

PPPL-2467

PPPL-2467

UC20-G

PPPL--2467


DE88 000111

DIFFERENTIAL FORM OF THE COLLISION INTEGRAL
FOR A RELATIVISTIC PLASMA

By

B.J. Braams and C.F.F. Karney

AUGUST 1987

PLASMA
PHYSICS
LABORATORY 

PRINCETON UNIVERSITY
PRINCETON, NEW JERSEY

PREPARED FOR THE U.S. DEPARTMENT OF ENERGY,
UNDER CONTRACT DE-AC02-76-CBO-3073.

NOTICE

This report was prepared as an account of work sponsored by the United States Government. Neither the United States nor the United States Department of Energy, nor any of their employees, nor any of their contractors, subcontractors, or their employees, makes any warranty, express or implied, or assumes any legal liability or responsibility for the accuracy, completeness or usefulness of any information, apparatus, product or process disclosed, or represents that its use would not infringe privately owned rights.

Printed in the United States of America

Available from:

National Technical Information Service
U.S. Department of Commerce
5285 Port Royal Road
Springfield, Virginia 22161

Price Printed Copy \$ * ; Microfiche \$4.50

<u>*Pages</u>	<u>NTIS Selling Price</u>	
1-25	\$7.00	For documents over 600 pages, add \$1.50 for each additional 25-page increment.
25-50	\$8.50	
51-75	\$10.00	
76-100	\$11.50	
101-125	\$13.00	
126-150	\$14.50	
151-175	\$16.00	
176-200	\$17.50	
201-225	\$19.00	
226-250	\$20.50	
251-275	\$22.00	
276-300	\$23.50	
301-325	\$25.00	
326-350	\$26.50	
351-375	\$28.00	
376-400	\$29.50	
401-425	\$31.00	
426-450	\$32.50	
451-475	\$34.00	
476-500	\$35.50	
500-525	\$37.00	
526-550	\$38.50	
551-575	\$40.00	
567-600	\$41.50	

DIFFERENTIAL FORM OF THE COLLISION INTEGRAL FOR A RELATIVISTIC PLASMA

Bastiaan J. Braams and Charles F. F. Karney

Plasma Physics Laboratory, Princeton University, Princeton, NJ 08544.

Abstract

The differential formulation of the Landau-Fokker-Planck collision integral is developed for the case of relativistic electromagnetic interactions.

Kinetic theory is founded upon the Boltzmann equation, which is a conservation equation for the phase-space distribution function of each species in an ensemble of interacting particles. For the case of Coulomb interactions, Landau¹ expressed the collision term in the Fokker-Planck form. This mixed integro-differential representation was extended to relativistic electromagnetic interactions by Beliaev and Budker.² For the nonrelativistic case, it was shown by Rosenbluth et al.³ and by Trubnikov⁴ that the integrals appearing in the collision term can be expressed in terms of the solution of a pair of differential equations. The present work extends that formulation to the relativistic collision integral.

For advanced-fuel fusion reactors temperatures on the order of 100 keV are required and a fully relativistic treatment of collisions is necessary. Even in present-day fusion experiments there can be a substantial component of relativistic electrons; although the majority of collisions may be accurately described in the nonrelativistic limit, it is advantageous to have a unified formulation of the collision operator. Relativistic kinetic theory also finds application in astrophysics. The differential form of the collision term involves only some simple elliptic differential equations, and is therefore much preferable to the integral form for computational work. Furthermore, the differential form is amenable to analytical treatment by employing an expansion in spherical harmonics; we apply it at the end of this letter to calculate the scattering and slowing down of fast particles in a relativistic, equilibrium background plasma.

According to Landau,¹ the collision term that occurs on the right-hand side of the Boltzmann equation for species *a* and describes the effect of collisions with species *b* may be written in the Fokker-Planck form,

$$C_{ab} = \frac{\partial}{\partial \mathbf{u}} \cdot (\mathbf{D}_{ab} \cdot \frac{\partial f_a}{\partial \mathbf{u}} - \mathbf{F}_{ab} f_a), \quad (1)$$

in which the coefficients \mathbf{D}_{ab} and \mathbf{F}_{ab} are defined by

$$\mathbf{D}_{ab}(\mathbf{u}) = \frac{q_a^2 q_b^2}{8\pi\epsilon_0^2 m_a^2} \log \Lambda_{ab} \int \mathbf{U}(\mathbf{u}, \mathbf{u}') f_b(\mathbf{u}') d^3 \mathbf{u}', \quad (2a)$$

$$\mathbf{F}_{ab}(\mathbf{u}) = -\frac{q_a^2 q_b^2}{8\pi\epsilon_0^2 m_a m_b} \log \Lambda_{ab} \int \left(\frac{\partial}{\partial \mathbf{u}'} \cdot \mathbf{U}(\mathbf{u}, \mathbf{u}') \right) f_b(\mathbf{u}') d^3 \mathbf{u}'. \quad (2b)$$

Here, f_a and f_b are the distribution functions for the two species, \mathbf{u} is the ratio of momentum to species mass, q_a and q_b are the species charge, m_a and m_b are the species mass, ϵ_0 is the vacuum dielectric permittivity, and $\log \Lambda_{ab}$ is the Coulomb logarithm. The kernel \mathbf{U} is specified below. The purpose of this letter is to present a differential formulation for the integral transforms that occur in Eqs. (2). To avoid unnecessary clutter we discard the factor that depends only on the species properties, drop the species subscript, and consider the transforms

$$\mathbf{D}(\mathbf{u}) = \frac{1}{8\pi} \int \mathbf{U}(\mathbf{u}, \mathbf{u}') f(\mathbf{u}') d^3 \mathbf{u}', \quad (3a)$$

$$\mathbf{F}(\mathbf{u}) = -\frac{1}{8\pi} \int \left(\frac{\partial}{\partial \mathbf{u}'} \cdot \mathbf{U}(\mathbf{u}, \mathbf{u}') \right) f(\mathbf{u}') d^3 \mathbf{u}'. \quad (3b)$$

For guidance, let us recall briefly the nonrelativistic theory.^{3,4} In that case the momentum-to-mass ratios \mathbf{u} and \mathbf{u}' reduce to the velocities \mathbf{v} and \mathbf{v}' , and the collision kernel is the one given by Landau,¹ $\mathbf{U} = (|\mathbf{s}|^2 \mathbf{I} - \mathbf{s}\mathbf{s})/|\mathbf{s}|^3$, where $\mathbf{s} = \mathbf{v} - \mathbf{v}'$. It may be seen that $\mathbf{U} = \partial^2 |\mathbf{s}| / \partial \mathbf{v} \partial \mathbf{v}$ and $(\partial / \partial \mathbf{v}') \cdot \mathbf{U} = -2\partial |\mathbf{s}|^{-1} / \partial \mathbf{v}$. To obtain the differential formulation, these representations are inserted into Eqs. (3), and the differentiation with respect to \mathbf{v} is moved outside the integration over \mathbf{v}' . Defining the potentials $h(\mathbf{v}) = -(1/8\pi) \int |\mathbf{s}| f d^3 \mathbf{v}'$ and $g(\mathbf{v}) = -(1/4\pi) \int |\mathbf{s}|^{-1} f d^3 \mathbf{v}'$, we have $\mathbf{D} = -\partial^2 h / \partial \mathbf{v} \partial \mathbf{v}$ and $\mathbf{F} = -\partial g / \partial \mathbf{v}$. Furthermore, from $\Delta_{\mathbf{v}} |\mathbf{s}| = 2|\mathbf{s}|^{-1}$ and $\Delta_{\mathbf{v}} |\mathbf{s}|^{-1} = -4\pi \delta(\mathbf{s})$ it follows that h and g obey the equations $\Delta_{\mathbf{v}} h = g$ and $\Delta_{\mathbf{v}} g = f$. ($\Delta_{\mathbf{v}}$ denotes the Laplacian with respect to the variable \mathbf{v} .) These equations provide the differential formulation of the collision term in the nonrelativistic case.

The Landau collision kernel was obtained in a semi-relativistic fashion, assuming Coulomb collisions and relativistic particle kinematics. It is a good approximation to the fully relativistic kernel given below provided that $|\mathbf{v}, \mathbf{v}'| \ll c^2$, which is true when one of the colliding particles is nonrelativistic. However, the reduction of the collision integral to the differential form of Rosenbluth and Trubnikov relies on the stronger assumptions $|\mathbf{v}|^2 \ll c^2$ and $|\mathbf{v}'|^2 \ll c^2$, and is therefore entirely nonrelativistic. A relativistically correct treatment of the Landau kernel was given by Franz.⁵ That work relies on an expansion of the collision operator in spherical harmonics, but the result can easily be modified to provide a differential formulation for the collision term that is exactly equivalent to the Landau collision integral. We shall not pursue that approach here, but turn now to the differential formulation based on the fully relativistic collision kernel.

The collision kernel for relativistic electromagnetic interactions was calculated by Beliaev and Budker.^{2,6} They obtained the expression

$$\mathbf{U}(\mathbf{u}, \mathbf{u}') = \frac{r^2 / (\gamma \gamma')}{(r^2 - 1)^{3/2}} ((r^2 - 1) \mathbf{I} - \mathbf{u}\mathbf{u} - \mathbf{u}'\mathbf{u}' + r(\mathbf{u}\mathbf{u}' + \mathbf{u}'\mathbf{u})), \quad (4a)$$

in which $\gamma = \sqrt{1 + |\mathbf{u}|^2}$, $\gamma' = \sqrt{1 + |\mathbf{u}'|^2}$, and $r = \gamma \gamma' - \mathbf{u} \cdot \mathbf{u}'$. (We set $c = 1$ in this part of the paper.) One finds

$$\frac{\partial}{\partial \mathbf{u}'} \cdot \mathbf{U}(\mathbf{u}, \mathbf{u}') = \frac{2r^2 / (\gamma \gamma')}{(r^2 - 1)^{3/2}} (r\mathbf{u} - \mathbf{u}'). \quad (4b)$$

Notice that r is the relativistic correction factor for the relative velocity between the two particles (i.e., for the velocity of one particle in the rest frame of the other). Conversely, this relative velocity is given by $r^{-1}(r^2 - 1)^{1/2}$.

In developing a differential formulation for the collision term based on the Beliaev and Budker kernel, it is helpful to work in terms of relativistically covariant quantities. The expression $\gamma\gamma'\mathbf{U}$ is equal to the space part of a four-tensor W that depends on the four-vectors $u = (\gamma, \mathbf{u})$ and $u' = (\gamma', \mathbf{u}')$,

$$W^{ij}(u, u') = \frac{r^2}{(r^2 - 1)^{3/2}} ((r^2 - 1)g^{ij} - u^i u^j - u'^i u'^j + r(u^i u'^j + u'^i u^j)), \quad (5a)$$

where g^{ij} is the metric tensor, with signature $-+++$. ($r = -u_i u'^i$ is clearly a four-scalar.) The tensor W is symmetric ($W^{ij} = W^{ji}$), symmetric in u and u' , satisfies $W^{ij}u_j = 0$, and satisfies $W_i^i = 2r^2(r^2 - 1)^{-1/2}$. Likewise $\gamma\gamma'(\partial/\partial u') \cdot \mathbf{U}$ is the space part of the four-vector V , where

$$V^i = \frac{2r^2}{(r^2 - 1)^{3/2}} (ru^i - u'^i). \quad (5b)$$

If the relativistic differential formulation is to parallel most closely the nonrelativistic formulation, then one should find a representation of the form $W^{ij} = \mathcal{H}^{ij}\psi$ and $V^i = -2\mathcal{G}^i\varphi$, where ψ and φ are four-scalars depending on u and u' , and \mathcal{H}^{ij} and \mathcal{G}^i are covariant differential operators acting on the variable u . In the nonrelativistic limit, ψ should reduce to $|\mathbf{v} - \mathbf{v}'|$ and φ should reduce to $|\mathbf{v} - \mathbf{v}'|^{-1}$. It should be possible to transform ψ and φ to a delta function by a sequence of second-order differential operators. The potentials would be defined as $h = -(1/8\pi) \int (\psi f / \gamma') d^3\mathbf{u}'$ and $g = -(1/4\pi) \int (\varphi f / \gamma') d^3\mathbf{u}'$; these expressions define four-scalars (see the discussion in Lifshitz and Pitaevski⁶). The differential equations satisfied by h and g follow immediately from those satisfied by ψ and φ . Finally, \mathbf{D} is obtained as the space part of $-\gamma^{-1}\mathcal{H}^{ij}h$ and \mathbf{F} as the space part of $-\gamma^{-1}\mathcal{G}^i g$. In fact, it will turn out that the relativistic formulation has to be somewhat more complicated, but not fundamentally different from the outline just sketched.

The restriction that a function of the four-vectors u and u' should be a four-scalar is a severe one. The expressions u^2 and u'^2 are constants ($= -1$), and thus any four-scalar that is formed from u and u' must be a function of $r = -u \cdot u'$ alone.

The form of the differential operators \mathcal{H}^{ij} and \mathcal{G}^i is restricted because these should be interior operators on the surface $u^2 = -1$ in four-space. In addition, it is required that $\mathcal{H}^{ij} = \mathcal{H}^{ji}$ and $u_i \mathcal{H}^{ij} = 0$. Under those restrictions it is found that the most general form of \mathcal{H}^{ij} and \mathcal{G}^i , up to a multiplicative constant, is $\mathcal{H}^{ij}\chi = \mathcal{L}^{ij}\chi + \alpha(g^{ij} + u^i u^j)\chi$ and $\mathcal{G}^i\chi = \mathcal{K}^i\chi + \beta u^i\chi$. Here, α and β are arbitrary constants, and

$$\mathcal{L}^{ij}\chi = (g^{ik} + u^i u^k)(g^{jl} + u^j u^l) \frac{\partial^2 \chi}{\partial u^k \partial u^l} + (g^{ij} + u^i u^j) u^m \frac{\partial \chi}{\partial u^m}, \quad (6a)$$

$$\mathcal{K}^i\chi = (g^{ik} + u^i u^k) \frac{\partial \chi}{\partial u^k}. \quad (6b)$$

Assuming that χ is a function of r alone, we obtain

$$\mathcal{L}^{ij}\chi = \frac{d^2\chi}{dr^2}(ru^i - u'^i)(ru^j - u'^j) + r\frac{d\chi}{dr}(g^{ij} + u^i u^j)$$

and $\mathcal{K}^i\chi = (d\chi/dr)(ru^i - u'^i)$. One is thereby led to the representations

$$W^{ij} = [\mathcal{L}^{ij} + (g^{ij} + u^i u^j)]\sqrt{r^2 - 1} - [\mathcal{L}^{ij} - (g^{ij} + u^i u^j)](r \cosh^{-1} r - \sqrt{r^2 - 1}), \quad (7a)$$

$$V^i = -2\mathcal{K}^i(r(\tau^2 - 1)^{-1/2} - \cosh^{-1} r). \quad (7b)$$

The spatial part of $\mathcal{L}^{ij}\chi$ is $L\chi$ and that of $\mathcal{K}^i\chi$ is $\mathbf{K}\chi$ where

$$L\chi = \gamma^{-2} \frac{\partial^2 \chi}{\partial \mathbf{v} \partial \mathbf{v}} - \mathbf{v} \cdot \frac{\partial \chi}{\partial \mathbf{v}} - \frac{\partial \chi}{\partial \mathbf{v}} \cdot \mathbf{v}, \quad (8a)$$

$$\mathbf{K}\chi = \gamma^{-1} \frac{\partial \chi}{\partial \mathbf{v}}, \quad (8b)$$

$\mathbf{v} = \mathbf{u}/\gamma$, and $\partial/\partial \mathbf{v} = \gamma(\mathbf{1} + \mathbf{u}\mathbf{u}) \cdot \partial/\partial \mathbf{u}$.

The above representations for W and V are only suitable for constructing a differential formulation of the collision term if the functions that occur on the right-hand sides can be reduced to delta functions by some sequence of differential operators. For that purpose the contraction $L = \mathcal{L}^i_i$ is needed; in terms of the three-space variables it is

$$L\chi = (\mathbf{1} + \mathbf{u}\mathbf{u}) : \frac{\partial^2 \chi}{\partial \mathbf{u} \partial \mathbf{u}} + 3\mathbf{u} \cdot \frac{\partial \chi}{\partial \mathbf{u}}. \quad (9)$$

If χ is a function of r alone, then $L\chi = (r^2 - 1)(d^2\chi/dr^2) + 3r(d\chi/dr)$ away from $r = 1$; at $r = 1$ (or $\mathbf{u} = \mathbf{u}'$) there may be a singularity. Specifically, it is found that

$$L(r(\tau^2 - 1)^{-1/2}) = -4\pi\gamma\delta(\mathbf{u} - \mathbf{u}'),$$

$$[L + 1](r(\tau^2 - 1)^{-1/2}) = -4\pi\gamma\delta(\mathbf{u} - \mathbf{u}').$$

The explicit form of the differential representation of Eqs. (3) based on the Beliaev and Budker collision kernel² follows: The potentials are

$$h_0 = -(1/4\pi) \int (\tau^2 - 1)^{-1/2} f(\mathbf{u}')/\gamma' d^3\mathbf{u}', \quad (10a)$$

$$h_1 = -(1/8\pi) \int \sqrt{\tau^2 - 1} f(\mathbf{u}')/\gamma' d^3\mathbf{u}', \quad (10b)$$

$$h_2 = -(1/32\pi) \int (r \cosh^{-1} r - \sqrt{\tau^2 - 1}) f(\mathbf{u}')/\gamma' d^3\mathbf{u}', \quad (10c)$$

$$g_0 = -(1/4\pi) \int r(\tau^2 - 1)^{-1/2} f(\mathbf{u}')/\gamma' d^3\mathbf{u}', \quad (10d)$$

$$g_1 = -(1/8\pi) \int \cosh^{-1} r f(\mathbf{u}')/\gamma' d^3\mathbf{u}'. \quad (10e)$$

These potentials satisfy the differential equations

$$\begin{aligned} [L+1]h_0 &= f, & Lg_0 &= f, \\ [L-3]h_1 &= h_0, & Lg_1 &= g_0, \\ [L-3]h_2 &= h_1, \end{aligned} \quad (11)$$

Finally we may write \mathbf{D} and \mathbf{F} as

$$\mathbf{D}(\mathbf{u}) = -\gamma^{-1}\{\mathbf{L} + \mathbf{I} + \mathbf{u}\mathbf{u}\}h_1 + 4\gamma^{-1}\{\mathbf{L} - \mathbf{I} - \mathbf{u}\mathbf{u}\}h_2, \quad (12a)$$

$$\mathbf{F}(\mathbf{u}) = -\gamma^{-1}\mathbf{K}(g_0 - 2g_1). \quad (12b)$$

Equations (10-12) together with the definitions, Eqs. (8-9), provide the differential formulation in the relativistic case.

In order to proceed further analytically, it is useful to decompose the distribution function and the potentials in spherical harmonics, e.g.,

$$f(u, \theta, \phi) = \sum_{n=0}^{\infty} \sum_{m=-n}^n f_{nm}(u) P_n^m(\cos \theta) \exp(im\phi). \quad (13)$$

Here $u = |\mathbf{u}|$ (different from the convention used earlier), θ is the polar angle, and ϕ is the azimuthal angle. The equation $\{L - \alpha\}g = f$ is equivalent to the system of separated equations $[L_n - \alpha]g_{nm} = f_{nm}$, where

$$[L_n - \alpha]y = (1 + u^2) \frac{d^2 y}{du^2} + (2u^{-1} + 3u) \frac{dy}{du} - \left(\frac{n(n+1)}{u^2} + \alpha \right) y. \quad (14)$$

After the change of variable $x = \sinh^{-1} u$ and the change of unknown $z = (\sinh x)^{-n} y$, then the equation $\{L_n - \alpha\}y = w$ transforms to $[\mathcal{D}_n - a^2]z = (\sinh x)^{-n} w$, where $a^2 = \alpha + 1$ and

$$[\mathcal{D}_n - a^2]z = \frac{d^2 z}{dx^2} + 2(n+1)(\coth x) \frac{dz}{dx} + ((n+1)^2 - a^2)z. \quad (15)$$

The solution to the homogeneous equation $[\mathcal{D}_n - a^2]z = 0$ is required in order to construct a Green's function for the problem. To obtain this solution we note the following recurrence: If $z_{n-1,a}$ solves $[\mathcal{D}_{n-1} - a^2]z = 0$, then $z_{n,a} = (\sinh x)^{-1} (d/dx) z_{n-1,a}$ solves $[\mathcal{D}_n - a^2]z = 0$. Furthermore, for $n = -1$ the homogeneous equation is trivial to solve, giving $z_{-1,a} = C_1 \exp(ax) + C_2 \exp(-ax)$ (for $a \neq 0$), and $z_{-1,0} = C_1 x + C_2$, where C_1 and C_2 are integration constants. However, the recurrence breaks down in the case that a is an integer. If $a = n$, then $z_{n-1,a} = 1$ solves $[\mathcal{D}_{n-1} - a^2]z = 0$, and differentiation produces the null solution to $[\mathcal{D}_n - a^2]z = 0$. The recurrence must then be restarted from the general solution to $[\mathcal{D}_n - n^2]z = 0$, which is

$$z_{n,n} = (\sinh x)^{-2n-1} \left(C_1 + C_2 \int_0^x (\sinh x')^{2n} dx' \right).$$

The integral that occurs here can be expressed in closed form.

The Green's function allows us to reduce the separated ordinary differential equations to quadrature. An important special application for these results is in the treatment of collisions off an equilibrium background distribution. Assuming that f_b is a stationary Maxwellian with density n_b and temperature T_b and that the energy of the colliding particles greatly exceeds T_b , we obtain

$$D_{uu} = \Gamma_{ab} \frac{K_1 u_{ib}^2}{K_2 v^3} \left(1 - \frac{K_0 u_{ib}^2}{K_1 \gamma^2 c^2} \right),$$

$$D_{\theta\theta} = \Gamma_{ab} \frac{1}{2v} \left[1 - \frac{K_1}{K_2} \left(\frac{u_{ib}^2}{u^2} + \frac{u_{ib}^2}{\gamma^2 c^2} \right) + \frac{K_0 u_{ib}^2 u_{ib}^2}{K_2 u^2 \gamma^2 c^2} \right],$$

and $F_u = -(m_a v / T_b) D_{uu}$. (The other components of \mathbf{D} and \mathbf{F} vanish.) Here we have put the expressions for \mathcal{D} and \mathbf{F} into dimensional form as in Eqs. (2), K_n is the n th-order Bessel function of the second kind, the argument for the Bessel functions is $m_b c^2 / T_b$, $u_{ib}^2 = T_b / m_b$, and $\Gamma_{ab} = n_b q_a^2 q_b^2 \log \Lambda_{ab} / (4\pi \epsilon_0^2 m_a^2)$. The errors are exponentially small in u / u_{ib} .

To conclude, we have presented a differential formulation for the Beliaev and Budker² relativistic collision integral. This permits the rapid numerical evaluation of the collision integral. The decomposition into spherical harmonics allows the collision operator to be expressed in terms of one-dimensional integrals for simple background distributions. This is useful in carrying out analytical work. It also provides a convenient method for calculating the boundary conditions for the potentials.

We are grateful to N.J. Fisch for several enlightening discussions. This work was supported by DoE contract DE-AC02-76-CHO-3073.

¹L. D. Landau, *Phys. Z. Sowjet.* **10**, 154 (1936).

²S. I. Beliaev and G. I. Budker, *Sov. Phys. Doklady* **1**, 218 (1956).

³M. N. Rosenbluth, W. M. MacDonald, and D. L. Judd, *Phys. Rev.* **107**, 1 (1957).

⁴B. A. Trubnikov, *Sov. Phys. JETP* **7**, 926 (1958).

⁵M. R. Franz, "The Numerical Solution of the Relativistic Bounce-Averaged Fokker-Planck Equation for a Magnetically Confined Plasma," University of California Report UCRL-96510 (April, 1987), submitted to *J. Comput. Phys.*

⁶E. M. Lifshitz and L. P. Pitaevskii, *Physical Kinetics, Course of Theoretical Physics*, Vol. 10 (Pergamon, Oxford, 1981), Section 50.

EXTERNAL DISTRIBUTION IN ADDITION TO UC-20

Dr. Frank J. Paoloni, Univ of Wollongong, AUSTRALIA
 Prof. M.H. Brennan, Univ Sydney, AUSTRALIA
 Plasma Research Lab., Australian Nat. Univ., AUSTRALIA
 Prof. I.R. Jones, Flinders Univ., AUSTRALIA
 Prof. F. Cap, Inst Theo Phys, AUSTRIA
 Prof. M. Heindler, Institut für Theoretische Physik, AUSTRIA
 M. Goossens, Astronomisch Instituut, BELGIUM
 Ecole Royale Militaire, Lab de Phys Plasmas, BELGIUM
 Com. of European, Dg XII Fusion Prog, BELGIUM
 Prof. R. Boucique, Laboratorium voor Natuurkunde, BELGIUM
 Dr. P.M. Sakanaka, Univ Estadual, BRAZIL
 Instituto De Pesquisas Espaciais-INPE, BRAZIL
 Library, Atomic Energy of Canada Limited, CANADA
 Dr. M.P. Bachynski, MPB Technologies, Inc., CANADA
 Dr. H.M. Skarsgard, Univ of Saskatchewan, CANADA
 Dr. H. Barnard, University of British Columbia, CANADA
 Prof. J. Teichmann, Univ. of Montreal, CANADA
 Prof. S.R. Sreenivasan, University of Calgary, CANADA
 Prof. Tudor W. Johnston, INRS-Energie, CANADA
 Dr. C.R. James, Univ. of Alberta, CANADA
 Dr. Peter Lukac, Komenského Univ, CZECHOSLOVAKIA
 The Librarian, Culham Laboratory, ENGLAND
 Mrs. S.A. Hutchinson, JET Library, ENGLAND
 C. Mouttet, Lab. de Physique des Milieux Ionisés, FRANCE
 J. Radet, GEN/CADARACHE - Bat 506, FRANCE
 Dr. Tom Mui, Academy Bibliographic, HONG KONG
 Preprint Library, Cent Res Inst Phys, HUNGARY
 Dr. B. Dasgupta, Sahe Inst, INDIA
 Dr. R.K. Chhajlani, Vikram Univ, INDIA
 Dr. P. Kew, Institute for Plasma Research, INDIA
 Dr. Phillip Rosenau, Israel Inst Tech, ISRAEL
 Prof. S. Cuporman, Tel Aviv University, ISRAEL
 Librarian, Int'l Ctr Theo Phys, ITALY
 Prof. G. Rostagni, Univ Di Padova, ITALY
 Miss Ciella De Palo, Assoc EURATOM-ENEA, ITALY
 Biblioteca, del CNA EURATOM, ITALY
 Dr. H. Yamato, Toshiba Res & Dev, JAPAN
 Prof. I. Kawakami, Atomic Energy Res. Institute, JAPAN
 Prof. Kyoji Nishikawa, Univ of Hiroshima, JAPAN
 Direc. Dept. Lg. Tokamak Res. JAERI, JAPAN
 Prof. Satoshi Itoh, Kyushu University, JAPAN
 Research Info Center, Nagoya University, JAPAN
 Prof. S. Tanaka, Kyoto University, JAPAN
 Library, Kyoto University, JAPAN
 Prof. Nobuyuki Inoue, University of Tokyo, JAPAN
 S. Mori, JAERI, JAPAN
 M.H. Kim, Korea Advanced Energy Research Institute, KOREA
 Prof. D.-I. Choi, Adv. Inst Sci & Tech, KOREA
 Prof. B.S. Lilley, University of Waikato, NEW ZEALAND
 Institute of Plasma Physics, PEOPLE'S REPUBLIC OF CHINA
 Librarian, Institute of Phys., PEOPLE'S REPUBLIC OF CHINA
 Library, Tsing Hua University, PEOPLE'S REPUBLIC OF CHINA
 Z. Li, Southwest Inst. Physics, PEOPLE'S REPUBLIC OF CHINA
 Prof. J.A.C. Cabral, Inst Superior Tecn, PORTUGAL
 Dr. Octavian Petrus, AL I CUZA University, ROMANIA
 Dr. Johan de Villiers, Plasma Physics, AEC, SO AFRICA
 Prof. M.A. Heilberg, University of Natal, SO AFRICA
 Fusion Div. Library, JEN, SPAIN
 Dr. Lennart Stenflo, University of UMEA, SWEDEN
 Library, Royal Inst Tech, SWEDEN
 Prof. Hans Wilhelmson, Chalmers Univ Tech, SWEDEN
 Centre Phys des Plasmas, Ecole Polytech Fed, SWITZERLAND
 Bibliotheek, Fon-Inst Voor Plasma-Fysica, THE NETHERLANDS
 Dr. D.D. Ryutov, Siberian Acad Sci, USSR
 Dr. G.A. Eliseev, Kurchatov Institute, USSR
 Dr. V.A. Glukhikh, Inst Electro-Physical, USSR
 Dr. V.T. Toick, Inst. Phys. Tech. USSR
 Dr. L.M. Kovrizhnykh, Institute Gen. Physics, USSR
 Prof. T.J.M. Boyd, Univ College N Wales, WALES
 Nuclear Res. Establishment, Jülich Ltd., W. GERMANY
 Bibliothek, Inst. Für Plasmeforschung, W. GERMANY
 Dr. K. Schindler, Ruhr Universität, W. GERMANY
 ASDEX Reading Rm, IPP/Max-Planck-Institut für
 Plasmaphysik, W. GERMANY
 Librarian, Max-Planck Institut, W. GERMANY
 Prof. R.K. Janov, Inst Phys, YUGOSLAVIA