seven, Mattheson began his musical education. He accepted instructions in instruments, composition, and singing.¹¹⁶ At age nine, he had already become a musical prodigy. In *Johann Mattheson: Spectator in Music*, Cannon states:

He was “possessed of a pure and lovely soprano voice, which was heard in different churches”; he played his own “compositions,” if such a title can be given to the production of so youthful a student, and “he was often heard playing the organ (although his feet could not yet reach the pedal); he also accompanied his singing in specially arranged compositions with a thorough-bass.”¹¹⁷

Mattheson’s musical experience at his young age led him towards the love for operas. Cannon states “this new connection with the art of the opera was of much greater benefit to him than his regular musical studies.”¹¹⁸ The opera formed an “entire musical University,”¹¹⁹ and its splendid baroque staging and innovated composition styles drew Mattheson’s mind. From his debut in 1696,¹²⁰ Mattheson made his career as an opera singer until 1705.¹²¹ It is likely that opera, the art full of diversity, brought him a wide view for his composition and theory. According to George Buelow:

¹¹⁴ Beekman C. Cannon, *Johann Mattheson: Spectator in Music* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1947), 18.

¹¹⁵ *Ibid.*, 19.

¹¹⁶ *Ibid.*

¹¹⁷ *Ibid.*, 20.

¹¹⁸ *Ibid.*, 20-21.

¹¹⁹ *Ibid.*, 21.

¹²⁰ Johann Mattheson, *Der Musicalische Patriot*, quoted in Cannon, BC, 25-26.

¹²¹ Cannon, BC, 31.

... his works exhibit a panorama of statements about what music was and also what he thought it should be in his lifetime. In effect, he set out to re-formulate much of the theory and aesthetics of music, attempting to replace with new ideas the worn-out, irrelevant rules and principles of theory and composition which had hardly changed in the previous two hundred years. As a judge of the new, Mattheson invariably had disdain for the past. In a number of didactic works, he casts aside almost all of the theoretical-philosophical foundations of earlier musical thought. In attacking the past, he found himself committed to constructing a new musical order, a musical Rationalism, a new philosophical mode of thinking about how to judge music as an art.¹²²

His first musical treatise was released in 1713, from which he gained his reputation. He also became a leading advocate of the Doctrine of Affections, *Affektenlehre*.¹²³ In his long life, Mattheson had about thirty theoretical publications and numerous musical compositions.¹²⁴

3.2 Mattheson's Das neu-eröffnete Orchestre

The greatest forte of Johann Mattheson was, not only in politics, but also as a writer in music theory. He started to compose operas in 1699, and later demonstrated his "real ability as a writer of oratorios,"¹²⁵ and he wrote many published books and translations. In 1713, Mattheson published his first musical treatise, *Das neu-eröffnete Orchestre*, from which he gained an increasing reputation. In addition, he also wrote many outstanding books, including *Das beschützte Orchestre* (1717),¹²⁶ *Das forschende Orchestre* (1721),¹²⁷ *Der vollkommene*

¹²² George J. Buelow, "Johann Mattheson and the Invention of Affektenlehre" in *New Mattheson Studies*, ed. George J. Buelow and Hans Joachim Marx (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1983), 393-40.

¹²³ George J. Buelow, "Affects, theory of the." *Grove Music Online*. 2001; Accessed 12 Feb. 2020. <https://libproxy.library.unt.edu:5982/grovemusic/view/10.1093/gmo/9781561592630.001.0001/omo-9781561592630-e-0000000253>.

¹²⁴ George J. Buelow, "Mattheson, Johann." *Grove Music Online*. 2001; Accessed 12 Feb. 2020. <https://libproxy.library.unt.edu:5982/grovemusic/view/10.1093/gmo/9781561592630.001.0001/omo-9781561592630-e-0000018097>.

¹²⁵ *Ibid.*, 62.

¹²⁶ Johann Mattheson, *Das beschützte Orchestre*, quoted in Cannon, BC, 164.

¹²⁷ Johann Mattheson, *Das Forschende Orchestre*, quoted in Cannon, BC, 175.

Capellmeister (1739),¹²⁸ *Grundlage einer Ehren-Pforte* (1740),¹²⁹ and more. Mattheson's *Das neu-eröffnete Orchestre* is a "universal and fundamental introduction"¹³⁰ to music, and it offers a "thorough and comprehensive manner"¹³¹ both in theory and practice of music. His modern and straightforward nature appears in the writing. Cannon states, "it was written in a popular style—one that deliberately avoided the obscurities of traditional musical parlance."¹³² In this book, he brings forth the "new" ideas to challenge conservative Lutheran musicians. Seemingly, Mattheson's preference for operas urged him to give birth to the newer methods. Many statements from the book are based on newer musical ideas, which could be influenced by the newer secular music—operas. Gloria Flaherty demonstrates:

Throughout his long life Mattheson persisted in defending theater as a serious, important, and necessary human endeavor. When he published his first treatises on music, *Das neu-eröffnete Orchestre* (1713), operatic theorists were still groping for arguments with which to refute the condemnations of pietistic clergymen and the complaints of neoclassical drama critics.¹³³

Even Mattheson himself used the word "Orchestre," which is the position of the orchestra in the theater.¹³⁴ Therefore, Cannon describes:

... "Orchestre," with its suggestions of the opera, as the cognomen for a "universelle" introduction to music, implies a critical realism new to musical books at that time.¹³⁵

¹²⁸ Johann Mattheson, *Dre vollkommene Capellmeister*, quoted in Cannon, BC, 200.

¹²⁹ Johann Mattheson, *Grundlage einer Ehren-Pforte*, quoted in Cannon, BC, 200-201.

¹³⁰ Johann Mattheson, *Das neu-eröffnete Orchestre*, Hamburg, 116-133, quoted in Cannon, BC, 157.

¹³¹ Steblin, 1983, 43.

¹³² Cannon, BC, 83.

¹³³ Gloria Flaherty, "Mattheson and the Aesthetics of Theater," in *New Mattheson Studies*, ed. George J. Buelow and Hans Joachim Marx (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1983), 79.

¹³⁴ *Ibid.*, 114.

¹³⁵ L. Meinardus, "Johann Mattheson und seine Verdienste um die deutsch Tonkunst," *der Walderseeschen Vortrage*, No. 8 (1879), 244-245, quoted in Cannon, BC, 115.

Mattheson's list of key characteristics, which this study employs, is a significant discussion among those revolutionary ideas in *Das neu-eröffnete Orchestre*. In 1713, Mattheson is the earliest German theorist who considered and discussed key characteristics.¹³⁶ His introduction of the concept of affective meanings in each key was used most frequently in the early eighteenth century.¹³⁷ Not only injecting his new ideas into the book, Mattheson also establishes the key thoughts from its history—the modes. Steblin states, the modern key affects he proposed could be traced to his interests in its history which related to modal affects.¹³⁸ His tonal aesthetic is also built on unequal temperaments which lead to different key properties.¹³⁹ According to *Das neu-eröffnete Orchestre*, Mattheson titles the second chapter of Part Three¹⁴⁰:

Von der Musicalischen Töne Eigenschaft und Würckung in Ausdrückung der Affecten.¹⁴¹ (an examination “of the particular characteristics of musical scales and their power to affect the Passions.”¹⁴²)

Mattheson believed in the significance of key associations not merely between the major-minor¹⁴³ distinction, but he also thought it was not entirely wrong. According to Steblin's translation, Mattheson remarks:

¹³⁶ Steblin, 1983, 43.

¹³⁷ Cannon, BC, 84.

¹³⁸ Steblin, 1983, 43.

¹³⁹ Young, 237.

¹⁴⁰ In *Das neu-eröffnete Orchestre* has three major parts. Part Three, “Pars Tertia Judicatoria”.

¹⁴¹ Mattheson, *Das neu-eröffnete Orchestre*, (Hamburg: Bei B. Schillers Wittwe, 1713), 231.

¹⁴² Cannon, BC, 126.

¹⁴³ The basic differentiation of scales lies in the major and minor third, and who “will have it that all minors are necessarily sad, but all majors joyous,” have in general warped the facts not too grossly, quoted in Cannon, BC, 126.

Those people who believe that the whole secret is to be found in the minor or major third, and who maintain that as a rule all minor keys are inevitably sad and that all major keys are usually joyful, are not entirely wrong; they have just not gone far enough in their investigations.

Much less correct are those people who believe that a piece in flats absolutely must sound soft and tender, while a piece in sharps must be hard, lively, and joyful. The error of the first opinion, the naiveté of the second, and the incongruity [of these views] can be clearly shown; the following will fully illuminate how both opinions contradict themselves.¹⁴⁴

Mattheson disagreed with the belief of his contemporaries that “a piece in sharps is more hard and lively than a piece in flats,” which interestingly became the view of the majority of 18th- and 19th-century’s principle advocates of tonal characterizations.¹⁴⁵ It was evolving because the tuning and temperament was resolving into equal temperament.

Mattheson interprets his detailed experience with the affective differences between sixteen major and minor scales¹⁴⁶ (see Table 3-1). These sixteen scales are within four-sharps (E major) to four-flats (F minor). In the *Neu-eröffnete Orchestre*, Mattheson indeed provides “the earliest and most extensive discussion”¹⁴⁷ of key meanings as written by a German theorist even though his understanding of the connection between tonality and the “Affections” becomes much more clearly defined in his later life.¹⁴⁸ Nevertheless, *Das neu-eröffnete Orchestre* is a book “rich in factual detail”¹⁴⁹ that urges German musicians to achieve eminence in their country. Lustig states, “One can hardly study the general-bass, aesthetics, or national

¹⁴⁴ Mattheson, *Das neu-eröffnete*, 232-233, translation quoted in Steblin, 50.

¹⁴⁵ Steblin, 1983, 50.

¹⁴⁶ Mattheson, 236-253, quoted in Cannon, 51.

¹⁴⁷ Steblin, 1983, 43.

¹⁴⁸ Cannon, BC, 127.

¹⁴⁹ Buelow, "Mattheson, Johann."

styles in the early eighteenth century without seeking out Mattheson’s opinions, nor can one investigate German music without comparing Mattheson’s theory to his own practice.”¹⁵⁰

Table 3-1: Johann Mattheson’s Key Characteristics List, 1713¹⁵¹

Number(s) of Key Signature	Major	Minor
0	C major has a rude and insolent character, but will not be inappropriate for boisterous dancing and where else one lets one’s joy come forth without inhibition; but an able composer may re-baptize [the key] into something charming and sometimes even apply it to tender moments.	A minor is somewhat plaintive, honorable, and at ease, meaning it invites to sleep; but it is not unpleasant in this. Apart from that apt to incite compassion in piano and instrumental pieces. Kircher: “This tone has a magnificent and serious affect which however can be used for flattery. Yes, the nature of this tone is rather moderate and can be used for a lot [of different] affects. Is at the same time moderate and sweet beyond measure.”
1 Flat	F major is capable to express the most beautiful sentiments of the world, be it magnanimity, steadfastness, love, or whatever else is on top of the list of virtues, and all this in such a natural way and incompatible ease that there is no coercion involved. Yes, the gentleness and character of this tone cannot be described in different terms than to compare it to a beautiful person whom everything he does, and be it as it could, makes look perfect, and who, as the French say, has <i>bonne grace</i> .	If one investigates D minor one will find that it contains something humble, calm, at the same time grand, pleasant, and content; therefore it is capable of promoting devotion in church pieces and peace of mind in secular pieces; even though this does not hinder one to express successfully with this tone something pleasant, but not particularly jumping but rather flowing [...] for heroic or epic it is the best. Because it has besides its nimbleness also a dignity etc. Aristotle calls it serious and constant.
1 Sharp	G major has much that is insinuating and speaking; it shines not just a little and is quite apt for both serious and merry things. Kircher calls it “amorous and voluptuous” and elsewhere also a “honest guardian of temperance”. Corvinus: “it favors merry and amorous things.”	E minor can express merriment only with great difficulty, whatever one does, because it makes one feel too pensive, deeply thinking, sad, and melancholy, but in such a way that one hopes to console oneself. One may set it a bit quicker, but it will not get much happier. Kircher says “It loves sadness and pain”. For Luciano it seems to have an impetuous character; for Glarean a plaintive one.

¹⁵⁰ Roger Lustig, Review of New Mattheson Studies, edited by George J. Buelow and Hans Joachim Marx, (New York: Cambridge University Press, 1983,) *Notes* 41, no. 3 (1985): 506-08, accessed December 2, 2019, doi:10.2307/941162.

¹⁵¹ Johann Mattheson, *Das neu-eröffnete Orchestre* (Hamburg: Bei B. Schillers Wittwe, 1713), 236-51. Handouts: Mattheson’s description of key characteristics, translated by Hendrick Schulze, unpublished, presented in class MUMH 6510: Performance Practice – Tuning Systems and Key Characteristics, University of North Texas, Denton, March 07, 2016.

Number(s) of Key Signature	Major	Minor
2 Flats	B-flat major is very entertaining but likes to retain a certain modesty and can therefore pass both for great and for small matters. Among other qualities that Kircher attributes to it, this one should not be ignored: It elevates the soul to [do] heavy/difficult things.	G minor is almost the most beautiful tone as it is not only combining the seriousness of [d minor] with a certain loveliness, but also carries with it an exceptional grace and pleasantness, through which it is comfortable for both tender and uplifting, both yearning and happy – in short both for moderate lament and moderate happiness, and thus very flexible. Kircher judges it as “it carries a modest and devout happiness, be happy and full of serious leaps.”
2 Sharps	D major is by nature somewhat sharp and obstinate; very apt for noise-making, merry, warlike, and uplifting things; but at the same time nobody will deny that this harsh tone may also give inspiration in a rather neat and strange way to delicate things.	H minor (B minor) is bizarre, unhappy, and melancholic; for that reason it is rarely used and it may perhaps be the reason why the ancients banned it from their monasteries and cloisters that they don't even remember it.
3 Flats	E-flat major has rather a lot of pathos; wants to have to do with nothing but serious and at the same time plaintive things and is the sworn enemy of opulence.	C minor is a very lovely but also sad tone, but because the first quality is superseding the second, and one also tires easily of sweet things it is not unwise to try to enliven it a bit by a merry or even movement, otherwise one might become a bit sleepy from its moderation. Should it be a piece though that is supposed to encourage sleep this remark is superfluous and you can just get to that goal in a natural way.
3 Sharps	A major gives much fatigue even though it is shining and is more apt for lamenting and sad passions than for entertainment; it is very apt for violin pieces.	F-sharp minor: even though this tone leads to great sadness, it is more languishing and amorous than lethal; this tone has otherwise something abandoned, lonely, and misanthropic.
4 Flats		F minor seems to depict a moderate and calm, but deep and heavy mortal fear in the heart that is combined with some desperation and is nimble beyond measure. It very nicely expresses a black melancholy and will sometimes cause the listener a horror or shiver.
4 Sharps	E major expresses very well a desperate or entirely deadly sadness; best used for extremely in-love help- and hopelessness, and has in certain circumstances such a cutting, separating, suffering, and penetrating that it cannot be compared to anything but a fatal separation between body and soul.	

Mattheson's attempt to connect with keys is audacious and personal. Buelow writes that "we need to remember the author's own words regarding key Affections. In essence any of these affective descriptions is personal, and Mattheson surely would have agreed that another individual's response might not correspond to his interpretation."¹⁵² Mattheson also indicates when discussing the quality of the keys in *Der vollkommene Capellmeister* (1739), that he "...would only append in closing that there is nothing incontrovertible to say about these qualities, since no key can be so sad or happy in and of itself that one might not compose the opposite. The remaining is to be presented in its proper place."¹⁵³ Thus Mattheson's description of key characteristics is relatively lengthier than Schubart's and Vogler's key explanations. His theory of the Affects and keys also impacts "a number of subsequent writers of the eighteenth century."¹⁵⁴ As Buelow discusses about Mattheson's key Affections in *Das neu-eröffnete Orchestre*:

This important document has sent several musicologists off on fishing expeditions into the music of the Baroque, where they have hoped to find that many if not all Baroque composers of the eighteenth century knew these same key Affections, either by acquaintance with Mattheson's treatise, or because they were in fact common knowledge.¹⁵⁵

So, from this perspective Lüthy presumes "Mozart probably knew Mattheson's writings."¹⁵⁶

This research also includes Mattheson's characteristic Affections for this reason and looks to see if Mozart utilizes Mattheson's key theory.

¹⁵² Buelow, "Mattheson and the Affektenlehre," 403.

¹⁵³ Mattheson & Harriss, 188.

¹⁵⁴ Buelow, "Mattheson and the Affektenlehre," 401.

¹⁵⁵ *Ibid.*, " 402.

¹⁵⁶ Lüthy, 40: "Mozart kannte wahrscheinlich Matthesons Schriften. Mattlinger sagt (<<Mozarts Bekenntnisse und Lehren>>, S. 7), dass die theoretische Auffassung Mozarts der Matthesons am nächsten komme."

3.3 Christian Friedrich Daniel Schubart

Christian Friedrich Danial Schubart (1739-91), a German poet, journalist, composer, and writer on music critique and politics, was born in Swabia, a region in southwestern Germany.¹⁵⁷ He received music training from his father, and his musical talent appeared at a young age.¹⁵⁸ Nevertheless, his parents decided young Schubart should go on a path of theology and he entered Erlangen University in 1758.¹⁵⁹

Schubart was a man who dared to challenge authority. He was full of great passion, especially for freedom,¹⁶⁰ for which he often raised his voice for middle- and lower-class people.¹⁶¹ However during his university life, his behavior required him to leave school in 1760.¹⁶² His behaviors and opinions caused him to move frequently in order to search for “a place he would be free to speak.”¹⁶³ After several relocations, he was banished from Württemberg in 1773, and Schubart took residence in Augsburg in the following year.¹⁶⁴ There he produced the notable *Deutsche (or Teutsche) Chronik*, a twice-weekly press reporting of politics, and criticism of music and literature.¹⁶⁵

Schubart never ceased putting forth his voice. For ten years, Schubart was imprisoned in the fortress of Hohenasperg, nonetheless he still devoted himself to writing. He started

¹⁵⁷ Ossenkop.

¹⁵⁸ Ibid.

¹⁵⁹ Ibid.

¹⁶⁰ Hart, 4.

¹⁶¹ Brown, 3.

¹⁶² Schubart & DuBois, 168.

¹⁶³ Brown, 3.

¹⁶⁴ Ossenkop.

¹⁶⁵ Schubart & DuBois, Editor’s note, 166.

dictating his autobiography¹⁶⁶ in 1778-79, and also established the renowned treatise *Ideen zu einer Ästhetik der Tonkunst*, which dates from 1784-85 and was published in 1806.¹⁶⁷ He also penned one of his eminent poems, “Die Forelle” composed in 1782, five years into his imprisonment.¹⁶⁸

Not only was Schubart an excellent organist and harpsichord/clavichord player,¹⁶⁹ he also accomplished “considerable success as a lied composer.”¹⁷⁰ He often sets his own texts, and his lieder are mostly in strophic form with a folk-like melody.¹⁷¹ As mentioned previously, Schubart wrote the poem “Die Forelle” in 1782, and in the same year he set it to music when he was in jail at Hohenasperg.¹⁷² Regarding his compositional style, when Abert describes the composing style of Leopold Mozart, he also briefly mentions Schubart’s as Leopold’s resembler: ... as with the songs of his [Leopold’s] compatriot, Christian Friedrich Daniel Schubart, he avoids the more elevated themes drawn from Nature, legend and history, preferring instead to explore the everyday world of common people. Rollicking peasants, carefree huntsmen, soldiers accompanied by the strains of fife and drum, coachmen, a lively sleigh party – these were the things that were dear to his heart.¹⁷³

Schubart’s lieder style is a modal outcome to the spirit of the southwestern German song. Abert states:

Here there is no trace of any rationalist speculation, but rather, a conscious debt to genuine folksong, for the sake of which composers not infrequently eschewed any loftier ambitions. Schubart is a typical representative of this spirit. He emphatically

¹⁶⁶ Schubart’s autobiography, *Leben und Gesinnungen, von ihm selbst im Kerker aufgesetzt* (Stuttgart, 1971-3/R), quoted in Ossenkop “Schubart.”

¹⁶⁷ Ossenkop.

¹⁶⁸ Brown, 19.

¹⁶⁹ Ossenkop.

¹⁷⁰ Ibid.

¹⁷¹ Ibid.

¹⁷² Brown, 61.

¹⁷³ Abert, 12.

rejected the Berliners' theoretical approach and was proud of the fact that his songs all came from the people.¹⁷⁴

According to Abert, the south-west German spirit, specifically Swabian which Schubart possessed, had important influence on the development of Mozart's lieder.

Apart from his musical compositional abilities, Schubart also published articles about music and other musicians. According to Abert, Schubart wrote about Mozart's *opera buffa* "*La finta giardiniera*":

That the work was sensationally successful is clear from the fact that the composer is not only – exceptionally – mentioned by name but also described in detail, a privilege accorded to no other composer. Writing in his *Deutsche Chronik*, Christian Friedrich Daniel Schubart noted that he 'heard an *opera buffa* by that wonderful genius *Mozart*; it is called *La finta giardiniera*. Flashes of genius appear here and there; but there is not yet that still altar-fire that rises towards Heaven in clouds of incense – a scent beloved of the gods. If Mozart is not a plant forced in the hot-house, he is bound to grow into one of the greatest musical composers who ever lived.'¹⁷⁵

In addition to young Mozart, Schubart also wrote about Leopold Mozart's treatise of violin playing, again as referenced by Abert:

Schubart thought that 'By his *Violinschule*, written in very good German and with deep insight, he has earned great merit. The examples are excellently chosen and his "fingering" is by no means pedantic. Although he inclines towards the school of Tartini, he allows his pupil more freedom in his handling of bow than the latter.'¹⁷⁶

Moreover, Schubart praised his contemporary's achievement, Vogler's invention—the *Orchestrion*, a species of organ. As well Schubart showed his preference for Vogler's improvisations more than "his rule-encrusted compositions."¹⁷⁷

¹⁷⁴ Abert, 12.

¹⁷⁵ Ibid., 262.

¹⁷⁶ Schubart, *Ideen zu einer Ästhetik der Tonkunst*, 157, quoted in Abert, 17.

¹⁷⁷ Grave & Grave, 227 & 255.

3.4 Schubart's *Ideen zu einer Ästhetik der Tonkunst*

Schubart's *Ideen zu einer Ästhetik der Tonkunst* (*Ideas towards an Aesthetic of Music*) dates from 1784-85, when he was incarcerated at Hohenasperg. Later the treatise was published in 1806, edited by Ludwig Schubart, his son.¹⁷⁸ The reason for Schubart to compose his own aesthetic of music may be the interview by Charles Burney, an English historian of music, in 1772.¹⁷⁹ According to DuBois, the scholarly histories of music by Burney, Hawkins, Martini, and Forkel, indeed were precious and praiseworthy works, but somehow their academic method was more for the expert, "not directed to the layman."¹⁸⁰ Furthermore, "musical almanacs" as DuBois states, were compiled for the general public, however those were spread only to contemporary activities.¹⁸¹ On the other hand, Schubart anticipated more in providing a general history of music through his *Ästhetik der Tonkunst*.¹⁸² As DuBois indicates, "The *Ästhetik der Tonkunst* is a 'popular' history of music."¹⁸³ Schubart meant to contribute a simply presented document for German public. Perhaps the fact related to his nationalism, and Schubart's interest in domestic folk-like thoughts.¹⁸⁴

When he was imprisoned at Hohenasperg, Schubart started dictating his *Ästhetik* draft to Baron Eugen von Scheeler,¹⁸⁵ son of the Asperg commandant, in 1784. From Dubois'

¹⁷⁸ Schubart & DuBois, Editor's note, 166.

¹⁷⁹ DuBois, 1.

¹⁸⁰ *Ibid.*

¹⁸¹ *Ibid.*

¹⁸² *Ibid.*

¹⁸³ *Ibid.*, 4.

¹⁸⁴ *Ibid.*, 23.

¹⁸⁵ Karl Maria Klob, *Schubart: ein deutsches Dichter – und Kulturbild* (Ulm: H Kerler, 1908), 397, quoted in Dubois, 2.

research, he indicates Schubart left very little information regarding the writing of the treatise. According to the foreword by Ludwig Schubart, “He (C.F.D. Schubart) had few books around him while he undertook the work and dictated a great deal from memory.”¹⁸⁶ His considerable reading and his background in music allowed him “to comment on music making throughout Germany without actually having first-hand knowledge,”¹⁸⁷ since Schubart himself never traveled outside of southern Germany.

As mentioned before, *Ästhetik* is a “popular” music history document. The *Ästhetik* style of writing tends to be practical and more casual. DuBois states that the topics included in the book are dealt with in “a very informal way.”¹⁸⁸ The reason might be the influence from lots of travel journals present at that time. The style of the travel journal focused more on personal reflections and contained little or no research. As stated in DuBois, “They (travelogues) were often rambling narratives on extramusical topics or discussions of musical taste where opinion could be expressed, and they were typically organized in the manner of a diary: by date rather than by topic.”¹⁸⁹ It may affect the contents of *Ästhetik* to be “very sketchy,”¹⁹⁰ compared to those scholarly theses such as the histories of Burney and the others. As was his character, Schubart was quite “practical.”¹⁹¹ When describing his compositional style, we know Schubart prefers to use genuine folk style rather than follow the theoretical techniques from northern

¹⁸⁶ Schubart, *Ideen*, trans. Dubois, 36.

¹⁸⁷ DuBois, 6.

¹⁸⁸ *Ibid.*, 5.

¹⁸⁹ *Ibid.*, 5-6.

¹⁹⁰ *Ibid.*, 4.

¹⁹¹ *Ibid.*

Germany. Perhaps his character was more frank and not willing to follow the rules, which affects both his literature and music writings.

The *Ästhetik der Tonkunst* contains two major parts and forty-six chapters in total. Part One, entitled 'The History of Music,' discusses many topics from a synoptic history of music, to Jews, to Greeks, to Romans, to the supremacy of Italy's singers, to schools of Germans, Saxon, Palatine-Bavarian, to most German cities and to the European principal countries. The second part is about 'The Principles of Music.' The subjects and topics organized in chapters are: Concerning Musical Instruments (indicating the organ, harpsichord, and clavier), Concerning Fingering, Solo Playing (indicating the string instruments, from violin to violoncello, and to lyre, harp, and lute etc.), Wind Instruments (brass and woodwinds), Concerning Singing (the human voice), Concerning Musical Style (from sacred, dramatic, to pantomime), The Technical Terms of Music (concerto, chorus, fugue, etc.), Concerning Musical Coloring (forte, piano, etc.), Concerning Music Genius, and the last, Concerning Musical Expression (characterizations of the keys).¹⁹² This dissertation mainly applies to and focuses on Schubart's last chapter—Concerning Musical Expression. Though the details of characteristics of the keys are simply Schubart's individual and intriguing portraits, his impressions uncover the styles from other contemporaries, either their playing or composing. Steblin indicates:

The personal and fantastic images which Schubart conjured up for each key were especially appealing to the romantic mind and had a tremendous impact on subsequent publications of key descriptions; even Beethoven and Schumann were moved to comment on Schubart's views.¹⁹³

¹⁹² Schubart, *Ideen*, quoted in DuBois.

¹⁹³ Steblin, 2002, 115.

Table 3-2 shows Schubart's 1806 version of key characteristics. The order arrangement follows the sharp-flat numbers.

Table 3-2: C.F.D. Schubart's Key Characteristics List, 1806¹⁹⁴

Number(s) of Key Signature	Major	Minor
0	C major is completely pure. Its character is: innocence, simplicity, naivety, children's talk.	A minor. Pious womanliness and tenderness of character.
1 Flat	F major. Complaisance and calm.	D minor. Melancholy womanliness, the spleen and humours brood.
1 Sharp	G major: Everything rustic, idyllic and lyrical, every calm and satisfied passion, every tender gratitude for true friendship and faithful love, —in a word every gentle and peaceful emotion of the heart is correctly expressed by this key. What a pity that because of its seeming lightness it is so greatly neglected nowadays...	E minor: Naïve, womanly innocent declaration of love, lament without grumbling; sighs accompanied by few tears; this key speaks of the imminent hope of resolving in the pure happiness of C major. Since by nature it has only one colour, it can be compared to a maiden, dressed in white, with a rose-red bow at her breast. From this key one steps with inexpressible charm back again to the fundamental key of C major, where heart and ear find the most complete satisfaction.
2 Flats	B^b major. Cheerful love, clear conscience, hope aspiration for a better world.	G minor. Discontent, uneasiness, worry about a failed scheme; bad-tempered gnashing of teeth; in a word: resentment and dislike.
2 Sharps	D major: The key of triumph, of Hallelujahs, of war-cries, of victory-rejoicing. Thus, the inviting symphonies, the marches, holiday songs and heaven-rejoicing choruses are set in this key.	B minor: This is as it were the key of patience, of calm awaiting one's fate and of submission to divine dispensation. For that reason its lament is so mild, without ever breaking out into offensive murmuring or whimpering. The use of this key is rather difficult for all instruments; therefore so few pieces are found which are expressly set in this key.
3 Flats	E^b major. The key of love, of devotion, of intimate conversation with God; through its three flats [1789: according to Euler] expressing the holy trinity. [1789: D# was the favorite of the great Jommelli; therefore he poured out his soul so often in this key. He wrote his most beautiful arias in it.]	C minor. Declaration of love and at the same time the lament of unhappy love. —All languishing, longing, sighing of the love-sick soul lies in this key.
3 Sharps	A major: This key includes declarations of innocent love, satisfaction with one's state of affairs; hope of seeing one's beloved again	F# minor: A gloomy key: it tugs at passion as a dog biting a dress. Resentment and discontent are its language. It really does not seem to like

¹⁹⁴ Schubart, *Ideen zu einer Ästhetik der Tonkunst*, ed. Ludwig Schubart (Vienna: Degen, 1806), ed. P.A. Merbach (Leipzig: Wolkenwanderer-Verlag, 1924), 261-65, quoted in Steblin, (Rochester, 2002), 115-123.

Number(s) of Key Signature	Major	Minor
	when parting; youthful cheerfulness and trust in God.	its own position: therefore it languishes ever for the calm of A major or for the triumphant happiness of D major.
4 Flats	A^b major. The key of the grave. Death, grave, putrefaction, judgment, eternity lie in its radius.	F minor. Deep depression, funereal lament, groans of misery and longing for the grave.
4 Sharps	E major. Noisy shouts of joy, laughing pleasure and not yet complete, full delight lies in E major.	C[#] Minor: Penitential lamentation, intimate conversation with God, the friend and helpmeet of life; sighs of disappointed friendship and love lie in its radius.
5 Flats	D^b Major. A leering key, degenerating into grief and rapture. It cannot laugh, but it can smile; it cannot howl, but it can at least grimace its crying. —Consequently only unusual characters and feelings can be brought out in this key.	B^b Minor. A quaint creature, often dressed in the garment of night. It is somewhat surly and very seldom takes on a pleasant countenance. Mocking God and the world; discontented with itself and with everything; preparation for suicide sounds in this key.
5 Sharps	B major. Strongly coloured, announcing wild passions, composed from the most glaring colours. Anger, rage, jealousy, fury, despair and every burden of the heart lies in its sphere.	G[#] minor. Grumbler, heart squeezed until it suffocates; wailing lament, difficult struggle; in a word, the color of this key is everything struggling with difficulty.
6 Flats	G^b Major. Triumph over difficulty, free sigh of relief uttered when hurdles are surmounted; echo of a soul which has fiercely struggled and finally conquered lies in all uses of this key.	E^b Minor. Feelings of the anxiety of the soul's deepest distress, of brooding despair, of blackest depression, of the most gloomy condition of the soul. Every fear, every hesitation of the shuddering heart, breathes out of horrible e ^b minor. If ghosts could speak, their speech would approximate this key.

As previously mentioned in Chapter 1, studies indicating and demonstrating how exactly Mozart employs the characteristics of keys with Schubart's descriptions are few. In Lüthy's examinations, several times he suggests that "Mozart hardly shares this view (with Schubart's key meanings)."¹⁹⁵ However, as Anton Schindler (1795-1864) describes, Beethoven held Schubart's *Ideen zu einer Ästhetik der Tonkunst* in "such high regard."¹⁹⁶ Schindler also mentions Beethoven enjoyed deliberating the key affects, and the composer was "in awe of

¹⁹⁵ Lüthy, 45: "Schubart meint, dass A-dur..... Diese Ansicht teilt Mozart."

¹⁹⁶ Schindler, 367.

what the genius of his great predecessors, Gluck, Haydn, and Mozart had accomplished in the use of tonal colouring to characterize their works.”¹⁹⁷ Schindler continues:

If one reason for Beethoven’s great admiration for Mozart’s *Zauberflöte* was its employment of every musical form, from the song of chorale and fugue, another reason was Mozart’s use here of various keys according to their specific psychical qualities. But as our master would grow warm in his discussion of this interesting subject, giving his hearers the pleasure of witnessing his defence of his theory as if it were an article of religious belief, he would frequently be challenged by sceptics and out-and-out rejecters of his faith. Both sceptics and rejecters of this aspect of aesthetics in the arts used to be more plentiful than at present.¹⁹⁸

“Since Mozart was not a reader of books and yet did ‘great things,’”¹⁹⁹ Schindler also casts out one notable question:

What would the *Corpus musicum*, that considered only thoroughbass and counterpoint sacred to music and that regarded any other science as superfluous, have said to Schubart's ideas on aesthetics?²⁰⁰

This study examines Mozart’s usage of key affects, and also reveal how Mozart accords with Schubart’s key descriptions, or not, in the following chapters.

3.5 Georg Joseph Vogler

Georg Joseph Vogler (1749-1814), also known as Abbé Vogler or Abt (Abbot)²⁰¹ Vogler, was born at Pleichach in Würzburg, Germany. He was a German composer, music educator and theorist, keyboard player, organ designer and a Roman Catholic priest.²⁰² Interestingly, his

¹⁹⁷ Schindler, 367.

¹⁹⁸ Ibid.

¹⁹⁹ Ibid.

²⁰⁰ Ibid.

²⁰¹ *Encyclopaedia Britannica*, s.v. “Vogler, Georg Joseph,” accessed November 11, 2019, https://en.wikisource.org/w/index.php?title=1911_Encyclopædia_Britannica/Vogler,_Georg_Joseph&oldid=9063852.

²⁰² Mårten Nehfors, “Georg Joseph Vogler,” *Swedish Music Heritage*, trans. Thalia Thunander, last modified 2015, accessed December 17, 2019, <http://www.swedishmusicalheritage.com/composers/vogler-georg-joseph/>.

reputation was quite bipolar. Vogler's pupils Carl Maria von Weber and Giacomo Meyerbeer praised him,²⁰³ nevertheless Mozart despised him as a fool and an organ trickster.²⁰⁴ Pope Pius VI appointed him Knight of the Golden Spur,²⁰⁵ however, as Vice Kapellmeister in Mannheim, the orchestra musicians disfavored him.²⁰⁶

Vogler's father, Johann Georg Vogler (1692-1752), a court musician and Würzburg instrument maker,²⁰⁷ provided young Georg's first music education himself while Georg was attending a Jesuit school.²⁰⁸ Young Vogler demonstrated an early sign of talent in music.²⁰⁹ Petty stated, "As early as the age of ten, his musical talent, especially at the keyboard, was extraordinary and later in life he would tour Europe as a virtuoso organist."²¹⁰

In 1767, Vogler had an opportunity to be introduced to Prince-Elector, Karl Theodor. The Prince, according to Britton, "wished to make the Mannheim Opera equally as prominent as the Orchestra and chose Vogler to assist in the endeavor."²¹¹ Vogler became an "imperial

²⁰³ Bynum Petty, "Charlatan or Visionary? Abbé Vogler and His Theory of Organ Design," *The Tracker* 57, no. 2 (Spring, 2013): 20-2, accessed August 27, 2019, <https://libproxy.library.unt.edu/login?url=https://libproxy.library.unt.edu:2165/docview/1335091719?accountid=7113>.

²⁰⁴ Mozart's Letter to His Father, quoted in David James Britton, *Abbé Georg Joseph Vogler: His Life, and His Theories on Organ Design* (DMA diss., University of Rochester, 1973, published on demand by University Microfilms International, 1980), 213-14.

²⁰⁵ Petty.

²⁰⁶ Britton, 10-11.

²⁰⁷ Nehfors, trans. Thunander.

²⁰⁸ Margaret Grave, "Vogler, Georg Joseph," *Grove Music Online*, 2001, accessed 20 Dec. 2019. <https://libproxy.library.unt.edu:5982/grovemusic/view/10.1093/gmo/9781561592630.001.0001/omo-9781561592630-e-0000029608>.

²⁰⁹ *Encyclopaedia Britannica*.

²¹⁰ Petty.

²¹¹ Britton, 4.

appointed almoner”²¹² to the court in 1771, and with the Prince as patron, Vogler was sent to Bologna to study counterpoint with Padre Giambattista Martini (1706-84) in 1773.²¹³ At this time, Padre Martini was one of the most erudite musicians and an outstanding worldwide-known teacher.²¹⁴ However Vogler discovered that Martini’s old-fashioned teaching system, “based on Kirnberger, and Fux’s *Gradus ad Parnassum*, contained ‘all too little soul and profundity’²¹⁵.”²¹⁶ He departed to Padua and studied with Francesco Antonio Vallotti (1697-1780), *maestro di capella* at the basilica of San Antonio, with whom Vogler studied composition and theology.²¹⁷ Padre Vallotti became his “true mentor and source of the insights for which he had undertaken his search.”²¹⁸

Vogler seems to have had excellent political skills and in a way a very nice “commanding personality.”²¹⁹ He was always introduced to the most significant aristocrats and noble people in each country, like the Elector Palatine Karl Theodor in Mannheim and Munich, Marie Antoinette in Paris, Gustav III in Stockholm, and Pope Pius VI in Rome. Apart from the above mentioned ‘Knight of the Order of the Golden Spur,’ Pope Pius VI also bestowed on him the Apostolic Protonotary and a Chamberlain to the Pope during his stay.²²⁰ Gustav Adolph III, King of Sweden, appointed Vogler to the post Royal Kapellmeister in Stockholm and also the

²¹² Britton, 4.

²¹³ Petty.

²¹⁴ Grave & Grave, 14.

²¹⁵ Vogler, quoted in Britton p.5, quoted in Schweiger, *Vogler’s Orgellehre*, p.8.

²¹⁶ Britton, 5.

²¹⁷ Grave and Grave, 15.

²¹⁸ Ibid.

²¹⁹ Britton, 6.

²²⁰ Ibid.

Instructor of the Crown Prince in 1786.²²¹ Vogler, in this regard, had quickly “risen to a higher social level than Mozart.”²²² Perhaps, it is the reason why Mozart’s opinions on Vogler tended to be negative.

It was in 1777 when Vogler met his younger opponent, W.A. Mozart, who decided to leave his post at Salzburg and arrived in Mannheim in late October of 1777.²²³ At that time, according to Abert, “In terms of its life and customs, too, Mannheim was a miniature Paris. In this regard, Mannheim was a natural stepping stone on the composer’s road to Paris.”²²⁴ It was a time that Mannheim had a “literary and musical heyday.”²²⁵ Mozart came to Mannheim searching for a position at the court, and at the time Vogler was the Vice-Kapellmeister and also the Spiritual Council.²²⁶ Grave and Grave describe:

In the autumn of 1777, he (Vogler) confronted his younger rival, W. A. Mozart, who had come to Mannheim in search of employment, and whose professional frustrations (vividly recounted in a series of letters to his father) contrasted so sharply with Vogler’s early success.²²⁷

Even though Mozart drew plenty of attention, he still considered Vogler as an impediment to progress into the Mannheim court. He wrote three letters to Leopold Mozart that harshly criticized Vogler’s book, *Tonwissenschaft und Tonsetzkunst* (Mannheim, 1776), Vogler’s training in Italy, Padre Vallotti’s view about Vogler, and Vogler’s ability on organ and piano playing.²²⁸

²²¹ Britton, 17.

²²² *Ibid.*, 10.

²²³ Abert, 371-72, 388.

²²⁴ *Ibid.*, 388.

²²⁵ *Ibid.*, 401.

²²⁶ Britton, 8.

²²⁷ Grave & Grave, 4.

²²⁸ Emily Anderson, Three Letters by Mozart, quoted in Britton, 213-14.

Mozart's view of Vogler may very likely be biased because he did not successfully receive any appointment. Mozart disliked that Vogler sight-read his concerto, and he also despised Vogler playing the first movement in "*prestississimo*."²²⁹ Mozart wrote, "The bass he generally played differently from the way it was written and sometimes he even rewrote the harmonies and the melodic line."²³⁰ However, Vogler appeared to be an expert in improvising. According to Britton, Vogler and Beethoven, and other prominent artists were invited to a musical *soirée*, held in Sonnleithner's²³¹ house, and both of them were requested to compete—improvising on themes presented by each other.²³² Britton states:

Although Beethoven's improvisation contained a wealth of startlingly beautiful ideas, Vogler's was the more emotionally moving, even with its own strong harmonic and contrapuntal organization. Vogler, having been once invited to show exactly what he could produce, returned to the piano after Beethoven had finished his treatment of Vogler's theme, and continued to improvise on his own theme. Vogler again put himself in a position to be criticized for unmitigated conceit.²³³

Margaret Grave in *Grove Music Online* mentions that Vogler's contemporaries accounted his "most original" achievements to be those of keyboard improvisation rather than notated works.²³⁴ Even Schubart commented about his own preference for Vogler's improvising abilities as mentioned previously in the discussion of Schubart (see p. 47).²³⁵

In Mozart's eye, he found Vogler "profoundly unattractive,"²³⁶ but as a concert organist,

²²⁹ Emily Anderson, Three Letters by Mozart, quoted in Britton, 213-14.

²³⁰ Ibid.

²³¹ Joseph Sonnleithner, secretary of the Hoftheater in Vienna.

²³² Britton, 27-8.

²³³ Schafnäutl, gives the text of a letter by Gänsbacher, reporting his impression of the famous encounter, quoted in Britton, 28.

²³⁴ Grave, *Grove Music Online*.

²³⁵ Grave & Grave, 227.

²³⁶ Abert, 401.

Vogler's concert sold "no fewer than 7,000 tickets within only two days" at Amsterdam, in 1785.²³⁷ Vogler fascinated audiences as a traveling virtuoso performer, and his intelligence for tone paintings impressed the audience throughout Europe. He was innovative and experimental, applying a theatrical style imitating thunderstorm sounds. He created colorful, diverse textures and sonorities, like a modern orchestra, with the organ.²³⁸ Grave and Grave state, "Contemporary reviews nevertheless attest to his fame as a brilliant technician and improviser of tone paintings on the organ."²³⁹

3.6 The Influence of G.J. Vogler, His Treatises and His Key Characteristics

After returning to the Mannheim court in 1776, Vogler started a new phase of his career. With the support of the Elector Karl Theodore, he established a music school, the *Mannheimer Tonschule*.²⁴⁰ He brought back the learning system from Italy, based on Vallotti's principles, as Britton described "in the modern Italian spirit," and gave training for virtuosi singers especially favored by the Prince.²⁴¹ For school teaching, he published two instructional writings: *Tonwissenschaft und Tonzkunst* (The Science of Harmony and the Art of Composition, 1776), a handbook about the theory of harmony; and *Stimmbildungskunst* (The Art of Voice Training, 1776), a manual on vocalism.²⁴² Vogler acclaimed himself as "the first systematic teaching-chair (Lehrkanzel) in music."²⁴³ Subsequently, he published the three-

²³⁷ Grave & Grave, 5.

²³⁸ *Ibid.*, 3

²³⁹ *Ibid.*

²⁴⁰ *Grove Music Online*.

²⁴¹ Britton, 7.

²⁴² Grave & Grave, 4.

²⁴³ Vogler, *Orgellehre* by Schweiger, quoted in Britton, 7.

volume series *Betrachtungen der Mannheimer Tonschule* (Observations of the Mannheim Music School, 1778-81), with which Vogler endeavored “to build up the taste of musical amateurs and to train them in the judging of a musical masterwork.”²⁴⁴ His publication obtained approbation from the Académie Royale des Sciences in Paris in 1780, and three years later the Royal Society in London endorsed his theoretical system.²⁴⁵

In 1786 when Vogler took his appointment in the court of Sweden, he found his second music school, the Royal Swedish Academy of Music (though it has been shut down and resumed again).²⁴⁶ He published many pedagogical writings in Sweden for teaching and lectures. With six months’ vacation in his Swedish contract, Vogler was able to utilize his time for traveling and performing in Europe extensively.²⁴⁷ He loved to visit organ factories in every country where he traveled.²⁴⁸ As an ambitious musician, he presented himself also as an “authority on organ design”²⁴⁹—he invented the *Orchestrion*, a species of organ. Grave and Grave states:

Building an experimental, transportable organ, the *Orchestrion*, as a point of departure, he devised a method of construction whose alleged virtues of efficiency, mechanical simplification, and cost reduction enabled him to procure commissions for new and redesigned instruments while providing the basis for heated debate among critics and performers.²⁵⁰

Vogler invited Kirsnick from Copenhagen and Racknitz from Sweden, both organ builders, to

²⁴⁴ Vogler, *Betrachtungen*, Vol. 1 (1778), p. 300, quoted in Hertha Schweiger, "Abt Vogler," *The Musical Quarterly* 25, no. 2 (1939): 156-66, accessed August 27, 2019, www.jstor.org/stable/738905.

²⁴⁵ *Grove Music Online*.

²⁴⁶ Nehfors, trans. Thunander.

²⁴⁷ Britton, 17-19.

²⁴⁸ *Ibid.*, 19.

²⁴⁹ Grave & Grave, 5.

²⁵⁰ *Ibid.*

“install free reed pipes” in his innovation.²⁵¹ Completed in Rotterdam in 1790, the first concert of the Orchestrion was held in Amsterdam in that year.²⁵²

Vogler was a practical music theorist and also a member of distinguished scientific institutions in many European countries. His prominent concepts included the theory of acoustics, the importance of acoustics in building concert hall and theaters, physical and chemical observations on the materials for organ pipes, and the opinions of key characteristics.²⁵³ Vogler still advocated unequal tuning to create individualities of each key.²⁵⁴ The key affects theory first was introduced in his *Betrachtungen der Mannheimer Tonschule* (1778), expanded in the article “Ausdruck” for the *Deutsche Encyclopädie*, vol. 2 (1779), and later again in his “Vergleichsplan der umgeschaffenen Neumünsterorgel in Würzburg”²⁵⁵ in 1812 (see Table 3-3).²⁵⁶ In his research of the key affects, “major keys become more intense, penetrating, and make more of an impact as they ascend by fifths (G, D, A, E); but as they descend by fifths (F, B^b, E^b, A^b) their force diminishes, and they become duller and darker...,”²⁵⁷ stated Grave and Grave.

Vogler’s treatises and teaching had great influence on many of his disciples. The

²⁵¹ Britton, 19.

²⁵² Barbara Owen and Arthur W.J.G. Ord-Hume, “Orchestrion,” *Grove Music Online*, 2001, accessed 27 Dec. 2019, <https://libproxy.library.unt.edu:5982/grovemusic/view/10.1093/gmo/9781561592630.001.0001/omo-9781561592630-e-0000020409>.

²⁵³ Schweiger, 158.

²⁵⁴ Steblin, 2002, 120.

²⁵⁵ [Comparison plan of redesigning the Neumünster organ in Würzburg] is an unpublished essay, set down in treatise form. According to Britton, Vogler’s plan, referred to as the “Simplification System,” was the single most complete sketch existing in Vogler’s description of re-establishing the Neumünster organ in Würzburg.

²⁵⁶ *Ibid.*, 120-24.

²⁵⁷ Grave & Grave, 42.

composers Carl Maria von Weber, Johann Gänsbacher, and Giacomo Meyerbeer, as well as music theorist Gottfried Weber were the most enthusiastic and loyal to Vogler in his later years.²⁵⁸ Carl Maria von Weber praises his mentor commemorating him in his *Writings on*

Music:

If only I could succeed in drawing a clear portrait of this rare psychological phenomenon in the arts, something worthy of the man himself and a lesson to students of music!²⁵⁹

From either his harmony approaches to music analysis, or his chromatic harmony and tonal paintings of the orchestration, Vogler's theories laid the foundation for the music of the Romantic period in the nineteenth century.²⁶⁰

As previously mentioned, the source of Vogler's key associations in this study is from his "Ausdruck," 1779, and "Vergleichsplan der Neumünsterorgel," 1812. The translation of the list (both 1779 and 1812) is primarily from Steblin's *A History of Key Characteristics*. This study also refers to Britton's research and translation of Vogler's "simplification system (1812)" —Vogler's systematized theories, which was a plan for re-establishing the Neumünster organ in Würzburg (Vergleichsplan der umgeschaffenen Neumünsterorgel, 1812).²⁶¹ Both sources have thoroughgoing lists of Vogler's key characteristics (1779 and 1812). Vogler's lists describe major keys only, and minor keys are not contained. Interestingly, dispersed details about Vogler's key affects and usages are found in Grave and Grave's *In Praise of Harmony—The Teachings of Abbé Georg Joseph Vogler*. Some information about minor keys theory appears in Vogler's

²⁵⁸ Grave & Grave, 7.

²⁵⁹ Carl Maria von Weber, *Writings on Music*, trans. Martin Cooper, ed. John Warrack (Cambridge, 1981), quoted in Grave and Grave, 1.

²⁶⁰ *Grove Music Online*.

²⁶¹ Britton, 86.

essays on critical analysis and musical progress,²⁶² which is explained in detail in the chapter “Music and Drama” within *Praise of Harmony*. These descriptions are adopted and integrated into Table 3-3. Considering Vogler’s explanation, the sharp-flat principle is clearly within an order, and minor keys descriptions are little, so that the format of Table 3-3 accordingly changes as follows.

Table 3-3: G.J. Vogler’s Key Characteristics List, 1779 & 1812^{263, 264}

Number(s) of Key Signature	Key	“Ausdruck” in <i>Deutsche Encyclopädie</i> , 1779	“Vergleichsplan der Neumünsterorgel,” 1812
0	C Major	Perhaps the key most fit for a painting, for pure water arias, for pure subjects. (Depicts the broad, rolling expanse of the River Thermodon. – from Vogler’s melodrama <i>Lampedo</i> , 1778)	A majestic key, full of gravity, for it has little charm; splendid. No one has chosen C for a piece whose character required some charm.
1 Sharp	G Major	Already livelier, although not stormy. Naïve actions, especially of innocent rustic pleasures, can be expressed here more simply than in other keys.	Already somewhat livelier; it was always the favourite key for Pastorals; it is used with much success for the depiction of a bright landscape painting. (Makes appearances mainly in connection with choruses of celebration. – <i>Gustav Adolf</i>)
2 Sharps	D Major	Enflames the heart. Now the whole body is enlivened; the spirit welters in heroic deeds – is roused to imprudent, joyful, even to somewhat boisterous songs of praise. Even the god of thunder has a claim to this key.	Much stronger [than G major]; indeed! Noisy. It is a lively key, suitable for pomp, for noise, rumours of war, etc. (the military brilliance. – <i>Gustav Adolf</i>)
3 Sharps	A Major	Still sharper, but since its range does not encompass the middle of the violin, namely the two middle strings D and A, as does that of D [major], it cannot serve for stormymatters as does D. The fire of anamorous and tender passion is more happily depicted hereby than that	Very penetrating. It is bright and shiny, but not as much so as E. (A major for Jupiter’s aria. – <i>Castore e Polluce</i> , 1786)

²⁶² Grave and Grave, 178-226.

²⁶³ Vogler, “Ausdruck, (musikalisch)” in *Deutsche Encyclopädie, oder Allgemeines Real-Wörterbuch aller Künste und Wissenschaften*, vol. 2 (Frankfurt-am-Main: Varrentrapp und Wenner, 1779), 386, and “Vergleichsplan der umgeschaffenen Neumünsterorgel in Würzburg,” 1812, quoted in Karl Emil Schaghäutl, *Abt Georg Joseph Vogler* (Augsburg: M. Huttler, 1888), 175-76, quoted in Steblin, 121-24, see also in Britton, “Abbé Georg Joseph Vogler” (DMA thesis, University of Rochester, Eastman, 1973), 95-96.

²⁶⁴ Descriptions with parentheses are integrated and adopted from Grave & Grave, 195.

Number(s) of Key Signature	Key	“Ausdruck” in <i>Deutsche Encyclopädie</i> , 1779	“Vergleichsplan der Neumünsterorgel,” 1812
		of rash [passion]. (ferocious, brilliant, penetrating, bright, and luminous – <i>Lampedo</i> , 1778)	
4 Sharps	E Major	Can depict fire best of all, especially as it stands out through the intensity of its piercing flames.	Very penetrating. Has not E always been chosen in all operas where Eumenides appear?
1 Flats	F Major	Good for dead calm.	Calm. In Gluck’s <i>Orpheus</i> and Vogler’s <i>Castor and Pollux</i> , F appeared to agree especially with a quiet joy in happy shades of Elysium. (In Gluckian fashion a group of blessed spirits presents a dance; outer calm. – <i>Castore e Polluce</i> , 1786)
	D minor	(Representation of a storm in the third scene in <i>Lampedo</i> , 1778)	(Inner unrest, agitated; funeral march – <i>Castore e Polluce</i> , 1786)
2 Flats	B ^b Major	Twilight. (Introduces the king and proceeds to function as a ritornello in a manner comparable to that of <i>Lampedo</i> 's theme.)	Calm; a pleasant key; it might have borrowed a certain special tenderness from E ^b . (Suggesting solitude; is used repeatedly for soliloquies and expressions of lonely sentiment. – opera <i>Gustav Adolf</i> , 1787.)
3 Flats	E ^b Major	Night. (Key for night and tenderness; [<i>affetuoso</i>] as Argabyses and Lampedo gaze upon each other and the amorously lyrical melody is announced. – from melodrama <i>Lampedo</i> , 1778)	Gentle night key; it exercises a monopoly over night pictures; an affable key. (tender key of E-flat major, assigned to Gustav in his third-act farewell. – <i>Gustav Adolf</i> .)
	C minor	(A choice which is justified as follows: to express sadness, the minor quality is appropriate. – from <i>Hamlet</i> , 1778)	
4 Flats	A ^b Major	Plutonian realm. (Suitable for evoking darkest night and underworld landscapes – from Vogler’s incidental music <i>Hamlet</i> , 1778)	Gentle night key; it is still blacker [than E ^b] and almost milder; an affable key.
	F minor		(After struggling with Furies, failing to bar Pollux from underworld, and before departing in a rage, Phoebe delivers a turbulent, dark-hued f-minor aria. – opera seria <i>Castore e Polluce</i> , 1786) (The underworld scenes of Act 3, call for the gloom. – <i>Castore e Polluce</i>)

As displayed in Table 3-3, the perspective from “Ausdruck” in 1779 is relatively more abstract than the view Vogler revised later in “Vergleichsplan der umgeschaffenen

Neumünsterorgel" in 1812. Grave and Grave state:

The narrow perspective of the *Betrachtungen* stands in contrast to the broadened scope of the late essay, where Vogler takes account of epoch-making achievements in the world of opera. He now sees that, while the Italians have languished, the Germans have produced two first-rank geniuses, Mozart and Gluck, whose works have set new standards of excellence in dramatic composition.²⁶⁵

This standpoint proves that Vogler did recognize Mozart. In 1793 and 1808, Vogler's publications showed his respects specifically for his former opponent. According to Grave and Grave, they demonstrate that Vogler continued to surpass his original ideology:

But music in the theater and concert hall has progressed immeasurably, outdistancing the predictions made in *Betrachtungen*. Doubtless more rapidly than he had anticipated, the Germans have overtaken the Italians, and there remains no need to look to the south for a worthy successor to Jommelli or Hasse. The greatest masters of the late eighteenth century have appeared on home ground, introducing hitherto unavailable resources of dramatic and instrumental expression. Standing foremost among them are the names of an older contemporary, Joseph Haydn, and a former rival, W. A. Mozart.

Vogler had to come to recognize the towering stature not only of Haydn, but also of W. A. Mozart, and he honored both artists in a publication entitled *Verbesserung der Forkel'schen Veränderungen über das Englische Volkslied "God Save the King"* (Frankfurt am Main, 1793). In this critique of an opponent's error-ridden efforts, it is no longer the Italians' or Mannheim's competency that he cites by way of contrast, but rather the inimitable inspirations of the two Viennese masters. Reaffirming this positive assessment, Vogler's 1808 essay awards the music of Haydn and Mozart a prominent place in the portrayal of modern advancement, notably in the fields of opera, oratorio, and instrumental music.²⁶⁶

Vogler's homage to Mozart even manifests in Vogler's composition. He revised his *Schuster Ballet* in 1808 to resemble Mozart's theme of the beginning phrase of the second movement of *Coronation Concerto*, K537 (Piano Concerto in D, 1788).²⁶⁷

As can be seen, Vogler's key descriptions in 1812 have more possibilities supplied as

²⁶⁵ Grave and Grave, 179.

²⁶⁶ Vogler, *Verbesserung der Forkel'schen Veränderungen* (Frankfurt am Main, 1793), 8-9, and Vogler, *Deutsche Kirchenmusik, mite inter Zergliederung*, 19-22, both quoted in Grave and Grave, 111.

²⁶⁷ Grave and Grave, 113.

relevant information for the analysis of Mozart's operas. The following examinations in Chapter 4 to Chapter 7 reveal how the descriptions in 1779 and in 1812 correspond with Mozart's key meanings in relation to the selected characters.

CHAPTER 4

LA CONTESSA AND SUSANNA IN *LE NOZZE DI FIGARO*

The first performance of *Le nozze di Figaro* (libretto by Lorenzo da Ponte) took place at the Burgtheater in Vienna on May 1st, 1786.²⁶⁸ Singers in the premiere included Luisa Laschi-Mombelli, playing the Countess, and Nancy Storace, who sang the first Susanna.²⁶⁹ The show was splendidly successful so that several numbers were repeated many times.²⁷⁰ Nevertheless six months later in November, either because Martín's opera, *Una cosa rara*, achieved its triumphant first performance on November 17th, 1786, or because Nancy Storace was heading back for England,²⁷¹ *Le nozze di Figaro* was closed out in Vienna in December, 1786.²⁷² In the revision of 1789, Mozart replaced two of Susanna's arias with alternative numbers—"Un moto di gioja" and "Al desio di chi t'adora", in order to suit the new Susanna, Adriana Ferrarese del Bene.²⁷³ This study discusses only "Deh, vieni non tardar," the original aria for Susanna, which most productions at the current time choose to perform.

4.1 La Contessa

4.1.1 Character Background

In *Il barbiere di Siviglia* some of Rosina's first words are "I am docile, I'm respectful. I'm

²⁶⁸ Abert, 806-10.

²⁶⁹ Ibid., 809.

²⁷⁰ According to Leopold Mozart writing to his daughter: "At the second performance of *Figaro's Wedding* in Vienna [on 3 May] five numbers were repeated and at the third [on 8 May] seven, including a short duet that had to be sung three times." Quoted in Abert, 809.

²⁷¹ Cairns, 135.

²⁷² *Nozze di Figaro* had the other production performed in Prague in 1786, and it was revived in Vienna until August 29th, 1789.

²⁷³ Abert, 974.

obedient, gentle, loving; I let myself be ruled, I let myself be guided. But, but if they touch me on my weak spot, I'll be a viper and a hundred tricks I'll play before I yield."²⁷⁴ These words indicate that Rosina has a certain piquant personality. This was said before Rosina married Count Almaviva and became the Countess we see in *Le nozze di Figaro*. Later, after becoming the Countess Almaviva, Rosina became "the unhappy, neglected, but affectionate wife"²⁷⁵ in *Le nozze di Figaro* by Mozart. In Mozart and Da Ponte's *Figaro*, the motivating force of the opera's focus is in fact—love—though the whole opera was packaged into hustling and fidgeting trifles.²⁷⁶ The Countess, as a representative lover figure from the stock characters of *opera buffa*, still displays a pure force of love. According to Abert, the Countess demonstrates "love and resignation":

From an ethical standpoint, the result is now less, now more pure: in the case of the Countess it attains to greatness thanks to the admixture – unique to her – of love and resignation, whereas with Cherubino it never rises above the stage of the unconscious and of wish fulfillment, leaving all ethical possibilities open.²⁷⁷

Indeed, the Countess retains her docility, respect, obedience, gentleness, and love, but a new aspect— "heartfelt seriousness"—also emerges into her character.²⁷⁸

4.1.2 Dove sono i bei momenti

4.1.2.1 Situational Synopsis

When Figaro's plan becomes exposed prematurely in the Act II Finale, the scheme

²⁷⁴ Valeriu Raut, "Una voce poco fa (English translation)," *Lyrics Translate*, last modified February 2, 2016, accessed January 1, 2020, <https://lyricstranslate.com/en/una-voce-poco-fa-voice-while-back.html>.

²⁷⁵ Kaiser, 16.

²⁷⁶ Abert, 932.

²⁷⁷ Ibid.

²⁷⁸ Kaiser, 16.

asking Cherubino to dress as Susanna will not work. The Countess has made the decision to disguise herself as Susanna and takes Susanna's place to meet the Count. She has urged Susanna to "make an assignation"²⁷⁹ with the Count in the garden later that evening. Now, she is waiting alone anxiously for her maid to bring back any news.

4.1.2.2 Textual and Tonal Analysis

The Countess' second aria is in a small sonata form which has a recapitulation; nevertheless, it only receives the name *Recitativo istrumentato ed Aria*. "Dove sono i bei momenti," a slow-fast tempo aria that even though it has the usual ABA form within the first tempo, Mozart did not entitle it a *rondò* (ABA'B':CC') as the second aria for the prima donna in other selected operas.²⁸⁰ A brief discussion of *rondò* occurs in the discussion of Donna Anna's second aria "Non mi dir," in Chapter 5.

"E Susanna non vien," the Countess' instrumental recitative, starts with an instrumental C chord, and the Contessa sings "And Susanna has not come" in the tune (G₄-G₄-C₅-C₅-B₄-C₄). It can be treated either as C major or G major. The undecided tonality is likely due to the exclamation of the Countess' beginning sentence, "È Susanna non vien!" (And Susanna hasn't come!) until the following accompanimental part includes an F-sharp that confirms the recitative begins in G major.

²⁷⁹ George Martin, *The Opera Companion*, (New York, NY: Amadeus Press, 2008), 223, accessed January 06, 2020, <https://books.google.com/books?id=MjTLYqOoi3kC&pg=PA220&lpg=PA220&dq=when+countess+agree+to+dress+as+susanna?&source=bl&ots=NpWBdS0Alh&sig=ACfU3U1-Yn5zmC9Q4VzWqNdP70XcpFSUIQ&hl=en&sa=X&ved=2ahUKEwj9i8yOsfDmAhWUbc0KHfW6DlwQ6AEwAHoECAoQAQ#v=onepage&q=when%20countess%20agree%20to%20dress%20as%20susanna%3F&f=false>.

²⁸⁰ Jessica Waldoff, *Recognition in Mozart Operas*, (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2006), 249.

Table 4-1: “E Susanna non vien! ... Dove sono i bei momenti”—Textual and Tonal Analysis, *Le Nozze di Figaro*, No. 20 Recitativo strumentato ed Aria²⁸¹

Text	Translation	Action	Affect	Tonal Color	Key Descriptions ²⁸²
Recitativo: [m. 1] E Susanna non vien! Sono ansiosa di saper come il Conte accolse la proposta. Alquanto ardito il progetto mi par, e ad uno sposo	And Susanna hasn't come! I am anxious to know how the Count received the proposal. Rather daring the plan I think, to one husband	waiting for Susanna; worrying about the plan, being afraid of her husband	anxious, worried	G major	Matt: ... insinuating and speaking; apt for both serious and merry things.
					Schu: ... every calm and satisfied passion, every tender gratitude for true friendship and faithful love.
					Vog: ... livelier, although not stormy. Naïve actions.
[m. 7] Sì vivace e geloso! Ma che mal c'è? Cangiando i miei vestiti con quelli di Susanna,	so quick (forceful) and jealous! But what harm in it? To change my clothes with those of Susanna,	stating, worrying, questioning	anxious, worried suspected, wondered	A minor	Matt: ... somewhat plaintive, honorable, and at ease, meaning it invites to sleep; but it is not unpleasant in this. Apart from that apt to incite compassion; Kircher: “This tone has a magnificent and serious affect which however can be used for flattery. Yes, the nature of this tone is rather moderate and can be used for a lot [of different] affects. Is at the same time moderate and sweet beyond measure.”
					Schu: ... pious womanliness, tenderness of character.
[m. 12] e i suoi coi miei al favor della notte. Oh cielo! A qual umil stato fatale io son ridotta da un consorte crudel! Che dopo avermi con un misto inaudito	and hers with mine, under cover of night. Heavens! To what humble state fatal I am reduced by a cruel consort! who, after he had me with a mixture unheard-of	questioning, feeling hurt	suspected, offended	D minor	Matt: ... humble, calm, at the same time grand, pleasant, and content, capable of promoting devotion in church pieces and peace of mind in secular pieces; for heroic or epic it is the best. Because it has besides its nimbleness also a dignity etc. Aristotle calls it serious and constant.
					Schu: ... melancholy womanliness, the spleen.
					Vog: ... representation of a storm; inner unrest, agitated, funeral march.
[m. 18]		stating, recalling		A minor	Matt: ... plaintive; honorable, apt to incite compassion. The tone has a magnificent and serious affect.

²⁸¹ Jane Bishop, “Dove sono: Libretto Translation (Italian-English),” *The Aria Database*, accessed January 02, 2020, <http://www.aria-database.com/search.php?sid=a454adeb7d37596818b9fa6a8b95ef89&X=1&individualAria=218> English translations modified by Meng-Jung Tsai.

²⁸² Abbreviations for the three authors, Mattheson as “Matt,” Schubart as “Schu,” and Vogler as “Vog.” The characteristic agreeing with the texts are highlighted in light red.

Text	Translation	Action	Affect	Tonal Color	Key Descriptions ²⁸²
d'infedeltà, di gelosia, di sdegni - prima amata, indi offesa, ed alfin tradita -	of infidelity, of jealousy and disdain - first loved me, then insulted, and finally betrayed -		angry, upset, depressed, offended		Schu: ... pious womanliness, tenderness of character.
[m. 24] fammi or cercar da una mia serva aita!	you let (force) me to seek from one my maid's help!	stating her mind	offended, upset, despairing	A minor/(F Major), A minor: vii/V, (B ^b Major /B ^b Minor) A minor	<p>Matt: [a] plaintive; honorable, apt to incite compassion. The tone has a magnificent and serious affect. [F] the most beautiful sentiments of the world, steadfastness, love, virtues. [B^b] pass both for great and for small matters; elevates the soul to [do] heavy/difficult things.</p> <p>Schu: [a] pious womanliness. tenderness. [F] complaisance and calm. [B^b] aspiration for a better world. [b^b] mocking God and the world; discontented with itself and with everything; preparation for suicide sounds in this key.</p> <p>Vog: [F] good for dead calm. [B^b] suggesting solitude.</p>
Aria: [m. 1] Dove sono i bei momenti di dolcezza e di piacer, dove andaro i giuramenti di quel labbro menzogner!	Where are the lovely moments of sweetness and pleasure; where they gone the oaths from that lip lying?	recalling, evoking the sweet memories, whimpering	sad, lonely, but also a feeling of cherished	C major	<p>Matt: ... has a rude and insolent character, but will not be inappropriate for boisterous dancing and where else one lets one's joy come forth without inhibition; but an able composer may re-baptize [the key] into something charming and sometimes even apply it to tender moments.</p> <p>Schu: ... pure; innocence, simplicity, naivety, children's talk.</p> <p>Vog: ... pure water arias, for pure subjects. A majestic key, full of gravity, splendid, the character required some charm.</p>
[m. 20] Perché mai, se in pianti e in	Why ever, if into tears and in	questioning, whimpering	sad, depressed	G major	<p>Matt: ... insinuating & speaking, apt for both serious and merry things.</p> <p>Schu: ... rustic & lyrical, calm & satisfied passion, gentle and peaceful emotion, faithful love.</p> <p>Vog: ... livelier, naïve actions, innocent rustic pleasures.</p>
[m. 22] pene per me tutto si cangiò,	pain, for me everything is changed,	questioning, whimpering	sad, depressed	G minor	<p>Matt: ... combines the seriousness w/ loveliness, tender, yearning, moderate lament.</p> <p>Schu: ... discontent, uneasiness, worry about failing, resentment & dislike.</p>

Text	Translation	Action	Affect	Tonal Color	Key Descriptions ²⁸²
[m. 27] la memoria	(Has) the memory	questioning, whimpering	depressed, despairing	G major	Matt: insinuating.
					Schu: faithful love, rustic, satisfied passion.
					Vog: naïve action, innocent rustic pleasures.
[m. 28] di quel bene	of that goodness	questioning, whimpering	depressed, despairing	A minor	Matt: plaintive, incite compassion.
					Schu: pious womanliness, tender.
[m. 29] dal mio sen non	from my breast	questioning, whimpering	depressed, despairing	C major	Matt: lets one's joy come forth w/o inhibition.
					Schu: innocent, simplicity.
					Vog: the character required some charm.
[m. 30] trapassò?	passed away?	questioning, whimpering	depressed, despairing	G major	Matt: insinuating.
					Schu: faithful love, rustic, satisfied passion.
					Vog: naïve action, innocent rustic pleasures.
[m. 32] la memoria	The memory	questioning, whimpering	depressed, despairing	A minor	Matt: plaintive, incite compassion.
					Schu: pious womanliness, tender.
[m. 33] di quel ben	of that goodness (joy)	questioning, whimpering	depressed, despairing	C major	Matt: lets one's joy come forth w/o inhibition.
					Schu: innocent, simplicity.
					Vog: the character required some charm.
[m. 34] non trapassò?	passed away?	questioning, whimpering	depressed, despairing	G major	Matt: insinuating.
					Schu: faithful love, rustic, satisfied passion.
					Vog: naïve action, innocent rustic pleasures.
Allegro: [m. 52] Ah! Se almen la mia costanza, nel languire amando ognor,	Ah! If only at least my constancy, amid its languishing still loves every hour,	gradually realizing the possibility	thrilled	C minor	Matt: lovely but sad.
					Schu: love and lament of unhappy love. All languishing, longing, sighing of love-sick soul.
					Vog: sadness.

Text	Translation	Action	Affect	Tonal Color	Key Descriptions ²⁸²
[m. 56-58 & 76-79] mi portasse una speranza di cangiar	Could bring me one hope of changing that	hoping to change	hopeful	C major/(F major on instr. part. m. 57-59, 77-79)	Matt: [C] lets one's joy come forth w/o inhibition. [F] magnanimity, steadfastness, love.
					Schu: [C] innocent, simplicity. [F] complaisance & calm.
					Vog: [C] majesty, full of gravity, splendid. [F] good for dead calm.
[m. 59 & 79] l'ingrato cor! di cangiar l'ingrato cor. Ah! Se almen la mia costanza,	ungrateful heart! of changing that ungrateful heart! Ah! If only at least my constancy,	hoping to change	hopeful, thrilled	C major Fixed.	Matt: lets one's joy come forth w/o inhibition.
					Schu: innocent, simplicity.
					Vog: majesty, full of gravity, splendid, broad & expanse rolling water.
[m. 74] nel languire amando	amid its languishing still loves	falling back to languish	weak	C minor	Matt: lovely but sad.
					Schu: love and lament of unhappy love. All languishing, longing, sighing of love-sick soul.
					Vog: sadness.
[m. 76] ognor mi portasse una speranza	every hour, Could bring me one hope	exerting herself, hoping, believing	loved (by herself), hopeful, positive	C major	Matt: lets one's joy come forth w/o inhibition.
					Schu: pure, innocent, simplicity.
					Vog: majesty, full of gravity, splendid, broad & expanse rolling water.
[m. 84-86 & 88-90] di cangiar	of changing that	exerting, hoping	determined, enlivened, strengthened	D major	Matt: obstinate, merry, war-like, uplifting, give inspiration to delicate things.
					Schu: triumph, war-cries, victory-rejoicing.
					Vog: enflames the heart, enlivened, stronger.
[m. 87 & 91] l'ingrato cor!	ungrateful heart!	hoping, believing	determined, strengthened	C major	Matt: boisterous dancing, lets one's joy come forth.
					Schu: pure, innocent, simplicity.
					Vog: majesty, full of gravity, splendid, broad & expanse rolling water.

The tonality changes along with the Countess' moods and reaches its climax "Fammi or cercar da una mia serva aita! (You force me to seek help from one of my maids!)" in an expressive A minor half-cadence,²⁸³ followed by an immediate shift to C major the aria starts in three quatrains of ABACC' form.

4.1.2.3 Application

- Tonal Colors in *Recitativo*: G – a – d – a/(F/B^b/b^b).

Due to the circumstance at the moment, the disturbed Countess will need to exchange dresses with Susanna, her chamber maid. The tonal centers continue to move into minor colors.

Abert states in *W.A. Mozart*:

The Countess is overcome by fear and anxiety at the thought of the hazardous step that she is planning to take in order to win back her husband's love, hence the recitative's constant vacillation between hesitation and the wish to press on..."²⁸⁴

There are no sharps or flats in the key signature and the orchestra begins with a C chord (m. 1) in a first inversion. The Countess singing "E Susanna non vien!" with an ascending fourth in the first two notes of the melody looks seemingly to be in C. However, the tonality provides some ambiguities of whether C major or G major is the key center until the presence of the F-sharp (m. 1 in the orchestra part) establishes a tonal color of G major (mm. 1–8). The anxious lady is alone, talking to herself "E Susanna non vien! Sono ansiosa..." (And Susanna hasn't come! I am anxious...), in which she *insinuates* (G major, Mattheson) some things that may be going to happen. Susanna is not only her chambermaid but is the one with the *tender gratitude for true friendship and faithful love* (G major, Schubart). Their plan, by any means *naïve actions* (G

²⁸³ Waldorf, 94.

²⁸⁴ Abert, 965.

major, Vogler) from the audiences' point of view, still causes anxiety in the Countess. She is wondering how her husband, the Count, will receive their proposal.

Speaking of her husband, the Countess is even more terrified and *plaintive* (A minor, Mattheson), because the Count is “sì vivace e geloso” (so forceful and jealous, mm. 7–8). The *honorable* (A minor, Mattheson) wife is like a *pious woman tenderly* (A minor, Schubart) asking herself, “Ma che mal c'è?” (But what harm in it? m. 9). She *plaintively* says, “To change my *honorable* (A minor, Mattheson) clothes with those of a maid?”, attempting to *incite compassion* (Mattheson). To exchange the clothes with her maid, the Countess must lower her *dignity* to a *humble* state (D minor, Mattheson) that she exclaims, “Oh cielo! A qual umil stato fatale io son ridotta da un consorte crudel!” (Heavens! To what *humble* and fatal state, I am reduced by a cruel husband! mm. 12–17). As Waldoff states, “class distinctions still remain at the heart of the opera [*Le Nozze di Figaro*].”²⁸⁵ This *melancholy woman* vents her *spleen* (D minor, Schubart) about her cruel husband. Inside of her is *stormy inner unrest* (D minor, Vogler) and the Countess has to endure “an unheard-of mixture of infidelity.”²⁸⁶ This unfaithful, jealous, and disdainful husband first loved her, then insulted her, and finally betrayed her, which hurts her feelings and her *magnificent and serious affect* (A minor, Mattheson). Now forced by her husband, Rosina, a *pious and tender woman* (A minor, Schubart), exclaims *plaintively*, “Can you not see my *honor* (A minor, Mattheson), my *love* and *constancy* (*steadfastness*, F major, Mattheson)? You force me to seek help from my maid, to *incite compassion* (A minor, Mattheson) from Susanna, that I have to be *calmly* (F major, Schubart

²⁸⁵ Waldoff, 90.

²⁸⁶ Bishop, “Dove sono: Libretto Translation,” *The Aria Database*, modified by Tsai.

and Vogler) *complaisant* (F major, Schubart) to put on a servant's clothes?"

Mozart employs the properties of A minor to not only introduce Rosina, the role's *plaintive, honorable* personality and *serious affect* (Mattheson), but also uses the A minor characteristic—to *incite compassion* (Mattheson)—to establish the development of Rosina's state of mind in accordance with Da Ponte's texts. Mozart builds up in the *recitativo accompagnato* an A minor (mm. 24–25) outburst “Fammi or cercar da una mia serva aida” to express her complex feelings.²⁸⁷ Among this A minor half-cadence ending, it is interesting to mention that “Fammi” (F chord, m. 24) also has properties of F major—the *most beautiful sentiments of the world, steadfastness, love and virtues* (Mattheson), which represents the quality of the Countess; “cercar” (FAD[#], m. 24, the 3rd beat) borrows the dominant seventh of B^b major/B^b minor to imply—to *retain a certain modesty and can therefore pass both great and small matters* (Mattheson), *aspiration for a better world* (Schubart), *mocking God and the world, discontented with itself and with everything* (B^b minor, Schubart) —and the tonal center returns to A minor at the third beat in measure 25 to prepare entering the aria in C major. The Countess *plaintively* (A minor, Mattheson) seeks the “help” (“aita”) of her maid, as the A minor color *incites compassion* (A minor, Mattheson).

- Tonal Colors in *Aria*: C – G – g – GaCG – C – c – C/(F) – C – c – C – (D) – C.
[Andantino] [Allegro]

In her C major aria “Dove sono i bei momenti,” the Countess recalls the sweet and *tender moments* (C major, Mattheson) she used to have with her husband. Those sweet beautiful moments are like *paintings* (C major, Vogler) in her mind, and suddenly tranquilize her

²⁸⁷ Waldoff, 92.

complex feeling from a “troubled present.”²⁸⁸ Abert describes this moment when he writes “There is great psychological subtlety, therefore, to the way in which the aria begins by recalling a happier past.”²⁸⁹ When the *innocent* and *naïve* recollection comes, she immerses herself deeply in past joyful *purity* and simplicity (C major, Schubart) though the *character required some charm* (C major, Vogler) is also applicable for the situation. In measures 13–18, as the Countess, depressed with her current situation, thinks about that lying lip “quel labbro menzogner” of her *rude and insolent* (C major, Mattheson) husband, she desperately *requires some charm* (C major, Vogler).

The first quatrain of the aria remains in C major “without modulating to any other key,”²⁹⁰ and the second begins in the dominant, G major (mm. 19–34). The sweeter and simpler past now is changed into tears, as *insinuating* (G major, Mattheson) her *faithful love* and *gentle peaceful emotion* (G major, Schubart) are turning into tearful *lament* and painful *yearning* (G minor, Mattheson). Those *naïve actions* and *innocent rustic pleasures* (G major, Vogler) are changed into *uneasy discontent* and *resentment* (G minor, Schubart). The memory of *merry and amorous things* seems already passed away from her breast. All her dreams have been awakened by the woodwinds²⁹¹ playing in G major, and Abert continues to state “with the modulation to G minor we find the voice entering into veritable dialogue with the winds, before inveighing against fate in tones that are all the more moving for being so subdued.”²⁹² Mozart

²⁸⁸ Waldoff, 92.

²⁸⁹ Abert, 966.

²⁹⁰ *Ibid.*

²⁹¹ *Ibid.*

²⁹² *Ibid.*

shifts the tonal center to its parallel G minor (the eighth upbeat to m. 22), when she mentions “pene” (pain).

The aria returns to the first quatrain (mm. 37–50) to create the ABA form of the *andantino* part, as Abert describes “memory retains the upper hand,”²⁹³ and Rosina immerses herself in the sweet dreams again. Regardless how beautiful the moment was, her thoughts are destroyed by those lying lips, “quel labbro menzogner” (mm. 50–51). She now *laments of her unhappy love* (C minor, Schubart) *sadly* (Mattheson & Vogler) singing, “Ah! If only at least my constancy, amid its *languishing, longing and sighing* (C minor, Schubart) still *loves* every hour. My constancy (*steadfastness*) and my love (mm. 56–59 & 76–79, the orchestra, F major, Mattheson) could bring me one hope to change that ungrateful heart!” When she makes this promise, her determination sounds *majestic, full of gravity, and splendid* (C major, Vogler, mm. 56–63). The Countess determines to *let her joy and willpower come forth without inhibition* (C major, Mattheson mm. 56–73). Firmness and *full of gravity* (C major, Vogler) now raises above other character attributes—pure, innocence, simplicity, naivety, majestic, splendid. Abert describes:

With the following allegro, her hopes are rekindled. The second section of the aria is clear proof of the psychological resolve that lies dormant in the Countess’s heart, in spite of her emotional tenderness. On a formal level, too, this section is exceptional in that it modulates only briefly at the words ‘nel languire amando ognor’ (‘always yearning lovingly for him’). But the modulation – from C major to C minor – is all the more effective as a result, with the melodic line freely following the text and with only the actual thought of hope repeatedly rising up from the waves of the Countess’s agitation...²⁹⁴

Her determination has a sudden retreat back when singing “nel languire amando ognor” (amid

²⁹³ Abert, 966.

²⁹⁴ Ibid.

its languishing still loves, mm. 74–75). Amid her *languishing* and *sighing* heart (C minor, Schubart), the Countess soon pulls herself together again with determination.

With the appearance of B-flat in the orchestra at measure 58 and 78, F major shadows the Countess' vocal line in C major. It may have two interpretations: 1) force strengthened: the Countess' *magnanimity* (Mattheson) and hope for a change is adding a *steadfast* (Mattheson) force of *love* (Mattheson) for the Count; 2) force weakened: the Countess' determination for changing is slightly shaken by her *complaisance* (Schubart) and wishes to be *calm* (Schubart & Vogler).

From measure 80 to 84, the Countess' C major motif ascends "higher and higher"²⁹⁵ from "mi portasse" (m. 80) to "di cangiar" (mm. 85–86). Astonishingly, Mozart composes the ascending melodic line to arrive at A₅ (m. 85 & 89), instead of G₅. I believe the purpose for which Mozart composes the A₅ is based on Da Ponte's text "cangiar." The word means "to change," and in order to do so, he chooses A₅ (not G₅ which would remain in C major), which then must be supported by a slightly different tonal color. As a result, the melody line is accompanied with C-sharp and F-sharp in the orchestra to cause a D major tonal color for the Countess' "cangiar"—the changing. I consider the composer's purpose of the embedded A₅ as the transformational moment of the Countess, or the awakening of "the spirit of the earlier Rosine."²⁹⁶ The Contessa emphasizes "di cangiar" (of changing) twice (mm. 85-86 & mm. 89-90) with D major color to show her strength. Kaiser states:

The high A not only comes as the climax and top note of the aria, held for an entire

²⁹⁵ Abert, 966.

²⁹⁶ Ibid.

brilliant bar, but it shifts precisely at ‘cangiar’, at ‘change’, returning via A flat to G and ending in a regular C major cadence. Here we are direct witness of how lustrously the desired transformation from a painful feeling of exclusion into the ‘homecoming’ triadic harmony is effected.²⁹⁷

The music dramatist endows the protagonist with *much stronger* (D major, Vogler) force. Her will is set *obstinately* (D major, Mattheson) and she is ready for *war* (D major, Mattheson, Schubart & Vogler). The “A₅” is *enflaming* her *heart* and *enlivening* her *body*, and her mind also *welters in heroic deeds* (D major, Vogler). Now Rosina is firm and unswerving with the hope to change that ungrateful husband.

As provided by the analysis above, the treatment of key characteristics supports Da Ponte’s text, which, written in 1786 before the French Revolution, offers new enlightening thoughts regarding social, economic, and even sexual inequality, which Da Ponte adopted from Beaumarchais’ play. Linda Lister writes that “Da Ponte called his libretto ‘an imitation, or let us say, an extract’²⁹⁸ of Beaumarchais’s play. The opera addressed the issues of sexual and social inequality, but the sociopolitical criticism had to be recast in a different way to suit the climate of Vienna in 1786 instead of Paris in 1784.”²⁹⁹ In the period of differing gender treatment, Da Ponte gave the Countess one hope to “change,” not that of her husband, but herself. From a *tender, pure* and *innocent* character, Mozart, with tonal changing, helped Rosina change into a woman with *strong* determination—a character now firm and *full of gravity*.

4.2 Susanna

4.2.1 Character Background

²⁹⁷ Abert, 966.

²⁹⁸ Dennis Arundell, “Dove sono Le nozze di Figaro?” *Opera* 35, no. 6, 1984, 178, quoted in Lister.

²⁹⁹ Lister, “Censor in Eighteenth-Century Opera.”

“Sir, I am a poor maidservant, you are my master. You were born a gentleman, I a wretched woman; but we have two things equally, and those are reason and honour” (“ma due cose eguali abbiam noi, e sono queste la ragione e l’onore”).³⁰⁰ So says Pamela in the play *La Pamela* (1756) by Carlo Goldoni based on Samuel Richardson’s novel. Similarly, Susanna is a chamber maid with this kind of mettle in Beaumarchais’ play, and in Mozart’s opera. The maidservant who Da Ponte and Mozart bring into *Nozze di Figaro* is a character of wit and force, the “general and strategist,”³⁰¹ and as Cairn quotes Nicolas Hytner in *Mozart and His*

Operas:

...and there Susanna, the one person who never worries about her role, her job, her position, can make time stand still. For everyone but Susanna, the opera is a voyage of self-discovery. Susanna seems to know herself from the first bar of the opera; and at the end of it...³⁰²

She is the character, who is “the only principal character not already familiar to the Viennese public”³⁰³ from Paisiello’s *Il Barbiere di Siviglia* (1782), and now stands in from the very beginning of the opera and partakes in every ensemble. She is clever and understands lots of things. When Figaro still believes that the Count has abrogated the *droit de Seigneur*, Susanna reminds Figaro “bada bene, appetito gli viene... Della tua Susannetta.” (“mind you, his appetite comes... for your own little Susanna.”)³⁰⁴ She thinks more thoroughly than Figaro, and senses things instinctively and comprehensively. For example, in Act 2, scene 3, when she returns to the Countess’ room, discovering the Count preparing to accuse the Countess,

³⁰⁰ Carlo Goldoni, *La Pamela*, quoted in Brigid Brophy, *Mozart the Dramatist* (London: Faber and Faber, 1964), 48.

³⁰¹ Brophy, 109.

³⁰² Cairns, 123.

³⁰³ Ibid.

³⁰⁴ Da Ponte, translation from *DM’s Opera Site*, modified by Tsai.

Susanna perceives the situation immediately. As Cairns describes, Susanna’s personality is “warm-hearted but sharp-eyed, resourceful, alert, a woman of strong feelings but fully in command of them, and cleverer than Figaro, for all his invincible belief in his cleverness.”³⁰⁵

4.2.2 Deh vieni non tardar

4.2.2.1 Situational Synopsis

At this point in the drama, the final act, Susanna arrives with the Countess to the castle gardens. It is evening and chilly. They have exchanged an article of clothing or two, perhaps a hooded cloak, in order to disguise themselves as each other. They are met by Marcellina who informs them that Figaro is nearby, has learned of the note Susanna sent to the Count, and is filled with jealousy. Marcellina and the Countess leave the scene and Susanna whispers under her breath, speaking of Figaro, “The rascal is eavesdropping. We’ll have some fun too, and pay him back for his suspicions.”³⁰⁶

4.2.2.2 Textual and Tonal Analysis

Being aware of Figaro nearby, Susanna reacts in a solo *recitativo accompagnato* followed by an aria that carries multiple thoughts, actions, and emotions. Mozart explicitly divided these actions or shifting thoughts tonally as well. Having discovered these changes of tonal centers and actions/thoughts, I projected the character’s affects and compared them with the key descriptions in Table 4-2.

4.2.2.3 Application

- Tonal Colors in *Recitativo*: C – a – F – B^b – F.

³⁰⁵ Cairns, 123.

³⁰⁶ Da Ponte, translation from *DM’s Opera Site*.

In discussions of Susanna, I have found scholars always describe her as having so many charms and strengths. Before analyzing this particular aria, singers need to bear in mind that Susanna now is disguised in the Countess' clothes. Susanna sings her first line of *recitativo accompagnato*, "Giunse alfin il momento" (G₄-G₄-C₅-C₅-B₄-C₅-C₅) with the same melodic fragment as the Countess uses when she sings her "E Susanna non vien!" (G₄-G₄-C₅-C₅-B₄-C₅) at the beginning of her Act 3 recitative and aria. However, Susanna sings the Countess' melody—in an explicit key of C major, established with the orchestral prelude. Rosina sings her line preceded by a single orchestral C major inversion chord which has the possibility to be the tonality of C major or G major. Rosina's first line has tonal ambiguity due to her emotional uncertainty. Then the orchestra sets the tonal center in G major at the end of measure one in the Countess' recitative.³⁰⁷ It is very likely that Mozart chose C major for the initial tonality for Susanna's recitative because the Countess' aria "Dove sono" in Act 3 is also in C major.

By this time in the drama Susanna and the Countess have exchanged cloaks, very often hooded cloaks in productions.³⁰⁸ It is also very likely that Susanna is playing her "Countess" part *completely pure* (C major, Schubart & Vogler) and with *innocence* (C major, Schubart), or, as her first line demonstrates she sighs "At last the moment is arrived that I shall *let my joy come forth without inhibition* (C major, Mattheson) into the arms of my beloved."

³⁰⁷ As previously described in the section of the Countess' recitative and aria, "E Susanna non vien!" in Act 3, scene 8. Her hesitation with the exclamation mark offers an uncertain tonality. The tonality becomes certain in G major after the orchestra comes in with the F-sharp.

³⁰⁸ This allows Susanna to play two characters at the same time. She sings the Countess's melodic fragment, in the Countess's cloak, as the tonality of C Major reveals Susanna in disguise. This operatic convention is meant to deceive the characters in the drama, not the audience. Another example of such a use of cloaks for disguise is found in Act 2 of *Don Giovanni* with Don Giovanni and Leporello. All other five principle characters are duped by this simple disguise.

Table 4-2: “Giunse alfin il momento... Deh vieni non tardar”—Textual and Tonal Analysis, *Le nozze di Figaro*, No. 28 Recitativo instrumentato ed Aria³⁰⁹

Text	Translation	Action	Affect	Tonal Color	Key Descriptions ³¹⁰
Recitativo: [m. 5] Giunse alfin il momento che godrò senz'affanno in braccio all'idol mio.	At last arrived at the moment that I will without reservation in the arms of lover mine (be).	declaring intention	excited, relieved	C major	Matt: ... a character of rude and insolent... where else one lets one's joy come forth without inhibition... something charming and sometimes tender moments.
					Schu: ... completely pure, innocence, simplicity, naivety, children's talk.
					Vog: ... the key fit for a painting, for pure water arias, pure subjects... A majestic key, full of gravity... charm, splendid.
[m. 12] Timide cure, uscite dal mio petto, a turbar non venite il mio diletto!	Timid care, be banished from my heart, and come not to disturb my joy.	telling herself not to worry	calm, soothed	A minor	Matt: ... plaintive, honorable, and at ease, meaning it invites to sleep... “Kircher: ... a magnificent and serious affect which however can be used for flattery...”
					Schu: Pious womanliness and tenderness of character.
[m. 17] Oh come par che all'amoroso foco l'amenità del loco, la terra e il ciel risponda,	Oh how it seems the amorous fire the beauties of this place, the earth and the sky respond.	enjoying and observing	content	F major	Matt: ...the most beautiful sentiments of the world, magnanimity, steadfastness, love, or... top list of virtues, and all this in such natural and incompatible ease that no coercion is involved...
					Schu: Complaisance and calm.
					Vog: ... good for dead calm... with a quiet joy in happy shades of Elysium.
[m. 22] Come la notte i furti miei seconda!	As the night to my ruses supports!	snickering	happy, amused	B ^b major	Matt: ... entertaining but retains a modesty, can pass both for great and small matters.
					Schu: ... cheerful love, clear conscience.
					Vog: ... calm, pleasant, certain tenderness.

³⁰⁹Libretto and English Translation, “Deh! Vieni non tardar”, Opera-Arias, accessed May 10, 2016, <http://www.opera-arias.com/mozart/le-nozze-di-figaro/deh-vieni-non-tardar/> English translations modified by Meng-Jung Tsai.

³¹⁰ Abbreviations for the three authors, Mattheson as “Matt,” Schubart as “Schu,” and Vogler as “Vog.”The characteristic agreeing with the texts are highlighted in light red.

Text	Translation	Action	Affect	Tonal Color	Key Descriptions ³¹⁰
Aria: [m. 1] Deh, vieni, non tardar, oh gioia bella, vieni ove amore per goder t'appella, finché non splende in ciel notturna face,	Ah, come, do not delay, O beautiful joy, come where love for comforts that calls you, until no more shines in the sky the night's torch,	asking love to come and enjoying the moment	supported, tender, loving	F major	Matt: ... the most beautiful sentiments of the world, magnanimity, steadfastness, love, or... top list of virtues, and all this in such natural and incompatible ease that no coercion is involved... Schu: Complaisance and calm. Vog: ... good for dead calm...with a quiet joy in happy shades of Elysium.
[m. 16] finché l'aria è ancor bruna e il mondo tace. Qui mormora il ruscel, qui scherza l'aura, che col dolce sussurro il cor ristaura,	Until the air is still dark and the world is silent. Here murmurs the brook, here plays the breeze, that with sweet whisper the heart restores,	appreciating the beauty (help) of nature	appreciative, serene	C major	Matt: ... a character of rude and insolent... where else one lets one's joy come forth without inhibition... something charming and sometimes tender moments. Schu: ... completely pure, innocence, simplicity, naivety, children's talk. Vog: ... the key fit for a painting, for pure water arias, pure subjects... A majestic key, full of gravity... charm, splendid.
[m. 26] qui ridono i fioretti e l'erba è fresca, ai piaceri d'amor qui tutto adesca. Vieni, ben mio, tra queste piante ascese, ti vo' la fronte incoronar di rose.	Here laugh the flowers and the grass is fresh, To the pleasures of love here all attract. Come, love mine, through these plants sheltered, You I wish the forehead crowned with roses.	appreciating the help of nature, asking her lover to come enjoy with her	mellow, delighted, expectant	F major	Matt: ... the most beautiful sentiments of the world, magnanimity, steadfastness, love, or... top list of virtues, and all this in such natural and incompatible ease that no coercion is involved... Schu: Complaisance and calm. Vog: ... good for dead calm... with a quiet joy in happy shades of Elysium.

As Abert describes Susanna's personality, "In keeping with her [Susanna's] character, she does so, not by expressing any over-emotional moral indignation but with a candid humour that allows her true thoughts to be heard behind the mask that she has assumed—if only Figaro would listen."³¹¹ As a clever and nimble girl like her, she swiftly puts up a scheme to overthrow Figaro's jealousy.³¹²

Her teasing is more playful and *flattery* (A minor, Mattheson). She uses a *tender* (A minor, Schubart) sound singing, "Timid care, be banished from my heart, go *sleep* and rest at *ease* (Mattheson), and come not to disturb my joy." In this A minor section (mm. 12–17) Mozart seems to focus on a different affect from the same tonality found in the Countess' recitative portion in "Dove sono." Here, Susanna does not feel *plaintive*, but she is *flattering* (A minor, Mattheson). Abert states, "Nor can it be mere chance that Susanna reveals her own feelings here, rather than play the part of the Countess, for all that she is dressed as the latter."³¹³ However sophisticated as Susanna is, she is not merely expressing her own emotions, but she is also taking care of everything. Assumably, she also needs to present *a magnificent and serious affect* (A minor, Mattheson), and feelings of a *pious womanliness* and *tenderness* (A minor, Schubart), as she is on a disguised mission.

Mozart employs F major (recit. mm. 18–21 & aria) to sculpt the scheming scene of "jealousy into a depiction of *natural* emotion."³¹⁴ Susanna praises the *beauty* of the environment, "come par che all' amoroso foco l' amenità del loco, la terra e il ciel responda" (Oh

³¹¹ Abert, 972.

³¹² Kaiser, 170.

³¹³ Abert, 972.

³¹⁴ Kaiser, 170.

how it seems the *love* fire the *beauties* of this place, the earth and the sky *calmly* [Schubart & Vogler] respond, mm. 18–21), as *all this in such natural and incompatible ease that no coercion is involved* (F major, Mattheson). Moreover, the night here aids her *entertaining* game (m. 22–23), which *can* help her *pass both great and small matters* (B^b major, Mattheson). The *calm* and *pleasant* (B^b major, Vogler) night furthers her designs, saying with her *clear conscience* (B^b major, Schubart).

- Tonal Colors in *Aria*: F – C – F.

In her F major aria “Deh vieni, non tardar,” Susanna acts in *complaisance* (Schubart) and *calm* (Schubart & Vogler), tenderly and lovingly singing, “Come, do not delay, o *beautiful* (Mattheson) *joy* (Vogler), come where *love* (Mattheson) for comforts as *good for dead calm* (Vogler), where love for comforts as *in such natural and incomparable ease* (Mattheson). F major in Mattheson’s list provides much more explanation:

F major is capable to express the most beautiful sentiments of the world, be it magnanimity, steadfastness, love, or whatever else is on top of the list of virtues, and all this in such a natural way and incompatible ease that no coercion is involved. Yes, the gentleness and character of this tone cannot be described in different terms than to compare it to a beautiful person whom everything he does, and be it as it could, makes look perfect, and who, as the French say, has *bonne grace*.³¹⁵

Susanna, a person with many great strengths (*a beautiful person whom everything she does, and be it as it could, makes look perfect, and who has bonne grace*), expresses the most *beautiful sentiments of the world*—love and nature. Of course, she is scheming to trick Figaro, “hence her decision to test him and see whether, in his jealousy, he can still understand the true language of her heart.”³¹⁶ Mozart furnishes this aria with *all this in such a natural and way*

³¹⁵ Mattheson, trans. Hendrick Schulze.

³¹⁶ Abert, 972.

and incompatible ease that no coercion is involved (F major, Mattheson).

For F major, Schubart and Vogler assign the characteristics of *complaisance and calm*, and *with a quiet joy in happy shades of Elysium*. From this perspective, Susanna disguises herself under her mistress' cloak, and not only does she present the Countess' elegance and *complaisance*, but also "an inner freedom that is capable of combining seriousness (*calm*) of purpose and playfulness (*a quiet joy in happy shades*) with an outstanding sense of humour."³¹⁷

It is worth mentioning the credit given to Da Ponte's text as "an example of Rococo poetry pure and simple, ... with its meticulously detailed tone-painting of all the individual features that make up the landscape—the stream, the caressing breeze, the smiling flowers and so on."³¹⁸ Here Mozart echoes the texts with Schubart's and Vogler's C major characteristics (mm. 16–26)—Susanna's words are like a *painting* (Vogler) of nature, *pure and simple* (Schubart), "Here murmurs the brook, here plays the breeze, that with sweet whisper the heart restores."³¹⁹ C major also suggests a tint of the Countess' temperaments.

The tonal center returns to F major at measure 26. Susanna conveys *the most beautiful sentiments of the world, which is love*. She sings, "Here, with *love* (Mattheson), the flowers laugh, the grass is fresh. Everything attracts, *all this in such a natural way and incompatible ease that no coercion is involved* (Mattheson), to the pleasures of love, *calmly* (Schubart & Vogler) waiting for you! Come with *complaisance* (Schubart) through the sheltered plants. Here I would crown your forehead with beautiful roses, and you and I would *appear to agree*

³¹⁷ Ibid.

³¹⁸ Ibid.

³¹⁹ Da Ponte, trans. *DM's Opera Site*.

especially with a quiet joy in happy shades of Elysium (Vogler)."

There is little tonal color shift in "Deh vieni, non tardar," compared with the other Mozart's arias in this study. The tonal color in this aria shifts only from tonic, dominant, then back to tonic (F – C – F, i.e., I – V – I). Regarding Barbarina's aria (e.g., "L'ho perduta," f – c – f – c – f – b^b – f – G^b/g^b – C) and Zerlina's two arias (e.g., "Verdrai, carino," C – G – C – d – C – d – C), there are more tonal colors explored than the color shifts in Susanna's serenade. The question is, why did Mozart structure a simple aria, in terms of tonal centers, in this disguised, culminating moment? From the very beginning, Susanna always appears in the center of the whole opera. Did Mozart do so intentionally, as Da Ponte adapted the text from Beaumarchais' play and supplied more lines for Susanna's "Deh vieni, non tardar"? Richard Andrews describes:

The culminating moment in this process comes in the fourth principal episode added to the story by Da Ponte: Susanna's serenade in the final act, 'Deh, vieni, non tardar'. Here again Da Ponte comes up with a text which is more complex, more laden with irony, than that of Beaumarchais, even as he exploits a situation which the French dramatist had created. Susanna knows that her Figaro is eavesdropping in the dark, full of jealous fury, convinced that after all she is going to give herself, or sell herself, to the Count. She is determined to make him suffer a little, to make him learn in his turn the appropriate 'lesson' on love and trust. '[D]iamogli la merce dei dubbi suoi' ('let's give him what he deserves for his doubting'), she sings in the recitative. (It has been observed in relation to *Le mariage* that everyone in this story has a lesson of some kind to learn.) She therefore sings what Figaro will interpret as a loving serenade of invitation to the approaching Count. But we know that she is singing for Figaro, and that in the end these feelings of anticipation can only be addressed to him:

Come, my treasure: among these hidden trees
I want to crown your forehead . . . with roses.

Full of resentful pique, Susanna proposes to 'crown a forehead', knowing that Figaro will mentally complete the phrase with an allusion to his own horns as a cuckold: full also of love, she wants to 'crown with roses' a forehead which she pretends will be the Count's, but which in the end we know can only be her husband's.³²⁰

³²⁰ Richard Andrews, "From Beaumarchais to Da Ponte: A New View of the Sexual Politics of 'Figaro'," *Music & Letters* 82, no. 2 (2001): 225, accessed March 19, 2020. www.jstor.org/stable/3526059.

The most feasible explanation for fewer tonal shifts is that Susanna wishes to be simple, so that Figaro could realize easily her *magnanimity* and *steadfastness* (Mattheson) to him; she also wants him to learn how to be *complaisant* (Schubart) and *calm* (Schubart & Vogler), as she has these two merits and has executed these for a long time. In addition, Susanna would love to test Figaro by not shifting her tonal centers too much. Could Figaro recognize her genuine affection behind her simple voice? According to Martha Nussbaum, the outcome that Susanna desired is “a loving husband focused on affection and pleasure, rather than revenge and jealousy.”³²¹ The answer is revealed later in the Act 4 “Finale” about which Martha Nussbaum states, “until, interestingly, Figaro does at least recognize Susanna by her voice, ‘the voice that I love’.”³²² Figaro does recognize her voice, singing “Pace, pace, mio dolce tesoro: io conobbi la voce che adoro” (Peace, peace, my sweet treasure: I recognized the voice which I adore). Susanna has her loving husband back, as Richard Andrews describes, “Susanna becomes the ‘winning subject’ of a comedy, singing her tender ironic serenade in a natural setting ‘under the pine trees’: thus she conquers the theatre, dominates Figaro, and wins in the name of the women this power contest against the men.”³²³ Susanna does indeed give Figaro a lesson!

³²¹ Martha C. Nussbaum, “Equality and Love at the End of *The Marriage of Figaro*: Forging Democratic Emotions,” *Journal of Human Development and Capabilities*, 11:3, (2010), 411, accessed March 19, 2020, DOI: 10.1080/19452829.2010.495514.

³²² Ibid.

³²³ Andrews, “From Beaumarchais to Da Ponte,” 226.

CHAPTER 5

DONNA ANNA AND ZERLINA IN *DON GIOVANNI*

Don Giovanni, the two act opera with its complete title *Il dissolute punito, ossia il Don Giovanni*, was premiered at the National Theater (of Bohemia) in Prague, on October 29, 1787.³²⁴ Teresa Saporiti was the premiere Donna Anna, and Teresita (Caterina) Bondini performed the first Zerlina in the Prague production.³²⁵ Da Ponte was the librettist because of the success of *Le nozze di Figaro*, and as he claimed in his *Memoirs*, it was his idea to suggest the subject of *Don Giovanni* to Mozart.³²⁶ The opera *Don Giovanni* was considered a *dramma giocoso*, meaning ‘comical drama’—an Italian opera featuring both aspects of comedy and tragedy in the plot.³²⁷ From Da Ponte’s recollection, Cairns states “Mozart had to be persuaded to make the work a comedy. The coexistence of serious and comic is the essence of Mozartian opera.”³²⁸ According to Abert, neither the poet, nor the librettist regarded the possibility of adding serious elements in the story of *Don Juan*: “all that they wanted to create was an effective *opera buffa*.”³²⁹ The serious elements, however, are the reason Mozart intendedly created “a good comic opera.”³³⁰ Mozart’s ideal arrangement, which Cairns describes from Mozart’s letter of May 1783, is to set out “two equally good female roles, one of them must be

³²⁴ Michael F. Robinson, “The ‘Comic’ Element in ‘Don Giovanni,’” in *Opera Guide Series: Don Giovanni by Wolfgang Amadeus Mozart*, ed. Nicholas John (London: John Calder Ltd., 1983), 7.

³²⁵ Abert, 1021-22.

³²⁶ *Ibid.*, 1016.

³²⁷ Robinson, 8.

³²⁸ Cairns, *Mozart and His Operas*, 144.

³²⁹ Abert, 1024 & 757: It is likely that Leopold Mozart’s death (1719-1787) in May that year had quaked Mozart unexpectedly.

³³⁰ Cairns, 156.

seria, the other mezzo carattere—the roles must be equal in quality.”³³¹ Donna Anna, in *Don Giovanni*’s situation here, would be the *seria* character, while Donna Elvira would be the *mezzo carattere*.³³² Cairns does not mention a third female character in Mozart’s true comic plan: “The third female can be entirely *buffa*.”³³³ The entirely *buffa* female is Zerlina. The investigation of key characteristics illuminates the significance of these two roles and the dramatic differences between them.

5.1 Donna Anna

5.1.1 Character Background

The role of Donna Anna has been extended in Da Ponte’s and Mozart’s creation. Before Da Ponte adopted Bertati’s libretto, the role of Donna Anna stayed within the walls of the nunnery, waiting for Don Ottavio to give her vengeance.³³⁴ Abert states:

.... The most radical change undertaken by Da Ponte, the expansion of the role of Donna Anna, who in Bertati’s version had disappeared from the opera after the opening scene, waiting for Ottavio to avenge her dishonor within the walls of a convent. In Da Ponte’s version she is permanently involved in the action as Don Giovanni’s most resolute adversary.³³⁵

He further indicates that the character expansion of Donna Anna should be credited to Mozart’s request. As previously described about the roles in a good comic opera, James Webster also mentions this, as demonstrated from Mozart’s letter to his father in 1783:

The importance of all this to Mozart is implied by his almost schematic demands regarding the number of roles in a *buffa* plot, and the relations among the female

³³¹ Ibid.

³³² Ibid.: “Elvira – the in-between role, between seria and buffa – is equal in quality and in importance to Anna.”

³³³ James Webster, “The Analysis of Mozart’s Arias” in *Mozart Studies*, ed. Cliff Eisen (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1991), 106.

³³⁴ Abert, 1043.

³³⁵ Ibid.

characters; demands that reflected the singing personnel of the new Italian troupe in Vienna:

I suppose that Varesco... could write a new libretto for me, with seven characters... The most necessary thing is that it be truly comic as a whole, and if possible include two equally good female roles: the one must be seria, the other mezzo carattere; but in quality both roles must be entirely the same. The third female can be entirely buffa.³³⁶

Thus, the role of Donna Anna has two solid arias and a significant number of ensembles in the opera (just as the role of Donna Elvira and Zerlina). Abert states “Donna Anna owes her undeniable dramatic life not to the librettist but the composer.”³³⁷

Regarding Donna Anna’s true character or her personality, it is never fair to assert that Donna Anna’s character is merely “distraught, excitable, instable, very emphatic and highly strung.”³³⁸ From the very beginning of the play Donna Anna has been assaulted by a masked/cloaked scoundrel (which is Don Giovanni, and Donna Anna does not realize this yet), and she has witnessed her father’s death. Anyone who has been through these sorts of situations would be led into the emotional reactions raised above. So, when unwrapping her original self, it should be considered from after the incident is resolved, which is after “Don Giovanni, the scoundrel, has gone to the Devil.”³³⁹ The larghetto duet (mm. 712–740) of Donna Anna and Don Ottavio in the Act 2 Finale presents her true personality. She has a faithful heart to love her betrothed and her father. From her texts “My dearest let me mourn for one year

³³⁶ James Webster, “The Analysis of Mozart’s Arias” in *Mozart Studies*, ed. Cliff Eisen (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1991), 106. Mozart’s letter to Leopold Mozart (May 7th, 1783) in *Times New Roman*.

³³⁷ Abert, 1043.

³³⁸ Kaiser, 19.

³³⁹ *Ibid.*, 21.

more" ("Lascia, o caro, un anno ancora, allo sfogo del mio cor," Act 2 Final),³⁴⁰ she demonstrates her decision to delay her matrimony, and her determination. As a matter of fact, she reveals her determination in swearing to avenge for her father.

Donna Anna in Mozart and Da Ponte's version is imbued with courage. The two creators nurture Donna Anna with a courageous and strong personality. Instead of being put "within the walls of a convent,"³⁴¹ Donna Anna wishes to fight for herself and urges her betrothed to come with her. Though she resembles the character Elettra from Mozart's *Idomeneo*, who is strong and preoccupied with revenge, Donna Anna has no psychological "Electra complex."

5.1.2 Non mi dir, bell'idol mio

5.1.2.1 Situational Synopsis

Donna Anna's second aria, "Crudele! Ah no, mio bene!... Non mi dir, bell'idol mio," is in Act 2, scene 12. Following the graveyard scene, this scene happens in a room in Donna Anna's house. Brophy describes this as "the only true domestic passage in *Don Giovanni*, where Don Ottavio reproaches Donna Anna with 'Crudele', and she replies with her heart-cry 'Crudele? Ah no, mio bene!' She then sings her incomparably moving 'Non mi dir'."³⁴² In this scene, Donna Anna discloses more of her true self, since up to this point "she has been unable all along to bring herself to play the Fury."³⁴³ As can be seen, Mozart in fact portrays her as a gentle, tender, and faithful character.

³⁴⁰ Da Ponte, translation from *DM's Opera Site*, accessed February 14, 2020. http://www.murashev.com/opera/Don_Giovanni_libretto_Italian_English.

³⁴¹ Abert, 1043.

³⁴² Brophy, 248.

³⁴³ Ibid.

5.1.2.2 Textual and Tonal Analysis

Mozart titled the aria “No. 23 *Recitativo accompagnato e Rondo.*” The type of *rondo*, or *rondò*, a two-tempo vocal showpiece, “became an important feature of Italian opera in the 1780s.”³⁴⁴ The *rondò* form initiates with a slow section of an *ABA* pattern, leading into a faster paragraph establishing a new theme, or sometimes applying a variation of the opening *A* section.³⁴⁵ The *rondò* (*ABA'B':CC'* from the basic pattern *ABACA*) is basically designated to the *prima donna* or *primo uomo* and tactically planned toward the ending scene or before the Act 2 Finale of a three-act opera (sometimes in two-act operas).³⁴⁶ Waldoff quotes Don Neville when she writes “the ‘rondò,’ always identified with a sincerity of expression, became, for Mozart, a means of expressing moments of profound psychological self-awareness of the characters concerned—an arrival point in a pattern of conduct—a ‘moment of truth.’”³⁴⁷ While Neville explains the *rondò* aria of Donna Anna:

Mozart's ‘Non mi dir’ (*Don Giovanni*), for example, an unquestioned *rondò* of profound emotional content assigned to the tragic heroine immediately before the opera's last finale, does not comply in all respects to the formal specifications of the *rondò* given above.³⁴⁸

³⁴⁴ Waldoff, 245.

³⁴⁵ Don Neville, “Rondò.” *Grove Music Online*. 2001; Accessed 19 Feb. 2020. <https://libproxy.library.unt.edu:5982/grovemusic/view/10.1093/gmo/9781561592630.001.0001/omo-9781561592630-e-0000023788>.

³⁴⁶ *Ibid.*

³⁴⁷ Don Neville, “‘Rondò’ in Mozart’s Late Operas,” 141, quoted in Waldoff, 246.

³⁴⁸ Neville, “Rondò.” *Grove Music Online*.

Table 5-1: “Crudel? Ah no, mio bene! ... Non mi dir, bell’idol mio”—Textual and Tonal Analysis, *Don Giovanni*, No. 23 Recitativo accompagnato e Rondo³⁴⁹

Text	Translation	Action	Affect	Tonal Color	Key Descriptions ³⁵⁰
Recitativo: Crudele? Ah no, mio bene!	Cruel? Ah no, my love!	exclaiming	surprised, disappointed	G minor	Matt: ... combining the seriousness with a certain loveliness, an exceptional grace and pleasantness, it is comfortable for both tender and uplifting, both yearning and happy – in short both for moderate lament and moderate happiness, and thus very flexible.
					Schu: Discontent, uneasiness, worry about a failed scheme; bad-tempered gnashing of teeth; in a word: resentment and dislike.
[m. 5] Troppo mi spiace allontanarti un	I am too unhappy at having to put off the	declaring, expressing	unhappy, disappointed	B ^b major/(F major)	Matt: ... very entertaining but retains a certain modesty, pass both for great and for small matters. Kircher: It elevates the soul to [do] heavy/difficult things.
					Schu: Cheerful love, clear conscience, hope, aspiration for a better world.
					Vog: Calm; a pleasant key; borrowed a special tenderness from E ^b . Suggesting solitude; for soliloquies and expressions of lonely sentiment.
[m. 6] ben che lungamente la nostr'alma desia.	joy which for a long time our soul desired.	expressing, addressing, explaining	unhappy, dejected. If only referring to 'joy', then joyous, referring to something she/they desired.	F major	Matt: ... magnanimity, steadfastness, love, or whatever else is on top of the list of virtues, and all this in such a natural and way and incompatible ease that there is no coercion involved. Yes, the gentleness and character of this tone cannot be described in different terms than to compare it to a beautiful person whom everything he does, and be it as it could, makes look perfect, and who, as the French say, has <i>bonne grace</i> .
					Schu: Complaisance and calm.
					Vog: Good for dead calm. agree especially with a quiet joy in happy shades of Elysium.
[m. 9] Ma il mondo, o Dio!	But what would the world (people) say!	moralizing	justified, considerate	D minor	Matt: ... humble, calm, at the same time grand, pleasant, and content; promoting devotion in church pieces and peace of mind in secular pieces; Because it has besides its nimbleness also a dignity etc. Aristotle calls it serious and constant.
					Schu: Melancholy womanliness, the spleen and humours brood.
					Vog: Inner unrest, agitated; funeral march.

³⁴⁹ Libretto and English Translation, “Non mi dir”, *DM’s Opera Site*, accessed March 23, 2016, http://www.murashev.com/opera/Don_Giovanni_libretto_Italian_English. English translations modified by Meng-Jung Tsai.

³⁵⁰ Abbreviations for the three authors, Mattheson as “Matt,” Schubart as “Schu,” and Vogler as “Vog.” The characteristic agreeing with the texts are highlighted in light red.

Text	Translation	Action	Affect	Tonal Color	Key Descriptions ³⁵⁰
[m. 10] Non sedur la costanza del sensibil mio core; abbastanza per	Do not seduce the constancy of my sensitive heart; enough for	moralizing, asking	tender, uneasy, devoted	G minor	Matt: ... combining the seriousness with a certain loveliness, an exceptional grace and pleasantness, it is comfortable for both tender and uplifting, both yearning and happy – in short both for moderate lament and moderate happiness, and thus very flexible.
					Schu: Discontent, uneasiness, worry about a failed scheme; bad-tempered gnashing of teeth; in a word: resentment and dislike.
[m. 14] te mi parla amore!	you to talk to me of love!	asking, begging	tender, uneasy, devoted	D minor	Matt: ... humble, calm, at the same time grand, pleasant, and content; promoting devotion in church pieces and peace of mind in secular pieces; even though this does not hinder one to express successfully with this tone something pleasant, but not particularly jumping but rather flowing [...] for heroic or epic it is the best. Because it has besides its nimbleness also a dignity etc. Aristotle calls it serious and constant.
					Schu: Melancholy womanliness, the spleen and humours brood.
					Vog: Inner unrest, agitated; funeral march
Rondo: [m. 16] Non mi dir, bell'idol mio che son io crudel con te. Tu ben sai quant'io t'amai,	Do not tell me, my true love, that I am cruel to you. You know well how much I love you,	begging, promising,	tender, wishful	F major	Matt: ... magnanimity, steadfastness, love, or whatever else is on top of the list of virtues, and all this in such a natural and way and incompatible ease that there is no coercion involved. Yes, the gentleness and character of this tone cannot be described in different terms than to compare it to a beautiful person whom everything he does, and be it as it could, makes look perfect, and who, as the French say, has <i>bonne grace</i> .
					Schu: Complaisance and calm.
					Vog: Good for dead calm. agree especially with a quiet joy in happy shades of Elysium.
[m. 30] tu conosci la mia fè.	you know to whom I am faithful.	reassuring	tender, wishful, devoted	D minor	Matt: ... contains something humble, calm, at the same time grand, pleasant, and content; therefore it is capable of promoting devotion in church pieces and peace of mind in secular pieces; even though this does not hinder one to express successfully with this tone something pleasant, but not particularly jumping but rather flowing [...] for heroic or epic it is the best. Because it has besides its nimbleness also a dignity etc. Aristotle calls it serious and constant.
					Schu: Melancholy womanliness, the spleen and humours brood.
Aria: [m. 33] tu conosci la mia fè.	you know to whom I am faithful.	reassuring	tender, wishful, devoted	F major	Matt: ... magnanimity, steadfastness, love, or whatever else is on top of the list of virtues, and all this in such a natural and way and incompatible ease that there is no coercion involved. Yes, the gentleness and character of this tone cannot be described

Text	Translation	Action	Affect	Tonal Color	Key Descriptions ³⁵⁰
					<p>in different terms than to compare it to a beautiful person whom everything he does, and be it as it could, makes look perfect, and who, as the French say, has <i>bonne grace</i>.</p> <p>Schu: Complaisance and calm.</p> <p>Vog: Good for dead calm. agree especially with a quiet joy in happy shades of Elysium.</p>
<p>[m. 37] Calma, calma il tuo tormento,</p>	Calm your torment,	asking, reflecting	kind, caring	C major	<p>Matt: ... rude and insolent character, but will not be inappropriate for boisterous dancing and where else one lets one's joy come forth without inhibition; but an able composer may re-baptize [the key] into something charming and sometimes even apply it to tender moments.</p> <p>Schu: ... completely pure. Its character is: innocence, simplicity, naivety, children's talk.</p> <p>Vog: Perhaps the key most fit for a painting, for pure water arias, for pure subjects. A majestic key, full of gravity, for it has little charm; splendid. No one has chosen C for a piece whose character required some charm.</p>
<p>[m. 42] se di duol non vuoi ch'io mora.</p>	if you do not wish me to die of grief.	asking, reflecting	kind, caring, tender	C minor	<p>Matt: ... very lovely but also sad tone, one also tires easily of sweet things it is not unwise to try to enliven it a bit by a merry or even movement, otherwise one might become a bit sleepy from its moderation. Should it be a piece though that is supposed to encourage sleep this remark is superfluous and you can just get to that goal in a natural way.</p> <p>Schu: Declaration of love and at the same time the lament of unhappy love. All languishing, longing, sighing of the love-sick soul lies in this key.</p> <p>Vog: ... a choice which is justified as follows: to express sadness.</p>
<p>[m. 44] se di duol non vuoi ch'io mora.</p>	if you do not wish me to die of grief.	asking, reflecting	kind, caring, tender	G minor	<p>Matt: ... combining the seriousness with a certain loveliness, an exceptional grace and pleasantness, it is comfortable for both tender and uplifting, both yearning and happy – in short both for moderate lament and moderate happiness, and thus very flexible.</p> <p>Schu: Discontent, uneasiness, worry about a failed scheme; bad-tempered gnashing of teeth; in a word: resentment and dislike.</p>
<p>[m.46] non vuoi ch'io mora.</p>	not wish me to die of grief.	asking, reflecting	kind, caring, tender	F minor	<p>Matt: ... moderate and calm, but deep and heavy mortal fear in the heart that is combined with some desperation. a black melancholy and will sometimes cause the listener a horror or shiver.</p>

Text	Translation	Action	Affect	Tonal Color	Key Descriptions ³⁵⁰
					Schu: Deep depression, funereal lament, groans of misery and longing for the grave.
					Vog: ... before departing in a rage, Phoebe delivers a turbulent, dark-hued f-minor aria.
[m. 48] Non mi dir, bell'idol mio che son io	Do not tell me, my true love, that I am	begging, promising	tender, wishful	F major	Matt: ... magnanimity, steadfastness, love, or whatever else is on top of the list of virtues, and all this in such a natural and way and incompatible ease that there is no coercion involved. Yes, the gentleness.
					Schu: Complaisance and calm.
					Vog: Good for dead calm. agree especially with a quiet joy in happy shades of Elysium.
[m. 53] crudel	cruel	saddening	tender, wishful	C minor	Matt: ... very lovely but also sad tone, one also tires easily of sweet things; it is not unwise to try to enliven it a bit by a merry or even movement.
					Schu: Declaration of love and at the same time the lament of unhappy love. All languishing, longing, sighing of the love-sick soul lies in this key.
					Vog: ... a choice which is justified as follows: to express sadness.
[m. 55] con te. Calma, calma il tuo	to you. Calm your	begging, asking	caring, kind	F major	Matt: ... magnanimity, steadfastness, love, or whatever else is on top of the list of virtues, and all this in such a natural and way and incompatible ease that there is no coercion involved. Yes, the gentleness and character of this tone cannot be described in different terms than to compare it to a beautiful person whom everything he does, and be it as it could, makes look perfect, and who, as the French say, has <i>bonne grace</i> .
					Schu: Complaisance and calm.
					Vog: Good for dead calm. agree especially with a quiet joy in happy shades of Elysium.
[m. 57] tormento, se di	torment, if you	reflecting on an action	caring, kind	F minor	Matt: ... moderate and calm, but deep and heavy mortal fear in the heart that is combined with some desperation. a black melancholy and will sometimes cause the listener a horror or shiver.
					Schu: Deep depression, funereal lament, groans of misery and longing for the grave.

Text	Translation	Action	Affect	Tonal Color	Key Descriptions ³⁵⁰
					Vog: (After struggling with Furies, failing to bar Pollux from underworld, and before departing in a rage, Phoebe delivers a turbulent, dark-hued f-minor aria. – opera seria Castore e Polluce, 1786) ³⁵¹
[m. 58] duol non	in grief none	reflecting	kind, caring, tender	D ^b major	Schu: A leering key, degenerating into grief and rapture. It cannot laugh, but it can smile; it cannot howl, but it can at least grimace its crying. —Consequently only unusual characters and feelings can be brought out in this key
[m. 59] vuoi ch'io mora,	wish me to die,	reflecting	kind, caring, tender	B ^b minor	Schu: A quaint creature, often dressed in the garment of night. It is somewhat surly and very seldom takes on a pleasant countenance. Mocking God and the world; discontented with itself and with everything; preparation for suicide sounds in this key.
[m. 60] non vuoi ch'io mora!	not wish me to die of grief.	reflecting	kind, caring, tender	F minor	Matt: ... moderate and calm, but deep and heavy mortal fear in the heart that is combined with some desperation. a black melancholy and will sometimes cause the listener a horror or shiver.
					Schu: Deep depression, funereal lament, groans of misery and longing for the grave.
					Vog: ... before departing in a rage, Phoebe delivers a turbulent, dark-hued f-minor aria.
[m. 72] Forse un	Perhaps some	expecting	wishful	F major	Matt: ... all this in such a natural and way and incompatible ease that there is no coercion involved, the gentleness and character of this tone.
					Schu: Complaisance and calm.
					Vog: Good for dead calm. agree especially with a quiet joy in happy shades of Elysium.
[m. 74] giorno il cielo ancora	day heaven still	expecting	wishful	C major	Matt: ... rude and insolent character, but will not be inappropriate for boisterous dancing and where else one lets one's joy come forth without inhibition; but an able composer may re-baptize [the key] into something charming and sometimes even apply it to tender moments.
					Schu: ... completely pure. Its character is: innocence, simplicity, naivety, children's talk.

³⁵¹ Grave and Grave, 200.

Text	Translation	Action	Affect	Tonal Color	Key Descriptions ³⁵⁰
					Vog: Perhaps the key most fit for a painting, for pure water arias, for pure subjects. A majestic key, full of gravity, for it has little charm; splendid. No one has chosen C for a piece whose character required some charm.
[m. 76] sentirà pietà di me	will hear will have pity on me.	expecting	wishful	F major	Matt: ... love, or whatever else is on top of the list of virtues, and all this in such a natural and way and incompatible ease that there is no coercion involved, gentleness. Schu: Complaisance and calm. Vog: Good for dead calm. agree especially with a quiet joy in happy shades of Elysium.
[m. 85]				B ^b major (G minor F major D minor)	
[m. 91] pietà di	will have pity on	expecting	wishful	G minor	Matt: ... combining the seriousness with a certain loveliness, an exceptional grace and pleasantness, it is comfortable for both tender and uplifting, both yearning and happy – in short both for moderate lament and moderate happiness, and thus very flexible. Schu: Discontent, uneasiness, worry about a failed scheme; bad-tempered gnashing of teeth; in a word: resentment and dislike.
[m. 93] me, sentirà pie-	me, will hear have pity	expecting	wishful	C minor	Matt: ... very lovely but also sad tone, one also tires easily of sweet things it is not unwise to try to enliven it a bit by a merry or even movement. Schu: Declaration of love and at the same time the lament of unhappy love. All languishing, longing, sighing of the love-sick soul lies in this key. Vog: ... a choice which is justified as follows: to express sadness.
[m. 95] -tà,	pity	expecting	wishful	G ^b major	Schu: Triumph over difficulty, free sigh of relief uttered when hurdles are surmounted; echo of a soul which has fiercely struggled and finally conquered lies in all uses of this key.
[m. 96] pietà di me. Forse, forse	pity on me. Perhaps, perhaps	expecting	wishful	F major	Matt: ... magnanimity, steadfastness, love, or whatever else is on top of the list of virtues, and all this in such a natural and way and incompatible ease that there is no coercion involved, gentleness. Schu: Complaisance and calm. Vog: Good for dead calm. agree especially with a quiet joy in happy shades of Elysium.

Text	Translation	Action	Affect	Tonal Color	Key Descriptions ³⁵⁰
[m. 103] il cielo un giorno	Heaven some day	expecting	wishful	B ^b minor, treated as appoggia-tura	Matt: ... very entertaining but retains a certain modesty, pass both for great and for small matters. Kircher: It elevates the soul to [do] heavy/difficult things.
					Schu: Cheerful love, clear conscience, hope aspiration for a better world.
					Vog: Calm; a pleasant key; borrowed a special tenderness from E ^b . Suggesting solitude; for soliloquies and expressions of lonely sentiment.
[m. 105] senti-	will hear	expecting	wishful	C minor	Matt: ... very lovely but also sad tone, one also tires easily of sweet things it is not unwise to try to enliven it a bit by a merry or even movement.
					Schu: Declaration of love and at the same time the lament of unhappy love. All languishing, longing, sighing of the love-sick soul lies in this key.
					Vog: ... a choice which is justified as follows: to express sadness.
[m. 106] -rà pietà di me.	have pity on me.	expecting	wishful	F major	Matt: ... magnanimity, steadfastness, love, or whatever else is on top of the list of virtues, and all this in such a natural and way and incompatible ease that there is no coercion involved, gentleness.
					Schu: Complaisance and calm.
					Vog: Good for dead calm. agree especially with a quiet joy in happy shades of Elysium.

The form of “Non mi dir” is AaBAa’:C, and each section presents two text lines. The [A] (*Larghetto*, mm. 16–27 & 48–55, line 1st, 2nd) and [C] (*Allegro moderato*, mm. 64–116, line 7th, 8th) sections are in the tonic key, and the [B] section (mm. 36–47, line 5th, 6th) is in dominant key. The [a] (mm. 28–35, line 3rd, 4th) and [a’] sections (mm. 55–63, line 5th, 6th) possess different text lines and the key modulates.

5.1.2.3 Application

- Tonal Colors in *Recitativo*: g – B^b – F – d – g – d.

Following Don Ottavio’s “Crudele!”, this *recitativo accompagnato* starts in G minor. The entire recitative passage is provided with the tonal colors of G minor, B^b major, F major, and ends with D minor. When Donna Anna declares her inner conflict between the sorrow for her father and Don Ottavio’s wedding proposal, Don Ottavio bursts out “You cruel one!” which makes her suffer even more (*discontent/uneasiness*, G minor, Schubart). She replies *seriously with a certain loveliness and an exceptional grace* (G minor, Mattheson) declaring her love for him. Mozart wrote the anticipating main motif³⁵² played by the orchestra in B^b major (mm. 3–5), and once again in F major (mm. 7–9). Donna Anna presents herself with a *clear conscience and hopes* Don Ottavio and she can live their lives in *a better world* (B^b major, Schubart), a better future. *Calmly*, she says “Troppo mi spiace allontanarti un ben (I am too unhappy at having to put off the joy)”³⁵³ with *special tenderness* (B^b major, Vogler), and *modestly*, she *elevates her soul to offer this difficult task a nice solution*³⁵⁴ (B^b major, Mattheson). With

³⁵² Abert, 1099.

³⁵³ Libretto and English Translation, “Non mi dir”, *DM’s Opera Site*, accessed March 23, 2016, http://www.murashev.com/opera/Don_Giovanni_libretto_Italian_English.

³⁵⁴ Abert, 1099.

magnanimity and *steadfastness* in Anna’s personality, Mattheson states “*whatever else is on top of the list of virtues* (F major),”³⁵⁵ she asks Don Ottavio, together with *complaisance* (F major, Schubart), to delay their marriage ceremony and to mourn for her father. As Abert states:

Ottavio’s renewed courtship stirs a mood of affecting *tenderness* in her soul, providing a perfect solution to the *difficult* task of declaring her *love* for him and, at the same time, refusing him his ultimate desire. Even now she remains conscious of her duty towards her murdered father, but, as we have already seen, this feeling has gradually turned to *sorrowful* resignation, without losing any of its intensity.³⁵⁶

She still feels her *inner unrest* (D minor, Vogler), due to the villain still at large. However, when she mentions “Dio (God)”, she is *humble* and tries to grasp her *peace of mind* (D minor, Mattheson). When she talks about love, “te mi parla amore (mm. 14–15)”, she understands love is *pleasant and content*, yet *seriously* and *constantly* Donna Anna expresses her desire to keep her *dignity* (D minor, Mattheson) “until her father’s shadow has been avenged.”³⁵⁷

- Tonal Colors in *Larghetto*:

Formal Unit: $\underline{F - F - d - g - F - C - (d) - C - c - g - f - F - c/C - F - f - D^b - b^b - f^\# - f}$:

- Tonal Colors in *Allegro moderato*:

Formal Unit: $\underline{F - C - F - B^b - g - F - d - g - c - G^b - F - c/C - F}$.

“Non mi dir,” the slow-fast tempo aria, is in F major. As stated earlier, the main themes of *larghetto* and *allegro moderato* (slow—fast) are in F major, which are sections [A] and [C] in

³⁵⁵ Mattheson, trans. Schulze: Mattheson’s key characteristics description, handouts.

³⁵⁶ Abert, 1099. Texts also match the key descriptions in *Italics*.

³⁵⁷ Abert, 1099.

the form. The second subject in the slow movement, the [B] passage, is in C major, F major's dominant. Several tonal transpositions occur in [a] and [a']. With the properties of F major as previously mentioned, describing Donna Anna's character³⁵⁸ *calmly (good for dead clam, Vogler)* she requests of Don Ottavio "Do not tell me that I am cruel to you. You know very well how much I love you."³⁵⁹ She *humbly and devotedly* (D minor, Mattheson) expresses "you know well to whom I am faithful."³⁶⁰

The tender tone from the clarinet³⁶¹ (m. 35–36), which *applies to the tender moment* (C major, Mattheson) prepares Donna Anna's request to please Don Ottavio "calm your torment."³⁶² The tone becomes *sad* (C minor, Vogler) *but still lovely* (C minor, Mattheson) saying "if you do not wish me to die of grief" (mm. 42–44).³⁶³ This *declaration of love* (C minor, Schubart) is her "impassioned plea"³⁶⁴ to her fiancé. As she continuously pleads, she displays an affective *combination of seriousness, loveliness, tenderness, yearning* (G minor Mattheson, mm. 44–46), *uneasiness* (G minor, Vogler), also *moderate and calm, but deep and heavy mortal fear* (F minor, Mattheson, mm. 46–47), and *deep depression* (F minor, Schubart).

Returning to section [A] (mm. 48–53), the tonal center in F major remains the same as when Donna Anna sings it the first time. When singing "crudel" (m. 53) again, she *laments of*

³⁵⁸ Abert, 1099.

³⁵⁹ Libretto and English Translation, "Non mi dir", *DM's Opera Site*, accessed March 23, 2016, http://www.murashev.com/opera/Don_Giovanni_libretto_Italian_English.

³⁶⁰ *Ibid.*

³⁶¹ Abert, 1099.

³⁶² Libretto and English Translation, "Non mi dir", *DM's Opera Site*.

³⁶³ *Ibid.*

³⁶⁴ Abert, 1099.

unhappy love, and *languishes* from being told that she is cruel. She *declares her love* (C minor, Schubart) for Don Ottavio so that she can mourn her deceased father. Because of her father's death, Donna Anna *expresses her sadness* (C minor, Vogler), and *tires easily of sweet things* (Mattheson), such as Don Ottavio's sweet offering of recompense. Losing her father causes a *black melancholy* in Donna Anna's torment (m. 57), which draws her into *deep and heavy mortal fear* (F minor, Mattheson). Her inner torment, like a *dark-hued turbulence* (Vogler), is the *funeral lament* for her father, and she *groans of* [over] his *misery* (F minor, Schubart). Her *feeling degenerates into grief* (D^b major, Schubart, m. 58), and she is *discontented* (B^b minor, Schubart) *with herself* and Don Ottavio, saying "vouì ch'io mora" ([if you] wish me to die). Since her father's death leads to her *deep depression* (F minor, Schubart), she would not wish Don Ottavio to be deprived of her love for him as well.

In the fast movement (m. 64), the key remains essentially in F major with Donna Anna's opening melisma figure in m. 72 shifting quickly every one or two bars to briefly provide different tonal colors such as C major in m. 74. "The hope that heaven someday will take pity on her in her distress"³⁶⁵ which is like a wishful seed of *a quiet joy in happy shades of Elysium* (F major, Vogler). She hopes that someday she can *let her joy come forth without inhibition* (C major, Mattheson). There is no doubt that from the beginning of "Non mi dir" in F major to this point the seed of Donna Anna's *complaisance* (Schubart), determination and her *steadfastness* (Mattheson) shall be in blossom. The protagonist does not realize later in the next scene the villain is about to face his destruction. The tonal center of her florid passage (mm. 83–98) starts

³⁶⁵ Abert, 1100.

in F major, passes through B^b major, G minor, D minor, and G^b major, and returns to F, which suggests the changing of her affections with the tonal shifts. Though the dominant seventh of G^b major only appears in measure 95, it illustrates Donna Anna's hope: "*Triumph over difficulty, free sigh of relief uttered when hurdles are surmounted; echo of a soul which has fiercely struggled and finally conquered lies in all uses of this key*"³⁶⁶ (G^b major, Schubart).

Magda Romanska describes the 18th century society: "By the 18th century, educated women were beginning to question male freedoms and dominance of society, and starting to demand similar freedoms for themselves."³⁶⁷ Da Ponte and Mozart reflect the social situation of more awakening women in the eighteenth century by depicting a strong willed but graceful female image, like Donna Anna. Her first line given to her by Da Ponte, is "Non sperar, se non m'uccidi, ch'io ti lasci fuggir mai!" (Don't hope, unless you kill me, that I will ever let you escape. Act 1, scene 1). She does not stay within the walls of nunnery to be a passive character, instead she bravely stands out seeking revenge. Also, before the Finale of Act 2, she calmly expresses her requirement for her marriage postponement (here she does not mean to leave Don Ottavio, but asks him to be the complaisant one to meet her wish) with a genuine F major rondò. As Cairns describes "Anna's motives need no psychological probing. They are clear. ... neither her account of her nocturnal adventure nor her stated reason for postponing her marriage is a lie. Mozart's art is steeped in irony; but there is no hint of it here."³⁶⁸ On the whole, Donna Anna gracefully and *calmly* expresses her *love*, her faithfulness (*steadfastness*),

³⁶⁶ Schubart, quoted in Steblin.

³⁶⁷ Magda Romanska, "The Women of Don Giovanni," In the Wings – Backstage glimpses with Boston Lyric Opera, April 24, 2015, accessed March 13, 2020, <http://blog.blo.org/the-women-of-don-giovanni>.

³⁶⁸ Cairns, 157.

and asks for generosity (*magnanimity*) from her beloved, and from heaven. The evidence presents that the key descriptions of the three theorists confirm Donna Anna's text.

5.2 Zerlina

5.2.1 Character Background

It appears that Zerlina is the most likely character to be attacked by feminist musicologists from Mozart's and De Ponte's operas. The Women's Studies researcher, Liane Curtis, argues against Joseph Kerman's statement in *Listen* writing, "there is no need to worry about Zerlina," ... she is simply just a "lower-class" peasant girl.³⁶⁹ She is highly concerned about Zerlina's two seductive arias, which in order to win her bridegroom back, underscore "the issue of domestic violence in all of opera."³⁷⁰ Abert's perspective explains how Da Ponte portrayed the dramaturgical development of Zerlina's character:

By being combined with Ximena,³⁷¹ Zerlina is far superior as a character to Maturina,³⁷² who is little more than an earthy *buffa* figure. From Da Ponte she acquired not only her naïve charm but also the natural impulsiveness of a simple young woman from the people. Particularly successful from a psychological point of view is Da Ponte's idea of her reconciliation with Masetto which rounds off her characterization in a pleasingly logical manner. But Masetto, too, has benefited from this new motif. Masetto's martyrdom is longer and more painful, but as a result, Zerlina's return to him seems all the more convincing. Each supports the other, and instead of two *buffa* figures who are treated by the librettist with the usual implacable contempt, we have an innocently

³⁶⁹ Joseph Kerman, *Listen* (New York: Worth Publishers, 1980), quoted in Liane Curtis, "The Sexual Politics of Teaching Mozart's Don Giovanni," *NWSA Journal*, vol. 12, no. 1 (2000), 119, accessed 21 Feb 2020, *Gale Literature Resource Center*, <https://libproxy.library.unt.edu:7175/apps/doc/A62682224/LitRC?u=txshracd2679&sid=LitRC&xid=175e0351>.

³⁷⁰ *Ibid.*

³⁷¹ Abert, 1040: *Donna Ximena*, Dama di Villena. A role in *Don Giovanni, ossia Il convitato di pietra*, also known as *Don Giovanni Tenorio*, libretto by Giovanni Bertati, and composed by Giuseppe Gazzaniga, first staged in Venice in 1787.

³⁷² *Ibid.*: *Maturina* Sposa promessa di Biagio, another role in Bertati's *Don Giovanni Tenorio*.

trusting everyday couple who, in spite of all their sins and the dangers to which they are exposed, are finally reconciled.³⁷³

Da Ponte's utilization of "To err is human, to forgive divine" by Alexander Pope (1688-1744) teaches us a life lesson.

As a matter of fact, Zerlina demonstrates her skillful astuteness in a natural way. Her strategy is so savvy that one may not associate with this but instead focus on "Zerlina's willingness to submit to male abuse."³⁷⁴ Kaiser interprets this peasant girl in a plausible way:

You don't want to touch me any more? Very well, punish me with a good hiding (whereby contact, even if painfully at first, would be reestablished as a preparation for peace). You have aches and pains because Don Giovanni beat you up? Very well, here is my heart, my bosom – a balsam that will heal you. You, Leporello, as the constant companion and accessory of your master, have played the devil. Very well, I'll tie you up painfully and avenge myself on you in the name of all affronted girls. That's how the libretto defines Zerlina if one ignores the playful exaggeration in her words and attends only to *what*, not *how*, she sings.³⁷⁵

Indeed, Zerlina is a master operator of "shrewdness and corporeality."³⁷⁶ The follow-up analysis reveals how Mozart positions Zerlina with the key utilization.

5.2.2 Batti, batti, o bel Masetto

5.2.2.1 Situational Synopsis

Zerlina's first aria, No. 12 "Batti, batti, o bel Masetto," takes place in Act 1, Scene 16.

After Masetto's "Ho capito, signor sì" in Act 1, Scene 8, Masetto has been separated from Zerlina. Subsequently, Don Giovanni attempts to beguile the bride in their famous duet.

³⁷³ Abert, 1043-44.

³⁷⁴ Holly Dee Morgan, "Don Giovanni's Avenging Women" (Masters Research thesis, Faculty of the VCA and Music, The University of Melbourne, 2013), 18, accessed February 21, 2020, <http://cat.lib.unimelb.edu.au/record=b5056251>.

³⁷⁵ Kaiser, 190.

³⁷⁶ Ibid.

Knowing Masetto is comprehensibly hurt by the circumstances, Zerlina sings the aria to make peace in the relationship between herself and her husband.

5.2.2.2 Textual and Tonal Analysis

In order to prevent hasty investigation, the research of Zerlina starts from her line “Ma se colpa io non ho!” in scene 16 and the following aria, “Batti, batti, o bel Masetto.” Comparing with Donna Anna, the trace of the tone colors in Zerlina’s recitative and aria is relatively simple. In this *secco* recitative, the bride recounts that nothing happened between her and Don Giovanni. Her high emotional quotient is clearly demonstrated in the recitative text “Vent your anger! Do everything you wish to me, but afterwards, my Masetto, let us make peace.”³⁷⁷ The song-like aria contains two parts with differing *tempi*, *Andante grazioso*—*Allegretto*, with its folk like melody which “sticks closely to the basic character of a child of nature.”³⁷⁸

5.2.2.3 Application

- Tonal Colors in *Recitativo*: a – d – D – C.

The selected recitative is from measure 16 to 26. Within this section, the key center travels through A minor, D minor to D major, and to C major. Zerlina’s *plaintive* asking tries to *incite compassion* (A minor, Mattheson), “But if I am not to blame? If I have been tricked by him?”³⁷⁹ With *serious affect*, this *tender* girl delivers her clarification and her *sweetness* is *beyond measure* (A minor, Mattheson & Schubart).

³⁷⁷ Libretto and English Translation, “Batti, batti, o bel Masetto”, *DM’s Opera Site*, accessed March 23, 2016, http://www.murashev.com/opera/Don_Giovanni_libretto_Italian_English.

³⁷⁸ Abert, 1075.

³⁷⁹ Libretto and English Translation, “Batti, batti,” *DM’s Opera Site*.

Table 5-2: “Ma se colpa io non ho! ... Batti, batti, o bel Masetto”—Textual and Tonal Analysis, *Don Giovanni*, No. 12. Aria³⁸⁰

Text	Translation	Action	Affect	Tonal Color	Key Descriptions ³⁸¹
Recitativo:[m. 16] Ma se colpa io non ho, ma se da lui ingannata rimasi;	But if fault I do not have? If by him I have been tricked?	clarifying, explaining	chastened	A minor	Matt: ... plaintive, honorable, and at ease, meaning it invites to sleep; but it is not unpleasant in this, to incite compassion, a magnificent and serious affect, can be used for flattery, moderate and sweet beyond measure. Schu: Pious womanliness and tenderness of character.
[m. 18] e poi, che temi? Tranquillati,	And then, what do you fear? Calm yourself,	convincing	yielding, gentle	D minor	Matt: ... humble, calm, at the same time grand, pleasant, and content; capable of promoting devotion in church pieces and peace of mind in secular pieces; besides its nimbleness also a dignity etc. Schu: Melancholy womanliness, the spleen and humours brood. Vog: Inner unrest, agitated; funeral march.
[m. 19] mia vita: non mi toccò la punta delle dita. Non me lo credi?	my love: he did not touch even the tips of my fingers. You don't believe it?	convincing	yielding, gentle	D major	Matt: ... sharp and obstinate; very apt for noise-making, merry, warlike, and uplifting things; this harsh tone may also give inspiration in a rather neat and strange way to delicate things. Schu: ... of triumph, of Hallelujahs, of war-cries, of victory-rejoicing. Thus, the inviting symphonies, the marches, holiday songs and heaven-rejoicing choruses are set in this key. Vog: Enflames the heart, whole body is enlivened; the spirit welters in heroic deeds – is roused to imprudent, joyful, even to somewhat boisterous songs of praise. Noisy. It is a lively key, suitable for pomp, for noise, rumours of war.
[m. 21] Ingrato! Vien qui, sfogati, ammazzami, fa tutto di me quel che ti piace; ma poi, Masetto mio, ma poi fa pace.	Ungrateful one! Come here! Vent your anger! Kill me! Do everything of me that you like, but afterwards, my	convincing, satisfying, pleasing	coquettish,	C major	Matt: ... a rude and insolent character, but will not be inappropriate for boisterous dancing and where else one lets one's joy come forth without inhibition; something charming and sometimes even apply it to tender moments. Schu: ... completely pure. Its character is: innocence, simplicity, naivety, children's talk. Vog: ... for pure subjects. A majestic key, full of gravity, for it has little charm; splendid, whose character required some charm.

³⁸⁰ Libretto and English Translation, “Batti, batti, o bel Masetto”, *DM's Opera Site*, accessed March 23, 2016, http://www.murashev.com/opera/Don_Giovanni_libretto_Italian_English. English translations modified by Meng-Jung Tsai.

³⁸¹ Abbreviations for the three authors, Mattheson as “Matt,” Schubart as “Schu,” and Vogler as “Vog.” The characteristic agreeing with the texts are highlighted in light red.

Text	Translation	Action	Affect	Tonal Color	Key Descriptions ³⁸¹
	Masetto, let us make peace.				
Aria: [m. 1] Batti, batti, o bel Masetto, la tua povera Zerlina; starò qui com'agnellina le tue botte ad aspettar.	Beat me, beat me, my Masetto, beat your poor Zerlina. I'll stay here like a baby lamb awaiting your every blow.	satisfying, pleasing	meek, docile	F major	<p>Matt: ... the most beautiful sentiments, magnanimity, steadfastness, love, or whatever else is on top of the list of virtues, and all this in such a natural way and incompatible ease that there is no coercion involved. Yes, the gentleness and character of this tone cannot be described in different terms than to compare it to a beautiful person whom everything he does, and be it as it could, makes look perfect, and who, as the French say, has <i>bonne grace</i>.</p> <p>Schu: Complaisance and calm.</p> <p>Vog: Good for dead calm. In Gluck's <i>Orpheus</i> and Vogler's <i>Castor and Pollux</i>, F appeared to agree especially with a quiet joy in happy shades of Elysium.</p>
[m. 19] Lascierò straziarmi il crine, lascierò cavarmi gli occhi, e le care tue manine lieta poi saprò baciar.	I'll let you pull my hair out, I'll let you gouge my eyes out, and your sweet little hands then happily I will know how to kiss.	pleasing	submissive, docile	C major	<p>Matt: ... a rude and insolent character, but will not be inappropriate for boisterous dancing and where else one lets one's joy come forth without inhibition; something charming and sometimes apply it to tender moments.</p> <p>Schu: ... completely pure. Its character is: innocence, simplicity, naivety, children's talk.</p> <p>Vog: ... for pure subjects. A majestic key, full of gravity, for it has little charm; splendid, whose character required some charm.</p>
[m. 32] saprò	I will know	pleasing	meek, affectionate	D minor	<p>Matt: ... humble, calm, grand, pleasant, and content; of promoting devotion in church pieces and peace of mind in secular pieces; does not hinder one to express successfully with this tone something pleasant, its nimbleness also a dignity.</p> <p>Schu: Melancholy womanliness, the spleen and humours brood.</p> <p>Vog: Inner unrest, agitated; funeral march</p>
[m. 33] saprò baciar.	I will know how to kiss.	pleasing	meek, affectionate	C major	<p>Matt: ... a rude and insolent character, but will not be inappropriate for boisterous dancing and where else one lets one's joy come forth without inhibition; something charming and sometimes apply it to tender moments.</p> <p>Schu: ... completely pure. Its character is: innocence, simplicity, naivety, children's talk.</p> <p>Vog: ... for pure subjects. A majestic key, full of gravity, for it has little charm; splendid, whose character required some charm.</p>

Text	Translation	Action	Affect	Tonal Color	Key Descriptions ³⁸¹
[m. 36] Batti, batti, ecc. Ah, lo vedo, non hai core!	Beat me, beat etc. Ah, I see it, you have no heart!	pleasing	meek, docile, coquettish	F major	Matt: ... the most beautiful sentiments, magnanimity, steadfastness, love, or whatever else is on top of the list of virtues, and all this in such a natural way and incompatible ease that there is no coercion involved. Yes, the gentleness and character of this tone cannot be described in different terms than to compare it to a beautiful person whom everything he does, and be it as it could, makes look perfect, and who, as the French say, has <i>bonne grace</i> .
					Schu: Complaisance and calm.
					Vog: Good for dead calm. In Gluck's <i>Orpheus</i> and Vogler's <i>Castor and Pollux</i> , F appeared to agree especially with a quiet joy in happy shades of Elysium.
[m. 61] Pace, pace, o vita mia, in contenti ed allegria notte e di vogliam passar,	Let's make peace, my own true love. In contentment and joy nights and days we want to pass.	pleasing, sweetening	affectionate	F major	Matt: ... the most beautiful sentiments, magnanimity, steadfastness, love, or whatever else is on top of the list of virtues, and all this in such a natural way and incompatible ease that there is no coercion involved. Yes, the gentleness and character of this tone cannot be described in different terms than to compare it to a beautiful person whom everything he does, and be it as it could, makes look perfect, and who, as the French say, has <i>bonne grace</i> .
					Schu: Complaisance and calm.
					Vog: Good for dead calm. In Gluck's <i>Orpheus</i> and Vogler's <i>Castor and Pollux</i> , F appeared to agree especially with a quiet joy in happy shades of Elysium.
[m. 68-69] (pas)-sar.		pleasing, sweetening	affectionate	(C major) (F major) B ^b major	Matt: ... entertaining, retains a certain modesty and can therefore pass both for great and for small matters. Kircher: It elevates the soul to [do] heavy/difficult things.
					Schu: Cheerful love, clear conscience, hope, aspiration for a better world.
					Vog: Calm; a pleasant key; it might have borrowed a certain special tenderness from E ^b .
[m. 70] notte e di vogliam passar, sì, notte e di vogliam passer.	nights and days we want to pass, yes, each day and night we want to pass.	pleasing, sweetening	affectionate	F major	Matt: ... the most beautiful sentiments, magnanimity, steadfastness, love, or whatever else is on top of the list of virtues, and all this in such a natural way and incompatible ease that there is no coercion involved. Yes, the gentleness and character of this tone cannot be described in different terms than to compare it to a beautiful person whom everything he does, and be it as it could, makes look perfect, and who, as the French say, has <i>bonne grace</i> .
					Schu: Complaisance and calm.
					Vog: Good for dead calm. F appeared to agree especially with a quiet joy in happy shades of Elysium.

Sensing her husband is in anger and *inner unrest* (D minor, Vogler), she *nimbly* asks him to *calm* down and expresses her *devotion* and *peace of mind* (D minor, Mattheson). For the text “My love: Don Giovanni did not touch even the tips of my fingers,”³⁸² (mm. 19–20) with *sharp* voice she *gives* Masetto *inspiration* from *delicate things* (D major, Mattheson). Her *heart* is likely *enflamed* (D major, Vogler): “You don’t believe me?”³⁸³ She calls Masetto “Ingrato (Ungrateful one)” (m. 21) in C major (*a rude and insolent character*, Mattheson), like many C major places in *Nozze di Figaro*, when Susanna or the Countess curse their men.³⁸⁴ *Boisterously* (C major, Mattheson) Zerlina continues, “Come here! Vent your anger! Kill me!”³⁸⁵ not unlike *naïve children’s* quarrelling words (C major, Schubart). Soon she applies her *pure* personality and *innocently* asks to make peace (Schubart and Vogler).

- Tonal Colors in *Aria*: F – C – d – C – F – | F – (C-F-B^b) – F_.
[Andante grazioso] [Allegretto]

Her aria “Batti, batti, o bel Masetto” is in F major and modulates to C major, F’s dominant, much like Susanna’s aria discussed above. Abert writes “The harmonic writing is as simple as possible in both Zerlina’s arias, with tonic and dominant and nothing else.”³⁸⁶ Speaking of tonal colors, except for its fundamental tonal progression of I – V – I, Mozart only attaches the color/chord of D minor in m. 32 and B^b major in m. 69 in the entire aria. On the surface, the three theorists’ perspectives of F major appear to conflict with Zerlina’s text “batti

³⁸² Libretto and English Translation, “Batti, batti,” *DM’s Opera Site*.

³⁸³ *Ibid.*

³⁸⁴ Examples for “A rude and insolent character”—Mattheson’s C major usages: 1) La Contessa’s line “e ad uno sposo sì vivace (with a husband so forceful)” (mm. 7-8) in her second recitative and aria; 2) In Act 4, Scene 9, Susanna’s recitative line “Il birbo è in sentinella. (The rascal’s eavesdropping)” (mm. 17-18).

³⁸⁵ Libretto and English Translation, “Batti, batti,” *DM’s Opera Site*.

³⁸⁶ Abert, 1075.

(beat me).” Only Schubart’s *complaisance* works well in the literal meaning of the word. The interpretation needs to be considered from the context of Zerlina’s situation.

Zerlina knows that ultimately her goal is to reconcile with her husband, so that she *gently* (F major, Mattheson) says “beat me, beat me, my darling Masetto.” *Complaisantly* and *calmly* (F major, Schubart) she must act, or otherwise as she requests, she may suffer real domestic violence. As Kaiser states she is “delightfully *natural* and pretty shrewd,”³⁸⁷ so that is the reason she can endure *all this in such a natural way and [with] incompatible ease* (F major, Mattheson). She understands that by doing so, her marriage will be able to reach *a joy in happy shades of Elysium* (F major, Vogler).

The key modulates to its dominant, C major, when she sings “Lascierò straziarmi il crine, lascierò cavarmi gli occhi (I’ll let you pull my hair out, I’ll let you gouge my eyes out)”³⁸⁸ (mm. 19–24). Like a *boisterous* kids’ game or *children’s talk*, she offers Masetto the opportunity to do everything he wishes to her. Her purpose is to *let Masetto’s joy come forth without inhibition* (C major, Matheson), because he is the one who *required some charm* (C major, Vogler). Similarly, as she did earlier in recitative, after she uses some extremely fierce words, she offers even sweeter words: “then happily I will know how to kiss your sweet little hands.”³⁸⁹ Zerlina comprehends well when she should be *innocent* and *naïve*, and when she needs to be *boisterous* and *daring* (C major, Mattheson). As quoted in Holly Dee Morgan’s thesis, “Don Giovanni’s Avenging Women,” Mary Ann Hunter states “Eroticizing a request to be beaten is in

³⁸⁷ Kaiser, 189.

³⁸⁸ Libretto and English Translation, “Batti, batti,” *DM’s Opera Site*.

³⁸⁹ Libretto and English Translation, “Batti, batti,” *DM’s Opera Site*.

this situation a daring gesture—a show of strength, as I think the music makes clear. We need not look away from it with the embarrassed distress of our postmodern wisdom, explain it away as ‘the way they thought then.’”³⁹⁰

At once, Mozart installs the tone color of D minor in measure 32. Zerlina sings “saprò (I will know)” revealing a mixed feeling of *humble, calm, and content*. She *promotes* her *devotion* and *peace of mind* (D minor, Mattheson) saying “saprò” and shows she indeed loves this young peasant guy. There is a fascinating moment when Zerlina sings her “passar” (mm. 68–70) in her *Allegretto 6/8* movement: the tonal colors of her vocal line “pass” through F major (m. 68 beat 1), C major (m. 68 beat 2), F major again (m. 69, beat 1), to B^b major (m. 69, beat 2), and finally returns to F major (m. 70). Zerlina literally sings “passar,” and the key indeed responds along with her by passing through different tonal colors. The characteristics of F and C major have been discussed earlier in this section. The property of B^b major as it relates to Zerlina’s state of mind suggests that “Let us make peace, my *cheerful love*, stay *calm*, therefore we can pass both for great and for small matters. Let us *elevate* our soul through this *difficult* situation and hope for a better world/life,”³⁹¹ (B^b major, Mattheson, Schubart & Vogler).

The F major characteristic presents a lovable and tender feature to illustrate Zerlina’s “delightfully natural and pretty shrewd” femininity. Holly Morgan disagrees with Christopher Benn’s statement— “Zerlina is the most normal woman of the opera. She is not a coquette, nor an inexperienced country girl.”³⁹² Instead, she writes “Rather, we can interpret that she can

³⁹⁰ Morgan, 18.

³⁹¹ Libretto translation adding the theorists’ description of B^b major characteristics.

³⁹² Christopher Benn, *Mozart on the Stage* (London: E. Benn Ltd, 1946), 74.

handle herself in any situation, due to her intelligence and strong feminine instincts.”³⁹³ The example of Zerlina’s “Batti, batti, o bel Masetto” provides evidence that interpreting Mozart’s arias through key characteristics must be considered not just from the literal meaning of the words, but also the specific situation or context of the character within the play. Therefore, the rationalization for “Batti, batti” is a situation in which Zerlina intelligently wishes to achieve her objective of *a quiet joy in happy shades of Elysium*—Vogler’s F major description.

³⁹³ Holly Morgan, “Don Giovanni’s Avenging Women,” 24.

CHAPTER 6

FIORDILIGI AND DESPINA IN *COSÌ FAN TUTTE*

On January 26th, 1790, *Così fan tutte* had its first performance at the Burgtheater in Vienna.³⁹⁴ Adriana Ferrarese del Bene, “La Ferrarese”, who had sung Susanna in the revival *Figaro* in 1789, was the premiere Fiordiligi.³⁹⁵ Dorotea Bussani, the first Cherubino in the cast of *Figaro* in 1786, performed the role of Despina.³⁹⁶ It is the fourth time Mozart and Da Ponte collaborated together including the incomplete *opera buffa*, *Lo sposo deluso*. In fact, the libretto of *Così fan tutte* was initially conceived for Antonio Salieri,³⁹⁷ and according to the recollection of Constanze “Salieri first tried to set this opera but failed,”³⁹⁸ so that another Mozart/Da Ponte opera was able to be the long-standing outcome.

Così fan tutte ossia La scuola degli amanti is a *dramma giocoso* in two acts related to a favored dramatic genre described by Cairns as, a “demonstration comedy” in the eighteenth century in which, “human nature, and human beings purportedly in love, are examined as though under laboratory conditions, and psychological equations are proposed and proved.”³⁹⁹ So with Da Ponte’s title “La scuola degli amanti [The School for (male) Lovers],”⁴⁰⁰ the subject matter of the opera seems to examine, or to propagandize, on the “moral constancy in

³⁹⁴ Abert, 1167.

³⁹⁵ Cairns, 193.

³⁹⁶ Ibid.

³⁹⁷ Abert, 1166n12.

³⁹⁸ Ibid.

³⁹⁹ Cairns, 178.

⁴⁰⁰ Ibid., 176.

women”⁴⁰¹ which causes numerous debates. According to Cairns’ indication, “Da Ponte’s brilliant *Così fan tutte*, if one reads it without the music in mind, is determinedly misogynistic.”⁴⁰² However, he suggests otherwise by offering the example from Jane Austen’s *Persuasion* of Anne Elliot’s sublime “All the privilege I claim for my own sex (it is not a very enviable one, you need not covet it), is that of loving longest, when existence or when hope is gone.”⁴⁰³ When composing, Mozart “frequently undercuts the plot and the words,”⁴⁰⁴ so that through examining the music, Cairns proposes that, one may discover the female characters in *Così*, as in *Figaro*, “feel more deeply than the male[s].”⁴⁰⁵ To see if the librettist or the composer is misogynistic or not, the application of key characteristics and tonal usage to scrutinize the text is helpful.

6.1 Fiordiligi

6.1.1 Character Background

The name Fiordiligi is the Italian version of the French “fleur-de-lis,” the lily flower, which symbolizes purity and chastity.⁴⁰⁶ In Italian, “ligi” is the masculine plural of the word “ligio,”⁴⁰⁷ which means faithful/loyal. So, the name Fiordiligi can be decoded into “fior di ligi” — “flower of fidelity.” The “faithfulness” and “chastity” this character (or Mozart/Da Ponte)

⁴⁰¹ Waldoff, 189.

⁴⁰² Cairns, 179.

⁴⁰³ Jane Austen, *Persuasion*, quoted in Cairns, 180.

⁴⁰⁴ Cairns, 180.

⁴⁰⁵ Ibid.

⁴⁰⁶ Encyclopaedia Britannica, s.v. “Fleur-de-lis,” accessed March 13, 2020, <https://www.britannica.com/topic/fleur-de-lis>.

⁴⁰⁷ Wiktionary, s.v. “ligio,” accessed March 13, 2020, [https://en.wiktionary.org/wiki/ligio#Italian: ligio \(feminine singular: ligia; masculine plural: ligi; feminine plural ligie; alternative feminine plural: lige, the word means: faithful, loyal, or devoted \(to\)\)](https://en.wiktionary.org/wiki/ligio#Italian: ligio (feminine singular: ligia; masculine plural: ligi; feminine plural ligie; alternative feminine plural: lige, the word means: faithful, loyal, or devoted (to))).

wishes to convey not only can be found in her first aria “Come scoglio,” but also from her first scene and duet with her sister, Dorabella. As Brophy states about these two female roles, “Mozart musically distinguishes Fiordiligi’s character from her sister’s largely by virtue of astonishing low notes which play such a heroic part in ‘Come scoglio’; and this despite the fact that it is Dorabella who is technically the mezzo-soprano.”⁴⁰⁸ So as Waldoff states, “On her first appearance, in the duet ‘Ah guarda sorella’ (No. 4), Fiordiligi appears to be virtually indistinguishable from her sister, Dorabella.”⁴⁰⁹ The trademark of Fiordiligi’s low notes defines her rigid faithfulness.

Having said this, Fiordiligi’s moral constancy has been smashed towards the end of drama. The answer to Don Alfonso’s opening scene question, “È la fede delle femmine come l’araba fenice” (Is there any woman’s fidelity like the Arabian phoenix) is ‘none’. The final stage of her alteration causes Fiordiligi’s majestic aria “Come scoglio” in the first act to be “one of the opera’s greatest parodies.”⁴¹⁰ In this aria, the wide leaps and the vocal register shifts become the mocking point.⁴¹¹ As Waldoff states, “this aria represents a parody of *seria* conventions with its wide leaps and other aspects of its setting, ... Da Ponte and Mozart subtly undermine not only Fiordiligi’s avowal of constancy, but the overused simile she invokes.”⁴¹² The case of Fiordiligi’s “Come scoglio” as parody may be very likely because of the premiere Fiordiligi,

⁴⁰⁸ Brophy, 37.

⁴⁰⁹ Waldoff, 229.

⁴¹⁰ Ibid.

⁴¹¹ Ibid., 230-31.

⁴¹² Ibid.

Adriana Ferrarese del Bene, whom Mozart “did not hold in particularly high regard.”⁴¹³ This is indicated in Mozart’s letter, “The leading woman singer, Madame Allegranti, is far better than Madame Ferarese [*sic*], which, I admit, is not saying very much.”⁴¹⁴ Consequently, this leads to the explanation that “It has become a commonplace that this aria represents a parody of seria conventions.”⁴¹⁵

Apart from the circumstances, if one questions if there is any capacity within a woman to feel compassion and to show significant sincerity, the answer is affirmative. Waldoff describes:

If the sentimental heroine is a woman whose moral constancy triumphs over every kind of adversity, then *Così fan tutte* has none. But if she is a woman of feeling whose affectionate sensibility and natural sympathy for the suffering of others make her vulnerable to men, and whose ultimate submission to male desire places her virtue “in distress,” then Fiordiligi is certainly one.⁴¹⁶

“With more strength of character, and conceived on a more heroic ‘Amazonian’ scale,” Kaiser does not doubt that “Fiordiligi is a young woman of deep feeling and great sincerity.”⁴¹⁷

6.1.2 Come scoglio immoto resta

6.1.2.1 Situational Synopsis

In Act 1, Scene 11, No. 13 Sestetto, two strangers⁴¹⁸—their lovers in disguise—enter the house of the two sisters who are frightened and remain at a safe distance from the men.

⁴¹³ Abert, 974.

⁴¹⁴ W.A. Mozart, letter of 16 April 1789, *Letters*, 924, quoted in Waldoff, 232.

⁴¹⁵ Waldoff, 230.

⁴¹⁶ *Ibid.*, 224.

⁴¹⁷ Kaiser, 80-81.

⁴¹⁸ Upon being introduced to the two lovers in disguise for the first time Despina says: “I wonder what they are, Wallachians or Turks?” Toward the end of the second act Despina, now disguised at the Notary, when reading the phony marriage contract out-loud refers to the men as Albanian nobles.

However, the strangers romantically pursue the sisters and declare their love in an exaggerated fashion singing together “in two-part harmonies”⁴¹⁹ (recit. mm. 38–42). Fiordiligi interposes herself between them and Dorabella saying “*Temerari, sortite fuori di questo loco!* (Rash men! Leave this place!)”⁴²⁰ (mm. 44–46) with “highly charged intensity”⁴²¹ and sings her first aria “*Come scoglio.*”

6.1.2.2 Textual and Tonal Analysis

The examination encompasses Fiordiligi’s preceding recitative beginning at measure 44, “*Temerari, sortite fuori,*” through the No. 14 Aria “*Come scoglio.*” The recitative text illustrates provoked rage bursting out from Fiordiligi. The orchestration, with dotted rhythms, also depicts her anger. The aria is unusual with a three-tempo scheme:⁴²² *andante maestoso*, *allegro*, and *più allegro*. Fiordiligi’s opening simile declares that her faith and her love to be like an immovable, indomitable rock. Her aria defends her fidelity. Abert states “even with (or) in her recitative she seems already fully armed like some Amazon warrior about to do battle.”⁴²³

⁴¹⁹ Abert, 1182.

⁴²⁰ Libretto and English Translation, “*Così fan tutte*”, *DM’s Opera Site*.

⁴²¹ Abert, 1182.

⁴²² Waldoff, 234.

⁴²³ Abert, 1183.

Table 6-1: “Temerari, ... Come scoglio immoto resta”—Textual and Tonal Analysis, *Così fan tutte*, No. 14 Aria⁴²⁴

Text	Translation	Action	Affect	Tonal Color	Key Descriptions ⁴²⁵
Orchestral chord: [m. 44]				C major	Matt: ... rude and insolent character, but will not be inappropriate for boisterous dancing and where else one lets one’s joy come forth without inhibition.
					Schu: ... completely pure. Its character is: innocence, simplicity, naivety, children's talk.
					Vog: A majestic key, full of gravity, for it has little charm; splendid.
Recitativo:[m. 44] Temerari,	Rash men!	ordering	incensed, provoked, affronted	F major	Matt: ... capable to express the most beautiful sentiments of the world, be it magnanimity, steadfastness, love, or whatever else is on top of the list of virtues.
					Schu: Complaisance and calm.
					Vog: Good for dead calm.
sortite fuori di questo loco! E non profane l'alito infausto degli infami detti nostro cor, nostro orecchio e nostri affetti.	Leave out from this place! And do not profane the dire breath of the infamous call our hearts, our ears and our loves.	ordering	incensed, provoked, affronted	D minor	Matt: ... humble, calm, at the same time grand, pleasant, and content; capable of promoting devotion in church pieces and peace of mind in secular pieces; for heroic or epic it is the best. Nimbleness, also a dignity etc. Aristotle calls it serious and constant.
					Schu: Melancholy womanliness, the spleen and humours brood.
					Vog: Representation of a storm, inner unrest, agitated, funeral march.
[m. 51] Invan per voi, per gli altri invan si cerca e nostre alme sedur.	In vain for you, for others in vain to seek and seduce our souls.	declaring	angry, provoked, affronted	G minor	Matt: ... the most beautiful tone, combining the seriousness with a certain loveliness, carries an exceptional grace and pleasantness, comfortable for both tender and uplifting, both yearning and happy – in short both for moderate lament and moderate happiness, and thus very flexible. Kircher: “it carries a modest and devout happiness, be happy and full of serious leaps.”

⁴²⁴ Libretto and English Translation, “*Così fan tutte*”, *DM’s Opera Site*, accessed March 23, 2016, http://www.murashev.com/opera/Così_fan_tutte_ossia_La_scuola_degli_amanti_libretto_Italian_English. English translations modified by Meng-Jung Tsai.

⁴²⁵ Abbreviations for the three authors, Mattheson as “Matt,” Schubart as “Schu,” and Vogler as “Vog.” The characteristic agreeing with the texts are highlighted in light red.

Text	Translation	Action	Affect	Tonal Color	Key Descriptions ⁴²⁵
					Schu: Discontent, uneasiness, worry about a failed scheme; bad-tempered gnashing of teeth; in a word: resentment and dislike.
[m. 55] L'intatta fede che per noi già si diede ai cari amanti,	The intact faith that by us already gave to our dear lovers,	declaring	fond of, loving, trusting	E ^b major	<p>Matt: ... a lot of pathos; wants to have to do with nothing but serious and at the same time plaintive things, and is the sworn enemy of opulence.</p> <p>Schu: ... of love, of devotion, of intimate conversation with God.</p> <p>Vog: Key for night and tenderness; <i>affetuoso</i>; Gentle night key; it exercises a monopoly over night pictures; an affable key.</p>
[m. 63] saprem loro serbar infino a morte, a dispetto del mondo e della sorte.	we will know how to keep them until death, despite the world and destiny.	declaring	trusting, devoted	B ^b major	<p>Matt: ... very entertaining; retains a certain modesty; pass both for great and for small matters. Kircher: It elevates the soul to [do] heavy/difficult things.</p> <p>Schu: Cheerful love, clear conscience, hope, aspiration for a better world.</p> <p>Vog: Twilight. Calm; a pleasant key: it might have borrowed a certain special tenderness from E^b. Suggesting solitude; is used repeatedly for soliloquies and expressions of lonely sentiment.</p>
Aria: [m. 1] Come scoglio immoto resta	As the rock remains unmoved	proclaiming	firm, trusting, devoted	B ^b major	<p>Matt: ... very entertaining; retains a certain modesty; pass both for great and for small matters. Kircher: It elevates the soul to [do] heavy/difficult things.</p> <p>Schu: Cheerful love, clear conscience, hope, aspiration for a better world.</p> <p>Vog: Twilight. Calm; a pleasant key: it might have borrowed a certain special tenderness from E^b. Suggesting solitude; is used repeatedly for soliloquies and expressions of lonely sentiment.</p>
[m. 9] contra i ven-	against the winds	proclaiming	firm, trusting, devoted	E ^b major	<p>Matt: ... a lot of pathos; wants to have to do with nothing but serious and at the same time plaintive things, and is the sworn enemy of opulence.</p> <p>Schu: ... of love, of devotion, of intimate conversation with God.</p>

Text	Translation	Action	Affect	Tonal Color	Key Descriptions ⁴²⁵
					Vog: Key for night and tenderness; <i>affetuoso</i> ; Gentle night key; it exercises a monopoly over night pictures; an affable key.
[m. 10] - ti	winds	proclaiming	firm, trusting, devoted	F minor	<p>Matt: ... depict a moderate and calm, but deep and heavy mortal fear in the heart that is combined with some desperation, and is nimble beyond measure. It very nicely express a black melancholy and will sometimes cause the listener a horror or shiver.</p> <p>Schu: Deep depression, funereal lament, groans of misery and longing for the grave.</p> <p>Vog: After struggling with Furies, failing to bar Pollux from underworld, and before departing in a rage, Phoebe delivers a turbulent, dark-hued f-minor aria; The underworld scenes.</p>
[m. 11] e la tempesta, così ognor quest'alma è forte nella fede e nell'amor.	and the storm, so always this spirit is strong in its faith and in its love.	proclaiming	firm, trusting, devoted, faithful, fond	B ^b major	<p>Matt: ... very entertaining; retains a certain modesty; pass both for great and for small matters. Kircher: It elevates the soul to [do] heavy/difficult things.</p> <p>Schu: Cheerful love, clear conscience, hope, aspiration for a better world.</p> <p>Vog: Twilight. Calm; a pleasant key: it might have borrowed a certain special tenderness from E^b. Suggesting solitude; is used repeatedly for soliloquies and expressions of lonely sentiment.</p>
[m. 24] Con noi nacque quella face che ci piace, e ci	With us was born that manner which we please, and	proclaiming	devoted, faithful, fond	F major	<p>Matt: ... the most beautiful sentiments of the world, be it magnanimity, steadfastness, love, or whatever else is on top of the list of virtues, in such a natural way and incompatible ease that there is no coercion involved; the gentleness and character of this tone cannot be described in different terms than to compare it to a beautiful person whom everything he does, and be it as it could, makes look perfect, and who, as the French say, has <i>bonne grace</i>.</p> <p>Schu: Complaisance and calm.</p> <p>Vog: Calm; F appeared to agree especially with a quiet joy in happy shades of Elysium; a group of blessed spirits presents a dance; outer calm.</p>

Text	Translation	Action	Affect	Tonal Color	Key Descriptions ⁴²⁵
[m. 30] consola;	consoles us;	proclaiming	devoted, faithful, fond	C major	Matt: ... rude and insolent character, boisterous dancing, lets one's joy come forth without inhibition; something charming and sometimes even apply it to tender moments.
					Schu: ... completely pure; innocence, simplicity, naivety, children's talk.
					Vog: ... broad; A majestic key, full of gravity, for it has little charm; splendid.
[m. 33] e potrà la morte sola	and only death alone will be able	proclaiming	firm, trusting, devoted, faithful	F major	Matt: ... the most beautiful sentiments of the world, be it magnanimity, steadfastness, love, or whatever else is on top of the list of virtues, in such a natural way and incompatible ease that there is no coercion involved; the gentleness and character of this tone cannot be described in different terms than to compare it to a beautiful person whom everything he does, and be it as it could, makes look perfect, and who, as the French say, has <i>bonne grace</i> .
					Schu: Complaisance and calm.
					Vog: Calm; F appeared to agree especially with a quiet joy in happy shades of Elysium; a group of blessed spirits presents a dance; outer calm.
[m. 38] far che can-	to change its	proclaiming	firm, trusting, devoted, faithful	D minor	Matt: ... humble, calm, at the same time grand, pleasant, and content; capable of promoting devotion in church pieces and peace of mind in secular pieces; for heroic or epic it is the best. Nimbleness, also a dignity etc. Aristotle calls it serious and constant.
					Schu: Melancholy womanliness, the spleen and humours brood.
					Vog: Representation of a storm, inner unrest, agitated, funeral march.
[m.39] -gi affetto	change its affection	proclaiming	firm, trusting, devoted, faithful	G minor	Matt: ... the most beautiful tone, combining the seriousness with a certain loveliness, carries an exceptional grace and pleasantness, comfortable for both tender and uplifting, both yearning and happy – in short both for moderate lament and moderate happiness, and thus very flexible. Kircher: "it carries a modest and devout happiness, be happy and full of serious leaps."

Text	Translation	Action	Affect	Tonal Color	Key Descriptions ⁴²⁵
					Schu: Discontent, uneasiness, worry about a failed scheme; bad-tempered gnashing of teeth; in a word: resentment and dislike.
[m. 40] il cor, far che cangi affetto il cor. far che can-	in our heart, to make change its affection in the heart. to make change	proclaiming	firm, trusting, devoted, faithful	F major	<p>Matt: ... the most beautiful sentiments of the world, be it magnanimity, steadfastness, love, or whatever else is on top of the list of virtues, in such a natural way and incompatible ease that there is no coercion involved; the gentleness and character of this tone cannot be described in different terms than to compare it to a beautiful person whom everything he does, and be it as it could, makes look perfect, and who, as the French say, has <i>bonne grace</i>.</p> <p>Schu: Complaisance and calm.</p> <p>Vog: Calm; F appeared to agree especially with a quiet joy in happy shades of Elysium; a group of blessed spirits presents a dance; outer calm.</p>
[m. 48] -gi af-	change affection	proclaiming	trusting, devoted, faithful	C major	
[m. 49] -fetto il cor.	affection in the heart.	proclaiming	trusting, devoted, faithful	F major	
[m. 57] [Interlude]				F minor	<p>Matt: ... depict a moderate and calm, but deep and heavy mortal fear in the heart that is combined with some desperation, and is nimble beyond measure. It very nicely expresses a black melancholy and will sometimes cause the listener a horror or shiver.</p> <p>Schu: Deep depression, funeral lament, groans of misery and longing for the grave.</p> <p>Vog: After struggling with Furies, failing to bar Pollux from underworld, and before departing in a rage, Phoebe delivers a turbulent, dark-hued f-minor aria; The underworld scenes.</p>
[m. 58] Come scoglio immoto resta	As the rock remains unmoved	proclaiming	firm, trusting, devoted	C major	<p>Matt: ... rude and insolent character, boisterous dancing, lets one's joy come forth without inhibition; something charming and sometimes even apply it to tender moments.</p> <p>Schu: ... completely pure; innocence, simplicity, naivety, children's talk.</p>

Text	Translation	Action	Affect	Tonal Color	Key Descriptions ⁴²⁵
					Vog: ... broad; A majestic key, full of gravity, for it has little charm; splendid.
[m. 62] contra i venti e la tempesta, così ognor quest'alma è forte nella fede e nell'amor.	against the winds and the storm, so always this spirit is strong in its faith and in its love.	proclaiming	firm, trusting, devoted, faithful, fond	B ^b major	<p>Matt: ... very entertaining; retains a certain modesty; pass both for great and for small matters. Kircher: It elevates the soul to [do] heavy/difficult things.</p> <p>Schu: Cheerful love, clear conscience, hope, aspiration for a better world.</p> <p>Vog: Twilight. Calm; a pleasant key: it might have borrowed a certain special tenderness from E^b. Suggesting solitude; is used repeatedly for soliloquies and expressions of lonely sentiment.</p>
[m. 76] nella fede e nell'amor.	in its faith and in its love.	proclaiming	devoted, faithful, fond	F major	
[m. 82] Rispettate, anime ingrato, quest'esempio di costanza, e una barbara speranza non vi renda audaci ancor, e una barbara spera-	Respect yourself, ungrateful souls, this example of constancy, and a barbarous hope will not render you bold again, and a barbarous hope	commanding proclaiming	affronted, provoked, trusting, faithful, devoted	B ^b major	<p>Matt: ... very entertaining; retains a certain modesty; pass both for great and for small matters. Kircher: It elevates the soul to [do] heavy/difficult things.</p> <p>Schu: Cheerful love, clear conscience, hope, aspiration for a better world.</p> <p>Vog: Twilight. Calm; a pleasant key: it might have borrowed a certain special tenderness from E^b. Suggesting solitude; is used repeatedly for soliloquies and expressions of lonely sentiment.</p>
[m. 96] -a- (coloratura)				C minor	<p>Matt: ... very lovely but also sad tone; tires easily of sweet things; try to enliven it by a merry or even movement, become a bit sleepy from its moderation. Should it be a piece though that is supposed to encourage sleep this remark is superfluous and you can just get to that goal in a natural way.</p> <p>Schu: ... of love and at the same time the lament of unhappy love. All languishing, longing, sighing of the love-sick soul lies in this key.</p> <p>Vog: ... a choice which is justified as follows: to express sadness, the minor quality is appropriate.</p>

Text	Translation	Action	Affect	Tonal Color	Key Descriptions ⁴²⁵
[m. 97] -anza non vi renda auda-	hope will not render you	proclaiming	trusting, faithful, devoted	B ^b major	Matt: ... very entertaining; retains a certain modesty; pass both for great and for small matters. Kircher: It elevates the soul to [do] heavy/difficult things.
					Schu: Cheerful love, clear conscience, hope, aspiration for a better world.
					Vog: Twilight. Calm; a pleasant key: it might have borrowed a certain special tenderness from E ^b . Suggesting solitude; is used repeatedly for soliloquies and expressions of lonely sentiment.
[m. 104] -ci ancor,	bold again,	proclaiming	trusting, faithful, devoted	G minor	Matt: ... the most beautiful tone, combining the seriousness with a certain loveliness, carries an exceptional grace and pleasantness, comfortable for both tender and uplifting, both yearning and happy – in short both for moderate lament and moderate happiness, and thus very flexible. Kircher: “it carries a modest and devout happiness, be happy and full of serious leaps.”
					Schu: Discontent, uneasiness, worry about a failed scheme; bad-tempered gnashing of teeth; in a word: resentment and dislike.
[m. 106] non vi renda au(da)ci ancor!	will not render you bold again!	proclaiming	trusting, faithful, devoted	B ^b major (F major)	Matt: ... very entertaining; retains a certain modesty; pass both for great and for small matters. Kircher: It elevates the soul to [do] heavy/difficult things.
					Schu: Cheerful love, clear conscience, hope, aspiration for a better world.
					Vog: Twilight. Calm; a pleasant key: it might have borrowed a certain special tenderness from E ^b . Suggesting solitude; is used repeatedly for soliloquies and expressions of lonely sentiment.
[m. 116] non vi ren-	will not render	proclaiming	faithful, devoted	G minor	
[m. 118] -da au-	render bold	proclaiming	faithful, devoted	F minor	
[m. 119] -daci ancor.	bold again.	proclaiming	faithful, devoted	B ^b major	

6.1.2.3 Application

- Tonal Colors in *Recitativo*: C – F – d – g – E^b – B^b.

Fiordiligi reveals her attitude full of *majesty* and *gravity* with her *pure* heart (C major, Vogler & Schubart) from the orchestral C major chord in measure 44. *Steadfastly* (F major, Mattheson) with her faith, she calls out “*Temerari*” (rash men), and strives to stay *calm* (F major, Schubart & Vogler) even though she feels provoked and affronted. With her *dignity*, the *devoted* lady (D minor, Mattheson), now venting her *spleen* (D minor, Schubart), *agitatedly* (Vogler) asks the two strangers to leave and not profane the ladies’ pure heart. *Gnashing with teeth*, she *dislikes* (G minor, Schubart) the infamous words from these trespassers. She *seriously* (E^b major, Mattheson) declares that the *love, devotion* (Schubart) and *tender affection* (Vogler) has already been given to their beloved ones. *Suggesting solitude* (B^b major, Vogler)— “until death,” she claims to keep their *love* (Schubart) and constancy. Fiordiligi *elevates the soul* (Mattheson) and *hopes* (Schubart) the farce can be passed.

- Tonal Colors in *Aria*: B^b – E^b – (f) – B^b – B^b – F – C – F – d – g – F – f – c – B^b – F –
[Andante maestoso] [Allegro]
B^b – C – B^b – g – B^b – F – B^b – g – f – B^b.
[Più Allegro]

The B^b major aria “Come scoglio” also contains the tonal colors of major tonalities E^b, F, and C; colors of minor tonalities F, D, G, and C minor. *Retaining* her faith as the rock, Fiordiligi *elevates her soul* (B^b major, Mattheson) to show her devotion—*nothing difficult* (Mattheson) will defeat her *love* and *hope* with a *clear conscience* (Schubart). No storm or tempest can destroy her *serious devotion* and *tender affection* (E^b major, Mattheson, Schubart & Vogler), for her spirit in its faith and in its love can resist the *dark turbulence* (F minor, Vogler). (*It elevates*

the soul to do heavy/difficult things, B^b major, Mattheson.)

The second quatrain (mm. 24–53) begins with its dominant, F major. *With the most beautiful sentiments and on top of the list of virtues*, this lady claims they were born with the manner to retain constancy (*steadfastness*, F major, Mattheson). Within this manner—love—will bring consolation (C major: *tender moments*, Mattheson, and *pure, innocent character*, Schubart). Retaining her *outer calmness* (F major, Vogler & Schubart), Fiordiligi expresses again “only death can be able to change their affection” (D minor: a *heroic devotion* and *dignity*, Mattheson). She demonstrates her *exceptional grace*, with *seriousness combining a certain loveliness* (G minor, Mattheson). The wide leaping melody (mm. 38–43) betrays a sense of *uneasiness* and *worry* (G minor, Schubart) inside of her, however the key shift back to F major (mm. 42–43) strengthens Fiordiligi’s attitude with *steadfastness* and her *incomparable ease* (Mattheson).

At measure 58, she again demonstrates her first proposition, as the unmoved rock, starting from C major, which provides the meaning of *broadness*, *majesty*, and *gravity* (Vogler). As the tonal center transposes to B^b and F major, her belief, *the top list of virtues* (F, Mattheson), remains to *elevate the soul* with this *difficult* task and to *hope for a better world* (B^b, Mattheson & Schubart).

Fiordiligi’s third quatrain comes with the third tempo, *più allegro*, returning back to B^b major. As previously mentioned about the features of B^b, F and C major, her attitude and claim remains the same. Da Ponte adds a new idea in her text in this stanza, “una barbara speranza” (a barbarous hope), and Mozart employs a coloratura section of C minor (mm. 95–97) to depict, as Fiordiligi describes it, the hope of the two invaders. She scorns the ridiculous hope—*lovely*

but sad tone (C minor, Mattheson), and the two *love-sick souls* (C minor, Schubart). Then she brings back her attitude and *clear conscience* to convince the Albanians that the “*hope will not render you bold again*” (B^b major, Schubart), *suggesting solitude* (Vogler) for them. Above all, Fiordiligi’s text and her state of mind in the aria “Come scoglio” considerably conform with the key’s affective perspectives from the three theorists.

The investigation provided above, shows that the key properties support the text, which would mean that Mozart confirms the truth of Fiordiligi’s wish to remain strong in her faith and love. So, consecutive questions exist: why Da Ponte and Mozart titled the opera “*Così fan tutte*?”—“That is what all women do?” and why Da Ponte adopted Metastasio’s verse but changed from “*È la fede degli ‘amanti’ come l’araba fenice*” to “*È la fede degli ‘femmine’?*”⁴²⁶ Why did the creators of the opera implant a powerful steadfast moment for Fiordiligi to display her manifesto of fidelity, yet later they embedded a defeat of her constancy in Act 2? A few traces can be discovered in Waldoff’s statement about the society in the late eighteenth century. She describes, “As *Così* demonstrates, the demands society makes on the woman of sensibility are so contradictory that even the most devoted heroin might easily stumble on the culture’s conflicting directives.”⁴²⁷ Since the opera was composed in the period of the Late Enlightenment, the reasonable explanation would be the authors would embed “an independent thinking” for women “standing in opposition to convention.”⁴²⁸ Also, the authors

⁴²⁶ Waldoff, 191: The original verse is “*È la fede degli amanti come l’arabe fenice: che vi sia, ciascun lo dice; dove sia, nessun losa.*” From *Demetrio* (1731), by Metastasio, quoted in <http://www-5.unipv.it/girardi/Metastasio.pdf>.

⁴²⁷ *Ibid.*, 228.

⁴²⁸ John Kerns, “Mozart’s Don Giovanni: An Enlightenment Hero?” *The Atlas Society*, last modified August 13, 2010, accessed March 22, 2020, <https://atlassociety.org/commentary/commentary-blog/3902-mozarts-don-giovanni-an-enlightenment-hero>.

conveyed a message to women learning how to feel. According to Waldoff:

At the same time, the culture of sensibility sent mixed messages to women. The ideal of moral constancy could easily be undone by the desire for romance, and the acute sensibility that marked the woman of sensibility often led to her victimization. Fiordiligi's and Dorabella's sentimental understanding leads them at first to take imaginative pleasure in their romances, as when in their first scene we see them congratulating themselves on their happiness and preparing for matrimony; later it supports their resistance to new suitors, in the act 1 sextet (No. 13) and in Fiordiligi's impressive aria of resistance, "Come scoglio immoto resta" (No. 14). But their vulnerability opens them to victimization, and the events of act 2 set their desire for romance against their "wished-for resistance to men." The crux of Don Alfonso's ruse, ... is to force the women's natural sensibilities into just such a contradiction: to set their susceptibility to feeling *against* their vows of constancy.⁴²⁹

So, in order to reveal a process of Fiordiligi's self-awareness due to her sympathy in her second aria "Per Pieta, ben mio, perdona" (No. 25), Da Ponte and Mozart arranged a strong and fierce preceding opposition—"Come scoglio immoto resta," from which a female's transformation would be explicit to the audience.

6.2 Despina

6.2.1 Character Background

The first impression of the character of Despina frequently falls into a rank of a cynical and roguish maid. She accepts the wage offered by Don Alfonso and works as a confederate to "play a part in the seduction scenario"⁴³⁰ fabricated by the misogynist Don Alfonso. In the whole opera, Despina seemingly does everything unusual—she drinks her mistresses' chocolate, which "is not merely enacting a breach in the servant's behavior;"⁴³¹ she frankly speaks out her detestation and dissension while doing her servility, "more than either Figaro or

⁴²⁹ Waldoff, 228.

⁴³⁰ Kaiser, 58.

⁴³¹ Giuseppe Gazzola, "Betting Against Themselves: Conflicting Conceptions of Love in *Così fan tutte*, o: *la scola degli amanti*," *MLN* 130, no. 1 (2015): 105-123, accessed March 02, 2020, doi:10.1353/mln.2015.0002.

Leporello had done;”⁴³² she also has to dress up, twice in the entire play, as a doctor with Mesmer’s magnet and as a notary to promote this experimental plot. She appears on the stage in an even shrewder and more cunning way than Susanna in *Le nozze di Figaro*.

However, as found in the previous discussion of Donna Anna’s true personality, the similar condition emerges when examining this character—what is Despina’s true character or her intention? Analyzing this role from any moment after her decision to enter into Alfonso’s trickery would be inexact. It will only orient the analysis of this character towards traditional readings, in which “Despina playing into a patriarchal and misogynistic expectation of female sexual decorum misses the revisionist opportunity and cheerful resistance to erotic constraint that Despina’s incitement provides.”⁴³³ So, to reveal the true personality of Despina, I scrutinize the libretto from before the maid and the old philosopher’s trade agreement.

As the sisters express their sentiments of despair since their men have left with the army, Despina utters the rational “Bravi, ‘vi par’, ma non è ver: ancora non vi fu donna che d’amor sia morta. (Splendid! ‘That’s what you think’, but that’s not true: No woman yet has ever died for love.)”⁴³⁴ The maid voices an independent female thought. Gazzola argues that Despina’s words actually “represents a departure from notions of chauvinistic relationships.”⁴³⁵ The choreographer/stage director, Anne Teresa De Keersmaeker, also states:

⁴³² Ibid.

⁴³³ Gazzola, “Betting Against Themselves.”

⁴³⁴ Da Ponte, *Così fan tutte*: Libretto and English Translation, *Opera Folio*, accessed March 23, 2016, http://www.operafolio.com/libretto.asp?n=Così_fan_tutte&translation=UK#Top. English translations modified by Meng-Jung Tsai.

⁴³⁵ Gazzola, “Betting Against Themselves.”

While the men supposedly go off to war, she obliges the women, afflicted and left at home, to face reality. "Do you really think your fiancées who have gone to war will remain faithful? My young doves, have no illusions. Instead of sitting sobbing, do as I do, go hunting!" She makes a plea for feminine autonomy, for pleasure and a sense of reality. The process they undergo invites them to take a new look at relations between men and women.⁴³⁶

According to Despina, the statement "no woman has ever died for love," provides a solid premise for her logic. She even sings her first aria denoting men's fickle fidelity in order to usher the sisters away from "the medieval idea of chivalric love."⁴³⁷ Not only her mind of logic, but in her disguise, her knowledge of speaking Latin, of the Mesmer stone, and the way she conducts the matrimonial contract (of course, her presentations looks buffoonish) also demonstrates Despina's understanding of science. Indeed, Despina is a character with liberal thinking who is willing to break the conventional course, just as the change that the French Revolution endowed "the transmission of power from the aristocracy to the bourgeoisie."⁴³⁸ At the same time Da Ponte wrote *Così fan tutte*, Despina is the spokesperson of the Age of Enlightenment.

6.2.2 In uomini! In soldati

6.2.2.1 Situational Synopsis

The No. 12 Aria "In uomini! In soldati" by Despina appears in Act 1, Scene 9. The sisters are suffering from their beloveds having left. After Despina realizes the situation, she first laughs at the sisters replying "Ritorneran." (They'll be back).⁴³⁹ Then she ridicules the sisters'

⁴³⁶ Anne Teresa De Keersmaeker, interview by Wannes Gyselincx, "All the Same, Men and Women Alike," *Opéra National de Paris*, accessed March 01, 2020, <https://www.operadeparis.fr/en/magazine/tous-les-memes-toutes-les-memes>.

⁴³⁷ Gazzola, "Betting Against Themselves."

⁴³⁸ Keersmaeker, interview by Gyselincx.

⁴³⁹ *Così fan tutte*: Libretto and English Translation, *Opera Folio*.

woeful thoughts—they may be killed—saying “Allora, poi, tanto meglio per voi.” (Well then, even better for you).⁴⁴⁰ It is very likely to the sisters that life without their lovers is pointless—with the thoughts of cavalier conventions, they wish to die. So, Despina sings this aria saying, “O women, let us play the same token as men do.”⁴⁴¹

6.2.2.2 Textual and Tonal Analysis

The examination of the aria “In uomini” begins with the preceding recitative at measure 53. In this aria in F major Despina presents a counterclaim to Alfonso’s “Così fan tutte”: all men are like that— “mobili” and “inconstanti”.⁴⁴² It contains two sections in different meter signatures: 2/4 and 6/8. The first section of the aria is like a *recitativo accompagnato* in a *buffa* way as Despina asks the question: “In uomini? In soldati? Sperare fedeltà?” (In men? In soldiers? You hope for their fidelity?) The selection of the preceding recitative is from Despina’s line, “Via via, passaro i tempi” (Go on with you, the times are past, m. 53). The key in the recitative is directly established in F major, leading into the aria. Since the tonal center of the selected recitative is the same as the following aria, they are combined in the discussion of F major below. The treatment of this aria differs from the other selected arias and therefore the key descriptions that disagree with the texts are in italicized bold typeface in Table 6-2. The explanation of this treatment is provided in the following discussion.

⁴⁴⁰ Ibid.

⁴⁴¹ *Così fan tutte*: Libretto and English Translation, *DM’s Opera Site*, translations modified by Meng-Jung Tsai.

⁴⁴² Gazzola, “Betting Against Themselves.”

Table 6-2: “Via via, passaro i tempi ... In uomini! In soldati”—Textual and Tonal Analysis, *Così fan tutte*, No. 12 Aria⁴⁴³

Text	Translation	Action	Affect	Tonal Color	Key Descriptions ⁴⁴⁴
Recitativo: [m. 53] Via via, passaro i tempi da spacciar queste favole ai bambini.	Go on with you, the times are past for spreading such fairy tales to children.	declaring	<i>scornful</i>	F major	Matt: ... express <i>the most beautiful sentiments of the world, be it magnanimity, steadfastness, love, or whatever else is on top of the list of virtues</i> , and all this in such a natural way and incompatible ease that there is no coercion involved, <i>the gentleness and character of this tone cannot be described in different terms than to compare it to a beautiful person</i> whom everything he does, and be it as it could, <i>makes look perfect</i> , and who, as the French say, has <i>bonne grace</i> .
					Schu: <i>Complaisance</i> and calm.
					Vog: Good for dead calm. In Gluck’s <i>Orpheus</i> and Vogler’s <i>Castor and Pollux</i> , F appeared to agree especially with a quiet joy <i>in happy shades of Elysium</i> .
Aria: [m. 1] In uomini, in soldati sperare fedeltà?	In men, in soldiers? you hope for fidelity?	posing	scoffing	F major	Matt: ... express <i>the most beautiful sentiments of the world, be it magnanimity, steadfastness, love, or whatever else is on top of the list of virtues</i> , and all this in such a natural way and incompatible ease that there is no coercion involved, <i>the gentleness and character of this tone cannot be described in different terms than to compare it to a beautiful person</i> whom everything he does, and be it as it could, <i>makes look perfect</i> , and who, as the French say, has <i>bonne grace</i> .
					Schu: <i>Complaisance</i> and calm.
					Vog: Good for dead calm. In Gluck’s <i>Orpheus</i> and Vogler’s <i>Castor and Pollux</i> , F appeared to agree especially with a quiet joy <i>in happy shades of Elysium</i> .
[m. 18] fedeltà?	fidelity?	posing	scoffing	C major	Matt: ... a rude and insolent character, but will not be inappropriate for boisterous dancing and where else one lets one’s joy come forth without inhibition; something charming and sometimes apply it to tender moments.
					Schu: ... completely <i>pure</i> . Its character is: <i>innocence, simplicity, naivety</i> , children’s talk.

⁴⁴³ Libretto and English Translation, “*Così fan tutte*”, *DM’s Opera Site*, accessed March 23, 2016, http://www.murashev.com/opera/Così_fan_tutte,_ossia_La_scuola_degli_amanti_libretto_Italian_English. English translations modified by Meng-Jung Tsai.

⁴⁴⁴ Abbreviations for the three authors, Mattheson as “Matt,” Schubart as “Schu,” and Vogler as “Vog.” The characteristic agreeing with the texts are highlighted in light red; those disagreeing with the texts are in *italicized bold* typeface.

Text	Translation	Action	Affect	Tonal Color	Key Descriptions ⁴⁴⁴
					Vog: ... for pure subjects. A majestic key, full of gravity, for it has little charm; splendid, whose character required some charm.
[m. 20] Non vi fate sentir, per carità! Di pasta simile son tutti quanti: le fronde mobili, l'aure incostanti han più degli uomini stabilità.	Don't tell me that, for pity's sake! The same stuff all men are made of: the swaying boughs, the fickle breezes have greater stability than men have.	declaring	scoffing	F major	Matt: ... express the most beautiful sentiments of the world, be it magnanimity, steadfastness, love, or whatever else is on top of the list of virtues , and all this in such a natural way and incompatible ease that there is no coercion involved, the gentleness and character of this tone cannot be described in different terms than to compare it to a beautiful person whom everything he does, and be it as it could, makes look perfect , and who, as the French say, has <i>bonne grace</i> . Schu: Complaisance and calm. Vog: Good for dead calm. In Gluck's <i>Orpheus</i> and Vogler's <i>Castor and Pollux</i> , F appeared to agree especially with a quiet joy in happy shades of Elysium .
[m. 33] Mentite lagrime, fallaci sguardi, voci ingannevoli,	Lying tears, false looks, deceitful voices,	declaring, mocking	scoffing	C major	Matt: ... a rude and insolent character, but will not be inappropriate for boisterous dancing and where else one lets one's joy come forth without inhibition; something charming and sometimes apply it to tender moments. Schu: ... completely pure . Its character is: innocence, simplicity, naivety , children's talk. Vog: ... for pure subjects. A majestic key, full of gravity, for it has little charm; splendid, whose character required some charm.
[m. 38] vezzi bugiardi,	lying charms,	declaring, mocking	scoffing	G major	Matt: ... has much that is insinuating and speaking; Kircher: amorous and voluptuous, also a " honest guardian of temperance ". Corvinus: merry and amorous things. Schu: ... rustic, idyllic and lyrical, every calm and satisfied passion, every tender gratitude for true friendship and faithful love ,—in a word every gentle and peaceful emotion of the heart is correctly expressed by this key . Vog: Already livelier, although not stormy. Naïve actions, especially of innocent rustic pleasures .
[m. 39] son le primarie lor qualità.	these are their primary qualities.	declaring	scoffing	C major	Matt: ... a rude and insolent character, but will not be inappropriate for boisterous dancing and where else one lets one's joy come forth without inhibition; something charming and sometimes apply it to tender moments.

Text	Translation	Action	Affect	Tonal Color	Key Descriptions ⁴⁴⁴
					Schu: ... completely pure . Its character is: innocence, simplicity, naivety , children's talk.
					Vog: ... for pure subjects. A majestic key, full of gravity, for it has little charm; splendid, whose character required some charm.
[m. 45] In noi non amano che il lor diletto,	In us they love only their delight,	declaring, warning	scoffing	G minor	Matt: ... almost the most beautiful tone, not only combining the seriousness with a certain loveliness, but also carries with it an exceptional grace and pleasantness , through which it is comfortable for both tender and uplifting , both yearning and happy .
					Schu: Discontent, uneasiness, worry about a failed scheme; bad-tempered gnashing of teeth; in a word: resentment and dislike.
[m. 47] poi ci dispregiano,	then they despise us	declaring, warning	scoffing	F minor	Matt: ... depict a moderate and calm, but deep and heavy mortal fear in the heart that is combined with some desperation, and is nimble beyond measure, black melancholy and will sometimes cause the listener a horror or shiver.
					Schu: Deep depression, funereal lament, groans of misery and longing for the grave.
					Vog: ... struggling with Furies, underworld, a turbulent, dark-hued f-minor aria.
[m. 48] neganci affetto,	deny us affection,	declaring, warning	scoffing	F major	Matt: ... express the most beautiful sentiments of the world, be it magnanimity, steadfastness, love, or whatever else is on top of the list of virtues , and all this in such a natural way and incompatible ease that there is no coercion involved.
					Schu: Complaisance and calm.
					Vog: Good for dead calm, especially with a quiet joy in happy shades of Elysium .
[m. 49] né val da' barbari chieder pietà.	nor worth from barbarians to ask for mercy.	declaring, warning	scoffing	B ^b major	Matt: ... very entertaining but likes to retain a certain modesty and can therefore pass both for great and for small matters. Kircher: It elevates the soul to [do] heavy/difficult things.
					Schu: Cheerful love , clear conscience, hope , aspiration for a better world.
					Vog: Twilight. Calm; a pleasant key; it might have borrowed a certain special tenderness from E ^b .

Text	Translation	Action	Affect	Tonal Color	Key Descriptions ⁴⁴⁴
[m. 51] né val da' barbari chieder pietà.	nor worth from barbarians to ask for mercy.	declaring, warning	scoffing	F major	Matt: ... express <i>the most beautiful sentiments of the world, be it magnanimity, steadfastness, love, or whatever else is on top of the list of virtues</i> , and all this in such a natural way and incompatible ease that there is no coercion involved.
					Schu: <i>Complaisance</i> and calm.
					Vog: Good for dead calm, especially with a quiet joy in <i>happy shades of Elysium</i> .
[m. 56] chieder pietà.	to ask for mercy.	declaring, warning	scoffing	F minor	Matt: ... depict a moderate and calm, but deep and heavy mortal fear in the heart that is combined with some desperation, and is nimble beyond measure, black melancholy and will sometimes cause the listener a horror or shiver.
					Schu: Deep depression, funereal lament, groans of misery and longing for the grave.
					Vog: ... struggling with Furies, from underworld, a turbulent, dark-hued f-minor aria.
[m. 58] Paghiam, o femmine, d'ugual moneta questa malefica razza indiscreta. Amiam per comodo, per vanità. La ra la, la ra la, la ra la la. Amiam per comodo, ecc.	We pay, oh women, of equal money this maleficent indiscreet species. Let us love for our convenience and for vanity. La ra la, la ra la, la ra la la. Let us love for our convenience, etc.	declaring, warning	exhilarated, en- thusiastic	F major	Matt: ... express the most beautiful sentiments of the world, be it magnanimity, steadfastness, love, or whatever else is <i>on top of the list of virtues</i> , and all this in such a natural way and incompatible ease that there is no coercion involved, the gentleness and character of this tone cannot be described in different terms than to compare it to a beautiful person whom everything he does, and be it as it could, <i>makes look perfect</i> , and who, as the French say, has <i>bonne grace</i> .
					Schu: <i>Complaisance</i> and calm.
					Vog: Good for dead calm. In Gluck's <i>Orpheus</i> and Vogler's <i>Castor and Pollux</i> , F appeared to agree especially with a quiet joy in happy shades of Elysium.

6.2.2.3 Application

- Tonal Colors in *Recitativo*: F.
- Tonal Colors in *Aria*: F – C – F – C – G – C – g – f – F – B^b – f – F.

Though the association of F major in both the recitative and aria is—the key of *the most beautiful sentiments* (Mattheson), or *complaisance* (Schubart), “In uomini” deviates from the key characteristics above, however retaining Despina’s manner which is *calm* (F major, Schubart & Vogler). In this case, in order to discuss something different from daily life, Despina intentionally offers a new idea to challenge the sisters’ rigid thinking. To show this, the treatment of key characteristics is so different from the treatment in any other aria that the only logical explanation must be that it was, in fact, meant to be ironic. In this sense, Despina asks “do you think men and soldiers have *the most beautiful sentiments, steadfastness, and the most faithful love?* (aria mm. 1–18: F major, Mattheson) Go on, keep your *complaisance* (Schubart) to spread such fairy tales to children (recit. mm. 53–55).”⁴⁴⁵ She derisively questions the ladies again: “Please do not tell me those *rude and insolent characters* are faithful (mm. 18–20). Men will *boisterously let their joy come forth without inhibition.* (C major, Mattheson) My dear *Signora*, do not be so *innocent and naïve!* (Schubart)”

After her scoffing indication “Don’t tell me you believe in that, for pity’s sake! (mm. 20–23)”⁴⁴⁶ The folklike second section starts also in F major, and its form is based on the musical style of *Siciliana*.⁴⁴⁷ According to Abert:

⁴⁴⁵ Libretto and English Translation, *DM’s Opera Site*, translations modified by Meng-Jung Tsai.

⁴⁴⁶ *Ibid.*

⁴⁴⁷ Abert, 1181.

Textually and musically she (Despina) behaves like [sic] a true child of opera buffa, expressing her contempt of men in the form of a siciliana, in which men's falseness is underlined by drones involving a pedal point and appoggiaturas that tell the same old story.⁴⁴⁸

Despina explicates that all men are made of the same ingredients, like pasta. Men are like the swaying boughs, not so *steadfast* (Mattheson); men are like the fickle breezes, not too dependable. They do not have the greatest stability, "*or whatever else is on top of the list of virtues*" (F major, Mattheson). Their lying tears (m. 33) and false looks (m. 35) are *not simple* (C major, Schubart). Their deceitful voices are not *pure and innocent* (Schubart), contrariwise, they are *rude and insolent* (Mattheson). Men love only their delight (mm. 45–47); falling for them will only bring you *resentment and dislike* (G minor, Schubart). They despise ladies (m. 48), they cause you *desperation* (F minor, Mattheson) and *deep depression* (Schubart). *Hoping* (mm. 49–51: B^b major, Schubart) for mercy from those barbarians will be *very entertaining* (Mattheson); this is only *cheerful love* (Schubart) from a female's cavalier dream. Despina says that whoever keeps asking for mercy (m. 56) from those men will *groan in misery* (F minor, Schubart) and bring *deep and heavy mortal fear* to their *heart* (Mattheson).

After the fermata at the measure 58, Despina adds that women in fact pay with the equal token in F major. As she regards women as her subject in this verse, the descriptions of F major agrees with her texts. She expresses that *with the most beautiful sentiments* the female should allow themselves *love "in such a natural way and incompatible ease that there is no coercion involved"* (F major, Mattheson). Da Ponte, by depicting Despina in this manner, advocates a new liberal opinion for women and urges females to understand themselves, by

⁴⁴⁸ Ibid.

thinking and by feeling. Gazzola provides an effective argument of Da Ponte's *Così fan tutte*:

Da Ponte's libretto, rather than dramatizing gender stereotypes and gender conflicts with a misogynistic attitude, marks an important intervention in a larger cultural transition involving theories of love and erotic engagement.⁴⁴⁹

Da Ponte's texts clearly challenge the thinking of that time with regard to gender roles, class standing, sexuality, and so on. People criticize the opera, targeting on its title. However, in Da Ponte's *Memoirs*, the subtitle of the work—*La scuola degli amanti (The School for Male Lovers)*, is “often ignored.”⁴⁵⁰ Grammatically speaking, this school could suggest either a plural masculine, or an integrative gender-neutral plural, or both.⁴⁵¹ This provides a clue that Da Ponte is not misogynistic as Cairns describes.⁴⁵² Nevertheless, the descriptions of key characteristics do reveal an essential guideline to the intention of Mozart and Da Ponte, the intention of the Enlightenment—the ideas about reason, nature, and humanity.⁴⁵³

⁴⁴⁹ Gazzola, “Betting Against Themselves.”

⁴⁵⁰ Ibid.

⁴⁵¹ Ibid.

⁴⁵² Cairns, 179.

⁴⁵³ Encyclopaedia Britannica, s.v. “Enlightenment,” accessed March 26, 2020, <https://www.britannica.com/event/Enlightenment-European-history>.

CHAPTER 7

VITELLIA AND SERVILIA IN *LA CLEMENZA DI TITO*

Mozart accepted the commission in the summer of 1791 to compose an *opera seria* for the Prague coronation of Leopold II as King of Bohemia.⁴⁵⁴ Based on political considerations, *La clemenza di Tito*, Metastasio's libretto written for Emperor Charles VI (Leopold's grandfather) in 1734, was planned by the impresario Domenico Guardasoni.⁴⁵⁵ Caterino Mazzolà, regarded as Da Ponte's replacement to Vienna's court,⁴⁵⁶ was commissioned as the librettist of the new adaption. The opera needed to be premiered on September 6 in that year, which was the coronation day. Mozart hastened to create the work within a few weeks. Cairns states "he [Mozart] composed it in more than the eighteen days that Niemetschek claimed was all he had."⁴⁵⁷ For this reason, it is very likely that Süßmayr, Mozart's amanuensis, helped with "practically all" of the *secco* recitatives for the entire *opera seria*.⁴⁵⁸ Staged at the Estates Theater in Prague, the premiered singers were Maria Marchetti-Fantozzi as Vitellia, and Antonina Campi (Sgra Antonini) as Servilia.⁴⁵⁹

From Metastasio's three-act libretto, *La clemenza di Tito* has been reduced to two acts.⁴⁶⁰ According to Cairns, Mazzolà and Mozart collaborated together to condense the

⁴⁵⁴ John A. Rice, "Operatic Culture at the Court of Leopold II and Mozart's *La clemenza di Tito*," in *Mozart's La clemenza di Tito: A Reappraisal*, ed. Magnus Tessing Schneider, and Ruth Tatlow (Stockholm: Stockholm University Press, 2018), 33, accessed March 5, 2020, DOI: <https://doi.org/10.16993/ban.b>. License: CC-BY NC-ND 4.0.

⁴⁵⁵ Waldoff, 265.

⁴⁵⁶ Cairns, 229.

⁴⁵⁷ *Ibid.*, 231.

⁴⁵⁸ *Ibid.*, 234.

⁴⁵⁹ Abert, 1218.

⁴⁶⁰ Cairns, 230.

recitatives and create the integration of ensembles in the opera. Tessing Schneider states:

...while Rochlitz praised the libretto revisions introduced by the Saxon court poet Caterino Mazzolà, albeit attributing them to Mozart, he depicted them merely as a means of tightening the action, to make the drama 'more concentrated' and 'far more interesting'; and to break the 'perpetual monotonous alternation of arias and recitatives' through the introduction of ensembles.⁴⁶¹

Apart from the ensemble enhancement to improve in dramatic importance, the composer-dramatist and the librettist also intensified the emotional level of characters, not only in the two female roles, but also in three of the male characters.⁴⁶² Depictions of conflicts and sentiments in *La clemenza di Tito* are humanized and more dramatic, as with characters such Tito, Sesto, and Vitellia. As Cairns describes, "The chief business of the drama, however, remained focused on the interaction of three characters, Tito, Sesto and Vitellia, and on their dilemmas and developing psychologies."⁴⁶³ The transformation of Vitellia in drama and in music shows Mozart's mastery of being a music dramatist.⁴⁶⁴

7.1 Vitellia

7.1.1 Character Background

Vitellia, the indignant daughter of the overthrown Emperor Vitellius, appears as one of the most irritable characters in Mozart's operas. The vindictive ambition⁴⁶⁵ of this character is

⁴⁶¹ Magnus Tessing Schneider, "From Metastasio to Mazzolà: Clemency and Pity in *La clemenza di Tito*," in *Mozart's La clemenza di Tito: A Reappraisal*, edited by Tessing Schneider, M. and Tatlow, R. (Stockholm: Stockholm University Press, 2018), 57, accessed March 5, 2020, DOI: <https://doi.org/10.16993/ban.c>. License: CC- BY NC-ND 4.0.

⁴⁶² Felicity Baker, "Tito's Burden," in *Mozart's La clemenza di Tito: A Reappraisal*, edited by Tessing Schneider, M. and Tatlow, R. (Stockholm: Stockholm University Press, 2018), 110, accessed March 5, 2020, DOI: <https://doi.org/10.16993/ban.c>. License: CC- BY NC-ND 4.0.

⁴⁶³ Cairns, 236.

⁴⁶⁴ Abert, 1230.

⁴⁶⁵ Abert, 1233.

even much stronger than Donna Anna's. Because of Vitellia's self-centered arrogance, her conspiracy triggers the entire drama of *La clemenza di Tito*. Felicity Baker describes her in this way:

This colourful character creates the entire intrigue, the plot against Tito's life and the brutal manipulation of the emotions of the young man who attempts to carry it out for love of her, and while doing extreme violence to his own love for Tito. The Age of Enlightenment did not doubt the violence of amorous passion.⁴⁶⁶

Her mind is fully beclouded with the political revenge that her love and hatred all mingle together for Tito. For this she takes advantage of Sesto's love for her. Her texts provide a harsh level of aggressiveness. For example, "S'aspetta forse che Tito a Berenice in faccia mia offra d'amor insano l'usurato mio trono, e la sua mano?"—Are we perhaps waiting for Tito, mad with love, before my very eyes to offer Berenice my throne that he has usurped, and his hand in marriage?,⁴⁶⁷ or "che mi ingannò, che mi sedusse, (e questo è il suo fallo maggiore) quasi ad amarlo? E poi, perfido! e poi di nuovo al Tebro richiamar Berenice!"—That he deceived me and (this is his greatest sin) tempted me almost into loving him? And then perfidious he is, down the Tiber to pay court to Berenice!⁴⁶⁸ Both sentences from the very opening scene show that Vitellia is quite argumentative when she speaks of Tito and her usurped throne, and her obsession for the crown turns her into a coercing personality. Vitellia's brutal cruelty and ill-judged⁴⁶⁹ mind offer, straightforward to the audience, a violent leading female character.

Vitellia's intense and villainous figure suits "the standards of strict psychological

⁴⁶⁶ Baker, "Tito's Burden," 111.

⁴⁶⁷ Libretto and English Translation, "*La clemenza di Tito*", *DM's Opera Site*, accessed March 23, 2016, http://www.murashev.com/opera/La_clemenza_di_Tito_libretto_English_Italian#.

⁴⁶⁸ Libretto and English Translation, "*La clemenza di Tito*", *DM's Opera Site*.

⁴⁶⁹ Baker, "Tito's Burden," 110-11.

development” in *opere serie*.⁴⁷⁰ Abert states that “it should be remembered that the figures of intrigue in *opera seria* cannot be judged by the standards of strict psychological development, being generally depicted at the outset as impassioned, black-hued villains.”⁴⁷¹ As a result, it provides Vitellia, the most brutal villain in the play, an astonishing transformation of inner self-discovery. The development of this character grows and changes so dramatically that this transformation becomes the most precious moment in *La clemenza di Tito*.⁴⁷² As Waldoff states, “The moment of recognition for Vitellia comes in her act 2 *accompagnato* and *rondò*, in which she acknowledges her own tyrannical behavior and undergoes a remarkable self-transformation. This aria is one the most compelling moments of self-discovery in all of Mozart’s operas.”⁴⁷³ At the end, Vitellia must have considerable courage to confront her inner self, then selflessly confront Tito to save Sesto’s life.⁴⁷⁴

7.1.2 Non più di fiori vaghe catene

7.1.2.1 Situational Synopsis

Vitellia’s great soliloquy of her redemption, including No. 22 *Recitativo accompagnato* “Ecco il punto, o Vitellia” and No. 23 *Rondò* “Non più di fiori vaghe catene,” immediately follow Servilia’s pleading aria, in Act 2, Scene 15. Servilia hopes to console and to beseech Vitellia, who while endeavoring to appear detached and uncaring has tears and pity in silence. She pleads with Vitellia, reminding her of Sesto’s love for her even more than he loves himself. For that,

⁴⁷⁰ Abert, 1242.

⁴⁷¹ Ibid.

⁴⁷² Baker, 110.

⁴⁷³ Waldoff, 276.

⁴⁷⁴ Baker, 112.

Vitellia is moved with tears of compassion, not just with sympathy. In fact, Vitellia has already perceived she is also a victim of her own conspiracy in the end of Act 1, and she has expressed her feeling of remorse at the beginning of Act 2.⁴⁷⁵ In this scene, because of Servilia's prompt, she realizes that she must abandon her egotistically political desire to confront Tito and to exempt Sesto, who loves her with no regrets.

7.1.2.2 Textual and Tonal Analysis

In Act 2, Scene 15, Vitellia encounters her powerful dilemma: the choice between pleading for Sesto's life and retaining her unrevealed secret, or fulfilling her dream to be the Empress.⁴⁷⁶ The dilemma reflects her emotional complications—fourteen tonal shifts in the thirty-six measure recitative. The tonal center begins in D major, passes through majors in G, C, F, B^b, A^b, E^b, and in A, D, C, B^b minors. Mozart set the F major aria in a *rondò* form with a 3/8 *Larghetto* and Common time *Allegro*. The slow movement is in regular ABAb' form, and the key resides between tonic and dominant. The *Allegro* begins at measure 44 in the parallel minor of F. The frequency of tonal shifting intensifies in the fast movement and contains minor keys in F, G, D, B^b, and major keys in A^b, B^b, C, and F major. In some sections, like measures from 87 to 99, the tonal shifting occurs every two measures. This *rondò* also features an *obbligato* instrument, basset horn (*corno di bassetto*).

⁴⁷⁵ Waldoff, 276-77.

⁴⁷⁶ Waldoff, 278.

Table 7-1: “Ecco il punto, o Vitellia ... Non più di fiori vaghe catene”—Textual and Tonal Analysis, *La clemenza di Tito*, No. 22 Recitativo accompagnato & No. 23 Rondo⁴⁷⁷

Text	Translation	Action	Affect	Tonal Color	Key Descriptions ⁴⁷⁸
Recitativo: [m. 1] Ecco il punto, o Vitellia,	Here is the moment, Oh Vitellia,	admitting	penitent	D major	Matt: ... sharp and obstinate; for noise-making, merry, warlike, and uplifting things; but at the same time nobody will deny that this harsh tone may also give inspiration in a rather neat and strange way to delicate things.
					Schu: ... triumph, Hallelujahs, war-cries, victory-rejoicing.
					Vog: Enflames the heart, whole body is enlivened; the spirit welters in heroic deeds, imprudent, joyful, boisterous songs of praise, the god of thunder, noisy, lively key, for pomp, for noise, rumours of war.
[m. 4] d'esaminar la tua costanza:	to examine your constancy:	admitting	penitent	G major	Matt: ... insinuating and speaking, suggestive and rhetorical, apt for both serious and merry things; favors merry and amorous things.
					Schu: ... rustic, idyllic and lyrical, every calm and satisfied passion, every tender gratitude for true friendship and faithful love, every gentle and peaceful emotion of the heart is correctly expressed by this key.
					Vog: ... livelier, naïve actions, innocent rustic pleasure.
[m. 6] avrà valor che basti	will you have enough valour	admitting	penitent	C major	Matt: ... rude and insolent character, lets one's joy come forth w/o inhibition, something charming, apply it to tender moments.
					Schu: ... pure; innocence, simplicity, naivety, children's talk.
					Vog: ... pure subjects, majestic, full of gravity, splendid, the character required some charm.
[m. 8] a rimirar esangue il Sesto tuo fedel? Sesto,	to look upon lifeless your faithful Sextus? Sextus,	confessing	penitent, ashamed	A minor	Matt: ... honorable, at ease, invites to sleep, apt to incite compassion; has a magnificent and serious affect, used for flattery, moderate and sweet beyond measure.
					Schu: Pious womanliness and tenderness of character.

⁴⁷⁷ Libretto and English Translation, “*La clemenza di Tito*”, *DM's Opera Site*, accessed March 23, 2016, http://www.murashev.com/opera/La_clemenza_di_Tito_libretto_English_Italian# English translations modified by Meng-Jung Tsai.

⁴⁷⁸ Abbreviations for the three authors, Mattheson as “Matt,” Schubart as “Schu,” and Vogler as “Vog.” The characteristic agreeing with the texts are highlighted in light red.

Text	Translation	Action	Affect	Tonal Color	Key Descriptions ⁴⁷⁸
[m. 12] che t'ama più della vita sua?	who loves you more than his own life?	confessing	penitent, culpable	F major	Matt: ... the most beautiful sentiments of the world, magnanimity, steadfastness, love, or... top list of virtues, generosity, constancy.
					Schu: Complaisance and calm.
					Vog: ... good for dead calm... with a quiet joy in happy shades of Elysium.
[m. 14] Che per tua colpa divenne reo?	Who for your fault became a criminal?	confessing	penitent, regretful	D minor	Matt: ... devout, humble, tranquil, also grand; devotion in church music, amusing, flowing.
					Schu: Melancholy womanliness, the spleen and humours brood.
					Vog: ... storm, inner unrest, agitated, funeral march.
[m. 15] Che t'ubbidì crudele? Che ingiusta t'adorò? Che in faccia a morte	Who obeyed you in your cruelty? In your wrongdoing who adored you? Who in the face of death	moralizing, admitting	penitent, regretful	B ^b major	Matt: ... very entertaining but retains a certain modesty, pass both for great and for small matters. Kircher: It elevates the soul to [do] heavy/difficult things.
					Schu: Cheerful love, clear conscience, hope aspiration for a better world.
					Vog: Calm; a pleasant key; borrowed a special tenderness. Suggesting solitude; for soliloquies and expressions of lonely sentiment.
[m. 17] sì gran fede ti serba,	keeps great faith to you,	admitting	penitent, ashamed, regretful	C minor	Matt: ... very lovely but also sad tone, one also tires easily of sweet things it is not unwise to try to enliven it a bit by a merry or even movement.
					Schu: Declaration of love and at the same time the lament of unhappy love. All languishing, longing, sighing of the love-sick soul lies in this key.
					Vog: ... to express sadness, the minor quality is appropriate
Aria: [m. 18] e tu frattanto non ignota a te stessa, andrai tranquilla al talamo d'Augusto?	while you, aware all of this, go tranquilly to the bridal bed of the Emperor?	moralizing, admitting	ashamed, remorseful, apologetic	A ^b major	Schu: The key of the grave. Death, grave, putrefaction, judgment, eternity.
					Vog: Plutonian realm; evoking darkest night and underworld landscapes; gentle night key; blacker, an affable key.
[m. 22] Ah, mi vedrei sempre Sesto d'intorno;	Ah, I'd see myself Sextus always be around;	admitting	penitent	B ^b minor	Matt: ... very entertaining but retains a certain modesty, pass both for great and for small matters. Kircher: It elevates the soul to [do] heavy/difficult things.
					Schu: Cheerful love, clear conscience, hope aspiration for a better world.
					Vog: Calm; a pleasant key; borrowed a special tenderness. Suggesting solitude; for soliloquies and expressions of lonely sentiment.

Text	Translation	Action	Affect	Tonal Color	Key Descriptions ⁴⁷⁸
[m. 24] e l'aure, e i sassi	and the breezes, and the stones	worrying	penitent, nervous	F minor	Matt: ... moderate and calm, but deep and heavy mortal fear in the heart that is combined with some desperation. a black melancholy and will sometimes cause the listener a horror or shiver.
					Schu: Deep depression, funereal lament, groans of misery and longing for the grave.
					Vog: ... a choice which is justified as follows: to express sadness.
[m. 25] temerei che loquaci mi scoprissero a Tito.	I'd fear that loquacious would discover me to Titus.	worrying	afraid, anxious	C minor	Matt: ... very lovely but also sad tone, one also tires easily of sweet things it is not unwise to try to enliven it a bit by a merry or even movement.
					Schu: Declaration of love and at the same time the lament of unhappy love. All languishing, longing, sighing of the love-sick soul lies in this key.
					Vog: ... to express sadness, the minor quality is appropriate.
[m. 29] A' piedi suoi vadasi il tutto a palesar. Si scemi il delitto di	At his feet Let me go everything to reveal. Such stupid crime of	deciding	penitent, gusty	E ^b major	Matt: ... a lot of pathos; wants to have to do with nothing but serious and at the same time plaintive things, and is the sworn enemy of opulence.
					Schu: ... of love, of devotion, of intimate conversation with God.
					Vog: ... for night and tenderness; Gentle night key; an affable key.
[m. 32] Sesto, se scusar non si può, col fallo mio. D'impero e d'imenei, speranze, addio.	Sextus, If he can be excused, with my fault. Of empire and marriage hopes, farewell.	repenting	regretful, devoted, wishful	B ^b major	Matt: ... very entertaining but retains a certain modesty, pass both for great and for small matters. Kircher: It elevates the soul to [do] heavy/difficult things.
					Schu: Cheerful love, clear conscience, hope aspiration for a better world.
					Vog: Calm; a pleasant key; borrowed a special tenderness. Suggesting solitude; for soliloquies and expressions of lonely sentiment.
Rondò: [m. 1] Non più di fiori vaghe catene discenda Imene ad intrecciar.	No more flowers of fair garlands shall Hymen descend to weave.	repenting, saddening	sorrowful, remorseful	F major	Matt: ... the most beautiful sentiments, magnanimity, steadfastness, love, on top of the list of virtues, in a natural and way and incompatible ease that there is no coercion involved; the gentleness and character of this tone cannot be described in different terms than to compare it to a beautiful person whom everything he does, and be it as it could, makes look perfect.
					Schu: Complaisance and calm.
					Vog: Good for dead calm. agree especially with a quiet joy in happy shades of Elysium.

Text	Translation	Action	Affect	Tonal Color	Key Descriptions ⁴⁷⁸
[m. 17] Stretta fra barbare aspre ritorte veggo la morte ver me avanzar.	Bound in barbarous harsh twists I see death advance towards me.	saddening, fearing	sorrowful, remorseful	C major	Matt: ... rude and insolent character, but will not be inappropriate for boisterous dancing and where else one lets one's joy come forth without inhibition; something charming and sometimes even apply it to tender moments.
					Schu: ... completely pure. Its character is: innocence, simplicity, naivety, children's talk.
					Vog: A majestic key, full of gravity, for it has little charm; splendid. No one has chosen C for a piece whose character required some charm.
[m. 29] Non più di fiori vaghe catene discenda Imene ad intrecciar. Non più di fiori	No more flowers of fair garlands shall Hymen descend to weave. No more flowers	repenting, saddening	sorrowful, remorseful	F major	Matt: ... the most beautiful sentiments of the world, magnanimity, steadfastness, love, or... top list of virtues, generosity, constancy.
					Schu: Complaisance and calm.
					Vog: ... good for dead calm... with a quiet joy in happy shades of Elysium.
[m. 39] vaghe catene	of fair garlands	saddening	sorrowful, remorseful	C major	Matt: ... rude and insolent character, but will not be inappropriate for boisterous dancing and where else one lets one's joy come forth without inhibition; something charming and sometimes even apply it to tender moments.
					Schu: ... completely pure. Its character is: innocence, simplicity, naivety, children's talk.
					Vog: A majestic key, full of gravity, for it has little charm; splendid. No one has chosen C for a piece whose character required some charm.
[m. 41] discenda Imene ad intrecciar.	shall Hymen descend to weave.	repenting, saddening	sorrowful, remorseful	F major	Matt: ... most beautiful sentiments, generosity, constancy, love, the gentleness and character, a beautiful person.
					Schu: Complaisance and calm.
					Vog: Good for dead calm. agree especially with a quiet joy in happy shades of Elysium.
[m. 46] Infelice!	Wretched me!	wailing	sorrowful, remorseful	F minor	Matt: ... moderate and calm, but deep and heavy mortal fear in the heart that is combined with some desperation. a black melancholy and will sometimes cause the listener a horror or shiver.
					Schu: Deep depression, funereal lament, groans of misery and longing for the grave.

Text	Translation	Action	Affect	Tonal Color	Key Descriptions ⁴⁷⁸
					Vog: ... before departing in a rage, Phoebe delivers a turbulent, dark-hued f-minor aria. ⁴⁷⁹
[m. 49] qual orrore! Ah, di me	how horrible! Ah, of me	fearing	sorrowful, horrified	A ^b major	Schu: The key of the grave. Death, grave, putrefaction, judgment, eternity. Vog: Plutonian realm; evoking darkest night and underworld landscapes; gentle night key; blacker, an affable key.
[m. 53] che si dirà?	what will be said?	worrying	sorrowful, horrified	F minor	Matt: ... moderate and calm, but deep and heavy mortal fear in the heart that is combined with some desperation, a black melancholy and will sometimes cause the listener a horror or shiver. Schu: Deep depression, funereal lament, groans of misery and longing for the grave. Vog: ... before departing in a rage, Phoebe delivers a turbulent, dark-hued f-minor aria.
[m. 60] Chi vedesse il mio dolore, pur avria di me pietà.	He who could see my grief, please have pity on me.	pleading	sorrowful, grieved, remorseful	F major	Matt: ... the most beautiful sentiments, generosity, constancy, love, the gentleness and character, a beautiful person. Schu: Complaisance and calm. Vog: Good for dead calm. agree especially with a quiet joy in happy shades of Elysium.
[m. 79] Non più di fiori vaghe catene discenda Imene ad intrecciar.	No more flowers of fair garlands shall Hymen descend to weave.	repenting, saddening	sorrowful, grieved, remorseful	B ^b major	Matt: ... very entertaining but retains a certain modesty, pass both for great and for small matters. Kircher: It elevates the soul to [do] heavy/difficult things. Schu: Cheerful love, clear conscience, hope aspiration for a better world. Vog: Calm; a pleasant key; borrowed a special tenderness. Suggesting solitude; for soliloquies and expressions of lonely sentiment.
[m. 87] Stretta fra barbare	Bound in barbarous	saddening, fearing	sorrowful, grieved, remorseful, afraid	G minor	Matt: ... combining the seriousness with a certain loveliness, an exceptional grace and pleasantness, it is comfortable for both tender and uplifting, both yearning and happy – in short both for moderate lament and moderate happiness, and thus very flexible. Schu: Discontent, uneasiness, worry about a failed scheme; bad-tempered gnashing of teeth; in a word: resentment and dislike.
[m. 89] aspre ritorte	harsh twists	fearing	sorrowful, grieved,	F major	Matt: ... the most beautiful sentiments of the world, magnanimity, steadfastness, love, or... top list of virtues, generosity, constancy.

⁴⁷⁹ Ibid., 200.

Text	Translation	Action	Affect	Tonal Color	Key Descriptions ⁴⁷⁸
			remorseful, afraid		Schu: Complaisance and calm. Vog: ... good for dead calm... with a quiet joy in happy shades of Elysium.
[m. 91] veggo la morte	I see death	fearing	sorrowful, grieved, remorseful, afraid	B ^b major	Matt: ... very entertaining but retains a certain modesty, pass both for great and for small matters. Kircher: It elevates the soul to [do] heavy/difficult things. Schu: Cheerful love, clear conscience, hope aspiration for a better world. Vog: Calm; a pleasant key; borrowed a special tenderness. Suggesting solitude; for soliloquies and expressions of lonely sentiment.
[m. 93] ver me avanzar.	advance towards me.	fearing	sorrowful, grieved, remorseful, afraid	C major	Matt: ... rude and insolent character, but will not be inappropriate for boisterous dancing and where else one lets one's joy come forth without inhibition; something charming and sometimes even apply it to tender moments. Schu: ... completely pure. Its character is: innocence, simplicity, naivety, children's talk. Vog: A majestic key, full of gravity, for it has little charm; splendid. No one has chosen C for a piece whose character required some charm.
[m. 95] veggo la morte	I see death	fearing	sorrowful, grieved, remorseful, afraid	D minor	Matt: ... devout, humble, tranquil, also grand; devotion in church music, amusing, flowing. Schu: Melancholy womanliness, the spleen and humours brood. Vog: ... storm, inner unrest, agitated, funeral march.
[m. 97] ver me avanzar.	Advance towards me.	fearing	sorrowful, grieved, remorseful, afraid	C major	Matt: ... rude and insolent character, but will not be inappropriate for boisterous dancing and where else one lets one's joy come forth without inhibition; something charming and sometimes even apply it to tender moments. Schu: ... completely pure. Its character is: innocence, simplicity, naivety, children's talk. Vog: A majestic key, full of gravity, for it has little charm; splendid. No one has chosen C for a piece whose character required some charm.
[m. 99] Infelice! qual orrore! Ah, di me che si dirà?	Wretched me! how horrible!	fearing, worrying	sorrowful, horrified, regretful	F minor	Matt: ... moderate and calm, but deep and heavy mortal fear in the heart that is combined with some desperation, a black melancholy and will sometimes cause the listener a horror or shiver. Schu: Deep depression, funereal lament, groans of misery and longing for the grave.

Text	Translation	Action	Affect	Tonal Color	Key Descriptions ⁴⁷⁸
	Ah, of me what will be said?				Vog: ... before departing in a rage, Phoebe delivers a turbulent, dark-hued f-minor aria.
[m. 109] Chi vedesse il mio dolore, pur avria di me pietà.	He who could see my grief, please have pity on me.	pleading	sorrowful, grieved, remorseful, afraid	A ^b major	Schu: The key of the grave. Death, grave, putrefaction, judgment, eternity. Vog: Plutonian realm; evoking darkest night and underworld landscapes; gentle night key; blacker, an affable key.
[m. 114] Chi vedesse	He who could see	pleading	grieved, remorseful	B ^b minor	Schu: A quaint creature, often dressed in the garment of night. It is somewhat surly and very seldom takes on a pleasant countenance. Mocking God and the world; discontented with itself and with everything; preparation for suicide sounds in this key.
[m. 116] il mio dolore, pur avria di me pietà.	my grief, please have pity on me.	pleading	sorrowful, grieved, remorseful, afraid	A ^b major	Schu: The key of the grave. Death, grave, putrefaction, judgment, eternity. Vog: Plutonian realm; evoking darkest night and underworld landscapes; gentle night key; blacker, an affable key.
[m. 119] pietà. pur avria di me pietà.	pity. please have pity on me.	pleading	sorrowful, grieved, remorseful, afraid	F minor	Matt: ... moderate and calm, but deep and heavy mortal fear in the heart that is combined with some desperation, a black melancholy and will sometimes cause the listener a horror or shiver. Schu: Deep depression, funereal lament, groans of misery and longing for the grave. Vog: ... before departing in a rage, Phoebe delivers a turbulent, dark-hued f-minor aria.
[m. 122] Infelice! qual orrore! Ah, di me che si dirà? Chi vedesse il mio dolore, pur avria di me pietà. Non più di fiori [ecc.]	Wretched me! how horrible! Ah, of me what will be said? He who could see my grief, please have pity on me. No more flowers of [etc.]	fearing, worrying	sorrowful, grieved, horrified, afraid	F major	Matt: ... the most beautiful sentiments of the world, magnanimity, steadfastness, love, or... top list of virtues, generosity, constancy. Schu: Complaisance and calm. Vog: ... good for dead calm... with a quiet joy in happy shades of Elysium.

7.1.2.3 Application

- Tonal Colors in *Recitativo*: D – G – C – a – F – d – B^b – c – A^b – b^b – f – c – E^b – B^b.

Servilia's words *gave inspiration* (D major, Mattheson) to Vitellia so that she starts her *recitativo accompagnato* singing, "Ecco il punto, o Vitellia!" ("Here is the moment, oh Vitellia!"). Servilia's speech *enflames the heart* (D major, Vogler) of this arrogant princess, and Vitellia is moved (*body is enlivened*, D major, Vogler) to self-reflection. She is now willing to examine her constancy *with every tender gratitude for true friendship and faithful love* (G major, Schubart). She questions herself *with a magnificent and serious affect* to value *honorable Sesto with compassion* (A minor, Mattheson). She ponders, "Sesto, *with the most beautiful sentiments of the world*, who loves me more than his own life? Who is so *generous and constant* to me (F major, Mattheson)! Such *complaisance* (Schubart)! Who is so *devout* (D minor, Mattheson)! For my fault, he became a criminal!" Vitellia feels *inner unrest* (D major, Vogler) and is remorseful with her *melancholy womanliness* (D minor, Schubart). In her *soliloquy*, Vitellia expresses *this lonely sentiment* (B^b major, Vogler) asking her own *conscience* (B^b major, Schubart), "Sesto, who obeyed me in my cruelty. His *cheerful love* (Schubart)... in my wrongdoing... He is going to face his death!" In a *very lovely but sad tone* (C minor, Mattheson), she *laments* Sesto's faith and love (the lament of unhappy love, C minor, Schubart) *sighing for this love-sick soul* (Schubart).

Not only *sighing* for Sesto, Vitellia also feels guilty for her *darkest* (A^b major, Vogler) dream leading everything to the *grave* (A^b major, Schubart)— "aware all of this and still go silently to the imperial nuptial?" A *deep and heavy mortal fear* emerges with *desperation* (F minor, Mattheson)— "e l'aure, e i sassi temerei che loquaci"—those windy and stony loquacious people. Thinking of this, Vitellia suddenly *groans of misery and is longing for the*

grave (F minor, Schubart). She fears with *sadness* (C minor, Vogler) that Tito would discover her unrevealed secret. Having *a lot of pathos*, she *plaintively wants to go* and prostrate herself before Tito's feet (*wants to do with nothing but serious and at the same time plaintive things*, E^b major, Mattheson). With *devotion*, she is willing to reveal her stupid crime and to *have an intimate conversation* (E^b major, Schubart) with Tito. With *clear conscience* (B^b major, Schubart) now, she is willing to *elevate the soul (do heavy/difficult things)*, B^b major, Mattheson) for Sesto, if he can be excused. "Addio," Vitellia expresses her *lonely sentiment* (B^b major, Vogler) for her "hopes of empire and marriage."⁴⁸⁰

- Tonal Colors in *Larghetto*: F – C – F – C – F.
Formal Unit: [A]-[B]-[A] – [b']

In this *larghetto* 3/8 aria, Mozart conveys Vitellia's self-reflection tenderly in F major.

The tonal centers alter only between F major and C major. Abert describes:

Textually speaking, the aria is based on the typically Metastasian contrast between the dream of marital happiness and the very real threat of death, with all its terrors. ... The opening is a tender idyll inspired by Italian models, except that the ornate Rococo melodies found there are replaced by a typically Mozartian, warm-hearted, songlike tone.⁴⁸¹

Vitellia expresses *the most beautiful sentiments* (F major, Mattheson) and her true repentance, saying, "Non più di fiori vaghe catene (No more flowers of fair garlands)." She must confront herself *complaisantly* (F major, Schubart) and *calmly* (Schubart & Vogler) with her internal complexity. She is willing to accept "...discenda Imene ad intrecciar; (No longer will Hymen descend to weave flowers of fair chains)."⁴⁸² The second stanza shifts to C major (mm. 17–28).

⁴⁸⁰ Libretto and English Translation, *DM's Opera Site*, modified by Tsai.

⁴⁸¹ Abert, 1241.

⁴⁸² Waldoff, 281: translation modified by Tsai.

She is aware, on one hand, of her death bound in those *rude and insolent* (C major, Mattheson) chains; on the other hand, she is able to confess her wrongdoing with her *pure* (Schubart) and *majestic* (Vogler) attitude. *Full of gravity* (C major, Vogler), she is ready for death advancing towards her. Vitellia mentions the second time “vaghe catene (beautiful chains)” (mm. 39–40) in C major which *applies to* her dreaming *tender moment* (C major, Mattheson)—the unobtainable wedding.

- Tonal Colors in *Allegro*: f – A^b – f – F – B^b – g – F – B^b – C – d – C – f – A^b – b^b – A^b – f – F ———.
 Formal Unit: [C] [D] [A’] [E] [C’] [D’] [c’-d’-
 postlude]

The key modulates to F minor to begin her fast movement. Vitellia’s *deep and heavy mortal fear* causes her a *horror or shiver* (F minor, Mattheson). With the preceding orchestral melody as a thought coming to her, Vitellia sings “Infelice” (mm. 46–47) to express her *deep depression*, which leads her into her *funeral lament* (F minor, Schubart). How horrible her *grave* (A^b major, Schubart) is! A *black melancholy* (F minor, Mattheson) and a *dark-hued* moment (Vogler) emerges when she supposes what will be said of her. Returning to F major, her musical material [D] (mm. 57–76), “Chi vedesse il mio dolore, pur avria di me pietà,” (He who could see my grief, please have pity on me)⁴⁸³ in fact echoes the fast movement of Sesto’s *rondò* “Deh per questo instante solo.”⁴⁸⁴ *Complaisantly* (F major, Schubart) she hopes in her mind that Tito, a generous and merciful person, who *on top of the list of virtues* (Mattheson), will see her grief and have pity on her.

Mozart includes the main motif [A] in the subdominant into the *allegro* with a

⁴⁸³ Libretto and English Translation, *DM’s Opera Site*, modified by Tsai.

⁴⁸⁴ Abert, 1241.

syncopated rhythm. This time (mm. 79–86) Vitellia, with her *clear conscience* (B^b major, Schubart) retains a certain modesty and sincerely encourages herself to confront Tito (*elevates the soul to [do] heavy/difficult things*, B^b major, Mattheson) and her own crime. Though the barbarous harsh twists *worry* (m. 87, G minor, Schubart) her, Vitellia calmly (m. 89, F major, Vogler) maintains her steadfastness (Mattheson) and her complaisance (F major, Schubart). She *humbly* (m. 95, D minor, Mattheson) looks into her unpronounced death sentence, in spite of her *funeral march* (D minor, Vogler). As Waldoff describes:

...the music and the text of the first tempo return at measure 79, recomposed in common time, presented in the subdominant (B-flat), and extended slightly, as death advances stepwise, in a passage that seems to merge some of the dramatic effectiveness of a reinterpreted return with the process of development.⁴⁸⁵

Abert also explains the idea about the returning motif [A]:

Also of importance from this point onwards is Mozart's entirely free approach to individual ideas in the text, all of which reappear within the narrowest possible confines, with Vitellia even harking back to her lost happiness, albeit without repeating the wistful melody heard on the earlier occasion. This section culminates in another of the rests in the full orchestra that are so characteristic of this aria, which prepares the way for the ultimate climax, a climax built up on a very free variant of the main theme of which the winds initially state only the bass.⁴⁸⁶

The utmost culmination, Abert mentioned, is from measure 87 to 105. Mozart shifted the tonal center every two measures, and established the climax set in F minor from measure 99. A *turbulent, dark-hued* (F minor, Vogler) *funeral lament* (Schubart) still *groans* from Vitellia's horrified *mortal fear in her heart* (Mattheson).

After the climax, the motif [D] starts again, and Vitellia sings her "Chi vedesse il mio dolore" (He who could see my grief) (mm. 109–121) in A^b major—the *key of the grave*

⁴⁸⁵ Waldoff, 282.

⁴⁸⁶ Abert, 1241.

(Schubart). It evokes *the darkest* (Vogler) feeling in the bottom of Vitellia's heart. She anticipates the scene of *Tito's judgment* (Schubart) of her crime. There will not be an imperial nuptial, but instead, a tomb, a grave, or an *underworld* (Vogler) for her. She, perhaps, might have a thought to desperately flee and disappear, like *a quaint creature, often dressed in the garment of night* (B^b minor, Schubart) that nobody will notice. As a regal princess, she would not flee but is *discontented with herself*, and she *prepares to see Tito (preparation for suicide, B^b minor, Schubart)*. Her mind, like *turbulent* (F minor, Vogler) waters, groans her last *funeral lament* (Schubart). With *deep and heavy mortal fear* (F minor, Mattheson) she is begging in her mind— "pur avria di me pietà"—Tito, please have pity on me. As Waldoff states "The effect of the repetition is therefore not one of return, but one of recollection and transformation."⁴⁸⁷ Now with returning to tonic, F major (m. 122), Vitellia is ready to accept her destiny, as the key now remains in F major, not shifting anymore.

The tonal center stays in tonic from measure 122 to the end. From the third stanza "Infelice, qual orrore," ("Wretched me, how horrible," m. 122), Vitellia repeats all three verses to represent her unwavering determination in F major. Mozart employed F major to depict Vitellia's redemption and self-discovery. Her characterization is outwardly strong from a self-centered—harsh and arrogant character, turning to an inward strength of complaisance and determination. Vitellia's F major section, from measure 122–189, establishes a path which can elevate her soul for her transformation, like a spiritual sublimation. Waldoff explains the ending section in the following way:

⁴⁸⁷ Waldoff, 282.

This closing passage brings the aria's transformation of musical material to a point of culmination and seems to gain exuberances as Vitellia repeats her hopeful assurance: "Chi vedesse il mio dolore, / Pur avria di me pietà." What has been dramatized is a shift from ignorance to knowledge, in this case a move from despair to hope. Moreover, the culmination of Vitellia's quest for self-discovery has come as part of an operatic process. Distinct melodic lines, the return to F major, and the return and eventual recomposition of musical material all serve the workings of a textual and musical plot in which Vitellia does not merely give lip service to remorse, but proves herself capable of growth and change.⁴⁸⁸

I disagree with Abert's statement about this aria being disconnected from Vitellia's character.

He writes, "Admittedly, the grand emotions expressed in this most substantial of arias are only loosely connected to the characterization of Vitellia found elsewhere in the opera."⁴⁸⁹ The aria is about Vitellia's transformation—*complaisance* (F major, Schubart) to a will of *steadfastness* (F major, Mattheson). As Waldoff describes, "The resignation (*complaisance*, Schubart), vision of death, and horror of all that has passed are transformed into a musical expression of hope and redemption. This aria is arguably the most important turning point in the opera's central drama of repentance and mercy."⁴⁹⁰

As a result of "Non più di fiori" in F major, Vitellia repents, as a *majestic* princess (C major, Vogler) sensing a *deep and heavy mortal fear* (F minor, Mattheson), singing her *funeral lament* (F minor, Schubart), and determines to *elevate her soul* (B^b major, Mattheson) to confess her crime. No matter how *discontent* and *uneasy* (G minor, Schubart) she is, or what kind of *judgment* or *death/grave* (A^b major, Schubart) she will receive, she is *devoted* and *humble* (D minor, Mattheson), willing to accept it. Then, realizing her internal emotions, Vitellia stays in *complaisance* and *calm* (F major, Schubart & Vogler) as her soul has already

⁴⁸⁸ Waldoff, 282-83.

⁴⁸⁹ Abert, 1241-42.

⁴⁹⁰ Waldoff, 283.

transformed into an elevated higher realm. This F major aria in Mozart's *opera seria* here is very likely to provide a heightened sense of affection than other F major arias from Mozart's *opere buffe*. A sublimating significance of the affection in "Non più di fiori" equals the implication of transformation in the F major "Et incarnatus est"⁴⁹¹ from Mozart's *Great Mass in C minor*, K. 427.

7.2 Servilia

7.2.1 Character Background

"Grazie, o Numi dei ciel. Pur si ritrova chi s'avventuri a dispiacer col vero," ("I thank you, oh Gods in heaven, that one has been found who will dare to speak an unwelcome truth.")⁴⁹² This text, spoken by Tito reflects how much he appreciates those who remain true, and do not flatter him. Servilia, Tito's preferred bride, is the sister of his confidant, Sesto.⁴⁹³ She is selected to be the Empress not only for her virtue and beauty, but she is the sister of the Emperor's close friend, and also a daughter of Rome. When Tito announces Servilia to be his royal bride, neither Sesto nor Annio, Servilia's beloved, have the audacity to disagree with their sovereign.⁴⁹⁴ Nonetheless, Baker states that Servilia "in her own way acts and thinks more independently in relation to the male characters, including the monarch, than do the three male characters in their own situations."⁴⁹⁵

⁴⁹¹ Text of "Et incarnatus est" in Credo: *Et incarnatus est de Spiritu Sancto ex Maria Virgine, et homo factus est.* (He was incarnated by the Holy Spirit out of the Virgin Mary, and was made man.)

⁴⁹² Libretto and English Translation, "*La clemenza di Tito*", *DM's Opera Site*.

⁴⁹³ Kaiser, 163.

⁴⁹⁴ *Ibid.*

⁴⁹⁵ Baker, 110.

While Servilia realizes Tito's order, she remains unflinching.⁴⁹⁶ It is very fascinating that in a time when women were oppressed into feminine stereotypes under the pen, through Metastasio to Mazzolà and Mozart, to whom was afforded a seemingly tender female character such strength and daring to challenge authority,⁴⁹⁷ the creators allowed her betrothed to accept the order silently in grieving.⁴⁹⁸

It also leads to the evidence that this woman is clever enough to "know from the start how to speak truth to the ruler in her situation of subjection."⁴⁹⁹ Servilia offers her hand to the Emperor's will but wisely solicits the sovereign, who, even knowing her heart and thoughts for Annio, still wishes her to be the Empress?⁵⁰⁰ Her frankness, genuineness, wisdom and fidelity, and her feelings of passion undoubtedly becomes the model of "superior moral maturity"⁵⁰¹ by Mozart and Metastasio/Mozzola.

7.2.2 S'altro che lacrime

7.2.2.1 Situational Synopsis

Servilia's "S'altro che lacrime," No. 21 *Aria Tempo di Minuetto*, occurs in Act 2, Scene 14. After Sesto revealed his crime to Tito, Annio and Servilia are afraid that Tito may confirm the death sentence to Sesto. They come to Vitellia, and Servilia beseeches Vitellia to make a plea for Sesto's life.

⁴⁹⁶ Kaiser, 163.

⁴⁹⁷ Baker, 110.

⁴⁹⁸ *Ibid.*, 103.

⁴⁹⁹ *Ibid.*

⁵⁰⁰ *Ibid.*

⁵⁰¹ *Ibid.*, 110.

7.2.2.2 Textual and Tonal Analysis

Due to the length of Servilia's single aria, to adhere to the treatment of key characteristics, this examination of Servilia commences from its preceding recitative "Andiam. Quell'infelice t'amò," at measure 45, in Scene 14 of the second act. Within the assessed selection, the tonal center begins in B major (mm. 45–49) and moves to its dominant in F[#] major (mm. 49–51, the analysis employs the description of G^b major instead). In these measures Servilia and Vitellia are engaged in a conversation, and specifically in measures 51 to 56, the application of the key descriptions reveal that a separate tonal color is applied to each character.

Table 7-2: “Andiam. Quell’infelice t’amò... S’altro che lacrime”—Textual and Tonal Analysis, *La clemenza di Tito*, No. 21 Aria⁵⁰²

Text	Translation	Action	Affect	Tonal Color	Key Descriptions ⁵⁰³
Recitativo: [m. 45] Servilia: Andiam. Quell’infelice t’amò più di se stesso; avea fra labbri sempre il tuo nome.	Servilia: Let us all go. That wretched man loved you more than himself; ever on his lips always your name.	asking for caring	Enthusiastic, fervent	B major	Matt: ... offensive, harsh, unpleasant, desperate character. ⁵⁰⁴
					Schu: Strongly coloured, announcing wild passions, composed from the most glaring colours. Anger, rage, jealousy, fury, despair and every burden of the heart lies in its sphere.
[m. 49] Servilia: Impallidia quallora si parlava di te.	Servilia: (His face) Turning pale when there was talk of you.	stating	fervent	F# major	Schu: [G ^b Major] Triumph over difficulty, free sigh of relief uttered when hurdles are surmounted; echo of a soul which has fiercely struggled and finally conquered lies in all uses of this key.
[m. 51] Vitellia: Ah parti!	Vitellia: Ah, begone!	requesting	anxious, afraid	<u>B major:</u> E major	[B major] Matt: ... offensive, harsh, unpleasant, desperate character.
					Schu: Strongly coloured, announcing wild passions, composed from the most glaring colours. Anger, rage, jealousy, fury, despair and every burden of the heart lies in its sphere.
[m. 52] Servilia: Ma tu perché restar? Vitellia, ah parmi...	Servilia: But why you remain? Vitellia, ah tell me...	asking	uncertain	B major <u>E major:</u>	[E major] Matt: despair, fatal sadness, hopelessness of extreme love, piercing, painful.
					Schu: Noisy shouts of joy, laughing pleasure and not yet complete, full delight.
					Vog: ... can depict fire, through the intensity of its piercing flames. Very penetrating.

⁵⁰² Libretto and English Translation, “*La clemenza di Tito*”, *DM’s Opera Site*, accessed March 23, 2016, http://www.murashev.com/opera/La_clemenza_di_Tito_libretto_English_Italian# English translations modified by Meng-Jung Tsai.

⁵⁰³ Abbreviations for the three authors, Mattheson as “Matt,” Schubart as “Schu,” and Vogler as “Vog.” The characteristic agreeing with the texts are highlighted in light red.

⁵⁰⁴ Mattheson’s description of B major from: George J. Buelow, “Johann Mattheson and the Invention of the *Affektenlehre*,” in *New Mattheson Studies*, ed. George J. Buelow and Hans Joachim Marx (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1983), 402.

Text	Translation	Action	Affect	Tonal Color	Key Descriptions ⁵⁰³
[m. 54] Vitellia: Oh Dei! (A major) Parti, verrò;	Vitellia: Oh Gods! Leave, I will come;	responding	scared, sorrowful, enflamed	A major D major:	[D major] Matt: ... sharp, obstinate, for noise-making, warlike, uplifting and merry things.
					Schu: ... triumph, of Hallelujahs, of war-cries, of victory-rejoicing.
					Vog: Enflamed, enlivened; heroic deeds, imprudent, joyful, boisterous songs of praise; the god of thunder; stronger; noisy, lively key, for pomp, for noise, rumours of war.
non tormentarmi.	do not torment me.			A major:	[A major] Matt: ... much fatigue, shining, lamenting, sad passions.
					Schu: ... innocent love, satisfaction with one's of affairs; hope of seeing one's beloved again when parting; youthful cheerfulness and trust in God.
					Vog: ... sharper, fire, amorous and tender passion, ferocious, penetrating, bright, and luminous.
Aria: [m. 1] Servilia: S'altro che lacrime per lui non tenti, tutto il tuo piangere non gioverà, tutto il tuo piangere non giove-	If other than tears for him you attempt, all your weeping will be of no avail, all your weeping will be of no avail	warning	ardent, compassion- ate, warm- hearted, affectionate	D major	Matt: ... sharp, obstinate, for noise-making, warlike, uplifting and merry things.
					Schu: ... triumph, of Hallelujahs, of war-cries, of victory-rejoicing.
					Vog: Enflamed, enlivened; heroic deeds, imprudent, joyful, boisterous songs of praise; the god of thunder; stronger; noisy, lively key, for pomp, for noise, rumours of war.
[m. 14] -rà, non gioverà.	avail, will be of no avail.	warning	ardent, compassion- ate, warm- hearted, affectionate	A major	Matt: ... much fatigue, shining, lamenting, sad passions.
					Schu: ... innocent love, satisfaction with one's of affairs; hope of seeing one's beloved again when parting; youthful cheerfulness and trust in God.
					Vog: ... sharper, fire, amorous and tender passion, ferocious, penetrating, bright, and luminous.
[m. 17] A questa inutile pietà che senti, oh quanto è	To this useless pity that you feel, oh how	declaring	ardent, compassion- ate, warm- hearted, affectionate	E minor	Matt: ... express merriment only with great difficulty, pensive, profound, grieved, sad, one hopes to console oneself.
					Schu: Naïve, womanly innocent declaration of love, lament without grumbling; sighs accompanied by few tears; this key speaks of the imminent hope of resolving in the pure happiness of C major.

Text	Translation	Action	Affect	Tonal Color	Key Descriptions ⁵⁰³
[m. 22] Simile la	similar is like	declaring	ardent, compassionate, warm-hearted, affectionate	D minor	Matt: ... devout, humble, tranquil, also grand; devotion in church music, amusing, flowing. Schu: Melancholy womanliness, the spleen and humours brood. Vog: ... storm, inner unrest, agitated, funeral march.
[m.23] crudel-	cruelty	declaring	ardent, compassionate, warm-hearted, affectionate	A minor	Matt: ... plaintive, honorable, and at ease, invites to sleep; to incite compassion. Kircher: magnificent and serious affect, moderate and a lot [of different] affects. moderate and sweet beyond measure. Schu: Pious womanliness and tenderness of character.
[m. 24] -tà. la crudel-	(cruelty. is like cruelty.	declaing	ardent, compassionate, warm-hearted, affectionate	D minor	Matt: ... devout, humble, tranquil, also grand; devotion in church music, amusing, flowing. Schu: Melancholy womanliness, the spleen and humours brood. Vog: ... storm, inner unrest, agitated, funeral march.
[m. 26] -tà. S'altro che lacrime Per lui non tenti, Tutto il tuo piangere Non gioverà.	If other than tears for him you attempt, all your weeping will be of no avail,	warning	ardent, compassionate, warm-hearted, affectionate	D major	Matt: ... sharp, obstinate, for noise-making, warlike, uplifting and merry things. Schu: ... triumph, of Hallelujahs, of war-cries, of victory-rejoicing. Vog: Enflamed, enlivened; heroic deeds, imprudent, joyful, boisterous songs of praise; the god of thunder; stronger; noisy, lively key, for pomp, for noise, rumours of war.
[m. 37] Tutto il tuo	all your	warning	ardent, compassionate, warm-hearted, affectionate	E minor	Matt: ... express merriment only with great difficulty, pensive, profound, grieved, sad, one hopes to console oneself. Schu: Naïve, womanly innocent declaration of love, lament without grumbling; sighs accompanied by few tears; this key speaks of the imminent hope of resolving in the pure happiness of C major.
[m. 38] piangere non	weeping no	warning	ardent, compassionate, warm-hearted, affectionate	B minor	Matt: ... bizarre, unhappy, and melancholic. Schu: ... of patience, of calm awaiting one's fate and of submission to divine dispensation. For that reason its lament is so mild, without ever breaking out into offensive murmuring or whimpering.

Text	Translation	Action	Affect	Tonal Color	Key Descriptions ⁵⁰³
[m. 39] giove-	avail	warning	ardent, compassionate, warm-hearted, affectionate	D major	Matt: ... sharp, obstinate, for noise-making, warlike, uplifting and merry things.
					Schu: ... triumph, of Hallelujahs, of war-cries, of victory-rejoicing.
					Vog: Enflamed, enlivened; heroic deeds, imprudent, joyful, boisterous songs of praise; the god of thunder; stronger; noisy, lively key, for pomp, for noise, rumours of war.
[m. 40 & 43] -rà	will be,	warning	ardent, compassionate, warm-hearted, affectionate	E minor	Matt: ... express merriment only with great difficulty, pensive, profound, grieved, sad, one hopes to console oneself.
					Schu: Naïve, womanly innocent declaration of love, lament without grumbling; sighs accompanied by few tears; this key speaks of the imminent hope of resolving in the pure happiness of C major.
[m. 41 & 44-] no gioverà.	no will be avail.	warning	ardent, compassionate, warm-hearted, affectionate	D major	Matt: ... sharp and obstinate; for noise-making, merry, warlike, and uplifting things; but at the same time nobody will deny that this harsh tone may also give inspiration in a rather neat and strange way to delicate things.
					Schu: ... triumph, Hallelujahs, war-cries, victory-rejoicing.
					Vog: Enflames the heart, whole body is enlivened; the spirit welters in heroic deeds – is roused to imprudent, joyful, boisterous songs of praise, the god of thunder, noisy. It is a lively key, suitable for pomp, for noise, rumours of war, etc.

7.2.2.3 Application

- Tonal Colors in *Recitativo*: B – F# – B/E – A/D – A.

The recitative under examination involves the conversation between Servilia and Vitellia. After Annio exits, Servilia *desperately* (B major, Mattheson) asks Vitellia to save her brother. Sesto's death sentence puts Servilia in *despair—every burden of Servilia's heart lies in its sphere*. With her *wild passion* (Schubart), she expresses to Vitellia that Sesto loved you more than himself. She mentions that Sesto, when hearing of slander about Vitellia, would have a pale complexion. Those slanderous words seem to be *echoes of a soul which has fiercely struggled* (F# [G^b] major, Schubart) in Sesto's mind. She now *utters a sigh* (F# [G^b], Schubart) asking Vitellia "are you weeping?" Vitellia fears the revelation that Servilia knows she is the conspirer.

From measure 51 to 56, two tonal colors emerge. Here, Vitellia *offensively* tells Servilia to leave, with a firm cadence in B major. As for Servilia, she responds and cadences in E major, as her state of mind is more consistent with the treatment of E major. She is in *despair with fatal sadness* about losing her brother (*hopelessness of extreme love*, E major, Mattheson). With *intensified* (E major, Vogler) anxiety, she asks Vitellia to reveal the truth. Vitellia retains *lamenting* saying, "Oh Dei! Parti, verrò; non tormentarmi." ("Oh Gods, please leave and I will come. Do not torment me with these *sad passions*.") (A major, Mattheson), however Vitellia's *hope of seeing Sesto (one's beloved) again* (A major, Schubart) is planted in her mind. The properties of A major conform with her emotions. D major belongs to Servilia, as she determines to persuade Vitellia (*obstinate* by Mattheson; *enflames the heart*, and *heroic deeds* by Vogler) and sings her D major aria "S'altro che lacrime." The evidence proves that, within

different tonal possibilities and its key characteristics, each character presents her own position and her state of mind (mm. 51–56).

- Tonal Colors in *Aria*: D – A – e – d – a – d – D – e – b – D – e – D.

Servilia's D major aria, "S'altro che lacrime," differs from the other Mozart's D major arias, such as Donna Anna's "Or sai chi l'onore" and Leporello's "Madamina, il catalogo è questo" from *Don Giovanni*; Il Conte's "Vedrò mentre io sospiro" and Bartolo's "La vendetta" from *Le nozze di Figaro*. The noble feeling of *Tempo di minuetto* signifies Servilia's internally ardent pleading, which is beseeching Vitellia's real action. Servilia's personality is tender, however she also has a strong and unswerving mind. D major in her aria is not for triumph, of Hallelujahs, or of shouting war-cries (Schubart). On the other hand, this D major aria represents Servilia's *stronger* (Vogler) mind. Her *enflamed* (Vogler) heart, in a gentle and graceful style, provides her *obstinate* (Mattheson) willpower. The clues from the key characteristics profoundly disagree with Abert's statement that "S'altro che lacrime" is merely "a sentimental number that falls pleasingly on the ear but offers little in the way of characterization."⁵⁰⁵ In Lüthy's *Mozart und die Tonartencharakteristik*, he includes in the end of the D-dur discussion Servilia's "S'altro che lacrime" as "the aria held in graceful tempo di minuetto."⁵⁰⁶ Without any other explanation, he begins his last paragraph about D major with the wording: "Unter den noch nicht erwähnten Arien in D-dur finden wir einige bedeutende Formen."⁵⁰⁷ (Among the

⁵⁰⁵ Abert, 1240.

⁵⁰⁶ Lüthy, 51.

⁵⁰⁷ Ibid.: Unter den noch nicht erwähnten Arien in D-dur finden wir einige bedeutende Formen. Here he includes Pedrillo's "Im Mohrenland gefangen" from *Entführung*, Don Giovanni's "Deh vieni alla finestra" from *Don Giovanni*, Sifare's "Lungi date mio bene" from *Mitrdade*, and so on.

arias not yet mentioned in D major, we find some [other] important forms). In fact, the key descriptions in this dissertation offer subtle details which Lüthy's declaration of Mozart's key usage in D major merely points out as an overview:

Es ist eigenartig wie selten in dieser Tonart bei Mozart edlere Regungen des Herzens zu finden sind. Hier gibt es kaum Momente tiefen seelischen Erlebens, sondern durchwegs mehr äusserliche Szenen, die sich von buffonesker Persiflierung, von Freude und militärischen Schneid bis zu kriegerischer Grausamkeit und Racheszenen erstrecken.

[It is strange how rarely noble emotions of the heart can be found in this key in Mozart. There are hardly any moments of deep emotional experience here, but consistently more external scenes that range from buffonian satirization, from joy and military cutting to warlike cruelty and revenge scenes.]⁵⁰⁸

As a matter of fact, the scrutinizing of the characterization of this aria indicates Servilia's tender but strong mind, and her ardent and obstinate determination to save her brother from the death sentence.

D major is the tonic; however, the tonal center often shifts to E minor. Servilia, *pensive* and *grieved*, *hopes to console* Vitellia (E minor, Mattheson) who is remaining stoic and seemingly unmoved, and only having tears and pity in silence. With a *womanly innocent declaration of love* for her brother, Servilia pleads with hopes, *lamenting without grumbling* (Schubart), that Vitellia may help with Sesto's adjudgment. The emotions, like D minor's *devotion* (Mattheson), *melancholy womanly* (Schubart), *inner unrest* (Vogler); A minor's *plaintive* and *inciting compassion* (Mattheson), *tender* (Schubart); B minor's *unhappy and melancholic* (Mattheson), *of patience*, and *not calmly awaiting one's fate and of submission to divine dispensation* (Schubart), all conform with Servilia's state of mind.

In Mazzolà's revision, he rewrote Servilia's recitative speech to Vitellia and establishes

⁵⁰⁸ Lüthy, *Mozart und die Tonartencharakteristik*, 48.

her plea to be *stronger* (D major, Vogler).⁵⁰⁹ Servilia's text to Vitellia in Metastasio's libretto, quoted in Tessing Scheider reads:

Deh non lasciarlo	Oh, do not let [Sextus]
Nel più bel fior degli anni	thus in the fairest flower of youth
Perir così. Sai che finor di Roma	perish. You know that till now of Rome
Fu la speme, e l'amore. Al fiero eccesso	he was the hope and love. To this cruel excess
Chi sa chi l'ha sedotto.	Who knows who enticed him?
In te sarebbe	To you,
Obbligo la pietà: quell'infelice	pity should be an obligation: That unhappy man
T'amò più di se stesso: avea fra' labbri	loved you more than he loved himself;
Sempre il tuo nome: impallidia qualora	your name was always on his lips; he turned pale
Si parlava di te. Tu piangi!	if someone spoke of you. You are weeping! ⁵¹¹

(Act III, scene 10)⁵¹⁰

Mazzolà only used the highlighted section to depict Servilia's unswerving strength. Furthermore, he took away the wording "Obbligo la pietà" ("pity should be an obligation"), which illustrates her *much stronger* pleading from her *compassionate and enflamed heart* (D major, Vogler). Tessing Schneider describes how Mazzolà helped Mozart emphasize the character's emotional appeals:

In his revision, Mazzolà cuts the first lines of Servilia's speech, down to and including the lines 'In te sarebbe / Obbligo la pietà'. Thereby, he not only made Servilia's plea less pointed (i.e. she no longer hints that Vitellia might be responsible for Sesto's misfortune); it also omits the implication that the sentiment of pity can be an obligation, making it clearer that Vitellia is moved to tears not because she *should* take pity on Sesto, but because Servilia reminds her of Sesto's love for her.

In such cases, Mazzolà's revisions support the dramatic function of Mozart's music: the arias of both Annio and Servilia become emotional appeals to the compassion of the

⁵⁰⁹ Tessing Schneider, "From Metastasio to Mazzolà," 62-3.

⁵¹⁰ Ibid., 62: texts in shaded were retained in Mazzolà's version.

⁵¹¹ Ibid., modified by Tsai.

onstage audience, which also gives the music a different dramaturgical function, rather than eloquent calls for virtuous conduct.⁵¹²

The text revision by no means can be fully credited to Mazzolà. As mentioned earlier, the commissioned composer and his librettist did not have much time to create this opera. They only had no more than six weeks to readapt *La clemenza di Tito* from the original Metastasio version.⁵¹³ Mozart needed to wait for Guardasoni's details of "the vocal styles and the capabilities of the engaged singers" (the *prima donna* [Vitellia] and the *musico* [Sesto]),⁵¹⁴ and according to Niemetschek, possibly composed the opera in nineteen days.⁵¹⁵ Regarding how the composer and the librettist cooperated the work, Cairns describes:

We do not know exactly when Guardasoni concluded arrangements with him [Mozart] (before he [Guardasoni] set out for Italy in search of his two stars) and therefore how long Mozart had to work on the opera before he left for Prague on 25 August, just under a fortnight before the premiere. But even if all the negotiations took only a few days, that gave him at most six weeks, the first part of which must have been monopolized by joint work on the libretto – for there is no reason to suppose that Mozart left the adaptation entirely to Mazzolà. It was surely a collaborative enterprise, as was his practice. Metastasio's librettos, *Tito* included, had been constantly reused, in shorted form and brought up to date to conform with the new ideas about aria-types and ensembles; but this *Tito* was exceptional in that the text was reshaped to make now fewer than eight ensembles, including the dramatic (and fundamentally anti-Metastasian) finale to Act I. Mozart's entry in the thematic catalogue, inscribed on 5 September, the eve of the first performance, speaks of "*La clemenza di Tito*, opera seria in two acts" as having been "reduced to a real opera by Sigre Mazzolà" – an operation which, we may be sure, was carried out under the watchful eye and with the active involvement of the composer.⁵¹⁶

From Cairns' argument, the collaborative effort between Mozart and Mazzolà for the

⁵¹² Tessing Schneider, "From Metastasio to Mazzolà," 62-3.

⁵¹³ Ruth Tatlow, and Magnus Tessing Schneider, "*La clemenza di Tito*: Chronology and Documents," in: *Mozart's La clemenza di Tito: A Reappraisal*, ed. Magnus Tessing Schneider, and Ruth Tatlow (Stockholm: Stockholm University Press, 2018), 4-5, accessed March, 05, 2020. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.16993/ban.a>. License: CC-BY NC-ND 4.0.

⁵¹⁴ Cairns, 230-31.

⁵¹⁵ Tatlow, and Tessing Schneider, "*La clemenza di Tito*: Chronology and Documents," 5.

⁵¹⁶ Cairns, 230.

text of the opera is reasonable to assume. Cairns' argumentation is that the reshaped text is with the composer's complicity, and that Mazzolà's revisions stand by Mozart's musical dramaturgy. Thus, the relation of the text and music in Servilia's "S'altro che lacrime," quoted from Tessing Scheinder previously, is most likely a joint decision reshaped by both creators. Therefore, Servilia's plea is never an obligation for pity, but an *obstinate* (D major, Mattheson) and *much stronger* pleading from her *compassionate* and *enflamed heart* (D major, Vogler), by Mozart and Mazzolà's development.

CHAPTER 8

INTEGRATION AND CONCLUSION

As John Platoff states, “There is substantial agreement that, at least some of the time, Mozart and the other composers chose keys (perhaps especially for arias) by relying on the conventional association of particular keys with certain character-types, affects, or dramatic situations.”⁵¹⁷ This research examines how Mozart applies key characteristics to his operatic compositions in the following ways: how he employs key affections to specific characters and develops a character’s emotions through key characteristics; how the affects generated by the text and the key descriptions relate and support each other; how the context and subtext are involved. Furthermore, the investigation in this dissertation actually demonstrates how these affections are applied not only on the macro level of the aria but actually down to the micro degree—verse by verse, or even word by word. With regards to this, the detailed investigation has a huge significance because this research 1) strengthens the notion that Mozart indeed used the keys in the way described, and 2) because it provides us with a hermeneutical tool to search for meanings in Mozart's music in a very detailed and complex way.

As a result of the examination of the eight aria texts juxtaposed with the key characteristics of the selected theorists, this dissertation discloses that Mozart utilized key characteristics to convey the emotions of the characters in four of his late Italian operas. The character’s state of mind and their emotions generated by the librettists’ text and Mozart’s music is directly supported by the descriptions of the key perspectives of all three selected

⁵¹⁷ John Platoff, “Tonal Organization in the *Opera Buffa* of Mozart’s Time,” in *Mozart Studies 2*, ed. Cliff Eisen (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1997), 148.

German theorists, Mattheson, Schubart and Vogler. The analysis of eight representative arias from two soprano categories, the prima donna and the soubrette, leads to the following observations and conclusions: a brief integration of the eight selected roles, the examined arias, and related keys; a discussion of comparison of the five F major arias; a discussion of the contrast of the three selected theorists; a discussion of the use of key characteristics in Mozart's operas; a reflection of practical applications for scholars, singers, conductors and stage directors; an explanation of the scope of this application from the present thesis with the affective properties of keys; and possibilities for further research or future scholarship.

8.1 Integrations

8.1.1 Integration of the Arias and Their Keys

The result of the comparative analysis of the eight arias from eight characters encompassing two soprano categories, the prima donna and the soubrette, reveals that strong correlations exist between Mozart's choice of keys and the character's affects in each aria, at a detailed, line by line level. This thesis analyses five arias in F major; one in D major; one in C major; one in B^b major (see Table 8-1).

Table 8-1: Selected Arias from Repertoire of the Examined Characters and Their Keys

Opera	Prima Donna		Soubrette	
<i>Le nozze di Figaro</i>	La Contessa		Susanna	
	Porgi amor	E ^b	Venite, inginocchiatevi	G
	Dove sono i bei momenti	C	Deh vieni, non tardar	F
<i>Don Giovanni</i>	Donna Anna		Zerlina	
	Or sai chi l'onore	D	Batti, batti, o bel Masetto	F
	Non mi dir, bell'idol mio	F	Vedrai, carino	C
<i>Così fan tutte</i>	Fiordiligi		Despina	
	Come scoglio	B ^b	In uomini! In soldati	F

Opera	Prima Donna		Soubrette	
	Per pietà, ben mio, perdona	E ^b	Una donna a quindici anni	G
<i>La clemenza di Tito</i>	Vitellia		Servilia	
	Deh se piacer mi vuoi	G	S'altro che lacrime	D
	Non più di fiori vaghe catene	F		

Note: Selected arias for analysis in this dissertation are highlighted in yellow.

The examination shows that the affective properties of the key predominantly conforms with the text throughout every aria. For example, the Countess' "Dove sono" in C major conveys the *pure, innocent* and *naïve* (Schubart) recollection of the character. She expresses a sentiment as she sings, "where are those *tender moments* (Mattheson)" indicating *the character requires some charm* (Vogler). This is also displayed in Susanna's "Deh vieni, non tardar" in F major. The aria carries *the most beautiful sentiments of the world* (Mattheson), expressing "O *beautiful* (Mattheson) *joy* (Vogler), come with *love's* comforts (Mattheson)." With a *calm* (Schubart) feeling, the role conveys a wish for *a quiet joy in happy shades of Elysium* (Vogler). On occasions like these, the key treatment assuredly approves the text and the character's state of mind.

There are a few cases that the key description does not directly or immediately serve in denotative agreement with the singing text. For example, Zerlina's "Batti, batti, o bel Masetto" in F major, the key description—*beautiful sentiments, love, calm, and happy shades*—does not offer any relevant implication with the text of "beat me." Only when probing into the subtext of the aria one finds significant connections between the character's affects and the key meanings. In this case Zerlina is willing to be *complaisant* (Schubart) to make peace with her bridegroom. Her remedying attitude is *steadfast* (Mattheson), *calmly* (Schubart & Vogler)

asking, “beat me, beat me, I’ll let you pull my hair out,” from which she expresses the message *in such a natural way and incompatible ease* (Mattheson). Although the text in the first section does not correspond immediately to the key association, the text in the second tempo does present a considerable relation to the F major property. With *love* (Mattheson), Zerlina *gently* (Mattheson) sings to make peace, wishing to be in *Elysium* (Vogler) with Masetto. So, the example of “Batti, batti” demonstrates that the capabilities of key characteristics are able to provide more meanings, or even conflicting meanings to the text.

8.1.2 Examined Arias in F Major

From the four selected Italian operas by Mozart, the specific use of F major accounts for a one-third of the repertoire from both soprano categories. A comparison of Mozart’s use of F major with the five arias is presented in Table 8-2. The table presents the F major arias, the character’s perspective, and how the texts and key descriptions agree, as marked with an “O.” In the case of Despina’s “In uomini! In soldati,” she sings about the absence of fidelity and constancy in men and soldiers and instructs the sisters that there is no necessity to offer generosity or complaisance to men. This does not directly align with any of the key characteristic. However, if considering from another perspective, a more sophisticated thinking, Despina enlightens the sisters to be *generous* (Mattheson) to the females (to themselves), satisfying their own minds (*complaisant* [Schubart] to oneself), so that, with the last stanza “Paghiam, o femmine, d’ugual moneta” (We pay, o women, the same money), Despina enlightens the sisters to discover—mentally and physically—a self-*Elysium* (Vogler). From this perspective, it fits with the key qualities in Table 8-2.

Table 8-2: Comparison—Arias in F Major with Their Key Characteristics

The Affective Properties of F Major		Magnanimity, Generosity	Mattheson Steadfastness, Constancy	Love	Schubart Complaisance, Resignation	Matt, Schu, Vog Good for dead calm, Ease, Natural, Gentleness, Calm	Vogler Quiet Joy, Happy shades, Elysium
Soubrette	Susanna, “Deh vieni, non tardar”	0	0	0	0	0	0
	Zerlina, “Batti, batti, o bel Masetto”		0	0	0	0	0
	Despina, “In uomini! In soldati”			0		0	0
Prima Donna	Donna Anna, “Non mi dir, bell’idol mio”		0	0		0	∅ (Half Strength)
	Vitellia, “Non più di fiore”			0	0		

Table 8-3: F Major Arias Comparison—Context/Subtext/Onstage Listeners

Singing Character, Aria, Onstage Listeners/Objects in Mind		Magnanimity, Generosity	Mattheson Steadfastness, Constancy	Love	Schubart Complaisance, Resignation	Matt, Schu, Vog Good for dead calm, Ease, Natural, Gentleness, Calm	Vogler Quiet Joy, Happy shades, Elysium
Soubrette	Susanna, “Deh vieni, non tardar” Figaro	Her Wishes for Figaro	Her Wishes for Figaro	Her Wishes for Figaro	Her Wishes for Figaro	Herself	Herself and Figaro
	Zerlina, “Batti, batti, o bel Masetto” Masetto	Her Requests for Masetto	Herself	Her Wishes for Masetto	Herself	Her Wishes for Masetto	Herself and Masetto
	Despina, “In uomini! In soldati” Fiordiligi & Dorabella	Her Instructions to the Sisters for Themselves	Her Instructions for the Sisters to Themselves	Herself and to the Sisters	Her Instructions for the Sisters to Themselves	Herself and to the Sisters	Mentally and Physically Elysium
Prima Donna	Donna Anna, “Non mi dir, bell’idol mio” Don Ottavio	Her Requests for Don Ottavio	Herself	Herself and Don Ottavio	Her Requests for Don Ottavio	Her Requests for Don Ottavio	Her Wishes for Themselves
	Vitellia, “Non più di fiore” (Tito & Sesto in Mind)	Her Wishes for Tito	Her Willingness to Sesto	Her Love for Them	Herself	Her Readiness	For Sesto’s Life

The comparative result in Table 8-2 presents a ratio of two thirds of the texts and the affects of the character supported by key characteristics. Nevertheless, the comparative result in Table 8-3, demonstrates that through comprehensive consideration of the context, the subtext and the character's expectation for the onstage listener, the analysis all agree with the F major descriptions. For example, the affective qualities of F major, not only reinforce Vitellia's love for Sesto and her complaisance, but also assist her thoughts regarding the generosity required from Tito, the fidelity responded to Sesto, the readiness to be calm and to accept her destiny, and her wish for Sesto (and Tito) to know the a happy shade of Elysium (see Table 8-3).

8.1.3 Contrast of Three Selected Theorists

As the examination illustrated in Chapters 4 through 7, the examination reveals the adoption of the key expository systems from three selected theorists on almost every occasion. In order to realize which theorist in the group is closest to the choice of Mozart, or whose descriptions are utilized more often, a contrast is conducted here to compare between three selected arias in C, B^b and D Major, and the key description of the three theorists.

As shown in Table 8-4, shaded descriptions for each aria are found at all times, with at least two theorists. An approximate proportion of the adoption is as follows:

- La Contessa's "Dove sono" in C Major: Schubart ≅ Vogler > Mattheson.
- Fiordiligi's "Come scoglio" in B^b Major: Mattheson > Schubart > Vogler.
- Servilia's "S'altro che lacrime" in D Major: Vogler > Mattheson, (none Schubart).

This demonstrates that the adoption of the three selected theorist's key characteristics is quite equal. In "Dove sono," the Countess sings of the past sweet memories in the first section, and

the treatment is towards “*a tender moment*” (Mattheson), and a *pure, innocent, naïve talk* (Schubart). With the second and faster tempo, she is indeed full of *gravity* and *majesty* (Vogler) with one hope of changing that ungrateful heart of the Count. It also suggests the Countess *required some charm* (Vogler) from love and hope. Thus, the information here corresponds with each theorist.

As for Fiordiligi’s “Come scoglio” in B^b Major, the application of Mattheson’s “*It elevates the soul to [do] heavy/difficult things*” to this aria is the most significant notion, because of the wide leaps of her vocal line. This signifies more than Schubart’s “*clear conscience, aspiration for a better world,*” though Fiordiligi does show the convictions of her conscience. She also presents a little wish that the two barbarians would/could leave as soon as possible. (*Soliloquy*, Vogler). The case of Servilia aligns more with the treatment of Vogler’s—*stronger* and *heroic deed*. As her texts and state of mind comprehensively disagree with the emotions of triumph, Hallelujahs, victory, or war (Schubart). She *obstinately* yet *gracefully gives inspiration* to Vitellia (*in a rather neat way to delicate thing*, Mattheson). This correlation of each the theorists and adoption present an average use of the three selected theorists’ properties. This dissertation did not attempt to reveal quantified numbers for a comparative adoption from the comparative usage of the key properties in this area.

Table 8-4: Contrast of the Selected Arias, Theorists and Their Key Descriptions⁵¹⁸

	Mattheson (1681-1764): <i>Das neu-eröffnete Orchestre</i> , ⁵¹⁹ 1713	Schubart (1739-1791): <i>Ideen zu einer Ästhetik der Tonkunst</i> , ⁵²⁰ (1784), 1806	Vogler (1749-1814): <i>Deutsch Encyclopädie</i> , 1779 & <i>Vergleichsplan der Neumünsterorgel</i> , 1812 ⁵²¹
La Contessa, "Dove sono," C Major	C major has a rude and insolent character, but will not be inappropriate for boisterous dancing and where else one lets one's joy come forth without inhibition; but an able composer may re-baptize [the key] into something charming and sometimes even apply it to tender moments.	C major is completely pure. Its character is: innocence, simplicity, naivety, children's talk.	Perhaps the key most fit for a painting, for pure water arias, for pure subjects. (Depicts the broad, rolling expanse of River Thermodon. – from Vogler's melodrama <i>Lampedo</i> , 1778) ⁵²² A majestic key, full of gravity, for it has little charm; splendid. No one has chosen C for a piece whose character required some charm.
Fiordiligi, "Come scoglio," B ^b Major	B-flat major is very entertaining but likes to retain a certain modesty and can therefore pass both for great and for small matters. Among other qualities that Kircher attributes to it, this one should not be ignore: It elevates the soul to [do] heavy/difficult things.	Cheerful love, clear conscience, hope, aspiration for a better world.	Twilight. (introduces the king and proceeds to function as a ritornello in a manner comparable to that of <i>Lampedo's</i> theme.) Calm; a pleasant key; it might have borrowed a certain special tenderness from E ^b . (Suggesting solitude; is used repeatedly for soliloquies and expressions of lonely sentiment. – opera <i>Gustav Adolf</i> , 1787.)
Servilia, "S'altro che lacrime," D Major	D major is by nature somewhat sharp and obstinate; very apt for noise-making, merry, warlike, and uplifting things; but at the same time nobody will deny that this harsh tone may also give inspiration in a rather neat and strange way to delicate things.	The key of triumph, of Hallelujahs, of war-cries, of victory-rejoicing. Thus, the inviting symphonies, the marches, holiday songs and heaven-rejoicing choruses are set in this key.	Enflames the heart. Now the whole body is enlivened; the spirit welters in heroic deeds – is roused to imprudent, joyful, even to somewhat boisterous songs of praise. Even the god of thunder has a claim to this key. Much stronger [than G major]; indeed! Noisy. It is a lively key, suitable for pomp, for noise, rumours of war, etc. (the military brilliance. – <i>Gustav Adolf</i>)

⁵¹⁸ The descriptions agreeing with the affects in the selected arias are highlighted in light red.

⁵¹⁹ Mattheson, *Das neu-eröffnete Orchestre*, 236-51. The key characteristics, handouts translated by Hendrick Schulze.

⁵²⁰ Schubart, *Ideen zu einer Ästhetik der Tonkunst*, 261-65, quoted in Steblin, (Rochester, 2002), 115-123.

⁵²¹ Vogler, "Ausdruck," in *Deutsche Encyclopädie*, 386, and "Vergleichsplan Neumünsterorgel," 1812, quoted in Steblin, 121-24, see also in Britton, "Abbé Georg Joseph Vogler," 95-96.

⁵²² Descriptions with parentheses are from Grave and Grave, *In Praise of Harmony*, 195-211.

Indeed, there might be ambivalent affections between the understanding of different receivers. The expression from musical communication may cause diverse emotions to various listeners. Possibilities might exist in the cases where the meanings differ between the systems of the theorists used by Mozart to express affections without words of a more complex nature. The reason for that is music is a system of communication that is largely connotative, which makes it essentially different from language, which is largely denotative. Like different shades of a color, one tonality is intrinsically able to provide varying qualities. According to Johann Mattheson in his *Der vollkommene Capellmeister*:

Yet we have already spoken sufficiently in the said books on the cited qualities of the keys, to which we refer here, and would only append in closing that there is nothing incontrovertible to say about these qualities, since no key can be so sad or happy in and of itself that one might not compose the opposite. The remaining is to be presented in its proper place.⁵²³

From Mattheson's words, he implied that a key naturally carries its connotations which can contain opposite feelings. I agree that, in a connotative system of communication, ambivalence may not be a weakness but a strength. However, further investigations would be required in this area. A new research that approaches the issue of different implications or connotative ambivalence from this perspective would be encouraged henceforth, and such an analysis could supplement this study in many affirmative ways.

8.2 Conclusions

8.2.1 Key Characteristics in Mozart's Operas

As previously mentioned in Chapter 1, Platoff asks in his essay "Myth and Realities about

⁵²³ Johann Mattheson, and Ernest Charles Harriss, *Johann Mattheson's Der Vollkommene Capellmeister: A Revised Translation with Critical Commentary* (Ann Arbor: UMI Research Press, 1981), 188.

Tonal Planning in Mozart's Operas," "is the supposition of Mozart's operas 'high-level tonal planning' true, or not?"⁵²⁴ At the end of his article, he indicates "The theoretical framework that I propose and the claims about tonal organization that I have challenged do not lead to the conclusion that high-level tonal planning in Mozart's operas is a dead issue."⁵²⁵ As the investigation provided in Chapters 4 through 7 and the synthesis of the presence of one third of the arias being in F major, the evidence leads to the conclusion that Mozart's operas may not hold a structure of "high-level tonal planning," but the affective assistance from the conventional connotation of the key characteristics does exist.

The information provided in the present study also reveals evidence that resolves several suggestions raised in Platoff's articles and in Robert Bott's essay "The Affect Effect: Key Characteristics in *Così fan tutte*." Through the analysis in this dissertation, many implications from Platoff produce new solutions. According to Platoff's "Tonal Organization in the Opera Buffa of Mozart's Time":

There is substantial agreement that, at least some of the time, Mozart and other composers chose keys (perhaps especially for arias) by relying on the conventional association of particular keys with certain character-types, affects, or dramatic situations: D major for a noble character or martial sentiments, for example, or G major for peasant simplicity. In fact, Antonio Salieri refers explicitly to this issue in describing how he began setting an operatic libretto to music. After reading it through carefully, and rereading the texts of the lyric numbers, 'I decided first on the key appropriate to the character of each lyric number.' The associations have to do with the general view of the 'character' of each key and with operatic practice and tradition in particular.⁵²⁶

In this present research, I have found clearer responses to several "murky"⁵²⁷ details from the

⁵²⁴ Platoff, "Myths and Realities," 3.

⁵²⁵ *Ibid.*, 14.

⁵²⁶ John Platoff, "Tonal Organization in the *Opera Buffa* of Mozart's Time," in *Mozart Studies 2*, ed. Cliff Eisen (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1997), 148–49.

⁵²⁷ Bott, "The Affect Effect," 26.

above section. Three focal points regarding key usage particular to Mozart's operas need to be clarified. First, Platoff states that there is substantial agreement that Mozart and his contemporary composers relied on the conventional key association for their creative choices.⁵²⁸ However, his declaration "at least some of the time" seems to imply a lack of comprehensive information in regard to: "how often" did the composers utilize the key and its affects.⁵²⁹ The analysis in this research reveals that the frequency of Mozart's use of the key meanings is thorough from the eight examined sections within his four of late Italian operas. It leads to a clue that the use of the key affections is not merely "some of the time."

Second, does Mozart utilize the key description "perhaps especially for arias?" The analysis of the recitatives preceding the arias selected and investigated in Chapters 4 through 7, reveals the usage of key characteristics in recitative sections as well. A clear demonstration is found in the discussion of Servilia's music where two tonal possibilities occur within the recitative, and one tonal key-descriptions is reserved for one character. The individual characters' unique standpoints and emotions are also reflected with different tone centers. Moreover, this research application provides that the key characteristics can be demonstrated on the microlevel—a word by word degree, not merely on the macrolevel of the closed forms. It is a tool for determining meanings that is much more precise than previously thought.

Third, Mozart did choose and utilize the key properties to compose his operas. However, does any particular key associate with a certain type of character? I believe the evidence of F major arias discussed earlier leads to a distinct clue. The F major aria not only

⁵²⁸ Platoff, "Tonal Organization," 148.

⁵²⁹ Bott, "The Affect Effect," 26.

carries the quick-witted loveliness of the soubrette type—the maid, but it also supports the prima donna’s moment of truth. Also, cases can be found in C major; the Countess’ “Dove sono” expresses her memories of past sweet moments, however Zerlina’s “Vedrai, carino” is a cute and sweet remedy for her Masetto. Since the feature of C major is “*innocent/sweet and naïve/cute,*” this proves that the composer’s intention of usage of the key complies with the character’s affects in the moment, not the character’s type. In addition, the use of key characteristics in Mozart's operas is thus shown to be dramatic, a means of character expression. It is still Mozart's authorial voice that the audience hears, but the composer puts it in service of expressing characters, not giving comments that are removed from the character.

8.2.2 Practical Applications

The detailed examination introduced in this study is conceived to avail singers, directors, and scholars to assist in their interpretation of the roles in Mozart’s operas and to comprehend Mozart’s intention and the operas. The analysis has displayed not only that this application works, but that it works as a tool for understanding situational meanings as well as meanings that have more long-term implications. Therefore, this method helps singers and directors to gain a comprehensive understanding of characters and dramatic situations alike. The information in the analysis is for the purpose of understanding affective content, to perceive the development of the character and the role interpretation, including not only the studies in this research, but the other roles in the four operas, also, ideally, all of Mozart’s operas. This research method for knowing the text to its translation (from literary text translation to its subtext) through dissociating the musical tonality with the description of the key affection is

effective. Though abundant studies in Mozart's operas have existed and numerous Mozart's operatic productions have been performed, the interpretative suggestions that this present thesis provides will be beneficial. Performers, directors, and future scholars will be able to apply this method and the description of key characteristics in this dissertation to consider the affective effects in their assignments and productions.

The interpretative approach in this dissertation is based on a strong understanding of the operatic text, i.e., its meaning and the word by word translation. I highly recommend scholars and performers, especially young singers, when adopting their interpretative methodology, be fully aware of the meaning of the text. This dissertation does not attempt to encourage the young learner to abort the initial significance of learning the words of Mozart's composition. This research also does not seek to declare that singers/performers shall merely apply the key meaning to learn/interpret the music of Mozart's operatic roles without comprehending the meaning of the libretto. In addition, the analysis of the key modulations is for the purpose of recognizing the "tonal color" from the key shift, and to define its juxtaposing key description.

With the awareness of the text, scholars and performers can apply the method in the present study to unravel the affections of the character and his/her state of mind in an aria, a scene, or the whole work. When approaching individuals' application, as previously mentioned, an aria/scene study would initiate from learning the text, and its translation, followed by tonal analysis, a basic analysis of harmony and tonality to discover the tonal center, from which then to divide its sectional text into smaller textual/tonal units. Next, observing the sectional text, identify its action and corresponding affect. Then, a parallel comparison contrasts the sectional

textual/tonal unit with the affective property of the specified key, and with examination to disclose the musical interpretation of the role's affection. In addition to the smaller sectional contrast, a contextual and subtextual coherence needs to be carefully considered for the examination, and to determine applicative descriptions, which comprise the treatment. Through this analytical approach, the refining treatment from the key description reveals the character's affections.

8.2.3 The Scope of Application and Possibilities for Future Scholarship

Though the selection of case studies conducted in this present research is specified to the category of soprano characters from the four late Italian operas by Mozart, the information and the method here applies to the characters of other voice types from these operas. The key description of the three selected German theorists is predictably also applicable to other Mozart's operas. For example, Pamina's "Ach, ich fühl's, es ist verschunden" in G minor, a *moderate lament* which is *the most beautiful tone as it is not only combining the seriousness with a certain loveliness, but also carries with an exceptional grace, sings her tender and yearning* (G minor, Mattheson). With Tamino's silence, Pamina is *discontent* and *uneasiness* (Schubart), wishing she was hearing from him. Sarastro's first aria "O Isis und Orisis" in F major, *expresses the most beautiful sentiments of the world—wisdom, strength, and valor, and is on top list of virtues* (Mattheson). When he sings "zu Grabe gehen" (go to the grave) the tonal center transitions to the key of "the grave", F minor—*groans of misery and longing for the grave* (Schubart). Both arias are from *Die Zauberflöte* (1791), which is the last operatic work of Mozart. Regarding the composed year of *Die Zauberflöte*, I anticipate the key qualities which

would be applicable in it. Therefore, these two examples above serve as a clue that this research method could be applicable not only in Mozart's Italian operas, but also in his German Singspiels.

Instances from Mozart's previous works, Arbace's "Se colà ne' fati è scritto" in A major from *Idomeneo*, conveys Arbace's *lamenting and sad passions* (Mattheson). He prays to the *gods (trust in God)* and *hopes to see the king and the prince again (hope of seeing one's beloved again, Schubart)*. Ilia's "Se il padre perdei" in E^b Major, expresses her *pathos* (Mattheson) in losing her father and homeland. However, Ilia feels happily *devoted* in Crete and declares that Idomeneo's *love* is like that of a father to her (Schubart). Her conversation with Idomeneo also agrees with Schubart's description of E^b Major, *the key of intimate conversation with God*. So, from *Idomeneo*, Mozart's composition in 1780-81, also demonstrates that this method can be applied to the works before Mozart's four late Italian operas. The above examples demonstrate noticeable signs of the utilization of the key perspective in Mozart's composing, and seemingly a high feasibility in all of Mozart's operas. Nevertheless, further investigations need to be conducted.

As previously mentioned, Platoff states "There is substantial agreement"⁵³⁰ of the employing of key affection around Mozart's time. For example, Antonio Salieri referred to the subject and how he composed an opera, previously mentioned by Platoff.⁵³¹ Mozart is highly aware of an explicit framework of the key affects to compose his operatic works, though the academic documents of this area are relatively rare. Continued research in this area is

⁵³⁰ Platoff, "Tonal Organization," 148.

⁵³¹ Ibid.

encouraged, exploring the extent of Mozart—the music dramatist—his application of key characteristics to other voice types and a wider exploration of his operatic compositions.

APPENDIX
LIST OF KEY CHARACTERISTICS

List of Key Characteristics: Johann Mattheson⁵³², C.F.D Schubart and G.J. Vogler⁵³³

Key	Johann Mattheson	C.F.D. Schubart		G.J. Vogler
	<i>Das neu-eröffnete Orchestre, 1713</i>	<i>Ideen zu einer Ästhetik der Tonkunst, (1784), 1806</i>	<i>Deutsch Encyclopädie, 1779</i> ⁵³⁴	<i>Vergleichsplan der Neumünsterorgel, 1812</i> ⁵³⁵
C Major	C major has a rude and insolent character, but will not be inappropriate for boisterous dancing and where else one lets one's joy come forth without inhibition; but an able composer may re-baptize [the key] into something charming and sometimes even apply it to tender moments.	C major is completely pure. Its character is: innocence, simplicity, naivety, children's talk.	Perhaps the key most fit for a painting, for pure water arias, for pure subjects. (Depicts the broad, rolling expanse of the River Thermodon – from Vogler's melodrama <i>Lampedo</i> , 1778)	A majestic key, full of gravity, for it has little charm; splendid. No one has chosen C for a piece whose character required some charm.
A Minor	A minor is somewhat plaintive, honorable, and at ease, meaning it invites to sleep; but it is not unpleasant in this. Apart from that apt to incite compassion in piano and instrumental pieces. Kircher: "This tone has a magnificent and serious affect which however can be used for flattery. Yes, the nature of this tone is rather moderate and can be used for a lot [of different] affects. Is at the same time moderate and sweet beyond measure."	Pious womanliness and tenderness of character.		
F Major	F major is capable to express the most beautiful sentiments of the world, be it magnanimity, steadfastness, love, or whatever else is on top of the list of	Complaisance and calm.	Good for dead calm.	Calm. In Gluck's <i>Orpheus</i> and Vogler's <i>Castor and Pollux</i> , F appeared to agree especially with a quiet joy in happy shades of Elysium. (In Gluckian fashion a

⁵³² Johann Mattheson, *Das neu-eröffnete Orchestre*, class handouts trans. Hendrik Schulze (Hamburg:Schiller, 1713), 236-51.

⁵³³ Rita Steblin, *A History of Key Characteristics in the Eighteen and Early Nineteenth Centuries* 2nd ed. (Rochester: University of Rochester Press, 2002), 115-123.

⁵³⁴ Descriptions with parentheses are integrated and adopted from Grave and Grave, *In Praise of Harmony*, 195.

⁵³⁵ Ibid.

Key	Johann Mattheson	C.F.D. Schubart		G.J. Vogler
	<i>Das neu-eröffnete Orchestre</i> , 1713	<i>Ideen zu einer Ästhetik der Tonkunst</i> , (1784), 1806	<i>Deutsch Encyclopädie</i> , 1779 ⁵³⁴	<i>Vergleichsplan der Neumünsterorgel</i> , 1812 ⁵³⁵
	virtues, and all this in such a natural way and incompatible ease that there is no coercion involved. Yes, the gentleness and character of this tone cannot be described in different terms than to compare it to a beautiful person whom everything he does, and be it as it could, makes look perfect, and who, as the French say, has <i>bonne grace</i> .			group of blessed spirits presents a dance; outer calm. – <i>Castore e Polluce</i> , 1786)
D Minor	If one investigates D minor one will find that it contains something humble, calm, at the same time grand, pleasant, and content; therefore it is capable of promoting devotion in church pieces and peace of mind in secular pieces; even though this does not hinder one to express successfully with this tone something pleasant, but not particularly jumping but rather flowing [...] for heroic or epic it is the best. Because it has besides its nimbleness also a dignity etc. Aristotle calls it serious and constant.	Melancholy womanliness, the spleen and humours brood.	(Representation of a storm in the third scene in <i>Lampedo</i> , 1778)	(Inner unrest, agitated; funeral march – <i>Castore e Polluce</i> , 1786)
B ^b Major	B-flat major is very entertaining but likes to retain a certain modesty and can therefore pass both for great and for small matters. Among other qualities that Kircher attributes to it, this one should not be ignore: It elevates the soul to [do] heavy/difficult things.	Cheerful love, clear conscience, hope aspiration for a better world.	Twilight. (introduces the king and proceeds to function as a ritornello in a manner comparable to that of <i>Lampedo</i> 's theme.)	Calm; a pleasant key; it might have borrowed a certain special tenderness from E ^b . (Suggesting solitude; is used repeatedly for soliloquies and expressions of lonely sentiment. – opera Gustav Adolf, 1787.)
G Minor	G minor is almost the most beautiful tone as it is not only combining the seriousness of [d minor] with a certain loveliness, but	Discontent, uneasiness, worry about a failed scheme; bad-tempered gnashing of teeth; in a word: resentment and dislike.		

Key	Johann Mattheson	C.F.D. Schubart		G.J. Vogler
	<i>Das neu-eröffnete Orchestre, 1713</i>	<i>Ideen zu einer Ästhetik der Tonkunst, (1784), 1806</i>	<i>Deutsch Encyclopädie, 1779</i> ⁵³⁴	<i>Vergleichsplan der Neumünsterorgel, 1812</i> ⁵³⁵
	also carries with it an exceptional grace and pleasantness, through which it is comfortable for both tender and uplifting, both yearning and happy – in short both for moderate lament and moderate happiness, and thus very flexible. Kircher judges it as “it carries a modest and devout happiness, be happy and full of serious leaps.”			
E ^b Major	E-flat major has rather a lot of pathos; wants to have to do with nothing but serious and at the same time plaintive things and is the sworn enemy of opulence.	The key of love, of devotion, of intimate conversation with God; through its three flats [1789: according to Euler] expressing the holy trinity. [1789: D [#] was the favorite of the great Jommelli; therefore he poured out his soul so often in this key. He wrote his most beautiful arias in it.]	Night. (Key for night and tenderness; [<i>affetuoso</i>] as Argabyses and Lampedo gaze upon each other and the amorously lyrical melody is announced.)	Gentle night key; it exercises a monopoly over night pictures; an affable key.
C Minor	C minor is a very lovely but also sad tone, but because the first quality is superseding the second, and one also tires easily of sweet things it is not unwise to try to enliven it a bit by a merry or even movement, otherwise one might become a bit sleepy from its moderation. Should it be a piece though that is supposed to encourage sleep this remark is superfluous and you can just get to that goal in a natural way.	Declaration of love and at the same time the lament of unhappy love. —All languishing, longing, sighing of the love-sick soul lies in this key.	(Grave & Grave: a choice which is justified as follows: to express sadness, the minor quality is appropriate. – from <i>Hamlet</i> , 1778)	
A ^b Major		The key of the grave. Death, grave, putrefaction, judgment, eternity lie in its radius.	Plutonian realm. (Suitable for evoking darkest night and underworld landscapes – from Vogler’s incidental music <i>Hamlet</i> , 1778)	Gentle night key; it is still blacker [than E ^b] and almost milder; an affable key.

Key	Johann Mattheson	C.F.D. Schubart		G.J. Vogler
	<i>Das neu-eröffnete Orchestre, 1713</i>	<i>Ideen zu einer Ästhetik der Tonkunst, (1784), 1806</i>	<i>Deutsch Encyclopädie, 1779</i> ⁵³⁴	<i>Vergleichsplan der Neumünsterorgel, 1812</i> ⁵³⁵
F Minor	F minor seems to depict a moderate and calm, but deep and heavy mortal fear in the heart that is combined with some desperation and is nimble beyond measure. It very nicely expresses a black melancholy and will sometimes cause the listener a horror or shiver.	Deep depression, funereal lament, groans of misery and longing for the grave.		(After struggling with Furies, failing to bar Pollux from underworld, and before departing in a rage, Phoebe delivers a turbulent, dark-hued f-minor aria. – opera seria <i>Castore e Polluce</i> , 1786) (The underworld scenes of Act 3, call for the gloom. – <i>Castore e Polluce</i>)
D ^b Major		A leering key, degenerating into grief and rapture. It cannot laugh, but it can smile; it cannot howl, but it can at least grimace its crying. —Consequently, only unusual characters and feelings can be brought out in this key.		
B ^b Minor		A quaint creature, often dressed in the garment of night. It is somewhat surly and very seldom takes on a pleasant countenance. Mocking God and the world; discontented with itself and with everything; preparation for suicide sounds in this key.		
G ^b Major		Triumph over difficulty, free sigh of relief uttered when hurdles are surmounted; echo of a soul which has fiercely struggled and finally conquered lies in all uses of this key.		
E ^b Minor		Feelings of the anxiety of the soul's deepest distress, of brooding despair, of blackest depression, of the most gloomy condition of the soul. Every fear, every hesitation of the shuddering heart, breathes out of horrible e ^b minor. If		

Key	Johann Mattheson	C.F.D. Schubart		G.J. Vogler
	<i>Das neu-eröffnete Orchestre, 1713</i>	<i>Ideen zu einer Ästhetik der Tonkunst, (1784), 1806</i>	<i>Deutsch Encyclopädie, 1779</i> ⁵³⁴	<i>Vergleichsplan der Neumünsterorgel, 1812</i> ⁵³⁵
		ghosts could speak, their speech would approximate this key.		
B Major	offensive, harsh, unpleasant, desperate character. ⁵³⁶	Strongly coloured, announcing wild passions, composed from the most glaring colours. Anger, rage, jealousy, fury, despair and every burden of the heart lies in its sphere.		
G# Minor		Grumbler, heart squeezed until it suffocates; wailing lament, difficult struggle; in a word, the color of this key is everything struggling with difficulty.		
E Major	E major expresses very well a desperate or entirely deadly sadness; best used for extremely in-love help- and hopelessness, and has in certain circumstances such a cutting, separating, suffering, and penetrating that it cannot be compared to anything but a fatal separation between body and soul.	Noisy shouts of joy, laughing pleasure and not yet complete, full delight lies in E Major.	Can depict fire best of all, especially as it stands out through the intensity of its piercing flames.	Very penetrating. Has not E always been chosen in all operas where Eumenides appear?
C# Minor		Penitential lamentation, intimate conversation with God, the friend and help-meet of life; sighs of disappointed friendship and love lie in its radius.		
A Major	A major gives much fatigue even though it is shining and is more apt for lamenting and sad passions than for entertainment; it is very apt for violin pieces.	This key includes declarations of innocent love, satisfaction with one's state of affairs; hope of seeing one's beloved again when parting; youthful cheerfulness	Still sharper, but since its range does not encompass the middle of the violin, namely the two middle strings D and A, as does that of D [major], it cannot serve for	Very penetrating. It is bright and shiny, but not as much so as E. (A major for Jupiter's aria. – <i>Castore e Polluce, 1786</i>)

⁵³⁶ Mattheson's description of B major from: George J. Buelow, "Johann Mattheson and the Invention of the *Affektenlehre*," in *New Mattheson Studies*, ed. George J. Buelow and Hans Joachim Marx (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1983), 402.

Key	Johann Mattheson	C.F.D. Schubart		G.J. Vogler
	<i>Das neu-eröffnete Orchestre, 1713</i>	<i>Ideen zu einer Ästhetik der Tonkunst, (1784), 1806</i>	<i>Deutsch Encyclopädie, 1779</i> ⁵³⁴	<i>Vergleichsplan der Neumünsterorgel, 1812</i> ⁵³⁵
		and trust in God.	stormy matters as does D. The fire of an amorous and tender passion is more happily depicted hereby than that of rash [passion]. (ferocious, brilliant, penetrating, bright, and luminous – <i>Lampedo, 1778</i>)	
F# Minor	F-sharp minor: even though this tone leads to great sadness, it is more languishing and amorous than lethal; this tone has otherwise something abandoned, lonely, and misanthropic.	A gloomy key: it tugs at passion as a dog biting a dress. Resentment and discontent are its language. It really does not seem to like its own position: therefore, it languishes ever for the calm of A major or for the triumphant happiness of D major.		
D Major	D major is by nature somewhat sharp and obstinate; very apt for noise-making, merry, warlike, and uplifting things; but at the same time nobody will deny that this harsh tone may also give inspiration in a rather neat and strange way to delicate things.	The key of triumph, of Hallelujahs, of warcries, of victory-rejoicing. Thus, the inviting symphonies, the marches, holiday songs and heaven-rejoicing choruses are set in this key.	Enflames the heart. Now the whole body is enlivened; the spirit welters in heroic deeds – is roused to imprudent, joyful, even to somewhat boisterous songs of praise. Even the god of thunder has a claim to this key.	Much stronger [than G major]; indeed! Noisy. It is a lively key, suitable for pomp, for noise, rumours of war, etc. (the military brilliance. – <i>Gustav Adolf</i>)
B Minor	H minor is bizarre, unhappy, and melancholic; for that reason it is rarely used and it may perhaps be the reason why the ancients banned it from their monasteries and cloisters that they don't even remember it.	This is as it were the key of patience, of calm awaiting one's fate and of submission to divine dispensation. For that reason its lament is so mild, without ever breaking out into offensive murmuring or whimpering. The use of this key is rather difficult for all instruments; therefore so few pieces are found which are expressly set in this key.		
G Major	G major has much that is insinuating and speaking; it shines not just a little and is quite apt for both serious and merry	Everything rustic, idyllic and lyrical, every calm and satisfied passion, every tender gratitude for true friendship and faithful	Already livelier, although not stormy. Naïve actions, especially of innocent rustic pleasures, can be expressed here	Already somewhat livelier; it was always the favourite key for Pastorals; it is used with much success for the depiction of a

Key	Johann Mattheson	C.F.D. Schubart		G.J. Vogler
	<i>Das neu-eröffnete Orchestre, 1713</i>	<i>Ideen zu einer Ästhetik der Tonkunst, (1784), 1806</i>	<i>Deutsch Encyclopädie, 1779</i> ⁵³⁴	<i>Vergleichsplan der Neumünsterorgel, 1812</i> ⁵³⁵
	things. Kircher calls it “amorous and voluptuous” and elsewhere also a “honest guardian of temperance”. Corvinus: “it favors merry and amorous things”.	love, —in a word every gentle and peaceful emotion of the heart is correctly expressed by this key. What a pity that because of its seeming lightness it is so greatly neglected nowadays...	more simply than in other keys.	bright landscape painting. (Makes appearances mainly in connection with choruses of celebration. – <i>Gustav Adolf</i>)
E Minor	E minor can express merriment only with great difficulty, whatever one does, because it makes one feel too pensive, deeply thinking, sad, and melancholy, but in such a way that one hopes to console oneself. One may set it a bit quicker, but it will not get much happier. Kircher says “It loves sadness and pain”. For Luciano it seems to have an impetuous character; for Glarean a plaintive one.	Naïve, womanly innocent declaration of love, lament without grumbling; sighs accompanied by few tears; this key speaks of the imminent hope of resolving in the pure happiness of C major. Since by nature it has only one colour, it can be compared to a maiden, dressed in white, with a rose-red bow at her breast. From this key one steps with inexpressible charm back again to the fundamental key of C major, where heart and ear find the most complete satisfaction.		

BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Abert, Hermann. *W.A. Mozart*. Translated by Stewart Spencer. Edited by Cliff Eisen. New Haven, CT: Yale University Press, 2007.
- Andrews, Richard. "From Beaumarchais to Da Ponte: A New View of the Sexual Politics of 'Figaro'." *Music & Letters* 82, no. 2 (2001): 214-33. Accessed March 19, 2020. www.jstor.org/stable/3526059.
- Allanbrook, Wye J., and Wendy Hilton. "Dance Rhythms in Mozart's Arias." *Early Music* 20, no. 1 (February 1992): 142-149. Accessed February 15, 2016. <http://www.jstor.org/stable/3127676>.
- Anna, Donna. "Feminine Vengeance I: The Assailed/Assailant." In *Understanding the Women of Mozart's Operas*, by Brown-Montesano, Kristi. University of California Press, 2007. California Scholarship Online, 2012. Accessed March 20, 2020. doi: 10.1525/california/9780520248021.003.0001.
- Arnn, John D. Review of *A History of Key Characteristics in the Eighteenth and Early Nineteenth Centuries*. *Notes* 40, no. 2 (December 1983):287-89. Accessed January 9, 2017. <http://www.jstor.org/stable/941305>.
- Baker, F. "Tito's Burden." In *Mozart's La clemenza di Tito: A Reappraisal*, edited by Magnus Tesson Schneider, and Ruth Tatlow, 97–119. Stockholm: Stockholm University Press, 2018. Accessed March 5, 2020. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.16993/ban.d>. License: CC-BY NC-ND 4.0.
- Bott, Robert. "The Affect Effect: Key Characteristics in *Così fan tutte*." *Harmonia* 14 (2015-2016): 38-39. Accessed April 02, 2018. <http://mhte.music.unt.edu/sites/default/files/Harmonia%20Final%202015-16.pdf>.
- Braatz, Thomas. "The Esoteric Bach," *Bach Cantatas Website*, April 2001. Accessed Mar 18, 2018. <http://www.bach-cantatas.com/Articles/Esoteric.htm>.
- Britton, David James, and Karl Emil von Schafhäütl. "Abbé Georg Joseph Vogler: His Life, and His Theories on Organ Design." DMA diss., University of Rochester, 1973. Published on Demand by London: University of Microfilms International, 1980.
- Brophy, Brigid. *Mozart the Dramatist*. London: Faber and Faber. 1964.
- Brown, Daniel Chu. "A political interpretation of C.F.D. Schubart's poem Die Forelle and the musical settings of the same title by Schubart and Franz Schubert." DMA diss., Order No. 10296237, The University of Memphis, 2015. Accessed August 27, 2019. <https://libproxy.library.unt.edu/login?url=https://libproxy.library.unt.edu:2165/docview/1846101785?accountid=7113>.
- Brunswick, Mark. "Tonality and Perspective." *The Musical Quarterly* 29, no. 4 (October 1943): 426-437. Accessed February 15, 2016. <http://www.jstor.org/stable/739419>.
- Buelow, George J. "Mattheson, Johann." *Grove Music Online*. 2001. Accessed December 2, 2019. <https://libproxy.library.unt.edu:5982/grovemusic/view/10.1093/gmo/9781561592630.001.0001/omo-9781561592630-e-0000018097>.

- , "Johann Mattheson and the Invention of Affektenlehre" in *New Mattheson Studies*, ed. George J. Buelow and Hans Joachim Marx (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1983), 393-40.
- Cairns, David. *Mozart and His Operas*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 2006.
- Cannon, Beekman C. *Johann Mattheson, Spectator in Music*. New Haven: Yale University Press, 1947.
- Cannon, Robert. *Opera*. New York: Cambridge University Press, 2012.
- Citron, Marcia J. *Gender and the Musical Canon*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1993.
- Curtis, Liane. "The Sexual Politics of Teaching Mozart's Don Giovanni." *NWSA Journal*, vol. 12, no. 1, 2000, p. 119. Gale Literature Resource Center. Accessed 21 Feb. 2020. <https://libproxy.library.unt.edu:7175/apps/doc/A62682224/LitRC?u=txshracd2679&sid=LitRC&xid=175e0351>.
- DuBois, Ted Alan. "Christian Friedrich Daniel Schubart's Ideen zu einer Ästhetik der Tonkunst: An Annotated Translation." PhD diss., University of South California, 1983. Accessed December 13, 2019. <https://www.musiklopedia.dk/dokumenter/boeger/engelsk-tonkunst.pdf>.
- Flaherty, Gloria. "Mattheson and the Aesthetics of Theater," in *New Mattheson Studies*, ed. George J. Buelow and Hans Joachim Marx (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1983), 79.
- Gazzola, Giuseppe. "Betting Against Themselves: Conflicting Conceptions of Love in *Così fan tutte*, o: la scola degli amanti." *MLN* 130, no. 1 (2015): 105-123. Accessed March 02, 2020. doi:10.1353/mln.2015.0002.
- Grave, Floyd K., and Margaret G. Grave. *In Praise of Harmony: The Teachings of Abbé Georg Joseph Vogler*. Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1988.
- Grave, Margaret. "Vogler, Georg Joseph." *Grove Music Online*. 2001. Accessed 20 Dec. 2019. <https://libproxy.library.unt.edu:5982/grovemusic/view/10.1093/gmo/9781561592630.001.0001/omo-9781561592630-e-0000029608>.
- Einstein, Alfred. *Mozart, His Character, His Work*. New York: Oxford University Press, 1972.
- Hagen, Emily June. "Depicting Affect through Text, Music, and Gesture in Venetian Opera, c. 1640-1658." PhD diss., University of North Texas, 2018. Accessed April 10, 2018. <https://digital.library.unt.edu/ark:/67531/metadc1157551/>.
- Hart, Gail K. "Doing Time in Schiller's Eighteenth Century: C. F. D. Schubart as Political Prisoner, or the Man in the Hole." *Pacific Coast Philology* 36 (2001): 1-9. Accessed August 27, 2019. doi:10.2307/3595466.
- Hay, Nick. "Tonality in Mozart's Don Giovanni". *Operaphenomenon* (blog). <http://www.nicholashay-operahistorian.blogspot.com/2012/06/tonality-in-mozarts-don-giovanni.html>.

- Howard, Luke. "Cosi fan tutte lesson 2: Misogyny in Così." Utah Opera. 2015. Accessed Oct 10, 2017. <http://www.utahopera.org/backstage/2015/02/cosi-fan-tutte-lesson-2-misogyny-in-cosi/>.
- Ishiguro, Maho A. "The Affective Properties of Keys in Instrumental Music from the Late Nineteenth and Early Twentieth Centuries." Master's Thesis, University of Massachusetts Amherst, 2014. Accessed November 11, 2019. <https://scholarworks.umass.edu/theses/536>.
- Kaiser, Joachim. *Who's Who in Mozart's Operas: From Alfonso to Zerlina*. Translated by Charles Kessler. New York: Schirmer Books, 1987.
- Kenyon, Nicholas. *The Pegasus Pocket Guide to Mozart*. New York: Pegasus Book, 2006. Accessed Oct 08, 2019. <https://archive.org/details/pegasuspocketgui0000keny>.
- Kerns, John. "Mozart's Don Giovanni: An Enlightenment Hero?" *The Atlas Society*. Last modified August 13, 2010. Accessed March 22, 2020. <https://atlassociety.org/commentary/commentary-blog/3902-mozarts-don-giovanni-an-enlightenment-hero>.
- Lister, Linda. "Beaumarchais, Figaro, Paisiello, and Mozart: Sociopolitical Criticism and Censor in Eighteenth-Century Opera." *Opera Journal* 45, no. 1 (March 2012): 3-31. Accessed February 15, 2016. <http://libproxy.library.unt.edu:2308/ehost/detail/detail?sid=5719cc44-24bb-4a9e-83ac-b5d45b223f52%40sessionmgr4005&vid=0&hid=4101&bdata=JnNjb3BIPXNpdGU%3d#AN=102828454&db=ibh>.
- Lustig, Roger. Review of *New Mattheson Studies*, edited by George J. Buelow and Hans Joachim Marx. *Notes* 41, no. 3 (1985): 506-08. Accessed December 2, 2019. doi:10.2307/941162.
- Lüthy, Werner. *Mozart und die Tonartencharakteristik*. Baden-Baden: Verlag Valentin Koerner, 1974.
- Martin, George. *The Opera Companion*, (New York, NY: Amadeus Press, 2008), 223, accessed January 06, 2020, <https://books.google.com/books?id=MjTLYqOoi3kC&pg=PA220&lpg=PA220&dq=when+countess+agree+to+dress+as+susanna?&source=bl&ots=NpWBdSOAlh&sig=ACfU3U1-Yn5zmC9Q4VzwqNdP70XcpFSUIQ&hl=en&sa=X&ved=2ahUKEwj9i8yOsfDmAhWUbc0KHfW6DlwQ6AEwAHoECAoQAQ#v=onepage&q=when%20countess%20agree%20to%20dress%20as%20susanna%3F&f=false>.
- Mattheson, Johann. *Das neu-eröffnete Orchestre: oder, universelle und gründliche Anleitung, wie ein galant Homme einen vollkommnen Begriff von der Hoheit und Würde der edlen Music erlangen, seinen Gout darnach formieren, die Terminos technicos verstehen und geschicklich [sic] von dieser vortrefflichen Wissensehatt raisonniren Möge*. Hamburg: Bei B. Schillers Wittwe, 1713.
- Mattheson, Johann. "Key Characteristics List." In *Das neu-eröffnete Orchestre*, 1713. Handouts translated by Hendrick Schulze, presented in class MUMH 6510: Performance Practice – Tuning Systems and Key Characteristics, University of North Texas, Denton, March 07, 2016.

- Mattheson, Johann, and Ernest Charles Harriss. *Johann Mattheson's Der Vollkommene Capellmeister: A Revised Translation with Critical Commentary*. Ann Arbor: UMI Research Press, 1981.
- Morgan, Holly D. "Don Giovanni's Avenging Women." Masters Research thesis, Faculty of the VCA and Music, The University of Melbourne, 2013. Accessed February 21, 2020. <http://cat.lib.unimelb.edu.au/record=b5056251>.
- Mozart, Wolfgang A., and Lorenzo Da Ponte. *Così fan tutte, ossia La scuola degli amanti*. Edited by Faye Ferguson and Wolfgang Rehm. 2006. 5th Reprint, Kassel: Bärenreiter-Verlag, 2016.
- , and Lorenzo Da Ponte. *Don Giovanni: opera in two acts*. After the play by Tirso de Molina. English translated by W. H. Auden and Chester Kallman. New York: G. Schirmer, 1961.
- , and Lorenzo Da Ponte. *Il dissoluto punito, ossia il Don Giovanni*. Edited by Wolfgang Plath and Wolfgang Rehm. 2005. 3rd Reprint, Kassel: Bärenreiter-Verlag, 2010.
- , and Lorenzo Da Ponte. *Le nozze di Figaro*. Edited by Ludwig Finscher. 2001. 15th Reprint, Kassel: Bärenreiter-Verlag, 2012.
- , and Caterino Mazzolà, after Pietro Metastasio. *La clemenza di Tito*. Edited by Franz Giegling. 2001. 6th Reprint, Kassel: Bärenreiter-Verlag, 2017.
- , Caterino Mazzolà, and Pietro Metastasio. *Titus: (La clemenza di Tito): Opera seria in drei Akten*. Zürich: Apollo-Verlag, 1953.
- , Caterino Mazzolà, and Pietro Metastasio. *Titus = La clemenza di Tito: an opera in two acts*. Libretto Translation by Humphrey Procter-Gregg. Piano reduction by Julius Rietz. New York City: International Music, 1982.
- , and Emanuel Schikaneder. *The Magic Flute*. New York: Schirmer, 1961.
- , and Giambattista Varesco, after Antoine Danchet. *Idomeneo, rè di Creta: (Ilia ed Idamante): an opera in three acts*. English translated by Waldo Lyman, and Nicholas Granitto, New York: Program Pub. Co., 1966.
- Murashev, Dmitry. "*Così fan tutte, ossia La scuola degli amanti*: Libretto Translation (Italian-English)." English Translated by William Weaver, 1963. Accessed March 23, 2016. http://www.murashev.com/opera/Cos%C3%AC_fan_tutte,_ossia_La_scuola_degli_amanti_libretto_English.
- , "*Don Giovanni*: Libretto Translation (Italian-English)." English Translated by William Murray, 1961. Accessed March 23, 2016. http://www.murashev.com/opera/Don_Giovanni_libretto_English.
- , "*La clemenza di Tito*: Libretto Translation (Italian-English)." Meeting of Mozart Academy in class MUMH 6510: Temperament and Key Characteristics, Denton, March 9, 2016. http://www.murashev.com/opera/la_clemenza_di_tito_libretto_italian_english.
- , "*Le nozze di Figaro*: Libretto Translation (Italian-English)." Meeting of Mozart Academy in class MUMH 6510: Temperament and Key Characteristics, Denton, March 23, 2016. http://www.murashev.com/opera/Le_nozze_di_Figaro_libretto_English.

- Nehfors, Mårten. "Georg Joseph Vogler." *Swedish Music Heritage*. Trans. Thalia Thunander. Last modified 2015. Accessed December 17, 2019. <http://www.swedishmusicalheritage.com/composers/vogler-georg-joseph/>.
- Nussbaum, Martha C. "Equality and Love at the End of *The Marriage of Figaro*: Forging Democratic Emotions." *Journal of Human Development and Capabilities* 11:3 (2010): 397-423. Accessed March 19, 2020. DOI: 10.1080/19452829.2010.495514.
- Open University of Israel. "Oh Susanna: The Wise Women of Mozart". *The Open Letter*, no. 20 (Autumn 2008): 12-13. Accessed March 20, 2016. <http://www-e.openu.ac.il/geninfor/openletter/ol20/12-13.pdf>.
- Opera Folio. "*Così fan tutte* (1790): English Translation." Opera Folio Libretti – Mozart, Wolfgang Amadeus. Accessed February 10, 2019. http://www.operafolio.com/libretto.asp?n=Così_fan_tutte&language=UK.
- Opernführer: The Virtual Opera House. "*Don Giovanni* (1787): English Translation." Opernführer Linked from Opera Folio, Don Giovanni Libretto. Accessed February 10, 2019. <http://www.opera-guide.ch/opera.php?id=251&uilang=de>.
- Ossenkop, David. "Schubart, Christian Friedrich Daniel." Grove Music Online. 2001; Accessed 9 Dec. 2019. <https://libproxy.library.unt.edu:5982/grovemusic/view/10.1093/gmo/9781561592630.001.0001/omo-9781561592630-e-0000025105>.
- Owen, Barbara, and Arthur W.J.G. Ord-Hume. "Orchestrion." Grove Music Online. 2001; Accessed 27 Dec. 2019. <https://libproxy.library.unt.edu:5982/grovemusic/view/10.1093/gmo/9781561592630.001.0001/omo-9781561592630-e-0000020409>.
- Platoff, John. "Myths and Realities about Tonal Planning in Mozart's Operas." *Cambridge Opera Journal* 8, no. 1 (March 1996): 3-15. Accessed February 15, 2016. <http://www.jstor.org/stable/823699>.
- ". "The Buffa Aria in Mozart's Vienna." In *Cambridge Opera Journal* 2, no. 2 (1990): 99-120. Accessed August 28, 2019. <http://www.jstor.org/stable/823677>.
- ". "Tonal Organization in the *Opera Buffa* of Mozart's Time." In *Mozart Studies* 2, edited by Cliff Eisen, 139-173. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1997.
- ". "Tonal Organization in 'Buffo' Finales and the Act II Finale of '*Le nozze di Figaro*'" *Music & Letters* 72, no.3 (August 1991): 387-403. Accessed February 15, 2016. <http://www.jstor.org/stable/736215>.
- Petty, Bynum. "Charlatan or Visionary? Abbé Vogler and His Theory of Organ Design." *The Tracker* 57, no. 2 (Spring 2013): 20-2. Accessed August 27, 2019. <https://libproxy.library.unt.edu/login?url=https://libproxy.library.unt.edu:2165/docview/1335091719?accountid=7113>.
- Rasch, Rudolf. "Tuning and Temperament." In *The Cambridge History of Western Music Theory*. Edited by Thomas Christensen, 193-222. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2002.

- Raut, Valeriu. "Una voce poco fa (English Translation)." *Lyrics Translate*. Last modified February 2, 2016. Accessed January 1, 2020. <https://lyricstranslate.com/en/una-voce-poco-fa-voice-while-back.html>.
- Redford, Bruce. Review of *Recognition in Mozart's Operas*, and: *Mozart and His Operas*. *The Opera Quarterly* 22, no. 3-4 (Summer-Autumn, 2006): 557-563. Accessed February 15, 2016. <http://muse.jhu.edu/journals/opq/summary/v022/22.3-4.redford.html>.
- Rice, John A. "Operatic Culture at the Court of Leopold II and Mozart's *La clemenza di Tito*." In *Mozart's La clemenza di Tito: A Reappraisal*. Edited by Magnus Tessing Schneider, and Ruth Tatlow, 33–55. Stockholm: Stockholm University Press, 2018. Accessed March 5, 2020. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.16993/ban.b>. License: CC-BY NC-ND 4.0.
- Rushton, Julian. "Mozart's Art of Rhetoric: Understanding an Opera Seria Aria ('Deh se piacer mi vuoi' from *La clemenza di Tito*)." *Contemporary Music Review* 17, no. 3 (August 2009): 15-27. Accessed February 15, 2016. <http://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/07494469800640171>.
- Schindler, Anton. *Beethoven As I Knew Him: A Biography*. Edited by Donald W. MacArdle. Translated by Constance Jolly. Chapel Hill, NC: University of North Carolina Press, 1966.
- Schubart, Christian Friedrich Daniel, and Ted DuBois. "On the Human Voice and the Characteristics of the Musical Keys." *New England Review* 25, Iss. 1/2 (2004): 166-171. Accessed August 27, 2019. <https://libproxy.library.unt.edu/login?url=https://libproxy.library.unt.edu:2165/docview/234218235?accountid=7113>.
- Schweiger, Hertha. "Abt Vogler." *The Musical Quarterly* 25, no. 2 (1939): 156-66. Accessed August 27, 2019. www.jstor.org/stable/738905.
- Sibbons, John. "Tonality Structure and Key Changes in Idamante's 3rd Act Aria in Mozart's Opera '*Idomeneo*' K. 366." *Mozart-Jahrbuch ... des Zentralinstitutes für Mozartforschung der Internationalen Stiftung Mozarteum Salzburg*, Vol.1980/83: 399-408. Accessed March 20, 2016. <http://digibib.mozarteum.at/ismretroverbund/periodical/titleinfo/1274932>.
- Steblin, Rita. *A History of Key Characteristics in the Eighteen and Early Nineteenth Centuries*. 2nd ed. Rochester, NY: University of Rochester Press, 2002.
- . *A History of Key Characteristics in the Eighteenth and Early Nineteenth Centuries*. Ann Arbor: UMI Research Press, 1983.
- Tatlow, Ruth and Magnus Tessing Schneider. "*La clemenza di Tito*: Chronology and Documents." In: *Mozart's La clemenza di Tito: A Reappraisal*, edited by Magnus Tessing Schneider, and Ruth Tatlow, 1–32. Stockholm: Stockholm University Press, 2018. Accessed March 5, 2020. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.16993/ban.a>. License: CC-BY NC-ND 4.0.
- Tessing Schneider, Magnus. "From Metastasio to Mazzolà: Clemency and Pity in *La clemenza di Tito*." In *Mozart's La clemenza di Tito: A Reappraisal*, edited by Magnus Tessing Schneider, and Ruth Tatlow, 56–96. Stockholm: Stockholm University Press, 2018. Accessed March 5, 2020. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.16993/ban.c>. License: CC- BY NC-ND 4.0.
- Waldoff, Jessica Pauline. *Recognition in Mozart's Operas*. New York: Oxford University Press, 2006.

Young, James O. "Key, Temperament and Musical Expression." *The Journal of Aesthetics and Art Criticism* 49, no. 3 (1991): 235-42. Accessed November 11, 2019. doi:10.2307/431477.