

THE BULLRING AS SOURCE AND SYMBOL IN THE
MAJOR WORKS OF ERNEST HEMINGWAY

APPROVED:

Martin Shockley
Major Professor

L. Robert Stevens
Consulting Professor

Isby C. Nichols, Jr.
Minor Professor

E. S. Clifton
Chairman of the Department of English

Robert B. Toulouse
Dean of the Graduate School

md

Grasmick, Janice K., The Bullring as Source and Symbol in the Major Works of Ernest Hemingway. Master of Arts (English), August, 1971, 152 pp., bibliography, 128 titles.

Many legends exist about Ernest Hemingway and his aficion for the Spanish bullfight. Hemingway's close observation of details and his wide reading acquainted him with the techniques of bullfighting, which he considered not a sport, but a tragedy. Close personal friendships with the matadors Cayento Ordonez, Sidney Franklin, Antonio Ordonez, and Luis Dominguin increased Hemingway's enthusiasm for the Spanish tragedy. Chapter I of this study discusses the legends and personal events that were the source of the representations of the bullring in his art.

Hemingway's study of the bullfight, Death in the Afternoon, parallels his desire to observe reality unflinchingly in his art. The bullfight becomes a symbol of the wholeness of life and death, of religion and aesthetics for Hemingway. By pitting art against death, the matador epitomizes the individual who makes his own meaning in an otherwise meaningless universe. Hemingway extends the values he has discovered in the bullfight to his hunting in The Green Hills of Africa. The second chapter of this thesis discusses the bullfight in these two non-fiction works: Death in the Afternoon and The Green Hills of Africa.

Like the bullfighter, Hemingway put his life experience into his works of art. The bullfight motif in The Sun Also

Rises enhances the theme and structure of the novel. The manner in which the characters observe Pedro Romero in the ring reflects their ability to face reality in their lives. The fact that Lady Brett Ashley and Jake Barnes face a moment of truth by the end of the novel contraverts the interpretation of the novel as a statement about the lost generation. In Death in the Afternoon Hemingway retaliates to the critics who had given harsh reviews to A Farewell to Arms. Hemingway fuses bullfighting and war subtly but artistically in For Whom the Bell Tolls. Hemingway's allusions to the bullfight point to the bullring as the central structure of the novel, reinforcing the anti-Facist theme. In his earliest short story about the bullfight, "The Undefeated," Hemingway associates fishing and bullfighting. He completes this association in The Old Man and the Sea, where Santiago demonstrates that in struggles of life and death such as in the bullfight, there is no victory or defeat.

This study of the bullfight in Hemingway's life and in his art demonstrates the values by which Hemingway lived and wrote. In Death in the Afternoon he pursues reality with courage and integrity, with grace under pressure. The bullring enhances the light and earth imagery and reinforces the structure and themes of Hemingway's major novels.

THE BULLRING AS SOURCE AND SYMBOL IN THE
MAJOR WORKS OF ERNEST HEMINGWAY

THESIS

Presented to the Graduate Council of the
North Texas State University in Partial
Fulfillment of the Requirements

For the Degree of

MASTER OF ARTS

By

Janice Katherine Grasmick, B. S.

Denton, Texas

August, 1971

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Chapter		Page
I.	SOURCE	1
II.	THE MAJOR NON-FICTION	33
	<u>Death in the Afternoon</u>	33
	<u>The Green Hills of Africa</u>	71
III.	THE MAJOR FICTION	79
	<u>The Sun Also Rises</u>	79
	<u>A Farewell to Arms</u>	102
	<u>For Whom the Bell Tolls</u>	118
	<u>The Old Man and the Sea</u>	137
IV.	CONCLUSION	147
	A BIBLIOGRAPHY	153

CHAPTER I

SOURCE

Discussing the life and death of Theodore Roosevelt in a poem written in 1923, Ernest Hemingway observed, "All the legends that he started in his life live on and prosper, unhampered now by his existence."¹ The same statement may be applied to Hemingway himself, who created, encouraged, and imitated legends that originated and prospered about him.² In his works he portrayed himself as a "man who could teach by example how to live the intense life that was best known to matadors."³ Other people, sometimes trying to stand in the shadow of the legendary Hemingway, increased the legends by elaborating on their relationship to the famous man. In Death in the Afternoon Hemingway alludes to the pictures of the matador Joselito which Gertrude Stein once showed him.⁴ The next year Gertrude Stein credited herself for teaching Hemingway about the corrida.⁵ Whatever the initial stimulus,

¹Ernest Hemingway, The Collected Poems, Number one of the Library of Living Poetry (n.p., n.d.), sixteenth poem, hereafter Poems.

²Philip Young, Ernest Hemingway (New York, 1952), p. 119.

³Robert Stephens, Hemingway's Non-Fiction (Chapel Hill, 1968), p. 46.

⁴Ernest Hemingway, Death in the Afternoon (New York, 1932), p.1, hereafter cited DIA.

⁵Gertrude Stein, The Autobiography of Alice B. Toklas (New York, 1933), p. 26.

Hemingway's association with the annual July Festival of San Fermin in Pamplona, Spain, brought over 100,000 visitors in 1966 to the village that was only half as crowded with visitors in 1922.⁶

According to Carlos Baker, Hemingway's biographer, Hemingway wrote a sketch about the goring of a matador for the Little Review in the early 1920's before he had seen a bullfight.⁷ Shortly thereafter, Hemingway set out with Robert McAlmon for Madrid, where he saw and enjoyed his first novillada. On the way to Madrid, the train stopped briefly near the carcass of a dead dog. When McAlmon turned his head to avoid looking at the carcass, Hemingway lectured him about facing reality.⁸ McAlmon, disliking the bullfight from the beginning, yelled⁹ when he saw "the Spanish brutality" of the goring of the horses.¹⁰ Although Hemingway at first feared that the spectacle of the horses would upset him,¹¹ the sixteen fights he saw that spring on a tour of Spain from San Sebastian to Granada convinced him that bullfighting was

⁶Shag Oag, In the Presence of Death, Antonio Ordóñez (New York, 1968), p.236.

⁷Carlos Baker, Ernest Hemingway, A Life Story (New York, 1969), p. 109.

⁸Robert McAlmon, Being Geniuses Together, 1920-1930 (New York, 1968), p.178.

⁹Baker, p. 111.

¹⁰McAlmon, p. 180

¹¹DIA, p. 1.

"not a sport" but a "tragedy" involving the death of the bull.¹² Implying that Hemingway may have enjoyed the bullfight because of Stein's praise for it,¹³ McAlmon claims that Hemingway insisted that they have the best seats and drink the finest liquor at the bullfights since McAlmon was footing the bill.¹⁴ Baker identifies Hemingway's portrait of Mr. X.Y. in Death in the Afternoon as Robert McAlmon.¹⁵

Hemingway later stated that after his first initiation to the bullfight he was unable to write "anything" on the subject for five years, except for four brief sketches.¹⁶ In 1924, however, the book In Our Time first appeared in the European bookstores.¹⁷ This book, reprinted later in America, contains six sketches about bullfighting.¹⁸ Two poems mentioning the bullfight were published in Der Querschnitt in 1924.¹⁹ The March, 1924, issue of the Transatlantic Review also includes an article by Hemingway entitled

¹²Ernest Hemingway, "Bullfighting A Tragedy," from By-Line: Ernest Hemingway, edited by William White (New York, 1967), pp. 95-6, hereafter By-Line.

¹³McAlmon, p. 276.

¹⁴Ibid., pp. 351-2.

¹⁵Baker, p. 111.

¹⁶DIA, p. 3.

¹⁷Baker, p. 134.

¹⁸Ernest Hemingway, In Our Time (New York, 1958), pp. 107, 115, 123, 138, 149-50, 178, hereafter IOT.

¹⁹Poems, fifth and sixth.

"And to the United States." The article, consisting of a series of unrelated paragraphs, refers to the bullfight in three of those paragraphs.²⁰ Hemingway sent three articles, "Bullfighting a Tragedy," "Pamplona in July,"²¹ and "World's Series of Bull Fighting a Mad, Whirling Carnival"²² to the Toronto Star Weekly in October, 1923. By March, 1925, Hemingway had written the short story "The Undefeated."²³ The Sun Also Rises, alluding to bullfighting, was completed on September 21, 1925.²⁴ When Hemingway was preparing Men Without Women for publication in 1927, he eliminated the short story "A Lack of Passion," about bullfighting, from the collection because the story was too long.²⁵ Hemingway's declaration that he was unable to write on the subject for the five years following the first corrida is certainly exaggerated. He was, nevertheless, unable to write a book specifically about bullfighting for the five years following 1925, the year he first proposed a book about the corrida to his future publisher, Maxwell Perkins.²⁶

²⁰Ernest Hemingway, "And to the United States," Transatlantic Review, I (March, 1924), 355-7.

²¹By-Line, pp. 90 and 99.

²²Stephens, p. 243.

²³Baker, p. 143.

²⁴Baker, p. 155.

²⁵Baker, p. 595.

²⁶Baker, p. 144.

After his first glimpse of the bullfights, Hemingway was eager to return to Spain. Because Gertrude Stein had highly praised the Fiesta of San Fermin in Pamplona, Hemingway took his wife, Hadley, to Pamplona in July, 1923. Despite their inability to speak Spanish, the couple found the daily running of the bulls from the hills to the pens in the Plaza de Toros exciting. Both were so impressed with the performance of the matador Nicanor Villalta that the child born to them on October 10, 1923, was named John Hadley Nicanor Hemingway²⁷ in honor of the matador.²⁸ When the first two matadors, Olmos and Maera, were gored in one corrida, the third matador, Algabeno, gracefully killed five bulls.²⁹ Hemingway recaptured this episode in one of the miniatures in In Our Time.³⁰

Early in 1924, Hemingway's cousin Frank Hines visited him in Paris. After a rigorous game of tennis, Hemingway lightheartedly "pretended that his racquet was a bullfighter's cape. He danced in front of trolley cars, executing correct and incorrect passes, and delightedly enraging motorists."³¹

That summer in Pamplona Hemingway engaged in more realistic bullfighting while visiting Pamplona with the Smiths, the Birds,

²⁷Baker, p. 117.

²⁸J. H. Cranston, Ink on My Fingers (Toronto, 1953), p. 108.

²⁹By-Line, p. 108.

³⁰IOT, p. 107.

³¹Baker, p. 128.

John Dos Passos, Robert McAlmon, Don Stewart, George O'Neil and Mrs. Hemingway.³² Don Stewart and Ernest Hemingway joined the amateur bullfights in which the horns of the bull were bandaged to prevent serious injury to the participants. When a bull tossed Stewart into the air, Hemingway jumped to his assistance. Stewart's cornada consisted of a few broken ribs; Hemingway's of a few bruises.³³ This incident is the probable source of two legends: one, that Hemingway rescued John Dos Passos from the horns of the bull,³⁴ and another, that Hemingway and his friends, not proving to be skilled bullfighters, were forced to "run for their lives" out of the arena one day.³⁵

Discussing the Pamplona corrida and its bulls that summer, Hemingway mentions that he had hoped the bullfight would appear as a work of art to some of the people in his cuadrilla. Despite his own enjoyment of the corrida, he laments, "None of them spoke to me after the fight, and two, including one on whom I had hoped to make a good impression, were quite ill."³⁶

³²Baker, p. 129.

³³Leicester Hemingway, My Brother, Ernest Hemingway (New York, 1962), p. 90.

³⁴Young, p. 119.

³⁵[Stanley J. Kunitz], Living Authors: A Book of Biographies, edited by Dilly Tante (New York, 1931), pp. 175-176.

³⁶DIA, p. 154.

as Dorman-Smith, and Mrs. A. B. as Sally Bird.³⁷ Captain D.S., a British soldier, was repulsed by the goring of the horses at his first bullfight, but by his sixth bullfight understood the corrida so well that he quarreled with another spectator about the performance of a matador. After Mrs. A. B.'s first bullfight, she was so "moderately horrified" that she did not attend another.³⁸

The Hemingways returned to Pamplona for the fiesta in July, 1925, this time staying at the hotel of the aficionado Juanito Quintana. A week before the festival, the Hemingways fished at Burguette with Bill Smith and Don Stewart. At Pamplona Harold Loeb joined the party after inviting Lady Duff Twysden, with whom he had had a brief romance, to meet him in Pamplona. Unfortunately for Loeb, Lady Twysden brought another man, Pat Guthrie, with her. Guthrie, displeased by Loeb's presence, asked Loeb to leave the cuadrilla. When Lady Twysden, at Loeb's request, disagreed with Guthrie, Hemingway accused Loeb of using a woman for protection instead of fighting Guthrie himself then and there. This accusation almost caused a fight between Hemingway and Loeb,³⁹ until Hemingway lightly offered to hold Loeb's jacket, containing his glasses, when Loeb expressed a concern that they might

³⁷Baker, p. 584.

³⁸DIA, pp. 496-497.

³⁹Baker, pp. 149-151.

be broken.⁴⁰ Loeb's account of his and Lady Twysden's experiences vaguely echoes Jake Barnes' relationship to Brett Ashley in The Sun Also Rises. How much the novel influenced Loeb's memory of the fiesta or how much the fiesta influenced the novel are questions almost impossible to answer in light of the legends that have grown from both accounts.

At the amateur bullfights that year, Don Stewart was content to remain an observer, while Bill Smith made the crowd chuckle "when one of the bulls butted him in the rear."⁴¹ Loeb's performance, however, was more dramatic. When a bull charged at him instead of at one of the towels he had borrowed from Juanito Quintana's hotel, Loeb turned his back to the bull, and grabbed the horns. After a brief ride around the arena, the bull tossed Loeb into the air, and Loeb landed on his feet. Later in the day Loeb found himself a celebrity in the town. Nino de la Palma, the matador, supposedly remarked to Hemingway that the town was reacting to Loeb as if he had planned the incident. According to Loeb, Hemingway himself did not remain inactive that day, for he tossed a bull to the ground in rodeo fashion in the amateurs.⁴²

In Death in the Afternoon, Hemingway portrays himself as the one who rode on the head of the bull. When the little

⁴⁰Harold Loeb, The Way It Was (New York, 1959), p. 29.

⁴¹Baker, p. 149.

⁴²Loeb, pp. 291-2.

old lady asks him why he never became a matador, he tells her:

Madame, I tried it in its simplest phases but without success. I was too old, too heavy and too awkward. Also my figure was the wrong shape, being thick in all the places where it should be lithe and in the ring I served as little else than target or punching dummy for the bulls.⁴³

He continues to tell her that he was saved from death by the bandages on the bulls' horns, and that the times he did encounter bulls with unbandaged horns, he would grab the bull by its horns and ride on the bull's head until he was thrown.⁴⁴

At the bullfight, Loeb found himself upset by the goading of the horses and disliking the bullfight because he did not care to be reminded of his own death "more than twice a day."⁴⁵ Baker identifies the portrait of Mrs. S. T. in Death in the Afternoon as Lady Duff Twysden, W. G. as Bill Smith, and R. S. as Don Stewart.⁴⁶ Hemingway describes Mrs. S. T. as an "alcoholic nymphomaniac" who was so "excited by bullfighters and general strong emotion that she became a partizan of the spectacle" until she drank herself to oblivion. W. G. was so shocked by the horses that he was "unable to see anything else in the fight." R. S., participating in the amateurs, was a "great crowd pleaser," who had come "to Pamplona two

⁴³DIA, p. 171.

⁴⁴DIA, p. 172.

⁴⁵Loeb, p. 290.

⁴⁶Baker, p. 589.

years." After his marriage, however, R.S. did not attend the corrida, although he often expressed the desire to do so.⁴⁷

The matador Cayento Ordonez (Niño de la Palma) was "sincerity and purity of style itself with the cape" that day.⁴⁸ Hemingway's wife, Hadley, was honored by Ordonez when he gave her the bull's ear that he had won for his performance.⁴⁹ Hemingway used the performance of Ordonez in 1925 in his portrait of Pedro Romero in The Sun Also Rises. He was careful to emphasize, though, that Cayento Ordonez was the prototype only of the actions of Romero in the bull-ring. Indeed, Romero, Hemingway's "brooding, humorless young maestro was little like the Niño of that time."⁵⁰ In Death in the Afternoon Hemingway concluded that after a cornada, the valor of Ordonez was gone and his later performances were only "the brave actions of a coward."⁵¹

Hemingway's depiction of the matador Juan Belmonte in both Death in the Afternoon and The Sun Also Rises was rooted in Hemingway's knowledge of Belmonte's life. Belmonte's "standstill technique"⁵² which allowed him to work in the

⁴⁷DIA, pp. 497-8.

⁴⁸DIA, p. 89.

⁴⁹DIA, p. 270.

⁵⁰Oag, p. 66.

⁵¹DIA, p. 90.

⁵²Juan Belmonte, Killer of Bulls: The Autobiography of a Matador, translated by Leslie Charteris (New York, 1937), p.92.

"terrain of the bull"⁵³ caused bullfighting critics to predict an early death for Belmonte,⁵⁴ who was defying "what they considered to be cosmic laws."⁵⁵ Part of Belmonte's technique was strengthened by the use he made of his short stature and his weakness.⁵⁶ After his first retirement from the ring in 1921,⁵⁷ Belmonte practiced in Mexico and Peru⁵⁸ and returned to Spain in 1925. The public was somewhat hostile to him in 1925, 1926, and 1927 because the people thought that he was exploiting his reputation in order to make money.⁵⁹ Hemingway describes this hostility in The Sun Also Rises when the crowd throws vegetables, bread and cushions at Belmonte in the plaza.⁶⁰ In order to emphasize the talent of Romero,⁶¹ Hemingway pictures Belmonte as choosing small, manageable bulls for his corridas with the assistance of his friend, a bull-breeder.⁶² In Death in the Afternoon Hemingway more impartially explains that Belmonte and his rival Joselito before Joselito's death in 1920 used small bulls with small

⁵⁴SAR, p. 214.

⁵⁵Belmonte, p. 183.

⁵⁶Belmonte, p. 308; DIA, p. 69.

⁵⁷DIA, p. 70.

⁵⁸Belmonte, pp. 295-303.

⁵⁹Belmonte, p. 310.

⁶⁰SAR, p. 214.

⁶¹Stephens, p. 247.

⁶²SAR, p. 215.

horns bred to be fierce in their charges because the two matadors could handle these bulls better than a larger breed of bulls for the spectacles the public demanded.⁶³

Before Hemingway returned to Madrid with Hadley, he sent a note to Harold Loeb apologizing for the remarks that had nearly led to their quarrel. On the train to Madrid, the Hemingways sat near the son of a Tofalla vintner, who offered them and some clergymen near them some samples from his father's vinyard. When Hemingway lost his and Hadley's railroad tickets, two members of the Civil Guard persuaded the conductor to let them stay on the train.⁶⁴ Hemingway told Hotchner a slightly different version of the story. After he had lost the train tickets, he and Hadley hid from the approaching conductor beneath the seats of the clergymen. At Madrid, where they were supposed to present some lost surrender tickets, the members of the Civil Guard, pretending that the Hemingways were prisoners, marched them past the conductor.⁶⁵

Despite his marriage problems the next year, Hemingway planned to go to Madrid for the novilladas in May. He missed the corrida on May 13, 1926, and found the next one canceled because of the physical defects of the bulls. When a snow-storm struck the city, festivities ended, and Hemingway spent

⁶³DIA, pp. 69-70.

⁶⁴Baker, p. 151.

⁶⁵A.E. Hotchner, Papa Hemingway (New York, 1966), pp. 175-176.

that Sunday in his hotel room working on short stories. One of these stories he first called "The Matadors," but later changed to "The Killers."⁶⁶

Pauline Pfeiffer, Hemingway's future wife, and the Murphys, a wealthy American couple,⁶⁷ accompanied the Hemingways to Pamplona that summer. Hemingway used his rhetorical talent to persuade Gerald Murphy to join him in the morning amateurs. At the approach of a bull, Murphy used his raincoat as a cape and prevented the bull from goring him. Hemingway later praised Murphy for his "perfect veronica."⁶⁸ The next summer Hemingway attended the San Fermin festival as in previous years, but this time with Pauline Pfeiffer as his wife.⁶⁹

The summer of 1928 took Hemingway to Kansas City, where Pauline's first child and Hemingway's second son, Patrick, was born. Working on the manuscript of A Farewell to Arms, Hemingway noted that this was the first July since 1923 he had not spent in Pamplona.⁷⁰ In 1929 Hemingway was back in Pamplona, eager to meet the American bullfighter Sidney Franklin. Franklin, who had not heard of Hemingway, ignored Guy Hickock's telegram asking him to meet Hemingway. Lillian Ross in her portrait of Franklin for The New Yorker mentions

⁶⁶Baker, pp. 169-70.

⁶⁷Baker, p. 158.

⁶⁸Baker, p. 172.

⁶⁹Baker, p. 186.

⁷⁰Baker, p. 195.

the discrepancy in the stories of the two men about their first encounter. Hemingway claimed that he first spoke to Franklin over the barrera in Madrid in August, 1929, between Franklin's two bulls at the corrida. The men then arranged to meet later in a cafe. Franklin, however, insisted that he first saw Hemingway in the cafe.⁷¹ Wherever the preliminaries took place, Franklin was gradually impressed by Hemingway. At Hemingway's first offer to get copies of his novels for Franklin to read, the bullfighter candidly expressed a lack of interest in any reading other than bullfighting journals and the Saturday Evening Post. Franklin did allow Hemingway to follow him on the bullfighting tour that fall, however. Hemingway "little by little" "amazed" Franklin with his knowledge of bullfighting.⁷² "He'd tell me things I didn't know myself," Franklin later told Lillian Ross.⁷³ Because of Hemingway's questioning, Franklin revived some ancient passes in the bullring. Since Hemingway understood the emotional temperament of the aficionado, the men arranged a system of signals to use during the corrida so that Hemingway could suggest passes for Franklin to make at the appropriate times to please the crowd. One day the Ambassador invited Franklin and Hemingway to tea. Franklin, having seen Hemingway only in corrida attire after a month of

⁷¹Lillian Ross, "Profiles: El Unico Matador," The New Yorker, XXV (March 26, 1949), 43-44.

⁷²Sidney Franklin, Bullfighter From Brooklyn (New York, 1952), pp. 171-175.

⁷³Ross, The New Yorker, p. 44.

their travels together, nearly refused the invitation because he thought Hemingway did not own clothes appropriate for the occasion. Only then did Franklin learn of Hemingway's fame.⁷⁴ Hemingway later remarked that Franklin had exaggerated their relationship in his interviews with Lillian Ross for her profile of Franklin. This comment, whether true or not, may have been one of Hemingway's half-hearted attempts to dodge publicity. He commented at that time "that he had early taught himself to walk dangerously so that people would leave him alone."⁷⁵

By 1930 Hemingway was working on the manuscript of Death in the Afternoon.⁷⁶ Before the publication of the book, Hemingway had watched the death of 1,500 bulls in the ring.⁷⁷ His article "Bullfighting, Sport and Industry" appeared in the March, 1930, issue of Fortune Magazine. In the article, beautifully illustrated by Goya and other artists, Hemingway explains that horses are used in the bullring to prevent the certain death of men when horses have been historically removed from the ring. He elaborates on the practice (more common before mattresses hid the horses' wounds) of the crowd's being able to request the immediate death of a badly gored horse before the pain from the wound would strike the animal

⁷⁴Franklin, pp. 179-181.

⁷⁵Baker, p. 465.

⁷⁶Baker, p. 214.

⁷⁷Baker, p. 407.

about half an hour after the goring.⁷⁸ From Sidney Franklin Hemingway first learned the words of Ricardi Bombita about the bullfight: "It is not the bull who gores the man but the man who gores himself on the bull by some mistake in technique."⁷⁹

In 1931, Hemingway, still laboring on Death in the Afternoon, decided to spend the summer in Europe at the bullfights. He planned to return to the United States in September before the birth of Pauline's second child in November. The Carlist Rebellion led by Don Jaime briefly threatened to replace the San Fermin festival on the Plaza de Toros in Pamplona, but the rebellion was halted in time for the festival.⁸⁰ Hemingway's oldest son, Bumby (John Hadley Nicanor Hemingway), was with him in Spain that summer.⁸¹ While Hemingway worked on Death in the Afternoon, Sidney Franklin taught Bumby some passes. Franklin was so impressed with the child's progress that he had his own "siik work cape and surge muleta" made "in exact replica to [Bumby's] size, about half the standard dimension."⁸² When Caresse Crosby, an old acquaintance of Hemingway's, met Hemingway and

⁷⁸Ernest Hemingway, "Bullfighting, Sport and Industry," Fortune, I (March, 1930), 140.

⁷⁹Ibid., p. 146.

⁸⁰Baker, pp. 221-225.

⁸¹Baker, p. 224.

⁸²Franklin, p. 205.

Franklin in a cafe that summer, she observed that Bumby was learning to handle a cape, while Hemingway used a chair in the cafe to represent the bull in this practice session. Crosby describes Hemingway as "a difficult taskmaster" who caused his son's face to be "puckered with apprehension." After the lesson, Hemingway told Bumby to do better the next time.⁸³ After a bullfight in which the matador Alcalareno III died "an ugly death" because his small stature "made it impossible for him to succeed as a matador,"⁸⁴ Hemingway, only at Bumby's⁸⁵ urging, told the child that the matador had been gored. When someone else entered the room and told Hemingway that the matador was dead, the child was upset. The next day he told his father that he couldn't stop thinking about how Alcalareno had died because of his size. Regretting what he had done to his child, Hemingway told him, "Don't think about it,"⁸⁶ much as his character George told Nick Adams in "The Killers" not to think about the death of the Swede.⁸⁷

Baker identifies the portrait of J. H. in Death in the Afternoon as Bumby's reaction to his first bullfight.⁸⁸

⁸³Caresse Crosby, The Passionate Years (New York, 1951), p. 284.

⁸⁴DIA, p. 227.

⁸⁵Baker, p. 603.

⁸⁶DIA, pp. 227-228.

⁸⁷Ernest Hemingway, The Short Stories (New York, 1966), p. 289.

⁸⁸Baker, p. 603.

J.H. -- 9 years old; American; male; education, French Lycee; one year kindergarten in U.S. Ridden Horses two years--allowed to go to bull-fights with his father as reward for work in school and because his younger brother having without his parents' intention seen one with no bad results, he felt it unjust that the smaller child should have seen spectacle he was not to have been allowed to attend until twelve years old. Followed action with great interest and without comment. When cushions commenced to be thrown at cowardly matador, whispered, "Can I throw mine, Papa?" Thought blood on horse's right front leg was paint and asked if horses were so painted so bull would charge them. Was greatly impressed by bulls, but thought work matadors did looked easy. Admired vulgar bravery of Saturio Toron. Said Toron was his favorite. The others were all frightened. Held firm belief that no bullfighter no matter what he did was doing his best. Took dislike for Villalta. Said, "I hate Villalta!" first time he had ever employed this word in regard to a human being. . . .Declared he did not believe there were any fighters as good as his friend Sydney. . . .Said he did not like to see the horses injured, but laughed at the time and afterwards only at funny incident in regard to horses. On discovering matadors were killed decided he would rather be a guide in Wyoming or a trapper. Maybe a guide in the summer and a trapper in the winter.⁸⁹

Bumby's dislike of Villalta is ironic, for he was named for Villalta. His belief that the actions of the matadors looked easy appears to contradict the fact that Bumby had been having a difficult time working with the cape (according to Caresse Crosby). His admiration for "Sydney" seems plausible in view of the lesson and small suit of clothes, not to mention the companionship Franklin gave Bumby. The allusion

⁸⁹DIA, p. 495.

to the younger brother who saw the bullfights without his parents' knowledge refers the reader to the preceding sketch of P.H., age four, whose nurse took him to a corrida in Bordeaux. From the beginning, P.H. liked the spectacle, and yelled at spectators to sit down so that he could see the bull. The initials P.H. coincide with those of Bumby's brother, Patrick Hemingway.⁹⁰ The ages of the boys in these sketches indicate that the sketches, if autobiographically true, took place in 1932.

On May 31, 1931, Hemingway watched the matador Gitanillo de Triana get gored by a bull. His pain, which lasted for hours, Hemingway contrasts to the fifteen minute pain of the bull and the immediate death of badly gored horses.⁹¹ The episode thematically parallels the short story "A Natural History of the Dead," included in Death in the Afternoon. In this story soldiers plead with a doctor to give an overdose of morphine to a badly wounded soldier, certain to die.⁹²

Unlike Bumby, Hemingway was not impressed with the matador Satuio Toron in 1931,⁹³ but considered Marcial Lalunda "the master" of fighters at that time.⁹⁴ At Pamplona, Manolo

⁹⁰DIA, p. 495.

⁹¹DIA, pp. 217-220.

⁹²DIA, pp. 141-4.

⁹³DIA, p. 223.

⁹⁴DIA, p. 248.

Bienvenida performed what Hemingway called "his one really great fight" out of fear of what the Pamplona public would do to him if he acted cowardly.⁹⁵ The next summer, in Cuba dreaming of Africa, Hemingway read the final galley proofs for Death in the Afternoon.⁹⁶

The depictions of Villalta and Maera in Death in the Afternoon extend and explain two of Hemingway's sketches in In Our Time. The early sketch shows the death of Maera in the ring,⁹⁷ while Death in the Afternoon celebrates the man's valor, his bravery despite painful wounds, and cites tuberculosis rather than a cornada as the cause of his death.⁹⁸ Villalta, who killed a bull cleanly and artistically in the early sketch,⁹⁹ Hemingway described as "the best killer today"¹⁰⁰ in Death in the Afternoon. After stating that a person's enjoyment of an art increases with his knowledge of that art,¹⁰¹ Hemingway reveals how this process has happened to him as he acquired an appreciation for the uses of the banderillas in the corrida.¹⁰²

⁹⁵DIA, pp.251-2.

⁹⁶Baker, pp. 228-9.

⁹⁷IOT, p. 178.

⁹⁸DIA, pp. 78-82.

⁹⁹IOT, p. 138.

¹⁰⁰DIA, p. 252.

¹⁰¹DIA, p. 10.

¹⁰²DIA, p. 98.

Hemingway did not stop writing or thinking about the bullfight after the publication of Death in the Afternoon. Max Eastman's 1934 scathing review of the book, retitling it "Bull in the Afternoon,"¹⁰³ angered Hemingway so much that the next time he saw Eastman, in Max Perkins' office three years later, Hemingway struck Eastman in the face, and a brief scuffle resulted.¹⁰⁴ When Hemingway watched the lion tamer Clyde Beatty in New York in 1933, Beatty's agility reminded him of that of a matador.¹⁰⁵ That same year Hemingway helped Franklin rewrite his translation into English of the novel about bullfighting, Currito de la Cruz by Alejandro Peres.¹⁰⁶ Hemingway and Franklin considered introducing the bullfight to Cuba in 1935. With a plaza in Madrid for their model, they constructed blueprints for a ring that could hold twenty thousand spectators. Cuban senators warned them, however, that any dissent about bullfighting would prevent a law permitting it in Cuba from being passed. Deciding to let the project simmer for awhile, Hemingway became involved with the Spanish Civil War.¹⁰⁷

¹⁰³Max Eastman, "Bull in the Afternoon," New Republic LXXV (June 7, 1933), 94-97.

¹⁰⁴Baker, p. 317.

¹⁰⁵Baker, p. 306.

¹⁰⁶Baker, pp. 607-8.

¹⁰⁷Franklin, pp. 214-5.

On their way to Spain in 1937, Hemingway and Franklin were delayed in Paris waiting for Franklin's passport. Admiring Franklin's bullfighting equipment, Hemingway pretended to be a bull. As he lunged at Franklin, Franklin made several veronicas until Hemingway was out of breath.¹⁰⁸

After General Franco defeated the Loyalists, with whom Hemingway had sided during the Spanish Civil War, Hemingway was exiled from Spain for nearly a decade. He did not exile Spain or the corrida from his mind during that time. He assisted Lillian Ross, "the person least suited in the world to do an article on bullfighting" (as he told her), with her sketch of Sidney Franklin for the New Yorker.¹⁰⁹ A fable, "The Faithful Bull," appeared in the March, 1951, issue of Holiday magazine. In 1953 Hemingway decided to go to Pamplona despite Franco. Friends in Spain assured him that it would be safe for him to come. He later "boasted that it had required great cojones to reenter Franco's Spain and pretended that he had been in danger of being shot by the border guards."¹¹⁰ When Hemingway and his fourth wife, Mary, arrived in Pamplona, there was no room for them in the inns. They were forced to find rooms in the village of Lecumberri, not far from Pamplona.¹¹¹

¹⁰⁸Baker, pp. 301-302.

¹⁰⁹Lillian Ross, Portrait of Ernest Hemingway (New York, 1961), p. 12.

¹¹⁰Ibid.

¹¹¹Baker, pp. 511-512.

That summer Hemingway first saw Antonio Ordonez, son of Cayento Ordonez (Niño de la Palma), in the ring. At their first meeting, Ordonez asked Hemingway if he were as good as his father. Hemingway told him that he was better.¹¹² As the Hemingways approached their seats in the barrera in Pamplona, Hemingway warned Rupert Bellville, a friend from England, to watch his wallet in the mad, whirling crowd. After the bullfight Hemingway found that his own wallet, one that Mary had given him, had been stolen.¹¹³ In Madrid in September, 1959, Hemingway's pocket was picked again. The New York Times printed his request to the thief to return the wallet, which Patrick Hemingway had given him as a gift, and the St. Christopher medal in the wallet. "As for the 9,000 pesetas (\$150) it contained, your skill deserves that prize as a reward," Hemingway wrote the thief.¹¹⁴ Nearly thirty years earlier Hemingway, referring to two Spanish newspapers, had nostalgically mused that La Libertad was becoming like Le Temps, and one could no longer place a notice in La Libertad and hope that the pickpocket would see the notice because Pamplona had changed and "the Republicans" were "all respectable."¹¹⁵ In 1953 Hemingway found the crowd in Pamplona

¹¹²Ernest Hemingway, "The Dangerous Summer," Life, LXIX (September 5, 1960), 88. hereafter D.S.

¹¹³Mary Hemingway, "Hemingway's Spain," Saturday Review, L (March 11, 1967), 49.

¹¹⁴Hotchner, p.230.

¹¹⁵DIA, p. 278.

remarkably the same as in earlier years, except that "the faces that were young once were as old as his own."¹¹⁶

In 1954 Aaron Hotchner traveled with the Hemingways to Spain. On the way to Madrid, Hemingway shaved off his beard to escape the attention of hero-worshippers. Despite the bad weather, he attended the San Isidro bullfights, although he later remarked "that even bullfighting seemed anticlimactic to a man who had just come out of Africa."¹¹⁷ He was pleased, however, with the skill of the matador Chicuelo II and found Cortega's killing technique skillful. Passing the Madrid slaughterhouse, Hemingway recalled that he had "really learned about killing" there in the days when practice killing was allowed in the slaughterhouses. He reminded Hotchner of an incident in Death in the Afternoon in which a gypsy girl and her brother kill a bull which had gored their brother to death.¹¹⁸

The matador Luis Miguel Dominguin, not in the ring that year because of a cornada in the stomach, invited the Hemingway cuadrilla to a tienta, or a "testing of the calves for bravery" on the ranch of the breeder Antonio Perez. There Hemingway explained to Ava Gardner, a member of the group, that calves could be more challenging than bulls. When a calf decided to charge at Hemingway instead of Dominguin,

¹¹⁶DS, (September 12, 1960), p. 75.

¹¹⁷Baker, pp. 524-525.

¹¹⁸Hotchner, pp. 134-135; DIA, pp. 24-25.

Hemingway, ignoring the screams of his companions telling him to move, grabbed the calf and flung it to the ground. After observing Dominguin at work with several calves, Hemingway compared him to Maera.¹¹⁹

Hemingway's old enthusiasm for the bullfight did not really reawaken until the next year, when Dominguin and the younger Ordonez visited him in Cuba, where he was busily working on Green Hills of Africa. His plans to visit the bullfights at Caracas were halted by his illness.¹²⁰ By 1956, however, Hemingway was back in Spain watching the two matadors in the ring.¹²¹

Hotchner again joined Hemingway for the feria at Zaragoza in 1956. There none of the three matadors, Ordonez, Litri, or Ostos, fought particularly well. When Ostos "brindied" a bull to Hemingway, Hemingway received a standing ovation from the spectators. Ostos, however, had problems killing the bull he had dedicated to Hemingway.¹²¹ In Ketchum, Idaho, in 1958 Hemingway was planning to follow Ordonez through Spain in 1959 and write an "addendum" to Death in the Afternoon.¹²³

¹¹⁹Hotchner, pp. 139-141.

¹²⁰Baker, p. 532.

¹²¹Baker, pp. 535-536.

¹²²Hotchner, pp. 172-174.

¹²³Hotchner, p. 205.

The next year Hemingway watched a young matador named Segura perform brilliantly at the San Isidro festival. When the President of the corrida failed to acknowledge the youth's outstanding performance, Hemingway stood at his seat in the barrera, and waved his handkerchief at the President until the President awarded Segura the ears of the bull. Hemingway followed Ordonez throughout Spain until the end of May. John Crosby, from the New York Herald Tribune,¹²⁴ and Bill Davis traveled with Hemingway. One afternoon Crosby attended a corrida with Hemingway. He overheard a spectator point to Hemingway and whisper to her companion that Hemingway was the American author of Of Mice and Men. Also overhearing the remark, Hemingway told Crosby that the girl "might at least have given him credit for Tortilla Flat."¹²⁵ When an espontaneo (amateur) jumped into the ring illegally and made three passes, Ordonez, despite the difficulty the amateur had created for him in killing the bull, offered to pay the man's fine. Later that day Ordonez was gored in the buttock, but ignored his wound long enough to kill the bull so skillfully that he was awarded both ears and the tail.¹²⁶

Hemingway tended Ordonez during his recovery from the wound, which kept him out of the ring until late June, 1959.

¹²⁴Baker, p. 545.

¹²⁵John Crosby, With Love and Loathing (New York, 1963), p. 13.

¹²⁶John Crosby, pp. 14-15.

By the time of the Pamplona festival, Hemingway had watched over twenty bullfights.¹²⁷ When Juanita Quintana was unable to get a hotel room for the cuadrilla, Hemingway observed that since no one at a fiesta bothered to sleep or change clothes, the rooms were unnecessary. Because of health problems, Hemingway only watched Ordonez and Hotchner run with the bulls that year. However, after Ordonez was gored in the calf stopping a bull from charging a fallen man, Hemingway jumped into the action. Using his jacket as a cape, he made the bull charge into a wooden fence.¹²⁸

At the first competitive mano a mano between Ordonez and Dominguin, Dominguin was wounded. When Ordonez was wounded a few days later, the manos were rescheduled for August 14.¹²⁹ In depicting his own reactions to the wound of Ordonez, Hemingway looked back to Death in the Afternoon. Much like the soldier in "A Natural History of the Dead,"¹³⁰ he asked the doctor to give Ordonez something for the pain. The doctor, however, replied, "He's a matador, Ernesto."¹³¹ As the doctor dressed Antonio's wound, the senior Ordonez entered the room and stood next to Hemingway. Hemingway was

¹²⁷Baker, p. 546.

¹²⁸Hotchner, pp. 212-215.

¹²⁹Hotchner, pp. 220-221.

¹³⁰DJA, p. 141.

¹³¹DS, (September 12, 1960), p. 61.

unaware of his presence until Cayento later told him about it, excusing Hemingway's reaction because "we were both looking at the wound."¹³² A picture in Death in the Afternoon shows a group of men with the dead matador Granero. Hemingway notes that "only two in the crowd are thinking about Granero. The others are all intent on how they will look in the photograph."¹³³ Neither Hemingway nor Cayento Ordonez could think of anything but Antonio's wound. During Antonio's recovery, Hemingway and Hotchner showed him how to play baseball. Hemingway suggested that Antonio in turn teach Hotchner how to bullfight. Hotchner thought that the incident was a joke until August 17, when he found himself disguised as a sobresalienta, who was to kill the bulls if the other matadors failed. The illegal masquerade ended safely and successfully.¹³⁴ The mano a mano, which Hemingway had arranged to write in a series for Life magazine, ended when Dominguin was seriously injured in Bilbao. Ordonez continued his career that year despite a slight wound and a dispute with the officials¹³⁵ over his use of suspended picadors.¹³⁶

¹³²DS, (September 12, 1960), p. 65.

¹³³DIA, p. 368.

¹³⁴Hotchner, pp. 222-224.

¹³⁵Baker, p. 549.

¹³⁶Hotchner, p. 231.

Hemingway shrugged off the scandalous incident as one which "was not true disaster because it involved only money."¹³⁷

Hemingway found it difficult to fulfill his contract for Life. Working on the article during the first half of 1960, he wrote 120,000 words when only 10,000 were necessary in the contract. He was displeased with his picture on the cover of the first installment and worried that he had not given sufficient credit to Dominguin.¹³⁸ Although the bullfighting critic Jose Maria de Cossio agreed with many of Hemingway's opinions of Ordonez,¹³⁹ other Spanish critics did feel that The Dangerous Summer denied credit to Dominguin. One critic, Gregorio Corrochano, in a preface to Cuando Suena el Clarion scathingly attacked The Dangerous Summer.¹⁴⁰ Despite its faults, The Dangerous Summer represents Hemingway's attempt to "return to the Spain of Death in the Afternoon and The Sun Also Rises."¹⁴¹

Several people who sat near Hemingway at the bullfights in the 1950's have written accounts of his reactions. Rex

¹³⁷DS, (September 19, 1960), p. 95.

¹³⁸Baker, pp. 552-554.

¹³⁹Oag, pp. 14-15.

¹⁴⁰Oag, p. 158.

¹⁴¹Stephens, p. 37.

Smith, who lived in Spain for a time, maintains that he often was only a few seats away from Hemingway at the corrida.

According to Smith, Hemingway

really felt cheated if a bullfighter did not have a few spangles torn off his jacket and a blood smear or two from the bull. He had his favorites and nobody was going to show him any different. . . , Hemingway's attitude was that a poem is what he paid for and nobody was going to show him any different.¹⁴²

Robert Ruark noted swarms of autograph hunters around Hemingway at a Pamplona fiesta, during which Ordonez performed. Jesus Cordoba that day dedicated a bull to Hemingway, but was clumsy in his execution. Holding Cordoba's hat and cape on his lap, Hemingway remarked sadly that the only thing he could do for Cordoba after that performance was to avoid spilling wine on the cape.¹⁴³

During the Dominguin-Ordonez rivalry, Eric Sevareid accompanied Ernest and Mary Hemingway to the corrida. Autograph hunters again plagued Hemingway in his front row seat, where, wearing a baseball cap, he "rested his beard on a rail."¹⁴⁴ Again the matadors dedicated bulls to him. Sevareid observed Hemingway demonstrate his temper, notably when those who knew nothing about bullfighting made ignorant comments

¹⁴²Rex Smith, (editor), Biography of the Bulls: An Anthology of Spanish Bullfighting (New York, 1952), 96.

¹⁴³Robert Ruark, "Papa Goes to the Fights," from Biography of the Bulls, p. 369.

¹⁴⁴Eric Sevareid, "Mano a Mano," Esquire, LII (November, 1959), p. 42.

that Hemingway overheard. When Kenneth Tynan, a theatre critic, shouted that a matador who had missed a sword thrust was only four inches off, "the reaction from Hemingway was confused by some with the dying bellow of the bull." Severeid says that Hemingway later apologized to Tynan,¹⁴⁵ but Hotchner declares that Tynan lost Hemingway's friendship in their disagreement over "whether the matador James Ostos had killed well that afternoon." Hotchner continues to state that Peter Buckley similarly lost Hemingway's friendship for interviewing Antonio Ordonez just before a bullfight.¹⁴⁶

A man who looked somewhat like the bearded Papa Hemingway often confused autograph hunters in Hemingway's later years. His name was Kenneth H. Vanderford, and he, like Hemingway, was an ardent American aficionado.¹⁴⁷ And the legends live on.

In The Dangerous Summer, Hemingway describes the pride of Antonio Ordonez in his two distinct personalities: the man and the torero.¹⁴⁸ Certainly Hemingway himself had at least two faces: the man and the writer. What the writer says the man has done is not always biographically true. The experiences of the man sometimes recur with certain artistic

¹⁴⁵Ibid.

¹⁴⁶Hotchner, pp. 119-120.

¹⁴⁷Robert Daley, The Swords of Spain (New York, 1966), p. 132.

¹⁴⁸DS, (September 19, 1960), p. 78.

changes in the work of the writer. Somewhere the figure of the man merges with that of the writer. Both created and extended a third facet of Hemingway's personality: the legend.

CHAPTER II

THE MAJOR NON-FICTION

When Juanito Montoya introduced Jake Barnes to Spaniards visiting the Pamplona fiesta, at first the Spanish aficionados were amused at Jake's interest in the bullfight because he was an American, and "somehow it was taken for granted that an American could not have afición."¹ The amusement of the Spaniards turned to amazement when they perceived the sincerity and depth of Jake's afición. Hemingway discusses the differences among the Spanish, French, British and American temperaments several times in Death in the Afternoon.² In one place he declares that "the English and the French live for life,"³ while the Spaniard lives with the realization that he will die. Hemingway describes elsewhere the Anglo-American's emphasis on victory in sports and his resulting replacement of "the avoidance of death by the avoidance of defeat." Hemingway further insists that "it takes much more cojones to be a sportsman when death is a closer party to the game." (DIA, p. 22)

Despite Hemingway's distinction of these basic differences in cultural values, American critics "have seldom been willing

¹Ernest Hemingway, The Sun Also Rises (New York, 1954) p. 132, hereafter cited as SAR in parentheses within the text.

²Robert Stephens, Hemingway's Non-Fiction (Chapel Hill, 1968), pp. 78-79.

³Ernest Hemingway, Death in the Afternoon (New York, 1932), p. 265, hereafter cited as DIA in parentheses within the text.

to accept the book on its own terms."⁴ Several American critics have judged Death in the Afternoon on the basis of American attitudes toward the bullfight rather than in terms of the content of the book. Max Eastman, for example, felt that Death in the Afternoon revealed Hemingway's "enthusiasm for killing--for courage and dominating and killing." He continued his review by admitting that the survival of the human race once hinged on man's victory over the animals, but claimed that those primitive days were over--except in Hemingway's works.⁵

Like Max Eastman, Granville Hicks failed to judge Death in the Afternoon on its own terms. Although he declared that the book contained "considerable humor" and a respect for bullfighting and writing, Hicks believed that people were buying the book only for Hemingway's name on the cover.⁶ Harry Levin did observe that the values in Death in the Afternoon "differ" from his own "assumptions," but accused Hemingway of writing the book "from the American zest of the fan who pays his money to reckon the carnage."⁷ Those critics willing to examine the book on its own rather than their own standards have observed

⁴Keneth Kinamon, "Hemingway, the Corrida and Spain, Texas Studies in Language and Literature, I (1959), 52.

⁵Max Eastman, "Bull in the Afternoon," New Republic, LXXV (1933), 96-97.

⁶Granville Hicks, "Bulls and Bottles," The Nation, CXXV (November 9, 1932), 461.

⁷Harry Levin, "Observations on the Style of Ernest Hemingway," Kenyon Review, XIII (1951), 606.

that Death in the Afternoon is "as much about aesthetics, art and writing as . . . about killing bulls."⁸ These more objective critics have recognized the bullfight as Hemingway's attempt to blend the "physical-aesthetic-ethical"⁹ into a unified vision of life.

At the center of Hemingway's ethics and aesthetics is the problem of honest perception,¹⁰ that is, realistically looking "at the world as it is."¹¹ Throughout Death in the Afternoon Hemingway alludes often to seeing the world "clear and as a whole." (DIA, p. 278) Blending the physical and the aesthetic, Hemingway compares the human eye to "a good healthy instrument," which will give an individual pleasure until his death, provided that he can "avoid going blind." (DIA, pp.10-11) "Blind folly" can discredit the bullfighter's performance and even cause his death in the ring. (DIA, p. 21) A person attending the bullfight honestly will find that "the meaning and end of the whole thing" is greater than the sum of its parts. Hemingway defines the aficionado as "one who has this sense of tragedy and ritual of the fight so that the

⁸Jackson Benson, Hemingway: The Writer's Art of Self-Defense (Minneapolis, 1969), p. 186.

⁹John Reardon, "Hemingway's Esthetic and Ethical Sportsmen," University Review, XXXIV (Autumn, 1967), 23.

¹⁰Benson, p. 22.

¹¹Martin Staples Shockey, "Hemingway's Moment of Truth," Colorado Quarterly, V (Spring, 1957), 381.

minor aspects are not important except as they relate to the whole." (DIA, p. 8-9) He advises the person attending a bullfight for the first time to sit in the higher seats, away from the ring in order to "see the entire spectacle" instead of the separate activities in the bullfight. (DIA, p. 15) Bullfighting experts too sit "high enough up so they can see everything that happens in any part of the ring in order to be able to judge it as a whole." (DIA, p. 32) Reading about violent death, Hemingway found the accounts of many authors "a blur" because "either the author had never seen it clearly or at the moment of it, he had physically or mentally shut his eyes." Hemingway adds that "if these very simple things were to be made permanent," the writer could not write "with any shutting of the eyes." (DIA, p. 2-3)

When Hemingway first introduces the Old Lady to the book, she agrees to accompany him to any cafe, "provided it is clean and wholesome." Hemingway assures her that "there is no wholesomer place on the peninsula." (DIA, p. 64) Hemingway correlates honest perception and wholeness when he posits that "the whole end of the bullfight was the final sword thrust, the actual encounter between the man and the animal, what the Spanish call the moment of truth, and every move in the fight was to prepare the bull for that killing." (DIA, p. 68) Carlos Baker calls Hemingway's quest for clear vision "the discipline of double perception," which actually means a unity

of vision between his inward emotion related to the outer world and the outer events producing that emotion.¹² Hemingway explains this perceptual and artistic problem as first, "knowing truly what you really felt rather than what you were supposed to feel," and then recording "the actual things. . . which produced the emotion." (DIA, p. 2) Only by freeing themselves from preconceptions and assumptions¹³ can the spectators at a bullfight experience their real feelings. Moral preconceptions, however, will make the spectator dislike the bullfight no matter how artistic the performance is. (DIA, p. 10) According to the critic Jackson Benson, an individual's clear vision of himself and his environment "is the basic requirement. . . for genuine concern. . . for others."¹⁴

In his efforts to see the world clearly and completely, Hemingway went to the bullfight, "the only place where you could see life and death, i.e., violent death now that the wars were over." (DIA, p. 2) The bullfight became an emblem to him of the "totality of the life and death principle."¹⁵ To Hemingway, life and death were inter-related rather than separate entities, and his efforts to perceive life clearly

¹²Carlos Baker, Hemingway: The Writer As Artist (New York, 1955), p. 54; hereafter cited as Baker, Writer.

¹³Ibid.

¹⁴Benson, p. 118.

¹⁵Joseph DeFalco, The Hero in Hemingway's Short Stories (Pittsburgh, 1963), p. 198.

and wholly made it impossible for him to ignore death as a part of life.¹⁶ The critic Robert Penn Warren equates Hemingway's concept of death with his concept of nada, and insists that "the typical Hemingway hero is the man aware, or in the process of becoming aware, of nada."¹⁷ Warren explains violence in Hemingway's works as man's confrontation with nothingness, which will annihilate existence at death.¹⁸ Critical of the mysticism of Waldo Frank's Virgin Spain, Hemingway was probably aware of the statement Frank made about the Spanish bullfight: "For although everything is in the bull ring, and although anything may happen, nothing happens."¹⁹

Hemingway uses the same ironic understatement implicit in the word "nothing" several times in Death in the Afternoon. After citing a brief conversation between a picador and a banderillo before a bullfight, Hemingway notes, "There is nothing more to be said." (DIA, p. 57) After discussing how "if two people love each other, there can be no happy end to it," Hemingway finds himself confronted with the Old Lady's question about what his digression about love has "to do with the bulls." He replies ironically, "Nothing, Madame, nothing at all, it is only conversation to give you your money's worth." (DIA, p. 122) In "A Natural History of the Dead," a lieutenant quarrels with a doctor about the inattention of

¹⁶Baker, Writer, p. 160.

¹⁷Robert Penn Warren, "Novelist--Philosopher, Ernest Hemingway," Horizon XV (1947), 161.

¹⁸Ibid., 162.

¹⁹Waldo Frank, Virgin Spain (New York 1926) - 226-227

of the doctor to the dying soldier. When a messenger disrupts the argument with the news of the soldier's death, the doctor informs the lieutenant that theirs had been "a dispute about nothing." (DIA, p. 144)

By facing death and nothingness, man learns the value of living.²⁰ Jake Barnes consoles Robert Cohn with the phrase, "Nobody ever lives their life all the way up except bullfighters."²¹ In his repeated encounters with death, the bullfighter learns how to control his danger of death in the bullring.²² The bullfighter Manuel Garcia Maera had learned control of the bull so well that he died of tuberculosis complicated with pneumonia, although Hemingway thought that Maera "had hoped for death in the ring but would not cheat by looking for it." Even in the hospital with the illness, Maera "fought with death." (DIA, p. 82)

The critic Melvin Backman identifies two motifs in Hemingway's works: the matador and the crucified. He defines the matador as the one who administers death and the crucified as the character who receives pain courageously, "even unto death."²³ His distinction of the two motifs separates too diametrically the concepts, which are actually part of the

²⁰Lincoln Kirstein, "The Canon of Death," Hound and Horn, VI (March, 1933), 341.

²¹SAR, p. 10.

²²Frederick Hoffman, "No Beginning and No End: Hemingway and Death," Essays in Criticism, III (January, 1953), 80.

²³Melvin Backman, "Hemingway: The Matador and the Crucified," Modern Fiction Studies, I (August, 1955), 2.

same whole, for the death the matador faces is double-edged like his sword. Along with his attempt to administer death to the bull, the matador also risks his own death in the ring.²⁴ Hemingway maintains that the matador, after killing the bull, creates

the feeling of rebellion against death which comes from its administering. Once you accept the rule of death thou shalt not kill is an easily and a naturally obeyed commandment. But when a man is still in rebellion against death he has pleasure in taking to himself one of the Godlike attributes: that of giving it. This is one of the most profound feelings in these men who enjoy killing. These things are done in pride and pride, of course, is a Christian sin, and a pagan virtue. But it is pride which makes the bullfight and true enjoyment of killing which makes the great matador. (DIA, p. 235)

Like the Romantic hero, the matador attempts to deify himself.²⁵ Hemingway describes the artistic faena as

the faena that takes a man out of himself and makes him feel immortal while it is proceeding, that gives him an ecstasy, that is, while momentary, as profound as any religious ecstasy, moving all the people in the ring together and increasing in emotional intensity as it proceeds, carrying the bullfighter with it, he playing on the crowd through the bull and being moved as it responds in a growing ecstasy of ordered, formal, passionate, increasing disregard for death that leaves you, when it is over, and the death administered to the animal that has made it possible, as empty, as changed and as sad as any major emotion will leave you. (DIA, p. 206-207)

²⁴Joseph Waldmeir, "Confitero Hominem: Ernest Hemingway's Religion of Man," PMASAL, XLIII (1956), 280.

²⁵Richard K. Peterson, Hemingway: Direct and Oblique (Paris, 1969), p. 55.

The death of the bull elevates both matador and audience to the level of gods by symbolically destroying the irrational, animalistic impulses within them.²⁶ At the moment of truth, the literal death of the bull and the symbolic death of the matador become stepping stones to a more intense comprehension of life for the matador.²⁷

W.M. Frohock declares that in Hemingway's system of values, the bulls "are almost superior to the men who kill them."²⁸ Max Geismar insists that Hemingway makes the bull and the man "equally important."²⁹ Early in Death in the Afternoon, however, Hemingway distinguishes the people who "identify" with animals from those who identify with people. The persons identifying with people can "be capable of great affect-on for an individual animal, a dog, a cat, or a horse for instance. But they will base this affection on some quality of, or some association with, this individual animal rather than on the fact that it is an animal and hence worthy of love." Hemingway cites his admiration for a few horses in the steeplechase races, but speculates that the money he had bet on those

²⁶Ibid., p. 38.

²⁷Shockley, p. 387.

²⁸W. M. Frohock, The Novel of Violence in America (Dallas, 1950), 187.

²⁹Max Geismar, "No Man Alone Now," Virginia Quarterly Review, XVII (1941), 521.

horses might have influenced his attitude toward them. (DIA, p. 5) At least on a literal level, then, Hemingway considers the bulls subordinate to man.

During a bullfight, however, the bull takes on a symbolic meaning. The bull literally possesses the capacity to kill the man. Pedro Romero tells Lady Brett Ashley in The Sun Also Rises that the bulls are his "best friends." When she asks him why he kills his best friends, he replies, "So they don't kill me."³⁰ Romero does judge each bull on an individual basis, however. When he had to fight a bull which had impaired vision, one of his sword-handlers remarked afterwards that the bull had been "a bad one." Romero affirmed that the bull had made him sweat.³¹ In Death in the Afternoon Hemingway claims that once he realized that the bullfight was a work of art, he was still able to admire the bull, but "felt no more sympathy for him than for a canvas or the marble a sculpture cuts or the dry powder snow your skiis cut through." (DIA, p. 99) The bull, then, also represents the materials out of which man can mould a work of art.

Richard Floor discusses Hemingway's determinism as related to the bull ring. Floor likens the bull in the arena to

³⁰SAR, p. 186.

³¹SAR, p. 219.

the forces man encounters in life. These "inexorable laws of time and circumstances" "condemn" man "finally to a lack of real achievement" in a world meaningless except for the meaning that each person creates for himself. Unlike the traditional determinist, however, Hemingway does not advise his fellow mortals to accept their destinies, to struggle blindly and futilely against fate, or to ignore the limitations external circumstances place on them. Instead, Hemingway judges others "by how much they wring from the slender piece of life they are given--by how much personal meaning they can thrust up against the meaninglessness of the world." Floor concludes that Hemingway's determinism in this way is a philosophy of affirmation and not despair.³²

Hemingway does allude to the forces of heredity and environment in Death in the Afternoon. The aspiring matador must undergo a strenuous training period³³ to develop his natural ability or "genius, which must be there to start with. . . ." (DIA, p. 88) Like the matador, the writer must possess a natural talent, although he is not "born with knowledge," but with an ability to learn "in a quicker ratio to the passage of time than other men." (DIA, p. 191) Hemingway also carefully defines the Spanish word suerte,

³²Richard L. Floor, "Fate and Life: Determinism in Ernest Hemingway," Renascence, XV (Fall, 1962), 23.

³³Reardon, p. 15.

which refers to the three acts of the bullfight. The meanings of the word connote the concept of determinism. Suerte can mean "chance, hazard, lots, fortune, luck, good luck, hap-hazard; state, condition, fate, doom, destiny, kind, sort; species, manner, mode, way, skillful maneuver; trick, feat, juggle, and piece of ground separated by landmark." (DIA, p. 96) The bullfight itself represents the forces which existence places on man.

Permeating Death in the Afternoon are images of physical illness and decay. The bullfight offers Hemingway an opportunity to view objectively violent death, uncomplicated by disease (DIA, p. 2), although some people at the bullfight become physically ill watching the goring of the horse. (DIA, p. 4) Discussing wine drinking as a civilized source of enjoyment, Hemingway asserts that despite the weakened liver and kidneys which excessive drinking may cause, he prefers acquiring a taste for wine over having "the corrugated iron internals" of his "boyhood." He explains that the body is going to wear out no matter what a man does, "but there seems to be much luck in all these things and no man can avoid death by honest effort nor say what use any part of his body will bear until he tries it." (DIA, p. 11) Despite this suggestion to others to taste wine, Hemingway does not urge drunkenness. In a passage in the manuscript of Death in the Afternoon, examined by the writer of this thesis at the Academic Center

at the University of Texas at Austin, Hemingway says that at the Pamplona fiestas, he was never able to participate until sunrise in the drinking rounds which took place from sundown to sunrise.

Hemingway uses other references to sickness and medicine in Death in the Afternoon. He attributes the death of the French writer, Raymond Radiguet, to typhoid fever (DIA, p. 72) and that of Manuel Garcia Maera to pneumonia. (DIA, p. 82) When Maera had first begun his career as a banderillo for Juan Belmonte, Belmonte used Maera as "an antidote" to his rival Joselito, making it appear that the "peon" banderillo of Belmonte was as skilled as the great Joselito. (DIA, p. 78) After Hemingway casually remarks that many bullfighters "are wracked with disease," the Old Lady naively asks him if mumps is among their sicknesses. Hemingway replies succinctly that mumps is infrequent among them (DIA, p. 93-94) and continues his discussion of the professional diseases of bullfighting a chapter later. Tuberculosis from the extreme heat and cold a matador is forced to endure in the mountainous climate of Spain (DIA, p. 101) and venereal disease from the tradition demanding the matador "to have many affairs" (DIA, p. 103) are two risks inherent in the profession. When the Old Lady asks Hemingway if there is a "remedy" for these illnesses,

Hemingway responds:

Madame, there is no remedy for anything in life. Death is a sovereign remedy for all misfortunes and we'd do best to leave off all discoursing now and get to the table.--Within our time the scientists may well abolish these old diseases and we'll live to see the end of all mortality. But meantime I would rather dine on suckling pig at Botin's than sit here and think of casualties my friends have suffered. (DIA, p. 104)

Disease and death are inherent in life itself. Man cannot control his ultimate destiny, but can experience his temporal existence to the utmost. Hemingway affirms that the bullfighter "is expected to do the best he can with the given bull." (DIA, p. 91)

Hemingway connects decay (DIA, p. 66) and decadence with the bullfight, although he warns the Old Lady of the multiple connotations of the word "decadence." (DIA, p. 72) The "malady of specialization" (DIA, p. 85) emphasizing cape work instead of the moment of truth, and the introduction of smaller, less ferocious bulls to the ring made bullfighting "a decadent art," which nevertheless "reached its fullest flower at its rottenest point." (DIA, p. 68) Hemingway calls the bull "the part of the fiesta that controls its health or its sickness." By demanding strong, fierce, large bulls, the public can control the suertes to some extent. (DIA, p. 164) The bull, then, symbolizes literal and symbolic death and deterministic forces beyond the individual's total control in life. The bull is also the raw material for a work of art.

Max Geismar defines Death in the Afternoon as a book dealing with spiritual as well as physical death.³⁴ After facing the reality of the nada (death, non-being), Hemingway advocates a courage of doing (action) to prevent this non-being from overpowering man during his life.³⁵ For Hemingway, who has rejected traditional values, action becomes the foundation of a new morality.³⁶ Experience serves as the pragmatic test of morality for Hemingway,³⁷ who meditates: "So far, about morals, I know only that what is moral is what you feel good after and what is immoral is what you feel bad after. . . ." (DIA, p. 4) Morality cannot exist without action. The individual learns "to appreciate values through experience" (DIA, p.12) To fail to act is to yield to nothingness, to a spiritual death-in-life.

To act, however, means to risk the possibility of being wounded.³⁸ Hemingway informs the reader, "You cannot have a great bullfighter that is not gored sooner or later. . . ." (DIA, p. 199) Although the wound is inevitable to one who decides to spend his life living, "until a matador has undergone his first severe wound you cannot tell what his permanent

³⁴Geismar, p. 522.

³⁵Nancy Hale, "Hemingway and the Courage to Be," Virginia Quarterly Review, XXXVIII (Autumn, 1962), 635.

³⁶John Colvert, "Ernest Hemingway's Morality in Action," American Literature, XXVII (November, 1955), 376.

³⁷Baker, Writer, p. 156.

³⁸DeFalco, p. 196.

value will be." (DIA, p. 166) Only through a painful initiation into experience can a character find a "permeating wisdom"³⁹ in life.

The character nonetheless must continually test his morality by risking future wounds.⁴⁰ The individual, "responsible to himself alone,"⁴¹ is the source of all morality. Explaining the term "decadence" to the Old Lady, Hemingway states that critics apply the word to "anything they do not understand or which seems to differ from their moral concepts." (DIA, p. 71) He also notes that the decadent bullfight of his day needed "a god to drive the half-gods out," (DIA, p. 96) and that Manuel Mejias Bienvenida appeared to be the Messiah in 1930, but by 1931, Domingo Lopez Ortega replaced him on the stage. (DIA, p. 167-168) Always fusing ethics and aesthetics throughout Death in the Afternoon,⁴² Hemingway observes that morality had undergone a "change in fashion" (DIA, p. 102) in the twentieth century. Like Nicanor Villalta and Niño de la Palma, the individual does not have to succumb to this decadence in his own life. (DIA., p 85) Through self-discipline these isolated individuals can create an order of their own

³⁹Reardon, p. 22.

⁴⁰Ibid., p. 20.

⁴¹C. S. Stavran, "Nada, Religion, and Hemingway, Topic, VI (Fall, 1966), 19.

⁴²Benson, p. 77.

within the chaos of their existence.⁴³ Defeated only within their own standards, these resolute individuals are not destroyed even when circumstances defeat them,⁴⁴ for they never betray the self-integrity central to their psychological existence. For example, although Manuel Garcia Maera's cuadrilla urged him to retreat to the infirmary when he dislocated his wrist in the bull ring, Maera insisted on killing the bull. Moreover, he killed the bull between its shoulders, "going in as a man should, over the horn, following the sword with his body," (DIA, p. 81) when he could have used quicker, but less honorable techniques and still retained the respect of his cuadrilla.

Like Maera, Pedro Romero also performed according to his self-imposed standards. Maneuvering the bull to locations in the ring where Brett could watch the details, Romero, "because he did not look up to ask if it pleased. . . did it all for himself inside, and it strengthened him, and yet he did it for her, too. But he did not do it for her at any loss to himself. He gained by it all through the afternoon."⁴⁵ Thus self-discipline allows a man to affirm his humanity to himself.⁴⁶

⁴³Malcolm M. Marsden, "Hemingway's Symbolic Pattern: The Basis of Tone," Discourse, XII (Winter, 1969), 27.

⁴⁴Warren, p. 2.

⁴⁵SAR, p. 216.

⁴⁶Robert P. Weeks, "Hemingway and the Uses of Isolation," University Review, XXIV (Winter, 1957), 125.

Integrity, courage, manliness, and honor are interwoven qualities, not separate virtues. The Spanish term pundador means "honor, probity, courage, self-respect and pride in one word." (DIA, p. 91) Spanish folklore holds that "human courage resides in the cojones,"⁴⁷ which Hemingway defines as "testicles; a valorous bullfighter is said to be plentifully equipped with these. In a cowardly bullfighter they are said to be absent." (DIA, p. 428) The critic Ray B. West speculates that an excess of the courage Hemingway admires could become hubris, a proud foolhardiness which Aristotle would have labelled a tragic flaw.⁴⁸ Indeed, Hemingway explicitly remarks that "too much honor destroys a man quicker than too much of any other fine quality and with a little bad luck it ruined Zurito in one season." (DIA, p. 258) The individual must continually test his courage as well as his morality. Hemingway observes that "courage comes such a short distance; from the heart to the head; but when it goes no one knows how far away it goes; in a hemorrhage, perhaps, or into a woman and it is a bad thing to be in bullfighting business when it is gone, no matter where it went." (DIA, p. 222) While one experience can cause a man to lose his courage, future events in his life can bring it back.

⁴⁷Kinnamon, p. 55.

⁴⁸Ray B. West, "Ernest Hemingway: Death in the Evening," The Antioch Review, IV (December, 1944), 574.

The matador cannot attain courage ultimately and eternally, but must continue to prove its existence in every new situation of pressure he encounters. Related to and determining a man's courage, then, is his skill.⁴⁹ Valor alone does not suffice. Although Luis Freg possessed an "indestructible" valor, Hemingway observed, "he has no art." (DIA, p. 262) Elsewhere Hemingway posits that "the matador must dominate the bull by knowledge and science." (DIA, p. 21) Slight technical errors can send the matador to the infirmary or to his own death. (DIA, p. 19) The torero's control must be both inward and outward. While controlling the bull, he must also refuse "to let his nerves master him." (DIA, p. 75) The personal virtues of honesty, integrity, courage and skill are vital to the matador's survival. Expanding outward from these personal qualities are the social qualities of sincerity, loyalty, stoicism, and compassion.⁵⁰ Hemingway shows no admiration for the insincere killers, Marcial Lalanda, Vicente Barrera, or Manolo Bienvenida, who trickily follow the letter but not the spirit of the bullfighting law when their secure half estocades kill the bull but do not culminate in a moment of truth. (DIA, p. 247-249). A picture of the dead matador

⁴⁹Shockley, p. 381.

⁵⁰Shockley, pp.381-383.

Granero contains only two men who "are thinking about Granero," (DIA, p. 368) Their loyalty poses a strong contrast to the fickleness of the others in the picture. Manuel Garcia Maera reveals his stoicism when despite his dislocated wrist, he kills the bull gracefully, refusing to go to the infirmary at the suggestion of his sword-handler. Hemingway observes that Maera "wasn't thinking about his wrist at all. He was thinking about the bull." (DIA, p. 82) The story "A Natural History of the Dead" in Death in the Afternoon contrasts the compassion of the lieutenant for a dying soldier with the callousness of the doctor to the condition of the dying man. (DIA, p. 141-144).

The bullfight provides Hemingway with a foundation for his views of aesthetics as well as ethics. A few images in the book evidence Hemingway's association of writing with bullfighting. First, Hemingway went to the bullfight because he "was trying to learn to write, commencing with the simplest things, and one of the simplest things of all and the most fundamental is violent death," (DIA, p. 2) which he could observe only in the bullring since the termination of the war. In a conversation with the Old Lady, Hemingway compares words to a sword, declaring, "Madame, all our words from loose using have lost their edge." (DIA, p. 58) Hemingway further mentions that a matador can always find something to do in a dangerous situation "if he keeps his nerve," although he may "sweat ink" at the time. (DIA, p. 57)

The great artist learns everything that has ever been discovered about his art, and "goes beyond what has been done or known and makes something of his own." (DIA, p. 100) "All art is only done by the individual." (DIA, p. 99) After accumulating the knowledge he has experienced, (DIA, p. 191) the artist must become objective, removing himself from his own ego.⁵¹ "From living every day with death," the matador achieves this objectivity, "the measure of his detachment" becoming "the measure of his imagination." (DIA, p.56)

That Hemingway himself strove for objectivity is evidenced by a few discrepancies between the manuscript of Death in the Afternoon at the University of Texas and the published volume. As observed by the writer of this thesis, the manuscript contains no date and possibly contains portions written sometime between 1923 and 1925. On the back of one of the manuscript pages are a few typed sentences from the short story "Mr. and Mrs. Eliot," first written as "Mr. and Mrs. Smith" in February, 1923. By 1925 the story was included in the book In Our Time with the title "Mr. and Mrs. Eliot."⁵² The sentences on the manuscript are from the later version of the story. At any rate, Hemingway began serious work on the book in 1929, the year after his father's suicide.⁵³ Describing

⁵¹Green Wyrick, "Hemingway and Bergson, The Elan Vital," Modern Fiction Studies, I (August, 1955), 19.

⁵²Carlos Baker, Ernest Hemingway: A Life Story (New York, 1969), pp. 132 and 140; hereafter cited as Baker, Biography.

⁵³Ibid., p. 199.

his desire to study violent death, Hemingway elucidates that violent death in the bullring is simple, unlike natural death, which can become complicated, especially if the death is "of a friend or someone you have loved or have hated." (DIA, p.2) In the manuscript Hemingway uses the death of a father as an example of a complicated death. He possibly wrote this paragraph during his father's life, and decided after his father's death that the example was too grimly ironic or personally revealing to publish.

That his father's death was on his mind is further evidenced by another paragraph, this time a paragraph in the printed volume and not in the manuscript. Concluding a depiction of the cowardice of Hernandorena, Hemingway notes that "the crowd had no more sympathy for him than for a suicide." The new paragraph begins: "For myself, not being a bullfighter and being much interested in suicides, the problem was one of depiction. . . ." (DIA, p.20)

Elsewhere in Death in the Afternoon Hemingway refers to suicides, this time in a dialogue with the Old Lady: "There is no lonelier man in death, except the suicide, than that man who has lived many years with a good wife and then outlived her." (DIA, p. 122) Because Hemingway did not introduce the Old Lady to the book until 1930,⁵⁴ the comment again

⁵⁴Baker, Biography, p. 214.

shows Hemingway's concern about his father's death without a direct reference to the event. Direct allusions to it would have contradicted Hemingway's concept of artistic detachment. Further, the indirect references may have been Hemingway's attempts to gain a more objective view of the event, which undoubtedly upset him.

Another example of Hemingway's belief in objectivity occurs after he has described different reactions of people to the goring of the horses in the ring. He insists that he is including the depictions "not because of a desire of the author to write about himself and his own reactions, considering them as important and taking delight in them because they are his, but rather to establish the fact that the reactions were instant and unexpected." (DIA, p. 8)

The bullfight serves as a focal point for Hemingway's comments about tragedy and comedy. He defines the bullfight as a tragedy, distinguishing it from the Anglo-Saxon concept of a sport, which involves "an equal contest" between two opponents. The bullfight rather poses "danger for the man but certain death for the animal." (DIA, p. 16) The three act tragedy climaxed by the death of the bull in the third act (DIA, p. 96-97) moves "all the people in the ring together" with a feeling "as profound as any religious ecstasy."

(DIA, p. 206-207) This feeling of immortality between the torero and the spectator results in a tragic catharsis,⁵⁵ a feeling Aristotle would term "pity and fear," which effects a symbolic purging in the participants.⁵⁶

In Hemingway's concept of tragedy, the matador experiences this cleansing through the death of the bull and renews his life through this symbolic death.⁵⁷

The gorings of the horses, which Hemingway calls "parodies," compose a "comic element" which may horrify or disgust the spectator at a bullfight. The "strange and burlesque visceral accidents" are comic episodes which cause the horses to "trail the opposite of clouds of glory" in an undignified manner after their gorings, which are not tragic because dignity is "destroyed in the spattering and trailing of its innermost values, in a complete burlesque of tragedy." (DIA, p. 6-7) Death, dignity and tragedy are intertwined in Hemingway's definition, while death, even the death of the horses, "is not comic." (DIA, 6-7) Because in the bullfight "the tragedy is all centered in the bull and the man," (DIA, p. 6) "the minor comic-tragedy of the horse" is unimportant except as it relates "to the whole" bullfight. (DIA, p. 9)

⁵⁵Baker, Writer, p. 153.

⁵⁶Aristotle, Poetics, VI, included in S.H. Butcher, Aristotle's Theory of Poetry and Fine Art (N.Y., 1951), p. 23.

⁵⁷Benson, p. 77.

"Lacking in courage and a little simple-minded," Raphael El Gallo refused to face the reality of death, notably when he had his brother Joselito kill several of "the last" bulls he planned to kill as a bullfighter. Hemingway insists that the death of El Gallo in the ring "would not be irony, nor tragedy, since there would be no dignity." (DIA, p. 159) For Hemingway dignity is as essential to tragedy as magnitude was to Aristotle.⁵⁸

Hemingway advises the tourist to go to Madrid for his first bullfight, for only in Madrid can "you get the essence. The essence, when it is the essence, can be in a plain glass bottle and you need no fancy labels. . . ." (DIA, p. 51) Hemingway carries this same principle of simplicity into his writing. When a writer adds an unnecessary phrase to his work, "he is spoiling his work for egotism. Prose is architecture, not interior decoration, and the Baroque is over." Hemingway further distinguishes characters, who are only caricatures, from living people, and advises the writer to "make people live" in order to make a book survive "as a whole." Hemingway also explains his theory of omissions in Death in the Afternoon. According to this theory, a writer "may omit things that he knows" in his craft and the reader will comprehend what the writer does not state explicitly if

⁵⁸Aristotle, VIII, 21.

the writing is true. Hemingway adds that "the dignity of the movement of an iceberg is due to only one-eighth of it being above water." (DIA, p. 191-2)

Like the matador Maera, Hemingway never "sucked after intellectuals." (DIA, p. 82) Critics such as Aldous Huxley (DIA, p. 190) and Ralph Ellison⁵⁹ have continued to call Hemingway an anti-intellectual throughout the years. Some of these attacks are founded on Hemingway's refusal to align with any faction during the social unrest of the early 1930's. Hemingway comments on this decision in an unpublished portion of the manuscript, insisting that writers who unite with movements in politics could too easily subordinate their writing to the purpose of the movement. He anticipated criticism for writing about the bullfight during the American depression in the passage, yet declared that since the bullfight involved the tragedy of death and was not a sport, he was not elevating sports above human problems in his system of values. The passage does show that Hemingway refused to compromise his art for intellectualism, despite the criticism he was receiving. Indeed, part of why critics did not accept Death in the Afternoon when it first appeared may be due to the concern of Americans about the depression when the book appeared.

⁵⁹Ralph Ellison, Shadow and Act (New York, 1966), p. 56

The continuing legend that Hemingway scorned intellectualism does not mean that Hemingway was unintellectual. In fact, Death in the Afternoon shows that Hemingway read widely and thought seriously about ethics, aesthetics and life itself. Many of his comments about art parallel the ideas in Aristotle's Poetics, whether Hemingway read Aristotle or not. The Oak Park High School did stress the classics, as well as British and American literature in its curriculum,⁶⁰ so Hemingway may have studied Aristotle's concepts of art. As already observed, both Hemingway and Aristotle describe the catharsis in a tragedy, and both feel that an excess of one characteristic can destroy an individual. Both writers considered spectacular elements in a tragedy less important than the emotional purging at the climax of the action.⁶¹ The spectator's sense of unity and wholeness in a tragedy is important to both Hemingway and Aristotle.⁶² Hemingway focuses more on the responsibility of the audience in the tragedy than does Aristotle. The audience can determine the quality of the performance, for "a bullfighter will not be better than his audience very long. If they prefer tricks to sincerity, they soon get the tricks." (DIA, p. 163) Comparing tragedy and

⁶⁰Charles Fenton, The Apprenticeship of Ernest Hemingway (New York, 1965), pp. 5-6.

⁶¹Aristotle, VI, 29.

⁶²Ibid., VII, 31.

the epic poem, Aristotle concludes that "tragedy is the higher art" because it fulfills its purpose "more perfectly" than the epic.⁶³ Criticizing the mysticism of Waldo Frank's Virgin Spain, Hemingway deduces that "all bad writers are in love with the epic." (DIA, p. 54)

Although Hemingway adamantly insisted that he had never been able to read Thoreau,⁶⁴ Stephens and other critics have pointed out similarities in the works of the two authors. Hemingway's purpose for attending the bullfight compares to Thoreau's reason for retreating to Walden Pond.⁶⁵ Hemingway wanted to "see life and death" as he "was trying to learn to write, commencing with the simplest things, and one of the simplest things of all and the most fundamental is violent death." (DIA, p. 2) Thoreau asserts, "I went to the woods because I wished to live deliberately, to confront only the essential facts of life, and see if I could not learn what it had to teach, and not, when I came to die, discover that I had not lived."⁶⁶ Both writers are in quest of the simple, yet essential facts of life and death, and hope to learn from their physical and psychological journeys. In Death in the Afternoon Hemingway concludes that "the great thing is

⁶³Ibid., XXVI, p. 111.

⁶⁴Green Hills of Africa (New York, 1935) 21; hereafter cited GHOA.

⁶⁵Stephens, p. 327.

⁶⁶Henry David Thoreau, Walden (New York, 1948), p. 74.

to last and get your work done and see and hear and learn and understand." (DIA, p. 278) Like Hemingway, Thoreau believes in intensifying life in the temporal world. The methods of the two writers differ, but some of their goals were similar.

The critic C. Hugh Holman has written an article comparing Hemingway to Thoreau's contemporary Ralph Waldo Emerson. The belief in self-reliance and the desire to experience life for themselves unites the thinking of the two writers.⁶⁷

Hemingway wholeheartedly confessed to admiration of Mark Twain's works.⁶⁸ The critic Lewis E. Weeks sees a similarity between Hemingway's "A Natural History of the Dead" and Twain's "A Catastrophe" in Life on the Mississippi. Weeks compares the cool, objective style of both writers in the works, and notes that the question of mercy killing arises in both events.⁶⁹ Other parallels exist between the two non-fiction works. Just as Hemingway considered bullfighting an art, Twain maintains that "steering [a steamboat] is very high art."⁷⁰ Twain asserts that "the prime purpose" of "Old

⁶⁷C. Hugh Holman, "Hemingway and Emerson: Notes on the Continuity of an Aesthetic Tradition," Modern Fiction Studies, I (August, 1955), 16.

⁶⁸GHOA, p. 22.

⁶⁹Lewis E. Weeks, Jr., "Mark Twain and Hemingway: 'A Catastrophe' and 'A Natural History of the Dead,'" Mark Twain Journal, XIV (Summer, 1968), 15-17.

⁷⁰Mark Twain, Life on the Mississippi (New York, 1963), p.113.

Times on the Mississippi" was a discussion of "piloting as a science."⁷¹ Hemingway praises the matadors Joselito and Belmonte, "who can dominate the bulls by science." (DIA, p. 161) Both authors criticize travel books written by people who know little about the country. Hemingway sneeringly advises those wanting to write a travel book on Spain to write it "immediately after their first visit to Spain," for "one-visit books are much surer of everything and bound to be popular." Hemingway condemns the mysticism in the travel books of Waldo Frank and Richard Ford. (DIA, p. 52-53) Twain attacks the "inaccuracies" in Captain Marryat's description of the Mississippi River, calling Marryat's book "pretty crude literature for a man accustomed to holding a pen." Twain also expresses an amazement at the "various" manufactured emotions in travel books.⁷² Twain and Hemingway are both leery of tourists. Twain is outraged at the construction of a tourist attraction in the graveyard in Vicksburg, the scene of many deaths during the Civil War.⁷³ Hemingway feels that the bullfight as an institution exists in spite of rather than because of the foreign tourists. (DIA, p. 8) On the manuscript Hemingway had a phrase or two expressing a concern that tourists might make the bullfight less Spanish and thus

⁷¹Ibid., p. 69.

⁷²Ibid., p. 166.

⁷³Ibid., pp. 218-219.

terminate its existence. Both authors use the theme of initiation in their books. Learning to be a pilot involves as much responsibility as learning to be a matador. A lack of skill in both professions could result in death. Both books emphasize courage.⁷⁴ Just as Mark Twain learns that the Mississippi River is always changing, Hemingway also feels time flowing beneath him. Discussing his memories of past fiestas, he realizes, "We've seen it all and we'll watch it go again. The great thing is to last and get your work done and see and hear and learn and understand." (DIA, p. 278)

In the dialogues with the Old Lady, Hemingway engages in several discussions which reveal his wide reading. At the end of Death in the Afternoon, Hemingway cites a bibliography of materials written about the Spanish bullfight and expresses an indebtedness to the authors of the 2077 books and pamphlets on the list. Included in this bibliography is the book Filosofia de los Toros by Santos Lopez Pelegrin.⁷⁵ If Hemingway was indeed familiar with the bibliography, he was aware of the Pelegrin book. In the middle of the book, Pelegrin uses a dialogue among three characters. El Baron

⁷⁴Ibid., p. 90

⁷⁵Graciano Diaz Arquer, Libros y Folletos de Toros (Madrid, 1931).

opposes the bullfight; Don Pedro defends it. La Marquesa is an ardent aficionado, but can neither defend nor oppose the bullfight, so she sits and listens to the debate between Don Pedro and El Baron.⁷⁶ Pelegrin may have provided a stimulus for Hemingway's creation of the Old Lady. If Hemingway read the book, he may have included the Old Lady in his own in accord with the traditional Pelegrin book.

Hemingway uses the dialogues with the Old Lady as a springboard for a parody of Andrew Marvell and an attack on T.S. Eliot.⁷⁷ In A Farewell to Arms, Frederick Henry quoted two lines from Marvell's poem "To His Coy Mistress."⁷⁸ In "The Wasteland," T.S. Eliot changes these same lines, "But at my back I alwaies hear/Times winged charriot hurrying near"⁷⁹ to "But at my back from time to time I hear/The sounds of horns and motors. . . ."⁸⁰ Criticizing the Humanists in Death in the Afternoon, Hemingway half-jokingly states that "procreation is indecorous, highly indecorous," and continues, "But regardless of how they started, I hope to see the finish of a few,

⁷⁶Santos Lopez Pelegrin, Filosofia de los Toros (Madrid, 1842), p. 71.

⁷⁷John Yunck, "The Natural History of a Dead Quarrel: Hemingway and the Humanists," South Atlantic Quarterly, LXII (Winter, 1963), 34.

⁷⁸A Farewell to Arms (New York, 1969), p. 154.

⁷⁹Andrew Marvell, The Poems and Letters of Andrew Marvell, edited by M. M. Margoliouth, 2 Vols. (Oxford, 1967) I, 26.

⁸⁰Peterson, p. 83.

and speculate how worms will try that long preserved sterility; with their quaint pamphlets gone to bust and into foot-notes all their lust." When the Old Lady admires the line, Hemingway credits T.S. Eliot with teaching him how to parody. (DIA, p. 139) The parody of Marvell's poem is even more ironic when examined as a whole in relation to Hemingway's passage. Marvell urges his Mistress to abandon her "coyness" and make love to him because:

. . . at my back I alwaies hear
 Times winged charriot hurrying near:
 And yonder all before us lye
 Desarts of vast Eternity.
 Thy Beauty shall no more be found:
 Nor, in thy marble Vault, shall sound
 My ecchoing Song: then Worms shall try
 That long preserv'd Virginity:
 And your quaint Honor turn to dust;
 And into ashes all my Lust.⁸¹

Hemingway's discussion of procreation parallels Marvell's argument that his Mistress' virginity and honor will "turn to dust." When the Old Lady enjoys the "very nice line about the lust," the effect is comic because the Old Lady is unaware of the context of the poem. The reader would not expect her to compliment the lines if she knew Marvell was asking his Mistress to be "indecorous." Marvell further addresses his Mistress: ". . .while the youthful hew sits on thy skin like morning dew. . .now let us sport us while we may."⁸² The Old Lady, whose skin is neither youthful nor like "morning dew,"

⁸¹Marvell, p. 26.

contrasts in physical appearance but parallels the propriety of Marvell's coy mistress. If Hemingway read T.S. Eliot's pamphlet on Andrew Marvell, the passage shows even more humor on Hemingway's part. Eliot describes Marvell's poem as witty because it allies "levity and seriousness (by which the seriousness is intensified.)"⁸³ Hemingway himself blends seriousness and wit in the passage. After his mention of Eliot, Hemingway begins his short story "A Natural History of the Dead," about death in the mountains of Italy during the first world war. (DIA, p. 140)

John Portz feels that despite the fact that Hemingway published "A Natural History of the Dead" as a short story in Winner Take Nothing, the story is actually a burlesque of "the pious philosophical assumptions" behind books by field naturalists. Bishop Stanley's Familiar History of the Birds, Mungo Park's Travels in the Interior Districts of Africa, and Byron Edward's discussion of Africa "assumed the natural condition of man to be one of harmony."⁸⁴ The New humanists Jean Cocteau, Aldous Huxley,⁸⁵ Irving Babbitt, Paul Elmer More and Stuart P. Sherman, "a prissy group of academicians," encounter Hemingway's criticism through the

⁸³T.S. Eliot, Andrew Marvell (London, 1924), p. 6.

⁸⁴John Portz, "Allusion and Structure in Hemingway's 'A Natural History of the Dead,'" Tennessee Studies in Literature, X (1965), 30-32.

⁸⁵John A. Jones, "Hemingway: The Critics and the Public Legend," Western Humanities Review, XIII (Autumn, 1959), 388.

"shockable qualities" of the Old Lady. Urging imitation in art and a return to the classical and neo-classical literature, the New Humanists opposed both the naturalism of H.L. Mencken and Hemingway's artistic goal of looking at the world for himself in his art. Portz maintains that Hemingway was familiar with the Naturalism-Humanism debate in The Bookman between 1929 and 1932.⁸⁶ Hemingway's notation of Goya's etchings and Charles Harrison's Generals Die in Bed in "A Natural History of the Dead" posit the opinion "that war is hell and death has no dignity or decency about it" in contrast to the New Humanists who glow with their self-deception.⁸⁷ These numerous allusions again demonstrate the breadth of Hemingway's reading.

Hemingway promises the Old Lady that "A Natural History of the Dead" will be a "Whittier's Snow Bound of our time," (DIA, p. 133) but disappoints her with his story. (DIA, p.144) Using the snowstorm as the center of his thoughts about the past and the future, Whittier imagines "the chill weight of the snow" on his sister's grave.⁸⁸ This snow-covered grave differs from the snow-covered corpses Hemingway describes. (DIA, p. 136) When oxen teams rescue the snow bound Whittier

⁸⁶Portz, pp. 34-35.

⁸⁷Ibid., pp. 35-36.

⁸⁸John Greenleaf Whittier, The Complete Poetical Works (Boston, 1894), p. 494.

family, the country doctor stops at the Whittier home to ask for Whittier's mother's assistance with a "poor neighbor sick abed."⁸⁹ The doctor's concern for his fellow man contrasts to the insensitive doctor in Hemingway's story. (DIA, p. 142) Despite the Old Lady's disappointment with Hemingway's story, the wars of the twentieth century have changed the life of modern man. Both Hemingway and Whittier note that "green hills of life. . .slope to death."⁹⁰

Critics have often observed the symbolism of the mountain and the plains, and the rain in A Farewell to Arms.⁹¹ Imagery of the earth's terrain, the sun and the climate occurs in Death in the Afternoon. One of the tentative chapter titles in the manuscript of Death in the Afternoon indicates that Hemingway consciously recorded details about the Spanish elements of geography and weather.

Bernard Oldsey notes that "Hemingway intended to see death in terms of black-white imagery--light and the absence of light, day and night, snow and muck, purity and impurity."⁹² Hemingway admires the artist Goya, who believed "in blacks and grays, in dust and in light, in high places rising from

⁸⁹Whittier, p. 498.

⁹⁰Ibid.

⁹¹Baker, Writer, pp.104 and 109.

⁹²Bernard Oldsey, "The Snows of Ernest Hemingway," Wisconsin Studies in Contemporary Literature, IV (Spring-Summer, 1963), 190.

plains, in the country around Madrid, in movement. . . ."

(DIA, p. 205) Hemingway uses similar color schemes in Death in the Afternoon.

The sun centers the imagery of darkness and light in the book. Hemingway says that "the sun is the best bullfighter, and without the sun the best bullfighter is not there. He is like a man without a shadow." (DIA, p. 15) Hemingway informs the potential aficionado about sol y sombra, the seats "that are in the sun when the fight commences but that will be in the shadow as the afternoon advances," (DIA, p. 32) for the bullfight begins between five o'clock and five-thirty in the afternoon. (DIA, p. 29) Hemingway discusses the hot summer nights in Madrid, noting that "nobody ever goes to bed in Madrid until they have killed the night." (DIA, p. 48) Next he depicts sunrises, specifically one which he observed in Kansas City and mistook for a fire. (DIA, p.48-49) Implicit in his statement about the night life of Madrid is an association of the darkness with the bull. Countless other references to light and darkness occur in Death in the Afternoon. A portion of Madrid bears the name Puerto del Sol. (DIA, p. 38) The final chapter in the book begins with morning (DIA, p.270) and concludes with Hemingway's recollection of "the night that July in Madrid." (DIA, p. 278) The middle of the chapter

is splashed with colors: "red-mud color of the ring;" "green leaves;" (DIA, p. 271); "the yellow flames of candles in the sun;" (p. 274); "shade under the trees" and "the sand white." (DIA, p. 275) Just before Hemingway mentions the night, he refers to "shadows." (DIA, p. 278) The multitude of colors parallels the catalogue of things Hemingway says he could not put into the book. "If I could have made this enough of a book, it would have had everything in it," he muses. (DIA, p. 270) The passing of a day in this final chapter enhances Hemingway's backward glance at the day (life) behind him and his anticipation of death. "Let it all change. We'll all be gone before it's changed too much. . . ." (DIA, p. 278)

Like the artist Goya, Hemingway depicts the mountains in Spain. Ronda, the "cradle of bullfighting," is "built on a plateau in a circle of mountains and the plateau is cut by a gorge that divides the two towns and ends in a cliff that drops sheer to the river and the plain below where you see the dust rising from the mule trains along the road." (DIA, p. 43) "Madrid is a mountain city with a mountain climate," where "the heat and the cold come and go quickly." (DIA, p. 47) In a mountain country, the cold can be "deadly." (DIA, p. 101) In "A Natural History of the Dead," the bodies are buried in the mountains, where the people encountered death. (DIA, pp. 140-141) In the glossary to the book, Hemingway defines the

word cumbre as "summit; torero cumbre: the very best possible faena cumbre: the absolute top in work with the muleta." (DIA, p. 300) Discussing the symbolism of the mountain in "The Snows of Kilimanjaro," Alfred G. Engstrom declares that the mountain in Hemingway's short story symbolizes death. He adds that Dante equated a mountain with righteousness; Flaubert, with art, and Hemingway with death.⁹³ From Hemingway's definition of the word cumbre, Hemingway associated the mountain with righteousness: "the very best possible;" with art, "faena cumbre;" and with death. The bullfight then represents the fusion of the concepts of the art and death motifs in Hemingway's works.

The Green Hills of Africa

Discussing the mountain climate in Spain in Death in the Afternoon, Hemingway claims that "a good part of it is African and in the fall and at the end of summer when the sun is gone the cold comes quickly and deadly for any one who must stand in it, wet with sweat, unable even to wipe himself dry." Hemingway continues to explain how this cold causes one of the professional diseases of the bullfighter: tuberculosis. (DIA, 101) The parallel between Africa and Spain is more precise in the manuscript of Death in the Afternoon in the University of Texas library. Two other authors writing about the Spanish

⁹³Alfred G. Engstrom, "Dante, Flaubert and Snows," Modern Language Notes, LXV (1950), 205.

bullfight have compared Spain and Africa. Richard Ford mentions the flow of the crowd into the arena on the day of the fiesta "when the dazzling glare and fierce African sun calcining the heavens and earth, fires up man and beast to madness. . . ."94 Santos Lopez Pelegrin lengthily depicts the historical, geological connection of Spain with the continent of Africa. Calling Africa the mother of the bullfight, Pelegrin writes, "El Africa, esa Nacion desconocida y á la que sin embargo se le appellida bárbara, ha debido ser la madre, ó como si dijeseamos, la fundadora de las corridas do toros."95

In Green Hills of Africa Hemingway notices the similarity of the African landscape to that of Spain: "The country was so much like Aaragon that I could not believe that we were not in Spain until, instead of mules with saddle bags," a group of natives passed the members of the safari.⁹⁶ Pauline, too, remarks, "We've been through three provinces of Spain today."⁹⁷ As in Spain, the African country became cold when the sun went down or was covered with clouds. Hemingway says that he "shivered" and "was cold with the sun under the clouds in spite of the heaviness of the air after the rain."⁹⁸

⁹⁴Richard Ford, Gatherings from Spain (London, 1927), p. 322.

⁹⁵Santos Lopez Pelegrin, pp. 5-6.

⁹⁶GHOA, p. 146.

⁹⁷GHOA, p. 151.

⁹⁸GHOA, p. 227.

Frohock compares the description of a bull Hemingway has killed in Green Hills of Africa with a passage in Death in the Afternoon, and adds that "the same desire to get at true feeling" permeates both books.⁹⁹ In the passage from Green Hills of Africa, the beast Hemingway slays is "big, long-legged, a smooth gray with the white stripes and the great, curling, sweeping horns, brown as walnut meats and ivory pointed, at the big ears and the great, lovely, heavy-maned neck. . . ."100 Frohock sees a similarity between this dead bull and a bull in Death in the Afternoon with "wide horns, solid looking as wood and smoothly pointed and the hump of muscle in his neck and shoulders, heavy and wide in repose, rises in a great swelling crest. . . ." (DIA, p. 30) Frohock does not note that Hemingway killed the African animal at five o'clock in the afternoon,¹⁰¹ the time of day when the bullfights commence.

Frohock notices another passage in Green Hills of Africa in which Hemingway slips into the bullfighting metaphor.¹⁰² Waiting for a wounded buffalo to charge, Hemingway says:

This was different, this was no rapid fire, no pouring it on him as he comes groggy out into the open, if he comes now I must be quiet inside and put it down his nose as he comes with the head

⁹⁹Frohock, p. 188.

¹⁰⁰GHOA, p. 231.

¹⁰¹GHOA, p. 229.

¹⁰²Frohock, p. 196.

out. He will have the head down to hook, like any bull, and that will uncover the place the boys wet their knuckles on and I will get one in there and then must go sideways into the grass and he would be Pop's from then on unless I could keep the rifle when I jumped.¹⁰³

Frohock concludes his analysis of the metaphors by stating that Hemingway's "confusion of the sports involved constitutes a most startling account of a man's wanting to identify himself with three figures of the killer."¹⁰⁴ Twice in Green Hills of Africa the character Pop calls Hemingway a "damned bullfighter" affectionately.¹⁰⁵

When M'Cola skins an animal, Hemingway uses words connoting the bullfight:

I held the flashlight for M'Cola while he worked on the second bull and, although tired, enjoyed as always his fast, clean, delicate scalpeling with the knife until, the cape all clear and spread back, he knocked [sic] through the connection of the skull and spine and then, twisting with the horns, swung the head loose and lifted it, cape and all, free from the neck, the cape hanging heavy and wet in the light of the electric torch that shone on his red hands and on the dirty khaki of his tunic.¹⁰⁶

The movement of the cape and the clean scalpeling are reminiscent of a bullfighter who is artistic in his faenas. Just as Green Hills of Africa contains images of the bullfight, Death in the Afternoon includes images of the hunt. After the Old

¹⁰³GHOA, p. 115.

¹⁰⁴Frohock, p. 186.

¹⁰⁵GHOA, pp. 213 & 290.

¹⁰⁶GHOA, p. 236.

Lady complains that "A Natural History of the Dead" seems little like Whittier's Snow Bound, Hemingway pretends to apologize, "We aim so high and yet we miss the target." (DIA, p. 144) Describing a man's pride in killing, Hemingway uses "game stalking" as an example of a challenge. (DIA, p. 233)

How a man kills an animal is important in both books. In Death in the Afternoon, Hemingway states that "killing cleanly and in a way which gives you aesthetic pleasure and pride has always been one of the greatest enjoyments of a part of the human race." (DIA, p. 233) In Green Hills of Africa, Hemingway complains when his competitor Karl does not kill a kudu bull cleanly.¹⁰⁷ When he himself fails to shoot a bull cleanly, he wishes that he hadn't hit the bull at all and calls himself "a son of a bitch to have gut shot him."¹⁰⁸ When Hemingway did shoot a bull cleanly in Green Hills of Africa, "the bull was lying on the side where the bullet had gone in and there was not a mark on him and he smelled sweet and lovely like the breath of cattle and the odor of thyme after rain."¹⁰⁹ In Death in the Afternoon, Hemingway claims that "a perfect sword thrust" is one which strikes the bull "between the shoulder blades." (DIA, p. 235) The manner of execution, then, is part of both the code of the matador and the code of the hunter.

¹⁰⁷GHOA, p. 14.

¹⁰⁸GHOA, p. 272.

¹⁰⁹GHOA, p. 231.

Other comparisons exist between the hunt and the bullfight. The Hyena in The Green Hills of Africa was "a dirty joke." This animal, "a self-eating devourer of the dead,"¹¹⁰ was a comic figure because it did not die cleanly.¹¹¹ Like the horse in the bullfight, the hyena is "emptied of its visceral content" (DIA, p. 7) in a manner comic only because it is undignified. Just as Hemingway has no interest in the bullfights with matadors on horseback, (DIA, p. 390) he considers hunting from an automobile against a sportsman's code.¹¹²

Similarities exist between some of the Old Lady dialogues and the comments Hemingway makes in Green Hills of Africa. In Death in the Afternoon Hemingway remarks that modern science may find cures for diseases despite the fact that "there is no remedy for anything in life." (DIA, p. 104) In Green Hills of Africa Hemingway speculates joyfully about the "remedies" for some of the diseases he has had because he wanted "to live in it [the world] and have time to hunt."¹¹³ When Hemingway told an anecdote to members of his safari, they were disappointed with his "dismal" tale about death,¹¹⁴ just as the Old Lady was distressed with "A Natural History of the Dead."

¹¹⁰GHOA, p. 38.

¹¹¹John Killinger, Hemingway and the Dead Gods (Kentucky, 1960), p. 76.

¹¹²GHOA, p. 55.

¹¹³GHOA, p. 283.

¹¹⁴GHOA, p. 196.

Both Death in the Afternoon and Green Hills of Africa contain Hemingway's remarks about the nature of writing.¹¹⁵ In one of these depictions, Hemingway defines the essential qualities of the writer as "talent" and "discipline."¹¹⁶ In Death in the Afternoon Hemingway had said that the writer was born with the ability to learn quickly and to use a "conscious application" of that knowledge. (DIA, p. 191) In Green Hills of Africa, he draws an analogy between the hunt and writing:

the way to hunt is for as long as you live against as long as there is such and such an animal; just as the way to paint is as long as there is you and colors and canvas, and to write as long as you can live and there is pencil and paper and ink. . . .¹¹⁷

Carlos Baker perceives the mountain-plain symbolism recurring in Green Hills of Africa.¹¹⁸ On the plains, Hemingway's luck is bad,¹¹⁹ but on the slopes of the mountains, he kills a bull cleanly and with an aesthetic feeling.¹²⁰ Both Death in the Afternoon and The Green Hills of Africa fuse death and art. Hemingway's reference to Whittier in Death in the Afternoon, in fact, may be another link between the two non-fiction works. In "Snowbound," Whittier observes that "the green hills of life. . . slope to death."¹²¹ The quotation

¹¹⁵Joseph Warren Beach, American Fiction: 1920-1940 (New York, 1941), p. 71.

¹¹⁶GHOA, p. 27.

¹¹⁷GHOA, p. 12.

¹¹⁸Baker, Writer, pp.103 & 170.

¹¹⁹GHOA, p. 86.

¹²⁰GHOA, pp. 92-93.

¹²¹Whittier, p. 498.

may be a source for the title of The Green Hills of Africa. In both books, the mountain is the symbol of art and death. Living by an artistic code can counteract the nothingness of a spiritual death-in-life despite the final inevitable fact that man must die.

In the bullfight Hemingway found the intense life, the artistic experience, and religious ecstasy to be inter-related. There he also saw the whole of life with death at its center. The insight he gained from the bull ring traveled with Hemingway to Africa, where hunting became symbolic of the whole of life and death. In his own artistic life, Hemingway related writing to life. He told Lillian Ross that after he finished a book, he felt as though he had died.¹²²

¹²²Lillian Ross, Portrait of Ernest Hemingway (New York, 1961), pp. 25-26.

CHAPTER III

MAJOR FICTION

The Sun Also Rises

When a mechanic repairing Gertrude Stein's Model T Ford did not do a good job, Miss Stein complained to the patron of the garage, who rebuked the mechanic with the impatient phrase, "You are all a génération perdue." In a conversation with Hemingway, Miss Stein extended the remark: "All of you young people who served in the war. You are a lost generation." She added, "You have no respect for anything. You drink yourselves to death. . . ." ¹ Because Hemingway used the lost generation quotation as an inscription for The Sun Also Rises, readers mistook the epigraph as a statement of Hemingway's personal belief in lost generationism. Hemingway later said that the novel was his subtle refutation of Gertrude Stein's remark. ² Bill Gorton jests with Jake Barnes about the "lost" generation in The Sun Also Rises when he tells Jake, "You're an expatriate. You've lost touch with the soil. You get precious. Fake European standards have ruined you. You drink yourself to death." ³ Continuing the bantering, Bill observes,

¹Ernest Hemingway, A Moveable Feast (New York, 1964), p. 29.

²Carlos Baker, Hemingway: The Writer as Artist (Princeton, 1967), pp. 80-83, hereafter cited as Baker, Writer.

³Ernest Hemingway, The Sun Also Rises (New York, 1954), p. 115, hereafter cited as SAR within parentheses in the text.

"You don't work. One group claims women support you. Another group claims you're impotent." Jake then interrupts Bill with the statement, "I just had an accident." (SAR, p. 115) His comment reminds both Bill and the reader of the war which initiated Jake's "accident."

While Hemingway denies the creed of the lost generation, he does realize all too well the destructiveness of the war which caused its survivors to be labeled "lost." The Sun Also Rises is definitely a commentary on the "atmosphere of postwar life."⁴ Most of the characters in the novel have suffered physical or psychological wounds. How a character lives with his wound tests his "permanent value" as an individual.⁵

When Robert Cohn asks Bill Gorton and Jake Barnes if Spanish customs allowed betting at the bullfights, Bill retorts that spectators at a bullfight do not need to bet. Jake adds, "It would be like betting on the war." (SAR, pp. 98-99) Both bullfighting and war involve the danger of death for the participants. Bets are irrelevant in both tasks because sooner or later, death for someone involved is inevitable.

⁴Frederick Hoffman, "No Beginning and No End: Hemingway and Death," Essays in Criticism, III (January, 1953), 81.

⁵Ernest Hemingway, Death in the Afternoon (New York, 1932), p. 166, hereafter cited as DIA within parentheses in the text.

Hemingway's attendance at the Pamplona fiesta in 1925 with Donald Stewart, Harold Stearns, Harold Loeb, Lady Duff Twysden, Pat Guthrie, Ford Madox Ford and Mrs. Hemingway accounts for the realistic details of the bullring in the novel.⁶ Indeed, the novel caused an uproar among the expatriates when one individual after another attempted to find the key unlocking the identities of the characters in this supposed roman à clef.⁷ Legends linger on and prosper about this Pamplona fiesta. Some critics speculate that Hemingway created a castrated Jake Barnes because his fidelity to his wife, Hadley, hindered him from having an affair with the genteel Englishwoman, Lady Duff Twysden. Biographical information about the personages at the fiesta refutes the interpretation of the novel as an exact roman à clef.⁸ John Dos Passos, who was in Pamplona when Lady Duff Twysden joined the Hemingway cuadrilla, recollects that after reading The Sun Also Rises, he questions "which remembered events Hemingway made up and which actually happened." To Dos Passos the fiesta itself resembled "A Cook's conducted tour with Hemingway as master of ceremonies."⁹ Despite the discrepancies between the

⁶Philip Young, Ernest Hemingway (New York, 1952), p. 57.

⁷Baker, Writer, p. 79.

⁸Bertram D. Sarason, "Brett Ashley and Lady Duff Twysden," Connecticut Review, II (April, 1969), 6, 10.

⁹John Dos Passos, The Best Times (New York, 1966), p.154.

biographical events and the novel, the narrator, Jake Barnes, makes observations and faces situations similar to those which Hemingway himself narrates in Death in the Afternoon.

Like Hemingway himself, Jake is a real aficionado. After giving Jake a "sort of oral spiritual examination," other Spanish aficionados were amazed that an American could understand the "passion" inherent in the bullfight. (SAR, pp.131-2) Jake reveals the depths of his afición when he describes his "disturbed emotional feeling that always comes after a bullfight, and the feeling of elation that comes after a good bullfight." (SAR, p. 164) Hemingway feels "very fine" during the bullfight, which gives him "a feeling of life and death and mortality and immortality." Afterwards he feels "very sad but very fine." (DIA, p. 4) Further, Jake instructs his friends about the corrida.¹⁰ On the second day of the fiesta, Jake "sat beside Brett and explained to Brett what it was all about." (SAR, p. 167) At the earlier running of the bulls, Jake informs Brett that a bull uses one horn more than another and was delighted when she detected a bull "shift from his left to his right horn." (SAR, pp. 139-40) In Death in the Afternoon Hemingway similarly describes the practice of trailing a cape before a bull "to see which horn he favors." (DIA, p. 65) On the final day of the fiesta, Jake overhears

¹⁰Robert Stephens, Hemingway's Non Fiction (Chapel Hill, 1968), p. 252.

three spectators behind him discuss Belmonte's performance. One asks the others, "What's he afraid of the bull for? The bull's so dumb he only goes after the cloth." (SAR, p.218) In Death in the Afternoon Hemingway records "Why doesn't the bull get him?" as a similar question those inexperienced with the bullfight ask about the matador. He continues to explain that "the bull cannot turn in a shorter space than his own length." (DIA, p. 194)

In one scene, Frances Clyne, Robert Cohn's mistress, asks to talk to Jake. The two leave the cafe where Robert Cohn and Harvey Stone sit ordering dinner. Frances gives Jake a long description of Robert's refusal to marry her. All Jake can do is agree with her that the situation is a "rotten shame." He tells her, "But there's no use talking about it, is there? Come on, let's go back to the cafe." Frances too realizes that "there isn't anything" that either she or Jake can do about Robert Cohn. (SAR, pp. 47-8) After describing the diseases matadors encounter in Death in the Afternoon, Hemingway faces the Old Lady's question of whether or not he has a remedy for the situation. He replies:

Madame, there is no remedy for anything in life. Death is a sovereign remedy for all misfortunes and we'd do best to leave off discoursing now and get to table. --Within our time the scientists may well abolish these old diseases and we'll live to see the end of all mortality. But meantime I would rather dine on suckling pig at Botin's than sit and think of casualties my friends have suffered. (DIA, pp. 103-4)

In both passages Hemingway realizes that discussion cannot change circumstances beyond control. He recommends eating-- that is, continuing his own existence, as an alternative to grieving about human destiny.

The entire passage from Death in the Afternoon further echoes the closing scene in The Sun Also Rises. Before Hemingway suggests dining at Botin's to the Old Lady, he tells her that good bullfighters can be "ruined if they marry and if they love their wives truly" because bullfighting involves risking death with every entrance into the arena, and loving a wife may attach the matador so closely to life that he may sacrifice his art for survival. (DIA, p. 104) As the novel concludes, Brett narrates to Jake the story of her renunciation of Romero despite Romero's desire to marry her. She claims that she would have lived with Romero if she "hadn't seen it was bad for him," and declares that she is "not going to be one of those bitches that ruins children." Brett and Jake then dine at Botin's and order "roast young suckling pig," (SAR, pp. 242-246) Hemingway's suggested course in Death in the Afternoon. The passage from Death in the Afternoon reinforces the interpretation of the conclusion of the novel as Jake's acquired vision of reality.¹¹ His final comment that it is "pretty" to think that he and Brett "could have had such a damned good time together" reveals his admission to himself that Brett

¹¹Dolbert E. Wylder, Hemingway's Heroes (Albuquerque, 1969), p. 64.

would never have been satisfied with him. Jake's use of the word "pretty" echoes Brett's former use of the word when she described Mike Campbell's conduct during her affair with Robert Cohn. (SAR, p. 181) In repeating the word, Jake observes that even if he had not been wounded, his relationship to Brett could have been no more permanent than her affairs with Cohn, Campbell or Romero.

Just as Hemingway was unable to drink from sundown until six in the morning during the running of the bulls at the fiesta, (DIA, manuscript, University of Texas) Jake found himself "so sleepy" that he "went to bed around four o'clock in the morning. The others stayed up." (SAR, p. 159) In Death in the Afternoon Hemingway portrays his awakening in the middle of the night trying to remember what he had "really seen" when the matador Hernandorena was gored. He discovers that he had seen "the clean, clean, unbearably clean whiteness of the thigh bone." (DIA, p. 20) Like his creator, Jake Barnes finds the night a time of introspection. After Brett has awakened him in the middle of the night, he lies awake, realizing that "it is awfully easy to be hard-boiled about everything in the daytime, but at night it is another thing." (SAR, p. 34) Unable to sleep another night, Jake recollects the treatment that he, Brett, and Campbell had given Robert Cohn. He declares that he likes to watch Campbell plague Cohn, although he becomes disgusted with himself afterwards for enjoying Cohn's suffering.

Jake continues thinking until he arrives at a definition of morality: "That was morality; things that made you disgusted afterwards. No, that must be immorality. That was a large statement. What a lot of bilge I could think up at night." (SAR, p. 149) Jake's moral vision parallels Hemingway's definition in *Death in the Afternoon*: ". . . I only know that what is moral is what you feel good after and what is immoral is what you feel bad after. . . ." (DIA, p. 4) After musing about morality, linguistics and his friends, Jake falls asleep "some time along toward daylight." (SAR, p. 149) Discussing the long, hot summer nights in Madrid, Hemingway maintains that people in Madrid advise him that just before morning is "the time to sleep" because it is cool. (DIA, p. 48)

Both Hemingway and Jake Barnes place a value on learning. Jake muses: "Perhaps as you went along you did learn something. I did not care what it was all about. All I wanted to know was how to live in it. Maybe if you found out how to live in it you learned from that what it was all about." (SAR, p. 148) Hemingway concludes Death in the Afternoon with the resolution that "the great thing is to last and get your work done and see and hear and learn and understand. . . . The thing to do is work and learn to make it." (DIA, p. 278) Experience, then, has a value in and of itself.

Although Jake realizes Juanito Montoya's disapproval of Brett's relationship to Romero, (SAR, p. 177) Jake knows that Montoya will forgive him eventually for his friends, who were "simply a little something shameful between us, like the spilling open of the horses in bullfighting." (SAR, p.132) Montoya extends forgiveness to anyone with sincere afición. Jake's friends do not mar Jake's perception of the moment of truth in the center of the ring.

The war has wounded not only Jake Barnes but also his friend, Lady Brett Ashley. Her psychological wound occurred when the man she loved died of dysentery in the war. In a desperate attempt to counteract this wound, Brett married Lord Ashley, (SAR, pp. 38-39) who had made her sleep on the floor at night while he slept with a loaded rifle in his bed. More than once he had threatened to kill Brett. As Mike Campbell observes, Lady Brett Ashley "hasn't had an absolutely happy life." (SAR, p. 203) Jake nevertheless calls Brett "a drunk" (SAR, p. 38) as candidly as Hemingway depicts Mrs. S. T. as the "alcoholic nymphomaniac" in Death in the Afternoon who was "rather shocked by horses, but so excited by bullfighters and general strong emotion that she herself became partisan of the spectacle" when she attended the bullfight. (DIA, p. 468) In the novel Brett tells Bill Gorton that the goring of the horses at first startled her, but she

nevertheless thoroughly enjoyed the spectacle. (SAR, p. 166) When she praises the green trousers Romero is wearing, Campbell observes that "Brett never took her eyes off them" throughout the bullfight. (SAR, p. 165) Like Mrs. S. T., Brett's attention focuses on the bullfighter in the arena rather than on the moment of truth at the death of the bull. Brett also drinks "herself out of any remembrance" of many activities like Mrs. S. T. (DIA, p. 498) When Count Mippipopulous recalls the details of the previous evening, Brett expresses an amazement that he would even want to remember the evening. She had been so drunk herself that she forgot about meeting Jake at the Crillon the next day. (SAR, p. 54) At the beginning of the novel, Brett lacks discrimination. She gulps down the Count's expensive wine as a toast and loses the taste of the wine as a result. (SAR, p. 59) Her brief affair with Robert Cohn and her refusal to control her attraction to Romero further demonstrate her failure to discriminate. Before her romance with Romero, she justifies her plot to seduce him as "right" for her, although she does admit that her activities make her feel like "a bitch." (SAR, p. 184) By the end of the novel when Brett leaves Romero, she has learned that "it makes one feel rather good deciding not to be a bitch." She explains her feeling as "sort of what we have instead of God." (SAR, p. 245) When she decides not to do something that will make her feel bad afterwards, Brett embraces a concept of morality akin to

that of Jake Barnes in the novel and Ernest Hemingway in Death in the Afternoon. As the critic Ganzel Dewey remarks, Brett has learned restraint for the first time in her life.¹²

The seven wars and four revolutions Count Mippipopolous has survived cause Brett to include him with herself and Jake as "one of us." The count tells Jake that because he has lived intensely he "can enjoy everything so well." He further advises Jake and Brett to "get to know the values," (SAR, p. 60) much as Hemingway elaborates on the need to "appreciate values through experience" in Death in the Afternoon. (DIA, p. 12) When Brett insists that the Count has no values and is "dead," the Count vehemently disagrees with her: "I am not dead at all." Jake observes that "food had an excellent place in the count's values. So did wine. The count was in fine form during the meal." (SAR, p. 61) Comparing the increased enjoyment an individual receives when he comprehends the bullfight with a person's expanding capacity to enjoy wine, Hemingway views wine as:

one of the most civilized things in the world and one of the natural things of the world that has been brought to the greatest perfection, and it offers a greater range for enjoyment and appreciation than, possibly, any other purely sensory thing which may be purchased. (DIA, p. 10)

¹²Ganzel Dewey, "Cabestro and Vaquilla: The Symbolic Structure of The Sun Also Rises," Sewanee Review, LXXVI (Winter, 1968), 47.

The count declares that all he wants "out of wines is to enjoy them." (SAR, p. 59) His "fine form during the meal" shows that he is indeed an artist whose experiences have enabled him to appreciate "the civilized things in the world."

In the novel Bill Gorton resembles Hemingway's sketch of R.S. in Death in the Afternoon. Like R.S., Bill "makes a few bets on questions of veracity, opinion, college loyalty, etc." (DIA, p. 498) When Robert Cohn condescendingly informs Jake and Bill that he doubts that Brett and Mike Campbell will arrive in Pamplona on the designated day, Bill rashly bets Cohn that the couple will appear that evening, (SAR, p. 95) only to lose the bet a few hours later. (SAR, p. 98) R.S.'s sincere enthusiasm for the bullfight (DIA, p. 498) parallels Bill's aficion in the novel. (SAR, pp. 164-167) When Pedro Romero first sees Bill, he notices that Bill's physical appearance resembles that of the matador Villalta. (SAR, p. 176) In Death in the Afternoon Hemingway depicts Villalta's unusual appearance because of a neck that is

three times as long as that of the average man. He is six feet tall to start with and those six feet are mostly legs and neck. You cannot compare it with the neck of a giraffe because the giraffe's neck looks natural. Villalta's neck looks as though it were being stretched out right before your eyes. It seems to stretch like rubber but it never snaps back. (DIA, p. 86)

Despite his long neck and a "voice that is a shade high sometimes," (DIA, p. 70) Villalta is nevertheless a valiant killer.

Like the count's aesthetic appreciation of wines, Bill's aficion demonstrates the extent to which he faces reality in his life because he can perceive the moment of truth in the bullring.

Over a whiskey and soda, Robert Cohn asks Jake Barnes if Jake has ever had the feeling that life was by-passing him. Jake informs him that "nobody ever lives their life all the way up except bullfighters." Cohn nevertheless pleads with Jake to travel to South America with him. Jake insists that "going to another country doesn't make any difference. . . . You can't get away from yourself by moving from one place to another." (SAR, pp. 10-11) As a sportsman, Robert Cohn was a boxing champion in his college years at Princeton despite his inherent dislike for the sport. (SAR, p. 3) Cohn, however, "loved to win at tennis," (SAR, p. 45) a game which in the Anglo-American tradition "replaced the avoidance of death by the avoidance of defeat." (DIA, p. 22) Cohn's affair with Lady Brett Ashley decreased his victories at tennis. While Cohn could finally accept defeat at tennis, he could not accept the "loss" of Lady Brett Ashley's attention. (SAR, p. 45) Although "a man can be destroyed but not defeated,"¹³ Cohn's refusal to recognize his defeat reflects his inability to accept reality, due to a lack of courage.¹⁴ By ignoring the

¹³Ernest Hemingway, The Old Man and the Sea (New York, 1952), p. 103, hereafter cited as OMS in parentheses in the text.

¹⁴Wylder, p. 58.

reality of his defeat, Cohn suffers a moral self-defeat. As Mike Campbell says, Cohn follows Brett around "like a steer." Cohn adds that it is "no life being a steer." (SAR, p. 141) Cohn's reactions to the bullfight again demonstrate his inability to face reality. Before the corrida, he expresses a fear that the bullfight will bore him. (SAR, p. 162) He finds on the contrary that the goring of the horses upsets him, and calls Brett a "sadist" because the gorings affect her only mildly. (SAR, p. 165) Like the moralist who attends the bullfight with a preconceived notion of how he ought to react, Cohn cannot experience the passionate moment of truth. Like Mr. X. Y. in Death in the Afternoon, he further uses his own reactions as a basis for judging how others ought to experience the bullfight. (DIA, p. 466) Unlike the Count, Cohn is not alive. Both Jake (SAR, p. 148) and Mike Campbell (SAR, p. 142) notice that Cohn never gets drunk. During the fiesta, however, Cohn does drink, but passes out "on Anis del Mono," (SAR, p. 158) after another failure to get Brett's attention. (SAR, p. 154) After Cohn drinks himself to oblivion, Bill tells Jake that Cohn is "dead." Bill repeats the word to Cohn when Cohn finally awakens. (SAR, pp. 158-159) Cohn does not even approximate living his "life all the way up." His lack of courage exemplifies instead his death-in-life.

Mike Campbell has served in the war, but has performed no act of bravery. Just before a party which the Prince of Wales was to attend, Campbell took his uniform to a tailor, who kindly supplied him with medals. (SAR, p. 135) Campbell likes neither sports nor hunting. He claims that he does not hunt because of "the danger of having a horse fall on you." (SAR, p. 192) He is as cowardly as Robert Cohn. Like Brett early in the novel, he is also indiscriminate. He owes money to "everybody," including Juanito Montoya, because he is not selective in his spending. (SAR, p. 192) Pedro Romero labels Campbell "the drunken one" when he meets Jake's cuadrilla, (SAR, p. 176) while Jake perceives that Campbell gets unpleasant when he drinks (SAR, p. 148) what is usually other people's wine. (SAR, p. 203) In Death in the Afternoon Hemingway mentions that "the bulls pay little attention to a drunk." When drunkards shout at the bulls during a corrida, Hemingway has observed the bulls ignoring the inebriates. (DIA, p. 30) Reality, then, eludes Campbell because of his drinking. At the bullfight, Campbell focuses his awareness on the reactions of Brett and Cohn to the spectacle. To his credit, however, Campbell manages to slur, "that Romero, what's his name is somebody. Am I wrong?" (SAR, p. 165) As the fiesta progresses, he senses Brett's attraction to Romero (SAR, p. 168) so that his alcoholic stupor prevents him from attending the final bullfight of the fiesta. Jake notices

that Campbell's appearance resembles "a death mask." (SAR, p. 210) Campbell perceives reality to a greater extent than Robert Cohn, but like Cohn, lacks courage to confront a situation and act gracefully within the limits.

The matador Juan Belmonte acts with courage, integrity, and skill within the ring despite the crowd's impatience with his performance.¹⁵ Before he enters the arena, Belmonte remains detached from the circumstances around him. Jake watches Belmonte "looking at nothing. . . all alone" in the ring. (SAR, p. 212) This detachment measures the degree of imagination the matador possesses. Confronting death daily detaches the matador from non-essential details of life. (DIA, p. 56) Although the crowd fails to appreciate the valor of Belmonte,¹⁶ the aging matador continues to test his own skill each time he enters the ring. His return to the ring after his initial retirement (SAR, p. 214) embodies his desire to continue living his life all the way up. After his performance, Belmonte eats soft boiled eggs in a cafe where Jake and Bill order the same dish. (SAR, p. 221) Because the word huevos, Spanish for "eggs," can also mean cojones, J. M. Linebarger interprets the dining scene after the bullfight as

¹⁵Wylder, p. 57.

¹⁶Jackson Benson, Hemingway: The Writer's Art of Self-Defense (Minneapolis, 1969), p. 141.

the characters' symbolic attempt to regain cojones. Belmonte's failure to live up to his old records that afternoon has diminished his huevos. Of course, Jake literally lacks huevos because of his wound. Because Bill Gorton fails to have an affair with Lady Brett Ashley, Linebarger questions Bill's masculinity.¹⁷ Hemingway's awareness of the double meaning of the word verifies Linebarger's article. In the explanatory glossary to Death in the Afternoon, Hemingway defines the word huevos as "eggs; slang for testicles as we say balls." (DIA, p. 410) Another word for testicles is cojones. (DIA, p. 396)

Pedro Romero personifies the "heroic man" in The Sun Also Rises.¹⁸ Like Belmonte, Romero is also detached before a corrida. When Jake first meets Romero, Romero seems "very far away and dignified." (SAR, p. 163) Melvin Backman insists that Pedro Romero "was exempt from the mal du siecle besetting the other characters in the novel." He adds that the "life and death struggle" in the arena causes Romero to meet life with "an intensity, a seriousness, a dedicated quality."¹⁹ Backman does not explain precisely what he means by the grand mal. If he is referring to the war as the mal of the century,

¹⁷J.M. Linebarger, "Eggs as Huevos in The Sun Also Rises," Fitzgerald/Hemingway Annual (1970), pp. 237-239.

¹⁸Paul B. Newman, "Hemingway's Grail Quest," University Review, XXVIII (Summer, 1962), 301.

¹⁹Melvin Backman, "Hemingway: The Matador and the Crucified," Modern Fiction Studies, I (August, 1955), 4.

Romero certainly has not served in the war. Romero does, however, confront death and life each day in the bullring, which Hemingway equates with war because both activities involve "violent death." (DIA, p. 2) Like Count Mippipopolous and Jake Barnes, Romero has been wounded, as evidenced by a "triangular scar" Jake detects on his cheekbone. (SAR, p. 185) The beating which Robert Cohn gives Romero "wounds" the matador physically but does not touch his spirit.²⁰ Romero does come closer to death more frequently than the other characters in the novel through his art. His work with the cape gives the aficionado "real emotion, because of the absolute purity of line in his movement. . . ." Romero refuses to create an illusion of being close to the bull in his performances. By actually allowing "the horns to pass him close each time," (SAR, p. 168) Romero faces death with courage and skill in the arena. Because he looks death in the eye, he lives an intense life. As in Death in the Afternoon, Hemingway associates artistry with a mountain when he describes how each of Romero's passes "as it reached the summit gave you a sudden ache inside." (SAR, p. 220) Many critics conceive of Romero as an idealized character who embodies the values of the Hemingway code. Romero, however, "represents more of the

²⁰Joseph Defalco, The Hero in Hemingway's Short Stories, (Pittsburgh, 1963), p. 196.

possibility of the ideal than the ideal itself."²¹ Romero is young and must continue to prove his valor day by day. Because the individual cannot actualize the code ideals, he can only pursue them in an approximation Hemingway equates with life itself.²² The inclusion of the older matador Belmonte in the novel demonstrates Hemingway's belief that a man must continue to prove his valor anew. Even if a man does not learn from living as Jake Barnes hopes, (SAR, p. 148) he can repeatedly attempt to live life to the hilt as long as he is alive. The quest represents a moral life-within-life, contrasted to Robert Cohn and Mike Campbell's death-in-life.

In their analyses of the novel, several critics magnify to almost outrageous proportions the scene in which the characters discuss the role of the steer in herding the bulls into the arena. In this episode, Bill Gorton advises Mike Campbell not to detach himself from the herd, associating himself with a steer and Campbell with a bull. Cohn then remarks that "it's no life being a steer," to which Campbell declares that he thought Cohn would enjoy such a life. (SAR, p. 141) Robert Mai, however, labels Jake the steer because

²¹Ibid.

²²Ernest Hemingway, The Green Hills of Africa (New York, 1935), p. 12, hereafter cited as GHOA.

of his wound, and continues the analogy by naming Romero and Cohn the bulls in the novel. Lady Brett Ashley, then, "kills" those bulls in the role of a matador.²³

Ganzel Dewey finds that critics who view Jake as an impotent steer in the novel too often interpret the novel as a wasteland inhabited by members of a lost generation. Dewey instead equates Jake with the cabestro, a more specialized steer whose function it is to herd the fighting bulls in transit to the ring. (DIA, p. 107) Because Jake is a peacemaker, ever "watchful of Cohn," Cohn becomes "a fighting bull" (at least in Dewey's article.) Dewey uses Cohn's former middleweight championship to verify Cohn's fighting characteristics.²⁴ Jake Barnes, however, reflects that Cohn possesses a "distaste for boxing." (SAR, p. 3) When Cohn finally does combat Romero, he cannot knock the matador out. In fact, after several minutes of fighting, Cohn begins to cry and declares that he can hit Romero no more. (SAR, p. 202) If Robert Cohn symbolizes a bull, the bullfight is indeed a dull one because "the ideal bullfight supposes bravery in the bull and a brain clear of any remembrance of previous work in the ring." (DIA, p. 145) Dewey characterizes Bill Gorton, like Jake, as a

RM ²³Robert P. Mai, "Ernest Hemingway and Men without Women," Fitzgerald/Hemingway Annual (1970), p. 181.

²⁴Dewey, p. 31.

cabestro because Gorton assists a Negro prizefighter during a scuffle in Vienna and because Gorton does not have an affair with Lady Brett Ashley.²⁶ Unlike Cohn, however, the Negro prizefighter had just knocked out the local youth who began the brawl. (SAR, p. 71) In Dewey's depiction of the characters in the novel, Brett becomes a vacquilla, the "mate of the fighting bull,"²⁷ because the vacquilla lacks feminine characteristics. (DIA, p. 105) Romero remains the matador in Dewey's analysis, but deals with Robert Cohn recibiento, a technique involving the matador's passivity until the bull comes to him.²⁸ Dewey uses the contrast between Jake, the cabestro, and Brett, the vacquilla, both of whom learn restraint, as the basis for the structure of the novel.²⁹

The critic Donald T. Torchiana agrees with Ganzel Dewey that the bullfight formulates the structure of the novel, but disagrees with the animalistic titles which Dewey confers on the characters. Torchiana perceives that the novel contains three parts³⁰ just as the bullfight is divided into three "acts" or suertes. (DIA, p. 96) After the first act of the bullfight, the bull appears victorious. (DIA, p. 98) Torchiana

²⁶Dewey, p. 37. #11

²⁷Ibid., p. 36 #12

²⁸Ibid., p. 35.

²⁹Ibid., pp. 26 & 47. #13

³⁰Donald Torchiana, "The Sun Also Rises: A Reconsideration," Fitzgerald/Hemingway Annual (1959), p. 98.

observes that "animalism seems to triumph" when Cohn runs off with Brett in the first part of the novel, in which Brett also has a brief fling with Count Mippipopulous and then returns to Campbell.³¹ Just as the second suerte confuses the bull, (DIA, p. 98) the Pamplona fiesta confuses the characters in the novel.³² Cohn quarrels with Bill (SAR, p. 95) and frustrates Jake (SAR, p. 99) and all the other characters at Pamplona. (SAR, p. 142) Jake encounters Montoya's disapproval when he introduces Romero to the group. (SAR, p. 177) Brett's affair with Romero culminates in a brawl between Cohn and Romero. (SAR, pp. 202-203) The final act of the bullfight results in the death of the bull. (DIA, p. 98) In the final suerte of the novel, Jake quells "the beast in himself" when he returns to Spain at Brett's plea. As the novel closes, Torchiana is persuaded "that Jake will come to Brett's rescue again, and that their meeting then, as at the book's beginning, will be repeated."³³ This hint that the cycle will repeat itself suggests a circular structure to the novel.

Torchiana has described explicitly how the three part structure of the book parallels the three acts of the bullfight. In Book I, the characters are scattered in different

³¹Torchiana, p. 99.

³²Ibid.

³³Ibid., p. 100.

places, but converge in Book II at Pamplona. Robin H. Farquhar suggests that Chapter XV, in which the fiesta begins, is the climax of the novel.³⁴ That chapter lies at the center of the novel, which contains twenty-nine chapters. After the climax, the characters begin to disperse, moving in separate directions back to their jobs or their homes. When Book III begins, the fiesta has ended, and the characters still in Pamplona discuss the respective places to which they will return. (SAR, pp. 227-228) The structure not only tidily fits into the pattern of a bull ring, but also clarifies the theme of the novel. The final act of the bullfight, which is climaxed by the death of the bull is an ecstatic, religious experience "that takes a man out of himself and makes him feel immortal while it is proceeding. . . ." (DIA, p. 206-207) Brett Ashley has transcended her own physical desires when she leaves Romero. (SAR, p. 243) Jake, too, assists Brett when she sends for him, although he recognizes that Brett has used him badly in the past. (SAR, p. 239) These individuals who perform selfless acts are not members of a lost generation. The novel ends in Madrid, (SAR, p. 247) the mountain city. (DIA, p. 47)

Hemingway's descriptions of the landscape in Death in the Afternoon echo earlier passages in The Sun Also Rises. In both books Hemingway paints the mountains and the plateau surrounding Pamplona, (SAR, p. 94) but in the later book

³⁴Robin H. Farquhar, "Dramatic Structure in the Novels of Ernest Hemingway," Modern Fiction Studies, XIV (Autumn, 1968), 274.

Hemingway mourns nostalgically that newly constructed apartment buildings obstruct the view of the mountains from the city. (DIA, p. 273) He depicts the wind blowing through the wheat fields and old castles in both books. (SAR, p. 93; DIA, p. 273) Imagery of sol y sombra, the sun and its shadows, weaves through each book. (SAR, p. 108; DIA, p. 275) In both books, the Spanish earth abides, while time continues to flow. Jake Barnes and Ernest Hemingway found a value in living fully on this abiding earth.

A Farewell to Arms

Hemingway does not allude directly to the bullfight in A Farewell to Arms. In Death in the Afternoon, however, he looks backward to this earlier work and intertwines some narrative threads from the novel into his book on the corrida. Some passages in Death in the Afternoon return the "punch" to critics who had judged the novel harshly.³⁵

Robert Herrick initiated the intellectual boxing match when he published a review called "What is Dirt" in The Bookman. The review discusses the censorship of passages in

³⁵John Yunck, "The Natural History of a Dead Quarrel: Hemingway and the Humanists," South Atlantic Quarterly, LXII (Winter, 1963), 32-33.

A Farewell to Arms and in All Quiet on the Western Front, another war novel then selling well in the United States. Herrick regrets the deletion of a passage dealing "explicitly with a necessity of the toilette which even animals and savages prefer to perform in private" in Remarque's All Quiet on the Western Front. Herrick feels that the publishers should have retained the censored lines because "the scene over the sanitary bucket tells me far more of war than all the vivid pictures of mangled flesh." According to Herrick, the censoring of the passage reflects an American tendency to gloss over the sordid realities of war. He declares that: "Americans more than Europeans need to have their consciousness pricked, and should have received this important story unblemished by prudery, in its full import," translated totally and literally from the German. A Farewell to Arms, on the other hand, receives Herrick's adamant disapproval, although he admits that he never finished reading the novel. The deletions of the details of the love scenes in the hospital diminished but did not demolish the "mere dirt" in the novel. In fact, Herrick implies that the publishers could have censored the entire novel without any "great loss" to anybody.³⁶

³⁶Robert Herrick, "What is Dirt," The Bookman, LXX (November, 1929), 258-262.

In the novel itself, however, the characters do not consider their actions dirt. In fact, Catherine Barkley tells Frederick Henry that she wishes that they "could do something really sinful" when the couple registers at a hotel before Frederick's return to the battle front. Catherine adds, "Everything we do seems so innocent and simple I can't believe we do anything wrong."³⁷ Hemingway was so perturbed by Herrick's article that he wrote the editors of the magazine a letter declaring that the editor deserved a spanking for printing Herrick's "trash."³⁸

Hemingway takes one stab at critics like Herrick in Death in the Afternoon when he declares that the term "decadence" "has become little more than a term of abuse applied by critics to anything they do not understand or which seems to differ from their moral concepts." (DIA, pp. 70-71) He further pictures mangled corpses in "A Natural History of the Dead," a depiction of the scattered clothing, torn flesh, swarming flies, and deplorable odor of the battlefield after the firing of an explosive. (DIA, pp. 136-138) After such a portrayal, no one could say that Hemingway ignores the squalid details of war in his works.

³⁷Ernest Hemingway, A Farewell to Arms (New York, 1969), p. 153, hereafter cited as AFA in parentheses in the text.

³⁸Carlos Baker, Ernest Hemingway: A Life Story (New York, 1969), p. 264, hereafter cited as Baker, Biography.

An anonymous critic printed a review of A Farewell to Arms in a later issue of The Bookman. This critic classifies Hemingway's style as "affected illiteracy," and insists that "genuine illiteracy" is easier to read.³⁹ Along with this nameless critic, Lewis Galantieri notes Hemingway's difficulties with a few vague grammar rules and punctuation marks.⁴⁰ Hemingway responds to these criticisms when he speculates about adding dialogue to Death in the Afternoon. Mimicking the critics, he describes himself in the third person: "The fellow is no philosopher, no savant, an incomplete zoologist, he drinks too much and cannot punctuate readily and now he has stopped writing dialogue." (DIA, p. 120) Hemingway then introduces the Old Lady to the readers.

In Death in the Afternoon, Hemingway snaps harshly at the insults Aldous Huxley tosses at A Farewell to Arms. Hemingway quotes part of an essay by Huxley. (DIA, p. 191) Entitled "Foreheads Villainous Low," the essay commences:

In A Farewell to Arms, Mr. Ernest Hemingway ventures, once, to name an Old Master. There is a phrase, quite admirably expressive (for Mr. Hemingway is a most subtle and sensitive writer), a single phrase, no more, about 'the bitter nail-holes' of Mantegna's Christs; then quickly, appalled by his own temerity,

³⁹"Inflammatory Topics," The Bookman, LXX (February, 1930), 646.

⁴⁰Lewis Galantieri, "The Brushwood Boy at the Front," Hound and Horn, III (1930), 262.

the author passes on (as Mrs. Gaskell might hastily have passed on, if she had been betrayed into mentioning a water-closet), passes on shamefacedly to speak once more of Lower Things. There was a time, not so long ago, when the stupid and uneducated aspired to be thought intelligent and cultured.⁴¹

Huxley continues to say that the pendulum has swung in the opposite direction. Instead of demonstrating their intelligence, educated people were concealing their knowledge in order to avoid being tagged "highbrows."⁴² Hemingway retorts that after reading Huxley's comment, he himself attempted to find the passage in question in A Farewell to Arms, and was unsuccessful, partly because he lacked patience and interest, and partly because he could do nothing to change the quotation anyway. He declares that the allusion to Mantegna "sounds very much like the sort of thing one tries to remove in going over the manuscript." He continues this retaliation to Huxley by insisting that his artistic goal has been to "create living people" and not to avoid "the appearance of culture." For the writer to use the people in his novels to flaunt his own knowledge flattens the characters to mere "caricatures" unless the people the writer breathes life into are themselves intellectual. (DIA, pp. 191-192)

⁴¹Aldous Huxley, Music at Night (London, 1949), p. 201.

⁴²Huxley, pp. 201-202.

Death in the Afternoon develops many other themes that Hemingway has touched on in A Farewell to Arms. Both books, for example, show Hemingway's preference for concrete details rather than abstract words. In A Farewell to Arms Frederick Henry declares that he "was always embarrassed by the words sacred, glorious, and sacrifice and the expression in vain." Such abstract words are "obscene" to him "beside the concrete names of villages, the numbers of roads, the names of rivers, the numbers of regiments and the dates." (AFA, pp. 184-185) These obscenities sugarcoat the realities of blood and death inherent in war.⁴³

Hemingway refers to a decadence in the meanings of words used repetitiously. (DIA, p. 71) When he uses the term "horse-shit," the Old Lady immediately utters her lack of familiarity with the word. Hemingway responds: "Madame, we apply the term now to describe unsoundness in an abstract conversation or, indeed, any overmetaphysical tendency in speech." (DIA, p. 95) The Old Lady again halts Hemingway in the midst of a discussion to ask him what he means by the term "love." He answers that love "is an old word and each one takes it new and wears it out himself." (DIA, p. 122) In the novel the priest distinguishes for Frederick Henry "passion and lust" from love, the desire to serve another. (AFA, p. 72)

⁴³Blanche Gelfant, "Language as a Moral Code in A Farewell to Arms," Modern Fiction Studies, IX (Summer, 1963), 174.

Hemingway's reference to Mantegna through the lips of Frederick Henry occurs on the morning when Henry and Catherine have emigrated to Switzerland by rowing across Lake Geneva after a warning that Frederick might be arrested for deserting the Italian army. When the guards at the border stop the lovers, Frederick tells them that they have come to Switzerland to "do the winter sport." Continuing the explanation, Frederick proposes that the war has interrupted his study of architecture and his "cousin" Catherine's study of art in Italy. When the guard turns his back, Frederick asks Catherine if she knows anything about art. The two quickly quiz each other about the artists Reubens, Titian and Mantegna. Catherine recollects Mantegna's bitterness, and Frederick agrees, "Lots of nail holes." The "lower things" Huxley accuses Hemingway of returning to consist of the confiscation of the boat by the Swiss and the inspection of the baggage. To avoid conflict, Frederick offers the guard a glass of brandy in the bags. (AFA, pp. 280-281) Hemingway probably claims that he cannot find this passage because it is not obtrusive and because it does forward the plot of the novel. Hemingway delivers a second blow to Huxley in the next chapter, where he alludes explicitly to Goya, Greco, and Velaquez. He overtly drops the names of Andre Gide, Oscar Wilde and Walt Whitman, almost addressing the entire conclusion of the chapter to Huxley. (DIA, pp. 203-205) Over a game of pool with Count Greffi near

the end of the novel, Frederick tells Greffi that his own highest values are love and life. The Count informs Frederick that love "is a religious feeling." (AFA, p. 262-263) Like the afición in a bullfight, love "takes a man outside himself and makes him feel immortal. . . ." (DIA, p. 206) Both love and afición are religious feelings.

After the war, Hemingway finds that he can observe the whole of life in the bullfight. (DIA, p. 2) After a man has been wounded either in war or in the bullfight, he retains his honor and courage only by continuing to face death courageously. (DIA, p. 92) Discussing cowardice, Catherine Barkley rejects the cliché that "the coward dies a thousand deaths, the brave but one." She insists that whoever composed this quotation must have been a coward because in her eyes "the brave dies perhaps two thousand deaths if he's intelligent. He simply doesn't mention them." (AFA, pp. 139-40)

Many images of doctors and hospitals recur in A Farewell to Arms. Some of these images parallel similar ones in "A Natural History of the Dead." The surgeon on the front who operates on Frederick Henry is a captain as is the doctor in "A Natural History of the Dead." (AFA, pp. 59-60; DIA, p. 143) Another surgeon who is a Captain-Doctor advises Frederick to wait six months before a final operation on his knee. Doctor Valentini, however, performs the knee operation on Frederick

the next day. (AFA, pp. 78-79) While the doctor in "A Natural History of the Dead" refuses to allow his subordinates to shoot a hopelessly injured man, (DIA, p. 142) one of Lieutenant Henry's men kills a deserter after a first shot at the man in flight only wounds him. (AFA, p. 204) In contrast to the insensitive doctor in Death in the Afternoon, the doctor delivering Catherine's child gives her gas to diminish the labor pains, (AFA, p. 317) and advises Frederick to allow the baby's delivery by a Caesarean operation. When Frederick questions what would happen if the doctors did "nothing " for Catherine, the surgeon informs him that they "would have to do something eventually." (AFA, p. 320-321)

Frederick Henry's companion Rinaldi is also a surgeon, frustrated and cynical because of the numerous deaths he witnesses in the war.⁴⁴ Rinaldi says he cannot think; he can only operate. (AFA, p. 167) His inability to think actually reflects his inability to allow himself to feel too sensitively about the death and wounds he watches.⁴⁵ This verbalization of his inability to think actually demonstrates his inability

⁴⁴Benson, p. 94.

⁴⁵Ibid., p. 95.

to forget about the horrors he has seen. He tries to use his work as an antidote for his despair over the human condition, but nonetheless declares life meaningless: "We never get anything. We are born with all we have and we never learn. We never get anything new. We all start complete." (AFA, p. 171)

Other characters express similar deterministic ideas. Frederick Henry feels "biologically trapped." (AFA, p. 139) He speculates that:

If people bring so much courage to this world the world has to kill them to break them, so of course it kills them. The world breaks everyone and afterward many are strong at the broken places. But those that will not break it kills. It kills the very good and the very gentle and the very brave impartially. If you are none of these you can be sure it will kill you too but there will be no special hurry. (AFA, p. 249)

In Death in the Afternoon Hemingway too considers the limits of man's existence. Although many matadors are killed in the ring, "it is the moderately talented, the beginners and the failures as artists who are most often killed." (DIA, p. 164) Devout matadors also are "killed more frequently" in the ring than other matadors, (DIA, p. 59) who heal in the wounded places and continue living temporarily. By the end of the novel, the good, gentle, brave Catherine, devoted to Frederick Henry, expresses the fact that she is "broken." (AFA, p. 323) Despite her utterance, her continued contempt for death shows that death does not break her courageous spirit.⁴⁶

⁴⁶James F. Light, "The Religion of Death in A Farewell to Arms," Modern Fiction Studies, VII (Summer, 1961), 173.

Neither war nor the bullfight culminates in victory for the contestants. Victory is a term used by "amateur" sportsmen, who equate it with avoiding defeat. (DIA, p. 22) Passini and Manero debate whether war is worse than defeat or defeat is worse than war. Passini informs Frederick that "there is no finish to a war," (AFA, p.50) even in victory. Later Frederick Henry pledges his own disbelief in victory, but declares also a disbelief in defeat. He speculates that the defeats the peasant has encountered have made the peasant wise. If the peasant were in power, however, he would be victorious and lose the opportunities for becoming wise. (AFA, p. 179)

Conversing with Frederick about her appearance after the baby's birth, Catherine tells Frederick that he will fall in love with her again. He jestingly asks her if she is trying to "ruin" him.(AFA, p. 305) Early in the novel, Rinaldi debates marrying Miss Barkley, whom he has just met. He asks Frederick if the idea of marriage is good--"after the war, of course." (AFA, p.12) Discussing marriage with some of his war brothers, Frederick Henry learns that Luigi did not want to be taken prisoner because of his wife. Frederick agrees, "I should think a married man would want to get back to his wife." (AFA, pp. 220-221) Hemingway clarifies these attitudes about marriage in Death in the Afternoon, where he says that

"many bullfighters are ruined if they marry if they love their wives truly." He continues to compare the bullfighter with the soldier, both of whose professions involve the danger of death. Loving a wife truly can make such professions uncomfortable for the bullfighter or soldier desirous of doing his job well. (DIA, p. 104)

Catherine Barkley's father has enjoyed wine so thoroughly that it has given him gout. (AFA, p.154) In Death in the Afternoon, Hemingway warns the reader that drinking an excess of wine may cause stiffening joints and painful big toes. By limiting his drinking, the individual can avoid having to cease drinking wine entirely. Hemingway himself, however, prefers the enjoyments of wine to "the corrugated iron internals of [his] boyhood."(DIA, p. 11)

The theme of time threads through both books. It is explicit especially in the references to Andrew Marvell's poem "To His Coy Mistress," especially the lines "But at my back I always hear/Time's winged chariot hurrying near." (AFA, p. 154; DIA, p. 139 refers to Marvell) On the battlefield Frederick describes himself and his comrades walking "along together, all going fast against time." (AFA, p.311) The year that Manuel Garcia Maera expected to die from consumption, he continued his artistry in the ring. Hemingway observes that he "never saw a man to whom time seemed so short as it did to [Maera] that season." (DIA, p. 79) Noticing the

changes the years have wrought on Spain, Hemingway remarks that things will continue to change as his life progresses. (DIA, p. 278)

John J. McAleer points out the religious implications of the repetition of the number three in the novel.⁴⁷ After a third day of rain, (AFA, p. 307) Catherine and Frederick move to town to await the birth of their child. After dwelling there three weeks, (AFA, p. 310) Catherine awakens with labor pains at three a.m. (AFA, p.312) Along with its religious associations, the number three recurs in the bullfight: three acts, (DIA, p. 96) for example, and the three stages of the bull's condition during the fight. (DIA, p.145) After a day at war, Frederick Henry returns to a small Italian town at five in the afternoon. (AFA, p. 36) He also sets up a billiard date with Count Greffi for the same hour, (AFA, p. 258) the time when a bullfight usually commences. (DIA, p.28) These numerical parallels with the bullfight may be only accidental, however, since Hemingway wrote the book on bullfighting after he wrote the novel.

Similar symbols, however, do recur in Death in the Afternoon. Carlos Baker equates the image of the mountain in the novel with life, love, and home, and contrasts the mountain to the death and war on the plains.⁴⁸ War, however, does

⁴⁷John J. McAleer, "A Farewell to Arms: Frederick Henry's Rejected Passion," Renaissance, XIV (Autumn, 1961), 76.

⁴⁸Baker, Writer, p. 116.

occur in the mountains of the novel. After Frederick is injured, he hears reports that the Italians are advancing on the Bainsizza plateau. He speculates also that even if the Italians did seize the plateau and Monte San Gabriel, "all of the highest mountains were beyond" in Austria. He adds, "Napoleon would have whipped the Austrians on the plains. He never would have fought them in the mountains." (AFA, p. 118) Lieutenant Henry later learns that the Bainsizza area is more like a series of small mountains than a plateau. (AFA, pp. 181-182) He again thinks about the difficulty of military tactics in mountainous areas. He considers that:

tactically speaking in a war where there was some movement a succession of mountains were [sic] nothing to hold as a line because it was easy to turn on them. You should have possible mobility and a mountain is not very mobile. Also, people always overshoot down hill. If the flank were turned, the best men would be left on the highest mountains. I did not believe in a war in mountains. (AFA, p. 183)

In "A Natural History of the Dead," the action occurs in the mountains. Hemingway declares cynically that "war in the mountains is the most beautiful of all war." Soldiers who died in the mountains in winter had "beautiful burying grounds," although the spring rains often washed the corpses out of their graves. (DIA, p. 141) The art of the bullfighter also resembles a mountain, the matador reaching "the summit of danger at the moment of killing." (DIA, p. 107) Although

the lovers, Catherine and Frederick, live happily in the mountains, Catherine does die in the mountains. (AFA, p. 290) The Taxi taking Catherine to the hospital goes "up the hill" from the hotel. (AFA, p. 313)

The imagery of darkness permeates A Farewell to Arms. In Death in the Afternoon, Hemingway speaks of the hot summer nights that made it impossible to sleep until nearly dawn in Madrid. His reference to killing the night equates the darkness with the bull, (DIA, p. 48) and sunlight with the matador. (DIA, p. 15) Frederick leaves Catherine at midnight, (AFA, p. 150) and tells Count Greffi that his only faith occurs at night. (AFA, p. 263) Frederick also considers how day and night make situations appear different. Unexplainable phenomena occur at night, and lonely people find night "a dreadful time." (AFA, p. 249) Catherine dies at night, after promising Frederick that she will "come and stay with [him] nights." (AFA, p. 331)

The symbolism of the rain in the novel coincides with the imagery of darkness.⁴⁹ Catherine Barkley fears the rain because she sees either herself or Frederick dead in it. (AFA, p. 126) When she dies, Frederick walks outside into the rain. (AFA, p. 322) For the army, the "permanent" rain brought cholera and death to seven thousand people. (AFA, p. 4) In

⁴⁹John Clendenning, "Hemingway's Gods, Dead and Alive," Texas Studies in Literature and Language, III (Winter, 1962), 495.

Death in the Afternoon Hemingway expresses a dislike for the spring rain in Spain when he desires to see the bullfights. (DIA, p. 47) The title for that chapter in the manuscript of Death in the Afternoon in Austin emphasizes the rain a bit more strongly than the chapter indicates. Both rain and darkness involve the absence of the sun, and for Hemingway, when the sun is not shining, "over a third of the bullfight is missing." (DIA, p. 15)

The critics quibble about the structure of the novel. H.K. Russell considers the retreat from Caporetto and the desertion of Lieutenant Henry the climax of the novel.⁵⁰ Robin H. Farquhar, on the other hand, finds a double-edged climax to the novel. The first turning point centers on Frederick's desertion from the army, and the second is Catherine's death.⁵¹ Herbert Simpson feels that the love theme and the war theme "do not merge in this novel," and this "confusion in structure reflects the author's confusion of intent."⁵² Simpson, however, does not account for the final irony in the novel. After escaping death on the battlefield, the lieutenant collides head on with death when Catherine

⁵⁰H.K. Russell, "The Catharsis in A Farewell to Arms," Modern Fiction Studies, I (August, 1955), 26.

⁵¹Farquhar, p. 276.

⁵²Herbert Simpson, "The Problem of Structure in A Farewell to Arms," Forum (University of Houston), IV (Winter, 1963) 20.

cannot survive childbirth.⁵³ The title of the novel is ambiguous, referring to the arms of love as well as the arms of war, and the farewell Frederick Henry must make to both.⁵⁴ Death itself fuses the dual themes of love and war in the novel.⁵⁵

While Hemingway does not explicitly allude to the bullfight in A Farewell to Arms, the two themes of love and war relate directly to the major theme of Death in the Afternoon: the moment of truth in which life and death appear as a whole in the center of the ring. Like aficion, love is a religious feeling. Love, war, and the bullfight culminate in death.

For Whom the Bell Tolls

While the motifs of war and bullfighting are only tenuously linked in The Sun Also Rises and A Farewell to Arms, Hemingway fuses the two in For Whom the Bell Tolls. The Spanish critic Arturo Barea disappointedly notes that the novel depicts "the Spain of the bull ring" rather than the country torn by war and revolution.⁵⁶ Frederick Von Ende

⁵³Fred. H. Marcus, "A Farewell to Arms: The Impact of Irony and the Irrational," The English Journal, LI (November, 1962), 535.

⁵⁴Ray B. West, Jr., The Art of Modern Fiction (New York, 1955), p. 633.

⁵⁵Robert Lewis, Jr., Hemingway on Love (Austin, 1965) p. 44

⁵⁶Arturo Barea, "Not Spain But Hemingway," Horizon, III (May, 1941), 356.

labels the novel "a kind of large-scale version of the bullfight enacted in the arena of the Spanish Civil War."⁵⁷

Hemingway did intend to equate the war with the bullfight, and this correlation enhances the themes of the novel.

The characters in the novel resemble the figures at a bullfight. Mr. Von Ende likens General Golz, who gives Robert Jordan orders for dynamiting the bridge, to the Presidente officiating at a bullfight. Just as the Presidente's signal commences the action in the arena, Golz's commands initiate the action of the novel. When questions arise about the execution of the bullfight, matadors can refer to the Presidente, paralleling Robert Jordan's effort to send Golz a message behind enemy lines. Andres, the character who carries the message, recollects his activities in the amateur bullfights before the war.⁵⁸ He had annually participated in the capeas, or amateur bullfights, of his native village, throwing himself on the back of the bull, and biting its ear despite the tossings he received. Calling him "Bulldog," the townsmen urged him on, cheering him with phrases such as "That's what it is to have a pair of cojones! Year after year!"⁵⁹ The youth Joaquin aspired to be a

⁵⁷Frederick Von Ende, "The Corrida Pattern in For Whom the Bell Tolls, RE: Arts and Letters, III (Spring, 1970), 63.

⁵⁸Von Ende, pp. 62 & 66.

⁵⁹Ernest Hemingway, For Whom the Bell Tolls, (New York 1968), p. 366, hereafter FWBT in parentheses in the text.

matador before the war.⁶⁰ Pilar asks him why he failed "at it," and he questions her meaning of "it." She then points out that he is wearing a coleta, a matador's pigtail, and he replies that fear had kept him from early success. The war has helped him to alleviate some of that fear, however, for "no bull is as dangerous as a machine gun." (FWBT, p. 134)

When Robert Jordan first meets Augustin, Augustin introduces himself to Jordan and declares that he is "dying of boredom in this spot." Jordan speculates that "the word aburmiento, which means boredom in Spanish, was a word no peasant would use in any other language." (FWBT, p. 45)

Arturo Barea contraverts Hemingway's remark that the word is commonly used among the Spanish peasants. Barea insists that the word aburrimiento is so abstract that the peasant would use a verb to express his boredom.⁶¹ Hemingway's spelling differs from Barea's in the novel, but in Death in the Afternoon, Hemingway's spelling coincides with that of Barea, when he defines aburrimiento as "boredom, the predominant sensation at a bad bullfight. Can be alleviated slightly by cold beer. Unless beer is very cold the aburrimiento increases." (DIA, p. 411) In this instance Hemingway has chosen the word associated with the bullfight in his characterization of Augustin.

⁶⁰Von Ende, p. 133

⁶¹Barea, p. 358.

Augustin reminds Robert Jordan about the degrees of dependability of the people in the guerilla band. He tells Jordan that Ferdinand is "fuller of boredom than a steer drawing a cart on the highroad. But to fight and do as he is told. Es muy hombre!" (FWBT, p. 293) The phrase is a "supreme compliment" in Spanish.⁶² Hemingway applies this phrase to Manuel Garcia Maera in Death in the Afternoon. (DIA, p. 82)

Like the matador Chagancho, (DIA, p. 79) Raphael is a gypsy. When Jordan asks Raphael if he can tell time without a watch, Raphael describes hours to him in terms of hunger. Jordan halts his description and tells him that he doesn't "need to be a clown." After Jordan gives him a duty, Raphael replies that guarding the bridge is "much work," and asks Jordan if someone else could do the job better. Jordan sends him anyway, after warning him to keep out of sight of the enemy. When Raphael insists that he certainly needs no reminder to keep under cover because he does not want to get shot, Jordan tells him to "take things a little seriously." (FWBT, p. 79) Chagancho too keeps distant from the bull in the ring. (DIA, p. 79) At the bullfight a mounted figure known as the alguacil attempts to catch the key to the toril

⁶²Keneth Kinnamon, "Hemingway, the Corrida and Spain," Texas Studies in Language and Literature, I (Spring, 1959), 50.

enclosing the bull when the Presidente throws the key into the box. The aficionados do "not take any of this seriously." (DIA, p. 61) Because of his role as a jester, Raphael resembles the alguacil in the ring as well as the matador Chagancho.

Frederick Von Ende parallels the old man Anselmo to the oldest and most trusted banderillos,⁶³ who examine the bulls the matadors will be fighting on the morning of the corrida. (DIA, p. 27) Anselmo also resembles "the very serious, white-haired, wide old man" named Gabriel, who:

in a sort of picturesque bullfighter's suit
(it was bought for him by popular subscription)
unlocks the door of the toril and pulling heavily
on it runs backward to expose the low passageway
that shows as the door swings open. (DIA, p. 61)

Like Gabriel, Anselmo is a serious old man whom Robert Jordan considers a "Christian. Something very rare in Catholic countries." (FWBT, p. 287) Anselmo dislikes killing other humans, but recognizes the necessity of doing so in war. (FWBT, p. 41) Like the old man in "A Clean Well-Lighted Place,"⁶⁴ Anselmo finds the night a "time of great loneliness"

⁶³Von Ende, p. 66.

⁶⁴Ernest Hemingway, The Short Stories of Ernest Hemingway (New York, 1966), pp. 379-383; hereafter cited as The Short Stories.

when he stands guard at the bridge. (FWBT, p. 197) On the day of the battle, Jordan yells at Anselmo to blow the bridge. (FWBT, p. 445) As Gabriel's actions commence the bullfight, Anselmo's explosion of the bridge with Jordan initiates the battle which results in their deaths.

In "Bullfighting, Sport and Industry," Hemingway includes reproductions of several works of art on the corrida: some etchings by Goya; a portrait of a matador by Manet, and a painting entitled "The Family of the Gipsy Bullfighter" by Ignacio Zuloaga. At the center of the portrait sits a large, heavy-set, white-haired woman dressed in black. Her face wears a proud, haughty expression, and her jeweled hands clutch the arms of the chair.⁶⁵ Except for Pilar's black hair, the gypsy woman resembles Robert Jordan's first view of Pilar. (FWBT, p. 30) The hot-tempered woman is an Earth Mother figure, who reminds the characters "again and again of the love-making and bull-fighting that, for Hemingway, represent Spain as it should have been."⁶⁶ Discussing his reluctance to allow Jordan to dynamite the bridge, Pablo compares safety in war with safety in the rules of bullfighting.

⁶⁵Ernest Hemingway, "Bullfighting, Sport and Industry," Fortune, I (March, 1930), 8.

⁶⁶Alan Guttman, "Mechanized Doom: Ernest Hemingway and the Spanish Civil War," Massachusetts Review, I (May, 1960), 546.

Pilar argues that there is no safety, and insists that after living "nine years with three of the worst paid matadors in the world," she is all too familiar with the procedure of the bullfight. She parrots the matador Finito, who often declared to her that "the bull never gored the man; rather the man gored himself on the horns of the bull." (FWBT, p. 55) The quotation parallels Hemingway's earlier citation of the lines.⁶⁷ Pilar's former lover, the matador Finito, descends from Hemingway's portraits of Varelito, Zurito, Maera, and Finito de Valladolid in Death in the Afternoon.⁶⁸ Robert Stephens also notes that Pilar's celebration of Valencia (FWBT, pp. 34-86) echoes Hemingway's depiction of the beaches and the seafood and the lovemaking in Valencia. (DIA, pp. 44-45)⁶⁹

Baker⁷⁰ and other critics⁷¹ point out the similarity of Pilar's description of Pablo's massacre of the fascists to the bullfight. (FWBT, pp. 109-129) The carts gathered in the town square gave it an appearance of a bullring, while the Sunday clothes of the peasants showed their expectation of fiesta activities. The eyes of the villagers focused on the

⁶⁷"Bullfighting, Sport and Industry," p. 140.

⁶⁸Stephens, p. 295.

⁶⁹Stephens, p. 69.

⁷⁰Baker, Writer, p. 260.

⁷¹Von Ende, p. 64.

ayuntamiento, where the fascists gathered. They almost expected a bull to exit.⁷² In Death in the Afternoon Hemingway defines the ayuntamiento as "the city hall or municipal government in Spanish towns. A box is reserved for the ayuntamiento in the Spanish bullrings." (DIA, p. 386) Pilar jokingly wore a discarded hat of the guardia civila before the murders began. (FWBT, p. 107) The civil guards were "a model of ruthless, disciplined constabulary" whom people regarded "very seriously." (DIA, p. 410) Unlike the bullfight, the massacre of the fascists resulted in no religious ecstasy.⁷³ Instead, Pilar stood on the balcony listening to the weeping of a woman whose husband had been killed that afternoon. (FWBT, pp. 128-129) The chaos of this slaughter resembles the amateur capeas, according to Von Ende, and contrasts to the ordered military discipline Robert Jordan brings to the operation.⁷⁴

Pilar tells Pablo, "and thou were more man than Finito in your time." (FWBT, p. 86) Pablo, however, has become muy flojo, as Anselmo describes him. (FWBT, p. 26) Hemingway defines flojo as "weak, so-so, unconvincing, spiritless." (DIA, p. 408) Pablo's scars indicate his former courage,

⁷²Baker, pp. 260-261.

⁷³Baker, Writer, p. 161.

⁷⁴Von Ende, p. 65.

(FWBT, p. 9) but he whispers to Pilar his fear of death.

(FWBT, p. 90) His disappearance with the caps and fuse for dynamiting the bridge is only one sign of his disloyalty to the guerilla band. (FWBT, p. 362) Although Pilar softens toward him when he returns, she calls him Judas Iscariot.

(FWBT, p. 391) Throughout the entire novel Pilar tells him he is a borracho, a drunk. (FWBT, p. 31) Hemingway has observed that "the bulls pay little attention to a drunk,"

(DIA, p. 30) and Pilar advises Jordan to ignore Pablo. (FWBT, p. 57) Pablo's concern for the horses emphasizes his dis-

loyalty to the band also. Anselmo declares to him, "Until thou hadst horses thou wert with us. Now thou art another capitalist more." (FWBT, p. 15) Pablo talks lovingly,

foolishly, and sentimentally to the horses. (FWBT, p. 64)

"Taking down his big blanket cape from the wall," Pablo insults Augustin's supposed violence. Seeing that Pablo is going outside to tend to the horses, Augustin exclaims,

"Befoul them" and calls Pablo a "horse lover." (FWBT, p. 215)

The reader of the novel cannot catch the full impact of the insult without considering the bullfight. People upset

about the goring of the horses at a bullfight are only amateurs and not real aficionados. They are blinded to the

moment of truth in the center of the ring. Pablo, then

refuses to face reality. Because he cannot be realistic, he

lacks courage, sincerity, stoicism, and loyalty, the other Hemingway code values.⁷⁵

Several critics comment on Maria's weakness as a character.⁷⁶ Her weakness, however, is due to the fact that Hemingway idealized her.⁷⁷ Maria "is associated with the sun" and life, as well as with the Virgin Mary and death.⁷⁸ When Robert Jordan first meets Maria, he asks Raphael whose woman she is. Raphael replies that she "is a very strange woman. Is of no one." (FWBT, p. 24) Robert Jordan also associates Maria with the Virgin Mary when he recalls that the Fascists, allied with the Catholic Church, retain a worship for Otra Virgen más, and concludes that perhaps "that was why they had to destroy the virgins of their enemies." (FWBT, p. 355) Backman cites the reference to "the Blessed Virgin of Pilar" (FWBT, p. 303) as additional evidence that Maria relates to the Blessed Virgin.⁷⁹ In Death in the Afternoon Hemingway comments that "the Virgen de la Soledad is the patron of all bullfighters and it is her portrait and image which are in the chapel of the bull ring at

⁷⁵Martín Staples Shockley, "Hemingway's Moment of Truth," Colorado Quarterly, V (Spring, 1957), 381-388.

⁷⁶Margaret Marshall, "Notes By the Way," The Nation, CLI (October 21, 1940), 591.

⁷⁷Robert Lewis, Jr., Hemingway on Love (Austin, 1965), p. 171.

⁷⁸Backman, p. 7.

⁷⁹Ibid.

Madrid." (DIA, p. 480) Robert Jordan finds that having Maria near him in the night abolishes the soledad of his loneliness. (FWBT, p. 264) Joaquin, who has carried her on his back to save her life, (FWBT, p. 133) prays to the Virgin during the attack against El Sordo. (FWBT, p. 321) Augustin tells Jordan to care well for Maria because he "has cared for her much, too." (FWBT, p. 290) Standing watch at night, a time of loneliness for him, Anselmo addresses the "most kind, most sweet, most clement Virgin" despite the fact that the Church is on the other side. (FWBT, p. 327) Pablo, who in his cowardice at night refers to God and the Virgin, (FWBT, p. 90) is possessive of Maria. (FWBT, p. 23) In the manuscript of Death in the Afternoon at the University of Texas at Austin, Hemingway explicitly equates the Virgin with the shrine of Pilar. In the novel, this association emphasizes the relationship between Pilar and Maria, to whom Pilar shows much affection.⁸⁰ Jordan clings to Maria "as though she were all of life and it was being taken from him." (FWBT, p. 264) He also, however, realizes, "But when I am with Maria I love her so that I feel, literally, as though I would die and I have never believed in that nor thought that it could happen." (FWBT, p. 166) Maria relates also to the Spanish earth,⁸¹ her hair like a field of grain blowing in the wind. (FWBT, p. 345)

⁸⁰Lewis, p. 168.

⁸¹Kinnamon, p. 60.

Robert Jordan is able to face reality. He knows that he is going to die, and admits that he loves Maria. In attempting to live the remainder of his life to the hilt, he decides that he must "make up in intensity what the relation will lack in duration and continuity." (FWBT, p. 168) After Jordan has blown the bridge, Pilar shouts to Maria that Jordan is "all right. Sin Novedad." (FWBT, p. 450) Her title shows her acceptance of Jordan as a fighter, for the term means "novelty; new fighter who attracts by his novelty." (DIA, p. 426)

Robert Jordan's beliefs focus many of Hemingway's comments on the theme of human commitment and solidarity. Realizing that his commission to blow up the bridge will result in his death, Jordan tells himself that he has no responsibility for the orders except to carry them out. "Yes, he should carry them out because it is only in the performing of them that they can prove to be impossible." (FWBT, p. 162) Jordan's recognition that he was fighting tyranny causes him to feel a "purging ecstasy of battle." (FWBT, p. 236) He describes this feeling as one of:

consecration to a duty toward all the oppressed of the world which would be as difficult and as embarrassing to speak about as a religious experience and yet it was as authentic as the feeling you had when you heard Bach, or stood in the Chartres Cathedral or the Cathedral at Leon and saw the light coming through the great windows; or when you saw Mantegna and Greco and Brueghel in the Prado. (FWBT, p. 235)

Commitment is a religious and aesthetic experience.

Jordan uses courage to carry out his impossible commission.⁸² Pablo continually challenges the cojones of the characters to draw attention away from his own cowardice. The other characters, however, know he is a coward. (FWBT, pp. 214-215) When Jordan, Anselmo, and Ferdinand ascend the hill to the cave, Jordan says that they are going "back to the palace of Pablo." Anselmo labels the cave a "Palace of Fear." Jordan then names it "La cueva de los huevos perdidas," or that of "the lost eggs." When Ferdinand interprets the eggs literally, Jordan explains, "Not eggs, you know. The others." (FWBT, p. 199) He alludes to the second meaning of huevos, the association with a man's cojones. While Hemingway indirectly considers his father's suicide in Death in the Afternoon, Robert Jordan directly confronts the fact of his father's cowardice, which led to his suicide. (FWBT, pp. 338-339) Jordan hopes to avoid being a coward at the moment of his own death.

Because of Hemingway's earlier attitude about the incompatibility of marriage with war and bullfighting, (DIA, p. 104) critics comment that Jordan's work occupies his mind more than does Maria.⁸³ Indeed, Jordan does remark that a

⁸²Jack Adler, "Theme and Character in Hemingway's For Whom the Bell Tolls," University Review, XXX (June, 1964), 294.

⁸³Wylder, p. 153.

woman cannot perform the work that he must do. (FWBT, p.73) Later in the novel, however, Maria remarks, "They would not let me go with thee in such work as this." In this passage of Jordan's fantasy about going to Madrid after the war, he replies to Maria that he may be able to find another profession. (FWBT, pp. 342-348) Wylder has counted the paragraphs in a passage about Jordan's thoughts about the bridge. He finds that this passage, which critics cite as an example of Jordan's lack of real affection for Maria, contains more paragraphs about Maria than about the bridge.⁸⁴ The love theme is thus a vital part of the novel. Love allies with life and death⁸⁵ in a moment of renewal for Robert Jordan.⁸⁶

Imagery of light and darkness reinforces the interpretation of the love scenes as the juxtaposition of life and death in the novel. Maria allies with the sun,⁸⁷ which Hemingway states is essential for a bullfight. (DIA, p. 11) During the first love scene in which the earth moves, Maria finds everything:

red, gold, orange, gold-red from the sun on the closed eyes, and it was all that color, all of it, the filling, the possessing, the having, all of the color, all in a blindness of that color. For

⁸⁴Ibid.

⁸⁵Lewis, p. 154.

⁸⁶Grebstein Sheldon Norman, "Sex, Hemingway and the Critics," Humanist, XXI (July-August, 1961), 213-214.

⁸⁷Backman, p. 6

him it was a dark passage which led to nowhere, then to nowhere, then again to nowhere, once again to nowhere, always and forever to nowhere, heavy on the elbows in the earth to nowhere, dark, never any end to nowhere, hung on all time always to unknowing nowhere. . . .(FWBT, p. 159)

As in Death in the Afternoon, Hemingway alludes to killing the darkness in For Whom the Bell Tolls. (FWBT, p. 252)

Along with Maria's representation of life and death to Jordan, these parallels with the sun and the shadow indicate that like the moment of truth in the bull ring, the love scenes represent the whole of life and death.

Along with the themes of duty, courage and love, fate plays a significant role in the novel. Robert Jordan's duty appears to him "a passageway with no exit." (FWBT, p. 305) Pilar has read "nothing" of death in his palm. (FWBT, p. 33) Later she tells him, "It is for this that we are born." (FWBT, p. 387) When the characters wish each other suerte near the end of the novel, (FWBT, pp. 404 & 407) the term reverberates with Hemingway's double-edged irony. Wishing each other "luck," the characters realize that they are approaching their ultimate "fate" or "destiny." (DIA, p.96) Pilar's smell of death speech reinforces the fatalism in the novel. She insists that gypsies were able to smell the death of Joselito and Ignacio Sanchez Mejias. Jordan then points out that spectators knew Mejias would get gored in the arena

because "he had been too long out of training." Pilar agrees, but nevertheless retains her belief that she can smell death. She tells Jordan that he can smell death if he goes to the "matadero early each morning." (FWBT, p. 255) Hemingway defines the matadero as the slaughterhouse. (DIA, p. 451) Pilar's recollection that she smelled death on Jordan's colleague who had been with the guerilla band earlier adds another note of doom to the novel. (FWBT, pp. 255-257)

Upset about the plight of the Spanish people, Robert Jordan believes, like Frederick Henry, that victory can be bad for the people. He curses, "Muck everybody but the people and then be damned careful what they turn into when they have power." (FWBT, p. 370)

Like A Farewell to Arms, the action of For Whom The Bell Tolls takes place in the mountains. (FWBT, p. 3) Discussing the mountainous climate of Spain, Hemingway recalls the year he was in Madrid when it snowed on May 15, and the bullfights were canceled. (DIA, p. 47) In the novel, snow comes at the end of May. Predicting the weather, Pilar informs Jordan that "these mountains do not know the names of the months." The calendar indicates the lunar month of May, yet snow is possible, although Hemingway declares he has never seen snow in the summer in Madrid. (DIA, p. 47)

The snow incorporates symbolic undertones in the novel. Pilar exclaims, "What rotten stuff is the snow and how beautiful it looks." She adds, "What an illusion is the snow." (FWBT, p. 154) Robert Jordan is frustrated by the snow because it complicates the dynamiting of the bridge for him. Snow, which is "bad for the work," postpones the preparations for the moment of truth, the explosion that will result in Jordan's death. Pablo, on the other hand, considers the snow "beautiful." (FWBT, p. 179) Along with his drinking, his cowardice, his love of horses, Pablo's concept of the snow demonstrates his inability to face reality, his enjoyment of illusions. Jordan associates the snow with life when he "lay very quietly and tried to hold onto himself that he felt slipping away from himself as you feel snow starting to slip sometimes on a mountain slope." (FWBT, pp. 470-471) As in A Farewell to Arms and "A Natural History of the Dead," death in For Whom the Bell Tolls occurs in the mountains. Because Jordan has recognized the inevitability of his death throughout the novel, he has lived his three days on the mountain "all the way up."

According to Frederick Von Ende, the bridge in the novel corresponds to the bull, "the allegorical representation of death" in the arena.⁸⁸ Carlos Baker diagrams the structure

⁸⁸Von Ende, pp. 66 & 69.

of the novel as "a series of concentric circles" comparable to a bull ring.⁸⁹ The bridge literally lies at the center of those circles.⁹⁰ Symbolically, the juxtaposition of life and death, the moment of truth in the bull ring, lies at the heart of the novel.

Von Ende describes how the recurrence of the number three in the novel relates to the three acts of the bullfight. Culminating in the death of the bull, the final act occurs in the novel when Jordan and Anselmo blow the bridge.⁹¹ The themes of love and death merge in Pilar's declaration that no one experiences the moving of the earth more than three times during his life. She admits to Jordan and Maria that she has felt the earth move twice in her life, and refuses to answer them when they question her about a third possibility. (FWBT, p. 175) Her silence prophesies that the earth will move the third time when she dies. Jordan and Maria feel the earth move twice in the novel.

Frederick Von Ende shows how the battle areas in the novel center around the bridge like the three terrains of the bull ring. The bridge itself corresponds to the center of the ring, the medios, while the remaining two sections of the ring correspond to "the respective camps of Pablo

⁸⁹Baker, Writer, p. 260.

⁹⁰Von Ende, p. 64.

⁹¹Guttman, p. 546.

and El Sordo," and the republican lines to "the barrera fence."⁹²

Critics applaud Hemingway's suggestion of the Spanish idiom in the novel.⁹³ The repetition of the Spanish language patterns reinforces "the inescapable fatality so explicit in this novel."⁹⁴ Arturo Barea, however, declares that many of the words Hemingway uses in the novel do not appear in the Spanish dictionaries.⁹⁵ Richard Ford explains that the language of the bullfight descends from "gipsy Romany," and experts in taumachian philology sometimes have trouble with the double meanings and metaphorical implications of the words.⁹⁶ Several words already noted in the text of this analysis of the novel are defined in Death in the Afternoon. On one page of the novel, four words relating to the corrida occur. (FWBT, p. 252) The estribo is the picador's stirrup; (DIA, p. 406); the barrera is the fence surrounding the bull ring; (DIA, p. 419); banderillos assist the matador, (DIA, p. 419); and the tendido consists of rows of seats around the ring. (DIA, p. 486) Hemingway undoubtedly deliberately

⁹²Von Ende, p. 64.

⁹³Joseph Warren Beach, American Fiction: 1920-1940 (New York, 1941), p. 115.

⁹⁴Edward Fenimore, "English and Spanish in For Whom The Bell Tolls," Journal of English Literary History (1943), 86.

⁹⁵Barea, 351.

⁹⁶Richard Ford, Gatherings From Spain (London, 1927), p. 318.

selected bullfighting terminology such as the word olé (FWBT, p. 256) in order to make the novel cohere artistically.

The use of the bullfight as the central structure reinforces one of the themes of the novel. To the Spanish people accustomed to individualism, the bull "has become a symbol of hated authority." In the past, bullfighting has been the means whereby "anti-authoritarian feelings find approved cultural expression."⁹⁷ Hemingway's use of the bull ring in the novel reinforces the anti-fascist theme of the novel.

The Old Man and the Sea

Robert Stephens has noticed an image which parallels fishing and bullfighting in Hemingway's journalism.⁹⁸ In "The Great Blue River," Hemingway depicts the actions of a man named Gregario, who is trying to catch a marlin. Endeavoring to keep the fish from going down, Gregario plays the marlin "as a bullfighter might play a bull, keeping the lure just out of his range, and yet never denying it to him, while you race--in the feather."⁹⁹ Hemingway drew earlier analogies between bullfighting and fishing than the one Stephens points out.

⁹⁷Jack Randolph Conrad, The Horn and the Sword: The History of the Bull as Symbol of Power and Fertility. (New York, 1957), pp. 185, 188 & 191.

⁹⁸Stephens, p. 315.

⁹⁹Ernest Hemingway, "The Great Blue River," Holiday, VI (July, 1947), 63.

The old man, Santiago, resembles Hemingway's aged matador, Manuel Garcia in "The Undefeated."¹⁰⁰ The eyes of Santiago remain "cheerful and undefeated" despite the fact that he has caught no fish in nearly three months. (OMS, p.6) Both men have been skilled in their professions in their youth, yet neither is content with memories of his past splendor. The thousands of earlier times the men have proved their strength mean "nothing" to them. Santiago realizes the need to prove it again. "Each time was a new time and he never thought about the past when he was doing it." (OMS, p.65) In the earlier short story, Hemingway describes a bull that "was hooking wildly, jumping like a trout, all four feet off the ground."¹⁰¹ When Manuel Garcia tries to perform an artistic faena, he realizes that he has come "too damn close" to the bull's horns.¹⁰² The fisherman Santiago similarly recognizes that part of the reason why the sharks have devoured his marlin is because he has gone "too far out" on the sea in his skiff. (OMS, p. 115) Neither Santiago nor Manuel Garcia can function as nobly as in his youth. In terms of their outward conflict, both men are defeated in their final battles. Like Catherine Barkley, Santiago admits that he has been "beaten" (broken), but this admission constitutes an inward victory, a final recognition of the basic

¹⁰⁰Young, p. 96.

¹⁰¹The Short Stories, p. 254.

¹⁰²Ibid., p. 258.

tenet of the Hemingway code: facing reality.¹⁰³ Defeat constitutes victory; facing death renews life. Santiago insists that "man is not made for defeat." He adds, "A man can be destroyed but not defeated." (OMS, p. 103) Like Manuel Garcia, who has been "reduced to fighting in the Nocturnals,"¹⁰⁴ Santiago finds himself alone on the sea in the dark. (OMS, p. 48) His final battle with sharks takes place at midnight, (OMS, p. 118) and he returns to the land just before dawn. (OMS, p. 121)

In "Bullfighting, Sport and Industry," Hemingway quotes Ricardi Bombita secondhand from Sidney Franklin: "It is not the bull who gores the man, but the man who gores himself on the bull by some mistake in technique."¹⁰⁵ In Death in the Afternoon, Hemingway transforms the bull to a fish and inverts the image:

We speak of killing a trout with a rod. It is the effort made by the trout that kills it. A catfish arrives at the side of the boat in full possession of all its force and strength. A tarpon, a trout or a salmon will often kill himself fighting the rod and line if you hold him long enough. (DIA, p. 61)

Hemingway thus has correlated bullfighting and fishing in his earliest discussions of the bullfight.

¹⁰³Shockley, p. 381.

¹⁰⁴Defalco, p. 197.

¹⁰⁵"Bullfighting, Sport and Industry," p. 140.

In Green Hills of Africa while hunting a wounded kudu bull, Hemingway comments that "if it had only rained so that the ground would hold a track, we could have stayed with that bull forever."¹⁰⁶ In The Old Man and the Sea, Santiago similarly addresses the fish: "I'll stay with you until I am dead." (OMS, p. 50) Santiago's concept of the marlin resembles Pedro Romero's attitude toward the bulls, which he insists are his "best friends," which he kills in order to prevent them from killing him. (SAR, p. 186) Santiago first pities the fish at the end of his line, (OMS, p. 46) but then declares that although he loves and respects the great marlin, he will kill the marlin before the day is over. (OMS, p. 52)

He finally recognizes that he and the fish are brothers beneath the sun and the moon on the sea. (OMS, p. 57) Not only do Santiago and Romero view their contestants alike, they also both seek "a technique which was straight and pure and natural."¹⁰⁷

Although Robert Mai remarks that Santiago has not experienced a "big wound,"¹⁰⁸ the old fisherman's face is weather-beaten and his hands have "deep-creased scars from handling heavy fish on the cords." These scars are not recent, but are "as old as erosions in a fishless desert." (OMS, p. 6)

¹⁰⁶GHOA, p. 274.

¹⁰⁷John Reardon, "Hemingway's Esthetic and Ethical Sportsmen," University Review, XXXIV (Autumn, 1967), 14-15.

¹⁰⁸Mai, p. 180.

On the ocean, Santiago's hands are again wounded. Just as Manuel Garcia Maera in Death in the Afternoon ignores the pain in his wrists during a bullfight, Santiago ignores the pain in his hands while he fishes on the sea.¹⁰⁹ By his pain, however, he knows that he is alive, (OMS, p. 117) for "pain does not matter to a man." (OMS, p. 84) Along with courage, a matador's control of his two hands is important for him in killing the bull: "He must have extraordinary courage and ability to perform two distinctly different acts with two hands at the same time. . ."(DIA, p. 178) The matador also needs "a fine left hand to manage the muleta." (DIA, p. 233) Although Santiago's left hand cramps on him and cripples his effort, (OMS, p. 84) he admits that despite the pain his "hands have done their work." (OMS, p. 98)

When Santiago first hooks the marlin, he wonders if the marlin has had a previous bad experience with a fisherman. (OMS, p. 40) In the bullfight, one detail of much importance is the bull's lack of experience with a man on foot. (DIA, p. 145) The bull is more dangerous if he has already seen a man on foot because he learns rapidly how to charge the man. The physical pain Santiago encounters in his struggle with the fish leads him to a "spiritual enlightenment."¹¹⁰

¹⁰⁹Backman, p. 10.

¹¹⁰Robert O. Stephens, "Hemingway's Old Man and the Iceberg," *Modern Fiction Studies*, VII (Winter, 1961) p. 288, hereafter cited as "Iceberg."

Santiago himself seeks such qualities as "beauty, nobility, courage, calmness, and endurance" which the fish represents to him.¹¹¹ The old man understands that his human intelligence enables him to master the marlin. Thought distinguishes the man from the beast.¹¹² He has the ability to control his pain, while pain "could drive" the marlin "mad." (OMS, p. 87)

Like Jackson Benson,¹¹³ Robert Stephens considers the bullfight the model for The Old Man and the Sea. Santiago first attempts to determine the personality of the fish on his hook in the manner of a matador observing a bull enter the arena.¹¹⁴ While a banderillo slows down the bull by the placing of the barbs, Santiago places the oars across the stern of his fishing skiff to give the fish more weight to pull.¹¹⁵ The harpooning of the fish (OMS, p. 93) resembles the final sword thrust of the matador into the bull.¹¹⁶

Pride, a common trait of the Spanish people, (DIA, p.264) allows the matador to take "to himself one of the Godlike attributes," that of administering death. (DIA, p. 264) Despite a profound humility, Santiago possesses pride. (OMS, p. 10) He admits to himself, "You did not kill the fish only

¹¹¹Arvin R. Wells, "Ritual of Transfiguration: The Old Man and the Sea," University Review (Winter, 1963), p. 98.

¹¹²"Iceberg," pp. 302-303.

¹¹³Benson, p. 171.

¹¹⁴"Iceberg," p. 301.

¹¹⁵Ibid.

¹¹⁶Backman, p. 10.

to keep alive and to sell for good, you killed him for pride and because you are a fisherman." (OMS, p. 105)

Santiago knows many younger fishermen who name the sea el mar, a masculine noun, because they consider the sea "a contestant or a place or even an enemy." (OMS, p. 27) These "amateur" fishermen associate the sea with victory (DIA, p. 22) in contrast to Santiago's love for the sea. The old fisherman pictures the sea as a feminine life-giving force. (OMS, p. 27) He would probably deem fishing a tragedy involving "danger for the man but certain death for the animal." (DIA, p. 16) Santiago does not think in terms of winning and losing. When the boy tells him that the Yankees lost the daily baseball game, Santiago informs him: "That means nothing. The great DiMaggio is himself again." (OMS, p. 18) Winning or losing is subordinate to how the matador, baseball player, or fisherman performs.

Vague elements of determinism pervade The Old Man and the Sea. The word suerte, Spanish for the maneuvers in the bullfight, can also mean luck, fate, and doom. (DIA, p. 96) Santiago finds his luck diminishing, both at the beginning (OMS, p. 5) and at the end of the novel. (OMS, p. 125) Just as there are three acts in a bullfight, (DIA, p. 96) Santiago spends three days and three nights alone on the sea. (OMS, p. 85) On the third day he harpoons the marlin, (OMS, p.93)

while the third part of the bullfight culminates in the death of the bull. (DIA., p. 97) At the end of the novel, the old man predicts "maybe three" more "days of heavy brisa" in answer to Manolin's question. (OMS, p. 125)

The book begins with the old man and the boy on the land. Santiago realizes he is unlucky then. The second part of the book involving Santiago alone with a fish on the sea reaches a climax when the fisherman kills the fish. The final tercio of the novel returns the old man to the shore, where he again tells the boy that he is unlucky. The voyage from the land to the sea and back to the shore implies a circle encompassing the three sections of the book, like the circular bull ring. The structure enhances the themes of courage and skill despite the risks of death and defeat.

Santiago's wife had possessed a picture of the Virgin of Cobre, which Santiago retained in his shack after her death. (OMS, p. 12) On the ocean Santiago prays mechanically to the Virgin, and promises to "make a pilgrimage to the Virgen de Cobre" if he should catch the fish. (OMS, p. 63) In Death in the Afternoon, Hemingway explains that although the Virgen de la Soledad is the patron of all bullfighters, the matadors can "take their patron from the local Virgin of their town, village, or district." (DIA, p. 480)

Existence on the sea sometimes resembles the mountainous city of Madrid. (DIA, p. 47) As Santiago drifts away from the land, the clouds over the shore look like mountains. (OMS, p. 32) Later he glances backward to see "the tops of the blue hills that showed white as though they were snow-capped and the clouds that looked like high snow mountains behind them." (OMS, p. 37) A mountain climate can "be dangerous in the fall and at the end of summer when the sun is gone [and] the cold comes quickly and deadly for any one who must stand in it wet with sweat, unable even to wipe himself dry." (DIA, p. 161) Such temperature changes predispose the bullfighter to tuberculosis. (DIA, p. 161) Santiago too endures the heat of the sun and the chill of the darkness, his sweat drying "cold" on his brow after sunset. (OMS, p. 44) At the end of the novel, Santiago tastes something "coppery and sweet" in his mouth. (OMS, p. 119) He tells the boy, "In the night I spat something strange and felt something in my chest was broken." (OMS, p. 126) These details vaguely hint that Santiago may experience the same doom as the matador Maera.¹¹⁷

Santiago's struggle in the sea takes place in September. He informs the boy that September is a month for "the great fish," and notes that "anyone can be a fisherman in May." (OMS, pp.14-15) Throughout the summer Santiago ate turtles'

¹¹⁷DIA, p. 82; see also Hemingway, Short Stories, "Banal Story," pp. 360-362.

eggs to gain strength for the challenging season in the fall. (OMS, p. 34) As in The Sun Also Rises and For Whom the Bell Tolls, the eggs here can signify Santiago's attempt to gain cojones. September, too, is a challenging season for bullfighters, who are often exhausted from the summer behind them, and who often encounter defective bulls in September, which can nevertheless be a "splendid month." (DIA, p. 49)

Trying to stay with the fish, Santiago determines, "Let him think that I am more man than I am and I will be so."

(OMS, p. 63) Although Santiago loses the fish, like the best of bullfighters, his failure to be defeated makes him a man.

CHAPTER IV

CONCLUSION

In a 1925 review of In Our Time, Edmund Wilson noted that Hemingway's miniatures of the bullfight had "the dry sharpness and elegance of the bullfight lithographs of Goya."¹ Hemingway thanked him for his favorable review in a letter dated October 18, 1924, and added that he and Mrs. Hemingway had just had a "fine time" in Pamplona, where Hemingway "learned a lot about bullfighting, the inside the ring scene."² This knowledge of the Spanish bullfight, which Hemingway continued to acquire throughout his life, manifests itself in his art.

In The Sun Also Rises, Hemingway refers to the bullfight overtly and explicitly. The manner in which the characters attend the bullfight reflects their ability to face reality in their lives. Lady Brett Ashley and Jake Barnes acquire a moral vision in the novel, akin to the moral vision Hemingway possessed in Death in the Afternoon. The structure of the novel centers on the Pamplona fiesta, where the characters converge, the plot becomes complicated, and Lady Brett Ashley meets Pedro Romero, a relationship which leads her to

¹Edmund Wilson, "Mr. Hemingway's Dry Points," The Dial, LXXVII (1924), 341.

²Edmund Wilson, Shores of Light (New York, 1952), p. 122.

her religious feeling. Jake Barnes and Bill Gordon experience the religious feeling of aficion during the performance of Pedro Romero in the arena. The role of the aged matador Belmonte in the novel is to demonstrate that a man must prove his courage and his skill again and again in his lifetime. The bullfight motif also counteracts the interpretation of the novel as a manifestation of lost generationism, and enhances the earth imagery and the imagery of the sun and shadows.

While Hemingway makes no explicit allusions to the bullfight in A Farewell to Arms, the major themes of the novel relate to the bullfight. Both love and aficion are religious feelings. War and the bullfight reveal the totality of life and death to the observant spectator. The death of Catherine Barkley fuses the themes of love and war, causing Frederick Henry to confront the basic fact of life that man must die. Hemingway used his later non-fiction work, Death in the Afternoon, as a retaliation to the critics who had judged A Farewell to Arms harshly. In both books, Hemingway discusses the value of the wound in moulding a man's character. The elements of determinism in the novel recur in Death in the Afternoon. The symbolism of the rain and the mountain in the novel relates directly to the bullfight.

Following the harsh review of Max Eastman, the critics have not given Death in the Afternoon the attention it merits. The book discusses Hemingway's attitudes toward morality, art, determinism, and life and death, as well as the technical details of bullfighting. A close examination of Death in the Afternoon further verifies that Hemingway was well-versed in art and literature, contrary to the opinion many earlier critics held toward him.

While Hemingway associates Spain with Africa in Death in the Afternoon, in Green Hills of Africa he finds resemblances between Africa and Spain. These geographical parallels may link Hemingway's African stories, such as "The Snows of Kilimanjaro," with his stories and novels about Spain or the values of the Spanish bullfight. The code of the hunter relates to the code of the matador. In Green Hills of Africa, Hemingway parallels the hunt and writing to life itself. Like the bullfighter who encounters death in the ring, Hemingway himself declared that he "was dead" after writing a book.³

In For Whom the Bell Tolls, Hemingway fuses bullfighting with the Spanish Civil War to enhance the anti-fascist theme of the novel. The characters in the novel either possess the emotions of spectators at a bullfight or directly parallel figures within a bullfight. Pablo's love for the horses

³Lillian Ross, Profile of Ernest Hemingway (New York, 1961), pp. 25-26.

reveals his inability to face the reality of the war situation, just as the spectator offended by the gorings of the horses at a bullfight cannot experience the moment of truth at the center of the ring. Hemingway's characterization of Maria is flat, because he idealizes her by paralleling her with the Virgin Mary, the patron saint of the bullfight. The structure of the novel again resembles the bull ring, enhancing the themes of love, war and fate. Like aficion, commitment to a social goal is a religious feeling in For Whom the Bell Tolls. Hemingway, then, has broadened his concept of the bullfight to include politics, as well as religion, aesthetics, life and death.

In The Old Man and the Sea, Santiago resembles Hemingway's earlier character, the matador Manuel Garcia, who appears in "The Undefeated" and "Banal Story." Like Belmonte in The Sun Also Rises, Santiago finds he must prove anew the skill and courage he possessed in his youth. His loss of the marlin does not defeat him, for in a struggle of life and death as in the bullring, there is no victory or defeat.

During the latter years of his life, Hemingway returned to the Spanish bullfight. Although critics of the time attacked "The Dangerous Summer" harshly, a more objective analysis of the work is needed. A scholarly comparison of

"The Dangerous Summer" with Death in the Afternoon might reveal significant changes in Hemingway's attitude toward life. The articles written for Life magazine represent at least Hemingway's attempt to reaffirm the values of the corrida which he had embraced as a young man.

A study of the bullfight elucidates much of the symbolism in Hemingway's works. At the center of the light imagery in Hemingway's art lies his association of the sun with a bullfighter and darkness with a bull. The image of the mountain, which critics often discuss in relation to A Farewell to Arms, relates to the themes of art, love, and death in Hemingway's works. Hemingway associates the mountain directly with the bullfight. The matador fuses the three themes of love, death, and art. By using his artistry to counteract the destructive forces of the bull in the ring, the bullfighter creates a religious feeling in the spectators, enabling them, through the death of the bull, to view life clearly and as a whole. In the bull ring, then, Hemingway finds "the fullest realization of his code, the finest image of his world."⁴

⁴Martin Staples Shockley, "Hemingway's Moment of Truth," Colorado Quarterly, V (Spring, 1957), 286.

In 1925 Hemingway wrote F. Scott Fitzgerald that his concept of heaven involved a gigantic bull ring with a trout stream flowing outside it.⁵ While heaven became more and more dubious to Hemingway, he found in the Spanish bullfight the values by which he lived his own life to the hilt.

⁵Carlos Baker, Hemingway: The Writer as Artist (Princeton, 1967), p. 143.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Books

- Aristotle, Poetics, included in S.H. Butcher, Aristotle's Theory of Poetry and Fine Art, New York, Dover Publications, Inc., 1951.
- Atkins, John, The Art of Ernest Hemingway: His Work and Personality, New York, Ray Publishers, 1963.
- Baker, Carlos, Ernest Hemingway: A Life Story, New York, Charles Scribner's Sons, 1969.
- _____ Hemingway: The Writer as Artist, Princeton Princeton University Press, 1967.
- Beach, Joseph Warren, American Fiction: 1920-1940, New York, Russell and Russell, 1960.
- Belmonte, Juan, Killer of Bulls: The Autobiography of a Matador, translated from the Spanish by Leslie Charteris, New York, The Book League of America, Inc., 1937.
- Clemens, Samuel Langhorne, Life on the Mississippi, New York New American Library, 1963.
- Conrad, Jack Randolph, The Horn and the Sword: The History of the Bull as Symbol of Power and Fertility, New York, E. P. Dutton and Company, 1952.
- Cranston, J.H., Ink on My Fingers, Toronto, Ryerson Press, 1953.
- Crosby, Caresse, The Passionate Years, New York, The Dial Press, 1953.
- Crosby, John, With Love and Loathing, New York, McGraw-Hill Book Company, Inc., 1963.
- Daley, Robert, The Swords of Spain, New York, The Dial Press, 1960.
- Defalco, Joseph, The Hero in Hemingway's Short Stories, Pittsburg, University of Pittsburg Press, 1963.
- Dias Arquer, Graciano, Libros y Folletos de Toros, Madrid, Administracion: Libreria de Pedro Vindel, Calle del Prado, Numero 31, 1931.

- Eliot, T. S., Andrew Marvell, London, Published by Leonard and Virginia Woolf at the Hogarth Press, 1924.
- Ellison, Ralph, Shadow and Act, New York, New American Library, 1966.
- Fenton, Charles, The Apprenticeship of Ernest Hemingway, New York, Viking Press, 1960.
- Ford, Richards, Gatherings from Spain, London, J. M. Dent and Sons, Ltd. 1927.
- Frank, Waldo, Virgin Spain, New York, Boni and Liveright, 1926.
- Franklin, Sidney, Bullfighter from Brooklyn, New York, Prentice-Hall, Inc. 1952.
- Frohock, W. M., The Novel of Violence in America, Dallas, Southern Methodist University Press, 1950.
- Hanneman, Audre, Ernest Hemingway: A Comprehensive Bibliography, Princeton, Princeton University Press, 1967.
- Hemingway, Ernest, By-Line: Ernest Hemingway, edited by William White, New York, Charles Scribner's Sons, 1967.
- _____, The Collected Poems, n.p., originally published in Paris, n.d.
- _____, Death in the Afternoon, New York, Charles Scribner's Sons, 1932.
- _____, A Farewell to Arms, New York, Charles Scribner's Sons, 1969.
- _____, For Whom the Bell Tolls, New York, Charles Scribner's Sons, 1968.
- _____, The Green Hills of Africa, New York, Charles Scribner's Sons, 1935.
- _____, In Our Time, New York, Charles Scribner's Sons, 1925.
- _____, The Old Man and The Sea, New York, Charles Scribner's Sons, 1952.
- _____, A Moveable Feast, New York, Charles Scribner's Sons, 1969.
- _____, The Short Stories of Ernest Hemingway, New York, Charles Scribner's Sons, 1966.

- Hemingway, Ernest, The Sun Also Rises, New York, Charles Scribner's Sons, 1954.
- Hemingway, Leicester, My Brother, Ernest Hemingway, New York The World Publishing Company, 1962.
- Hotchner, A.E., Papa Hemingway: A Personal Memoir, New York, Random House, 1966.
- Huxley, Aldous, Music at Night, London, Chatto and Windus, 1949.
- Killinger, John, Hemingway and the Dead Gods: A Study in Existentialism, Louisville, Lexington, University of Kentucky Press, 1960.
- [Kunitz, Stanley, J.,] Living Authors: A Book of Biographies, edited by Dilly Tante, New York, The H. W. Wilson Company, 1931.
- Lewis, Robert, Jr., Hemingway on Love, Austin, University of Texas Press, 1965.
- Loeb, Harold, The Way It Was, New York, Criterion Books, 1959.
- Lopez Pelegrin, Santos, Filosofia de Los Toros por Abenamar, Madrid, Boix, Editor Calle de Carretas, Numero 8, 1842.
- Marvell, Andrew, The Poems and Letters of Andrew Marvell, edited by H.M. Margolioth (2 volumes), Oxford, Clarendon Press, 1967.
- McAlmon, Robert, Being Geniuses Together: 1920-1930, Garden City, Doubleday and Company, Inc., 1968.
- Oag, Shag, In The Presence of Death: Antonio Ordonez, New York, Coward-McCann, Inc. 1968.
- Peterson, Richard K. Hemingway: Direct and Oblique, Mouton, 1969.
- Ross, Lillian, Portrait of Ernest Hemingway, New York Simon and Schuster, 1961.
- Smith, Rex, (editor) Biography of the Bulls: An Anthology of Spanish Bullfighting, New York, Rinehart and Company, Inc., 1957.

- Stein, Gertrude, The Autobiography of Alice B. Toklas, New York, Harcourt, Brace and Company, 1933.
- Stephens, Robert, Hemingway's Non-Fiction, Chapel Hill, University of North Carolina Press, 1968.
- Thoreau, Henry David, Walden, New York, Holt, Rinehart and Winston, 1948.
- West, Ray B., Jr., The Art of Modern Fiction, New York, Rinehart and Company, Inc., 1955.
- Whittier, John Greenleaf, The Complete Poetical Works, Boston, Houghton Mifflin and Company, 1894.
- Wilson, Edmund, Shores of Light, New York, Farrar, Straus and Young, Inc., 1952.
- Wylder, Delbert E., Hemingway's Heroes, Albuquerque, University of New Mexico Press, 1969.
- Young, Philip, Ernest Hemingway, New York, Rinehart and Company, Inc., 1952.

Articles

- Adler, John, "Theme and Character in Hemingway's For Whom The Bell Tolls," University Review, XXX (June, 1964) 293-299.
- Backman, Melvin, "Hemingway: The Matador and the Crucified," Modern Fiction Studies, I (August, 1955), 2-11.
- Barea, Arturo, "Not Spain But Hemingway," Horizon, III (May, 1941), 350-361.
- Clendenning, John, "Hemingway's Gods, Dead and Alive," Texas Studies in Literature and Language, III (Winter, 1963), 489-502.
- Colvert, John, "Ernest Hemingway's Morality in Action," American Literature, XXVII (November, 1955), 372-385.
- Cowley, Malcolm, "Hemingway and the Hero," New Republic, CXI (December 4, 1944), 754-8.

- Dewey, Ganzel, "Cabestro and Vaquilla: The Symbolic Structure of The Sun Also Rises," Sewanee Review, LXXVI (Winter, 1968), 26-48.
- Eastman, Max, "Bull in the Afternoon," New Republic, LXXV (June 7, 1933), 94-97.
- Engstrom, Alfred G., "Dante, Flaubert and Snows," Modern Language Notes, LXV (1950), 203-205.
- Evans, Robert, "Hemingway and the Pale Cast of Thought," American Literature, XXXVIII (May, 1966), 161-176.
- Farquhar, Robin H., "Dramatic Structure in the Novel of Ernest Hemingway," Modern Fiction Studies, XIV (Autumn, 1968), 271-282.
- Fenimore, Edward, "English and Spanish in For Whom The Bell Tolls," ELH, X (1943), 73-86.
- Floor, Richard, "Fate and Life: Determinism in Ernest Hemingway," Renaissance, XV (Fall, 1962), 23 - 26.
- Galantiere, Lewis "The Brushwood Boy at the Front," Hound and Horn, III (1930), 259-262.
- Geismar, Max, "No Man Alone Now," Virginia Quarterly Review, XVII (1941), 517-534.
- Gelfant, Blanche, "Language as a Moral Code in A Farewell to Arms," Modern Fiction Studies, IX (Summer, 1963), 173-176.
- Gray, J. Glenn, "The Idea of Death in Existentialism," The Journal of Philosophy, XLVIII (March, 1951), 113-127.
- Grebstein, Sheldon Norman, "Sex, Hemingway and the Critics," Humanist, XXI (July-August, 1961), 212-218.
- Guttman, Alan, "Mechanized Doom: Ernest Hemingway and the Spanish Civil War," Massachusetts Review, I (May, 1960), 541-561.

Hale, Nancy, "Hemingway and the Courage to Be," Virginia Quarterly Review, XXXVIII (Autumn, 1962), 620-639.

Hemingway, Ernest, "And to the United States," Transatlantic Review, I (March, 1924), 355-357.

_____, "Bullfighting a Tragedy," from By-Line: Ernest Hemingway, edited by William White, New York Charles Scribner's Sons, 1967, pp. 90-98.

_____, "Bullfighting, Sport and Industry," Fortune, I (March, 1930), 83-88; 139-146; 150.

_____, "The Dangerous Summer," Life, XLIX (September 5, 1960), 77-109; (September 12, 1960), 60-82; (September 19, 1960), 74-96.

_____, "The Faithful Bull," Holiday, IX (March, 1951), 51.

_____, "The Great Blue River," Holiday, VI (July, 1949), 60-63; 95-97.

_____, "The Good Lion," Holiday, IX (March, 1951), 50.

_____, "Pamplona in July," from By-Line: Ernest Hemingway, edited by William White, New York, Charles Scribner's Sons, 1967, pp. 99-108.

Hemingway, Mary, "Hemingway's Spain," Saturday Review, L (March 11, 1967), 48-49; 102-107.

Herrick, Robert, "What is Dirt," The Bookman, LXX (November 1929), 258-262.

Hicks, Granville, "Bulls and Bottles," The Nation, CXXV (November 9, 1932), 461.

Hoffman, Frederick, "No Beginning and No End: Hemingway and Death," Essays in Criticism, III (January, 1953), 73-84.

Holman, C. Hugh, "Hemingway and Emerson: Notes on the Continuity of an Aesthetic Tradition," Modern Fiction Studies, I (August, 1955), 12-16.

- "Inflammatory Topics," The Bookman, LXX (February, 1930), 641-647.
- Jones, John A. "Hemingway: The Critics and the Public Legend," Western Humanities Review, XIII (Autumn, 1969), 387-400.
- Kinnamon, Keneth, "Hemingway, the Corrida and Spain," Texas Studies in Literature and Language, I (Spring, 1959), 44-61.
- Kirstein, Lincoln, "The Canon of Death," Hound and Horn, VI (March, 1933), 336-341.
- Levin, Harry, "Observations on the Style of Ernest Hemingway," Kenyon Review, XIII (1951), 581-609.
- Linebarger, J. M., "Eggs as Huevos in The Sun Also Rises," Fitzgerald-Hemingway Annual (1970), pp. 237-239.
- Light, James, "The Religion of Death in A Farewell to Arms," Modern Fiction Studies, VII (Summer, 1961), 169-173.
- Mai, Robert P. "Ernest Hemingway and Men Without Women," Fitzgerald-Hemingway Annual, (1970), pp. 173-186.
- Marcus, Fred H., "A Farewell to Arms: The Impact of Irony and the Irrational," The English Journal, LI (November, 1962) 527-535.
- Marsden, Malcolm M., "Hemingway's Symbolic Pattern: The Basis of Tone," Discourse, XII (Winter, 1969), 16-28.
- Marshall, Margaret, "Notes By the Way," The Nation, CLI (October 21, 1940), 591.
- McAleer, John J., "A Farewell to Arms: Frederick Henry's Rejected Passion," Renascence, XIV (Autumn, 1961), 72-79; 89.
- Newman, Paul B., "Hemingway's Grail Quest," University Review, XXVIII (Summer, 1962), 295-303.
- Oldsey, Bernard, "The Snows of Ernest Hemingway," Wisconsin Studies in Contemporary Literature, IV (Spring-Summer, 1963), 172-198.

- Portz, John, "Allusion and Structure in Hemingway's 'A Natural History of the Dead,'" Tennessee Studies in Literature, X (1965), 27-42.
- Reardon, John, "Hemingway's Esthetic and Ethical Sportsmen," University Review, XXXIV (Autumn, 1967), 13-23.
- Ross, Lillian, "Profiles: El Unico Matador," The New Yorker, XXV (March 12, 1949), 34-47; (March 19, 1949), 34-51; (March 26, 1949), 32-56.
- Ruark, Robert, "Papa Goes to the Fights," from Biography of the Bulls, edited by Rex Smith, New York, Rinehart and Company, 1957, pp. 369-371.
- Russell, H.K., "The Catharsis in A Farewell to Arms," Modern Fiction Studies, I (August, 1955), 25-30.
- Sarason, Bertram D., "Brett Ashley and Lady Duff Twysden," Connecticut Review, II (April, 1969), 5-13.
- Sevareid, Eric, "Mano a Mano," Esquire, LII (November, 1959), 40-44.
- Simpson, Herbert, "The Problem of Structure in A Farewell to Arms." Forum (University of Houston), IV (Winter, 1963), 20-24.
- Shockley, Martin Staples, "Hemingway's Moment of Truth," Colorado Quarterly, V (Spring, 1957), 380-388.
- Stavrau, C.S., "Nada, Religion and Hemingway," Topic, VI (Fall, 1966), 5-20.
- Stephens, Robert O., "Hemingway's Old Man and the Iceberg." Modern Fiction Studies, VII (Winter, 1961), 295-304.
- Taube, Myron, "The Nada and Plato's Cave," The CEA Critic XXVI (May, 1964), 55-56.
- Torchiana, Donald, "The Sun Also Rises: A Reconsideration," Fitzgerald-Hemingway Annual, (1969), 77-104.
- Von Ende, Frederick, "The Corrida Pattern in For Whom The Bell Tolls," RE: Arts and Letters, III (Spring, 1970), 63-70.

- Waldmeir, Joseph, "Confiteor Hominem: Ernest Hemingway's Religion of Man," PMASAL, XLII (1956), 349-356.
- Warren, Robert Penn, "Novelist-Philosopher, Ernest Hemingway," Horizon, XV (1947), 161-169.
- _____, "Hemingway," The Kenyon Review, IX (Winter, 1947), 1-28.
- Weeks, Lewis E. Jr., "Mark Twain and Ernest Hemingway: 'A Catastrophe' and 'A Natural History of the Dead,'" Mark Twain Journal, XIV (Summer, 1968), 15-17.
- Weeks, Robert P., "Hemingway and the Uses of Isolation," University Review, XXIV (Winter, 1957), 119-125.
- Wells, Arvin R., "Ritual of Transfiguration: The Old Man and the Sea," University Review, XXX (Winter, 1963), 95-100.
- West, Ray B., "Ernest Hemingway: Death in the Evening," The Antioch Review, IV (December, 1944), 569-580.
- Wilson, Edmund, "Mr. Hemingway's Dry Points," The Dial, LXXVII (1924), 340-341.
- Wyrick, Green, "Hemingway and Bergson: The Plan Vital," Modern Fiction Studies, I (August, 1955), 17-19.
- Yunck, John, "The Natural History of a Dead Quarrel: Hemingway and the Humanists," South Atlantic Quarterly, LXII, (Winter, 1963), 29-42.

Unpublished Materials

- Hemingway, Ernest, manuscript of Death in the Afternoon, Academic Center, University of Texas, Austin, Texas.