

Ronald Siegel and Ada Hirschman Reply

To the Editor:

We stated (Siegel and Hirschman, 1983, p. 196) that Ernesto Bozzano's first publication on the topic of deathbed visions was in 1906 in *Revue du Monde Invisible*. We also referred in passing to his publications between 1905 and 1910 in *Annals of Psychical Science*, which included the 1906 paper cited by Carlos Alvarado and Ian Stevenson. We thank them for pointing out the four-month difference in the 1906 papers. We agree it's a small point. Bozzano's continuing interest in deathbed visions from 1906 to 1923 was our larger point.

We referred parenthetically, and collectively, to *Luce e Ombre*, *La Revue Spirite*, and *La Revue Métapsychique* as spiritualist publications in the broadest sense of the word. In that spirit, we still do, despite the claim that contributors in *Métapsychique* were not as "committed" as those in *Spirite*.

We agree that Bozzano was influenced by Eusapia Palladino but we never stated they had sittings in the early 1890s, only that Bozzano was attracted to parapsychology and Palladino during the

early 1890s. Theodore Ribot's gift in 1891 of the *Annales des Sciences Psychiques* supports our estimate of these dates.

We did not state that British and American scholars were ignorant of the Italian and French language in which Bozzano's works appeared, and we did not state that such works were unread. We only stated that Bozzano had minimal influence on these scholars as reflected by the fact that few of his works were eventually translated into English, something we might expect to happen with truly influential works in any non-English language. In addition, we mentioned that Bozzano's papers in English were cited numerous times but the 1923 work in French and Italian was rarely noted. Since it was Bozzano's case examples that received the earlier attention, it is reasonable to expect that the addition of many new cases in the 1923 book would have attracted similar citations had it appeared in the *Annals of Psychical Science* or elsewhere in English, especially after getting some attention from Charles Richet.

We stated that Richet, in a letter to Bozzano, found that the survival theory was the most salient explanation of all the facts. The letter we referred to was the one published in *Luce e Ombra* in 1924. Our interpretation of Richet's position there is consistent with Gastone de Boni's interpretation of the 1935 letter. We also stated that Bozzano's arguments were far from compelling, and if Richet's opinion wavered, we are pleased.

REFERENCE

- Siegel, R. K., and Hirschman, A. E. Bozzano and the first classification of deathbed visions: a historical note and translation. *Anabiosis*, 1983, 3, 195-201.

Ronald K. Siegel
Ada E. Hirschman
Department of Psychiatry and Biobehavioral Sciences
School of Medicine
University of California, Los Angeles