RESILIENCE AMONG HIGH ACHIEVERS IN AN INSTRUMENTAL MUSIC PROGRAM

Benjamin J. Price, B.M.E

Thesis Prepared for the Degree of

MASTER OF MUSIC

UNIVERSITY OF NORTH TEXAS

December 2011

APPROVED:

Nathan Kruse, Major Professor
Donna Emmanuel, Committee Member
Debbie Rohwer, Committee Member
Debbie Rohwer, Chair of the Department of Music Education
James C. Scott, Dean of the College of Music
James D. Meernik, Acting Dean of the Toulouse Graduate School
Price, Benjamin J. Resilience among high achievers in an instrumental music program. Master of Music (Music Education), December 2011, 91 pp., references, 104 titles.

Positive adaptations experienced in spite of challenges faced is known as resilience. Comparatively little research has focused on in-depth descriptions regarding how resilience is manifested in children. The purpose of this study was to add to previous research in the identification of characteristics of resilience in students, and to determine the extent to which band membership has aided their resilience in other domains. Data was collected from a random sample of band seniors from the class of 2011 ($n = 3$) who attended a large high school in the South. Specific research questions were: (1) What characteristics of resilience are present in the talk of participants in a high school instrumental music program? (2) To what extent has this population perceived that membership in band aided their resilience in other domains? A descriptive study design was chosen that used qualitative data.

Following data analysis that included category matrices, prominent themes emerged from the participants’ responses. These included self-improvement, forward thinking, optimism, inner drive, increased achievement, determination, development of relationships to peers and adult mentors, and development of connectedness to the school. The findings of this study complemented previous research on characteristics of resilient students, and suggested that the participants derived positive benefits from group membership and from positively contributing to the school. Recommendations based on these findings for researchers included the need for resilience to be studied across other subject areas in school, and across different populations of students. Recommendations for teachers and administrators included varied opportunities for extra-curricular and co-curricular student engagement.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

**PROLOGUE** .............................................................................................................................................. 1

## Chapters

1. **INTRODUCTION** ......................................................................................................................... 3
   - Definitions of Resilience ............................................................................................................... 4
   - Resilience Research ....................................................................................................................... 5
   - Social Identity and Resilience ...................................................................................................... 7
   - Self-Categorization Theory as an Extension of Social Identity Theory ................................... 9
   - Need for the Study .......................................................................................................................... 10
   - Summary and Purpose .................................................................................................................. 11

2. **REVIEW OF RELATED LITERATURE** ......................................................................................... 13
   - Positive Adaptations Made By Groups ...................................................................................... 13
     - Social Creativity, Individual Mobility, and Social Competition ........................................... 13
     - Collectivism ............................................................................................................................... 15
   - Measures and Processes of Assessing Resilience ..................................................................... 16
     - In Psychology ............................................................................................................................ 16
     - As a Complex Idea ..................................................................................................................... 17
     - In Academic Settings ............................................................................................................... 18
   - A Theoretical Model of Resilience in Education ....................................................................... 19
   - Student-Centered Characteristics that Influence Resilience .................................................... 19
   - School-Centered Characteristics that Influence Resilience ...................................................... 21
   - Music’s Role in Schools ................................................................................................................. 23
   - Music’s Role in Resilience .......................................................................................................... 24
   - Summary ....................................................................................................................................... 25

3. **METHODOLOGY** ......................................................................................................................... 26
   - Design ........................................................................................................................................... 26
   - Participants ...................................................................................................................................... 27
   - Procedures and Data Collection ................................................................................................. 28
   - Question Development ............................................................................................................... 29
PROLOGUE

Most mornings, I arrived at the high school band hall’s back door at 7:30 a.m. As I walked slowly from my car to the door, I was always deep in thought about lessons for the day or how I was going to teach differently based on yesterday’s rehearsals. My wonderings would often switch, though, to thoughts about my students and how I could better build positive relationships or how I could reach out to them more. As I came closer to the door, my thoughts were interrupted. I was often greeted by students already waiting at the door. It was always predictable who I saw each morning and that they seemed to enjoy spending extra time in the band hall. Despite their obvious enthusiasm, I always wondered what they were really getting out of their band experience. Was it a purely social outlet for them? Or were they also enjoying becoming better musicians?

Once I opened the band hall so that students could come in to practice, I often listened to a mixture of long tones, scales with an occasional wrong note, excerpts from contest music, region music, and solos and ensembles through the office walls. I also watched their behavior through the office windows that looked out into the main band room. My musings never lasted too long at this hour; there were always interruptions. My colleagues and I would field a question from one of the students who was practicing. From time to time, someone needed a clarinet or saxophone reed. Some students just dropped by to say hi and chat, or take tape from the dispenser that was on my desk. I always enjoyed when they did that, and I never missed an opportunity to ask them how they were doing or what was going on with them. Those interactions would spur on further thoughts, much like I had when I first walked in the door, about what life was like for them. I had always prided myself on being a good listener, and I
always hoped that the students that would stop by appreciated the listening ear that I would lend them.

In the course of developing a positive rapport with my students, it became easy to see that some students were in the process of dealing with challenges. Some students were open about what was going on, while others were more introverted. Still other groups appeared to wear a persistent expression that looked as though they were constantly stressed, overloaded, and overwhelmed. I always wished that I could help them and relieve them of some of the burdens they appeared to have. Still, they managed to come to class, do their best, and give all that they had, despite whatever it was they were enduring in other parts of their lives. What was going on in them that they were able to do that? I found it admirable that they had the strength in their character to keep going. Did they see that the same way I did? What did they have in their skill-sets that others did not? What benefits were these particular students getting out of band? Was band helping them socially? Academically? These persistent questions kept spinning in my head throughout most days. What started out as a personal need to answer these questions turned into the discovery of an area of research that needed more personal accounts and perspectives: resilience.
CHAPTER 1
INTRODUCTION

Over the past few years in the United States, concerns for the well-being of school students have been the subject of much research, often focusing on conditions that create challenges with the potential of making success difficult (Kominski, Jamieson, & Martinez, 2001). Challenges and positive adaptations to those challenges can manifest themselves in many different ways among students. Whether the specific challenges are social, academic, or a combination of the two, many students succeed despite identification (either personal or by the school) or actual experience of challenges. The intersection of challenges and positive adaptations, known as resilience, is the cornerstone of this study. While research has been conducted in the field of general education, issues of resilience in the music classroom have not been explored. Because of unique characteristics found within the music setting, examining resilience among music students would add new insights into the field, informing not only music education practice, but general education as well. This study focuses specifically on a high school band program, and is an initial exploration into those persistent questions concerning my students’ challenges and success.

Because resilience has often been studied in terms of correlations and experiments, a need to explore how resilience is constructed and perceived through descriptive research exists. Before an understanding of resilience within the context of band classrooms can be realized, however, an examination of the literature surrounding resilience must be conducted. This examination includes discussions on resilience research, the identification of resilient individuals, and identity construction in individuals and groups as possible explanations for
resilient behavior and outcomes. The initial ideas explored in this chapter serve to frame the phenomenon I experienced with my own students for so many years.

Definitions of Resilience

Resilience can generally be defined as the degree to which individuals positively adapt to their settings, despite adversity. Throughout three decades of resilience research, there has been a slow-building agreement on definitions of key terms that define adversity and positive adaptations (O’Dougherty-Wright & Masten, 2005). O’Dougherty-Wright and Masten (2005) identified several terms and relevant definitions that will be used throughout this study:

Adversity – Environmental conditions that interfere or threaten the accomplishment of age-appropriate tasks

Compensatory factor – A measurable characteristic in a group of individuals that predicts general or specific positive outcomes

Cumulative protection – The presence of multiple protective factors in an individual’s life.

Cumulative risk – Increased risk due to (a) the presence of multiple risk factors; (b) multiple occurrences of the same risk factor; or (c) the accumulating effects of ongoing adversity

Distal risk – Risk arising from a child’s ecological context but mediated through more proximal processes

Resilience – A pattern of positive adaptation in the context of past or present adversity

Risk factor – A measurable characteristic in a group of individuals or their situation that predicts a negative outcome on a specific outcome criterion

Proximal risk – Risk factors experienced directly by the child
Protective factor – Quality of a person or context or their interaction that predicts better outcomes, particularly in situations of risk or adversity

Vulnerability – Individual susceptibility to undesirable outcomes (p. 19).

Resilience Research

As outlined above, resilience is associated with the positive adaptations that individuals make despite adversity. O’Doherty-Wright and Masten (2005) delineated the evolution of resilience research into three periods, each defined by certain characteristics and dates found in research: the first period (1970-1990) identified predictors, traits, and patterns of behavior among resilient individuals; the second period (1990-2000) focused on causal explanations for these predictors, patterns, and traits; and the third period (2000-present) emphasized developing intervention studies to eliminate risk. Anthony (1974) focused on the invulnerable children who appeared to be impervious to stress in the face of a negative situation, due to the remarkable nature of their character or personality. As research in this area grew, however, it became clear that stress-resistance and resilience were more appropriate terms, instead of invulnerable, because they reflected both the situation, or context, and the individual’s response to that context. The most resilient individuals from the end of this period were identified as such not only because they experienced positive outcomes such as high grades and low instances of misbehavior in school, but because they experienced these positive outcomes in the face of cumulative risk.

Haggerty and Rutter (1986) found that other trends in the first period of resilience research involved identifying correlations among several predictor and context-centered variables. The goal of this research that focused on correlations was primarily to establish what personality traits and characteristics resilient individuals had, or what they did that was different
in behavior from individuals who were not resilient (Haggerty et al., 1986; Garmezy, 1985; Masten, 2001). Predictor variables related to high resilience have included intelligence, high self-efficacy, and optimism. These emerged as three prominent, person-centered variables, while context-centered variables that contributed to high resilience included parental involvement, neighborhood quality, effective schools, children-centered policies, and a low tolerance of physical violence (Haggerty et al., 1986). Garmezy (1985) first noted a marked consistency in these correlates, and that this consistency was found across large samples, using contrasting methodologies, thus giving these correlates strength. Masten (2001) used the term short list to define these broad-based characteristics that the first wave of research identified as predictors contributing to high resilience.

In the second period of research (1990-2000), explanations for the aforementioned predictors focused on how resilience might be shaped through an individual’s development. The role of contextual situations and the integration of the individual’s development in these situations also were explored. In the first period of research, the resilient individual was being studied without any connection to his/her context. In the second period of research, there was a dynamic approach between the integration of the individual and his/her context. Theoretical and philosophical models also were developed that focused on why certain predictors only worked for some people in some situations, and to what extent these predictors actually mediated risk (O’Dougherty-Wright & Masten, 2005). Though the acknowledgement of context began in this period of research, studies still focused on correlations and experiments.

In the third period of research, which began in 2000, focus has shifted to intervention-based studies designed to prevent risk. The Seattle Social Development Project, FAST track, Head Start, and the Perry Preschool Project all have been programs designed out of the need to
mediate risk and promote success (O’Doughterty-Wright & Masten, 2005). A framework for policies and practices on resilience has been developed, which has been based on results of experimental studies designed to test resilience (O’Dougherty-Wright & Masten, 2005). Much of the current literature can be identified as belonging to either the second or third periods of resilience research (O’Dougherty-Wright & Masten, 2005). As in the second period of research, much of the third period literature is correlational or experimental in nature. As is common throughout all three periods of resilience research, few descriptive studies exist.

Social Identity and Resilience

Now that a history of resilience research and operational definitions of resilience have been discussed, it is necessary to examine literature surrounding social identity development and reference group theory so that there can be a deeper understanding of resilience from a social-psychological perspective. Shibutani (1955) defined a reference group as “that group whose outlook is used … as the frame of reference in the organization of [the individual’s] perceptual field” (p. 565). Therefore, the group functions both as a standard of comparison and as a normative source of attitudes and beliefs. Membership groups can be especially important kinds of reference groups, since the individual is a direct participant in that group and begins to internalize its norms. This internalization aids the individual in constructing the social world in which the individual lives.

Complementing Shibutani’s (1955) work on reference group theory is Tajfel’s, and Turner’s social identity theory (1982). According to Tajfel (1982), there are three components that make up social identity theory: social identity, social categorization, and social comparison. First, Tajfel (1982) defined social identity as, “that part of and individual’s self-concept which derives from his/her knowledge of his/her membership of a social group (or groups) together
with the value and emotional significance attached to that membership” (p. 63). Next, social categorization stems from the assumption that individuals seek out ways to categorize themselves into groups. These groups can be arbitrarily defined or can be defined using conventional social norms. Regardless of the definition of the group, individuals will tend to self-categorize; the groups that the individuals classify themselves into will, “segment, classify and order the social environment, and thus enable the individual to undertake many forms of social action. […] [Social categorization] also provides a place of self-reference” (Tajfel, 1982, pp. 15-16). Applied to a school setting, social categorization takes place as students categorize themselves into groups that they define, based on common characteristics. Music students, for example, are seen as a group but are further self-identified and identified by others as either band, choir, or orchestra students. Finally, social comparison derives from social categorization. As individuals group themselves, there is a natural tendency for them to compare their group (the in-group) to groups to which they do not belong (the out-groups) as being better or worse, similar or different (Tajfel, 1982).

Based on social identity, social categorization, and social comparison, social identity theory carries with it central assumptions and theoretical principles regarding the need for group membership, including how individuals become members of a group and how those groups are seen in the social environment. On these assumptions and principles, Tajfel and Turner (1986) claimed:

1. Individuals strive to maintain or enhance their self-esteem; they strive for a positive self-concept.

2. Social groups or categories and their membership carry positive or negative value connotations. Hence, social identity may be positive or negative according to the
evaluations (which tend to be socially consensual, either within or across groups) of those
groups that contribute to an individual’s social identity.

3. The evaluation of one’s own group is determined with reference to specific other
groups through social comparisons in terms of value-laden attributes and characteristics.
Positively discrepant comparisons between in-group and out-group produce high
prestige; negatively discrepant comparisons between in-group and out-group produce low
prestige. (p. 16)

and furthermore:

1. Individuals strive to achieve or to maintain positive social identity
2. Positive social identity is based to a large extent on favorable comparisons
that can be made between the in-group and some relevant out-groups: the in-group must
be perceived as positively differentiated or distinct from the relevant out-groups.
3. When social identity is unsatisfactory, individuals will strive to either leave their
existing group and join some more positively distinct group and/or to make their existing
group more positively distinct. (p. 16)

Self-Categorization Theory as an Extension of Social Identity Theory

Turner and Hogg (1987) proposed an extension of social identity theory known as self-
categorization theory. Based on the self-categorization component of social identity theory, the
authors stated that individuals categorize themselves and are perceived by others according to
common group characteristics. These degrees of categorization can range from broad levels to
specific levels of distinction. Since the focus of this theory is to explain group categorization
and individuals are perceived according to common group characteristics, unique individual
characteristics are minimized. Since self-categorization theory emphasizes the group’s common
characteristics, and social identity theory emphasizes the individual’s characteristics, these two theories can be used in combination for a more complete understanding of the individual’s role in the group. Furthermore, these theories have been used to examine resilience in children from a social perspective (Bottrell, 2009).

Bottrell (2009) argued that an understanding of social identity and other social-psychological components is critical to understanding resilience as a social construct. As such, resilience has evolved into being variable, as opposed to being an all-or-nothing characteristic (Bottrell, 2009; Masten, 1994). This social theory of resilience aligns closely with the second and third periods of resilience research. Based on normative models of group behavior, Bottrell (2009) qualitatively studied inner-city youth in Sydney in an effort to understand the social processes that contributed to their resilience. Bottrell discovered that how individuals conceptualize resilience could impact the programs and interventions that have been designed to mitigate risk and serve as protective factors.

Need for the Study

The research by Anthony (1974), Garmezy (1985), Haggerty and Rutter (1986), Masten (1994), O’Dougherty-Wright and Masten (2005) has mostly focused on examining resilience as a complex idea through correlations and experiments. Though this research has identified characteristics of resilience, protective factors that might mitigate an individual’s risk, and the extent to which certain interventions are effective as protective factors, what is missing from the literature available on resilience are examinations of individual construction and perception of resilience. These researchers have examined issues of resilience in education settings in the context of well-being, student success, group membership, identity construction, and other factors, little research has focused on the impact of music participation. Music settings are
places that operate differently from academic settings because of several factors, some of which are informal learning, the role of creativity and self-expression, and outcomes that center on personal, artistic, and socio-cultural elements. Because of these and other factors, the music classroom provides a unique vantage point into how students might make positive adaptations to adversity. The findings from this study would assist music educators in being more aware of how resilience operates so that they might provide more explicit opportunities for resilience to flourish. The findings might also add to the relevant advocacy information about the positive benefits of music participation. These findings might also inform the area of general education which has not often looked at such characteristics that are found in music settings, including informal learning, creativity, and artistry. The findings would also contribute to topics relevant for future research concerning music participation and the development of resilience. Additionally, this study uses a qualitative research design in an effort to complement extant research by illustrating how resilience works in one music program.

Summary and Purpose

A foundational understanding of resilience definitions, trends in resilience research, social identity theory definitions, and the intersection of social identity and resilience have been discussed here in order to provide a theoretical background for this study. Also discussed in this chapter was self-categorization theory as an extension of social identity theory, as well as Bottrell’s (2009) work in developing a social theory of resilience. Finally, the need for the study was outlined, specifically noting the absence of resilience research in music.

The purpose of this descriptive study that uses qualitative data is to explore how resilience is exhibited in a high school instrumental music program and will specifically answer these questions: (1) What characteristics of resilience are present in the talk of participants in a
high school instrumental music program? (2) To what extent has this population perceived that membership in band aided their resilience in other domains?

Before an investigation of resilience can be carried out, however, it is necessary to conduct a review of related literature. Chapter 2 discusses resilient youth not only as a group who are in need of further study, but whose behaviors, characteristics, and traits can be seen as applications of the definitions and theories that have been discussed in this chapter. The processes and strategies of identifying resilient youth is examined, as will a theoretical model of resilience in education. In addition, coping strategies that individuals use when group membership is not satisfactory is discussed through the resilience perspective. The next chapter also outlines the trend for resilience to be utilized as a phenomenon to explain atypical behavior in individuals. The material presented in this chapter, combined with the material presented in Chapter 2, ultimately provides a theoretical framework around which this study takes place.
CHAPTER 2

REVIEW OF RELATED LITERATURE

School is often a child’s first introduction into the social world outside of the family. As group membership is formed among students at early ages, group hierarchies are established based on perceived group status. Groups in schools can be drawn along lines, such as race, ethnicity, interest, talent, or any other category that distinguishes one group from another (Eccles, Stone, Barber, & Hunt, 2003). When group membership is not satisfactory, individuals frequently learn to adapt positively, which can be viewed as resilient behavior. In the previous chapter, definitions and concepts of resilience and identity were discussed; this chapter focuses on specific aspects of resilience. Since many characteristics might influence resilient behavior, and since many circumstances can be perceived as adverse, this chapter examines the literature surrounding factors influencing resilience in youth, resilient experiences, and measurement of resilient behavior. First, the positive adaptations that individuals make within a group are discussed as one of the many possible applications of resilience. Next, a discussion of measures and processes that are used to assess resilience is presented, followed by a theoretical model of resilience in education, student-centered characteristics, and school-centered characteristics that can influence resilience. Lastly, music’s role in schools and music’s role in resilience is outlined in order to provide a specific context around which this study will take place.

Positive Adaptations Made by Groups

Social creativity, individual mobility, and social competition. O’Dougherty-Wright and Masten (2005) defined resilience as “a pattern of positive adaptation in the context of past or present adversity” (p. 16). Tajfel’s social identity theory (1982) assumed that when social identity is not satisfactory, individuals will either leave a group or positively adapt (Tajfel &
Turner, 1986). Tajfel and Turner (1986) and Turner and Brown (1978) identified coping strategies in further support of this assumption. These coping strategies included individual mobility, which is leaving or distancing from the group in some way; social creativity, which involves making new comparisons between groups or changing the attributes of the group; and social competition, or competition directed between two groups. Regardless of the specific behaviors displayed, social creativity, individual mobility, and social competition all appear in some manifestation when individuals want to change their in-group status for a status they perceive as being more positive or higher. Similarly, Merton (1957) discussed mobility as a dynamic process that individuals use when they want to change reference groups. Merton (1957) stated that when individuals want to change groups, they will adopt the values, beliefs, and attitudes of the group to which they want to belong. Referring to this behavior as anticipatory socialization, Merton viewed this conduct as helpful to individuals by easing their transition between groups and making social acceptance easier. These social adaptations that individuals make can be seen as resilient adaptations.

Shinnar (2008), Kaufman (2003), Galen (2003), and Aries and Sader (2007) identified social creativity and individual mobility as two means of either changing status into a higher group or positively adapting in a low-status group, though each study used different populations. While Shinnar (2008) worked with Mexican immigrants, Galen (2003) sampled primarily Caucasian students, and Kaufman (2003) and Aries and Seider (2007) sampled an ethnically diverse group of students. Regardless of the samples’ ethnicities, the social creativity behaviors found by the researchers focused on searching for new and favorable characteristics of the in-group, positively interpreting characteristics of the in-group, and searching for other lower-status groups with which to compare the in-group. The individual mobility behaviors predominantly
involved stereotype distancing and physical distancing, as individuals either left the group or differentiated themselves from the group in some meaningful way. Kaufman (2003) also noted that social mobility is especially difficult because of the variety of situations and contexts an individual might encounter. In other words, what might lead to a change of group for one person might not necessarily lead to a change of group for another member of the group.

Collectivism. Collectivism is a unique characteristic found within certain groups and is defined as an individual’s interest in seeing the group succeed or advance. It is usually characterized by a sense of shared responsibility between the individual and the group (Allen & Bagozzi, 2001; Boen & Vanbeselaere, 2001, Carson, 2009; Taylor & Moghaddam, 1994; Triandis, Bontempo, Villareal, Asai, & Lucca, 1988). In particular, collectivism has been studied in Hispanic, Asian American, and African American cultures as a component of racial identity (Belda, 1999; Breton, 2007; Caldwell, 1998; Carson, 2009; Choiu, 2001; Cohen & Garcia, 2005) and has been paired with individualism. Synonymous with aspects of social mobility, individualism is the tendency of individuals to seek out higher-status groups by leaving the lower-status groups behind (Coon & Kemmelmeier, 2001; Raeff, Greenfield & Quiroz, 2000; Wink, 1997).

Research has been inconclusive regarding which ethnic groups are the most collectivistic. Coon and Kemmelmeier (2001) found that Asian Americans and African Americans scored higher on collectivism than Hispanic Americans, while Chae (2000) found that Latino and African Americans scored higher in comparison to Asian Americans and Caucasians. In yet another finding, Gabreyna and Barba (1987) discovered that Hispanics did not display a high degree of collectivism when asked to collaborate with strangers, while Caucasians did. Every group in each of the studies displayed characteristics of collectivism. The differences among the
studies focused on frequency of behaviors that characterized collectivism, or the degree of collectivism displayed.

Collectivism also has been studied as a component of interpersonal relationships. Raeff, Greenfield, and Quiroz (2000) surveyed Latino students and parents who attended an urban public school, and Caucasian students and parents who attended a private university-affiliated school. They also surveyed the teachers at both schools to test all of the groups’ levels of collectivism, based on open-ended responses to scenario-based questions about hypothetical interpersonal situations. As the authors predicted, the Latino students and parents displayed behaviors indicating a higher level of collectivism in areas relating to helping peers in need and division of labor than either their Caucasian counterparts or their teachers. Since there was no significant difference in the levels of collectivism displayed by either group of teachers based on their responses to the same questions, the need to study this variance between collectivistic behaviors of Latino students and parents and individualistic behaviors of their teachers emerged. This particular characteristic of collectivism also can be an extension of the positive adaptations individuals make within a group to see their group succeed in the face of challenges, which can further be classified as resilient behavior.

Measures and Processes of Assessing Resilience

In psychology. Measurement instruments commonly found in psychology have been used as a vehicle to assess risk, levels of functioning, achievement, and degrees of psychological well-being, which in turn can be analyzed in terms of resilience across a wide variety of disciplines. The Minnesota Multiphasic Personality Inventory-Adolescents Instrument (MMPI-A) (2006) has been used to assess the self-concept of adolescents. Blankenbuehler (2007) explained that participants who scored high on the MMPI-A also faced risk factors in terms of
resilience. Similarly, Carbonell, Reinherz, and Giaconia (1998) used the Youth Self Report (Achenbach, 1991), the Rosenberg Self-Esteem Scale (Rosenberg, 1986), the Piers-Harris Childrens’ Self-Concept Scale (Piers, 1984), and the Interpersonal Problems Scale (Reinherz, Giaconia, Lefkowitz, Pakiz & Frost, 1993) to assess and examine a variety of constructs. These researchers explained their findings in terms of resilience as a psychological phenomenon. Still other instruments, such as the Locus of Internal Control Scale for Children (Nowicki & Strickland, 1973) and the Self-Description Questionnaire I (Marsh & Holmes, 1990) have been used to assess an individual’s risk in the dimensions particular to the questionnaires. The subsequent positive adaptations an individual makes, despite high scores on the questionnaires, have been explained in terms of resilience (Hand, 2004; Morgan, 1999; Place, Reynolds, Cousins, & O’Neill, 2002; Schwartz, 2003). Regardless of the instrument used or the specific resilient outcome surveyed, these instruments have been useful in establishing the foundation of identifying resilient individuals in psychological settings.

As a complex idea. Few measurement instruments exist that measure resilience as a complex idea. Students with the highest degree of cumulative risk or adversity, but who display the most positive adaptations can be deemed highly resilient. Thus, these students are further outliers than individuals who do not work to make positive adaptations despite the same amount of cumulative risk or adversity. The degree to which resilience is present is often used as a scale of measurement in resilience research, which assesses the distance resilient individuals have traveled in their adaptations to their adversity (Morales, 2008). Among the instruments used to measure resilience across a wide variety of disciplines, including the general population, psychology, and medical sciences, is the Connor-Davidson Resilience Scale (2003), which assesses the degree of resilience across domains of biological, psychological, and sociological
factors (Campbell-Sills & Stein, 2007; Connor & Davidson, 2003). Though the original instrument of Connor and Davidson (2003) contained 25 questions and measured multiple domains of resilience, Campbell-Sills and Stein (2007) contend that only 10 questions from this scale are needed. Based on low internal consistency across two of the three domains of the original scale (.45 and .65), Campbell-Sills and Stein proposed that measuring only one domain using 10 questions might yield similar results as the original scale that measured multiple domains with internal consistency problems. The internal consistency of the new 10-item questionnaire was .85, which was calculated using Cronbach’s alpha. Regardless of the original 25-question instrument, the 10-question shortened version of the original instrument the Connor-Davidson Resilience Scale remains one of the few instruments that specifically measures resilience, as opposed to psychological instruments that explain the results of risk in terms of resilience.

In academic settings. The process of measuring academic resilience is similar to the process found in psychology. Tests are administered that assess psychological risk factors, and content knowledge tests have been given to groups of students in math, reading, and science. The results from students who score high on both the subject test and who experience risk are explained in terms of academic resilience (Capella & Weinsetin, 2001; McTigue & Washburn, 2009; Obradovic, Long, Cutuli, Chi-Keung, Hinz, Heistad & Masten, 2009; Southerland, 2005).

Studies exploring academic resilience do exist and explain the process of resilience quantitatively and descriptively; however, these studies have been specific to African American groups (Gale, 1996; Phillips, 1996). More of these studies are needed across not only racial and ethnic lines, but across academic disciplines as well so that a deeper understanding of academic resilience can be garnered.
A Theoretical Model of Resilience in Education

Research has identified several factors that can influence academic resilience. However, there are few models that explain how resilience works in school settings. Drawing on the paucity of these models, Morales’ (2000, 2008a, 2008b) extensive research has led to a theoretical model of how academic resilience may work with students. In the Resilience Cycle, Morales (2008a) identified a “hub of emotional intelligence, from which spokes of identifying needs, acquiring protective factors, protective factors working together, self-efficacy building, and enduring motivation function together” (p. 24). Though Morales’ work has centered on populations attending college as opposed to P-12 schools, he applied this model to Dominican American students, as well as Hispanic, African American, and other minority ethnic and racial groups. Morales (2000, 2008b) drew on individual narratives to illustrate the Resilience Cycle in practice. As a model that explains the resilience idea in higher education, validation of this model has yet to be conducted. Additionally, developing models that illustrate the process of resilience could be an initial step in applying Morales’ theories to other educational settings. First, however, a greater understanding of the process of resilience in education is needed so that models can be built.

Student-Centered Characteristics that Influence Resilience

Since resilience has been described and identified in a variety of disciplines, such as psychology, sociology, medicine, and education, the placement of resilient individuals in their proper contexts becomes critically important due to the specific ways in which adversity, positive adaptation, and protective factors leading to resilience can intersect (Shilling, 2007). In schools, positive student-centered adaptations can be measured by grade point average as well as the degree to which social bonds are formed among peers (Garmezy, Masten, & Tellegen, 1984;
Garmezy, 1991). These methods of assessing positive adaptations are essential in establishing a proper context to identify resilient individuals in schools.

Gonzalez and Padilla (1997), Finn and Rock (1997), Borman and Rachuba (2001), and Borman and Overman (2004) all worked with diverse samples, but found consistent results in identifying characteristics that may contribute to resilience. In addition to levels of high academic engagement, the researchers concluded that an internal locus of control and positive outlook toward school and the self were important correlates of resilience in these studies. Furthermore, Martin (2002) and Alfaro, Umana-Taylor, Gonzales-Backen, Bamaca, and Zeiders (2009) argued that individual motivation alone could influence high academic achievement in students. Additionally, Carspecken and Cordeiro (1991), Gelfand (1999) and Perez, Espinoza, LeCroy and Krysik (2008), and Ramos, Coronado, and Cortes (2009), and Ruiz (2009) found that extensive networks of parental support, friendship support, and extracurricular activity participation can act as protective factors in Hispanic populations. Connectedness, a feeling of belonging to the school’s environment, also has emerged as an important correlate to achievement; researchers have found that high achievers within a school tended to feel as though they were integral parts of the environment, regardless of their race or ethnicity (Bond, Butler, Thomas, Carlin, Glover, Bowes, & Patton, 2007; Gonzalez & Padilla, 1997; Rowe & Stewart, 2009). In addition to positive academic outcomes, Bond et al. (2007) found that as participants scored higher on a measure of social and school connectedness, fewer instances of negative outcomes, such as smoking, drug abuse, and drinking, as well as depressive or anxious symptoms were reported. The research conducted by Bond et al. (2007) has focused on identifying non-intellectual protective factors and correlating specific protective factors to academic achievement, rather than comparing protective factors to each other to test levels of
effectiveness. In contrast, Ford, Kokjie and Lewis (1996) found that only an individual’s emotional intelligence quotient (EQ) was a statistically significant predictor variable in determining academic resilience in African Americans. Nevertheless, the specifics of how these protective factors work in academic settings remain uncertain.

Conduct in schools also can be a measure of social competence. Those students with few instances of misconduct can be seen as highly socially competent. The more social competence displayed in situations where more adversity is encountered, the more resilient the student. Masten, Hubbard, Gest, Tellegen, Garmezy, and Ramirez (1999) found that above-average intelligence and high levels of parental support served as statistically significant predictors of proper school conduct when analyzed together regardless of stage of childhood development. Furthermore, having a high IQ alone served as a statistically significant predictor of social competence in childhood, but in adolescence, having a high IQ was not statistically significant. These findings suggest that certain protective factors and predictors of protective factors might have different levels of effectiveness according to stage of development and context, thus further underscoring the need for developing models that explain how protective factors work in various settings with various populations.

School-Centered Characteristics that Influence Resilience

School-centered characteristics that can influence resilience also have been identified, which primarily center around positive relationship development to adults and peers, and engagement in extra-curricular activities that serve as one of many possible ways through which increased social competence can be developed. Schools can serve as an environment where healthy relationships develop between teachers and students, as well as places where intervention programs are designed and implemented to decrease the amount of risk or to serve as protective
factors to mitigate risk (Bernard, 1993; Brooks, 2006; Downey, 2008; McGlyn & Lawson, 2007; Morrison & Allen, 2007). Additionally, school counselors’ roles in the resilience process have been explored, as the implementation of resilience-based intervention programs often starts with them (Masten, Herbers, Cutuli & Lafavor, 2008; Sink & Edwards, 2008). The fostering of emotional intelligence in students also has emerged as an important correlate in identifying schools with resilient student bodies (Connor & Slear, 2009). These schools also tend to have a broad range of support systems in place designed to give students opportunities to develop caring relationships with adults and other students and to participate and contribute positively to the overall environment of the school (Bernard, 1993; Henderson & Milstein, 2003). However, research is unclear about how these opportunities are specifically manifested in students.

The opportunity that students have to engage in extracurricular activities can be an extension of the many support systems schools have that are designed to teach students the skills they need to achieve greater degrees of social competence (Runco, Osaka, & Hwang, 1987; Blomfield & Barber, 2009; Call, 1974; Tiet, Huizinga, & Byrnes, 2010). Peck, Roeser, Zarrett, and Eccles (2008) surveyed the quality and quantity of extracurricular experiences on an educationally resilient population that consisted of high school students, and found that not only did the amount of extracurricular activities in which students were involved have a significant positive relationship to educational resilience and social competence, but that the quality of those experiences influenced their overall resilience as well. This finding suggests that extracurricular activities can afford youth with unique opportunities to engage in venues that might aid in fostering their social, emotional, and intellectual development. One type of extracurricular activity present in many schools is some kind of music program. These programs might also be
held within the school day, and because of their unique characteristics an exploration of the role
of music programs in schools is necessary.

Music’s Role in Schools

Music organizations in schools have functioned both as extracurricular activities and co-
curricular activities (Elliott, 1995; Reimer, 2003). As an academic discipline, music classes are
taken during the school day, where the subject matter is learned. Performances are usually held
outside the normal school day and often serve as an application of the skills learned during the
instructional day. Hargreaves, Marshall, and North (2003) noted that the assessment of music’s
importance in schools is outcome-based and typically centers on broad-based personal, artistic,
and socio-cultural outcomes, which include increased academic achievement, increased
creativity, increased music literacy, performances, character development, and an increased
development in interpersonal skills.

Folkestad (2005, 2006) identified four main dimensions that distinguish formal and
informal music learning: (1) the situation in which learning occurs, (2) the learning style
(learning music by ear, or by formal means), (3) ownership of the activity (teaching versus self-
directed music-making), and (4) intentionality (music-making as a performance versus music-
making as a pedagogical activity). Though music learning can take place in informal contexts
through oral traditions, music in Western culture is learned primarily in formal contexts through
written traditions, as found in schools or conservatories, where teachers and curricula determine
what students are taught (North & Hargreaves, 2008). Within the formal context of music
learning, the conservatory model tends to dominate the field of music teaching. Because most
music teachers have a background in Western classical music and were taught under the
conservatory model, the cycle can be self-perpetuating (North & Hargreaves, 2008; York, 2001).
However, York (2001) observed a difference between the music knowledge of students and teachers, suggesting that the musical background teachers bring to the classroom might be different than the musical background of their students. As a result, formal music curricula may not be adequately reaching all students, which may impact the extent to which music is a protective factor in schools.

Music’s Role in Resilience

Protective factors that might foster resilience through increased academic and social competence have been found in music education and in music’s role in students’ lives. Though Shehan-Campbell, Connell, and Beegle (2007) did not house their conclusions under the premise of resilience, they noted that music and music participation have emotional benefits, life benefits, and social benefits among a wide population of students. Dillon (2006) studied music-making in a primary school and in two high schools, where a large percentage of the population was economically and socially challenged. The researcher identified several protective characteristics from music making that can be transferred to other domains, which include: (1) opportunities for creative engagement, (2) promoting self-motivating behavior, (3) interacting with the community, (4) being culturally inclusive, and (5) exhibiting a positive relationship between analytical and intuitive knowledge (Dillon, 2006). Sells and Shepard (1998) cited music participation as one of several varied school-centered protective factors that might aid in developing resilience in special education populations. Meanwhile, Shaffer, Coffino, Boelcke-Stennes, and Masten (2007) profiled girls who grew up in an urban environment and chronicled their development over 20 years. Music participation emerged as one of many protective factors that aided the social and emotional competence in a portion of this population, as well. Though the Shaffer et al. (2007), Sells and Shepard (1998), and Dillon (2006) studies took place in
different settings, music participation emerged as one of many possible protective factors in the fostering of resilience.

While most of these studies were not explicitly framed within resilience theory, there are multiple connections between the factors identified and those associated with resilience. This further indicates the need for this study, focusing specifically on characteristics of resilience identified in the talk of the participants.

Summary

Research trends in group membership, psychology, and education have focused on assessing large groups of individuals through multiple instruments and noting the relationships across the responses. Often, these results were explained in terms of theories, such as social identity theory and reference group theory, or as a phenomenon, like resilience. Student-centered characteristics, including academic achievement and social competence, and school-centered protective factors, such as the fostering of emotional intelligence in students, have been discussed in this chapter as characteristics that can influence resilience. There is certainly a need for the development of additional models that demonstrate how resilience works and can be fostered. However, before additional models and instruments that assess resilience in schools can be developed, more data collection is needed to determine how resilience works in students. Additionally, studies that explore and describe how school-centered protective factors in music classes manifest themselves in students might add to the body of resilience research. In the context of this study, it is apparent there needs to be more in-depth exploration of how factors of resilience operate at the individual level.
CHAPTER 3

METHODOLOGY

In the first chapter, definitions of resilience and social identity theory were presented in order to provide a theoretical background to the present study. In the second chapter, research trends in psychology and education pertaining to resilience were discussed in order to provide an overview of how resilience is thought of in those disciplines. As explained in that chapter, research has focused on identifying characteristics, traits, and behaviors of resilient individuals. Research also has used measurement instruments to describe individuals who experience adversity and those who make positive adaptations. Also discussed were the limited number of studies that have explored music’s specific role as a protective factor in fostering resilience. In this chapter, the design of the study is outlined along with a description of both the school setting and the research participants.

Design

This study employed a descriptive study design using qualitative data (Stake, 1995; Yin, 1989). While it is impossible to produce generalizable results from examining only a few cases, these cases are studied in depth, because:

[The] real business of case study is particularization, not generalization. We take a particular case and come to know it well, not primarily as to how it is different from others but what it is, what it does. There is emphasis on uniqueness, and that implies knowledge of others that the case is different from, but the first emphasis is on understanding the case itself. (Stake, p. 8)

This study included a semi-structured interview with three (3) participants who are discussed below.
This descriptive study that used qualitative data explored how resilience worked in one instrumental music program. An additional aim of this research was to allow the participants’ voices to speak to a variety of factors that they perceived contributed to resilience in their specific population. This study explored the following questions:

1) What characteristics of resilience are present in the talk of participants in a high school instrumental music program?

2) To what extent has this population perceived that membership in band aided their resilience in other domains?

Participants

The three participants in this study were all 18 year-old seniors who graduated with the class of 2011 and who maintained membership in the same band for all four of their high school years. The participants also maintained membership in the same middle school band for the three years prior to joining the high school band. In all, each participant was involved in band for seven years. Two students were male; one was a Hispanic male clarinet player, and one was a White male trumpet player. One student was a Hispanic female flute player. A contextual description of the participants is listed at the end of this chapter.

The population from which the three participants were randomly selected was a high school with a total enrollment of 2,384 that was situated in an urban area. Out of the 2,384 total students enrolled at the high school, the band was composed of 236 students (33 of which were seniors) and was the largest student organization on campus. As part of the participant selection process, I followed the criteria the school district used to identify students who were considered “at-risk.” These factors included social challenges, such as a disciplinary placement to an alternative campus, and economic challenges, such as being homeless or highly mobile. Specific
criterion used to identify academic challenges included being in danger of failing classes (by receiving a failing grade in at least two of three marking periods during the semester), failing one or more classes for the semester, falling behind in credits needed to matriculate, or having failed state standardized tests. To examine the possible impact of band experience on factors of resilience, I focused on those students who had been band members for all four years of high school and who were considered “at-risk” according to the school guidelines mentioned above. Despite fitting at least one criterion on the above list, these students demonstrated high musical achievement and retained high overall grade-point averages.

Procedures and Data Collection

Nineteen interview questions were used for the current study. The questions were designed based on a review of similar instruments used to conduct descriptive research of this nature (Averna, 1999; Davis, 2008; Fitzgerald, 2009; Janesick, 2004; Morales, 2008; Shehan-Campbell et al., 2007). The interview questions contained an even balance of questions designed to ascertain the characteristics of resilience present in the participants’ talk (Question 1), and to explore the extent to which band membership has aided resilience in other domains (Question 2). Nine open-ended questions addressed research question one and nine open-ended questions addressed research question two. Types of interview questions related to Question 1 included asking the participants “What does adversity mean to you?”, “How have you responded to adversity in your life?”, and “What does the quality of being adaptive mean to you?” Types of interview questions related to Question 2 included asking the participants, “What rewards have you received from being in band?”, “What relationships, if any, do you see between band membership and other areas of your life?”, and “How should schools assist a diverse student body in meeting academic or social success? In other words, how can schools help students
belong?” Additionally, a final question asking for other information that the participants would like to add was placed at the end of the interview.

During the main study, which took place during the participants’ last two weeks in high school, each informant participated in a single interview with me in the high school band room. The time the participants spent in the semi-structured interview with me ranged from 29 to 48 minutes. During this time, the participants described their high school experiences, their band experiences, their perceived personality qualities, and the perceived social, academic, and musical challenges they faced during their development as a student. While I endeavored to capture the salient features of the participants’ perceptions, I realized that generalizations transferred to other settings were not appropriate.

All participant interviews were recorded using the computer program Audacity. The interviews were then self-transcribed using Microsoft Word 2007 and stored on a Dell 2305 desktop computer and a Hewlett-Packard 6530b laptop computer. In addition, each of the participants was assigned a pseudonym in order to protect their anonymity. All data pertaining to each participant were stored on both computers according to pseudonym.

Question Development

Originally, 18 questions were sent to professors in psychology and teacher education who had an active interest in resilience research, so they could provide their opinions on the appropriateness and clarity of the proposed interview questions. After two attempts to contact two non-responders, additional professors, psychologists, and a doctoral student with relevant research interests were asked for their opinions. Additional attempts were made to elicit responses, but only two reviewers provided feedback. Based on the suggestion of one peer reviewer, an additional question was added. Some questions were revised for clarity and
ambiguous wording. Next, high school student volunteers who closely resembled the participants were asked to evaluate the questions to determine whether the items were confusing, unclear, or too personal to be answered accurately. The volunteers provided valuable comments concerning the clarity of a few questions. Further revisions that eliminated more ambiguous wording and vague meanings were made as a result of the volunteers’ feedback, and the final list of semi-structured interview prompts, which contained 19 open-ended questions designed to facilitate a conversation (see Appendix A), were prepared for the pilot study.

I followed all proper protocols for submitting the application, interview questions, introductory questionnaire, and informed consent documents to the University of North Texas Institutional Review Board. Once the IRB approved the study, data collection began. A pilot study was subsequently conducted with two participants from the same high school band, but not associated with the main study so that further feedback regarding the interview questions could be garnered. The pilot study also allowed me to practice responding to participants and allowed me to practice analyzing data. The lessons learned from the pilot study with respect to the process of data collection and analysis ultimately informed the main study.

Trustworthiness

Trustworthiness was maintained during data analysis by implementing member checks and peer review. Member checks were useful in allowing the participants the opportunity to clarify wording and provide interpretations of their responses. This method of ensuring the accurate documentation of the participants’ own voices also strengthened consistency. Once the participants confirmed that their opinions, stories, and perceptions had been accurately captured in the transcripts (see Appendix B), the analyzed and coded interview data were arranged into themes using category matrices (Miles & Huberman, 1994).
Peer review was used to ensure consistency in the interpretation of the data. The coded transcript data and themes (see Appendix C and Appendix D) were sent to music education professors and doctoral students in music education who had extensive qualitative research experience, but who had no connection with the school or participants. The peer reviewers were asked for their input on themes for the data, as well as their thoughts and suggestions for presentation of the results. Based on their feedback, which included suggestions for alternate theme titles and code placements, revisions were made to adjust theme titles and to reassign codes to other sections (see Appendix E). This added another layer of rigor to support accurate interpretation of the data, as the peer reviewers were neutral parties who helped account for researcher bias.

Trustworthiness also can be increased through participants’ honest responses to interview questions. Knox and Burkard (2009) noted that a long-term, established, positive relationship with the interview participants is the single most important factor in establishing high levels of trustworthiness in data collection of this nature. Because I had already established a positive teacher-student relationship with the participants, it was logical to assume that their responses would be accurate and detailed.

It should also be noted that since the three participants in this study were my students for four years, this might have influenced how questions were asked, formulated, or interpreted. The interview questions might have been perceived as being of a sensitive nature, so the safety and comfort level that the participants had with me could have influenced their responses as well. I was also the data collector and interpreter in this study, so my interpretations of the results might not have been the way a third party would have interpreted them. Being immersed in the setting also allowed me to glean aspects unique to the setting itself, and has spurred on my interest in
these students’ resilience. Though I relied on other forms of trustworthiness to guide responsible interpretation of the data, including the maintenance of a field log to alert me to any bias not previously detected, my prior knowledge of the setting, behavior, and beliefs of these participants, including findings from the pilot study, might have influenced the way I deciphered the data.

In addition to the semi-structured interview, five demographic questions were asked, and observations and participant-observations were used to supplement the basic demographic introductory information about the participants in order to introduce them before the results of their responses to the interview questions were presented. Asking non-invasive questions about the participants’ age, instrument played, the number of years they had been in band, and the band-related awards and honors they received allowed for a deeper appreciation of their responses and demographic context.

Introduction to the Setting

Before the participant introductions, an accurate description of the school setting of which these students have been a part is essential so that their responses can be placed in the proper context. Based on 2010-2011 Texas Education Agency statistics, this large, urban high school in the Dallas-Fort Worth was a comprehensive school that contained grades 9-12, 170 full-time teachers, 19 instructional aides, 13 professional support staff, 5 counselors, 5 vice-principals, and 1 principal. Classified as a 5A high school, which is the classification that houses the largest group of high schools in Texas, this school has been rated Academically Acceptable by the Texas Education Agency for the 2010-2011 school year, based on previous years’ performance on the Texas Assessment of Knowledge and Skills. In this high school, there is an ethnic and racial distribution of 64% Hispanic, 22% Caucasian, 8% African American, 5%
Asian, and 1% Native American. In addition, 1,475 of the students at this high school have been identified as At-Risk which accounts for 61% of the school population (Texas Education Agency, 2011).

This band had three primary full-time directors, one of which was myself, and also one part-time color-guard instructor. During the fall semester, there was one marching band, which comprised its membership from the total enrollment in the band program. Also, during the fall semester there was one concert band that accommodated students unable to be in marching band. During the spring semester, there were three auditioned concert bands that were grouped based on ability.

Introduction to the Participants

Cesar. Cesar served as one of the informants. During his tenure in the high school band, Cesar distinguished himself as a leader and an exceptional musician, despite identifying certain academic challenges and family turmoil. He served as drum major during his senior year, and was first chair during his sophomore, junior, and senior years. Additionally, Cesar earned chairs in the District Honor Band during his time as a high school musician. His dedication to the band for exceptional playing and leadership also earned him two nationally-sponsored band awards that are given out by school band programs. He won the Semper Fi award, sponsored by the Army, and awarded based on nomination by band directors, Cesar also received the John Phillip Sousa award, which is sponsored by The Instrumentalist, and voted on by his peers. When his name was announced as the recipient of these prestigious awards at the spring concert, the other students applauded enthusiastically, while Cesar stood up, buttoned his suit jacket, and calmly and professionally walked up to the podium to accept the two highest awards given in the band program. His peers also voted him Band Beau, which was the award given to the most popular
student in the band. Often seen in the band hall before and after school, Cesar frequently was in the company of his friends, who were also in band. While with his companions, Cesar laughed, joked, and smiled while around them. Cesar possessed a rare combination of stoicism, calmness, and a task-master's attitude. He was always highly polite (responding with "sir" when asked a question or "yes, sir," when obeying a request by me), as well as pleasant and engaging (frequently the first to say, “Good afternoon" with a genuine smile) when interacting with peers or adults. This balance of qualities allowed him to earn the respect of his peers and trust of the band directors, neither of which he abused. Whether given a task to accomplish or asked to serve as a leader, Cesar's focus, dependability, and desire to do any job well also aided him in achieving high respect from his peers, and high honors from his band directors that recognized his positive contributions and service to the band.

Elle. While in band, Elle dependably yet quietly carried out her role in the flute section by serving as a musical model to the younger flutists. When asked to play individually, Elle could be counted on to demonstrate mature musicality and a superior flute tone. Her attentiveness to instruction during band class was balanced with her patient, constructive, and unobtrusive help she frequently gave to others within her section. Elle's friendliness and courtesy also was extended to me. She regularly greeted me at the band hall door first, smiled, or waved hello as she walked into class. Frequently seen with her friends in the band hall, Elle seemed to enjoy the company of others, especially when carrying on a conversation. Her pleasant attitude with others, combined with a genuine confidence, openness and honesty in her demeanor, made her very likable among her peers. Despite identifying academic challenges present in her development, Elle's patience and willingness to help others improve with others served as valuable assets during her tenure as a member of the band.
Ruben. Ruben was gifted with the ability to entertain and to make others laugh. Ruben's highly engaging, magnetic personality and obvious intelligence drew others to him. During his time with the band, Ruben held several key trumpet solos in marching season and in concert season. Based on competitive auditions, he also was selected to the All District Honor Band and All Region Honor Band. Ruben also served as section leader during his senior year. Despite frequent absences from class at the end of his senior year, which could have led to a loss of credit or failing grade, Ruben managed to maintain high musical standards for himself, as he kept up with class assignments. During our interactions in class or after school, Ruben often displayed sharp awareness and intelligence by asking critical questions.
CHAPTER 4

FINDINGS

Following data analysis that included category matrices (Miles & Huberman, 1994), nine salient themes emerged and were sorted by research question. In the first section of this chapter, four characteristics of resilience will be discussed. The second section will examine the remaining five themes that describe the extent to which band membership aided the participants’ resilience across the academic and social domains.

Characteristics of Resilience

Research question one explored what characteristics of resilience are present in the participants’ talk. As evidenced by the responses of the participants, four characteristics of resilience emerged as prominent themes. Specifically, these categories included Self-improvement (the positive characteristics and outlooks that developed over time), Forward thinking (the ability to look ahead, realize goals and balance priorities), Optimism (a positive outlook on past and present events), and Inner drive (a relentless pursuit of goals). The salient features of these themes are discussed below.

Self-improvement. Cesar and Elle spoke to improvements they perceived in their own social development. Cesar commented that he grew socially from remaining reticent and unnoticed. He matured to become studious and friendly. His sociability and subsequent popularity stemmed from positive qualities he believed in and displayed in his life. Elle noted that her self-improvement was rooted in her adaptive abilities and hoped that the future would hold positive outcomes for her.

I started off as a real shy kid, like really, really shy. And as the years progressed, I became more and more outgoing. I came in as a freshman not knowing much, just quiet,
and shy, and not really understanding much, then, I [talked] to people, then from there, I grew, and eventually became a leader. If you knew me back in middle school, you’d see a serious difference! I went from being a shy, quiet, kid that barely talks that really didn’t like work that hard in school at all, to an, to an outgoing, confident, hard working student. There’s a big difference, an extreme difference. I [went from being] not even noticeable, to now, it’s like, “That’s me! Drum major! First chair! Ex-track star!” (Cesar interview, May 25, 2011)

You make yourself over the years, not just one point … that’s why you have to make yourself better, [you have to] look at your new environment and new surroundings and adapt to them, make the best of it, and become someone great (Elle, interview, May 31, 2011).

Forward thinking. Elle commented further on her ability to think ahead and see the possibilities for her future in terms of her own independence and positive contribution as an adult. Furthermore, Ruben believed that the lessons he learned concerning balancing time on task and exceptional work with leisure time would aid him in the future. The participants’ ability to think in terms of what might lie ahead and apply lessons learned to their future experiences held separate social and moral implications for each of them.

[I know] I’m capable of doing so much more, of having goals, of wanting to do things for myself, and for others and helping out and making a difference, but in the beginning, when you’re young, you just focus on right now, right now, but as you get older, you start thinking “Oh, I want to graduate, I started a job, … and I’m being recognized, and you start looking at the future and opening your eyes more and you start looking ahead instead of just focusing on what’s going on right now. You will meet new people, and
then you will get new goals, and you will make new friendships. There’s bigger things (Elle, interview, May 31, 2011).

With the other experiences I’ve had with you [and the other band directors], [I] understand that you can still have fun, and you can still have a great time, and also get your work done in a high manner. So there’s a time for playing and a time for seriousness, and all the time in between you can do whatever you want, but [during] those [other] times you need to do what is right (Ruben, interview, June 2, 2011).

Optimism. Elle’s optimistic view was reflected in her ability to frame social and academic challenges in their original context. From this positive framing, she gleaned beneficial lessons and maintained a moderate perspective toward the social and academic challenges she experienced. Meanwhile, Ruben’s guarded optimism was revealed in his future application of lessons learned earlier in his social and academic development.

As you get older you learn new things, life teaches you new lessons for sure, and sometimes, there’s things that are good because they shape you up, they make you stronger … You have the moment that you go through this, and you think, “I’m never going to get out of this. I can’t do this,” but then you look back and think, “I’ve been through much worse than what I’m going through right now, I can make it, I got this!”… Once you grow up, you start looking back, you see what was wrong at the time and then you realize that there’s bigger things out there for you. [There are] better things on going for you. It’s only high school, it’s not going to determine the rest of your life, it’s just another chapter right now, it’s just closing and starting something new (Elle, May 31, 2011).
With what I’ve done so far, and what I’ve learned, the only thing that I realize is that my future is going to be a bright one if I take what I’ve learned and learn from my mistakes (Ruben, interview, June 2, 2011).

While building positive relationships with his peers and maintaining a contrarian viewpoint to instances of being harassed himself, Cesar’s optimism is manifested through his attitude and mature ways he interacts with his peers, and adults. His maturity of thought and behavior is evident through his statement and his interactions with the people around him.

[I] make sure I stay a positive person. People will like someone that can stay positive. People will want to be your friend. Period. If you can put a smile on another person’s face, it’ll make you happy because you’re making other people happy. [If] you make somebody else smile, they’ll make you smile, and it just goes [on] from there, and then they’ll make somebody else smile. And then, it just keeps going ... I decided it’s better to become a good person than become a bitter, angry person that bullies other people to make themselves feel better about themselves (Cesar, interview, May 25, 2011).

Inner drive. The participants remarked that their relentless pursuit to achieve personal and academic goals often came from within. Ruben pointed out that his desire to do something intrinsically rewarding might pay dividends in his future career. Moreover, Elle commented on her pursuit of goals in a broader sense and recommended that along with positive self-talk, nothing should get in the way of goal achievement.

I really want to pursue and do something in my life that pertains to music. I want to keep music in my life. I don’t want to have a desk job, work as a manager of a food restaurant, or something, I want to do something that I really love, and would say, “Hey, this is
great, my life is awesome.” So, audio engineer gives me the will to do that, and having the knowledge from band helps a lot (Ruben, interview, June 2, 2011).

You gotta build yourself up, and don’t let [anything] stop you. You gotta keep going for what you really want, you gotta break all the boundaries and break the things down that are stopping you from getting to where you are, you just gotta keep going (Elle, interview, May 31, 2011).

Though each participant articulated his or her views from differing perspectives, common traits linked their responses together. These characteristics of resilience present in the participants’ talk included self-improvement, forward thinking, optimism, and inner drive. Through these qualities, participants adapted to the social and academic challenges they faced and hinted that they intended to use these properties in the future as well. Next, the participants discussed their perceptions of music making, band membership, and the ways in which they perceived that band membership had aided their resilience across other domains.

Music Making and Band Membership as an Aid in Resilience

For each participant, band membership was a way to develop connectedness to the school and to cultivate positive social relationships with peers and adults. Band affiliation also was attributed to increased academic competence through increased achievement in other academic classes as well as band itself. Themes in this section included Increased achievement (passing all classes), Determination through work (extra efforts resulting in internal and external rewards), Development of peer relationships (connection to friends through common group membership), Development of mentor relationships (connection to an adult through association in school), and Development of connectedness (connection to the school and environment
through collective experiences). Each of these emerged as prominent categories in determining the extent to which band membership played a role in aiding resilience across other domains.

Increased achievement. Cesar, Elle, and Ruben indicated that the ability to participate in extra-curricular band activities served as a motivator to help them pass their classes. Because of the no-pass, no-play rule that is enforced state-wide, students with at least one failing grade at the end of any six-week marking period would be ineligible to participate in extracurricular activities during the following six weeks, which would include band contests, athletic events, and extra-curricular field-trips. Students could regain their eligibility after three weeks only if they passed all classes during the next three-week grading period. Otherwise, they would remain ineligible to participate until the next marking period. In any given six-week period, one-third to one-half of the band typically was ruled ineligible to participate because they failed one or more classes. Speaking to the role that band membership played in achievement in other classes, Cesar demonstrated positive work habits, which also were reflected in his rehearsal technique during band classes.

In middle school, my grades weren’t that great, because I really wasn’t into band, but in high school, I started to get more into band, and my grades started getting better. In band, you have to work harder, because you’re part of something else, and you want to stay eligible [to participate] for band, and so that will make you want to work harder in band … It’s rubbed off, because if I’m going to work hard in marching band, I may as well work hard in my school work … since band showed me how to work hard is that it’s going to keep me working hard (Cesar, interview, May 25, 2011).

In addition to the extra time she spent studying in the band hall, Elle stated that meeting deadlines played a part in her increased motivation to remain eligible. Additionally, Ruben
remarked on how broad-based applications of increased achievement were intertwined with band membership. Ruben’s responses primarily focused on passing classes and an improved work ethic.

Academically, with band, there are certain points where you have to have the grades. You have to be passing your classes in order to participate in events, and it helped out, you knew you had a deadline that, where you had to be passing all of your classes, and like, three weeks check-mark was good for me because I just couldn’t put things off, like, “oh I’ll do it later.” I remembered, I have to do it now, because if not, I won’t be able to participate in band (Elle, May 31, 2011).

You have to study more, apply yourself more, to pass the class. And, I guess that works with just about everything. I mean, band really helped me with everything, every aspect of my life … with my work ethic, my schoolwork, because you know you have to pass your classes to be in band… (Ruben, June 2, 2011).

Determination through work. Increased social efforts in band often led to increased internal and external rewards for the participants. Cesar became a proficient player and leader which led to rewards and external recognition. He also took his responsibilities as a student with increased responsibilities very seriously by working tirelessly to accomplish tasks.

Hard work gets you places. [In band,] I’ve worked hard by taking my instrument home, [practicing] it, [trying] to get better, and eventually my sophomore year it got me first chair, which I was really proud of, because I worked hard for it. I took my music, went home, [and] practiced for hours. [Band has also] kept me busy … and then it just kept going, keeping myself, busy, busy, busier, to make sure I keep myself up [to reach my goals]. Band has helped me show that if you work hard, you’ll get an award, you’ll
get that first chair, you’ll become the drum major, stuff like that seriously pays off. That hard work seriously pays off (Cesar, interview, May 25, 2011).

In contrast, Ruben and Elle noticed internal rewards and commented on their achievement of goals through increased efforts in band. Both participants remarked further on positive work habits and meaningful time devoted to skill development. Reinforcement of positive work habits and skill development became a part of Elle’s individual practice and warm-up routine.

Band showed me work ethic. Summer band was hot! You’re out there, and you still work … What’s the point of being out there and working on your music and marching if you’re not going to get anything out of it? If you’re playing around not taking [rehearsal] serious [then] you’re out there for no reason, but if you apply yourself, and you focus and you really get down, then afterwards, you’ll be where you want (Ruben, interview, June 2, 2011).

In 6th grade, when you first get something new, you just say, “No, I can’t do this,” but, you have to give things a chance, and you have to work at it. You have to keep going, for your goals, to get better. It’s not going to get better, [just by] coming to class, and playing … you have to take time out, and really practice, to achieve what you want to … I would come home and play my flute forever (Elle, interview, May 31, 2011).

Development of peer relationships. The participants commented extensively on the ways in which they perceived band membership aided their social development. Drawing an analogy to family, Cesar described how band membership gave him the opportunity to develop bonds with others.
Well, [band is] like a family, you get to be next to them, around them, talk to them, and have fun with them. First you start off as strangers, and then eventually, you become friends. Maybe you notice something about them, and you talk to them for no reason, and from there, it just starts like a family kind of thing (Cesar, May 25, 2011). Elle cited the benefits of sharing experiences and the common thread of band membership. For her, band membership also led to meaningful friendships that have developed throughout her time in high school.

You create stronger bonds, especially during summer band, because you’re around each other so much … at the end of the year, everyone’s friends with each other, and you look back at [the experiences] and laugh, and remember how much fun you had and how much time we shared together … I’ve gotten social with a lot of people … [my friend] lives on my street, but we never really talked, but because of band, we became best friends and [had] something else to share in common … we got a stronger relationship because of band, [it was] another thing we had in common. [Also, another girl] lived down my street, but we never talked, until band sophomore year, and we’ve gotten to know each other. Now, we see each other like every day and we go over to each other’s houses, and we’ve become best friends, and it was actually because of band (Elle, interview, May 31, 2011).

Ruben’s unique perspective revolved around the meaningful relationship created through a musical connection. Ruben’s statements regarding time on task and comments during rehearsals to the other members of his section revealed that he was willing to share his deeper knowledge of musical concepts.
I’ve contributed to band, but it’s nowhere close to what band has given me as far as the satisfaction and the friends I’ve made in band … Friends last forever. … You still have that relationship with that person, and that’s something that time isn’t going to throw out. … Especially in band, [there is] one of my great friends, [and] I know she shares the same enthusiasm about music, and stuff like that that I do. I can tell that when I’m playing and I’ll need to take a breath, I’ll look over at her, and see the look on her face when she’s playing, and I know that she understands … our friendship is centered [around] understanding the love of music (Ruben, interview, June 2, 2011).

Development of mentor relationships. Ruben revealed that his deeply-valued relationship with a previous band director was highly influential in his social, emotional, and musical development. This mentor taught him helpful lessons, served as a positive role model, and displayed qualities that Ruben came to appreciate. As the only participant to mention the role of a mentor in his life, Ruben described his unique perspective.

I bonded with my beginning band director a lot. I’d stay after school, and he helped me love band … He believed if you truly loved band that you would put forth yourself and you would apply yourself doing whatever you needed to do … he always was kind of like a father figure, I mean, my father has always been there for me and stuff like that but he hasn’t always been there for me, you know, psychologically and mentally and stuff, and then [my beginning band director] kind of filled that gap … I just loved being around him, and around the band hall … He was a very kind person, but he also balanced his kindness with his strictness. I always loved his level of understanding about certain things. … he understood individual problems, and he tried to address them on like a one-
to-one basis, and that was something I really admired about him. He would be able to talk to you one-on-one (Ruben, June 2, 2011).

Development of connectedness. Finally, Cesar and Elle remarked that staying connected to others provided social benefits. Commenting on the positive feelings associated with common experiences shared within a group of people, Elle saw opportunities for positive reflection based on shared experiences. Cesar, meanwhile, noticed the growth of personal characteristics that allowed him to reap positive social benefits. These remarks served as their recommendations on what schools could do to help students belong.

If you’re not in any clubs or anything, then you’re kind of excluded, because when people walk around with their club shirts on, [you remember] when we did this [together], … and it’s nice, and it’s a good feeling to know that you made a difference (Elle, interview, May 31, 2011).

[Schools should] really encourage, people to join band or some sort of extracurricular activity. It’s really made me more confident and outgoing. I would be that quiet kid that would go sit by himself at lunch or something. And now, people know me and I don’t even know them (Cesar, interview, May 25, 2011).

Intrinsic Value in Music Making

During the interview, each participant commented on the internal feelings and emotions associated with music-making. Though neither a characteristic of resilience, nor a statement about the extent to which they had perceived that band membership aided their resilience across other domains, their statements were significant.

When I play any kind of piece, especially like a slower piece with chords and things, It makes me feel like I am playing something beautiful and that I’m actually a part of the
music know that I’m playing what [the writer] wrote, I’m connected to what he wrote, and his ideas, and my ideas, and we just create, a masterpiece, I guess (Ruben, interview, June 3, 2011).

I love my flute, and it’s something different, different than anything else, and it’s how it makes me feel, or how I feel when I’m playing my flute … I like playing, I like moving my fingers fast with my flute because it’s a challenge too, because it’s not just “oh do it this speed”, but you can keep going and challenge yourself and see how far you can go (Elle, interview, May 31, 2011)! Playing music helps relax my mind; it would give me a breath of fresh air (Cesar, interview, May 27, 2011).

Summary of Findings

Common themes emerged in the participants' talk, which included self-improvement, forward thinking, optimism, and inner drive. Though each participant had his or her own unique perceptions, shared themes tied their responses together. Self-improvement manifested itself in Cesar through his awareness of the ways in which he developed socially and the qualities he acquired during that process. Similarly, Elle's awareness of her own self-improvement became apparent as she adapted to her surroundings. With a look ahead, she commented on the possibilities the future may hold, whereas Ruben detailed implications from lessons learned about time management. Optimism was a unanimous characteristic that permeated Cesar’s, Ruben’s, and Elle’s responses. Their responses ranged from applying lessons to the future, learning from past events, and maintaining a moderate perspective on life’s challenges to building positive relationships with others, while consciously choosing not to treat others poorly. Finally, the internal motivation present in the pursuit of aspirations emerged prominently as a
shared characteristic of resilience. Though the participants commented on either career-related goals, band-related goals, or broad-based goals, the inner drive they discussed while describing their future aspirations was a unifying element.

Common themes also surfaced with regard to the extent to which band membership aided resilience in other domains. These themes included increased achievement, determination through work, development of peer relationships, development of mentor relationships, and development of connectedness. Band membership offered many extra-curricular opportunities for the participants. The motivation to pass all of their classes and the application of positive work habits in other areas served in supporting Ruben, Elle, and Cesar in the academic domain. Furthermore, the opportunity to develop relationships with peers, a mentor, and connectedness to the school provided social benefits that helped the participants in their own unique realization of the positive benefits associated with band membership. The next chapter will focus on the interpretation of these findings and will discuss how the results relate to the theoretical framework established in previous chapters.
CHAPTER 5
DISCUSSION AND IMPLICATIONS

Discussion of Protective Factors

The purpose of this descriptive case study was to identify characteristics of resilience present in the participants’ talk, and to explore the extent to which the participants perceived that band membership has aided resilience in other domains. Resilience was manifested in the participants’ talk by individual protective factors such as self-improvement, forward thinking, optimism, and inner drive, and the cumulative protection found when protective factors, such as those listed, worked together. Furthermore, increased achievement, determination through work, the development of peer relationships, the development of a relationship to a mentor, and the development of connectedness also appeared as protective factors that aided the participants across other domains. Though generalizability of the findings is not possible due to the limited number of participants and the specificity of their context, these findings and subsequent discussion might illuminate, in part, other relevant issues related to the fostering of resilience in students.

The characteristics of resilience present in the participants’ talk were consistent with the predictor variables of resilience found from the first period of resilience research from the early 1970s to the 1990s. Specifically, these characteristics included optimism, the development of self-regulating skills, and problem-solving skills (Anthony, 1974; Garmezy, 1985; Haggerty et al., 1983; Masten, 2001). Additional research by Gelfand (1999) and Perez et al. (2009) highlighted extensive support networks, meaningful friendships, and extracurricular activity participation as protective factors. The participants’ responses appeared to complement these research findings as well. Additionally, a high degree of emotional intelligence can be assumed by the ability of the individual to report salient features of relationships and adaptations.
pertaining to an individual’s social or emotional development. This ability can serve as a further indicator of resilient behavior (Masten, 2001). Through self-improvement, Cesar indicated awareness of the ways in which he had developed socially and emotionally from middle school to high school. Through self-improvement and forward thinking, Elle conveyed an awareness of the processes associated with adapting to new surroundings, thus maintaining an optimistic outlook on the future. Ruben focused his responses on the application of the lessons he had learned regarding time on task and leisure time.

The positive adaptations individuals make throughout their development are often framed around an optimistic state of mind and disposition (Borman & Overman, 2004; Borman & Rachuba, 2001; Finn & Rock, 1997; Garmezy, 1985; Gonzales & Padilla, 1997; Haggerty et al., 1983). Optimism not only was reflected in Elle's ability to frame challenges, but Cesar's ability to turn negative feelings regarding being bullied into positive feelings upon which he built relationships with others. Cesar also noted many social benefits through his outlook on his positive disposition. Ruben's cautious optimism was reflected in his awareness that learning from mistakes can yield more desirable outcomes in the future. As evidenced by the perceptions of the participants, optimism appeared to play an important role in their development, although their personal levels of optimism were on a continuum.

Schools that are effective in fostering increased social competence through the development of relationships and connectedness have also been found to be important protective factors in aiding resilience (Bernard, 1993; Bond et al., 2007; Henderson & Milstein, 2003; Masten, 2001). Elle talked extensively about how band membership allowed her to acquire new friendships and to develop existing relationships. She also specifically commented that her closest relationships have revolved around the common bond of band membership.
Complementing Elle’s perspectives, Cesar added that band membership offered him the opportunity to develop familial bonds with his peers while providing insights on how he built these relationships. Ruben responded with a different viewpoint on his development of relationships by focusing on the music-making experience as opposed to the band membership experience. Using musical bonds to develop a connection to one of his close friends, he noted many salient features of that relationship, such as their enduring friendship that centered on the common interest of and connection to music.

Ruben’s statement complemented the work of Shehan-Campbell, Connell, and Beegle (2007), in which the authors noted that music-making has positive emotional benefits, as well as social benefits. Speaking to connectedness, Cesar believed that administrators, teachers, and students could facilitate community among individuals by publicly advertising organizations that appealed to a wide variety of students in the school. Furthermore, Elle noted the positive effect she experienced as a result of being involved in a common organization that had enriched the school environment. These examples of increased social competence might also increase emotional intelligence, which Connor and Slear (2009) noted as an important correlate in identifying resilient students in schools. Bond et al. (2007) found similar results that students who scored highly on a measure of social and school connectedness instruments had fewer instances of negative outcomes, such as smoking or drug abuse. Dillon (2006) identified music making in schools as a protective factor because it offers opportunities for creative engagement. As evidenced by their responses, the participants were highly engaged in the process of music making and were able to derive personal satisfaction from increased efforts. In the current study, these increased efforts resulted in external rewards for Cesar and internal rewards for Elle. The internal satisfaction that music making created for the participants was a finding that deserves
closer attention. Though outside the scope of this study’s research questions, the participants all mentioned the feelings of satisfaction they received when they were engaged in the music-making process. This might suggest that the participants perceived mostly external benefits from band membership but internal benefits from music making (Elliott, 1995; Reimer, 2003).

The development of a relationship with a mentor has been found to serve as a protective factor by contributing to positive development in children (Masten, 2001). Ruben specifically mentioned that his relationship to his beginning band director was pivotal not only in his development as a musician, but in his development as a maturing person. The positive nature of their relationship deepened as Ruben’s mentor worked to develop a trusting relationship with him. By recognizing unique problems and addressing them privately, Ruben’s beginning band director also created a caring and nurturing relationship that played a positive role in Ruben’s development during an especially vulnerable time. The positive benefits associated with a relationship to a mentor are not unique in fostering resilience; however, Ruben’s opinions deserve consideration in this case (Masten, 2001; O’Dougherty-Wright & Masten, 2005). As the only participant who mentioned the role that an adult mentor played in his social and emotional development, Ruben’s thoughts and views on the subject highlighted valuable features of such a relationship.

The development and display of academic competence has been used to identify resilience (Garmezy 1991; Garmezy, Masten, & Tellegen, 1984). Using their inner drive and determination to motivate them to reach goals and receive both internal and external rewards for their work, the participants noted positive benefits associated with their increased efforts. Cesar's efforts earned him first chair and leadership honors. Ruben learned that increased work often leads to desirable results and noted that his career choice will provide him with internal
satisfaction. Elle saw that the extra time she spent working purposefully on developing her own musical skills paid dividends in terms of achieving goals.

Additionally, Ruben and Cesar not only applied positive characteristics associated with increased achievement in other classes, such as extra time spent studying and a more positive work ethic, but noted that band membership helped to reinforce those habits. Elle's development of increased academic competence was rooted in the motivation and desire to participate in band and other extra-curricular activities. Deadlines became important to Elle; she knew she had to pass her classes by the end of each marking period to stay eligible for the band-related extra-curricular activities. Similarly, Ruben commented that the desire to stay eligible for the extra-curricular band activities motivated him to pass his classes. Since both Elle and Ruben valued participation in extra-curricular activities, the extra motivation to pass their classes so as not to let their peers down might have served as a protective factor in aiding academic resilience as well. Though many variables might ultimately influence resilient behavior in children, the display of academic competence remains a critical positive adaptation in a school setting.

Applications of the Results to Social Identity Theory and Collectivism

The participants’ responses closely aligned with the literature surrounding social identity theory (Tajfel, 1982) in that they derived a part of their self-concept from attaching value and significance to band membership. Though band might function as a reference group through which individuals use the norms and values of the group to construct their individual beliefs (Shibutani, 1955), Cesar’s, Elle’s and Ruben’s talk focused more on the positive social benefits of band membership and how the overall self-concepts of the participants were aided as a result of membership in a school organization. Social identity theory also assumes that individuals maintain a positive self-concept at all times. Their explanations might also suggest that their
self-concept has not only been enhanced but positively developed by membership in band as well. Since resilience has been understood within a social context (Botrell, 2009), the opportunities that band membership offered the participants to develop positive social relationships with peers or a mentor also might have worked to enhance their characteristics of resilience.

Collectivism, which is defined as a sense of shared responsibility between the group and the individual (Allen & Bagozzi, 2001; Carson, 2009; Mogahaddam & Taylor, 1994; Triandis et al., 1988), also was present in the stories of Cesar, Ruben and Elle. Through comments on the accolades he had received, Cesar implied a sense of shared responsibility. His achievements not only helped distinguish himself from his peers, but they furthered the advancement of the group as well. Furthermore, his desire to be the best player and the best leader he could be might have underscored a salient characteristic of collectivism. Cesar worked diligently to ensure that he contributed positively to the group both as an outstanding player and a model leader. His work not only garnered him individual awards and achievements, but also improved the group by giving his peers a positive peer role model. Similarly, collectivism also was present in Elle's numerous comments on her own development as a flutist. Using collectivism and other features from social identity theory such as maintaining a positive self-concept to their advantage, the participants experienced more social and emotional benefits.

Instances of social creativity, individual mobility, and social competition were not mentioned in the informants’ responses. This might suggest that the participants were satisfied with their membership in the group, as well as the status associated with band membership. The further lack of apparent desire to change groups or make positive comparisons between groups might also suggest that status associated with band membership was high enough as to contribute
positively to the participants’ self-concepts and social identities. Since the participants did not compare band membership with other school organizations, it is possible that some positive comparisons might have taken place in the participants’ development as they made the choice to continue being a member of the band. Even though social creativity, individual mobility, and social competition were not present in Cesar, Ruben, or Elle’s responses or behaviors, these adaptations might be present in other areas of their lives or in other populations in different contexts.

The Resilience Cycle

The findings from this study also supported Morales’ (2000, 2008a, 2008b) work on how resilience may be manifested in students. In the resilience cycle, Morales (2000, 2008a) emphasized that motivation, acquisition of protective factors, self-efficacy building, and identification of needs all work together and function like spokes, as if on a wheel. Emotional intelligence, which is at the center of the model, acts as the hub. As the participants in this study expressed their views on their perceived personality characteristics, band membership, high school experiences, and positive adaptations, their keen and insightful thoughts into their own development allowed more salient features of their emotional intelligence, acquisition of protective factors, and their self-efficacy development to rise to the surface.

The participants' responses regarding their own social, emotional, and academic development can be applied directly to this model. At the center of the model is a high level of emotional intelligence, which can be evidenced by the participants' revealing responses. As Cesar chronicled his own academic development and subsequent increased achievement, he noted that band membership played a part in his desire to develop academic competence. Caesar realized he was part of a group and that he did not want to let the group down. Failing classes,
for good, would have led to his nonparticipation in extracurricular events. His identification of the need to participate in something enjoyable was similar to Ruben's realization that not passing classes would lead to nonparticipation in an activity that he highly valued. Similarly, Elle strove to pass her classes so that she could participate in an activity she perceived as fun. Thus, the desire to participate in the extracurricular activities associated with band membership appeared to act as a protective factor against poor academic achievement. The subsequent positive work habits that were instilled in Cesar and Elle, such as meeting deadlines and a more focused work ethic, also might have worked to build self-esteem and increase self-efficacy.

Summary of the Findings

A discussion of the findings presented in Chapter 4 can serve to situate the results within the frameworks established in the previous chapters. The characteristics of resilience present in the participants’ talk have manifested themselves through protective factors that have worked individually and together. These protective factors have aided the participants in their social, emotional, and cognitive development. Applications of the findings in terms of social identity theory and collectivism were also discussed. Lastly, the findings were discussed in terms of the resilience cycle. When the protective factors, social context, and resilience cycle applications are combined together, a more complete picture of the participants’ responses and behaviors can be realized. Based on the lessons learned from the three participants in this study, the following section explores implications of the findings for the research community and for practitioners in school settings.

Implications for Future Research

As discussed in the previous chapters, research has focused primarily on the identification of characteristics and behaviors of resilient individuals in the context of a
phenomenon or as an atypical result found in an experiment or correlation. Though the findings of this thesis complemented previous research in the identification of characteristics and behaviors associated with resilience, the participants’ individual histories and backgrounds might have influenced their responses. However, their responses might elicit a deeper appreciation from readers when the personal stories and background of information are taken into account. Additionally, the Morales (2008) resilience cycle remains the only theoretical model of working resilience. More models like this are needed and might be built based on more descriptive research using qualitative data collection techniques as well as quantitative research that can supplement the experiments and correlations from previous periods of research. Before resilience models are generated, however, it might be useful to have a clearer understanding of how resilience is specifically manifested in students.

Research that is similar in nature to Botrell’s (2009) could explore the extent to which social theories might help explain resilience. More useful data could be gathered as a result of additional descriptive, correlational, and experimental studies that explore what, if any, trends exist for social context and resilience. Furthermore, studies could be conducted using similar data collection techniques as found in this thesis, but might differ in terms of the setting or extracurricular activity. Additional information also could be collected through the use of larger data sets to determine if relationships exist between the participation in extracurricular activities and resilient behavior. Furthermore, longitudinal or experimental investigations could help determine how resilience can be fostered as a long-lasting characteristic that is applied to new situations, instead of being motivated by external factors. Research could also be conducted that explores to what extent resilient students perceive that their characteristics are transferrable to different academic situations or subjects. For example, are the same behaviors and
characteristics present in the work ethic of a resilient student in history as well as in English? To what extent is resilience potentially mitigated in school settings where a higher degree of adaptability is expected? How do resilient students perceive their own characteristics? In what ways is resilience suppressed in settings where conformity is expected? Though the specific role of school counselors has been explored in aiding resilience in children, further inquiry is needed in this area, as well as uncovering the specific roles that teachers, administrators, and other school officials might play in the development of resilience.

Additionally, relevant advocacy and philosophical information might be garnered from student responses specific to the positive effects associated with playing and creating music. The extent to which music-making activities impact resilience could be the topic for further questions that lead to research exploring the specific effect that the act of playing music has on resilient behavior. Specific questions could investigate a neurological basis for any perceived effect.

Implications for Practice

While researchers might use these findings to supplement previous research and to explore other avenues toward understanding resilience through different perspectives, educators might apply these findings in their own contexts as a way to foster resilience in their students. This thesis presented features of how resilience worked in an instrumental music program. Educators and their students, administrators, and parents who read this might find relevant advocacy information about the positive benefits of music participation. Also, music educators might be able to use these findings as a starting point for developing responsiveness to what their students are learning from musical experiences, regardless of musical setting. Students might achieve a greater awareness of how their own resilience has been shaped as a result of group membership. Though generalizability was not the goal of this study, several implications for
school personnel can be gleaned from the findings and discussion of the results. What follows are recommendations for practitioners of education based on the lessons learned from the participants in this study.

1. Develop the roles of adult mentors in schools.

   All school personnel play a critical role in the social, emotional, and academic development in students’ lives. By focusing on a positive, caring relationship with students that maintains appropriate boundaries, these adults might aid in the creation of an environment where active mentoring takes place. Implementation of mentoring programs during the school day might serve as an initial starting point for developing such relationships with groups of students. With all dedicated classroom teachers as primary leaders of a small, pre-assigned group of students, schools could schedule a short, but regular amount of time either each day, every few days, or once a week, for a class that functions as a comfortable place for small groups of students to connect around a meaningful curriculum designed to foster positive relationships between teachers and students.

   Because of the important nature of this class, teachers and other involved personnel who choose to serve as mentors should be properly guided in the implementation of such a curriculum. This training could occur in inservice sessions before the start of the school year, in general faculty meetings, or during department meetings prior to the implementation of the program. Counselors and administrators could provide support for teachers who are searching for ways to connect meaningfully with their small group. Since as many interested teachers as possible could be used to keep the student-teacher ratio as low as possible, proactive strategies for conducting a class of this nature could be provided during the regular faculty meetings or disseminated through e-mail well in advance of the beginning of the program. Because all
available teachers would be encouraged to participate, it would be critical for the teachers to understand that the program was being implemented for the potential positive benefits it might bring to the students through a meaningful curriculum and connection to the group. An overall atmosphere of collegial support within the school would be needed as well, as teachers would need to feel free to seek out the advice of administrators and counselors if they experienced conflict. In addition to developing teachers’ roles as mentors, counselors’ roles as mentors might also be enhanced through the implementation of such a program. The students, in turn, might come to rely on the group, including the mentor, for sources of academic or social support in times of need.

2. Develop the roles of student mentors in schools.

Tutoring or mentoring programs could be established that pair older students who have overcome academic, social, or personal challenges with younger students who might be encountering similar challenges. For example, high school students could be matched with elementary school students. The call could begin at the high school for juniors or seniors who were interested in serving as mentors at a neighboring school. In turn, counselors and teachers could work together at the upper and lower levels to devise criteria for selection into the program, and to pair the selected upper-level students with a younger student at the lower level. Similar to a “study-buddy,” the pair could work together on schoolwork before, during, or after school. Cooperating teachers, interested counselors, and administrators could assume supervisory roles, providing scaffolding to each member of the duo if difficulties arose with meaningful connection, discipline problems, or other logistical issues. Also similar to a “big-brother/big-sister” program, the pair could work on positive relationship-building with each other and enjoy the synergistic benefits that mentoring can afford.
3. Develop more opportunities for co-curricular and extracurricular enrichment within the school.

In addition to seeking out and sponsoring avenues that appeal to more students through extracurricular activities, teachers could design activities that complement the curriculum in core classes while enhancing the overall environment in the school. Under the guidance of interested teachers, students who study certain branches of science could conduct experiments that investigate potential environmental or ecological issues in the school. Based on their findings, these students could then prepare and deliver a presentation that might contain positive outcomes for the school or its students. English or journalism classes might enrich the school by developing a regularly issued school newspaper. Additionally, the students that create the newspaper might continue to enjoy positive benefits of group membership.

Students involved in an activity that is both co-curricular and extra-curricular might benefit from the academic rigor of a co-curricular class as well as the positive benefits associated with group membership in an extra-curricular activity. Having more opportunities available that engage as many students as possible might also contribute to an increased positive environment in the school. Furthermore, history and geography classes could study relevant social or political issues from the past, then design investigations to see if such issues are present within the school population at the present time. Music students could enrich the school by seeking out as many varied venues of performance within the school. Aside from marching band pep rallies, opportunities might exist for other band students, orchestra, and choir students to perform within the context of the regular school day. These opportunities might include small ensembles playing music appropriate for the environment in various locations throughout the school.
Regardless of the specific subject, concept, or activity, opportunities for co-curricular engagement are numerous and could enrich the students’ connectedness to the school.

4. Foster resilience as a holistic characteristic.

Schools function as one of many socializing agents in the development of children. As such, many social and emotional characteristics children acquire are fostered within the environment of the school. Along with the acquisition of certain lifelong academic skills that are needed to function in society, such as reading, writing, math, and music, children can learn the ability to adapt positively while facing certain challenges within the confines of the school. These adaptations, many of which are learned within the school, can serve as an affirmative turning point in the academic, social, or emotional development of a child. The promise of a reward or consequence often functions as a powerful external motivator. Educators might use caution when using external motivators to develop positive adaptations, so the children who acquire these skills do not depend on the presence of a reward to elicit positive adaptations. For example, though the “no-pass, no-play” rule in some states might boost academic achievement because of the students’ desire to participate in extracurricular activities, the rule might lose some of its intent if the expectation of achievement is not transferred to a characteristic that students apply throughout their lives both in and out of school settings. For resilience to be holistic, a combination of external and internal motivators could work together and complement each other so that students can experience positive adaptations in the face of social, emotional, or academic challenges, regardless of context.

Conclusion

The material presented in Chapters 1 and 2 served as the framework for this study by highlighting relevant definitions, research trends in psychology, education and music pertaining
to resilience. Chapter 3 focused on the data-collection methods used in this study and contained an introduction to the context from which the participants were selected. The findings presented in Chapter 4 along with the subsequent analysis and implications for both research and practice presented in Chapter 5 served to illustrate the characteristics of resilience present in the participants’ talk, and to discuss the extent to which band membership aided the positive adaptations experienced by the participants despite exposure to certain challenges.

Through this thesis, an additional perspective has been provided on resilience. Though sometimes analyzed as a phenomenon, resilience can also be thought of as a process of adaptation. There are many challenges students can face, and there are many ways that students can adapt. Therefore, teachers who are aware of and sensitive to the issues surrounding resilience might mitigate, in part, the inevitable trials that all students encounter.
EPILOGUE

Though my initial wonderings and curiosity stemmed from my daily interactions with my students, I have also learned much about an area of research known as resilience. Through investigating and learning about resilience in this context, I have come to realize that there are many more questions that could be investigated relating to this complex idea and process. In a psychological context, there seems to be much to be learned about the interaction of resilience with individual human beings’ thoughts, perceptions, actions and behaviors. In educational settings, investigations could be conducted that explore the effects of how resilience interacts on academic achievement, and social competence. In musical settings, findings might emerge about music’s specific role as either a protective factor, or music’s unique role in the lives of human beings. My curiosity has been awakened by this investigation, from which I have learned that this idea is a newly found scholarly interest of mine. I now understand that this project is not the end of my investigation in this area, but the beginning.

My desire to continue to research and investigate resilience as a scholarly pursuit would not have the meaning that it holds for me today without my nine years of experience as a public school band director. I learned an infinite amount of information from my students during that time. Most important, I am able to see the world differently because of the day-to-day interactions I had with the students I taught over my nine years as a middle school and high school band director in the public schools. My perspectives on the impacts being in band and the overall experience of music making has on students has also changed throughout my time in the public schools. Ultimately, I will continue to be a teacher first and foremost regardless of who I teach, what level I teach, or what subjects I teach. However, it is with the combined knowledge that I have learned from my teaching experiences thus far and the lessons learned from my
students that I now hope to make an additional difference for my future students through investigator’s eyes as well.
APPENDIX A

SEMI-STRUCTURED INTERVIEW QUESTIONS
1) Why have you chosen to remain a part of the band?

2) What rewards have you received from being in band?

3) What relationships, if any, do you see between band membership and other areas of your life?

4) Do you believe there is a relationship between your high grade-point average and your participation in band?

5) What does being resilient meant to you?

6) What qualities do you believe resilient people have?

7) Do you consider yourself to be resilient? If so, in what ways?

8) What does adversity mean to you?

9) How, if at all, have you experienced adversity in your life?

10) How have you responded to adversity in your life?

11) Describe how, if at all, band membership has played a role in navigating adversity?

12) What does the quality of being adaptive mean to you?

13) Based on these experiences, describe how you have adapted despite adversity.

14) In general, what do you know now that you didn’t know when you first joined band?

15) What, if any, long-term goals do you have for yourself?

16) In what ways do you think your experiences will impact your future?

17) What roles do you see yourself taking on in the future?

18) How should schools assist a diverse student body in meeting academic or social success? In other words, how can schools help students belong?

19) Is there anything else we have not talked about that you would like to add?
APPENDIX B

INTERVIEW TRANSCRIPT SAMPLE
Interview with Cesar
High School Band Room
May 25, 2011, 7:30 a.m.- 8:00 a.m.

BP = Ben Price, interviewer and thesis author
C = Cesar, participant

C: In middle school, my grades weren’t that great, because I really wasn’t into band, but in high school, I started to get more into band, and my grades started getting better.

BP: Mmm hmm…Can ---

C: In band, you have to work harder, because you’re part of something else, and you want to stay eligible for band, and so that will make you want to work harder in band. <brief pause> It’s rubbed off, because if I’m going to work hard in marching band, I may as well work hard in my school work <2 second pause> since band showed me how to work hard is that it’s going to keep me working hard.

BP: How do you feel that you’ve worked hard?

C: Oh, yeah, like how I’ve worked hard is by, taking my-like, taking my instrument home, well, not like, well freshman are like, I’ll take my instrument home, practice it, try to get better and better, and eventually, yeah, my sophomore year it got me first chair which I was really proud of. Cuz, I worked hard for it. I took my music, went home, practiced it for hours, and my like lips hurt, yeah.

BP: Mmm hmm…So, in what ways do you feel like your experiences here will impact your future?

C: What I feel is, that, since band showed me HOW to work hard is that it’s going to KEEP me working hard. Cuz, if not, I wouldn’t have had, like, I wouldn’t have had this, I wouldn’t have had this boost to work hard, I doubt I would.
APPENDIX C

INTERVIEW TRANSCRIPT SAMPLE
Interview with Cesar
High School Band Room
May 25, 2011, 7:30 a.m. - 8:00 a.m.

BP = Ben Price, interviewer and thesis author
C = Cesar, participant

C.: In middle school, my grades weren’t that great because I really wasn’t into band, but in high school, I started to get into band, and my grades started getting better.

BP: Mmm hmm…Can ---

C: In band, you have to work harder, because you’re part of something else, and you want to stay eligible for band, and so that will make you want to work harder in band. <brief pause> It’s rubbed off, because if I’m going to work hard in marching band, I may as well work hard in my school work. Since band showed me how to work hard, it’s going to keep me working hard.

BP: How do you feel that you’ve worked hard?

C: Oh, yeah, like how I’ve worked hard is by, taking my-like, taking my instrument home, well, not like, well freshman are like, I’ll take my instrument home, practice it, try to get better and better, and eventually, yeah, my sophomore year it got me first chair which I was really proud of. Cuz, I worked hard for it. I took my music, went home, practiced it for hours, and my like lips hurt, yeah.

BP: Mmm hmm…So, in what ways do you feel like your experiences here will impact your future?

C: What I feel is, that, since band showed me HOW to work hard is that it’s going to KEEP me working hard. Cuz, if not, I wouldn’t have had, like, I wouldn’t have had this this boost to work hard, I doubt I would.
APPENDIX D

PRELIMINARY LIST OF CODES AND THEMES
Self-Actualization/-Improvement/-Worth/-Efficacy(?)

- Shy to outgoing *(who you want to be?)*
- Not knowing/understanding to leader *(development or self-to-self?)*
- Shy and quiet to outgoing and hardworking
- Not noticeable to well-known *(development or self-to-self comparison?)*
- …over the years
- …not just one point *(developmental as a process…)*
- Look
- Adapt
- Become someone great *(who you want to be?)*
- Having goals *(like below?)*
- Future independence *(who you want to be?)*
- Looking ahead
- Bigger things *(like optimism below?)*
- Past experiences to future

**Determination**

- Hard work
- Award
- Pay off
- *Work ethic (in two places)*
- Be where you want *(combine with above?)*
- Work at it *(how?)*
- Take time out
- Practice to achieve what you want to *(from below?)*

**Optimism**

- [experiences] make you stronger
- “I can’t do this” to “I can make it”
- Look back
- Better things in the future
- Bright future
- Learn from mistakes
- Stay positive
- Better to become a good person
Pursuit/Inner Drive/Goal achievement

- I want to pursue
- The will to do what I want
- Go for what you really want
- Break all the boundaries
- Break the things down that are stopping you
- Keep going

Increased achievement

- Grades not that great to started getting better
- Work harder
- Work hard
- Academically, you have to have the grades
- Pass your classes in order to participate
- Deadline
- Study more
- Apply yourself more
- Work ethic

Peer relationships—familial relationships/peer bonding experiences

- Like a family
- Friends
- Bonds
- Gotten social
- Stronger relationship
- Relationship
- Understanding

Relationship to a mentor

- Bonded
- Beginning band director
- Father figure
- Talk to you one-on-one
Connectedness

- Not in clubs leads to exclusion
- Sharing memories
- Making a difference
- Join extra-curricular activity
- Sit by myself to known around school

Establishment of value to music—Doesn't answer a research question but interesting….

- I am playing something beautiful
- I am a part of the music
- I am connected to what the composer wrote
- A masterpiece
- I like playing my flute
- Challenge
- Keep going
- Challenge yourself
- See how far you can go
- Playing music helps me relax
- Breath of fresh air
APPENDIX E

FINAL LIST OF CODES AND THEMES
Self-improvement

- shy to outgoing
- not knowing/understanding to leader
- shy and quiet to outgoing and hardworking
- not noticeable to well-known
- …over the years
- …not just one point
- look
- adapt
- become someone great

Forward thinking

- having goals
- future independence
- looking ahead
- bigger things
- past experiences to future

Optimism

- [experiences] make you stronger
- “I can't do this” to “I can make it”
- Look back
- Better things in the future
- Bright future
- Learn from mistakes
- Stay positive
- Better to become a good person

Inner drive

- I want to pursue
- The will to do what I want
- Go for what you really want
- Break all the boundaries
- Break the things down that are stopping you
- Keep going
Increased achievement

- Grades not that great to started getting better
- work harder
- work hard
- Academically, you have to have the grades
- Pass your classes in order to participate
- Deadline
- Study more
- Apply yourself more
- Work ethic

Determination through work

- Hard work
- Award
- Pay off
- Work ethic
- Be where you want
- Work at it
- Take time out
- Practice to achieve what you want to

Development of peer relationships

- Like a family
- Friends
- Bonds
- Gotten social
- Stronger relationship
- Relationship
- Understanding

Development of a relationship to a mentor

- Bonded
- Beginning Band Director
- Father Figure
- Talk to you one-on-one
Development of connectedness

- Not in clubs leads to exclusion
- Sharing memories
- Making a difference
- Join extra-curricular activity
- Sit by myself to known around school

Music's Intrinsic Value

- I am playing something beautiful
- I am a part of the music
- I am connected to what the composer wrote
- A masterpiece
- I like playing my flute
- Challenge
- Keep Going
- Challenge yourself
- See how far you can go
- Playing music helps me relax
- Breath of fresh air
REFERENCES


80


Shaffer, A., Coffino, B., Boelcke-Stennes, K., & Masten, A. S. (2007). From urban girls to


