

TRANSATLANTIC CROSSINGS: NADIA BOULANGER AND MARION BAUER

Blaine Alexis Brubaker

Thesis Prepared for the Degree of

MASTER OF ARTS

UNIVERSITY OF NORTH TEXAS

August 2019

APPROVED:

Mark McKnight, Major Professor

Rebecca Geoffroy-Schwinden, Committee
Member

Margaret Notley, Committee Member

Benjamin Brand, Chair of the Department of
Music History, Theory, and
Ethnomusicology

Felix Olschofka, Interim Director of Graduate
Studies in the College of Music

John Richmond, Dean of the College of Music

Victor Prybutok, Dean of the Toulouse
Graduate School

Brubaker, Blaine Alexis. *Transatlantic Crossings: Nadia Boulanger and Marion Bauer*. Master of Arts (Music), August 2019, 40 pp., bibliography, 14 primary sources, 33 secondary sources.

In the summer of 1906, Marion Bauer (1882-1955) boarded a ship to Paris to meet with Raoul Pugno, a French pianist and composer. Juliette Nadia Boulanger (1887-1979) was also close with Pugno around the same time. Living with the Pugno family in Gargenville during the summer, Bauer was able to travel to Paris, where she met several important musicians of the time and also nineteen-year-old Boulanger. Pugno, who worked closely with Boulanger, asked her to teach counterpoint and harmony to Bauer. Boulanger agreed and reportedly asked Bauer for English lessons in payment. Both women went on to become important music pedagogues, teaching hundreds of students. Their meeting allowed Bauer and Boulanger to share their ideas on teaching and music with each other. As time passed, the relationship between the two women fade from collective memory, but Boulanger's teaching principles of harmony, hearing, la grande ligne, and music history and literature live on through her students and fellow teachers and composers. Bauer's writings demonstrate similarities to these four key principles. Using Kimberly Francis and Emily Green's understanding of Pierre Bourdieu's theory of cultural production and an analysis of Boulanger's pedagogical principles, I believe that Boulanger's early accumulation of cultural capital and experience was shared with Bauer, assisting Bauer in her future role as American music pedagogue.

Copyright 2019

By

Blaine Alexis Brubaker

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
CHAPTER 1. INTRODUCTION	1
CHAPTER 2. BIOGRAPHY	7
Marion Bauer	7
Nadia Boulanger	13
CHAPTER 3. PEDAGOGIES OF BOULANGER AND BAUER	18
Nadia Boulanger	18
Marion Bauer	23
CHAPTER 4. COMPARISON OF BAUER’S WRITINGS AND BOULANGER’S PEDAGOGIES AND CONCLUSION	29
BIBLIOGRAPHY.....	38

CHAPTER 1

INTRODUCTION

In the summer of 1906, Marion Bauer (1882-1955) boarded a ship to Paris to meet with Raoul Pugno (1852-1914), a French pianist and composer. While Pugno and his family were traveling through the United States earlier that year, Bauer's older sister, Emilie Francis, had introduced the family to Bauer. The Pugnos could speak only French, but luckily for them, Bauer was fluent in French. Pugno's daughter, Renée, and Bauer became friends and Bauer taught the girl and her family English. The progress was so great that Mme. Pugno invited Bauer to come stay with the Pugno family in France and take piano lessons with Pugno himself and continue Renée's English lessons. Pugno also offered to arrange harmony and analysis lessons for Bauer.¹

Juliette Nadia Boulanger (1887-1979) was also close with Pugno around the same time. When she was thirteen, Boulanger's father, Ernest Boulanger, died, leaving young Nadia to assume the role of breadwinner for her family. In the fall of 1904, Boulanger began to teach privately to support her mother and her younger sister, Lili. Pugno, a close family friend, became even closer with Boulanger during this difficult time in her life and referred students to her. Pugno promoted Boulanger as a concert pianist and organist, in addition to performing in concerts with her.²

Living with the Pugno family in Gargenville during the summer, Bauer was able to travel to Paris, where she met several important musicians of the time and also nineteen-year-old Boulanger. Pugno, who worked closely with Boulanger, asked her to teach counterpoint and

¹ David Ewen, *Composers of Today: A Comprehensive Biographical and Critical Guide to Modern Composers of All Nations* (London: H.W. Wilson, 1936), 16.

² Caroline Potter, "Boulanger, (Juliette) Nadia," Grove Music Online, accessed April 9, 2018, <https://libproxy.library.unt.edu:2147/10.1093/gmo/9781561592630.article.03705>.

harmony to Bauer. Boulanger agreed and reportedly asked Bauer for English lessons in payment. The students in Bauer's English class were Nadia Boulanger, Lili Boulanger, and Renée Pugno.³

This fateful meeting began Boulanger's teaching legacy as Bauer was her first American student. Many claimed Aaron Copland to be Boulanger's first American student, but later in life, he commented in an interview with Edward Cone, "I wasn't literally the first American to study with [Boulanger], but I was the first to study composition with her. Melville Smith had been studying organ with her, and I believe that Marion Bauer had studied harmony shortly before."⁴ Students of Boulanger claim her teaching and presence had an impact on the rest of their lives. Although Boulanger and Bauer met early on in their respective musical careers, their relationship impacted Bauer's musical and pedagogical ideas.

Many women composers and performers have been treated in scholarly historical accounts recently, especially in studies by feminist musicologists. While the terms "women composers" or "women performers" are problematic, gender should not be ignored or removed. By universalizing the way music is discussed, scholars marginalize women's experiences and trivialize their work. But before tackling the issue of universality in music, scholars must take on the issue of the "great composer." The issue of the "great composer" stems from the composer being perceived as a genius or in a position of power above others, such as performers and teachers. Since scholars had put more time and effort into their writings on composers, those in secondary roles were becoming lost to time. Luckily, as years have passed, the infatuation with the "great composer" has lessened, allowing those acting in supporting roles, such as teachers,

³ Susan Pickett, *Marion and Emilie Francis Bauer: From the Wild West to American Musical Modernism* (Lulu Publishing, 2016), 33, 40-41; Madeline Goss, *Modern Music Makers* (New York: E.P. Dutton, 1952), 131.

⁴ Richard Kostelanetz and Steve Silverstein, eds., *Aaron Copland: A Reader: Selected Writing 1923-1972* (New York, NY: Routledge, 2004), 350.

performers, patrons, and critics, to have their moment in the history books. In her 1999 book chapter on gender, musicology, and feminism, Suzanne Cusick, however, points out that even feminist musicologists are guilty of this romanticized narrative as well by focusing on only women composers or on feminist readings of male composers. Those who play supporting roles in the lives of composers, such as teachers, patrons, conductors, or collaborators, must be connected to the works of the composers being discussed even to have their names mentioned.

In response to Cusick and the writing of other feminist musicologists, Kimberly Francis has applied Pierre Bourdieu's theories on the field of cultural production. Bourdieu's model of cultural production allows scholars to position other cultural musical figures with composers to create interdependent narratives. This way composers are not isolated figures. To become successful, they must work with other people in society. By using Bourdieu's model, scholars can move past composer-centered historiographies. Francis notes:

Indeed, even the work of feminist musicologists has tended to focus on women composers or feminist interpretations of male composers. And while this work remains greatly important for the field, it continues to entrench composers as the absolute center of any musicologist inquiry, and any discussion of actors who play tangential roles — roles so often filled by women — is more often relegated to the peripheries, if such discussion are incorporated at all. This myopia has directly affected Boulanger.⁵

By focusing on individuals in tangential roles to that of the “great composer,” scholars bring to light people who allowed the composers to shine and demonstrate that these people are not only secondary figures in history. These individuals led the charge in the development of music, art, and culture through their support of composers.

In her book, Francis explains Bourdieu's theory of cultural production. According to Bourdieu, culture “can only be defined within and among a group of individuals who engage in

⁵ Kimberly Francis, *Teaching Stravinsky: Nadia Boulanger and the Consecration of a Modernist Icon* (New York, NY: Oxford University Press, 2015), 10.

discussion and definition of culture.”⁶ This system of social interactions between individuals are defined as a “field.” For culture specifically, the space in which art is discussed and defined is the “field of cultural production.” The field of cultural production is where art’s validity is judged, and this struggle is what decides what makes art “art.” By arguing for the definition of art, individuals in a field decide on art’s definition and what can be called art. Bourdieu states, “It is the struggle itself that makes a field’s history.” This history is what is being recorded by scholars. History, then, must include all actors within a field. In the case of musicology, these actors are not only composers but patrons, teachers, performers, and so on. Bourdieu’s model also allows for subfields, “areas of specialization and dedication to a certain artist, cultural orientation, or cultural production.”⁷ Subfields contain their own rules and position when compared to the field of cultural production overall. For example, Francis notes that Boulanger participated in the field of musical modernism and then positioned herself in the subfield of neoclassicism, focusing on Stravinsky’s form of neoclassicism. By defining specific artists and styles in which she wanted to support, Boulanger positioned herself and helped define neoclassicism as art. Her support of Stravinsky led to discourse on Stravinsky’s music, identifying him as a major force in the formation of modern musical styles. Boulanger also created her own subfield, the Boulangerie. The name is French for “bakery” but is a pun on the way Boulanger formed her students into composers, like the way bakers produce bread.⁸

Nadia Boulanger, through her extensive and successful music career, participated heavily within the field of cultural production, creating what Bourdieu called “cultural capital.” The success Boulanger had in her field translates into prestige and cultural influence. This prestige

⁶ Francis, *Teaching Stravinsky*, 11.

⁷ Francis, *Teaching Stravinsky*, 11.

⁸ Francis, *Teaching Stravinsky*, 11.

and cultural influence, also known as cultural capital, can then be spent, accumulated, and invested in the same ways that financial wealth can be spent, accumulated, and invested.

The cultural influence Boulanger exerted through these experiences was passed on through those with whom she interacted. She taught hundreds of students, gave lectures, composed, performed, and conducted various ensembles. This also includes those with whom she may not have kept in touch, such as Marion Bauer. Bauer, after her initial meeting with Boulanger in France in the summer of 1906, went back to America in 1907, publishing compositions and teaching her own students. Through Boulanger, Bauer met important people in the musical world, which allowed her to start her own career as a teacher, composer, and writer. Both women earned and passed on cultural capital through various musical experiences.

Bauer and Boulanger also participated in a type of capital Bourdieu defined as “symbolic capital.” In her discussion of dedications to Haydn in the late eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries, Emily Green notes that dedications act as symbolic capital. When dedicating a piece of music to another composer, the composer who wrote the piece is trying to attach him- or herself to the dedicatee. This act is mostly to bring prestige to their own work; by dedicating their work to someone society perceives to be culturally important, the publishing composer is trying to associate their dedicatee’s cultural brilliance to their work, hoping they may be able to make more money from their composition.⁹ Bauer attempted to do the same with Boulanger’s name. For example, in most of her autobiographical accounts, Bauer mentioned Boulanger as one of her teachers, knowing the influence Boulanger had on American musical cultural in the early and mid-twentieth century.

⁹ Emily Green, “A Patron Among Peers: Dedications to Haydn and the Economy of Celebrity,” *Eighteenth-Century Music* 8, no. 2 (2011): 230-231.

In my thesis, I am connecting Boulanger and Bauer through a Bourdieusian framework as developed by Francis and Green. The initial meeting between the two women was at a starting point in their musical careers. The passage of influence from Boulanger, a young pedagogue, to Bauer allowed Bauer to succeed as a musician and musicologist and to create connections with other influential musicians of her day. I discuss the lives of Boulanger and Bauer and their cultural impact by looking at various writings by and on both women and analyzing Bauer's work for similarities to Boulanger's key pedagogical tenets. By exploring these writings and their relationship, Boulanger's cultural and symbolic capital can be seen as being accumulated and spent on Bauer, a pedagogue of music history and champion of modern music in the United States during the early twentieth century.

CHAPTER 2

BIOGRAPHY

Marion Bauer

From birth, Bauer was surrounded by family members who fostered musical opportunities. Jacques Bauer, Bauer's father, was "a natural, though untrained, musician and had a fine tenor voice" and sang for the family operatic arias, ballads, and French songs.¹⁰ He also played military band instruments, having the ability to easily play them "with very little work."¹¹ Bauer credits her father for her talent and love of music.¹² Emilie Francis Bauer, Bauer's older sister, also played a large role in Bauer's musical upbringing. Seventeen years older than Marion, Emilie Francis had previously studied piano with Miguel Espinosa and taught piano lessons from the Bauer home.¹³ While she was giving piano lessons and practicing, Emilie Francis placed Marion on top of the piano in a basket, allowing Marion to hear music of Mozart, Beethoven, and other popular classical composers before she could speak.¹⁴ Jacques and Emilie Francis Bauer also participated in local performances together and supported the local Oratorio society as well, but it is unknown if Marion actually attended these performances.¹⁵

¹⁰ Madeleine Goss, *Modern Music-Makers: Contemporary American Composers* (New York, NY: Dutton, 1952), 130.

¹¹ Ewen, *Composers of Today*, 16.

¹² David Ewen, *American Composers Today: A Biographical and Critical Guide* (New York: H.W. Wilson, 1949), 20. Bauer's biographical information in Ewen's works are written by Bauer herself.

¹³ Sarah Grace Shewbert, "Marion Bauer's 'Completely Musical Life' (1882-1955): An American Composer's Essential Creative Works and Contributions to Twentieth-Century Music" (PhD diss., University of Washington, 2014), 35.

¹⁴ This story is a favorite of several biographies. See Deborah Cohen, "Marion Bauer: Critical Reception of Her Historical Publications" (PhD diss., University of California Los Angeles, 1997), 45; Goss, *Modern Music Makers*, 129-130; Peggy A. Horrocks, "The Solo Vocal Repertoire of Marion Bauer with Selected Stylistic Analyses" (PhD diss., The University of Nebraska, 1994), 4; and Shewbert, "Marion Bauer's 'Completely Musical Life'", 35.

¹⁵ Pickett, *Marion and Emilie Francis Bauer*, 6-7.

When her father died suddenly in 1888, Bauer and her family moved to Portland, Oregon, where she completed her primary and secondary education. Emilie Francis had moved to Portland a few years before to work as a critic for the *Oregonian*, and the family moved to join her. It is assumed that Bauer began piano lessons with her older sister after her family's move to Portland, since accounts tell the story of Bauer studying with her older sister as soon as she could sit at a piano.¹⁶ Bauer completed her primary and secondary school education in Portland at the age of sixteen and completed post-secondary education at St. Helen's Hall and Portland High School in English at eighteen.¹⁷ Talented at several subjects, including drawing, teaching, writing, and music, she was not sure what to pursue as a career. Bauer ended up "following the path of least resistance" and moved to New York City to live with Emilie Francis, who had relocated there around 1888, and study music.¹⁸ She knew that through her sister's connections in New York City as a music critic, she would meet with some of the most influential people in American classical music at the time. Not only would she have these connections, but she would also be living with her sister, a close and financially stable family member.

After moving to New York City sometime between 1901 and 1903, Bauer began her first serious study of music. She initially worked with her older sister and then with Henry Holden Huss (1862-1953), an American composer, teacher, and pianist.¹⁹ Under Huss, Bauer studied harmony and piano until she left for France in 1906. Huss also oversaw Bauer's first publications: *Arabesque* and *Elegie*, published by the John Church Company in 1904.²⁰ Within

¹⁶ Goss, *Modern Music-Makers*, 130.

¹⁷ Cohen, "Marion Bauer," 80, 102-103.

¹⁸ Ewen, *Composers of Today*, 15.

¹⁹ Ewen, *Composers of Today*, 15.

²⁰ Marion Bauer, *Piano Compositions by Marion E. Bauer: Arabesque, Elegie* (Cincinnati, OH: The John Church Company, 1904).

these two works, Bauer demonstrated her sister's influence. Dedicated to Emilie Francis, *Arabesque* is similar in compositional technique to Claude Debussy's *Deux arabesques* (1891) with its impressionist language and flowing arpeggiations. Emilie Francis was writing articles about Debussy in 1902, so Bauer must have been introduced to the composer's music during the time she was studying with her sister.²¹ Living in a metropolitan area allowed Bauer to perform her newly published works in recitals and gave her the opportunity to make connections with other musicians and composers, including Raoul Pugno.²² Her encounter with Pugno and his family led Bauer to take her first trip to Europe. While for the most part she worked with Pugno and Boulanger on this trip, she also studied with American composer Louis Campbell-Tipton (1877-1921), who had settled in Paris in 1901.²³

Bauer made other trips to Europe for musical study, including two trips to Germany from 1910 to 1911 and in the summer of 1914, and two trips to France during the fall and winter of 1923-1924 and 1924-1925. During her trips to Germany, Bauer studied with Jean Ertel (1865-1933) in Berlin. Known as a critic and composer, Ertel first taught Bauer counterpoint and musical form. Three years later, Bauer returned to Berlin to study orchestration with Ertel.²⁴ These lessons would become important in the following decades as Bauer began to explore large-form compositions. Her 1914 trip was cut short due to the onset of World War I, and she returned to the United States in the fall with "practically no baggage except her manuscripts."²⁵

²¹ Pickett, *Marion and Emilie Francis Bauer*, 47. Pickett claims on page 40 that Bauer first heard Debussy's music during her trip to France in 1906. If her sister was writing about Debussy in 1902, it seems odd that Bauer would not have heard of Debussy before 1906. Also, the musical language used within her *Arabesque* is like that of Debussy's *Deux arabesques*, especially the first arabesque.

²² Shewbert, "Marion Bauer's 'Completely Musical Life'," 38-39.

²³ John Tasker Howard, *Our American Music* (New York, NY: Thomas Y. Crowell Company, 1946), 393.

²⁴ Shewbert, "Marion Bauer's 'Completely Musical Life'," 43-45.

²⁵ Shewbert, "Marion Bauer's 'Completely Musical Life'," 48.

Bauer's trips to Paris were spent studying fugues and orchestration with André Gédalge (1856-1926), lecturing at "one of the fashionable girls' schools in Paris," attending concerts, composing, and promoting her own music.²⁶ Bauer also made connections with other American composers studying in France, including a young Aaron Copland, who was studying with Boulanger at the time. It is unknown whether Bauer met with Boulanger during her later trips to France. In a 1925 *Musical Leader* article, Bauer recounts the musical activities in Paris during the winter of 1924 but does not mention Boulanger in any way.²⁷

While in New York, Bauer worked as a professor, lecturer, writer, and a composer; her focus, however, was on her work as an educator. Upon her return from Europe in 1926, she was made a member of the Executive Board of the League of Composers and began to teach at New York University (NYU) in the music department. By 1930, she was promoted to associate professor and acting chair; Bauer was the first woman associate professor in the music department at NYU. Her classes there were on the topics of form, analysis, and composition, and her lectures were on music history, appreciation, and musical criticism.²⁸

The Great Depression had an impact on the number of performances given by Bauer in the 1930s, but this did not stop her from publishing several books and compositions.

Collaborating with Ethel Peyser (1887-1961), Bauer published *How Music Grew: From Prehistoric Times to the Present Day* in 1926 and *Music Through the Ages: A Narrative for*

²⁶ Pickett, *Marion and Emilie Francis Bauer*, 124 and Emilie Francis Bauer, "Marion Bauer Sailing," *Musical Leader* 50, no. 19 (Nov. 5, 1925): 400. Emilie Francis does not specify what girls' school at which Bauer was to lecture. Future research would be useful to see if Bauer lectured at a school where Boulanger taught. This same "fashionable girls' school" is mentioned a second time when Bauer returned from Paris in January 1926. For this article, please see Emilie Francis Bauer, "Marion Bauer Returns," *Musical Leader* 51, no. 4 (January 28, 1926): 6.

²⁷ Emilie Francis Bauer, "The New School of Composers: Marion Bauer Returns from Paris and Tells of Activities in the French Capital," *Musical Leader* 49, no. 17 (Apr. 23, 1925): 442.

²⁸ Pickett, *Marion and Emilie Francis Bauer*, 140.

Student and Layman in 1932. Both books went through several revisions during her lifetime, demonstrating the popularity of these textbooks with students and the general public. She also published her own work on twentieth-century music in 1933. *Twentieth Century Music* contained not only Bauer's analysis of various twentieth-century compositions but also musical excerpts of scores not readily available in the United States at the time.²⁹

At the end of her life, Bauer was still active in her music career. In 1939, she founded the American Music Center with Aaron Copland, Howard Hanson, Quincy Porter, Otto Luening, and Harrison Kerr. American composers were having difficulty publishing and distributing their music, so the American Music Center was founded as a central communications center for composers trying to have their compositions performed and for performers wanting to perform American compositions.³⁰ Around the same time, Bauer resigned from her post as New York correspondent with *The Musical Leader*, a position that had been in the family since 1900. She continued to write a regular column and the occasional essay. It is no coincidence that Bauer's compositional output was higher during these later years after her resignation from *The Musical Leader*. Not only did she compose but she also published a new book, *Musical Questions and Quizzes*, and revised *Twentieth Century Music* at the same time. Furthermore, she also continued to publish articles in *Modern Music* and *The Music Quarterly*.

In the 1940s Bauer focused more intensely on large-form works. Almost all of her compositions during this decade use larger forms: Concertino for Oboe, Clarinet, and String Quartet (1940); Symphonic Suite for Strings (1941); Piano Concerto ("American Youth") (1943); *Sun Splendor* (1943-1946); *China* for chorus and orchestra (1945); Prelude and Fugue

²⁹ Further discussion of Bauer's texts is located in chapter 2.

³⁰ Pickett, *Marion and Emile Francis Bauer*, 185.

for flute and string orchestra (1948); and Symphony no. 1 (1947-1950). She also composed several songs and piano pieces for the young piano student. As seen in this list of works, Bauer was experimenting with different musical styles. Works such as *Symphonic Suite for Strings* and the Piano Concerto use a “romantic,” or a loosely tonal, idiom while *Sun Splendor, China*, and Symphony no. 1 use quintal harmonies. During her career’s early years, Bauer’s music was referred to as “ultramodern.” At this point in her career, Bauer was no longer considered radical or ultramodern in her compositions. Compared with her experimentalist colleagues, she was considered “middle-of-the-road,” her impressionist writing seen as almost conservative.³¹

Bauer retired from New York University in 1951 at the age of sixty-eight. She continued to work as the National Music Advisor to the Phi Beta Fraternity, a “co-education fraternity for people in the performing and creative arts.”³² She also gave concerts, composed, and taught part-time at The Juilliard School and the New York College of Music. In addition, she collaborated on another book with Ethel Peyser, *How Opera Grew*, and began writing notes and tentative chapters for four more books.³³ On August 9, 1955 while staying at the home of her close friend and collaborator Harrison Potter, Bauer suffered a heart attack and died from coronary thrombosis.³⁴

After her death, Bauer was largely forgotten. During her lifetime, she had promoted the music of twentieth-century composers. Through her work with students and the public, she brought a better understanding of contemporary music to a large audience. She understood that if contemporary classical music was to survive, the public needed to be educated. Through her

³¹ Goss, *Modern Music-Makers*, 136, and Howard, *Our American Music*, 435-436.

³² Pickett, *Marion and Emilie Francis Bauer*, 174.

³³ Pickett, *Marion and Emilie Francis Bauer*, 177.

³⁴ Cohen, “Marion Bauer,” 131.

textbooks and articles, she sought to bring music to everyone, not just those studying music in an academic setting.

Nadia Boulanger

Juliette Nadia Boulanger, born September 16, 1887, was raised in a musical and well-educated family. Ernest Boulanger (1815-1900), Nadia's father, was a professor of voice at the Paris Conservatoire from 1872 to his death; Raïssa Boulanger (1856-1935), Nadia's mother, moved from Russia to Paris to study under Ernest at the Conservatoire. Nadia's love of music did not begin at birth, however. The family's apartment had a harmonium and a piano and Ernest taught private singing lessons from home. Supposedly Nadia cried loudly at the sounds of the lessons and hid in her mother's skirts if she heard music on the streets.³⁵ When Nadia turned five, she grew out of her aversion to music. Raïssa had recently become pregnant, and Nadia was worried that she would be ignored because of the new sibling. One day, instead of hiding from the sound of a fire bell, Nadia approached the piano and plunked on the keys until she figured out the sounds of the bell. After this incident, Nadia listened to her father's voice lessons, sang along to his accompaniments, and began to study the fundamentals of music.³⁶

These fundamentals enraptured Boulanger and she decided to study music seriously. Because her father was the head of the Paris Conservatoire, she was easily able to study at the Conservatoire. In 1895, her father enrolled her in a solfège class and she started organ and composition lessons with Louis Vierne (1870–1937), the main organist at the Cathedral of Notre Dame. In 1898, she enrolled in a harmony class at the Conservatoire taught by August Chapuis

³⁵ Léonie Rosenstiel, *Nadia Boulanger: A Life in Music* (New York: W. W. Norton, 1982), 21.

³⁶ Rosenstiel, *Nadia Boulanger*, 26. Alan Kendall, *The Tender Tyrant, Nadia Boulanger: A Life Dedicated to Music* (London, England: Macdonalds and Jane's, 1976), 8. Alan Kendall claims that Raïssa Boulanger had no academic background and took it upon herself to learn harmony so she could teach her daughters the basics of music. This contradicts information in Rosenstiel's book.

(1858–1933). By 1900, she was enrolled in Paul Vidal’s (1863–1931) accompaniment class and by 1901, she enrolled in Gabriel Fauré’s (1845–1924) composition class. After winning First Prize at the Conservatoire in harmony, organ, piano accompaniment, in fugue, and composition by 1904, she began to earn money by performing.

The death of her father in 1900 left the family in need of a steady income, so Boulanger took up the role of breadwinner after her graduation from the Conservatoire in 1904. She began to teach friends of friends and family and kept composing and studying with other composers at the Conservatoire. In addition, Boulanger began a serious working relationship with her close friend and teacher Raoul Pugno during her final years at the Conservatoire. In order to assist Boulanger in earning money, Pugno would pass along students to Boulanger and would hold frequent concerts with her, promoting her compositions and her talent as a performer. In passing along students to Boulanger, Pugno was the one who introduced her to a young Marion Bauer in 1906, Boulanger’s first American pupil.

Pugno’s support encouraged Boulanger to perform in concerts and continue composing. With his and Charles-Marie Widor’s (1844–1937) encouragement, she participated in the Prix de Rome in 1907, 1908, and 1909, winning the Second Grand Prize in 1908. This win furthered her fame as a composer, but she was still dependent on teaching and performing for her family’s livelihood. While traveling in Russia in 1914 with Boulanger, Pugno died of a pulmonary embolism.³⁷ She lost the figure who had been supporting her as a composer and had served as a father figure after the death of her own father. According to Rosenstiel, “Pugno’s name alone had helped to generate public interest in Nadia’s concerts and recitals. Now he was gone.”³⁸

³⁷ Jérôme Spycket, *Nadia Boulanger* (Stuyvesant, NY: Pendragon Press, 1992), 40.

³⁸ Rosenstiel, *Nadia Boulanger*, 116.

Pugno's fame as a virtuosic pianist had helped bring attention to her compositions. Boulanger was also heavily impacted by the death of her younger sister Lili in early 1918. Lili was also a composer and the first woman to win the Prix de Rome in 1913. After the death of Pugno, Boulanger's composing and performing career declined; she composed a few short instrumental works in 1914 and set four texts by Camille Mauclair in 1922.³⁹ By the 1920s, Boulanger had turned her focus more toward teaching than composing.

Boulanger's teaching career spanned decades and two continents. In 1919, Boulanger began to work as one of the first staff members at the Ecole Normale de Musique where she taught harmony, counterpoint, music history, analysis, organ, and composition from 1920 to 1939 and keyboard harmony at the Paris Conservatoire from 1946 to 1957. Boulanger also began to teach as a founding member of the Conservatoire Américain in Fontainebleau in 1921, a position she held until her death, and became its director in 1949. She began to take on more and more American students who were coming to Paris to further their musical education in ways they could not in the United States. One of these students was Aaron Copland, who in 1923 asked Boulanger if she would take him on as a student. Realizing Copland's talent as a composer, she worked with Walter Damrosch, conductor of the New York Symphony Orchestra, to arrange for Copland's *Symphony for Organ and Orchestra* to be premiered by the New York Symphony Orchestra. Through this premiere, Copland became Boulanger's ticket to the United States, making possible her first visit to the country. In late 1924, Boulanger left for America and played the organ part in the symphony's premiere on January 24, 1925.⁴⁰ After the premiere, she spent the rest of the year in the United States, traveling and giving various lectures and

³⁹ Caroline Potter, *Nadia and Lili Boulanger* (Aldershot, England: Ashgate, 2006), 25.

⁴⁰ Julia Smith, *Aaron Copland: His Work and Contribution to American Music* (New York, NY: E. P. Dutton & Company, 1955), 75.

performances across the country. This includes her famous lectures on modern music at Rice University in Houston, Texas.⁴¹

After this initial trip, Boulanger traveled to the United States several more times. While in the United States from 1937 and 1938, she taught composition, harmony, and counterpoint. She also spent time lecturing, conducting, performing, and giving interviews.⁴² She taught at several different schools during this one-year long trip, including Harvard University, Wellesley College, Washington College, Radcliffe College, and the Longy School of Music. With the onset of World War II, Boulanger journeyed to America for an extended visit between 1940 and 1946. During this period, she continued serving as a guest lecturer and teacher in a number of universities. She also traveled across the United States, as she had done in 1925, and she lectured, extending her reach to more students. Many people she met during her travels ended up traveling to Fontainebleau after the war to study with her.⁴³ Boulanger continued to teach until her death at the age of ninety-two, working at several different schools and giving lessons out of her home in Paris and Gargenville.

Today, Boulanger is known for the impact she had on American composers, American music, and the American musical sound. It is difficult to discuss influential mid-twentieth-century American composers without mentioning her name in some way. The wide reach she had over the musical community gave her cultural capital. The students she taught were tied together by her teaching and pedagogical ideas, creating a group that defined the way music

⁴¹ Barrett Ashley Johnson, *Training the Composer: A Comparative Study Between the Pedagogical Methodologies of Arnold Schoenberg and Nadia Boulanger* (Newcastle upon Tyne, UK: Cambridge Scholars Publishing, 2010), 13. Detailed discussion on the Rice lectures can be found in chapter 2.

⁴² Johnson, *Training the Composer*, 13.

⁴³ Janet S. Schneider, "Basic Pedagogical Principles of Nadia Boulanger" (Master's thesis, Eastern Michigan University, 1998), 5-6.

should be written and heard. The cultural capital she passed on to her students had been passed along to her student's students and so on. Because of the accomplishments of her students, her name has been remembered as one of the greatest music pedagogues in the history of music.

CHAPTER 3

PEDAGOGIES OF BOULANGER AND BAUER

Nadia Boulanger

Over her seventy-five-year career, Boulanger taught more than six hundred American students, not including students from around the world.⁴⁴ She began teaching in 1905 after her father's death. In her family's Paris apartment, she taught piano, organ, harmony, fugue, and accompaniment lessons. Many of her past teachers, such as Raoul Pugno, Gabriel Fauré, and Paul Vierne, sent students. It was through Pugno that Boulanger was put into contact with American students who taught her English in return for lessons.⁴⁵ Her pedagogy influenced her students in one way or another, which allowed her pedagogical tradition to flourish not only during but after her lifetime. Because of the massive number of students she taught over her lifetime, several biographies by her students and sets of interviews with them have been published. These provide details about her work and methods.

Students of Boulanger note specific principles, or tenets she would use within her lessons, lectures, and other sessions. These four main principles were hearing, harmony, *la grande ligne*, and music history and literature.⁴⁶ Hearing, according to Boulanger, "is the sense by which sound is detected and perceived."⁴⁷ One of the first skills Boulanger would test students on was aural recognition; if students had well-developed pitch recognition and accuracy, she would take them on as pupils. About students who came to her with undeveloped aural skills, she remarked, "if there is no ear, if I sing Do and they sing Fa then I am obliged to say to them:

⁴⁴ Pickett, *Marion and Emilie Francis Bauer*, 40.

⁴⁵ Spycket, *Nadia Boulanger*, 21.

⁴⁶ Schneider, "Basic Pedagogical Principles of Nadia Boulanger," 32.

⁴⁷ Schneider, "Basic Pedagogical Principles of Nadia Boulanger," 32.

It will displease you... but it is better that I tell you now – you are no musician.”⁴⁸ Exercises used to improve musical memory in her classes included writing out parts of musical selections by memory and playing and singing separate lines from a piece at the keyboard.⁴⁹ She recognized that students must make artistic decisions when it comes to creating and performing music. Having a well-developed ear meant knowing exactly how to interpret music and make informed musical decisions before it is ever physically performed.

As much as Boulanger focused on students’ aural skills, her lessons predominantly focused on harmony, the combination of musical tones into chords and chord progressions.⁵⁰ While Boulanger focused on music scores in her harmony lessons, she used a few texts when teaching harmony and counterpoint: André Gedalge’s *Traité de la fugue* (1904), Theodore Dubois’s *Traité d’harmonie théorique et pratique* (1921), Marcel Dupré’s *Cours de contrepoint* (1938), and an exercise of 178 figured basses by Paul Vidal. The book she used most often, according to Boulanger’s students, was the Dubois text; however, Boulanger used the Gedalge and Dupré text for the study of counterpoint. For more detailed information on writing fugues, she would turn to the Gedalge text.⁵¹ She also emphasized learning all of the various scales and modes. By learning these scales and modes, one would not need to think very hard about them when performing a harmonic analysis. In using these texts and methods, Boulanger taught her students harmony and counterpoint, starting with the basics, with the idea that the roots of harmonic styles today can be linked back to the earliest music. The harmonic language of composers during Boulanger’s time could be connected back to Romantic, Classical, and

⁴⁸ Schneider, “Basic Pedagogical Principles of Nadia Boulanger,” 34.

⁴⁹ Schneider, “Basic Pedagogical Principles of Nadia Boulanger,” 35.

⁵⁰ Schneider, “Basic Pedagogical Principles of Nadia Boulanger,” 37.

⁵¹ Johnson, *Training the Composer*, 53-56.

Baroque era composers, and those composers could be connected back to the modes of Gregorian chant. Harmony and hearing were intertwined in Boulanger's eye. For her, "the history of harmony is the history of the development of the human ear."⁵²

Her understanding of harmony and aural skills led to Boulanger's concept of connecting musical elements to form *la grande ligne* (the "great line").⁵³ Aaron Copland explained this concept as "[A] sense of forward motion, of flow and continuity in the musical discourse; the feeling for inevitability, for creating of an entire piece that could be thought of as a functioning entity."⁵⁴ Every note within a musical work must have a meaningful function. By using specific notes, rhythmic patterns, and dynamics, a constant musical motion is created, leading to a logical beginning, middle, and end to the piece. To enforce the idea of *la grande ligne* in the student, Boulanger used repetitive rhythm exercises to demonstrate the correct feeling for the overall form. A composer's attention to these small details and their significance to the overall meaning of the work would be apparent to those listening to it.

The foundation of Boulanger's pedagogy was the study of music history and literature. Music history and literature, according to Boulanger, are the composers and compositions that have she determined to have lasting value and a major impact on the course of music. Various works supported Boulanger's other pedagogical principles; when she taught lessons in her Rue Ballu apartment on Wednesday afternoons, students would come together to study everything from Bach cantatas and Beethoven quartets to works by Gesualdo, Mahler, and Schoenberg. Later in her life, she was concerned with living composers such as Oliver Messiaen and Iannis

⁵² Don G. Campbell, *Master Teacher, Nadia Boulanger* (Washington D.C.: Pastoral Press, 1984), 100.

⁵³ Teresa Walters, "Nadia Boulanger, Musician and Teacher: Her Life, Concepts, and Influences" (DMA diss., John Hopkins University, 1981), 98.

⁵⁴ Aaron Copland, *Copland on Music* (New York, NY: Pyramid Books, 1960), 90.

Xenakis.⁵⁵ Her main focus when using these musical works from different time periods, genres, and styles was “to coordinate facts about the development of musical styles, to integrate aesthetic themes and relationships among masterworks, thus, to ‘seek to explain their beauty, to understand their apparent contradictions’.”⁵⁶ By studying these works, she was not only giving her students examples of great music and composers, she was also demonstrating to them her definition of art and aesthetic quality.

Boulanger also passed on her own definitions of art, music, and aesthetic quality, whether she realized it or not, through her essays and lectures. Over her lifetime, she published a few articles and essays in the journals *Le Monde musical* and *Spectateur des arts*. These writings record contemporary musical events and people and allow Boulanger’s personality and ideas about aesthetic value to shine through. Boulanger’s lectures allowed her to apply all four of her pedagogical principles at once, which can be seen in her lecture series on modern music given at Rice University in Houston, Texas in 1925. The “Lectures on Modern Music” were three separate lecture-recitals: “Modern French Music,” “Debussy: The Preludes,” and “Stravinsky.” In the first lecture, Boulanger discussed the harmony of modern music and notable modern French composers who composed in this style. She began by discussing the basic harmonic ideas of modern music. Breaking with the traditional viewpoint that the harmony of modern music was completely different from that of music of the past, she claimed that “the dissonances of today are the consonances of tomorrow.”⁵⁷ That is, intervals such as the third and seventh that were heard as dissonant in the past are heard as consonant today. Over years of hearing these

⁵⁵ Johnson, *Training the Composer*, 82.

⁵⁶ Walters, “Nadia Boulanger, Musician and Teacher,” 275.

⁵⁷ Campbell, *Master Teacher, Nadia Boulanger*, 100. An edited version of Boulanger’s Rice Lectures is included within this book and this is the version referenced throughout this thesis. For the original publication, please see Nadia Boulanger, “Lectures on Modern Music,” *The Rice Institute Pamphlet* 13, no. 2 (April 1926): 113-195.

harmonies, humans are able to adapt and expand what they understand as consonant and pleasing.⁵⁸ Boulanger understood that this lecture would not magically make modern music intelligible to those who had never listened to it before. However, the point of the lecture was to bring selected modern French composers and their compositions to light and spark some curiosity about modern music in her listeners. In turn, these listeners would then explore modern music on their own instead of turning away from it completely.

The second and third lectures at Rice University both focused on contemporary composers who, she thought, would be misunderstood by listeners. The second lecture, “Debussy: The Preludes,” covered the life of Claude Debussy (1862–1918) and his compositional language. After discussing his life, Boulanger used musical examples to compare his work to that of Modest Mussorgsky, and then presented each work in volumes one and two of Debussy’s Preludes. Each prelude was quickly analyzed musically and anecdotally, relating the descriptive titles to musical features found in the prelude. The third lecture, “Stravinsky,” introduced Igor Stravinsky’s (1882–1971) music and his compositional features. Much of the lecture is devoted to noting the wide range of influences on Stravinsky’s music, including jazz on the “Piano Concerto,” Wagner’s and Scriabin’s music on *The Firebird*, and Schoenberg’s music on *Three Japanese Lyrics*.⁵⁹ Boulanger and Stravinsky had a lifelong friendship, and she always promoted his music, noting specifically in this lecture that “only to the very great has it been permitted, in the past, to achieve such heights of universal beauty. That Stravinsky should have done so is no small tribute to the greatness of his genius and a certain indication of the classic and enduring qualities of his art.”⁶⁰ In this third lecture, Boulanger focused more on her

⁵⁸ Campbell, *Master Teacher, Nadia Boulanger*, 100.

⁵⁹ Campbell, *Master Teacher, Nadia Boulanger*, 144.

⁶⁰ Campbell, *Master Teacher, Nadia Boulanger*, 147.

pedagogical principles of *la grande ligne* and music history and literature. She comments on the forward motion of Stravinsky's musical lines: "The extraordinary life and interest of the work reside as they do in Bach's music, in the style itself, in the vitality of lines which are perpetually in movement, are forever unfolding and renewing themselves."⁶¹ Stravinsky's music never stopped flowing, and for Boulanger, this was what made his music relevant. She also compares Stravinsky's music to that of Johann Sebastian Bach, a composer who Boulanger regarded as one of the greats and whose music played a large role in her teaching.

Marion Bauer

Marion Bauer considered herself a composer, but during her lifetime other music critics saw her as a writer. One of her first jobs while in New York City was assisting her sister Emilie Francis in writing articles and reviews for the *Musical Leader*, an early twentieth-century Chicago-based music journal. Throughout her life she contributed to the *Musical Leader* as a New York correspondent, but this did not stop her from writing for other journals such as *Modern Music*, *The Music Quarterly*, *The Sackbut*, and *La Revue Musicale*. Bauer also had a lifelong love of teaching, especially of teaching the broad public about classical music and its history. This love inspired many of her large book projects.

Over the course of her lifetime, Bauer wrote five textbooks: *How Music Grew: From Prehistoric Times to the Present Day*; *Music Through the Ages: A Narrative for Student and Layman*; *Twentieth Century Music: How It Developed, How to Listen to It*; *Musical Questions and Quizzes*; and *How Opera Grew*.⁶² All of these textbooks laid a great deal of emphasis on teaching music history and literature to the layperson. Three of these texts, *How Music Grew*,

⁶¹ Campbell, *Master Teacher, Nadia Boulanger*, 146.

⁶² Due to time restraints, this thesis will not be covering *Musical Question and Quizzes* and *How Opera Grew*.

Music Through the Ages, and *Twentieth-Century Music*, were used in schools and other academic settings to educate students and the broader public about music history.

The first two books, *How Music Grew: From Prehistoric Times to the Present Day* and *Music Through the Ages: A Narrative for Student and Layman*, were born out of a collaboration between Ethel Rose Peyser and Bauer. Peyser was a New York-based journalist and political activist who wrote articles for *Good Housekeeping*, *House and Garden*, and *House Beautiful* and published a book on buying and maintaining household equipment.⁶³ Although it is unknown why the two collaborated on texts about music, they had previously worked together on a six-article series on music for the *Pictorial Review* before they began work on *How Music Grew*. Peyser gives music as a hobby in her autobiographical sketches.⁶⁴ In 1925, Bauer suggested that they create a music history text for young people. Although Peyser agreed and wanted to start work immediately, this meant sending manuscript versions of the text across the Atlantic, as Bauer spent most of 1925 in Europe.⁶⁵ A version of the manuscript became the first textbook collaboration between the two women, published in 1925 by G. P. Putman's Sons Publishing.⁶⁶ Intended as a one-volume general survey of music history with a focus on Western classical music and its composers, the authors' aim was to "help you to love music better, because you will have seen its struggle with politics, religion, and its critics."⁶⁷ Here music is portrayed as an almost human figure, growing and evolving through its struggle; Bauer and Peyser wanted their

⁶³ Pickett, *Marion and Emilie Francis Bauer*, 136.

⁶⁴ The *Pictorial Review* was an American woman's magazine, focused on middle-class women and social issues of the day. Kathleen L. Endres and Therese L. Lueck, eds., *Women's Periodicals in the United States: Consumer Magazines* (Westport, CT: Greenwood Press, 1995), 276. "Marion Bauer Leaves for Paris," *Musical Leader* 48, no. 21 (20 November 1924): 492. Pickett, *Marion and Emilie Francis Bauer*, 136.

⁶⁵ Goss, *Modern Music-Makers*, 134.

⁶⁶ Cohen, "Marion Bauer," 157.

⁶⁷ Cohen, "Marion Bauer," 144.

readers to extend empathy and understanding to music and those who work within music. To further push their ideas on music as an evolving and growing entity, they intended not to “write a history but rather... to follow a lane parallel to the road along which music has marched down to us through the ages.”⁶⁸ By using the metaphor of a long-walked road, the authors imply that they are using a progressive or evolutionary view of history, just as humans progress or evolve through the years. *How Music Grew* was highly successful and went through six printings and a revised edition by 1939.⁶⁹

After the success of their first book, Bauer and Peyser collaborated a second time in 1932 on *Music Through the Ages: A Narrative for Student and Layman*. *Music Through the Ages* was intended for readers of any age but focused on the student “in the classroom or out of it.”⁷⁰ It was used as a standard text for high school and college music classes and went through eight editions.⁷¹ It covers much of the same information as *How Music Grew* but with more details and a different layout: more information in tables, fewer illustrations and examples in musical notation, and narrower margins and line spacing.⁷² By including numerous of musical examples, Bauer and Peyser expected that a reader would be able to understand their harmonic analysis of various musical style periods and composers. This approach differentiated it from *How Music Grew*, which was more of an introductory text written in simple language for younger students and not assuming competency in music of its readership.

⁶⁸ Cohen, “Marion Bauer,” 144.

⁶⁹ Cohen, “Marion Bauer,” 140.

⁷⁰ Marion Bauer and Ethel R. Peyser, *Music Through the Ages: A Narrative for Student and Layman* (New York: G. P. Putnam’s Sons, 1932), iii.

⁷¹ Cohen, “Marion Bauer,” 216.

⁷² Cohen, “Marion Bauer,” 217.

A year later, Bauer authored her first textbook on her own: *Twentieth Century Music: How It Developed, How to Listen to It*. This book, instead of being for younger readers, was for those already knowledgeable about eighteenth and nineteenth-century music who wanted to understand twentieth-century music. The inspiration for the book came from a young woman who approached Bauer about her discomfort with new music, after trying to understand it:

Recently, a young woman who, although not a musician, has attended concerts regularly, said to me almost despairingly: 'What can I do to grow to like modern music? I don't understand it. I have tried to listen to it, but it means nothing to me; in fact, it takes away much of my pleasure in going to concerts.' She is one of many who love music, who know how to listen but do not know how to adjust themselves to the new conditions. They do not know how to exchange old ears for new.⁷³

As a composer of modern music herself, Bauer understood that those unfamiliar with new music would have a difficult time listening through the large amount of dissonance.

Twentieth Century Music uses a three-part method to educate its readers. The first part of the method is to demonstrate musical innovations in the twentieth century as the evolution of eighteenth and nineteenth-century music. The second part introduced readers to local and international composers of modern music and various patrons, organizations, performance venues, publishers, radio programs, and academies that encourage and promote modern music. Finally, the text includes more than one hundred examples of twentieth-century music, analyzed using new technical terminology that has been developed for discussing this repertory and compositional techniques on which it is founded. These examples contain excerpts of scores that were difficult to obtain within the United States. For many music students, this was their only exposure to many twentieth-century compositions. Composer Milton Babbitt was one of these students, and Bauer's textbook moved him to study with her at New York University. *Twentieth*

⁷³ Marion Bauer, *Twentieth Century Music* (New York, NY: G. P. Putnam's Sons, 1933), ix.

Century Music had enough impact on the public that Bauer produced a second edition in 1947 with updated material; reprint editions appeared as late as 1993, thirty-eight years after Bauer's death and sixty years after the book's original publication.⁷⁴

After she retired from New York University, Bauer continued to write educational texts. Bauer had ideas for several different textbooks; these ideas ranged from volumes on contemporary composers to a history of influential composers throughout the years, to a textbook on harmony, which demonstrated her interest in teaching music and advocating for her fellow musician. According to Deborah Cohen's dissertation on Bauer, Bauer completed a book in 1951 titled "Music Is a Language." Although "Music Is a Language" is mentioned in promotional material about her from 1951, no extant copies of the book or manuscript survive. Another text mentioned in Bauer's correspondence and secondary sources is a harmony textbook. Madeleine Goss notes that this modern harmony book was "in progress" as of 1952, but no material has yet been discovered.⁷⁵

Some of Bauer's ideas for books are held in the form of unpublished manuscripts at the New York University archives. The titles of these manuscripts are "Titans of Music," "Who was Monteverdi?," "Modern Creators of Music: A Survey of Contemporary Music and its Makers," and "Some Social Aspects of Music: Its Purpose and Place." "Titans of Music" was to be a survey of music history that focused on a number of the "great" composers: Claudio Monteverdi, Johann Sebastian Bach, Wolfgang Amadeus Mozart, Hector Berlioz, Robert and Clara Schumann, Johannes Brahms, Frederic Chopin, Franz Liszt, Richard Wagner, Modest

⁷⁴ Cohen, "Marion Bauer," 260.

⁷⁵ Goss, *Modern Music-Makers*, 134. Cohen, "Marion Bauer," 15. Cohen mentions the letter from Bauer to Philip James discussing the modern harmony book within a footnote.

Mussorgsky, Claude Debussy, and Béla Bartók.⁷⁶ Before “Titans of Music” was created, it seems that Bauer had planned to write a book about Monteverdi alone titled “Who was Monteverdi?” The unfinished manuscript survives, and Bauer seems to have turned it into a part of “Titans of Music.”⁷⁷ “Modern Creators of Music: A Survey of Contemporary Music and Its Makers” was a book in the same vein as “Titan of Music”; however, “Modern Creators of Music” focuses on influential composers of the late nineteenth and twentieth centuries.⁷⁸ The last of the book manuscripts is a book on music aesthetics titled “Some Social Aspects of Music.” In this text, Bauer was planning to discuss both classical and popular music, including jazz, new directions in opera, film music, music on radio and television, music and its role in religion, and in therapy and industry.⁷⁹

⁷⁶ Manuscript of “Titans of Music” by Marion Bauer, 1951, MC.3, Box 1, Folder 2, Marion Eugenie Bauer Papers, New York University Archives, New York, NY.

⁷⁷ Manuscript of “Who was Monteverdi?” by Marion Bauer, undated, MC.3, Box 1, Folder 3, Marion Eugenie Bauer Papers, New York University Archives, New York, NY.

⁷⁸ Manuscript of “Modern Creators of Music: A Survey of Contemporary Music and Its Makers, undated, MC.3, Box 1, Folder 7, Marion Eugenie Bauer Papers, New York University Archives, New York, NY.

⁷⁹ Manuscript of “Some Social Aspects of Music: Its Purpose and Place,” undated, MC. 3, Box 1, Folder 11, Marion Eugenie Bauer Papers, New York University Archives, New York, NY.

CHAPTER 4
COMPARISON OF BAUER'S WRITINGS AND BOULANGER'S PEDAGOGIES AND
CONCLUSION

It is unknown whether Boulanger and Bauer kept in touch after their first meeting in 1906. However, the two went on to become well-known pedagogues in their respective countries. Although the definite relationship between Bauer and Boulanger is still unclear, their relationship influenced by Bauer and her pedagogical techniques, and demonstrates Boulanger's pedagogical principles in her own writings.

Bauer's relationship with Boulanger was public knowledge as she included Boulanger's name as a teacher within writings that discuss her biography. When she died, her obituary in the *New York Times* listed her "well known" teachers as Henry Holden Huss, Raoul Pugno, André Gedalge, Nadia Boulanger, and Paul Ertel.⁸⁰ In 1947, the New York Philharmonic Society published notes on Bauer's *Sun Splendor* and stated that she was a student of Boulanger while in France.⁸¹ John Tasker Howard's *Our American Music*, a survey of American composers, provides similar information on Bauer.⁸² David Ewen, who was responsible for several encyclopedias of American and contemporary composers, had Bauer write her own autobiographical article in *Composers of Today* (1936) and *American Composers Today: A Biographical and Critical Guide* (1949). The two articles contain similar information and make the same comment about Pugno and Boulanger: "[Pugno] had seen my first little attempts at

⁸⁰ "Marion E. Bauer, Composer, Is Dead," *New York Times*, August 11, 1955, located in Bauer, Marion: Clippings, M-Clippings (Names), New York Public Library, New York, NY.

⁸¹ "Tone Poem, 'Sun Splendor,' Op. 19," *N.Y. Philharmonic Symphony Society Notes*, October 25, 1947, located in Bauer, Marion: Clippings, M-Clippings (Names), New York Public Library, New York, NY.

⁸² Howard, *Our American Music*, 435-436.

composition and was very encouraging, telling my sister that he would arrange for lessons in harmony, which he did. ...My harmony teacher was Nadia Boulanger.”⁸³

Bauer goes into a little more detail about her relationship with Boulanger in Madeleine Goss’s *Modern Music-Makers: Contemporary American Composers* (1952). The biography is written in the third person, but Goss mentions that most of her information comes from the composers themselves. Bauer lauded Boulanger for her knowledge of harmony and counterpoint, which she called “extraordinary.”⁸⁴ Goss’s article on Bauer does not regard Boulanger as a formal teacher but does recount the moment the two women decided to share their knowledge with each other: “When Nadia who wanted to learn English suggested that they exchange lessons – ‘If you will teach me English I will teach you harmony’ – Marion was delighted. She soon had a regular English class at Gargenville, consisting of Renee Pugno, Nadia and Lili Boulanger.”⁸⁵ It can be assumed that since an English class was started in Gargenville with Bauer teaching and Boulanger in attendance, Bauer did take harmony lessons with Boulanger.

Although no communication between the two women after their meeting in 1906 has been found, Bauer kept herself connected to Boulanger’s name through including her as a teacher in important biographies and articles. This connection led to comparisons between Boulanger and Bauer. In describing Bauer, her former student Milton Babbitt (1916-2011) said, “The only thing was that her basic orientation was Boulanger. She had studied with Boulanger. She was very French oriented, very much in the Boulanger tradition, except she wasn’t that kind of personality. She was a dear lady from Walla Walla; she wasn’t a stern lady from France.”⁸⁶

⁸³ Ewen, *Composers of Today*, 16. Ewen, *American Composers Today*, 21.

⁸⁴ Goss, *Modern Music-Makers*, 131.

⁸⁵ Goss, *Modern Music-Makers*, 131.

⁸⁶ Pickett, *Marion and Emilie Francis Bauer*, 211.

Babbitt never studied with Boulanger, but he did study with Roger Sessions, who had been a Boulanger student. He must have made this comparison through his own personal knowledge of Bauer and through stories of Boulanger told by Sessions and other friends.⁸⁷ Overall, the comparison is positive and links Bauer's French orientation to that of Boulanger.

Others were not so positive in their comparisons. In an anonymous program note about Bauer's "White Birches," the author praised Bauer for not taking on the teaching of Boulanger in her compositions: "Bauer holds the dubious distinction of having been the first American pupil of Mlle. Nadia Boulanger, teacher and mentor of virtually all those American composers who make of cacophony their special language. It is greatly to the credit of Miss Bauer's inherent taste and musical integrity that she has not succumbed entirely to the blandishments of this prophet from Paris."⁸⁸ Bauer was known for writing her own biographies, but in 1925 she wrote in a letter to music critic and author Irving Schwerké that she felt uncomfortable writing about herself and that her sister Emilie Francis "usually supplies this kind of copy for me."⁸⁹ With the information of the "White Birches" note incomplete, it is difficult to say who wrote it. Emilie Francis's writing was known for having a lively and cutting tone, and the tone of the "White Birches" note is a bit harsh and pointed, while still singing the praises of Bauer.⁹⁰ If Emilie Francis was the author of the note, it would contradict a 1918 article from the *Musical Leader* in which she identified Bauer as the "one representative pupil" of Boulanger in America at the

⁸⁷ "Milton Babbitt," Encyclopedia Britannica, last updated Apr. 3, 2019, <https://www.britannica.com/biography/Milton-Babbitt>.

⁸⁸ "White Birches," located in Bauer, Marion: Clippings, M-Clippings (Names), New York Public Library, New York, NY.

⁸⁹ Pickett, *Marion and Emilie Francis Bauer*, 124.

⁹⁰ Pickett, *Marion and Emilie Francis Bauer*, 137.

time.⁹¹ The wording used does not place either Bauer or Boulanger in a negative light. Perhaps this was Emilie Francis's way of keeping her own opinions at bay, but as a music critic, she was known for being outspoken. She, however, did not mention her sister's name as a pupil of Boulanger in a 1925 *Musical Leader* article on Boulanger's performance with the New York Symphony. In this case, Copland is noted as the representative pupil of Boulanger as the New York Symphony performed Copland's *Symphony for Organ and Orchestra* with Boulanger playing organ at this concert. Emilie Francis specifically remarks, "The symphony for organ and [orchestra?] by Mr. Copland is the work of a well-schooled young composer, formerly a pupil of Rubin Goldmark, and more recently of Mlle. Boulanger in a milieu which has colored his idiom."⁹²

Bauer also wrote about Boulanger and her thoughts about some of Boulanger's other students in one of her unpublished manuscripts. In chapter one of "Some Social Aspects of Music: Its Purpose and Place," Bauer speaks of the role of music education and the influence of teachers on American composers. A short list of Boulanger's students appears in the chapter, with a focus on Aaron Copland and Roy Harris (1898–1979). In the section on Copland, Boulanger is not mentioned outright. This is not the case in the Harris section. Bauer lauds Harris as an "independent and pioneering spirit" and claims that he has "worked out his own technique by blazing his own trail in spite of lessons with Nadia Boulanger and others."⁹³ She also claims that Harris's form consists of developing everything from a "germ motive" and the composition

⁹¹ Emilie Francis Bauer, "French Music to Dominate at New York Concert," *Musical Leader* 36, no. 12 (Sept. 19, 1918), 266.

⁹² Emilie Francis Bauer, "New York Symphony Offers Novelty," *Musical Leader* 49, no. 3 (Jan. 15, 1925), 64.

⁹³ Manuscript of Chapter II of "Some Social Aspects of Music: Its Purpose and Place," undated, MC. 3, Box 1, Folder 13, Marion Eugenie Bauer Papers, New York University Archives, New York, NY.

then unfolds from this germ motive.⁹⁴ As the mind of a Boulanger student, developing everything from a germ motive makes sense. Boulanger's *la grande ligne* calls for a piece to have consistent forward momentum, with every note given a meaningful function. If Harris's form is what Bauer says it is, then the idea of a germ motive developing and unfolding over the course of a composition would be a sign of Boulanger's impact on Harris, contradicting Bauer's claims.

Boulanger's impact on Bauer can also be seen in whom she chose to study with in France later in life. As previously mentioned, Bauer studied and composed in France from 1923 to 1926. During this time, she studied with André Gedalge, a famous teacher of counterpoint and fugues. Gedalge was a close friend of Ernest Boulanger and was working alongside Boulanger as early as 1901. In 1904, Gedalge wrote *Traité de la fugue*, and Boulanger was cited as using this text during her time at Fontainebleau. It is unknown if Boulanger used Gedalge's text during Bauer's harmony lessons in 1906. However, if Boulanger was professionally close with Gedalge around the time of Bauer's harmony lessons, it is possible that Bauer learned about Gedalge through her.

Bauer, through her studies with Ertel, Gedalge, Campbell-Tipton, and Boulanger, appears to have been concerned with harmony throughout her life. Towards the end of her life she was working on a book about modern harmony, but she had begun to tackle harmony in *Twentieth Century Music*. Chapter nine of the book gives a detailed discussion of the fundamentals of music theory, beginning with early Chinese and Greek scales and demonstrating the progression to twelve-tone scales. Bauer was concerned with scales in many of her compositions. Practicing

⁹⁴ Manuscript of Chapter II of "Some Social Aspects of Music: Its Purpose and Place," undated, MC. 3, Box 1, Folder 13, Marion Eugenie Bauer Papers, New York University Archives, New York, NY.

scales is of course an important part of technique building for performing musicians. Boulanger also understood this and urged students to be able to play all of the scales and modes in order to analyze compositions and recognize scales on sight. One of Bauer's first harmony teachers was Boulanger, and Boulanger must have emphasized learning scales to her during their lessons.

Both women also shared a teleological outlook in their explanations of music history and literature. A teleological approach to music considers it to be evolving or progressing towards an end goal. From this viewpoint, features of contemporary music are not new, but have developed over time and come to this point, and only will develop more as time goes on. That is, the value of compositions of the past is based on the development of elements that define later musics. This type of thinking can be seen in Boulanger's first lecture at Rice University. Not only does she claim that "the dissonances of today are the consonances of tomorrow," but also that "Music, like life is in constant evolution. Its transformation goes on incessantly, but the process is so gradual that, for the most part, we remain quite unconscious of the nature and extent of the changes which are taking place before our very eyes."⁹⁵ Discussing music as an entity that is evolving constantly reveals her teleological orientation. She also goes on to say in her discussion of Fauré that "his use of seventh chords prepared the way for countless later liberties in Maurice Ravel and Debussy and clearly foreshadow the latter composer's manner of connecting chords of the ninth."⁹⁶ Through this statement Boulanger connects Fauré to Ravel and Debussy and makes them the successors of Fauré.

Bauer's teleological outlook can likewise be discovered in her writings. Similarly to Boulanger, she comments on the "progression" and "evolution" of music in *Twentieth Century*

⁹⁵ Campbell, *Master Teacher, Nadia Boulanger*, 99-100.

⁹⁶ Campbell, *Master Teacher, Nadia Boulanger*, 106-107.

Music: “To many, the present day music seems to break completely with the past, to have no logical connection with former accepted methods. While it must be acknowledged that we are in a stage of transitional upheaval, the change when reviewed step by step is not mere chaos, but presents a front of progressive and reasonable evolution.”⁹⁷ Although she makes this claim, she goes on to differentiate “progress” from “evolution”: “Music does not ‘progress,’ and in no sense can one call old music inferior to the new or vice versa. To achieve the art of good listening is to accept the old music for what it is, and likewise the new, each for its own virtues. Happy is he who can enjoy the Old and yet appreciate the New!”⁹⁸ Boulanger argues for the same ideas. Older music has its place in history. Being able to listen to and understand all types of music makes musicians competent in their field. Through studying music history and listening to music, a musician can make informed decisions about interpretation and other musical expression.

Of Boulanger’s four pedagogical principles, *la grande ligne* is arguably the most difficult to identify within Bauer’s writings, since it is more of an aesthetic than a compositional technique. Boulanger, however, did identify certain composers as users of *la grande ligne* in her writings and lectures. By comparing her explanations of certain composers’ usages of *la grande ligne* to Bauer’s writings on composers, it can be understood that Bauer also knew and applied *la grande ligne*. In her third lecture on modern music, Boulanger discusses the music of Stravinsky and his use of *la grande ligne* in detail. Almost a year before Boulanger’s lectures at Rice University, Bauer wrote an essay on Stravinsky and his music that was published in the *Musical Leader*. In this essay, she too lauds Stravinsky as a “creator of such force and genius that

⁹⁷ Bauer, *Twentieth Century Music*, ix.

⁹⁸ Bauer, *Twentieth Century Music*, x.

whether his works remain or not, his influence does.”⁹⁹ Stravinsky, in Bauer’s eyes, had moved away from impressionism towards expressionism, a style which is heavily dominated by rhythmic patterns and by the physical reactions listeners feel in response. In this style, one passes through “cycles dominated in turn by rhythm, melody, and harmony.”¹⁰⁰ The rhythms in Stravinsky’s works are calculated, and because of his technical mastery, every rhythm, melody, and harmony has a specific meaning within the work. The aesthetic Bauer outlines in this article is what Boulanger would define is that of *la grande ligne*. Every musical decision within a composition is calculated and each note is given a specific meaning.

Boulanger, whether her students realized it or not, had a great deal of influence over her students. She brought them to undertake an intense study of music, focusing on harmony, hearing, music history and literature, and *la grande ligne*. By breaking down the fundamentals of music to her students, she allowed them to compose the way they felt the most comfortable while still achieving musical cohesion. Boulanger must have realized this while teaching at a young age as her pedagogical principles were developed through her experiences with the Paris Conservatoire. While the level of communication between Boulanger and Bauer after 1906 has not yet been inconclusively determined, we do know that Bauer was Boulanger’s first American student. According to Goss’s biography, the two women were pleasant to one another and learned something from each other, whether it concerned harmony or English. If Bauer and Copland met in Boulanger’s salon in Paris during the 1923–1924 season, there must have been some continuing connection between the two women. Boulanger’s influence and cultural capital

⁹⁹ Marion Bauer, “Igor Stravinsky: A Musical Survey by Marion Bauer,” *Musical Leader* 47, no. 12 (20 March, 1924), 227.

¹⁰⁰ Bauer, “Igor Stravinsky,” 227.

were passed on to Bauer when they first met and allowed Bauer to meet others within Boulanger's musical circles, such as Gedalge and Copland.

Although the anonymous note about Bauer mentions that she did not “[succumb] entirely to the blandishments of this prophet from Paris,” this is not entirely true. Bauer uses the same pedagogical principles as Boulanger: harmony, hearing, music history and literature, and *la grande ligne*. It is difficult to say how Bauer implemented the hearing principle, as that requires first-hand knowledge of Bauer's teaching style within the classroom, information that is currently not available. However, it is known that Bauer encouraged her students in the other three principles within her writings, which educates those wanting to learn how to listen to certain types of classical music. Bauer's ties to Boulanger are strong, though she denied Boulanger's influence on her and her music. Despite their distance, these two women were connected through the power of influence and cultural capital. As Bauer said herself in an article on the music of the future, “The Paris School no doubt, guides the world movement.”¹⁰¹

¹⁰¹ Marion Bauer, “Music of the Future: Pendulum Swinging Back to Classic Beauty and Harmony — Dissonances of the Modernists an Influence of the War,” *Musical Leader* 49, no. 22 (May 28, 1925): 615.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Primary Sources

- Bauer, Emilie Francis. "French Music to Dominate at New York Concerts." *Musical Leader* 36, no. 12 (19 September 1918): 266-267.
- . "Marion Bauer Returns." *Musical Leader* 51, no. 4 (January 28, 1926): 6.
- . "Marion Bauer Sailing." *Musical Leader* 50, no. 19 (5 November 1925): 400.
- . "The New School of Composers: Marion Bauer Returns from Paris and Tells of Activities in the French Capital." *Musical Leader* 49, no. 17 (23 April 1925): 442.
- . "New York Symphony Offers Novelty," *Musical Leader* 49, no. 3 (15 January 1925): 64.
- Boulanger, Nadia. "Lectures on Modern Music." *The Rice Institute Pamphlet* 13, no. 2 (April 1926): 113-195.
- Bauer, Marion. "Igor Stravinsky: A Musical Survey by Marion Bauer." *Musical Leader* 47, no. 12 (20 March 1924): 277.
- . "Music of the Future: Pendulum Swinging Back to Classic Beauty and Harmony — Dissonances of the Modernists an Influence of the War." *Musical Leader* 49, no. 22 (28 May 1925): 615.
- . *Piano Compositions by Marion E. Bauer: Arabesque, Elegie*. Cincinnati, OH: The John Church Company, 1904.
- . *Twentieth Century Music: How It Developed, How to Listen to It*. New York, NY: G. P. Putnam's Sons, 1933.
- Bauer, Marion, and Ethel R. Peyser. *Music Through the Ages: A Narrative for Student and Layman*. New York, NY: G. P. Putnam's Sons, 1932.
- Bauer, Marion: Clippings, M-Clippings (Names). New York Public Library, New York, NY.
- Marion Eugenie Bauer Papers, MC.3. New York University Archives, New York, NY.
- "Marion Bauer Leaves for Paris." *Musical Leader* 48, no. 21 (20 November 1924): 492.

Secondary Sources

- Babbitt, Milton. "Introduction to Marion Bauer's *Twentieth Century Music*." In *The Collected Essays of Milton Babbitt*, edited by Stephen Peles with Stephen Dembski, Andrew Mead, and Joseph N. Straus, 367-370. Princeton, N.J.: Princeton University Press, 2003.
- Campbell, Don G. *Master Teacher, Nadia Boulanger*. Washington D.C.: Pastoral Press, 1984.

- Cohen, Deborah. "Marion Bauer: Critical Reception of Her Historical Publications." PhD diss., University of California, 1997.
- Copland, Aaron. *Copland on Music*. New York, NY: Pyramid Books, 1960.
- Copland, Aaron, and Vivian Perlis. *Copland: 1900 Through 1942*. New York, NY: St. Martin's/Marek, 1984.
- Cusick, Suzanne G. "Gender, Musicology, and Feminism." In *Rethinking Music*, edited by Nicholas Cook and Mark Everist, 471-498. New York: Oxford University Press, 1999.
- DeVries, Diane Lynn. "The Pedagogical Influence of Nadia Boulanger on the Works of Her Female Students: An Analysis of Selected Compositions." Master's thesis, Michigan State University, 1998.
- Edwards, J. Michele, "Bauer, Marion Eugénie." *Grove Music Online*. Accessed April 9, 2018. <http://libproxy.library.unt.edu:2173/grovemusic/view/10.1093/gmo/9781561592630.001.0001/omo-9781561592630-e-0000002353>.
- . "Marion Bauer." In *The Norton-Grove Dictionary of Women Composers*, Ed. Julie Ann Sadie and Rhian Samuel, 41-43. New York, NY: W.W. Norton, 1995.
- Endres, Kathleen L., and Therese L. Lueck, eds. *Women's Periodicals in the United States: Consumer Magazines*. Westport, CT: Greenwood Press, 1995.
- Ewen, David. *American Composers Today: A Biographical and Critical Guide*. New York, NY: H.W. Wilson Company, 1949.
- . *Composers of Today: A Comprehensive Biographical and Critical Guide to Composers of All Nations*. New York: H. W. Wilson Company, 1934.
- Francis, Kimberly. "‘Everything Had to Change’: Nadia Boulanger’s Translation of Modernism in the Rice Lecture Series, 1925." *Journal of the Society for American Music* 7, no. 4 (2013): 363-381.
- . "Her-Storiography: Pierre Bourdieu, Cultural Capital, and Changing the Narrative Paradigm." *Women and Music: A Journal of Gender and Culture* 19 (2015): 169-177.
- . *Teaching Stravinsky: Nadia Boulanger and the Consecration of a Modernist Icon*. New York, NY: Oxford University Press, 2015.
- Goss, Madeline. *Modern Music-Makers: Contemporary American Composers*. New York: Dutton, 1952.
- Green, Emily. "A Patron Among Peers: Dedications to Haydn and the Economy of Celebrity." *Eighteenth-Century Music* 8, no. 2 (2011): 215-237.

- Horrocks, Peggy A. "The Solo Vocal Repertoire of Marion Bauer with Selected Stylistic Analyses." DMA diss., University of Nebraska, 1994.
- Howard, John Tasker. *Our American Music*. New York, NY: Thomas Y. Crowell Company, 1946.
- Johnson, Barrett Ashley. *Training the Composer: A Comparative Study Between the Pedagogical Methodologies of Arnold Schoenberg and Nadia Boulanger*. Newcastle upon Tyne, UK: Cambridge Scholars Publishing, 2010.
- Kendall, Alan. *The Tender Tyrant, Nadia Boulanger: A Life Devoted to Music: A Biography*. Wilton, CT: Lyceum Books, 1977.
- Kostelanetz, Richard, and Steve Silverstein, eds. *Aaron Copland: A Reader: Selected Writings 1923-1972*. New York, NY: Routledge, 2004.
- Monsaigne, Bruno. *Mademoiselle: Conversations with Nadia Boulanger*. Manchester: Carcanet, 1985.
- Pickett, Susan. *Marion and Emilie Francis Bauer: From the Wild West to American Musical Modernism*. Lulu Publishing, 2014.
- Potter, Caroline. "Boulanger, (Juliette) Nadia." *Grove Music Online*. Accessed April 9, 2018. <https://libproxy.library.unt.edu:2147/10.1093/gmo/9781561592630.article.03705>.
- . *Nadia and Lili Boulanger*. Aldershot, England: Ashgate, 2006.
- Rosenstiel, Léonie. *Nadia Boulanger: A Life in Music*. New York: W. W. Norton, 1982.
- Schneider, Janet S. "Basic Pedagogical Principles of Nadia Boulanger." Master's thesis, Eastern Michigan University, 1998.
- Shewbert, Sarah Grace. "Marion Bauer's 'Completely Musical Life' (1882-1955): An American Composer's Essential Creative Works and Contributions to Twentieth-Century Music." PhD diss., University of Washington, 2014.
- Smith, Julia. *Aaron Copland: His Work and Contribution to American Music*. New York, NY: E. P. Dutton & Company, 1955.
- Spycket, Jérôme. *Nadia Boulanger*. Stuyvesant, NY: Pendragon Press, 1992.
- Stevens, Elizabeth Mruk. "The Influence of Nadia Boulanger on Composition in the United States: A Study of Piano Solo Works by Her American Students." DMA dissertation, Boston University, 1975.
- Walters, Teresa. "Nadia Boulanger, Musician and Teacher: Her Life, Concepts, and Influences." DMA diss., John Hopkins University, 1981.